



Scientific Panel on Nutrition, Novel Foods and Food Allergens

MINUTES OF THE 10TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON SUGARS

Held on 9-10th April 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 16 April 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Roger Adan, Pauline Emmett, Carlo Galli, Mathilde Kersting, Paula Moynihan, Luc Tappy, Marco Vinceti (chair)

■ Hearing Experts:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Stephanie Bodenbach (SANTE E1)

■ EFSA:

AMU Unit: Elisa Aiassa, Andrea Baù, Valeria Ercolano, Laura Martino

NUTRI Unit: Ester Artau Cortacans, Agnès De Sesmaisons-Lecarrè, Charlotte Nielsen¹, Silvia Valtueña Martínez

DATA Unit: Davide Arcella, Zsuzsanna Horvath,

■ Others:

Not Applicable

¹ Only on 10 April 2019



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes, except for the order in which agenda items were discussed on the second day.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 22-23 January 2019, Parma.

The [minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting](#) held on 22-23 January 2019 were agreed by written procedure on 28 January 2019.

5. Scientific topic for discussion [http:](#)

5.1. Draft Scientific opinion on the Tolerable Upper Intake Level of dietary sugars (EFSA-Q-2016-00414)

5.1.1. Presentation and discussion on the current status of data extraction of intervention studies

There was an introduction on the progress made in relation to the data extraction from the intervention studies included in the systematic review for metabolic disease-related outcomes, which is almost complete. Decisions were made to exclude some studies for which the data available are not suitable for the assessment.

5.1.2. Presentation and discussion on data analysis of intervention studies

The WG was informed that the data analysis of the intervention studies has started. The results will be presented and discussed at the next WG meeting.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



5.1.3. Discussion on the appraisal of intervention studies

The WG shared and discussed the pilot appraisals of intervention studies done before the meeting and agreed on the outcomes.

There was a presentation on how the appraisal forms will look like in DistillerSR® tool in order for the WG members to be able to appraise the studies before the next WG meeting.

5.1.4. Studies on dental caries

The WG was informed about the current status of systematic review on dental caries-related outcomes. Decisions were taken to contact authors for individual data to perform dose-response analyses on homogeneous endpoints where possible.

5.1.5. Presentation on the food composition database for total sugars

The WG was informed about the on-going work on the food composition database for total sugars. First estimates of intake data from the EFSA's Comprehensive Food Consumption Database were presented and discussed.

5.1.6. Presentation and discussion on data extraction of observational studies

The WG discussed issues related to the quantification of sugars intake from different sources in the observational studies included after the full-text screening and proposed some solutions in preparation for the data extraction.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

The next meeting will take place on 12-13 June 2019 in Parma.

Scientific Panel on Nutrition, Novel Foods and Food Allergens

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on Sugars

Held on 22-23 January 2019

(Agreed on 28 January 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Roger Adan, Pauline Emmett, Carlo Galli, Mathilde Kersting, Marco Vinceti (Chair)

- **Hearing Experts: Not Applicable**

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

None

- **EFSA:**

NUTRI Unit: Lucia Fabiani, Charlotte Nielsen¹, Silvia Valtueña Martínez

AMU Unit: Elisa Aiassa, Laura Martino¹

DATA Unit: Davide Arcella², Zsuzsanna Horvath²

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paula Moynihan, Luc Tappy, Irene Mattisson, Bryndís Eva Birgisdóttir, Stephanie Bodenbach

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ Only on 22 January 2019; ² Only on 23 January 2019

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group (WG) members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Draft Opinion on the scientific opinion on the Tolerable Upper Intake Level of dietary sugars (EFSA-Q-2016-00414)

4.2. Data extraction for intervention and observational studies

There was an introduction on the progress made in relation to the systematic reviews conducted in relation to this project. The full-text screening has been completed for studies on metabolic diseases and dental caries, and the preparatory work for the data extraction is ongoing.

