

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 21st meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 6-8 November 2017

(Agreed on 1 December 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Rob Smith (Chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Cecilia Berg, Philippe Berny, Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz, Silvia Pieper, Chris Topping, Scott Weir (6-7 November)

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

The agenda was adopted with changes in the order of agenda items.

2. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting held on 9-11 October 2017.

The minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting held on 9-11 October were agreed on 19 October by written procedure.⁴

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The meeting focused on finalisation of the following appendices:

4.1. Finalisation of appendix on dermal exposure.

A few points which were unclear could be clarified in the meeting and a final version was agreed for inclusion as an appendix.

4.2. Finalisation of appendix on risk mitigation options.

The applicability of some suggested risk mitigation options was discussed and agreed.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ Please find [here](#) the link to the minutes published on the EFSA website

4.3. Finalisation of appendix on refinement of risk assessment

A final version was agreed in the meeting.

4.4. Finalisation of appendix on GD development needs

The wording of some of the points needed adjustments.

4.5. Overview table on exposure routes and endpoints

An updated version of the table was included as an Annex to the opinion.

4.6. Points for finalisation in the main text identified prior to the meeting

All points which were identified for finalisation of the main text were discussed and agreed.

5. Any Other Business

Nothing else was discussed.

6. Next meeting(s)

No other meeting is foreseen.

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 20th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 9-11 October 2017

(Agreed on 19 October 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Rob Smith (Chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Cecilia Berg, Philippe Berny, Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz, Silvia Pieper, Chris Topping, Scott Weir

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes in the order of agenda items.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 19th Working Group meeting held on 14 September 2017.

The minutes of the 19th Working Group meeting held on 14 September were agreed on 22 September by written procedure.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Completion of answering the comments received in the public consultation.

Some answers to comments from the public consultation were left open and needed discussion in the group. The group agreed on the answers and amendments of the text in the opinion.

5.2. Appendix on risk mitigation options.

The draft appendix was presented and modified after discussion within the group.

5.3. Appendix on dermal exposure calculation for moving animals

An updated calculation of dermal exposure from contact to soil and plants was discussed. Some changes were suggested for the final version of the appendix.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ Please find [here](#) the link to the minutes published on the EFSA website

5.4. Draft text on reptile testing

The draft text on reptile testing was discussed and suggested to be integrated in the main text of the opinion.

5.5. Overview table on exposure routes and endpoints

It was agreed to expand the table with information for reptiles and to add it as an appendix to the opinion.

5.6. Recent publication on model predicting acute dermal toxicity

An article suggesting a model to predict acute dermal toxicity of plant protection products to terrestrial life stages of amphibians was discussed with regard to its use in a risk assessment context as such a model could potentially be used as a first screening step in the risk assessment. However further work is necessary before such an approach can be recommended as a number of issues were identified among which the representativeness of the limited number of pesticides for other pesticides with different properties.

6. Any Other Business

No other business was discussed.

7. Next meeting

November 06-08, (2 days, starting on 06November at 14:00 and end on 08 November 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 19th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 14 September 2017

(Agreed on 22 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Rob Smith (Chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Cecilia Berg, Philippe Berny (14:30 – 16:45), Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz, Silvia Pieper

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Chris Topping.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes in the order of agenda items.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting held on 6-7 July 2017.

The minutes of the 18th Working Group meeting held on 29 August were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Appendix on dermal exposure calculation from contact to soil and plants while moving.

The different approaches on how to calculate dermal exposure from soil contact were discussed. Further work is necessary to finalise the document. The assumptions and issues for each of the approaches need to be worked out in detail.

5.2. Appendix on possible refinements of a future risk assessment.

The updates of the draft appendix were presented and agreement was reached on the content of the draft appendix.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqamphibian.pdf>

5.3. Overview table with exposure routes and endpoints.

It was agreed to include an overview illustration with the different life stages of amphibians and the coverage with tests in the opinion.

Due to lack of time it was not possible to discuss the appendix on needs for GD development and risk mitigation. The discussion was postponed to the next meeting.

6. Any Other Business

None

7. Next meeting(s)

October 9-11, (2 days, starting on October 9 at 14:00 and end on October 11 at 13:00)

November 6-8, (2 days, starting on November 6 at 14:00 and end on November 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 18th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 29 August 2017

(Agreed on 14 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Rob Smith (Chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Cecilia Berg (14:00-17:00), Philippe Berny, Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz, Silvia Pieper

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Chris Topping.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes in the order of agenda items.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting held on 6-7 July 2017.

The minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting held on 6-7 July were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Appendix on what is needed to develop a Guidance Document

A first draft of the appendix summarising the main issues which need to be addressed before a guidance document can be developed was discussed. Some changes in the text were proposed and new points were added. It was agreed to keep the text short and to focus only on the essential issues for guidance document development.

5.2. Appendix on possible refinements of a future risk assessment.

The draft appendix was discussed and recommendations were made for changes. It was highlighted the appendix should highlight that some of the refinement options proposed for birds and mammals are

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqamphibian.pdf>

not easily applicable for amphibians and reptiles. This will be clarified in the text.

