

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 35th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held in Brussels on 27 June 2018

(Agreed on 13 July 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Leon Brimer, Kevin Chipman, Karl-Heinz Engel (by teleconference), Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice-Chair) Wim Mennes (Chair) and Gerard Mulder.

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino, Giorgia Vianello and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 34th Working Group meeting held in Parma on 15 May 2018 by teleconference.

The minutes of the 34th Working Group meeting held in Parma on 15 May 2018 were agreed by written procedure on 1 June 2018³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.411 (EFSA-Q-2015-00820) – 2-(4-Methylphenoxy)-N-(1H-pyrazol-3-yl)-N-(thiophen-2-ylmethyl)acetamide [FL-no: 16.133]

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming Panel meeting.

5.2. (EFSA-Q-2018-00251) 2-Hexyl-2-decenal – (EFSA-Q-2018-00409) 2-octyl-2-dodecenal and (EFSA-Q-2018-00410) 2-butyl-2-octenal

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next meeting of the flavouring working group.

5.3. EFSA-Q-2018-00252 – Mixture of 3 and 4-butylthiophene-2-carbaldehyde (3:1)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next meeting of the flavouring working group.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

5.4. FGE.215 Revision 1 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00180) 4-Phenylbut-3-en-2-one [FL-no: 07.024], (EFSA-Q-2015-00181) 1-(4-methoxyphenyl)pent-1-en-3-one [FL-no: 07.030], (EFSA-Q-2015-00182) 3-methyl-4-phenylbut-3-en-2-one [FL-no: 07.027], (EFSA-Q-2015-00183) 4-(2,3,6-trimethylphenyl)-but-3-en-2-one [FL-no: 07.206], (EFSA-Q-2015-00184) 1-(4-methoxyphenyl)-4-methylpent-1-en-3-one [FL-no: 07.049], (EFSA-Q-2015-00185) vanillylidene acetone [FL-no: 07.046] and (EFSA-Q-2015-00186) 4-phenylbut-3-en-2-ol [FL-no: 02.066].

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substances. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substances will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

5.5. FGE.217 Revision 2 – (EFSA-Q-2013-00286) 5-Pentyl-3H-furan-2-one [FL-no: 10.170], (EFSA-Q-2014-00425) 3,4-dimethyl-5-pentylidenefuran-2(5H)-one [FL-no: 10.042], (EFSA-Q-2014-00426) furan-2(5H)-one [FL-no: 10.066], (EFSA-Q-2014-00427) 5,6-dihydro-3,6-dimethylbenzofuran-2(4H)-one [FL-no: 10.034], (EFSA-Q-2014-004258) 5,6,7,7a-tetrahydro-3,6-dimethylbenzofuran-2(4H)-one [FL-no: 10.036], (EFSA-Q-2014-00429) 2,7-dimethylocta-5(trans),7-dieno-1,4-lactone [FL-no: 10.043], (EFSA-Q-2014-00430) hex-2-eno-1,4-lactone [FL-no: 10.046], (EFSA-Q-2014-00431) non-2-eno-1,4-lactone [FL-no: 10.054], (EFSA-Q-2014-00432) 3a,4,5,7a-tetrahydro-3,6-dimethyl-benzofuran-2(3H)-one [FL-no: 10.057] and (EFSA-Q-2014-00433) 2-decen-1,4-lactone [FL-no: 10.060].

The item was not discussed due to lack of time.

5.6. FGE.222 Revision 1 – (EFSA-Q-2014-00436) 4-(2-Furyl)but-3-en-2-one [FL-no: 13.044], (EFSA-Q-2014-00437) 3-(2-furyl)acrylaldehyde [FL-no: 13.034], (EFSA-Q-2014-00438) furfurylidene-2-butanal [FL-no: 13.043], (EFSA-Q-2014-00439) 3(2-furyl)-2-phenylprop-2-enal [FL-no: 13.137], (EFSA-Q-2014-00440) 3-(2-furyl)-2-methylprop-2-enal [FL-no: 13.046] and (EFSA-Q-2014-00441) 3(5-methyl-2-furyl)prop-2-enal [FL-no: 13.150].

The item was not discussed due to lack of time.

5.7. FGE.216 Revision 2 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00199) 2-Phenylcrotonaldehyde [FL-no: 05.062], (EFSA-Q-2015-

00201) 5-methyl-2-phenylhex-2-enal [FL-no: 05.099], (EFSA-Q-2015-00202) 4-methyl-2-phenylpent-2-enal [FL-no: 05.100], (EFSA-Q-2015-00203) 2-phenylpent-2-enal [FL-no: 05.175] and (EFSA-Q-2015-00204) 2-phenyl-4-methyl-2-hexenal [FL-no: 05.222].

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next meeting.

6. Next meeting

This was the last meeting of the CEF WG on Flavourings.

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 34th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 15 May 2018 by Teleconference

(Agreed on 1 June 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Leon Brimer, Kevin Chipman, Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice-Chair) and Wim Mennes (Chair).

- **European Commission representative:**

-

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Jan van Benthem.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 33rd Working Group meeting held in Parma on 16-17 April 2018.

The minutes of the 33rd Working Group meeting held in Parma on 16-17 April 2018 were agreed by written procedure on 2 May 2018³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.411 (EFSA-Q-2015-00820) – 2-(4-Methylphenoxy)-N-(1H-pyrazol-3-yl)-N-(thiophen-2-ylmethyl)acetamide [FL-no: 16.133]

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.2. FGE.201 Revision 2 – (EFSA-Q-2017-00117) 2-Methylpent-2-enal [FL-no: 05.090], (EFSA-Q-2017-00118) 2-methylcrotonaldehyde [FL-no: 05.095], (EFSA-Q-2017-00119) 2-methylbut-2-en-1-ol [FL-no: 02.174], (EFSA-Q-2017-00120) 2-ethylhept-2-enal [FL-no: 05.033], (EFSA-Q-2017-00121) 2-butylbut-2-enal [FL-no: 05.105], (EFSA-Q-2017-00122) 2-isopropyl-5-methylhex-2-enal [FL-no: 05.107], (EFSA-Q-2017-00123) 2-methyloct-2-enal [FL-no: 05.126] and (EFSA-Q-2017-00124) 4-methyl-3-hepten-5-one [FL-no: 07.261].