The WG considered the endpoints of interest (disease and intermediate factors) investigated in the intervention and observational studies included in the assessment, and discussed about the endpoints that could be used for dose-response analyses.

The WG further discussed issues related to the quantification of the sugars intake from different sources in the observational studies included after full-text screening, and proposed some solutions in preparation for the data extraction.

4.3. Discussion on the appraisal of individual studies

The WG performed a pilot appraisal on a set of intervention studies, following the OHAT/NTP RoB tool customised for human controlled trials, as foreseen in the protocol.

4.3. Presentation on the current status of the intake assessment

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

The WG was informed about the on-going work on the food composition database for total sugars. The outlier analysis and data cleaning are almost complete.

5. Next meeting

The next meeting will take place on 9-10 April 2019 in Parma.

Scientific Panel on Nutrition, Novel Foods and Food Allergens

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Sugars

Held on 22-23 November 2018

(Agreed on 3 December 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Roger Adan, Pauline Emmett, Carlo Galli, Mathilde Kersting, Paula Moynihan, Luc Tappy, Marco Vinceti (Chair)

- **Hearing Experts:** Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

None

- **EFSA:**

NUTRI Unit: Lucia Fabiani, Silvia Valtueña Martínez, Charlotte Nielsen

AMU Unit: Elisa Aiassa¹, Laura Martino¹

DATA Unit: Davide Arcella, Zsuzsanna Horvath²

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Bryndís Eva Birgisdóttir, Irene Mattisson, Stephanie Bodenbach

2. Adoption of agenda

4.1. Item 6 (Discussion on the appraisal of individual studies) was withdrawn from the Agenda. The agenda was adopted with this change.

¹ Only on 22 November 2018

² Only on 23 November 2018

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group (WG) members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Draft Opinion on the scientific opinion on the Tolerable Upper Intake Level of dietary sugars (EFSA-Q-2016-00414)

4.2. Discussion on data extraction

There was an introduction on the progress made in relation to the systematic reviews conducted in relation to this project. The full-text screening has been almost completed both for metabolic diseases and dental caries studies.

The WG discussed issues mainly related to how sugars intake has been assessed, calculated and reported in the observational studies included after full-text screening, and proposed some solutions in preparation of the data extraction.

The WG also discussed and solved some issues related to the data available from the intervention studies included after full-text screening. The discussion focussed mainly on the dietary conditions in which the studies were conducted, the type of interventions and comparators, and the outcome variables reported. A preliminary set of data to extract was also discussed.

4.2 Full-text screening: feedback from the WG/NUTRI Unit and discussion on the remaining conflicts among reviewers

The WG discussed and solved the remaining conflicts found among reviewers during the full text screening of papers (done in duplicate) for the projects on metabolic diseases and dental caries.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4.3. Presentation on the current status of the intake assessment

The WG was informed about the on-going work on the food composition database for total sugars, in particular on the outlier analysis and data cleaning.

4.4. AOB

The WG was informed about the amount and type of data received on the questionnaires sent in September to European Countries regarding national food consumption surveys and national food composition data on total, added and free sugars, and on national dietary recommendations on the amount of sugars (whether total, added or free) to be consumed in the diet. Answers from 25 countries (out of 37 contacted) were received.

5. Next meeting

The next meeting will take place on 22-23 January 2019 in Parma.

Scientific Panel on Nutrition, Novel Foods and Food Allergens

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Sugars

Held on 2-3 October 2018

(Agreed on 5 October 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Roger Adan, Pauline Emmett, Carlo Galli¹, Mathilde Kersting, Luc Tappy, Marco Vinceti (Chair)

- **Hearing Experts:** Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Bryndís Eva Birgisdóttir (University of Iceland) (via webconference), Irene Mattisson (National Food Agency, Sweden)

- **EFSA:**

AMU Unit: Laura Martino, Andrea Baù¹

NUTRI Unit: Lucia Fabiani, Silvia Valtueña Martínez

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paula Moynihan.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

¹ Only on 2 October 2018

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group (WG) members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Draft Opinion on the scientific opinion on the Tolerable Upper Intake Level of dietary sugars (EFSA-Q-2016-00414)

There was an introduction on the progress made in relation to the systematic reviews conducted in relation to this project. Two separate literature searches were performed: one for metabolic disease-related outcomes and the second for dental caries. The title and abstract screening has been completed for both projects.

