

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Beehave model evaluation

Held on 27-29 April 2015

(Agreed on 29 May 2015)

Participants

Working Group Members:

- Robert Smith (Chair)
- Jos Boesten
- Fani Hatjina
- Jeff Pettis (via telecon.)
- Melissa Reed
- Fabio Sgolastra
- Chris Topping

• Hearing Experts¹:

- Not Applicable

• European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

- Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- **EFSA:**
 - **Pesticide Unit:** Franz Streissl, Csaba Szentes, Maria Arena (27 - 28 April)
 - **Emerging Risks Unit:** Agnès Rortais (27- 28 April)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Chris Topping

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 14 April, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 14 April were agreed on 29 May and published on the EFSA website on 25 June 2015.

5. Scientific topic for discussion

Statement of the PPR Panel on the suitability of the BEEHAVE model for its potential use in a regulatory context and for the RA on multiple stressors in honeybees at the landscape level

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

(EFSA-Q-2014-009040)

5.1 Finalisation of open issues in chapter 3

The questions identified to finalise chapter 3 were discussed and agreed.

5.2 Finalisation of open issues and deletion of parameter evaluation appendix

The proposed changes in chapter 7 and the appendix were agreed.

5.3. Parameter mortality rates

The evaluation of mortality rates was presented and agreed.

5.4. Effect of squadron size on population size

The evaluation of the effect of squadron size was presented and discussed.

5.4 Finalisation of conclusions and recommendations.

The conclusions and recommendations were finalized during the meeting

5.5 Summary

The text on the summary was finalized during the meeting

5.6 Conclusions on the problem formulation

The conclusions on the problem formulation were discussed and a final text was agreed.

6. Next meeting

The next Working Group will be held in June 2015.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Beehave model evaluation

Held on 27-29 April 2015

(Agreed on 29 May 2015)

Participants

Working Group Members:

- Robert Smith (Chair)
- Jos Boesten
- Fani Hatjina
- Jeff Pettis (via telecon.)
- Melissa Reed
- Fabio Sgolastra
- Chris Topping

• Hearing Experts¹:

- Not Applicable

• European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

- Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- **EFSA:**
 - **Pesticide Unit:** Franz Streissl, Csaba Szentes, Maria Arena (27 - 28 April)
 - **Emerging Risks Unit:** Agnès Rortais (27- 28 April)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Chris Topping

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 14 April, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 14 April were agreed on 29 May and published on the EFSA website on 25 June 2015.

5. Scientific topic for discussion

Statement of the PPR Panel on the suitability of the BEEHAVE model for its potential use in a regulatory context and for the RA on multiple stressors in honeybees at the landscape level

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

(EFSA-Q-2014-009040)

5.1 Finalisation of open issues in chapter 3

The questions identified to finalise chapter 3 were discussed and agreed.

5.2 Finalisation of open issues and deletion of parameter evaluation appendix

The proposed changes in chapter 7 and the appendix were agreed.

5.3. Parameter mortality rates

The evaluation of mortality rates was presented and agreed.

5.4. Effect of squadron size on population size

The evaluation of the effect of squadron size was presented and discussed.

5.4 Finalisation of conclusions and recommendations.

The conclusions and recommendations were finalized during the meeting

5.5 Summary

The text on the summary was finalized during the meeting

5.6 Conclusions on the problem formulation

The conclusions on the problem formulation were discussed and a final text was agreed.

6. Next meeting

The next Working Group will be held in June 2015.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Beehave model evaluation

Held on 15 April 2015 by teleconference

(Agreed on 29 May 2015)

Participants

Working Group Members:

- Robert Smith (Chair)
- Jos Boesten
- Fani Hatjina
- Jeff Pettis
- Melissa Reed
- Fabio Sgolastra

• Hearing Experts¹:

- Not Applicable

• European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

- Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- **EFSA:**

Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl, Csaba Szentes

Scientific Committee/Emerging Risks Unit: Agnès Rortais

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Chris Topping

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 10-12 March, Parma

The minutes of the of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 10-12 March were agreed and published on the EFSA website on 13 April 2015.

5. Scientific topic for discussion

Statement of the PPR Panel on the suitability of the BEEHAVE model for its potential use in a regulatory context and for the RA on multiple stressors in honeybees at the landscape level

(EFSA-Q-2014-009040)

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

5.1 Questions for finalising chapter 3 (conceptual model)

The questions related to bee biology were clarified.

5.2 Mite release procedure

The evaluation of the mite release procedure was presented.

5.3. Parameter evaluation chapter

The discussion point was not prepared and therefore not discussed.

5.4. Mortality procedures

The evaluation of the mortality procedures was presented and discussed.

