



EFSA Working group of Pesticide Residues Unit

Minutes of the 20th meeting of the EFSA Working Group on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides

Held on 15 December 2020, Tele-meeting

(Agreed on 18 December 2020)

Participants

- Working Group external Members: Tamara Coja, Kyriaki Machera and Elena Menegola
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
The Pesticide Peer review unit: Federica Crivellente (Chair) and Anna Castoldi
The Pesticide Residues unit: Luc Mohimont
The Evidence Management Unit: Sara Levorato
The Scientific Committee and Emerging Risk Unit: Jean-Lou Dorne
- Others:
Not Applicable



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes at the beginning of the meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 CRA for cranio-facial malformations ([EFSA-Q-2020-00752](#))

Based on the initial findings in toxicological studies related to cranio-facial malformations, the WG identified 2 types of cranio-facial malformations that need to be distinguished in the perspective of cumulative risk assessment: cranio-facial alterations due to abnormal skeletal development and head alterations not due to abnormal skeletal development. The respective indicators and a strategy to elaborate a cumulative assessment group regarding cranio-facial alterations due to abnormal skeletal development were discussed.

The Working Group also agreed that this grouping approach was complying to the draft Scientific Opinion/Guidance of the scientific Committee on scientific criteria for grouping chemicals into assessment groups.

5. Next meeting(s)

22 January 2021

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



EFSA Working group of Pesticides Residues Unit

Minutes of the 19th meeting of the EFSA Working Group on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides

Held on 26 November 2020, Tele-meeting

(Agreed on 08 December 2020)¹

Participants

- Working Group external Members: Tamara Coja, Kyriaki Machera and Elena Menegola
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
The Pesticide Peer review unit: Federica Crivellente (Chair) and Anna Castoldi
The Pesticides Residues unit : Luc Mohimont
The Evidence Management Unit: Sara Levorato
- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes at the beginning of the meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 CRA for cranio-facial malformations ([EFSA-Q-2020-00752](#))

EFSA introduced the project and its place in the overall workplan in the area of cumulative risk assessment of pesticides. The approach to establish cumulative assessment group was presented and it was discussed how to apply it to cranio-facial malformations. AS first step, it was agreed to compile a list of findings in toxicological studies related to cranio-facial malformations, considering also the WHO report of a WHO Registry Meeting on Craniofacial Anomalies (2001).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

15 December 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



EFSA Working group of Pesticides Residues Unit

Minutes of the 18th meeting of the EFSA Working Group on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides for their effects on the nervous system and the thyroid

Held on 20 November 2020, Tele-meeting

(Agreed on 27 November 2020)¹

Participants

■ Working Group external Members:

Judy Choi, Tamara Coja, Andrew David Hart, Antonio Hernández-Jerez, Kyriaki Machera, Alexandra Mienne, Marloes Schepens and Anneli Widenfalk

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

The Pesticides Residues unit : Maria Anastassiadou, Samira Jarrah and Luc Mohimont (chair)

The Pesticide Peer review unit: Federica Crivellente and Iris Mangas

The Evidence Management Unit: Bruno Dujardin and Sara Levorato

■ Others:

Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes at the beginning of the meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 CRA for chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition (EFSA-Q-2020-00411)

The participants discussed and reached a consensus by expert knowledge elicitation techniques on the impact of dependencies between uncertainties pertaining to exposure and toxicology and differences between populations on the assessment of cumulative risks of chronic acetyl cholinesterase inhibition.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

Not Applicable

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



EFSA Working group of Pesticides Residues Unit

Minutes of the 17th meeting of the EFSA Working Group on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides for their effects on the nervous system and the thyroid

Held on 30 September 2020, Tele-meeting

(Agreed on 05 October 2020)¹

Participants

- Working Group external Members:
Andrew David Hart, Alexandra Mienne, Marloes Schepens and Anneli Widenfalk
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
The Pesticides Residues unit : Maria Anastassiadou, Samira Jarrah and Luc Mohimont (chair)
The Evidence Management Unit: Bruno Dujardin
- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes at the beginning of the meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 CRA for chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition (EFSA-Q-2020-00411)

