

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 7 - 8 March 2018**

**Web-meeting**

**(Agreed on 08/03/2018)<sup>1</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (Chair - SP)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Giuseppe Stancanelli

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach Schulz

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working

<sup>1</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment EFSA-Q-2018-00069.**

The mandate on the update of the previous (2015) *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment was discussed, with particular focus on the interpretation of the Terms of reference.

The working group plan and next steps were discussed, including particularly data needs, data availability and gaps.

#### **5. Miscellaneous**

Next meetings were planned

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 17-18 May 2018, Parma (Italy)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP – Chair)

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

Marie-Agnès Jacques has participated via WEB-conference on 17 May 2018 (MAJ)

Juan Antonio Navas Cortés has participated via WEB-conference (JANC)

- **European Commission representative:**

Pasquale Di Rubbo (PdR - DG SANTE) has participated via WEB-conference on 17 May 2018

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Giuseppe Stancanelli (GS)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

##### **Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment EFSA-Q-2018-00069<sup>6</sup>**

The WG members reviewed the EC Mandate and asked clarification to Pasquale Di Rubbo about the terms of reference of the Mandate.

The WG discussed and agreed on the following points:

- Need to review the 2015 *Xylella* pest risk assessment and evaluate what need to be updated considering new scientific evidences, availability of data, and info
- Spreading of the disease: need to look for the available data at EU level from different sources (ongoing projects, published data)
- Establishment of the disease: need to look for data and info about host, vector, and pest current distribution
- Latency period: a review of the available scientific literature and from the EFSA host plant database will be done by the WG to retrieve data to estimate it. Other factors affecting the minimum number of years before lifting the demarcated areas will also be considered.

#### **5. Next meetings**

The next meeting of the Working Group will be 21-22 June 2018 in Parma

---

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>6</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00069>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 21-22 June 2018, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 12 July 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP – Chair)

Donato Boscia (DB) participated via WEB-conference

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

Marie-Agnès Jacques (MAJ)

Juan Antonio Navas Cortés (JANC)

- **Hearing experts:**

Daniel Chapman (DC) and Steven White (SW) participated via WEB-conference, for 1 hour, on 22 May 2018.

Samuel Soubeyrand (SS) participated via WEB-conference, for 1 hour, on 22 May 2018.

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Giuseppe Stancanelli (GS), Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (OMS)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>7</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>8</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Scientific topics for discussion

#### 4.1. Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment EFSA-Q-2018-00069<sup>9</sup>

The WG members discussed and agreed on the following points:

- Further discussion about the terms of reference of the mandate after the EC clarifications
- The EFSA 2015 *Xylella* pest risk assessment was reviewed by the WG members and the points that need to be updated were identified
- Current situation of *Xylella* infection in Apulia
- Update on ongoing international and local projects, and availability of datasets of potential interest
- Availability of maps/information to define the *Xylella* hosts distribution at the European level, in order to analyse the potential establishment in EU

First tasks were assigned: i) literature review about *Xylella* incubation period, ii) literature review about methods available to analyse *Xylella* climate suitability in Europe, iii) identification of the main elements of the pest risk assessment

On 22 June, Daniel Chapman and Steven White presented their work about *First attempts at estimating dispersal of Xylella from monitoring data* and discussed their main findings with the WG members.

<sup>7</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencpolicy.pdf>

<sup>8</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>9</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00069>

After them, Samuel Soubeyrand presented his work about *Inference of the dynamics of Xylella fastidiosa based on French surveillance data* and discussed their main findings with the WG members.

After the two presentations, the hearing experts left the meeting and the WG members discussed about the hearing experts presentation and identified elements of interest for the Xylella pest risk assessment.

## **5. Next meetings**

The next meeting of the Working Group will be on 16 July 2018 by Web call

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 16-17 and 26 July 2018, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 03 August 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP – Chair, Web meeting)

Gianni Gilioli (GG, physical, Web meeting + physical meeting)

Marie-Agnès Jacques (MAJ, Web meeting)

Juan Antonio Navas Cortés (JANC, Web meeting)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (OMS),  
Giuseppe Stancanelli (GS)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>10</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>11</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working

<sup>10</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>11</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>



group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

##### **4.1. DAY01: Discussion on the determination of the asymptomatic period**

AM and MAJ discussed and agreed on the following points:

- The methodology to extract the relevant papers for the asymptomatic period determination from the EFSA Host Plant Database (EHPD) was discussed and agreed
- AM showed the result of the first screening of the EHPD
- AM and MAJ agreed on the methodology to apply to search and extract the relevant data from the selected documents
- AM and MAJ agreed on tasks and intermediate deadlines

##### **4.2. DAY02: Discussion on the model components for the *Xylella* Pest Risk Assessment**

AM updated the WG about the discussion of the previous day. The WG gave further suggestions about the methodology for extracting the data from the relevant documents.

The WG discussed and agreed on the following points:

- the questions to be addressed for the pest risk assessment were defined
- different modelling solutions for the pest risk assessment were discussed and a draft proposal was agreed by the WG including the modelling of the short and long dispersal

##### **4.3. DAY03: Discussion on the modelling solution formalization and implementation**

The WG started the discussion about the formalization of the proposed modelling solution. The discussion was focused on the conceptual definition of the short spread model and the issues linked to its development.

The working group also discussed about the possibility to interact with other research teams working on similar topics.