5.3. Appendix with dermal exposure calculations from contact to soil and plants while moving.

Due to lack of time this agenda point could not be discussed. It was agreed to comment in writing and to postpone the discussion to the next teleconference.

6. Any Other Business

The timelines for developing first drafts of the new sections and finalisation of the public consultation report were agreed.

7. Next meeting(s)

September 14, 14:00-18:00 Teleconference

October 9-11, (2 days, starting on October 9 at 14:00 and end on October 11 at 13:00)

November 6-8, (2 days, starting on November 6 at 14:00 and end on November 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 17th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 6-7 July 2017

(Agreed on 29 August 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Rob Smith (Chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Cecilia Berg, Philippe Berny (6 July, 14:00 – 15:00), Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz, Silvia Pieper, Chris Topping

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Philippe Berny for 6 July after 15:00 and for 7 July.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes in the order of agenda items.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting held on 19-22 June 2017.

The minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting held on 19-22 June were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Section on needs for future GD

The main issues which need to be addressed before a guidance document can be developed were identified by the WG.

5.2. Section on possible refinements of a future risk assessment.

It was agreed that a section on possible refinement options should be included in the opinion. As a first step an approach similar to birds and mammals risk assessment could be followed. However, the refinement

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqamphibian.pdf>

options need to be adapted to amphibian and reptile specific risk assessments.

5.3. Inclusion of procurement results

The results of the procurement results will be included in the different relevant sections of the opinion.

5.4. Inclusion of risk mitigation options

Available information on different options to mitigate the risk to amphibians and reptiles will be included in an Appendix to the opinion.

6. Any Other Business

The timelines for developing first drafts of the new sections and finalisation of the public consultation report were agreed.

7. Next meeting(s)

August 29, 14:00-18:00 Teleconference

September 14, 14:00-18:00 Teleconference

October 9-11, (2 days, starting on October 9 at 14:00 and end on October 11 at 13:00)

November 6-8, (2 days, starting on November 6 at 14:00 and end on November 8 at 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 16th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 19-22 June 2017

(Agreed on 06 July 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Rob Smith (Chair), Paulien Adriaanse (19-21 June), Annette Aldrich, Cecilia Berg (19-21 June, half days), Philippe Berny (19 - 21 June), Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz, Silvia Pieper, Chris Topping

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting held on 28 February 2017.

The minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting held on 28 February were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion of comments received in the public consultation on the draft opinion and answers to be provided

Comments which needed discussion within the WG were identified, discussed and answered during the meeting.

Changes to be made in the draft opinion were agreed in the meeting.

A need for additional expertise on pesticide effects on reptiles was identified in the meeting.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqamphibian.pdf>

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meetings

July 6-7 (1day, starting on June 6 at 14:00 and end on June 7 at 13:00)

August 29, 14:00-18:00 Teleconference (new)

September 14, 14:00-18:00 Teleconference (new)

October 9-11, (2 days, starting on October 9 at 14:00 and end on October 11 at 13:00)

November 6-8, (2 days, starting on November 6 at 14:00 and end on November 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 15th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 28 February 2017

(Agreed on 19 June 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (chair), Annette Aldrich, Cecilia Berg, Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz, Silvia Pieper, Chris Topping

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Philippe Berny.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after adding one agenda point for updating the working group on the progress made in the development of a population model for newts.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 10-12 January.

The minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 10-12 January were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. New structure of section 10

A new structure of chapter 10 harmonising the sections on aquatic and terrestrial environment was proposed and agreed by the WG.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqamphibian.pdf>

5.2. Comparison of endpoints based on the data of Crane.

There was no need for discussing this item after including the study with explanatory text in the draft conclusion. It was decided to exchange via e-mail in case further clarification is needed.

5.3. Amendments in the text of section 7.9.

This was a minor point and due to lack of time it was decided to exchange via e-mail in case further clarification is needed.

5.4. Proposal for developing an in-vitro test

It was decided to add the proposal of developing in-vitro test methods for amphibian skin testing.

6. Any Other Business

No discussion on any other business.

7. Next meetings

June 19-22 (3 days, starting on June 19 at 14:00 and end on June 22 at 13:00)

July 6-7 (1day, starting on June 6 at 14:00 and end on June 7 at 13:00)

September 21-22 (1day, starting on Sep. 21 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 22 at 13:00)

October 9-11 (2 days, starting on October 9 at 14:00 and end on October 11 at 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 14th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 10-12 January 2017

(Agreed on 28 February 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Chris Topping (Chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Philippe Berny (11 and 12 January), Kyriaki Machera (10 and 11 January via teleconference), Manuel Ortiz, Silvia Pieper

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Robert Smith and Cecilia Berg.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with including discussion points on proposals for conclusions and recommendations and a presentation on preliminary results from the procurement on the biological relevance of effects on amphibians and reptiles observed in laboratory tests and in the field.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting held on 12-14 December 2016.

The minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting held on 12-14 December were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Presentation of changes from previous version and a first draft of the conclusions and recommendations.

The new text in the sections of coverage of amphibians and reptiles by the current risk assessment, exposure models and in the exposure section was presented. Conclusions and recommendations from each chapter were discussed and agreed.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqamphibian.pdf>

5.2. Environmental relevant exposure quantities (EREQs) .

The relevant exposure quantities from exposure to sediment were discussed and agreed.

5.3. Use of monitoring data.

It was concluded that monitoring data could be useful in order to have more information on occurrence and exposure of amphibians and reptiles in the field.

5.4. Combination of oral and dermal exposure in the risk assessment (addition of exposure or combination of TERs/ETRs).

A way forward on how to combine the oral and dermal risk was discussed and agreed by the WG.

5.5. Presentation of preliminary results of the procurement on the biological relevance of effects on amphibians and reptiles observed in laboratory tests and in the field.

Preliminary results from the procurement were presented to the WG.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meetings

April 24-27 (3 days, starting on April 24 at 14:00 and end on April 27 at 13:00)

June 19-21 (2 days, starting on June 19 at 14:00 and end on June 21 at 13:00)

July 6-7 (1day, starting on June 6 at 14:00 and end on June 7 at 13:00)

September 21-22 (1day, starting on Sep. 21 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 22 at 13:00)

October 9-11 (2 days, starting on October 9 at 14:00 and end on October 11 at 13:00 (in case of adoption of the opinion in September this meeting may not be needed any more)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 12-14 December 2016

(Agreed on 19 June 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Philippe Berny (13 and 14 December), Cecilia Berg, Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz, Silvia Pieper (on 12.12 and 13.12 half day), Chris Topping (on 12.12 and 13.12 half day)

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with including a discussion on additional comments received from PPR panel members.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting held on 7-9 November 2016.

The minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting held on 7-9 November were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. New text on population modelling

The new text was presented and changes to the previous versions were highlighted.

5.2. Amended text on SPGs and where to place the section on population modelling

The section on population modelling was agreed to be taken out from the SPG chapter and included as a separate chapter before the SPG chapter.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqamphibian.pdf>

5.3. General framework

Changes in the general framework scheme were proposed and agreed by the WG.

5.4. Exposure of tadpoles from sediment uptake

This agenda point was not discussed in detail because of lack of time.

5.5. Exposure chapter

The WG discussed the different elements of the exposure assessment goal for different life stages of amphibians and reptiles and the exposure routes and definition of environmentally relevant exposure quantities.

5.6. Inclusion of sublethal effects in the introduction

New text was included in the introduction highlighting the importance of sublethal effects (e.g. reproduction) on the population level.

5.7. Inclusion of the literature review conducted by the study visitor

Data on pond size and occurrence of amphibian species are included in the Appendix of the opinion related to exposure in the aquatic habitat.

5.8. Comments of panel members

The WG discussed the comments received from panel members. The text of the opinion was changed where appropriate and answers to the comments were provided.

6. Any Other Business

The best working procedures and deadlines for finalising the draft opinion for the plenary meeting were discussed and agreed.

7. Next meetings

January 10-12 (2 days, starting on Jan. 11 at 14:00 and end on Jan. 13 at 13:00)

April 24-27 (3 days, starting on April 24 at 14:00 and end on April 27 at 13:00)

June 19-21 (2 days, starting on June 19 at 14:00 and end on June 21 at 13:00)

July 6-7 (1day, starting on June 6 at 14:00 and end on June 7 at 13:00)

September 21-22 (1day, starting on Sep. 21 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 22 at 13:00)

October 9-11 (2 days, starting on October 9 at 14:00 and end on October 11 at 13:00 (in case of adoption of the opinion in September this meeting may not be needed any more)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 7-9 November 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 12 December 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Philippe Berny, Cecilia Berg, Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz, Silvia Pieper, Chris Topping

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes in the order of the agenda items and adding a point on population modelling.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on 19-21 September 2016.

The minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on 19-21 September were agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Update on the body-size and surface calculations for snakes.

A presentation was given on measurement of the body size of *Coronella austriaca* and how this can be used to refine the body surface calculations for snakes.

5.2. Text on general risk assessment framework

A new text was presented and discussed on how to link exposure and effects in the general risk assessment framework.

5.3. Appendix on the pond size and depth.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

The new text describing amphibian habitats i.e. the data on pond size and depth in different regions of Europe was presented. Possible options for getting more data (pond depth) and co-operation with JRC were discussed.

5.4. Feedback from the panel and identification of points where we would like to have further feedback.

The comments and questions of the panel members were discussed and addressed. Further points where the WG members would like to have feedback from the panel were discussed.

5.5. Integration of the new text on amphibian testing

The authors of the chapter agreed the way forward to integrate the new text in the respective chapter.

5.6. Proposal for defining negligible effects.

The WG discussed a definition for negligible effects to be included in the specific protection goal options.

5.7. Population modelling and its use in defining SPGs

The WG discussed the questions which should be addressed by the population model in order to define protection goal options.