5.5 Outstanding issues needed to finalise other chapters

No outstanding issues were identified

6. Next meeting

The next Working Group will be held in June 2015.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Beehave model evaluation

Held on 10 - 12 March 2015

(Agreed on 13 April 2015)

Participants

Working Group Members:

- Jos Boesten (by teleconference 10-11 March afternoon)
- Fani Hatjina
- Jeff Pettis (by teleconference 10-11 March afternoon)
- Melissa Reed (by teleconference 10-11 March)
- Fabio Sgolastra
- Chris Topping (by teleconference 10-11 March afternoon)

• Hearing Experts¹:

- Not Applicable

• European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

- Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- **EFSA:**

- Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl, Csaba Szentes, Maria Arena (10 March and half day 11 March)
- Scientific Committee/Emerging Risks Unit: Agnès Rortais (10-11 March)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the (1st and 2nd)th Working Group meeting held on 21-23 January 2015, Parma and 25 February, WEB-conference

The minutes of the of the 1st and 2nd Working Group meeting held on 21-23 January 2015, and 25 February were agreed on 11 March 2015.

5. Scientific topic for discussion

Statement of the PPR Panel on the suitability of the BEEHAVE model for its potential use in a regulatory context and for the RA on multiple stressors in honeybees at the landscape level (EFSA-Q-2014-009040)

5 .1 Discussion on the different draft chapters

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

The draft chapters were discussed. The responsible authors received feedback and input to proceed and finalise their draft chapters.

5.2 How to proceed with the evaluation of processes (formal model)

Ten processes were identified which will be checked in depth.

6. Next meetings

April 15 (14:00-18:00) Teleconference

April 27 (9:00-18:00), 28 (9:00-18:00), 29 (9:00-13:00) Parma

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Beehave Model Evaluation

Held on 25 February 2015, by WEB-conference

(Agreed on 12 March 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Robert Smith (Chair), Jos Boesten, Fani Hatjina, Jeff Pettis, Melissa Reed, Fabio Sgolastra, Chris Topping

- **EFSA:**

- Pesticide Unit: Franz Streissl, Maria Arena, Alessio Ippolito, Rachel Sharp
- Scientific Committee/Emerging Risks Unit: Agnès Rortais

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Melissa Reed.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 21-23 January 2015, Parma

Agreement of the minutes of the of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 21-23 January was postponed to the meeting in March.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Feedback on problem formulation

The main questions discussed were related to the structure of the problem formulation and how to integrate all individual points of the problem formulation into the different chapters. It was agreed that not each subpoint of the problem formulation can be addressed in each chapter within the given timeframe. It was agreed to add a paragraph on the validity of the model (boundary conditions) in the problem formulation and to finalise the problem formulation after the draft chapters are available.

5.2 Clarification and discussion on the different chapters

Problems encountered when drafting the different chapters were discussed and solutions were suggested.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 New date for fallback meeting in June

It was agreed to re-schedule the fall-back meeting for 3-4 June (only in case that the panel does not adopt it in the plenary (May 27-28)).

7. Next meetings

March 10 (9:00-18:00), 11 (9:00-18:00), 12 (9:00-13:00) Parma

April 15 (14:00-18:00) Teleconference

April 27 (9:00-18:00), 28 (9:00-18:00), 29 (9:00-13:00) Parma

Scientific Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Beehave Model Evaluation

Held on 21-23 January 2015, Parma

(Agreed on 12 March 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Robert Smith, Jos Boesten, Christopher Topping, Fani Hatjina, Fabio Sgolastra, Melissa Reed
- Jeff Pettis has participated via teleconference on 21 Jan. afternoon

- **EFSA:**

- Pesticides Unit: Franz Streissl, Csaba Szentes, Maria Arena, Rachel Sharp (22 + 23 Jan.), Domenica Auteri (21 Jan. afternoon, 22 Jan. morning),
- Scientific Committee/Emerging Risks Unit: Agnès Rortais, Stefania Volani
- ALPHA Unit: Renata Leuschner (21 Jan.)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Scientific topics for discussion

The mandate and its background were presented. A common understanding of the mandate was reached by the working group. The questions to the model developer were discussed and refined. After the presentation of the model there was an opportunity to ask the hearing expert questions related to the understanding of the model and to receive information needed for the model evaluation.

The working group developed a structure of the statement which follows the opinion on good modelling practice. Responsible authors for the different chapters were identified.

5. Next meetings

February 25 (14:00-18:00) Teleconference

March 10 (9:00-18:00), 11 (9:00-18:00), 12 (9:00-13:00) Parma

April 15 (14:00-18:00) Teleconference

April 27 (9:00-18:00), 28 (9:00-18:00), 29 (9:00-13:00) Parma