##### **4.4. Next steps**

Update about the “asymptomatic period” task at the beginning of September

Discussion with EC to have confirmation about the interpretation of the request related to the assessment of the probability of short and long distance spreading

Finalize formalization of short distance spreading model

## **5. Next meetings**

The next meeting of the Working Group will be 6-7 September 2018 by Web call

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 6 and 7 September 2018, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 14 September 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP – Chair, Web meeting)

Gianni Gilioli (GG, Web meeting)

Marie-Agnès Jacques (MAJ, Web meeting)

Juan Antonio Navas Cortés (JANC, Web meeting)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Alice del Bianco (AB), Andrea Maiorano (AM), Giuseppe Stancanelli (GS)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>12</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>13</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working

<sup>12</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>13</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

##### **4.1. DAY01: Discussion on the determination of the asymptomatic period**

SP, MAJ, AM, and AB discussed and agreed on the following points:

- AM finished the extraction of the relevant papers from the EFSA host plant database according to methodology defined in previous meeting
- MAJ showed the preliminary results of data extraction
- Issues and limits of methodology for data extraction. Refinement of methodology
- First results with refined methodology will be shown in next meeting at the end of September 2018

##### **4.2. DAY02: Discussion on the model components for the *Xylella* Pest Risk Assessment**

AM updated the WG about the possibility to join efforts with research teams working at the modelling of *Xylella* spread within the POnTE and XF-Actors EU projects. The proposal is still under discussion.

GG showed a proposal for modelling the spread of *Xylella* and potential application of the model were discussed. The WG agreed that the proposed model satisfy the needs of the pest risk assessment.

The WG discussed about the different sections to be included in the Pest Risk Assessment and decided to start to write the draft version of the introductory part and the description of the scenario of the pest risk assessment.

##### **4.3. Next steps**

Refine methodology for data extraction for the determination of the asymptomatic period. The table prepared to store the data will be modified according to the discussion as soon as possible.

Show preliminary results of study on asymptomatic period at the next WG meeting.

Show advancements of model development at the next working group meeting.

Start drafting the pest risk assessment document.

## **5. Next meetings**

The next meeting of the Working Group will be 20 September 2018 by web

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 20 September 2018, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 27 September 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP – Chair, Web meeting)

Gianni Gilioli (GG, Web meeting)

Daniel Chapman (DC, Web meeting)

Steven White (SW, Web meeting)

- **Hearing Experts:**

Daniel Chapman (DC, Web meeting)

Steven White (SW, Web meeting)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Alice del Bianco (AB), Andrea Maiorano (AM), Giuseppe Stancanelli (GS)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>14</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>15</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

### **4.1. Discussion about short/long distance dispersal modelling**

DC and SW presented most recent advances about their modelling approach for long distance dispersal modelling of *X. fastidiosa*. The first version of their modelling approach was published in 2017, but then they have been continued working on the model to further improve the representation of the epidemic.

GG presented the model that the WG is developing for describing the short distance spreading of *X. fastidiosa*.

The WG discussed about the characteristics of the DC & SW's model and about its ability to analyse the emergency phytosanitary measures applied according to the EU Decision 2015/789, including the possibility to link the short-distance and the long distance models.

### **4.2. Next steps**

DC and SW were proposed to contribute to the works of the working group with their model.

## **5. Next meetings**

The next meeting of the Working Group will be 27-28 September 2018 in Parma.

---

<sup>14</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>15</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 27-28 September 2018, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 8 October 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP – Chair)

Donato Boscia (DB)

Daniel Chapman (DC – Web)

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

Marie-Agnés Jacques (MAJ)

Juan Antonio Navas Cortes (JANC)

Steven White (SW – Web)

- **European Commission (DG SANTE)**

Pasquale Di Rubbo (PdR – Web)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Alice del Bianco (AB), Andrea Maiorano (AM), Giuseppe Stancanelli (GS)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>16</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>17</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

The WG discussed with PdR about the progress of the works for the pest risk assessment and about the following related points:

- Asymptomatic period: very difficult to find specific information. Maybe some statistical procedures can be applied based on the information from some scientific papers
- Update about Risk Reduction Options
- Potential establishment: preliminary results
- Short and long spread: discussion on conceptual model and potential analysis

#### **5. Next steps and next meeting**

- Perform further analysis and tests on potential establishment
- Write report on risk reduction options review
- Define conceptual model for short spread
- Define case studies for short and long spread
- Decide and agree on further tasks and deadlines
- Finish literature analysis on duration of the asymptomatic period and analyse results

The next meeting of the Working Group will be 1 October 2018 by Web.

---

<sup>16</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>17</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 8<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 8 October 2018, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 22 October 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP – Chair - Web)

Daniel Chapman (DC - Web)

Gianni Gilioli (GG - Web)

Steven White (SW – Web)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Alice del Bianco (AB, Web), Andrea Maiorano (AM)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>18</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>19</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest

---

<sup>18</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>19</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

The WG meeting was focused on modelling issues considering the comments from Pasquale di Rubbo of DG SANTE during the previous WG meeting.