6. Any Other Business

The best working procedures and deadlines for finalising the draft opinion for the plenary meeting were discussed and agreed.

7. Next meeting(s)

December 12-14 (2 days, starting on Dec. 12 at 14:00 and end on Dec. 14 at 13:00)

January 10-12 (2 days, starting on Jan. 10 at 14:00 and end on Jan. 12 at 13:00)

April 24-27 (3 days, starting on April 24 at 14:00 and end on April 27 at 13:00)

June 19-21 (2 days, starting on June 19 at 14:00 and end on June 21 at 13:00)

July 6-7 (1day, starting on June 6 at 14:00 and end on June 7 at 13:00)

September 21-22 (1day, starting on Sep. 21 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 22 at 13:00)

October 9-11 (2 days, starting on October 9 at 14:00 and end on October 11 at 13:00. in case of adoption of the opinion in September this meeting may not be needed any more)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 19-21 September 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 7 November 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Philippe Berny, Cecilia Berg, Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz Santaliesra, Silvia Pieper, Christopher Topping

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes in the order of the agenda items and adding an item on a new proposal for the opinion structure.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th and 10th Working Group meetings held on 30 June and 25 August 2016, via Tele-conference.

The minutes of the 9th and 10th Working Group meetings held on 30 June and 25 August 2016 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Update on the oral and dermal exposure assessments including review of body-size and surface for snakes.

The Working group was informed of changes in the calculations and a literature search to find information on body size and skin surface of snakes. This information is required to estimate dermal exposure from direct overspray of snakes.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgamphibian.pdf>

5.2. Text on standard test methods and reproductive endpoints in amphibians

The updated draft text on test methods and reproductive endpoints in amphibians was presented to the WG and briefly discussed.

5.3. Ecology and biology of amphibians and reptiles and sources of exposure.

The draft section was discussed. The experts proposed that the section should focus on aspects which are later on important for the risk assessment. A table would be useful listing the different life stages and predominant exposure routes.

5.4. Toxicological endpoints relevant for amphibians and reptiles.

It was highlighted that this section still needs to be developed.

5.5. Literature review on focal species

The information which should be obtained from literature in order to propose focal species was agreed.

5.6. Modelling section.

The content of the modelling section was discussed. It was agreed to include the basics of population modelling and also an example of an elaborated individual based population model. A proof of concept for calibrating lower tier assessments with the model should be included in the opinion.

5.7. Timing for finalisation and adoption of the draft opinion and public consultation.

A short presentation was given on the timelines and milestones for finalising the draft opinion including a public consultation.

5.8. Meeting dates in 2017.

The meeting dates for 2017 were agreed in line with the timelines for finalisation of the opinion.

5.9. Proposal for new opinion structure

A new structure of the opinion was agreed.

5.10. Elaborating a general framework for risk assessment.

First ideas for a risk assessment framework were discussed.

5.11. Exposure calculations for ponds with data from Spain and UK.

Exposure concentrations in small ponds were calculated based on pond size information from Spain and UK.

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Not Applicable

7. Next meeting(s)

November 7-9 (2 days, starting on Nov. 7 at 14:00 and end on Nov. 9 at 13:00)

December 12-14 (2 days, starting on Dec. 12 at 14:00 and end on Dec. 14 at 13:00)

January 11-13 (2 days, starting on Jan. 11 at 14:00 and end on Jan. 13 at 13:00)

April 24-27 (3 days, starting on April 24 at 14:00 and end on April 27 at 13:00)

June 19-21 (2 days, starting on June 19 at 14:00 and end on June 21 at 13:00)

July 6-7 (1day, starting on June 6 at 14:00 and end on June 7 at 13:00)

September 21-22 (1day, starting on Sep. 21 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 22 at 13:00)

October 9-11 (2 days, starting on October 9 at 14:00 and end on October 11 at 13:00 (in case of adoption of the opinion in September this meeting may not be needed any more)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 25 August 2016, by Tele-conference

(Agreed on 19 September 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (chair), Annette Aldrich, Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz Santaliestra, Silvia Pieper, Christopher Topping

- **Hearing Experts ¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paulien Adriaanse, Cecilia Berg and Philippe Berny.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after adding one agenda point for updating the working group on the progress made in the development of a population model for newts.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 30 June 2016 via Tele-conference.

The agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 30 June 2016 was postponed to the next meeting.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Presentation of oral and dermal exposure calculations

Worst case oral and dermal exposure calculations were conducted for amphibians, reptiles and birds. The aim was to compare the relative importance of oral and dermal exposure pathways, to identify the groups of amphibians and reptiles with the greatest oral and dermal exposure and whether the first tier assessment for birds cover amphibians and reptiles. This exercise should help to focus the efforts of the working group on the most important exposure pathways.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgamphibian.pdf>

5.2. Short update on species selected for the procurement

The final species selection was explained to the working group.

5.3. Presentation on the development of the newt model

Preliminary results of model runs were presented to the working group.

5.4. Tasks for the study visitor

The working group made suggestions on possible tasks for the study visitor which could support the development of the opinion.