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next genotoxicity working group.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

5.3. FGE.204 Revision 1 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00297) 7-Methyl-3-octen-2-one [FL-no: 07.177], (EFSA-Q-2015-00298) oct-3-en-2-ol [FL-no: 02.102], (EFSA-Q-2015-00299) oct-2-en-4-ol [FL-no: 02.193], (EFSA-Q-2015-00300) pent-3-en-2-one [FL-no: 07.044], (EFSA-Q-2015-00301) 4-hexen-3-one [FL-no: 07.048], (EFSA-Q-2015-00302) oct-2-en-4-one [FL-no: 07.082], (EFSA-Q-2015-00303) hept-2-en-4-one [FL-no: 07.104], (EFSA-Q-2015-00304) hept-3-en-2-one [FL-no: 07.105], (EFSA-Q-2015-00305) 5-methylhex-3-en-2-one [FL-no: 07.106], (EFSA-Q-2015-00306) oct-3-en-2-one [FL-no: 07.107], (EFSA-Q-2015-00307) dec-3-en-2-one [FL-no: 07.121], (EFSA-Q-2015-00308) 5-methylhept-2-en-4-one [FL-no: 07.139], (EFSA-Q-2015-00309) non-2-en-4-one [FL-no: 07.187], (EFSA-Q-2015-00310) non-3-en-2-one [FL-no: 07.188], (EFSA-Q-2015-00311) trans-6-methyl-3-hepten-2-one [FL-no: 07.244] and (EFSA-Q-2015-00312) 6-methyl-3-hepten-2-one [FL-no: 07.258].

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next genotoxicity working group.

5.4. FGE.216 Revision 2 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00199) 2-Phenylcrotonaldehyde [FL-no: 05.062], (EFSA-Q-2015-00201) 5-methyl-2-phenylhex-2-enal [FL-no: 05.099], (EFSA-Q-2015-00202) 4-methyl-2-phenylpent-2-enal [FL-no: 05.100], (EFSA-Q-2015-00203) 2-phenylpent-2-enal [FL-no: 05.175] and (EFSA-Q-2015-00204) 2-phenyl-4-methyl-2-hexenal [FL-no: 05.222].

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substances. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substances will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

6. Next meeting

To be decided.

Standing Working group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 33rd Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 16-17 April 2018 in Parma

(Agreed on 2 May 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Romualdo Benigni, Leon Brimer, Kevin Chipman, Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Chair), Gerard Mulder, Agneta Oskarsson and Camilla Svendsen.

- **European Commission representative:**

-

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino, Annamaria Rossi and Giorgia Vianello.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Karl-Heinz Engel, Wim Mennes and Jan van Benthem.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 32nd Working Group meeting held on 22 February 2018 by teleconference.

The minutes of the 32nd Working Group meeting held on 22 February 2018 by teleconference were agreed by written procedure on 6 March 2018³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.411 (EFSA-Q-2015-00820) – 2-(4-Methylphenoxy)-N-(1H-pyrazol-3-yl)-N-(thiophen-2-ylmethyl)acetamide [FL-no: 16.133]

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next meeting of the flavouring working group.

5.2. FGE.412 (EFSA-Q-2016-00869) – 1-Methylnaphthalene [FL-no: 01.014]

The item was not discussed.

5.3. FGE.203 Revision 2 – (EFSA-Q-2017-00003) Deca-2,4-dien-1-ol [FL-no: 02.139], (EFSA-Q-2017-00004) hepta-2,4-dien-1-ol [FL-no: 02.153], (EFSA-Q-2017-00005) hexa-2,4-dien-1-ol [FL-no: 02.162], (EFSA-Q-2017-00006) nona-2,4-dien-1-ol [FL-no: 02.188], (EFSA-Q-2017-00007) hexa-2(trans),4(trans)-dienal [FL-no: 05.057], (EFSA-Q-2017-00008) trideca-2(trans),4(cis),7(cis)-trienal [FL-no:

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

05.064], (EFSA-Q-2017-00009) nona-2,4-dienal [FL-no: 05.071], (EFSA-Q-2017-00010) 2,4-decadienal [FL-no: 05.081], (EFSA-Q-2017-00011) hepta-2,4-dienal [FL-no: 05.084], (EFSA-Q-2017-00012) penta-2,4-dienal [FL-no: 05.101], (EFSA-Q-2017-00013) undeca-2,4-dienal [FL-no: 05.108], (EFSA-Q-2017-00014) dodeca-2,4-dienal [FL-no: 05.125], (EFSA-Q-2017-00015) octa-2(trans),4(trans)-dienal [FL-no: 05.127], (EFSA-Q-2017-00016) deca-2(trans),4(trans)-dienal [FL-no: 05.140], (EFSA-Q-2017-00017) deca-2,4,7-trienal [FL-no: 05.141], (EFSA-Q-2017-00018) nona-2,4,6-trienal [FL-no: 05.173], (EFSA-Q-2017-00019) 2,4-octadienal [FL-no: 05.186], (EFSA-Q-2017-00020) tr-2, tr-4-nonadienal [FL-no: 05.194], (EFSA-Q-2017-00021) tr-2, tr-4-undecadienal [FL-no: 05.196], (EFSA-Q-2017-00022) hexa-2,4-dienyl acetate [FL-no: 09.573].

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next meeting of the genotoxicity working group.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 15 May 2018 by teleconference.

Standing Working group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 32nd Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 22 February 2018 by Teleconference

(Agreed on 6 March 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Romualdo Benigni, Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice-Chair), Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder and Camilla Svendsen.

- **European Commission representative:**

-

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Maria Anastassiadou, Carla Martino, Annamaria Rossi and Giorgia Vianello.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 31st Working Group meeting held in Parma on 16-18 January 2018.

The minutes of the 31st Working Group meeting held in Parma on 16-18 January 2018 were agreed by written procedure on 2 February 2018³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.77 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2016-00159) – 6-Methylquinoline [FL-no: 14.042]

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.2. FGE.411 (EFSA-Q-2015-00820) – 2-(4-Methylphenoxy)-N-(1H-pyrazol-3-yl)-N-(thiophen-2-ylmethyl)acetamide [FL-no: 16.133]

The item was not discussed due to lack of time.

5.3. FGE.412 (EFSA-Q-2016-00869) – 1-Methylnaphthalene [FL-no: 01.014]

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held in Parma from 16 to 17 April 2018.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

Standing Working group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 31st Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 16-18 January 2018 in Parma

(Agreed on 2 February 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Romualdo Benigni, Leon Brimer, Kevin Chipman, Paul Fowler (1st and 2nd day), Rainer Gürtler (3rd day), Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder (1st and 2nd day), Agneta Oskarsson, Camilla Svendsen and Jan van Benthem.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (Flavis, DTU) and Karin Nørby (Flavis, DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell (2nd and 3rd day)

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino, Claudia Roncancio Peña and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Karl-Heinz Engel and Trine Husøy.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 30th Working Group meeting held in Parma on 12-14 December 2017.