The main points of discussion included:

- Approaches for including landscape heterogeneity in model analysis (both short and long spread models)
- Differences among the different outbreaks in EU
- Assumption at the basis of simulations and case studies
- Data needs
- Start drafting description of methodologies for the Scientific Opinion

#### **5. Next steps and next meeting**

Define methodology for landscape heterogeneity. Draft description of methodology as soon as possible. The next meeting of the Working Group will be 22 October 2018 at IVIA, Valencia, Spain.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 9<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 22 October 2018, IVIA, Valencia (Spain)**

**(Agreed on 29 October 2018)<sup>20</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP – Chair - Web)

Donato Boscia (DB)

Daniel Chapman (DC)

Gianni Gilioli (GG - Web)

Marie-Agnés Jacques (MAJ)

Juan Antonio Navas Cortés (JANC)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Alice Delbianco (AB, Web), Andrea Maiorano (AM)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>21</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on

<sup>20</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>21</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest<sup>22</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### 4. Scientific topics for discussion

The WG meeting was aimed at updating the state of the different activities and define the next deadlines and activities.

- **Asymptomatic period.** 100 papers reviewed so far. Draft report to be done by the next Panel meeting on 22 November
- **Review of RROs.** Draft report due by 15 November. Review of control in plant will be done by a different group specifically set up for this task
- **Potential establishment.** Further analysis confirmed previous results. Other approaches to be tested and compared. Use multi-model ensemble approach for uncertainty assessment.
- **Short distance spread modelling.** Development of conceptual model continues. Model need to be implemented by next Panel meeting.
- **Long distance spread modelling.** Full description of model to be provided by next Panel meeting. AM to look for maps of soil use for Alicante (Spain), Madrid (Spain), PACA (France)

#### 5. Next steps and next meeting

Define methodology for landscape heterogeneity. Draft description of methodology as soon as possible. By next Panel meeting draft report of Asymptomatic period, RROs review, potential establishment should be completed.

Working session with GG on 29 October 2018 in Parma. Next meeting of the WG will be on 22-23 November in Parma.

---

<sup>22</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 10<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

Held on 29 October 2018, EFSA, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 23 November 2018)<sup>23</sup>

#### Participants

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM)

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>24</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>25</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

<sup>23</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>24</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>25</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

The WG meeting was focused on:

- Working session on the characteristics of short spread model
- Revision of terms of reference
- Definitions of baseline scenario

#### **5. Next steps and next meeting**

Define other pest risk assessment scenarios. Implementation of the short distance spread model and first test runs as soon as possible. Next meeting of the WG will be on 22-23 November in Parma.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 11<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 22-23 November 2018, EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 30 November 2018)<sup>26</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (Chair - SP)

Daniel Chapman (DC – Web call)

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

Marie-Agnés Jacques (MAJ)

Juan Antonio Navas Cortès (JANC)

Steven White (SW – Web call)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG),

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (OMS)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

EFSA welcomed the participants. Donato Boscia apologised for absence.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

---

<sup>26</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>27</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>28</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

##### **Presentation to the PLH Panel**

The WG discussed about the outcomes of the presentation to the PLH Panel. More attention was dedicated to the area of potential establishment and the modelling of long distance spread.

##### **Update from activities**

The review of the papers for the asymptomatic period work was finished. Some work to finalize the table including all the collected data needs to be done.

As far as the work on potential establishment the WG decided to use all the available data including data from the national Xylella monitoring programs. Data needs to be consolidated and standardized. EFSA will do it. A multimodel ensemble approach will be applied.

As far as the RROs review, updated information need to be found only regarding the availability of resistant germplasm. In fact a dedicated team working on the control in planta will work on this aspect on 27-28 November, and report on vector control is expected for January. The WG will ask DB will to give more info about the most recent studies on resistant germplasm.

##### **Working sessions**

Three groups were organized to work practically on different aspects of the project.

The group dedicated to short/long spread modelling (SP, AM, GG, DC, SW, MG) discussed about the coming meeting (30 November) with DG SANTE and worked on the settings of the baseline scenarios for the pest risk assessment.

The group dedicated to asymptomatic period (MAJ, OMS, AD) assessment finalized the data table. MAJ started drafting the methodology section of the work to be included in the Scientific Opinion.

---

<sup>27</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>28</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

JANC worked at the potential establishment and finalized a program including next steps.

## **5. Next steps and next meeting**

Start analysis on asymptomatic period data and start drafting report. Include data from monitoring programs in potential establishment and draft report. Finalize definition of scenarios and start simulations tests. Next meeting of the WG will be on 27-28 November in Parma.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 12<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

Held on 27-28 November 2018, EFSA, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 10 December 2018)<sup>29</sup>

#### Participants

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

David Makowski (DM)

Jonathan Yuen (JY)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG), Giuseppe Stancanelli (GS)

AMU Unit: Irene Munoz Guajardo (IMG)

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>30</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>31</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

<sup>29</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>30</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>31</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

##### **Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment (EFSA-Q-2018-00069)**

The WG discussed the outline of the ongoing *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment, in particular the update of the section regarding Risk Reduction Options *in planta*.

##### **Planning of activities**

The RROs in planta of the previous *X. fastidiosa* PRA were considered and discussed. It was decided to deliver a separate opinion and to apply a systematic literature review approach.

##### **Literature review**

The review question, keywords, screening process and data extraction form were defined. IMG was involved in the selection of information sources, finalization of the search string and retrieval of publications. DM and JI performed the screening for relevance of the retrieved publications and the extraction of informative data from the selected studies.

##### **Definition of the outline of the opinion on RROs in relation to Control *in planta***

The outline of the Scientific Opinion on RROs in relation to control *in planta* was discussed and defined, and different tasks were assigned.