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Not Applicable

7. Next meeting(s)

September 19-21 (2 days, starting on Sep. 19 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 21 at 13:00)

November 7-9 (2 days, starting on Nov. 7 at 14:00 and end on Nov. 9 at 13:00)

December 12-14 (2 days, starting on Dec. 12 at 14:00 and end on Dec. 14 at 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 30 June 2016, by Tele-conference

(Agreed on 19 September 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Philippe Berny, Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz Santaliestra, Silvia Pieper, Christopher Topping

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies were received from Cecilia Berg.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 13-15 June 2016.

The minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 13-15 June 2016 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Information needed for exposure assessment in ponds

All the information which was made available to the working group was briefly discussed. It was agreed that the available data will be analysed to derive categories of ponds in agricultural landscapes.

5.2. Selection of species for which detailed information is searched for and which kind of information will be needed

The list of species which were identified in literature as being vulnerable to pesticide impacts was discussed. It was agreed that a

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgamphibian.pdf>

proposal for species for which detailed information will be collected is distributed and agreed by written procedure.

5.3. Update on SPG chapter

Due to time constraints it was not possible to present the updated SPG chapter. It was agreed that the WG members send their comments to the authors of the chapter.

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Not Applicable

7. Next meeting(s)

August 25 (0.5d Teleconference, starting at 9:00 and end at 13:00)

September 19-21 (2 days, starting on Sep. 19 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 21 at 13:00)

November 7-9 (2 days, starting on Nov. 7 at 14:00 and end on Nov. 9 at 13:00)

December 12-14 (2 days, starting on Dec. 12 at 14:00 and end on Dec. 14 at 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 13-15 June 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 30 June)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich (13 June via teleconference), Cecilia Berg (14-15 June), Philippe Berny (14-15 June), Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz Santaliestra, Silvia Pieper (13 and 14 June half day via teleconference), Christopher Topping

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Cecilia Berg (13 June).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes in the order of the agenda items and postponing item 12 (exposure assessment goals) to the meeting of September.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 19 May 2016 via teleconference.

The minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 19 May 2016 were agreed.³

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Presentation on content of chapter 1.4 Ecology/biology of amphibians and reptiles and sources of environmental exposure to pesticides.

An overview was given on the biology and ecology of amphibians and reptiles. It was recommended that the chapter on the biology and ecology of amphibians and reptiles should focus on the most important ecological and biological features of amphibians and reptiles in the context of risk assessment for pesticides and also show the full range of different life history strategies in amphibians and reptiles.

5.2. Text on standard test methods and reproductive endpoints in amphibians

The draft text on test methods and reproductive endpoints in amphibians was presented and discussed by the WG.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgamphibian.pdf>

5.3. Effect assessment endpoints

In addition to mortality and growth it was discussed whether other endpoints would be of use in a future risk assessment scheme. Immune response in amphibians seems to be of particular relevance given that many species are in decline due to some diseases (chytridiomycosis). Sex determination in reptiles seems to be an important endpoint as it is not genetically fixed and dependant on environmental factors (temperature) and might be more easily disturbed by chemical stressors.

5.4. Decision on dermal toxicity endpoints and routes of exposure to be considered as the most relevant ones.

The relative importance of the different exposure routes was discussed. It is suggested that the relative importance should be investigated in depth before a proposal can be elaborated, especially for the effect assessment for adult amphibians in their terrestrial habitats. Such an analysis should be provided before the September meeting.

5.5. Modelling chapter – input needed and how to organise the section on modelling

It was agreed that the chapter should include a section describing how models could be used to explore different aspects which are relevant for setting protection goals.

5.6. Identification of focal species and information to be extracted from literature.

The traits which are of importance for selecting focal species were discussed using the list of traits provided in the EFSA opinion on endangered species and a first selection of species of interest was conducted.

The following agenda items were postponed to the next meetings due to lack of time:

5.7. Introduction to population level effects.

5.8. Life stage table and endpoints

5.9. Feedback on the section on coverage of the risk by aquatic risk assessment and updated chapters 1.3, 1.6, 1.8

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Not Applicable

7. Next meeting(s)

June 30 (teleconference 9-12 CET)

September 19-21 (2 days, starting on Sep. 19 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 21 at 13:00)

November 7-9 (2 days, starting on Nov. 7 at 14:00 and end on Nov. 9 at 13:00)

December 12-14 (2 days, starting on Dec. 12 at 14:00 and end on Dec. 14 at 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 19 May 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 13 June 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Cecilia Berg, Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz Santaliestra, Silvia Pieper, Christopher Topping

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticides Unit: Christopher Lythgo, Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Philippe Berny.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 26-28 April 2016, Vienna.

The minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 26-28 April 2016 were agreed.³

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Information needed for exposure assessment in ponds

The information required to develop exposure assessment was discussed. A list of minimum required information was agreed and available information will be checked whether it contains this information.