The minutes of the 30th Working Group meeting held in Parma on 12-14 December 2017 were agreed on 14 December 2017.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.77 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2016-00159) - 6-Methylquinoline [FL-no: 14.042]

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.2. FGE.410 Revision 1 (EFSA-Q-2017-00001) - Naringenin [FL-no: 16.132]

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substance. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substance will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

5.3. FGE.412 (EFSA-Q-2016-00869) – 1-Methylnaphthalene [FL-no: 01.014]

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.4. FGE.55 Revision 1: [FL-no: 05.097] 3-Methyl-2-phenylbutyraldehyde (EFSA-Q-2017-00238), [FL-no: 08.109] 3-phenylpyruvic acid (EFSA-Q-2017-00239), [FL-no: 09.728] ethyl 4-phenylbutyrate (EFSA-Q-2017-00240), [FL-no: 09.729] methyl 4-phenylbutyrate (EFSA-Q-2017-00241) and [FL-no: 09.802] ethyl 2-ethyl-3-phenylpropionate (EFSA-Q-2017-00242).

The item was not discussed due to lack of time.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held on 22 February 2018 by teleconference.

Standing Working group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 30th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings Held on 12-14 December 2017 in Parma (Agreed on 14 December 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Romualdo Benigni, Leon Brimer, Kevin Chipman, Karl-Heinz Engel (2nd and 3rd day), Paul Fowler (by teleconference), Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Chair), Wim Mennes (by teleconference), Gerard Mulder, Camilla Svendsen and Jan van Benthem.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (Flavis, DTU) and Karin Nørby (Flavis, DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell (2nd and 3rd day)

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino and Annamaria Rossi.

SCER Unit: Bernard Bottex (1st day)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Agneta Oskarsson.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 29th Working Group meeting held in Oslo on 10-12 October 2017.

The minutes of the 29th Working Group meeting held in Oslo on 10-12 October 2017 were agreed by written procedure on 20 October 2017⁴.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.13 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2014-00421) 2-Ethyl-5-methylfuran [FL-no: 13.125] and (EFSA-Q-2014-00422) 2-octylfuran [FL-no: 13.162]

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substances. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substances will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

5.2. FGE.55 Revision 1: [FL-no: 05.097] 3-Methyl-2-phenylbutyraldehyde (EFSA-Q-2017-00238), [FL-no: 08.109] 3-phenylpyruvic acid (EFSA-Q-2017-00239), [FL-no: 09.728] ethyl 4-phenylbutyrate (EFSA-Q-2017-00240), [FL-no: 09.729] methyl 4-phenylbutyrate (EFSA-Q-2017-00241) and [FL-no: 09.802] ethyl 2-ethyl-3-phenylpropionate (EFSA-Q-2017-00242).

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

- 5.3. FGE.67 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2013-00853) 2-Acetylfuran [FL-no: 13.054], (EFSA-Q-2013-00854) 3-acetyl-2,5-dimethylfuran [FL-no: 13.066], (EFSA-Q-2013-00855) 2-hexanoylfuran [FL-no: 13.070], (EFSA-Q-2013-00856) 2-acetyl-5-methylfuran [FL-no: 13.083], (EFSA-Q-2013-00857) 2-acetyl-3,5-dimethylfuran [FL-no: 13.101], (EFSA-Q-2013-00858) 2-butyrylfuran [FL-no: 13.105], (EFSA-Q-2013-00859) 2-pentanoylfuran [FL-no: 13.163], (EFSA-Q-2014-00388) 1-(2-furyl)-propan-2-one [FL-no: 13.045], (EFSA-Q-2014-00389) 1-(2-furyl)butan-3-one [FL-no: 13.138], (EFSA-Q-2014-00416) 2-pentylfuran [FL-no: 13.059], (EFSA-Q-2014-00417) 2-heptylfuran [FL-no: 13.069], (EFSA-Q-2014-00418) 2-butylylfuran [FL-no: 13.103], (EFSA-Q-2014-00419) 2-decylfuran [FL-no: 13.106] and (EFSA-Q-2014-00420) 3-methyl-2(3-methylbut-2-enyl)furan [FL-no: 13.148].**

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substances. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substances will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

- 5.4. FGE.74 Revision 4: [FL-no: 12.009] Diallyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00720), [FL-no: 12.013] dimethyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00721), [FL-no: 12.020] methyl propyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00722), [FL-no: 12.023] dipropyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00723), [FL-no: 12.045] methyl allyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00724), [FL-no: 12.074] diallyl polysulfides (EFSA-Q-2016-00725), [FL-no: 12.155] methyl ethyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00726), [FL-no: 12.280] diisopropyl trisulphide (EFSA-Q-2016-00727)**

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

- 5.5. FGE.77Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2016-00159) - 6-Methylquinoline [FL-no: 14.042]**

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Expertise of the WG

The WG members agreed to include pharmacology, human medicine, clinical pathology and epidemiology among the expertise that could be needed in the work of the present WG.

7. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held in Parma from 16 to 18 January 2018.

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting.

With regard to this meeting Dr Trine Husøy and Dr Camilla Svendsen declared the following interest on items 5.1 'FGE.13 Revision 3' and 5.3 'FGE.67 Revision 3': As also declared in their annual declarations of interest, they did experimental work with substituted furans on their genotoxic and carcinogenic properties for the Research Council of Norway (public institute). Additionally, they are working on a report on furan exposure, in the context of a research project at the Research Council of Norway. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁶, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned, since the experimental work for the Research Council of Norway was done on substituted furans that are not subject to evaluation in the present revision of FGE.67Rev3 and FGE.13Rev3. The same is applicable to the activity on furan exposure, since furan is not evaluated in the present revision of FGE.67Rev3 and FGE.13Rev3.