#### **5. Next steps and next meeting**

Start drafting the report, especially the sections of Introduction and Methodology. Investigate if information reported in not peer-review journals can be retrieved. Next web meeting of the WG will be on 12 December.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 13<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 28 and 30 November 2018, Web meeting**

**(Agreed on 3 December 2018)<sup>32</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP)

Daniel Chapman (DC)

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

Paolo Gonthier (PG)

Steven White (SW)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM)

- **DG SANTE (on 30 November):**

Pasquale di Rubbo (PdR)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

EFSA welcomed the participants. Donato Boscia apologised for absence on 29 November.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>32</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>33</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>34</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

#### ***28 November (SP, DC, GG, AM, SW)***

##### **Preparation of scenario table for discussion with DG SANTE**

The WG discussed a table including the draft baseline scenarios to be analysed with the spread models and which are based on the emergency phytosanitary measures currently applied against *Xylella*. Information that are specified for each scenario include the definition of initial conditions, landscape structure, spatial scale, temporal scale of outputs, phytosanitary actions, and assessed variable.

The WG agree on the fact that this table is to be considered a "living" table which can be modified according to specific needs or technical limits related to modelling.

#### ***30 November (SP, DC, GG, AM, SW, PdR)***

##### **Discussion with DG SANTE**

The WG discussed with PdR of DG SANTE about the definition of the baseline scenarios and of the elements that will be considered by the spread models, including initial conditions, landscape structure, spatial scale, temporal scale of outputs, phytosanitary actions, and assessed variable.

Characteristics of the alternative scenarios to be tested were discussed.

##### **Potential impact of *Xylella* on forest species (AM, PG)**

AM and PG discussed about the possibility to organize an Expert Knowledge Elicitation to estimate the potential impact of *Xylella* on forest

<sup>33</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>34</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

species. However, quantitative data and information from the scientific/technical literature is needed. During a working session AM and PG worked at a literature search.

## **5. Next steps and next meeting**

The discussion about the scenario table need to be continued and it will be updated during the working group meeting of 3-4 December 2018.

Preliminary results of the literature search about the impact of *X. fastidiosa* on forest species will be discussed in a web meeting on 8 January 2019.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 14<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 3 and 4 December 2018, and on 10 and 11 December,  
Web meeting**

**(Agreed on 3<sup>rd</sup> January 2019)<sup>35</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP)

Donato Boscia (DB, on 3, 10, 11 December)

Daniel Chapman (DC)

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

Marie-Agnés Jacques (MAJ, on 10 December)

Juan Antonio Navas Cortès (on 3, 4, 10 December)

Steven White (SW)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

- **DG SANTE (on 3 and 4 December, and on 11 December):**

Pasquale di Rubbo (PdR)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

EFSA welcomed the participants. Donato Boscia apologised for absence on 29 November.

---

<sup>35</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.



## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>36</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>37</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topics for discussion

### **3 and 4 December (SP, AM, DC, GG, SW, PdR, JANC, DB, MG, AD)**

During the first hour each member of the WG updated about the advancement of the respective activities. The rest of the time was dedicated to working sessions on specific topics.

*Working session on potential establishment:* JANC worked at the data available, including data and information from the EFSA Xylella Host Plant Database, and the data from the countries Xylella monitoring activities, and planned next tasks including the use of different models and approaches to map the potential distribution of Xylella.

*Working session on literature review for EKE on impact:* DB, MG, and AD, searched in the scientific and technical literature data and information available for the preparation of the evidence dossier for the expert knowledge elicitation on the impact of Xylella. Information available is little and further literature research is needed to allow the development of an evidence dossier with enough information for an EKE.

*Working session on spread modelling and scenarios for pest risk assessment:* The WG discussed and finalized the first draft of a table including the baseline scenarios for pest risk assessment. The table includes all the elements that will be needed for analysing different options for the implementation of the phytosanitary measure. The table was discussed with DG SANTE to check that baseline conditions reflect the characteristics of the current measures.

<sup>36</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>37</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## **10 and 11 December (SP, AM, DC, GG, SW, MAJ, JANC, PdR, DB, MG, AD)**

During the first hour each member of the WG updated about the advancement of the respective activities. The rest of the time was dedicated to working sessions on specific topics.

*Working session on potential establishment:* JANC continued working at the data available and started implementation and setting of the different methodologies that will be applied for the potential establishment assessment.

*Working session on methodology of asymptomatic period analysis:* MAJ drafted the first version of the methodology section for the Scientific Opinion related to the assessment of the asymptomatic period.

*Working session on literature review for EKE on parameters related to Xylella epidemiology:* DB, AD, and MG, searched in the scientific and technical literature data and information available for the preparation of the evidence dossier for the expert knowledge elicitation on parameters related to Xylella epidemiology useful for the modelling of the potential spread of Xylella.

*Working session on spread modelling and scenarios for pest risk assessment:* The WG re-discussed the scenario table according to the last discussion with DG SANTE. The scenario table was completed and its final version re-discussed with DG SANTE.

## **5. Next steps and next meeting**

Next steps include:

- Finalizing development and testing of spread models
- Run of spread models following scenario table
- Development of alternative options for phytosanitary measures
- Finalizing evidence dossier for EKE on impact and on modelling parameters
- Finalizing work on asymptomatic period

Draft methodology section of Scientific Opinion ready by 21 December.