5.2. Selection of species for which detailed information is searched for and which kind of information will be needed

Amphibian and reptile species occurring in Europe was presented. This list will enable the selection of species which will be done in the next meeting together the identification of the exact information that is required.

5.3. Next tasks and progress of opinion chapters

The authors of the different chapters updated the group on the progress in writing. Issues were identified for discussion in the next meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgamphibian.pdf>

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Data required for developing an amphibian model

The discussion was postponed to the next meeting.

7. Next meeting(s)

June 13-15 (2 days, starting on June 13 at 14:00 and end on June 15 at 13:00)

June 30 (teleconference 9-12 CET)

September 19-21 (2 days, starting on Sep. 19 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 21 at 13:00)

November 7-9 (2 days, starting on Nov. 7 at 14:00 and end on Nov. 9 at 13:00)

December 12-14 (2 days, starting on Dec. 12 at 14:00 and end on Dec. 14 at 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 26-28 April 2016, Vienna (Austria)

(Agreed on 19 May 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Philippe Berny, Manuel Ortiz Santaliestra, Silvia Pieper, Christopher Topping
Kyriaki Machera has participated via teleconference.

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Cecilia Berg.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes in the order of the agenda items.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 22-24 February 2016, Parma.

The minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 22-24 February 2016 were agreed.³

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Presentation and discussion on exposure assessment goals for amphibian eggs in ponds and exposure of reptile eggs in field

Different options on exposure assessment goals of amphibian eggs in ponds were presented. The need for more detailed information on pond size, depth and spatial distributions of ponds was identified.

Drainage scenarios for estimating exposure of reptile eggs in nest cavities were considered, however other exposure assessments (e.g. total soil concentrations) are considered as more useful.

5.2. Coverage of amphibians and reptiles by the risk assessment for birds and mammals

The current risk assessment for birds and mammals including available endpoints was presented. In order to have a better overview and to identify potential gaps in the assessment it was

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqamphibian.pdf>

decided to produce a table with the endpoints and life stages to be covered in the risk assessment.

The herptox model from US-EPA was discussed. Only the oral route of exposure is covered. Further work is needed to see what aspects can be recommended for the assessment of species occurring in Europe.

5.3. Specific protection goals

Details on the specific protection goals for birds and mammals were presented and different options were discussed for amphibians and reptiles including the approach based on ecosystem services.

5.4. Introduction to population level effects

A presentation was given on the principles of population level effects and how to deal with them. It was concluded that there may be scope in the opinion to elaborate this further as an introduction to more elaborated population modelling.

5.5. Spatial aspects

A presentation was given on spatial aspects to be considered when evaluating population level impacts. It was agreed to include a short subchapter on this in the opinion.

5.6. Presentation of newt model

A population model for crested newt is under development. The principles of the model were presented. It was discussed on how such a model could be used to derive specific protection goals and how to use it in risk assessment in the context of pesticide authorisation.

5.7. Inclusion of capture-recapture studies with amphibians and reptiles in the procurement on amphibians and reptiles

It was discussed what type of information is most useful from the on-going procurement for the development of the current opinion.

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Not Applicable

7. Next meeting(s)

May 19 (teleconference 9-12 CET)

June 13-15 (2 days, starting on June 13 at 14:00 and ending on June 15 at 13:00)

June 30 (teleconference 9-12 CET)

September 19-21 (2 days, starting on Sep. 19 at 14:00 and ending on Sep. 21 at 13:00)

November 7-9 (2 days, starting on Nov. 7 at 14:00 and ending on Nov. 9 at 13:00)

December 12-14 (2 days, starting on Dec. 12 at 14:00 and ending on Dec. 14 at 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Amphibian Reptile Opinion/Pesticides Unit

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 22-24 February 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 26 April 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (Chair), Paulien Adriaanse, Annette Aldrich, Cecilia Berg, Philippe Berny, Kyriaki Machera, Manuel Ortiz, Silvia Pieper

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Chris Topping.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes in the order of the agenda items.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 12-14 January 2016, Parma.

The minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 12-14 January 2016 were agreed.³

5. Hearing Expert (s)

No hearing experts were invited.

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

6.1. Presentation and discussion on the coverage of aquatic life stages of amphibians in the aquatic risk assessment.

The coverage of the risk to aquatic life stages of amphibians by the risk assessment for fish was discussed. Some points were identified which need further elaboration in the current opinion.

6.2. Presentation on endocrine effects in amphibians

An overview was presented on endocrine effects and testing in amphibians.

6.3. Exposure tables

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqamphibian.pdf>

A further elaborated overview on the exposure routes and exposure media for the different amphibian and reptile life stages was presented and discussed. Some modifications were made to the overview table.

6.4. Open fate/exposure questions from December meeting

Issues which were still open from the December meeting were discussed and a way forward to address them was agreed.

6.5. Pyraclostrobin studies

Studies done with the fungicide pyraclostrobin under laboratory and semi-field conditions were presented and the test design and their potential use to make recommendations for testing of terrestrial amphibian life stages were discussed.

6.6. Further elaboration of the different chapters

The structure of the document was revisited and a chapter on the general risk assessment framework was added.