With regard to this meeting, Dr Kevin Chipman and Dr Wim Mennes declared the following interest on items 5.1 'FGE.13 Revision 3' and 5.3 'FGE.67 Revision 3': they were members of the EFSA WG on furan in food. The mandate of this WG ended in July 2017. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁶, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the experts concerned, since furan, 2-methylfuran, 3-methylfuran and 2,5-dimethylfuran are not subject to evaluation in the present revision of FGE.67Rev3 and FGE.13Rev3.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

Standing Working group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 29th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 10-12 October 2017 in Oslo

(Agreed on 20 October 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Romualdo Benigni, Leon Brimer, Kevin Chipman, Karl-Heinz Engel (2nd and 3rd day), Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice-Chair), Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder, Camilla Svendsen and Jan van Benthem.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (Flavis, DTU) and Karin Nørby (Flavis, DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell (via teleconference)

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Agneta Oskarsson.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 28th Working Group meeting held on 28 September 2017 by teleconference.

The minutes of the 28th Working Group meeting held on 28 September 2017 were agreed.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.55 Revision 1: [FL-no: 05.097] 3-methyl-2-phenylbutyraldehyde (EFSA-Q-2017-00238), [FL-no: 08.109] 3-phenylpyruvic acid (EFSA-Q-2017-00239), [FLno: 09.728] ethyl 4-phenylbutyrate (EFSA-Q-2017-00240), [FL-no: 09.729] methyl 4-phenylbutyrate (EFSA-Q-2017-00241) and [FL-no: 09.802] ethyl 2-ethyl-3-phenylpropionate (EFSA-Q-2017-00242).

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.2. FGE.74 Revision 4: [FL-no: 12.009] Diallyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00720), [FL-no: 12.013] Dimethyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00721), [FL-no: 12.020] Methyl propyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00722), [FL-no: 12.023] Dipropyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00723), [FL-no: 12.045] Methyl allyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00724), [FL-no:

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

12.074] Diallyl polysulfides (EFSA-Q-2016-00725), [FL-no: 12.155] Methyl ethyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00726), [FL-no: 12.280] Diisopropyl trisulphide (EFSA-Q-2016-00727)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.3. FGE.406: [FL-no: 16.129] (S)-1-(3-(((4-amino-2,2-dioxido-1H-benzo[c][1,2,6]thiadiazin-5-yl)oxy)methyl)-piperidin-1-yl)-3-methylbitan-1-one (EFSA-Q-2015-00082)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.4. FGE.411: [FL-no: 16.133] 2-(4-Methylphenoxy)-N-(1H-pyrazol-3-yl)-N-(thiophen-2-ylmethyl) acetamide (EFSA-Q-2015-00820)

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substance. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substance will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held in Parma from 12 to 14 December 2017.

Standing Working group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 28th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 28 September 2017, by TELE-conference

(Agreed on 12 October 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Paul Fowler, Trine Husøy and Wim Mennes (Chair)

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission representative:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Carla Martino, Annamaria Rossi and Siiri Sarma

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Karl-Heinz Engel and Miguel Angel Granero Rosell.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 27th Working Group meeting held on 11 September 2017, teleconference.

The minutes of the 27th Working Group meeting held on 11 September 2017 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. FGE.501: [FL-no: 21.002] Grill flavour concentrate (vegetable) (EFSA-Q-2015-00821)⁵

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of this flavouring. The scientific evaluation of this flavouring will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

6. Any Other Business

None.

7. Next meeting(s)

10-12 October 2017, Oslo (Norway).

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00821>

Standing Working group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 27th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 11 September 2017 by TELE-conference

(Agreed on 28 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Paul Fowler, Trine Husøy, Wim Mennes (Chair) and Detlef Wölflé.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (DTU) and Karin Nørby (DTU)

- **European Commission representative:**

DG SANTE: Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Eric Barthélémy, Maria Carfí, Anna Federica Castoldi and Carla Martino

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler and Agneta Oskarsson.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 26th Working Group meeting held on 23 August 2017, teleconference.

The minutes of the 26th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 23 August 2017 were agreed⁴.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Benzophenone [FL-no: 07.032] (EFSA-Q-2016-00425)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.2. Ethyl Acrylate [FL-no: 09.037] (EFSA-Q-2016-00426)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.3. FGE.501: [FL-no: 21.002] Grill flavour concentrate (vegetable) (EFSA-Q-2015-00821).

This topic was not discussed due to lack of time.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

6. Any Other Business

None.

7. Next meeting

10-12 October 2017, Oslo (Norway).

Standing Working group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 26th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 23 August 2017 by TELE-conference

(Agreed on 11 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Romualdo Benigni, Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Trine Husøy (Chair), Agneta Oskarsson, Camilla Svendsen and Detlef Wölfe.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

None

- **European Commission representative:**

DG SANTE: Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Annamaria Rossi and Siiri Saarma

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Rainer Gürtler, Jan Van Benthem, Wim Mennes and Gerard Mulder.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 25th Working Group meeting held on 3-4 July 2017, Parma.

The minutes of the 25th Flavouring Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 19 July 2017⁴.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Benzophenone [FL-no: 07.032] (EFSA-Q-2016-00425)

The WG considered the available data. The discussion will continue in the next Flavouring WG meeting.

5.2. Ethyl Acrylate [FL-no: 09.037] (EFSA-Q-2016-00426)

The WG considered the available data. The discussion will continue in the next Flavouring WG meeting.

6. Any Other Business

None.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

7. Next meeting

11 September 2017, teleconference.

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 25th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings Held on 3-4 July 2017 in Parma (Agreed on 19 July 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Romualdo Benigni, Leon Brimer, Rainer Gürtler (morning of the 2nd day via TC), Trine Husøy (Vice-Chair), Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder, Agneta Oskarsson, Camilla Svendsen and Detlef Wölflé (2nd day via TC).

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (DTU) and Karin Nørby (DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

-

- **EFSA:**

Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino, Siiri Saarma and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Jan van Benthem, Karl-Heinz Engel and Paul Fowler.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 23rd and 24th CEF Flavouring Working Group meetings held on 26 June 2017 by teleconference.

The minutes of the 23rd and 24th Flavouring Working Group meetings held on 26 June 2017 were agreed.

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. Benzophenone [FL-no: 07.032] (EFSA-Q-2016-00425)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.2. Ethyl Acrylate [FL-no: 09.037] (EFSA-Q-2016-00426)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.3. FGE.55 Revision 1: [FL-no: 05.097] 3-methyl-2-phenylbutyraldehyde (EFSA-Q-2017-00238), [FL-no: 08.109] 3-phenylpyruvic acid (EFSA-Q-2017-00239), [FL-no: 09.728] ethyl 4-phenylbutyrate (EFSA-Q-2017-00240), [FL-no: 09.729] methyl 4-phenylbutyrate (EFSA-Q-2017-00241) and [FL-no: 09.802] ethyl 2-ethyl-3-phenylpropionate (EFSA-Q-2017-00242).

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.4. FGE.73 Revision 4: [FL-no: 02.091] myrtenol (EFSA-Q-2017-00250), [FL-no: 09.302] myrtenyl acetate (EFSA-Q-2017-00251), [FL-no: 09.278] p-mentha-1,8-dien-7-yl-acetate (EFSA-Q-2017-00252) and [FL-no: 02.060] p-mentha-1,8-dien-7-ol (EFSA-Q-2017-00253).

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.5. FGE.203 Revision 2: [FL-no: 02.139] Deca-2,4-dien-1-ol (EFSA-Q-2017-00003), [FL-no: 02.153] hepta-2,4-dien-1-ol (EFSA-Q-2017-00004), [FL-no: 02.162] hexa-2,4-dien-1-ol (EFSA-Q-2017-00005), [FL-no: 02.188] nona-2,4-dien-1-ol

(EFSA-Q-2017-00006), [FL-no: 05.057] hexa-2(trans),4(trans)-dienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00007), [FL-no: 05.064] trideca-2(trans),4(cis),7(cis)-trienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00008), [FL-no: 05.071] nona-2,4-dienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00009), [FL-no: 05.081] 2,4-decadienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00010), [FL-no: 05.084] hepta-2,4-dienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00011), [FL-no: 05.101] penta-2,4-dienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00012), [FL-no: 05.108] undeca-2,4-dienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00013), [FL-no: 05.125] dodeca-2,4-dienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00014), [FL-no: 05.127] octa-2(trans),4(trans)-dienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00015), [FL-no: 05.140] deca-2(trans),4(trans)-dienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00016), [FL-no: 05.141] deca-2,4,7-trienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00017), [FL-no: 05.173] nona-2,4,6-trienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00018), [FL-no: 05.186] 2,4-octadienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00019), [FL-no: 05.194] tr-2, tr-4-nonadienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00020), [FL-no: 05.196] tr-2, tr-4-undecadienal (EFSA-Q-2017-00021), [FL-no: 09.573] hexa-2,4-dienyl acetate (EFSA-Q-2017-00022).

The WG considered the available data. The FGE is presently under evaluation in the Genotoxicity WG.

5.6. FGE.501: [FL-no: 21.002] Grill flavour concentrate (vegetable) (EFSA-Q-2015-00821)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held on 23 August 2017 by teleconference.

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

**Minutes of the 24th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 26 June 2017 from 14:00 to 17:30 by teleconference
(Agreed on 3 July 2017)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
Romualdo Benigni, Leon Brimer, Trine Husøy (Vice-Chair), Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder and Detlef Wölfe.
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
Vibe Beltoft (DTU) and Karin Nørby (DTU).
- **European Commission representative:**
-
- **EFSA:**
Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Agneta Oskarsson, Rainer Gürtler and Camilla Svendsen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

4. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

4.1. Benzophenone [FL-no: 07.032] (EFSA-Q-2016-00425)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

4.2. Ethyl Acrylate [FL-no: 09.037] (EFSA-Q-2016-00426)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma from 3 to 4 July 2017.

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

**Minutes of the 23rd Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 26 June 2017 from 9:00 to 12:30 by teleconference
(Agreed on 3 July 2017)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Romualdo Benigni, Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel, Trine Husøy (Vice-Chair), Wim Mennes (Chair) and Gerard Mulder.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (DTU) and Karin Nørby (DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

-

- **EFSA:**

Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Paul Fowler, Agneta Oskarsson, Rainer Gürtler, Camilla Svendsen and Detlef Wölflé.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 22nd CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 20 June 2017 by teleconference.

The minutes of the 22nd Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 20 June 2017 by teleconference were agreed on 28 June 2017 by written procedure.⁴

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.410: 4',5,7- trihydroxyflavanone [FL-no: 16.132] (EFSA-Q-2015-00567)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.2. FGE.502: [FL-no: 21.003] Grillin' 5078 (EFSA-Q-2016-00002)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.3. FGE.503: [FL-no: 21.004] Grillin' CB-200SF (EFSA-Q-2016-00003)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.4. FGE.210 Revision 3: alpha-Damascone [FL-no: 07.134] (EFSA-Q-2016-00308), delta-damascone [FL-no: 07.130] (EFSA-Q-2016-00309), cis-1-(2,6,6-trimethyl-2-cyclohexen-1-yl)but-2-en-1-one [FL-no: 07.225] (EFSA-Q-2016-00310), trans-1-(2,6,6-trimethyl-2-cyclohexen-1-yl)but-2-en-1-one [FL-no: 07.226] (EFSA-Q-2016-00311) and alpha-damascenone [FL-no: 07.231] (EFSA-Q-2016-00312).

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substance. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substances will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held by teleconference on 26 June 2017 (pm).

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 22nd Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings Held on 20 June 2017 by teleconference (Agreed on 28 June 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Romualdo Benigni, Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel (Chair), Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice-Chair), Gerard Mulder and Camilla Svendsen.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (DTU) and Karin Nørby (DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

-

- **EFSA:**

Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Paul Fowler, Wim Mennes, Agneta Oskarsson and Detlef Wölflé.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 21st CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held from 30 May to 1 June 2017 in Parma.

The minutes of the 21st Flavouring Working Group meeting held from 30 May to 1 June 2017 were agreed on 15 June 2017 by written procedure.⁴

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.502: [FL-no: 21.003] Grillin' 5078 (EFSA-Q-2016-00002)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.2. FGE.503: [FL-no: 21.004] Grillin' CB-200SF (EFSA-Q-2016-00003)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.3. FGE.210 Revision 3: alpha-Damascone [FL-no: 07.134] (EFSA-Q-2016-00308), delta-damascone [FL-no: 07.130] (EFSA-Q-2016-00309), cis-1-(2,6,6-trimethyl-2-cyclohexen-1-yl)but-2-en-1-one [FL-no: 07.225] (EFSA-Q-2016-00310), trans-1-(2,6,6-trimethyl-2-cyclohexen-1-yl)but-2-en-1-one [FL-no: 07.226] (EFSA-Q-2016-00311) and alpha-damascenone [FL-no: 07.231] (EFSA-Q-2016-00312).

The available data were discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held by teleconference on 26 June 2017 (am).

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 21st Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings Held on 30 May - 1 June 2017 in Parma (Agreed on 15 June 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Romualdo Benigni, Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel (2nd and 3rd day), Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler (1st and 2nd day), Trine Husøy (Vice-Chair), Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder, Agneta Oskarsson and Camilla Svendsen.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell.

- **EFSA:**

Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino, Claudia Roncancio Peña and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Ulla Beckman Sundh and Detlef Wölfle.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 20th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 25-27 April 2017 in Parma.

The minutes of the 20th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 25-27 April 2017 were agreed on 10 May 2017 by written procedure.⁴

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.500: [FL-no: 21.001] Rum ether (EFSA-Q-2012-00904)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.2. FGE.410: [FL-no: 16.132] 4',5,7- trihydroxyflavanone (EFSA-Q-2015-00567)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.3. Naringenin (EFSA-Q-2017-00001)

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substance. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substance will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held by teleconference on 20 June 2017.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

**Minutes of the 20th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 25-27 April 2017 in Parma
(Agreed on 10 May 2017)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh (2nd day via TC), Romualdo Benigni, Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel (2nd and 3rd day), Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler (1st day and 2nd day), Trine Husøy (Vice-Chair), Wim Mennes (Chair) (1st and 2nd day), Gerard Mulder, Agneta Oskarsson (1st and 2nd day) and Camilla Svendsen.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (DTU) and Karin Nørby (DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell.

- **EFSA:**

Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino, Claudia Roncancio Peña, Annamaria Rossi and Siiri Saarma.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Detlef Wölfe.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 19th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 3 April 2017 by teleconference.

The minutes of the 19th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 3 April 2017 were agreed on 19 April 2017 by written procedure.⁴

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.55 Revision 1: [FL-no: 05.097] 3-methyl-2-phenylbutyraldehyde (EFSA-Q-2017-00238), [FL-no: 08.109] 3-phenylpyruvic acid (EFSA-Q-2017-00239), [FL-no: 09.728] ethyl 4-phenylbutyrate (EFSA-Q-2017-00240), [FL-no: 09.729] methyl 4-phenylbutyrate (EFSA-Q-2017-00241) and [FL-no: 09.802] ethyl 2-ethyl-3-phenylpropionate (EFSA-Q-2017-00242).

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.2. FGE.73 Revision 4: [FL-no: 02.091] myrtenol (EFSA-Q-2017-00250), [FL-no: 09.302] myrtenyl acetate (EFSA-Q-2017-00251), [FL-no: 09.278] p-mentha-1,8-dien-7-yl acetate (EFSA-Q-2017-00252) and [FL-no: 02.060] p-mentha-1,8-dien-7-ol (EFSA-Q-2017-00253).

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substance. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substances will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

5.3. FGE.410: [FL-no: 16.132] 4',5,7- trihydroxyflavanone (EFSA-Q-2015-00567)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

5.4. 1-Methylnaphthalene (EFSA-Q-2016-00869)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.5. Naringenin (EFSA-Q-2017-00001)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.6. FGE.500: [FL-no: 21.001] Rum ether (EFSA-Q-2012-00904)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.7. FGE.502: [FL-no: 21.003] Grillin' 5078 (EFSA-Q-2016-00002)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.8. FGE.503: [FL-no: 21.004] Grillin' CB-200SF (EFSA-Q-2016-00003)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.9. Benzophenone [FL-no: 07.032] (EFSA-Q-2016-00425) and Ethyl Acrylate [FI-no: 09.037] (EFSA-Q-2016-00426)

The available data were discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.10. FGE.226 Revision 1: [FL-no: 16.071] 4,5-epoxydec-2(E)-enal (EFSA-Q-2015-00205)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma from 30 May to 1 June 2017.

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Dr. Trine Husøy and Dr. Camilla Svendsen declared the following interest: As also declared in their annual declarations of interest, they did experimental work with substituted furans on their genotoxic and carcinogenic properties for the Research Council of Norway (public institute). Furan is one of the components present in Rum ether (FGE.500). In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁶, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the experts concerned, since the experimental work for the Research Council of Norway was done on substituted furans and not on furan itself.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

**Minutes of the 19th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 3 April 2017, by teleconference
(Agreed on 19 April 2017)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
Ulla Beckman Sundh, Wim Mennes (Chair), Agneta Oskarsson and Detlef Wölfle.
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
Vibe Beltoft (DTU) and Karin Nørby (DTU).
- **European Commission representative:**
None.
- **EFSA:**
Maria Carfí, Natalia Kovalkovičová, Annamaria Rossi and Siiri Saarma.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 18th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 27 March 2017, teleconference

The minutes of the 18th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 27 March 2017 were agreed on 11 April 2017 by written procedure.⁴

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. Benzophenone [FL-no: 07.032] (EFSA-Q-2016-00425) and Ethyl Acrylate [FL-no: 09.037] (EFSA-Q-2016-00426)

The available data were discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 25-27 April 2017.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

Standing Working group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 18th meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held by Teleconference, 27th March 2017

(Agreed on 11th April 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler, Paul Fowler, Trine Husøy (Vice chair), Wim Mennes (Chair)

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Karin Nørby (DTU)

- **European Commission and/or Member States**

None

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Carla Martino, Siiri Saarma and Annamaria Rossi

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 17th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 7-9 March 2017 in Parma

The minutes of the 17th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 7-9 March 2017 in Parma were agreed on 27 March 2017 by written procedure.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1. Smoke Flavouring Primary Product RS1003 (EFSA-Q-2015-00313)⁵

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the smoke flavouring primary product. The scientific evaluation of the smoke flavouring primary product will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held by teleconference on 3rd April 2017.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencpolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00313>

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 17th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings Held on 7-9 March 2017 in Parma (Agreed on 27 March 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh (1st and 2nd day), Leon Brimer (3rd day for 2h via TC), Karl-Heinz Engel (afternoon of the 2nd day via TC), Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler (1st and 2nd day), Trine Husøy (Chair) (1st and 2nd day), Wim Mennes (afternoon of the 2nd day via TC), Gerard Mulder, Agneta Oskarsson, Camilla Svendsen and Detlef Wölfe (only for item 5.6).

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (DTU) and Karin Nørby (DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell (2nd and 3rd day).