Next meeting of the Xylella WG is 8 January 2019 about the impact of Xylella on forest species.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 15<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 12 December 2018**

**(Agreed on 18 December 2018)<sup>38</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

David Makowski (Vice-Chair - DM)

Jonathan Yuen (JY)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Alice Delbianco (AD)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

EFSA welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>39</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>40</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during

<sup>38</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>39</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>40</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

### **Discussion on Data and Methodology**

The WG discussed the section of Data and Methodology of the draft opinion on Risk Reduction Options *in planta*. The Pierce's disease website ([www.piercedisease.org](http://www.piercedisease.org)) was consulted to retrieve additional relevant information.

### **Working session**

DM and JY screened additional references retrieved in Pierce Disease website and three project reports published in 2017 and 2018 were selected. DM and JY drafted the section on effectiveness of control measures based on published results considering seven references.

### **Feedback session**

The WG and discussed and checked the drafted opinion and planned next steps and next meeting.

## **5. Next steps and next meeting**

Two references have to be included in the section of effectiveness of control measures based on published results. Conclusions have to be drafted. Next web meeting of the WG will be on 10 January 2019.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 16<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 08 January 2019 (09:00 – 13:00)**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 18 January 2019)<sup>41</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (Chair - SP)

Paolo Gonthier (PG)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>42</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>43</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest

<sup>41</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>42</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>43</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment EFSA-Q-2018-00069.**

##### **Discussion on impact and potential establishment of *Xylella* on forest species**

PG reported the preliminary results of the literature search about the impact of *Xylella fastidiosa* on forest species. Information available is very little and not enough for an Expert Knowledge Elicitation. A report on the impact of *Xylella* on forest species will be included in the Scientific Opinion.

##### **Working sessions**

The WG worked on the preparation of the final draft of the report.

#### **5. Next steps and next meeting**

Finalizing the final draft report.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 17<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 10 January 2019**

**(Agreed on 17 January 2019)<sup>44</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

David Makowski (Vice-Chair - DM)

Jonathan Yuen (JY)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Alice Delbianco (AD), Giuseppe Stancanelli (GS)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

EFSA welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>45</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>46</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during

<sup>44</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>45</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>46</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

##### **Discussion on Data and Methodology**

The WG discussed on additional references to be considered for the assessment, in particular one scientific paper published in December 2018 and the Proceedings of the Pierce's disease Research Symposium (2018).

##### **Working session**

DM and JY screened the above mentioned additional references and drafted the section on effectiveness of control measures based on published results considering those additional references, together with the section on conclusions. The draft opinion was finalised.

##### **Feedback session**

The WG checked the drafted opinion to be sent to the PLH Panel for comments.

#### **5. Next steps and next meeting**

Presentation for the PLH Plenary meeting scheduled for 30<sup>th</sup> January will be prepared. Next web meeting of the WG will be on 8<sup>th</sup> February 2019.



## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 18<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 16-17 January 2019 (10:00 – 14:00)**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 28 January 2019)<sup>47</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP)

Marie-Agnés Jacques (MAJ)

Juan Antonio Navas Cortes (JANC)

Daniel Chapman (DC)

Steven White (SW)

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

Pasquale di Rubbo (PdR)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>47</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>48</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>49</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment EFSA-Q-2018-00069.

DAY 01 (SP, AM, MAJ, JANC, AD)

Each member updated the WG on the activities related to asymptomatic period and potential establishment.

During the working session, the WG worked on the draft of specific sections of the Scientific Opinion and started preparing the PPT presentation for the Panel.

DAY 02 (SP, AM, DC, SW, GG, PdR)

Each member updated the WG on the activities related to long and short spread distance of *Xylella* and the possible scenarios were discussed.

During the working session, the WG worked on the draft of specific sections of the Scientific Opinion and started preparing the PPT presentation for the Panel.

### 5. Next steps and next meeting

EKE on the impact of *Xylella* from 21 to 25 January.

---

<sup>48</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>49</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 19<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 22 January 2019**

**(Agreed on 8 February 2019)<sup>50</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP), Marie-Agnés Jacques (MAJ)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Alice Delbianco (AD),

AMU Unit: José Cortinas Abrahantes (JCA)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

EFSA welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>51</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>52</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during

<sup>50</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>51</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>52</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

##### **Update on activities related to Asymptomatic period**

The WG discussed on the methodology applied for assessing the asymptomatic period of different *X. fastidiosa* subspecies in different host plant species.

##### **Working session**

SP and MAJ analysed the results obtained so far and drafted the section on the assessment of the asymptomatic period in the PRA opinion.

##### **Feedback session**

The WG checked the drafted opinion to be sent to the PLH Panel for comments.

#### **5. Next steps and next meeting**

Presentation for the PLH Plenary meeting scheduled for 30<sup>th</sup> January will be prepared. Next web meeting of the WG will be on 13-14<sup>th</sup> February 2019.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 20<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

Meeting held in EFSA, Parma (Italy), 21 - 25 January 2019

(Agreed on 12 February 2019)<sup>53</sup>

#### DAY 1

##### **Participants:**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Gianni Gilioli (GG), Donato Boscia (Chair - DB), Joao Spotti Lopes (JSL), Miguel Angel Miranda (MAM)
- **Hearing Experts:** Milonas Panagiotis (MP), Nicola Bodino (NB)
- **EFSA:** ALPHA Unit: Alice Delbianco (AD), Andrea Maiorano (AM), Michela Guzzo (MG), Giuseppe Stancanelli (GS), Sara Tramontini (ST), Mart Kinkar (MK). AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (OMS)

##### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

EFSA welcomed the participants.

##### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

##### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>54</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>55</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening.

##### **4. Introduction on the mandate and methodology**

AM and ST presented the mandate on *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment (EFSA-Q-2018-00069) and the methodology of the Expert Knowledge Elicitation (EKE).

<sup>53</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>54</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>55</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## **5. Training on the EKE process**

OMS described the EKE methodology and trained the WG members and Hearing experts on the EKE process.

## **6. EKE on the potential impact on Olive**

AD showed and described the evidence dossier prepared by EFSA. Main evidences were discussed and uncertainties were identified by WG members and Hearing experts. The Working Group performed the expert elicitation to judge on the parameter following the Quartile method of the Sheffield protocol. WG members and Hearing experts reached a common agreement on the result that will be published as Annex in the update of the *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment.

## **DAY 2**

### **Participants:**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Gianni Gilioli (GG), Donato Boscia (Chair - DB), Joao Spotti Lopes (JSL), Federico Dicenta (FD), Miguel Angel Miranda (MAM)
- **Hearing Experts:** Milonas Panagiotis (MP)
- **EFSA:** ALPHA Unit: Alice Delbianco (AD), Andrea Maiorano (AM), Michela Guzzo (MG), Giuseppe Stancanelli (GS), Sara Tramontini (ST), Mart Kinkar (MK). AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (OMS)

### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

EFSA welcomed the participants.

### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>56</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>57</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening.

### **4. EKE on the potential impact on Almond**

MG showed and described the evidence dossier prepared by EFSA. Main evidences were discussed and uncertainties were identified by WG members and Hearing experts. The Working Group performed the expert elicitation to judge on the parameter following the Quartile method of the Sheffield protocol. WG members and Hearing experts reached a common agreement on the result that

<sup>56</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>57</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

will be published as Annex in the update of the *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment.

### **DAY 3**

#### **Participants:**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Gianni Gilioli (Chair - GG), Juan Antonio Navas Cortes (JC), Joao Spotti Lopes (JSL), Domenico Bosco (DB), Miguel Angel Miranda (MAM)
- **Hearing Experts:** Pierfederico La Notte (PLN)
- **EFSA:** ALPHA Unit: Alice Delbianco (AD), Andrea Maiorano (AM), Michela Guzzo (MG), Sara Tramontini (ST), Mart Kinkar (MK). AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (OMS)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

EFSA welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>58</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>59</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening.

#### **4. EKE on the impact on Grapevine**

MG showed and described the evidence dossier prepared by EFSA. Main evidences were discussed and uncertainties were identified by WG members and Hearing experts. The Working Group performed the expert elicitation to judge on the parameter following the Quartile method of the Sheffield protocol. WG members and Hearing experts reached a common agreement on the result that will be published as Annex in the update of the *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment.

### **DAY 4**

#### **Participants:**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Gianni Gilioli (Chair - GG), Juan Antonio Navas Cortes (JC), Joao Spotti Lopes (JSL), Antonio Vicent (AV)

<sup>58</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>59</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

- **EFSA:** ALPHA Unit: Alice Delbianco (AD), Andrea Maiorano (AM), Michela Guzzo (MG), Sara Tramontini (ST), Mart Kinkar (MK). AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (OMS)

### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

EFSA welcomed the participants.

### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>60</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>61</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening.

### **4. EKE on the impact on Citrus sp.**

AD showed and described the evidence dossier prepared by EFSA. Main evidences were discussed and uncertainties were identified by WG members and Hearing experts. The Working Group performed the expert elicitation to judge on the parameter following the Quartile method of the Sheffield protocol. WG members and Hearing experts reached a common agreement on the result that will be published as Annex in the update of the *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment.

## **DAY 5**

### **Participants:**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** Gianni Gilioli (Chair - GG), Juan Antonio Navas Cortes (JC), Joao Spotti Lopes (JSL), Antonio Vicent (AV)
- **EFSA:** ALPHA Unit: Alice Delbianco (AD), Andrea Maiorano (AM), Michela Guzzo (MG), Sara Tramontini (ST), Mart Kinkar (MK). AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz (OMS)

### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

EFSA welcomed the participants.

### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>62</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of

<sup>60</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>61</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>62</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>



Interest<sup>63</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening.

#### **4. Outcome of the EKE process**

The Working Group discussed and reviewed the outcome of the Expert Knowledge Elicitation performed in the previous days. A draft report on the EKE process was prepared.

---

<sup>63</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 21<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 29 January 2019 (09:00 – 18:00)**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 11 February 2019)<sup>64</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (Chair - SP)

Daniel Chapman (DC – Web call)

Marie-Agnés Jacques (MAJ)

Juan Antonio Navas Cortès (JANC)

Steven White (SW)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Gianni Gilioli apologised for absence.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>64</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>65</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>66</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

Review of the PPT presentation for the PLH Open Plenary.

The WG reviewed the PPT to be presented during the PLH Open Plenary. The presentation included updates about each section of the Scientific Opinion (SO) under development.

Timeline, calendar, deadlines for the WG were discussed and finalized.

### **Update from activities**

Full description of short and long spread distance models and preliminary results for the potential establishment and asymptomatic period were discussed.

### **Working sessions**

SP and SW worked on the short/long spread modelling. The outputs reported in the PPT presentation were further discussed. Spread modelling scenarios were discussed.

MAJ worked on the asymptomatic period section. Papers used for data extraction were further checked to identify any inconsistency related to different methodological approaches.