7. Any Other Business

7.1. Not Applicable

8. Next meeting(s)

April 26-28 (2 days, starting on April 26 at 14:00 and end on April 28 at 13:00)

May 19 (teleconference 9-12 CET)

June 13-15 (2 days, starting on June 13 at 14:00 and end on June 15 at 13:00)

June 30 (teleconference 9-12 CET)

September 19-21 (2 days, starting on Sep. 19 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 21 at 13:00)

November 7-9 (2 days, starting on Nov. 7 at 14:00 and end on Nov. 9 at 13:00)

December 12-14 (2 days, starting on Dec. 12 at 14:00 and end on Dec. 14 at 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Amphibian Reptile Opinion/Pesticides Unit

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 12-14 January 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 22 February 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Kyriaki Machera (from 12 January 13:00), Silvia Pieper, Annette Aldrich, Manuel Ortiz, Chris Topping

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Thomas Steeger, Edward Odenkirchen, Amy Blankinship, Melissa Panger, Brian Anderson, Aubee, Catherine, Kristina Garber.

All hearing experts were invited for agenda point 6.5.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Cecilia Berg and Robert Smith.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after including a presentation on the ALMASS program and the discussion on an exposure overview table to the agenda.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 15-17 December 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 15-17 December 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Hearing Expert (s)

No hearing experts were invited.

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

6.1. ALMASS presentation.

The ALMASS program was presented and the WG was informed that it is planned to develop a model for newts in Denmark.

6.2. Extrapolation from fish data to aquatic life stages of amphibians and chronic toxicity

The information provided by US-EPA on the comparison of mortality and growth endpoints was discussed and questions were identified for further clarification.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqamphibian.pdf>

6.3. Exposure tables

A proposal for an overview on the exposure routes and exposure media for the different amphibian and reptile life stages was discussed. The WG concluded that such an overview is useful and should be developed further in the next meeting.

6.4. Identification of further questions to US EPA

Based on the slides received from US-EPA further points for clarification were identified with regard to the Terrestrial Investigation Model (TIM) and the oral exposure model for amphibians and reptiles (T-herps).

6.5. Presentation of US-EPA TIM model and T-herps

A presentation on the US-EPA TIM model was given and questions of the WG related to exposure estimates for amphibian and reptiles were answered by the hearing experts from US-EPA.

6.6. Further elaboration of the different chapters

No time was left to continue drafting the different chapters during the meeting.

7. Any Other Business

7.1. Not Applicable

8. Next meeting(s)

February 22-24 (2 days, starting on Feb. 22 at 14:00 and end on Feb. 24 at 13:00)

April 26-28 (2 days, starting on April 26 at 14:00 and end on April 28 at 13:00)

May 19 (teleconference 9-12 CET)

June 13-15 (2 days, starting on June 13 at 14:00 and end on June 15 at 13:00)

June 30 (teleconference 9-12 CET)

August 23-25 (2 days, starting on August 23 at 14:00 and end on August 25 at 13:00)

September 13-15 (2 days, starting on Sep. 13 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 15 at 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Amphibian Reptile Opinion/Pesticides Unit

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 15-17 December 2015, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 12 January 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (Chair), Kyriaki Machera, Silvia Pieper, Annette Aldrich, Manuel Ortiz, Chris Topping

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Cecilia Berg and Philippe Berny.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after changing the order of the discussion of agenda items.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 24-26 November 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 24-26 November 2015 were agreed on 15 December 2015.

5. Hearing Expert (s)

No hearing experts were invited.

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

6.1. Protection goals options.

The regulatory framework which outlines general protection goals for terrestrial vertebrates was presented. The applicability of the protection goals which were agreed and implemented in the birds and mammals Guidance Document were discussed in view of their applicability for amphibians and reptiles. The possibility to develop protection goal options for population level effects and integration of population dynamic approaches were presented.

6.2. Identification of questions related to EPA exposure models

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

The exposure model developed by US EPA for dermal and inhalation exposure of birds was discussed and considered useful as a basis build on. It was proposed to contact EPA for clarification of details on model parameters and underlying assumptions in their models.

6.3. Identification of questions for fate experts

First questions were identified where specific fate expertise is needed.

6.4. Identification of questions related to the EPA comparison of fish and amphibian long-term tox

Due to lack of time it was not possible to discuss this point.

6.5. How to proceed with the comparison of endpoints

It was agreed that the inclusion of the results of the outsourced project is essential for the quality of the opinion. Different options were discussed on how to ensure that the results of the procurement can be incorporated.

6.6. Further elaboration of the different chapters

The importance of making progress in writing of chapters was stressed.

7. Any Other Business

- 7.1. It was agreed that specific expertise in fate and behaviour of pesticides would be beneficial to address some exposure issues. It is suggested to invite a panel member with fate and behaviour background to the WG.

8. Next meeting(s)

January 12-14 (2.5 days, starting on Jan. 12 at 9:00 and end on Jan. 14 at 13:00)

February 22-24 (2 days, starting on Feb. 22 at 14:00 and end on Feb. 24 at 13:00)

April 26-28 (2 days, starting on April 26 at 14:00 and end on April 28 at 13:00)

May 19 (teleconference 9-12 CET)

June 13-15 (2 days, starting on June 13 at 14:00 and end on June 15 at 13:00)

June 30 (teleconference 9-12 CET)

August 23-25 (2 days, starting on August 23 at 14:00 and end on August 25 at 13:00)

September 13-15 (2 days, starting on Sep. 13 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 15 at 13:00)

Scientific Panel on Amphibian Reptile Opinion/Pesticides Unit

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 24-26 November 2015, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 15 December 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (Chair), Kyriaki Machera, Silvia Pieper, Annette Aldrich, Manuel Ortiz, Philippe Berny, Chris Topping

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Carsten Brühl, Scott Weir, Peter Dohmen

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 4-6 November 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 4-6 November 2015 were agreed on 24 November 2015.

5. Hearing Expert (s)

Dr. Carsten Brühl was invited to answer questions in relation to his research on amphibians in agricultural landscapes.

Dr. Scott Weir was invited to present details of his research on reptiles related to dermal exposure and effects on different life stages and population level effects.

Dr. Peter Dohmen was invited to give a presentation on research on amphibian ecotoxicology conducted by their company. The focus was on effects from dermal toxicity and semi-field testing methods.

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 6.1. Presentation of Peter Dohmen on on-going research initiated by BASF on amphibian ecotoxicology including test methods for dermal uptake and semi-field test methods.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

- 6.2. The questions which need to be addressed for dermal and inhalation exposure of amphibians and reptiles were discussed taking into account available information.
- 6.3. Presentation of Manuel Ortiz on amphibian and reptile testing within the HERPESTI project. The results on toxicity to different life stages of amphibians and reptiles and differences in exposure routes were very useful input for development of the opinion.
- 6.4. Discussion on population level effects / protection goals options for long-term effects.
- 6.5. Toxicological endpoints / sensitive life stages / oral vs dermal vs inhalation exposure

The working group discussed the toxicologically most sensitive life stages and important exposure routes. Overview tables were produced as a starting point for further investigation of these aspects.

7. Any Other Business

- 7.1. Agreement on future meeting dates
- 7.2. Identification of new tasks

8. Next meeting(s)

December 15-17 (2.5 days, starting on Dec. 15 at 9:00 and end on Dec. 17 at 13:00)

January 12-14 (2.5 days, starting on Jan. 12 at 9:00 and end on Jan. 14 at 13:00)

February 22-24 (2 days, starting on Feb. 22 at 14:00 and end on Feb. 24 at 13:00)

April 26-28 (2 days, starting on April 26 at 14:00 and end on April 28 at 13:00)

May 19 (teleconference 9-12 CET)

June 13-15 (2 days, starting on June 13 at 14:00 and end on June 15 at 13:00)

June 30 (teleconference 9-12 CET)

August 23-25 (2 days, starting on August 23 at 14:00 and end on August 25 at 13:00)

September 13-15 (2 days, starting on Sep. 13 at 14:00 and end on Sep. 15 at 13:00)

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Amphibian Reptile Opinion

Held on 3-4 November 2015, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 24 November 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Smith (Chair), Kyriaki Machera, Silvia Pieper, Annette Aldrich, Manuel Ortiz

- **Hearing Experts:**

Carsten Brühl, Scott Weir

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl

Scientific Committee/Emerging Risks Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Chris Topping and Philippe Berny.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Expert (s)

Dr. Carsten Brühl was invited to give a presentation on his research on amphibians in agricultural landscapes.

Dr. Scott Weir was invited to give a presentation on his research on reptiles and effects of pesticides on reptile populations.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1.** Presentation of the mandate, questions to address and available EFSA documents
- 5.2.** Presentation of Carsten Brühl
- 5.3.** Presentation of Scott Weir
- 5.4.** Elaboration of document structure and chapters in the opinion

A preliminary structure of the opinion was agreed and working group members volunteered to take over the main responsibility for drafting different chapters.

6. Any Other Business

- 6.1.** Nomination of vice chair was postponed
- 6.2.** Agreement on future meeting dates will be done by written procedure
- 6.3.** A need to consult fate experts on
- 6.4.** Agreement on the need for a waiver for Scott Weir.

It was noted by the chair of the WG that expertise in reptile ecotoxicology is lacking in the working group. It was agreed by all working group members that the expertise of Scott Weir related to effects of pesticides on reptiles is essential for the development of the opinion and that his

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

active involvement in the working group is essential. Therefore the WG asks for a waiver for the expert Scott Weir.

7. Next meeting(s)

The next meetings will be held on:

- 24-26 November 2015 (2.5 days, starting on November 24 at 9:00 and end on November 26 at 13:00)
- 15-17 December 2015 (2.5 days, starting on December 15 at 9:00 and end on December 17 at 13:00)
- 12-14 January 2016 (2 days, starting on January 12 at 9:00 and end on January 14 at 13:00)