- **EFSA:**

Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino, Siiri Saarma and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Romualdo Benigni.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 15th and 16th CEF Flavouring Working Group meetings held on 24-26 January 2017 in Parma and on 22 February 2017 by teleconference

The minutes of the 15th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 24-26 January 2017 in Parma were agreed on 13 February 2017 by written procedure.⁴

The minutes of the 16th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 22 February 2017 by teleconference were agreed on 7 March 2017.⁴

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.74 Revision 4: [FL-no: 12.009] Diallyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00720), [FL-no: 12.013] Dimethyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00721), [FL-no: 12.020] Methyl propyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00722), [FL-no: 12.023] Dipropyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00723), [FL-no: 12.045] Methyl allyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00724), [FL-no: 12.074] Diallyl polysulfides (EFSA-Q-2016-00725), [FL-no: 12.155] Methyl ethyl trisulfide (EFSA-Q-2016-00726), [FL-no: 12.280] Diisopropyl trisulphide (EFSA-Q-2016-00727)

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substance. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substance will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

5.2. FGE.410: [FL-no: 16.132] 4',5,7- trihydroxyflavanone (EFSA-Q-2015-00567)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.3. FGE.411: [FL-no: 16.133] 2-(4-Methylphenoxy)-N-(1H-pyrazol-3-yl)-N-(thiophen-2-ylmethyl) acetamide (EFSA-Q-2015-00820)

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substance. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substance will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

5.4. 1-Methylnaphthalene (EFSA-Q-2016-00869)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.5. Naringenin (EFSA-Q-2017-00001)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.6. Benzophenone [FL-no: 07.032] (EFSA-Q-2016-00425) and Ethyl Acrylate [Fl-no: 09.037] (EFSA-Q-2016-00426)

The available data were discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.7. FGE.500: [FL-no: 21.001] Rum ether (EFSA-Q-2012-00904)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.8. FGE.502: [FL-no: 21.003] Grillin' 5078 (EFSA-Q-2016-00002)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.9. FGE.503: [FL-no: 21.004] Grillin' CB-200SF (EFSA-Q-2016-00003)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 25 April 2017.

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Dr. Trine Husøy declared the following interest: As also declared in her annual declaration of interest, she did experimental work with substituted furans on their genotoxic and carcinogenic properties for the Research Council of Norway (public institute). Furan is one of the components present in Rum ether (FGE.500). In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁶, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned, since the experimental work for the Research Council of Norway was done on substituted furans and not on furan itself.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

Standing Working group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 16th meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 22 February 2017 by teleconference

(Agreed on 07 March 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Karl-Heinz Engel, Trine Husøy (Vice-Chair), Wim Mennes (Chair) and Paul Fowler.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Carla Martino, Annamaria Rossi and Siiri Saarma

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. FGE.500 (EFSA-Q-2012-00904) - Rum ether³

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 7 - 9 March 2017.

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2012-00904>

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Dr. Trine Husøy declared the following interest: As also declared in her annual declaration of interest, she did experimental work with substituted furans on their genotoxic and carcinogenic properties for the Research Council of Norway (public institute). Furan is one of the components present in Rum ether (FGE.500). In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁵, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned, since the experimental work for the Research Council of Norway was done on substituted furans and not on furan itself.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 15th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 24-26 January 2017 in Parma

(Agreed on 13 February 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh (1st and 2nd day), Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice-Chair) (1st and 2nd day), Wim Mennes (Chair) and Gerard Mulder.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Karin Nørby (DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell.

- **EFSA:**

Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Carla Martino and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Paul Fowler.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 8-10 November 2016 in Parma

The minutes of the 14th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 8-10 November 2016 were agreed on 28 November 2016 by written procedure.⁴

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.57 Revision 1: [FL-no: 02.067] isopulegol (EFSA-Q-2014-00339), [FL-no: 07.067] isopulegone (EFSA-Q-2014-00340), [FL-no: 09.219] isopulegyl acetate (EFSA-Q-2014-00341) and [FL-no: 07.127] p-mentha-1,4(8)-dien-3-one (EFSA-Q-2014-00346)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.2. FGE.302: [FL-no: 16.119] N-(2-methylcyclohexyl)-2,3,4,5,6-pentafluorobenzamide (EFSA-Q-2014-00060)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.3. FGE.408: [FL-no: 16.131] (E)-3-(3,4-Dimethoxyphenyl)-N-[2-(4-methoxyphenyl)-ethyl]-acrylamide (EFSA-Q-2015-00246)

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substance. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substance will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

5.4. FGE.411: [FL-no: 16.133] 2-(4-Methylphenoxy)-N-(1H-pyrazol-3-yl)-N-(thiophen-2-ylmethyl) acetamide (EFSA-Q-2015-00820)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

5.5. FGE.501: [FL-no: 21.002] Grill flavour concentrate (vegetable) (EFSA-Q-2015-00821)

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substance. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substance will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

5.6. FGE.210 Revision 3: [FL-no: 07.134] alpha-damascone (EFSA-Q-2016-00308), [FL-no: 07.130] delta-damascone (EFSA-Q-2016-00309), [FL-no: 07.225] cis-1-(2,6,6-trimethyl-2-cyclohexen-1-yl)but-2-en-1-one (EFSA-Q-2016-00310), [FL-no: 07.226] trans-1-(2,6,6-trimethyl-2-cyclohexen-1-yl)but-2-en-1-one (EFSA-Q-2016-00311) and [FL-no: 07.231] alpha-damascenone (EFSA-Q-2016-00312)

The draft scientific opinion was discussed by the WG and will be presented for discussion in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 22 February 2017.

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Prof. Dr. Karl-Heinz Engel declared the following interest: As also declared in his annual declaration of interest, his University receives research funding for analysis of flavourings for Silesia. This funding is not related to any of the agenda items. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁶, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 14th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings Held on 8-10 November 2016 in Parma (Agreed on 28 November 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh (1st and 2nd day via TC), Leon Brimer (2nd and 3rd day via TC), Karl-Heinz Engel (1st day), Paul Fowler (Chair), Rainer Gürtler and Gerard Mulder.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft and Karin Nørby (DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Natalia Kovalkovičová, Carla Martino and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Trine Husøy and Wim Mennes.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

4. Agreement of the draft notes and minutes of the 13th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 27-29 September 2016 in Parma