JANC worked on the potential establishment. Classes of suitability were better defined.

### **5. Next steps and next meeting**

---

<sup>65</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>66</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Update from the Working Group on the PRA of *Xylella fastidiosa* at the PLH Open Plenary.

Next meeting to discuss the draft of the Scientific Opinion to be sent to the Panel on 25 February 2019.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 30-31 January and 01 February 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 13 February 2019)<sup>67</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Davide Martinetti (DM)

Gianni Gilioli (GG - Chair)

Michael Maixner (MM)

Miguel Ángel Miranda Chueca (MAM)

- **Hearing experts:**

Crescenza Dongiovanni (CD)

Domenico Bosco (DB)

Maria Saponari (MS)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach-Shulz (OMS - Facilitator)

- **Other participants:**

---

<sup>67</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

The PLH Panel member Wopke van der Werf participated to the elicitation as observer on 01 February 2019.

### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>68</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>69</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Introduction on the mandate and methodology**

AM introduced the mandate *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment (EFSA-Q-2018-00069).

### **5. Training on the EKE process**

The training on the EKE methodologies was performed by OMS on 29 January 2019.

### **6. EKE on *Xylella* biological/epidemiological parameters for modelling purposes**

GG presented the model for the short spread distance being developed within the update of the Scientific Opinion of *Xylella fastidiosa* and the parameters to elicit:

- Vector local spread
- Radial distance of disease spread
- Host susceptibility (transmission)

<sup>68</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>69</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

- Acquisition rate of the vector

For the above mentioned parameters, the WG reviewed the evidence dossier presented by AD and MG and after a discussion on the available data, the elicitation took place following the formal elicitation procedure. Due to lack of time, the following parameters (that were initially included in the elicitation) the WG did not apply the formal elicitation procedure but they were discussed shortly in order to retrieve the main information from expert judgement:

- Growth rate of bacteria/disease in the host
- Adult natural mortality
- Adult mortality due to chemical treatment and weed control
- Prevalence of infected vectors

The Experts reached an agreement on the values for all the parameters and a detailed report will be published as an Annex of the Scientific Opinion.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 23<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 07 and 13 February 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 06/03/2019)<sup>70</sup>**

#### **Participants**

##### **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Joao Roberto Spotti Lopes (JRSL)

##### **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>71</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on

---

<sup>70</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>71</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>



Declarations of Interest<sup>72</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment EFSA-Q-2018-00069.**

##### **Review the section of risk reduction options (RROs) for vector control**

JRSL reported his review on the RRO's for vector control of the Scientific opinion on *Xylella fastidiosa* published by EFSA in 2015.

##### **Working session**

JRSL worked on the draft of the update of RRO's for vector control. At the end of the working session (07<sup>th</sup> February), the first draft was discussed and the main points to develop highlighted.

The 13<sup>th</sup> of February, JRSL presented a second draft of the RRO's for vector control. The draft was discussed and final adjustments are needed.

#### **5. Next steps**

The finalized draft will be reviewed by the WG members.

---

<sup>72</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 24<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Held on 13 - 14 February 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 06/03/2019)<sup>73</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (Chair - SP)

Marie-Agnes Jacques (MAJ)

Juan Antonio Navas Cortes (JN)

Donato Boscia (DB)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

---

<sup>73</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>74</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>75</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment EFSA-Q-2018-00069.**

##### **Update on the different activities**

Each member updated the WG on the progress of his work on the different sections.

The draft of the section related to the asymptomatic period is almost finished and the analyses are completed. The issues and the uncertainties need to be well explained in the SO.

JANC updated the WG on the section related to the Potential Establishment. He presented the methodology, accuracy and performance of the model. Maps must be defined with better thresholds and the methods explained in details in the SO.

##### **Discussion on comments and questions received in the Open Plenary**

Overall the WG received good feedbacks from the Open Plenary. There were comments on the EKE results for the impact of *Xylella* on grapevine, so the WG went through the report and the results were discussed.

##### **Working session**

During the working session:

MAJ worked on the asymptomatic period section to complete the draft.

JANC tested different thresholds to use for the potential establishment, he worked on the map of *Xylella fastidiosa* subsp. *pauca* and completed the Köppen-Geiger maps. He also completed the drafting of the methodology section for the potential establishment.

DB worked on the draft of the RRO's section related to the variability of the germplasm and the agricultural practises.

The deadlines for the drafts and the WG crossing reviews of the different sections of the SO were planned.

---

<sup>74</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>75</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

At the end of the working session, each member reported an update on the work that was done.

## **5. Planning the next WG meetings**

Next meetings (web) to finalize the draft of the SO.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 25<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 20 February 2019, 09.30-13.30**

**(Agreed on 28/02/2019)<sup>76</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

David Makowski (Vice-Chair - DM)

Jonathan Yuen (JY)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

EFSA welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>77</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>78</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during

<sup>76</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>77</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>78</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

##### **Discussion comments received from the Panel**

The WG discussed and reviewed the comments received from the PLH Panel members on the first draft on the scientific opinion on the Effectiveness of *in planta* control measures for *Xylella fastidiosa* EFSA-Q-2019-00045.

##### **Working session**

DM and JY worked on the implementation and finalization of the draft opinion.

##### **Feedback session**

The WG checked the second draft of the scientific opinion to be sent to the PLH Panel for comments.