The participants discussed and reached a consensus by expert knowledge elicitation techniques on the combined impact of uncertainties pertaining to exposure on the assessment of cumulative risks of chronic acetyl cholinesterase inhibition.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

20 November 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

EFSA Working group of Pesticides Residues Unit

Minutes of the 16th meeting of the EFSA Working Group on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides for their effects on the nervous system and the thyroid

Held on 29 October 2020, Tele-meeting

(Agreed on 05 October 2020)¹

Participants

- Working Group external Members:
Judy Choi, Tamara Coja, Andrew David Hart, Antonio Hernandez-Jerez and Kyriaki Machera
- Hearing Experts:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
The Pesticides Residues unit: Luc Mohimont (chair) and Maria Anastassiadou
The Pesticides Peer Review unit: Iris Manga
- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes at the beginning of the meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 CRA for chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition (EFSA-Q-2020-00411)

The participants discussed and reached a consensus by expert knowledge elicitation techniques on the combined impact of uncertainties pertaining to toxicology on the assessment of cumulative risks of chronic acetyl cholinesterase inhibition.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

20 November 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

EFSA Working group of Pesticides Residues Unit

Minutes of the 15th meeting of the EFSA Working Group on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides for their effects on the nervous system and the thyroid

Held on 08 July 2020, Tele-meeting

(Agreed on 14 July 2020)¹

Participants

- Working Group external Members:
Andrew David Hart, Alexandra Mienne, Marloes Scheppens and Anneli Widenfalk
- Hearing Experts:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
The Pesticides Residues unit : Maria Anastassiadou, Samira Jarrah and Luc Mohimont (chair)
The Data Team (exposure): Bruno Dujardin
- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes at the beginning of the meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 CRA for chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition (EFSA-Q-2020-00411)

The participants discussed and reached consensus by expert knowledge elicitation techniques on the individual impact of most of the sources of uncertainty pertaining to exposure and regarding the assessment of the cumulative risks of chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition. For some sources of uncertainty, it was agreed to collect additional information.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

29 September 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

EFSA Working group of Pesticides Residues Unit

Minutes of the 14th meeting of the EFSA Working Group on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides for their effects on the nervous system and the thyroid

Held on 07 July 2020, Tele-meeting

(Agreed on 14 July 2020)¹

Participants

- Working Group external Members:
Judy Choi, Tamara Coja, Andrew David Hart, Antonio Hernandez-Jerez and Kyriaki Machera
- Hearing Experts:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
The Pesticides Residues unit: Maria Anastassiadou and Luc Mohimont (chair)
The Pesticides Peer Review unit: Alfonso Lostia and Iris Manga
- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes at the beginning of the meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 CRA for chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition (EFSA-Q-2020-00411)

The participants discussed and reached consensus by expert knowledge elicitation techniques on the individual impact of most of the sources of uncertainty pertaining to toxicology and regarding the assessment of the cumulative risks of chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition. For some sources of uncertainty, it was agreed to collect additional information.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

08 July 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



EFSA Working group of Pesticides Residues Unit

Minutes of the 13th meeting of the EFSA Working Group on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides for their effects on the nervous system and the thyroid

Held on 08 June 2020, Tele-meeting

(Agreed on 19 June 2020)¹

Participants

- Working Group external Members:
Judy Choi, Tamara Coja, Andrew David Hart, Antonio Hernandez-Jerez and Kyriaki Machera
- Hearing Experts:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
The Pesticides Residues unit: Maria Anastassiadou and Luc Mohimont (chair)
The Pesticides Peer Review unit: Alfonso Lostia and Iris Manga
- Others:

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.



Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes at the beginning of the meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 CRA for chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition (EFSA-Q-2020-00411)

The participants discussed the sources of uncertainty pertaining to toxicology and affecting the assessment of the cumulative risks of chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

07 July 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



EFSA Working group of Pesticides Residues Unit

Minutes of the 12th meeting of the EFSA Working Group on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides for their effects on the nervous system and the thyroid

Held on 03 June 2020, Tele-meeting

(Agreed on 18 June 2020)¹

Participants

- Working Group external Members:
Andrew David Hart, Alexandra Mienne, Marloes Scheppens and Anneli Widenfalk
- Hearing Experts:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
The Pesticides Residues unit : Maria Anastassiadou, Samira Jarrah and Luc Mohimont (chair)
The Data Team (exposure): Bruno Dujardin
- Others:
Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes at the beginning of the meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 CRA for chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition (EFSA-Q-2020-00411)

The participants discussed the sources of uncertainty pertaining to exposure and affecting the assessment of the cumulative risks of chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

08 June 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

EFSA Working group of Pesticides Residues Unit

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the EFSA Working Group on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides for their effects on the nervous system and the thyroid

Held on 27 May 2020, Tele-meeting

(Agreed on 15 June 2020)¹

Participants

- Working Group external Members:
Judy Choi, Tamara Coja, Andrew David Hart, Antonio Hernandez-Jerez and Kyriaki Machera
- Hearing Experts:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
The Pesticides Residues unit: Luc Mohimont (chair) and Maria Anastassiadou
The Pesticides Peer Review unit: Alfonso Lostia and Iris Manga
- Others:

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.



Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes at the beginning of the meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 CRA for chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition (EFSA-Q-2020-00411)

The participants discussed cumulative assessment group used to perform the assessment of chronic acetylcholinesterase inhibition, which was established in the EFSA scientific report on the establishment of cumulative assessment groups of pesticides for their effects on the nervous system published in September 2019.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6. Next meeting(s)

03 June 2020



EFSA Working group of Pesticides Residues Unit

Minutes of the 18th meeting of the EFSA working group on the establishment of cumulative assessment groups for effects on the nervous system and the thyroid and of the 10th meeting of the EFSA Working Group on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides for their effects on the nervous system and the thyroid (joint meeting)

Held on 27-29 January 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 07 February 2020)¹

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Andrew David Hart, Susanne Hougaard-Bennekou, Bernadette Ossendrop, Antonion Hernandez-Jerez, Gerrit Wolterink, Peter Craig (29 January) and Carsten Kneuer (27 and 29 January)

■ Hearing Experts:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.



- EFSA:
The Pesticides Residues unit: Luc Mohimont (chair)
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies were received from Bruno Dujardin.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes at the beginning of the meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 EFSA Scientific reports on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides residues regarding 2 acute effects of the nervous system and 2 chronic effects on the thyroid ([EFSA-Q-2018-00345](#) and [EFSA-Q-2018-00346](#))

The Working Group considered the responses to the comments submitted during the public consultation and discussed new versions of the 2 scientific reports, updated following these comments.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



5. Any Other Business

5.1. Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

Not applicable



EFSA Working group of Pesticides Residues Unit

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the EFSA Working Group on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides for their effects on the nervous system and the thyroid

Held on 18-19 December 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 14 January 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Andrew David Hart, Susanne Bennekou, Bernadette Ossendrop
- Hearing Experts:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Pesticide Residues unit: Luc Mohimont (chair)
- Others:
Not Applicable



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Bruno Dujardin.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

EFSA Scientific reports on the cumulative risk assessment of pesticides residues regarding 2 acute effects of the nervous system and 2 chronic effects on the thyroid ([EFSA-Q-2018-00345](#) and [EFSA-Q-2018-00346](#))

The Working Group considered the outcome of the public consultation on the 2 draft scientific reports, which closed on 15 November 2019. About 200 comments were submitted by about 20 organisations.

The Working Group had a first exchange of views on how to respond to the comments and identified the appropriate changes to the documents in view of their final publication.

5. Any Other Business

5.1. Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

27-29/01/2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf