

PESTICIDES UNIT

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on relevance of dissimilar mode of action (response addition) and its appropriate application for cumulative risk assessment of pesticides in food

Held on 19 and 20 November 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 29 11 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Karen Ildico Hirsch-Ernst (chair), Susanne Hougaard Bennekou, Alberto Mantovani, Antonio Hernandez Jerez, Andreas Kortenkamp
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - Pesticides Unit: Andrea Terron, Hans Steinkellner

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Diane Benford

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

Relevance of dissimilar mode of action (response addition) and its appropriate application for cumulative risk assessment (CRA) of pesticides in food ([EFSA-Q-2011-01020](#))

Review of the 5th draft. The draft was reviewed by the working group.

Address comments from the Panel and SC members. All the comments received were discussed and addressed.

Review of the Summary/Abstract and final comments from the Chair. The Summary and Abstract were reviewed by the working group.

Post meeting note. The Opinion was presented by the Chair of the working group at the PPR plenary meeting. The PPR Panel discussed the Opinion and congratulated the Working Group for the result achieved. The PPR Panel unanimously adopted the Opinion.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

PESTICIDES UNIT

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on relevance of dissimilar mode of action (response addition) and its appropriate application for cumulative risk assessment of pesticides in food

Held on 21 (all day) and 22 (morning only) 10 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 30 10 2013)

Participants

• **Working Group Experts:**

- Karen Ildico Hirsch-Ernst (chair)
- Susanne Hougaard Bennekou
- Alberto Mantovani (from 11 a.m. on the first day)
- Antonio Hernandez Jerez
- Andreas Kortenkamp (first day only and up to 3 p.m.)
- Diane Benford

• **Hearing Experts:**

- none

• **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- none

• **EFSA:**

- Pesticides Unit: Andrea Terron, Federica Crivellente, Hans Steinkellner (second day only)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Relevance of dissimilar mode of action (response addition) and its appropriate application for cumulative risk assessment (CRA) of pesticides in food ([EFSA-Q-2011-01020](#))

- A new draft of the Opinion was provided to the members of the Working Group. All the actions agreed at the last Working Group meeting were finalized and were addressed in the new draft of the Opinion.
- The same draft was sent to the PPR Panel members and to the Emerging Risks and Scientific Committee Unit to liaise with the members of the Scientific Committee for comments. No comments were received from the PPR Panel but some comments were received from one Scientific Committee member and were discussed during the Working Group meeting.
- The draft was discussed at the Working Group meeting and new text was added to the Opinion.
- A new draft was provided during the Working Group meeting and the new consolidated version will be submitted to the PPR Panel, to the two peer reviewers of the Opinion committed by the Panel and to the Emerging Risks and Scientific Committee Unit to consult the Scientific Committee. Written comments to the new draft will be considered at the next WG meeting on 19-20 November 2013.

5. Next meeting

19 - 20 November 2013

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

PESTICIDES UNIT

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on relevance of dissimilar mode of action (response addition) and its appropriate application for cumulative risk assessment of pesticides in food

Held on 25 09 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 11 10 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Karen Ildico Hirsch-Ernst (chair), Susanne Hougaard Bennekou, Alberto Mantovani (only in the afternoon), Antonio Hernandez Jerez, Andreas Kortenkamp, Diane Benford (only in the morning).
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - Pesticides Unit: Andrea Terron, Hans Steinkellner

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. ODols were asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Relevance of dissimilar mode of action (response addition) and its appropriate application for cumulative risk assessment (CRA) of pesticides in food (EFSA-Q-2011-01020)

- The first draft of the opinion was provided to the members of the Working Group on September 16th and the content was discussed during the Working Group meeting.
- The new draft will be submitted to the PPR Panel and to the SC Unit to consult the SC with reference to the article 28. Written comments will be discussed at the next WG meeting on 21st-22nd October.

5. Next meeting(s)

- 1) 21st October (all day) - 22nd October (morning only)
- 2) 19-20 November (to be kept as contingency plan)

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

PESTICIDES UNIT

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

**Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group
on relevance of dissimilar mode of action (response addition) and its appropriate
application for cumulative risk assessment of pesticides in food**

**Held on 18th – 19th of June 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 28 06 2013)**

Participants

- **Working Group Experts¹:**
 - Karen Ildico Hirsch-Ernst (chair), Susanne Hougaard Bennekou, Alberto Mantovani, Antonio Hernandez Jerez, Andreas Kortenkamp.
 - Diane Benford has participated for an update of the WG activities via teleconference on June 20th
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - Pesticides Unit: Andrea Terron, Johann Steinkellner, Federica Crivellente

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Relevance of dissimilar mode of action (response addition) and its appropriate application for cumulative risk assessment (CRA) of pesticides in food ([EFSA-Q-2011-01020](#))

A proposal outline of this opinion was presented and agreed by the working group. Discussion was held on the scientific content that should be addressed in the different chapters of the opinion.

5. Next meeting(s)

- 1) 25 September
- 2) 23-24 October
- 3) 19-20 November (to be kept as contingency plan)

6. Any other business

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>