#### **5. Next steps and next meeting**

Next web meeting of the WG will be on 6<sup>th</sup> March 2019.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 26<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 21 – 22 February 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 13/03/2019)<sup>79</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP)

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

Daniel Chapman (DC)

Steven White (SW)

Alexander Mastin (AIM)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

---

<sup>79</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>80</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>81</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment EFSA-Q-2018-00069.**

The WG members reported their updates and final results on the different activities related to short and long spread modelling and asymptomatic period analysis.

During the working session, the WG members worked on the draft of the spread modelling paragraphs and reviewed other sections of the draft SO.

#### **5. Planning the next WG meetings**

The next meeting will be the 4<sup>th</sup> of March to finalize the SO draft and send it to the Panel.

---

<sup>80</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>81</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>



## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 27<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 04 March 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 13/03/2019)<sup>82</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Marie-Agnes Jacques (MAJ)

Donato Boscia (DB)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>83</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on

---

<sup>82</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>83</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest<sup>84</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment EFSA-Q-2018-00069.**

DB and MAJ reviewed the SO section related to the short and long spread modelling.

---

<sup>84</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 28<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 04 March 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 13/03/2019)<sup>85</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP)

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

Daniel Chapman (DC)

Steven White (SW)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG), Giuseppe Stancanelli (GS)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>86</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on

---

<sup>85</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

Declarations of Interest<sup>87</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment EFSA-Q-2018-00069.**

The WG members went through all the comments received and drafted the conclusion of the sections related to the potential establishment, asymptomatic period, short and long spread modelling.

A first draft of the SO was finalized.

---

<sup>86</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>87</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 29<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 05 March 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 13/03/2019)<sup>88</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Domenico Bosco (DB)

Rodrigo Krugner (RK)

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

Miguel Angel Miranda (MAM)

Pierfederico La Notte (PLN)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

---

<sup>88</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>89</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>90</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. EKE on the potential impact on Grapevine**

GG explained the EKE scenario and assumptions of the process.

The WG members discussed the evidence and the outcomes of the previous EKE on grapevine. RK reported his review and new evidence were also discussed.

The final decision of the WG was to confirm the results of the previous EKE but the reasoning behind the outcomes was better explained.

---

<sup>89</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>90</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 30<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 12-13-15 March 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 04/04/2019)<sup>91</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP)

Steven White (SW)

Daniel Chapman (DC)

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

Juan Antonio Navas-Cortés (JANC)

Marie-Agnès Jacques (MAJ)

Donato Boscia (DB)

Paolo Gonthier (PG)

Alexander Mastin (AIM)

Nicola Bodino (NB)

Anna Simonetto (AS)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>91</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>92</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>93</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment EFSA-Q-2018-00069.**

### **Review of the comments received from the Panel**

AM presented a summary of the comments received from the Panel on the first draft of the SO.

### **Working session on the finalization of the SO draft**

The WG was divided in groups to go through the comments, answer to them and implement the text of the different sections.

Once each group finished the review of the respective sections, they reported their updates to the WG.

Another session of internal reviews of the different sections was performed and the draft was improved. Two more paragraphs were added to the draft SO.

The second draft of the SO was finalized by the WG.

---

<sup>92</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>93</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>



## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 31<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 12-13-15-18 March 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 27/03/2019)<sup>94</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** David Makowski (DM, Vice-Chair), Jonathan Yuen (JY)
- **EFSA:** ALPHA Unit: Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>95</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>96</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

<sup>94</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>95</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>96</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

#### **4. Discussion on effectiveness of *in planta* control measures for *X. fastidiosa***

The WG performed the literature search and screening of scientific papers on avirulent and weakly virulent strains of *X. fastidiosa*. Five additional papers were selected and assessed in the scientific opinion. The WG also discussed and reviewed the comments received from the Panel members. The draft opinion was finalized and implemented.

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 32<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 25-26 March 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 08/04/2019)<sup>97</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:**

Stephen Parnell (SP)

Steven White (SW)

Daniel Chapman (DC)

Gianni Gilioli (GG)

Juan Antonio Navas-Cortés (JANC)

Donato Boscia (DB)

Paolo Gonthier (PG)

Anna Simonetto (AS)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Andrea Maiorano (AM), Alice Delbianco (AD), Michela Guzzo (MG)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>97</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>98</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>99</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Discussion on the *Xylella fastidiosa* Pest Risk Assessment EFSA-Q-2018-00069.**

#### **Review of the comments received from the Panel for the second draft of the SO**

No comments were received from the Panel for the second draft of the SO

#### **Working session on the finalization of the SO draft**

The WG reviewed the general sections of the draft SO (abstract, summary, conclusions).

The final version of the draft SO was finalized.

#### **Review of the presentation for the PLH Plenary**

The WG will go directly through the draft SO text during the PLH Plenary.

---

<sup>98</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>99</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health

### Minutes of the 33<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on *Xylella fastidiosa* pest risk assessment

**Web meeting, 26 March 2019**

**EFSA, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 05/04/2019)<sup>100</sup>**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group (WG) Members:** David Makowski (DM, Vice-Chair)
- **EFSA:** ALPHA Unit: Alice Delbianco (AD)

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>101</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>102</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

<sup>100</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>101</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>102</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

#### **4. Discussion on effectiveness of *in planta* control measures for *X. fastidiosa***

DM discussed and reviewed the last comments received from the Panel members. The draft opinion was implemented and finalized for possible Panel adoption.