The WG discussed and solved conflicts found during the full text screening of papers related to metabolic disease outcomes (done in duplicate). The principles and the tool that will be used for the critical appraisal of individual studies were also discussed. The group was informed about the on-going work on the food composition database for total sugars.

5. Next meeting

The next meeting will take place on 22-23 November 2018 in Parma.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Scientific Panel on Dietetic Products, Nutrition and Allergies

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Sugars

Held on 15-16 May 2018

(Agreed on 22 May 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Roger Adan, Pauline Emmett, Mathilde Kersting, Paula Moynihan, Luc Tappy, Marco Vinceti (Chair)

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Bryndís Eva Birgisdóttir (University of Iceland) (via webconference),
Irene Mattisson (National Food Agency, Sweden)

- **EFSA:**

AMU Unit: Ana García, Irene Muñoz Guajardo

DATA Unit: Davide Arcella

NUTRI Unit: Lucia Fabiani, Andrea Germini, Silvia Valtueña Martínez

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Monty Duggal.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Outcome of the public consultation on the draft protocol for free sugars ([EFSA-Q-2017-00828](#))

The Working Group continued the discussion of the comments received during the public consultation and proceeded with the drafting of the technical report that will address the comments received. All the sections of the document were discussed. A new version of the technical report will be circulated for a final round of comments before the document is presented to the next NDA Panel plenary meeting.

5. Protocol for the assessment of the mandate on free sugars ([EFSA-Q-2017-00646](#))

The working group discussed the revisions of the draft protocol and agreed on the changes proposed following the comments received during the public consultation. All sections of the document were discussed. A new version of the draft protocol will be distributed for a final round of comments before the document is presented to the next NDA Panel plenary meeting.

6. Workplan 2018-2019

The WG discussed and approved timelines and task allocations for the activities to be carried out during the next year.

7. Next meeting

The next meeting will take place on 2-3 October 2018 in Parma.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Dietetic Products, Nutrition and Allergies

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Sugars

Held on 20-21 March 2018

(Agreed on 26 March 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Roger Adan, Pauline Emmett, Mathilde Kersting, Paula Moynihan, Luc Tappy (day 1), Marco Vinceti (Chair)

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Bryndís Eva Birgisdóttir (University of Iceland) (via webconference),
Stephanie Bodenbach (DG SANTE), Irene Mattisson (National Food Agency, Sweden)

- **EFSA:**

AMU Unit: Ana García, Irene Muñoz Guajardo

DATA Unit: Davide Arcella, Horwath Zsuzsanna

NUTRI Unit: Andrea Germini, Silvia Valtueña Martínez

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Monty Duggal.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Outcome of the public consultation on the draft protocol for free sugars ([EFSA-Q-2017-00828](#))

The members of the working group were informed about the comments received during the public consultation on the draft protocol for the assessment of free sugars that closed on 4th March, and on the feedback received from the participants to the related Technical meeting with stakeholders held in Brussels on 13th February.

The Working Group discussed the comments received and started the preparation of the technical report that will address all the comments received during the public consultation process. A new version of the technical report will be circulated in preparation for the next working group meeting.

5. Protocol for the assessment of the mandate on free sugars ([EFSA-Q-2017-00646](#))

The working group discussed which parts of the protocol will need to be revised based on the comments received. A new version of the draft protocol will be circulated in preparation for the next working group meeting.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will take place on 15-16 May 2018 in Parma.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Dietetic Products, Nutrition and Allergies

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Added sugars

Held on 30 November 2017

(Agreed on 7 December 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Roger Adan, Pauline Emmett, Mathilde Kersting, Paula Moynihan, Luc Tappy, Marco Vinceti (Chair)

- **Hearing experts:**

Andy Hart

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Bryndís Eva Birgisdóttir (University of Iceland), Irene Mattisson (National Food Agency, Sweden)

- **EFSA:**

AMU Unit: Ana García

DATA Unit: Davide Arcella

NUTRI Unit: Andrea Germini, Silvia Valtueña Martínez

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Stephanie Bodenbach (DG SANTE) and Monty Duggal.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Protocol for the assessment of the mandate on free sugars ([EFSA-Q-2017-00646](#))

The members of the Working Group discussed the new version of the draft protocol for the assessment. Comments from the experts and from the mandate requestors were discussed and the document amended accordingly.

Andy Hart supported the discussion on the methods for integrating and weighing the evidence to set a level of intake for free sugars and on how to evaluate the uncertainty in the body of the evidence that will be gathered.

A new version of the draft protocol will be circulated via email for final comments before the document will be presented to the EFSA NDA Panel members for possible endorsement for public consultation.

5. Next meeting

The next meeting will take place on 20-21 March 2018 in Parma.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Dietetic Products, Nutrition and Allergies

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Added sugars

Held on 9-10 November 2017

(Agreed on 17 November 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Roger Adan, Mathilde Kersting, Paula Moynihan, Luc Tappy, Marco Vinceti (Chair)

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Bryndís Eva Birgisdóttir (University of Iceland), Stephanie Bodenbach (DG SANTE), Irene Mattisson (National Food Agency, Sweden)

- **EFSA:**

AMU Unit: Ana García, Irene Munoz Guajardo

DATA Unit: Davide Arcella, Laura Kirwan

NUTRI Unit: Andrea Germini, Silvia Valtueña Martínez

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Monty Duggal and Pauline Emmett.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Protocol for the assessment of the mandate on free sugars ([EFSA-Q-2017-00646](#))

The members of the Working Group discussed the new version of draft protocol for the assessment, which incorporates all the contributions and comments received. The protocol will be further revised following the decisions taken at the meeting and a new version will be presented at the next meeting.

5. Next meeting

The next meeting will take place on 30th November 2017 via web-conference.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Dietetic Products, Nutrition and Allergies

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Added sugars

Held by WEB-conference on 2 October 2017

(Agreed on 5 October 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Roger Adan, Pauline Emmett, Paula Moynihan, Luc Tappy, Marco Vinceti (Chair)

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Stephanie Bodenbach (DG SANTE), Irene Mattisson (National Food Agency, Sweden)

- **EFSA:**

AMU Unit: Ana García, Irene Munoz Guajardo

DATA Unit: Davide Arcella

NUTRI Unit: Valeriu Curtui, Andrea Germini, Silvia Valtueña Martínez

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Monty Duggal, Mathilde Kersting and Bryndís Eva Birgisdóttir (University of Iceland).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Protocol for the assessment of the mandate on added sugars ([EFSA-Q-2017-00646](#))

The members of the Working Group discussed the new version of draft protocol for the assessment, which incorporates all the contributions and comments received. The protocol will be further revised following the decisions taken at the meeting and a new version will be presented at the next meeting.

5. Next meeting

The next meeting will take place on 9-10 November 2017 in Parma.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Dietetic Products, Nutrition and Allergies

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Added sugars

Held on 18-19 July 2017, Parma, Italy

(Agreed on 24 July 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Monty Duggal, Pauline Emmett, Mathilde Kersting, Paula Moynihan, Luc Tappy, Marco Vinceti (Chair)

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Stephanie Bodenbach (DG SANTE)

- **EFSA:**

AMU Unit: Ana García

DATA Unit: Davide Arcella

LA Unit: Simone Gabbi

NUTRI Unit: Valeriu Curtui, Andrea Germini, Silvia Valtueña Martínez

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Roger Adan and Irene Mattisson (National Food Agency, Sweden).

2. Adoption of agenda