The minutes of the 13th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 27-29 September 2016 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.07 Revision 5: [FL-no: 02.131] but-3-en-2-ol (EFSA-Q-2016-00467), [FL-no: 02.187] non-1-en-3-ol (EFSA-Q-2016-00470), [FL-no: 07.161] hex-1-en-3-one (EFSA-Q-2016-00471) and [FL-no: 07.210] 1-nonene-3-one (EFSA-Q-2016-00472)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.2. FGE.57 Revision 1: [FL-no: 02.067] isopulegol (EFSA-Q-2014-00339), [FL-no: 07.067] isopulegone (EFSA-Q-2014-00340), [FL-no: 09.219] isopulegyl acetate (EFSA-Q-2014-00341) and [FL-no: 07.127] p-mentha-1,4(8)-dien-3-one (EFSA-Q-2014-00346)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.3. FGE.63 Revision 3 : [FL-no: 07.102] pent-1-en-3-one (EFSA-Q-2016-00462), [FL-no: 07.081] oct-1-en-3-one (EFSA-Q-2016-00463), [FL-no: 02.023] oct-1-en-3-ol (EFSA-Q-2016-00464), [FL-no: 02.099] pent-1-en-3-ol (EFSA-Q-2016-00465), [FL-no: 02.104] hex-1-en-3-ol (EFSA-Q-2016-00466), [FL-no: 02.136] dec-1-en-3-ol (EFSA-Q-2016-00468), [FL-no: 02.155] 1-hepten-3-ol (EFSA-Q-2016-00469), [FL-no: 09.281] oct-1-en-3-yl acetate (EFSA-Q-2016-00473) and [FL-no: 09.282] oct-1-en-3-yl butyrate (EFSA-Q-2016-00474)

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in the next CEF Panel meeting.

5.4. FGE.302: [FL-no: 16.119] N-(2-methylcyclohexyl)-2,3,4,5,6-pentafluorobenzamide (EFSA-Q-2014-00060)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.5. FGE.407: [FL-no: 16.130] 4-amino-5-(3-(isopropylamino)-2,2-dimethyl-3-oxopropoxy)-2-methylquinoline-3-carboxylic acid (EFSA-Q-2015-00244)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in the next CEF Panel meeting.

5.6. FGE.411: [FL-no: 16.133] 2-(4-Methylphenoxy)-N-(1H-pyrazol-3-yl)-N-(thiophen-2-ylmethyl) acetamide (EFSA-Q-2015-00820)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.7. FGE.500: [FL-no: 21.001] Rum ether (EFSA-Q-2012-00904)

The data available was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 24 - 26 January 2017.

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

**Minutes of the 13th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 27-29 September 2016 in Parma
(Agreed on 8 November 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh, Leon Brimer, Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Chair), Wim Mennes (morning of the 2nd and 3rd day), Gerard Mulder and Christina Tlustos (morning of the 2nd day, via TC).

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft and Karin Nørby (DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

FIP: Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Natalia Kovalkovičová, Carla Martino, Anne Theobald and Annamaria Rossi.

LEGAL: Simone Gabbi

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Karl-Heinz Engel.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

4. Agreement of the draft notes and minutes of the 12th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 7-9 June 2016 in Aberdeen

The minutes of the 12th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 7-9 June 2016 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.49Rev1 – (EFSA-Q-2011-00049 and EFSA-Q-2011-01015)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for discussion and possible adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.2. FGE.302 (EFSA-Q-2014-00060)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.3. FGE.406 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00082)

The WG identified some issues that are critical for the safety assessment of the flavouring substance evaluated in FGE.406. The topic will be submitted to the next CEF Plenary for discussion.

5.4. FGE.407 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00244)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.5. FGE.408 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00246)

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substance. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substance will be

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

5.6. FGE.410 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00567)

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substance. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substance will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

5.7. FGE.411 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00820)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.8. FGE.501 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00821)

The WG requires additional information from the applicant to be able to conclude on the safety of the flavouring substance. The scientific evaluation of the flavouring substance will be suspended, awaiting the submission of the additional information requested.

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 8 - 10 November 2016.

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 12th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings Held on 7-9 June 2016 in Aberdeen (Agreed on 27 September 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh, Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel (2nd and 3rd day), Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice chair), Wim Mennes (Chair) and Gerard Mulder.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Karin Nørby (DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

-

- **EFSA:**

Maria Anastassiadou, Maria Carfí, Natália Kovalkovičová (via tele-conference), Anne Theobald (via teleconference) and Annamaria Rossi.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Harriet Wallin.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the draft notes and minutes of the 11th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 19-21 April 2016 in Oslo

The minutes of the 11th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 19-21 April 2016 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.49Rev1 – (EFSA-Q-2011-00049 and EFSA-Q-2011-01015)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.2. FGE.77Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2016-00159)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.3. FGE.313 – (EFSA-Q-2013-00837 and EFSA-Q-2015-00320)

The draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.4. FGE.400 – (EFSA-Q-2012-00871)

The draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.5. FGE.500 Rum ether – (EFSA-Q-2012-00904)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

5.6. FGE.501 Grill flavour concentrate (vegetable) – (EFSA-Q-2015-00821)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.7. FGE.502 Grillin' 5078 (EFSA-Q-2016-00002)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

5.8. FGE.503 Grillin' CB-200SF (EFSA-Q-2016-00003)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

5.9. Smoke Flavouring Primary Product RS1003 (EFSA-Q-2015-00313)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 27 - 29 September 2016.

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Prof. Dr. Karl-Heinz Engel declared the following interest: As also declared in his annual declaration of interest, his University receives research funding for analysis of flavourings for Silesia. This funding is not related to any of the agenda items. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁶, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

Dr. Trine Husøy declared the following interest: As also declared in her annual declaration of interest, she was chairing a working group on the risk assessment of furan, one of the ingredients of rum ether, at the Norwegian Scientific Committee for Food Safety. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁷ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁸, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned, since the mandate of the working group on furan at the Norwegian Scientific Committee for Food Safety has been finalised since 2010.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 11th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 19-21 April 2016 in Oslo

(Agreed on 7 June 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh (1st and 2nd day), Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel (1st day via teleconference), Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice chair), Wim Mennes (Chair) and Gerard Mulder.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (DTU) and Karin Nørby (DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell (via teleconference)

- **EFSA:**

Annamaria Rossi, Maria Carfi, Anne Theobald (via teleconference) and Maria Anastassiadou.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Harriet Wallin.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the draft notes and minutes of the 10th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 1-3 March 2016 in Parma

The minutes of the 10th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 1-3 March 2016 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.49Rev1 – (EFSA-Q-2011-00049 and EFSA-Q-2011-01015)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.2. FGE.313 – (EFSA-Q-2013-00837 and EFSA-Q-2015-00320 and -322)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.3. FGE.411 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00820)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.4. FGE.410 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00567)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.5. FGE.500 Rum ether – (EFSA-Q-2012-00904)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.6. FGE.502 Grillin' 5078 – (EFSA-Q-2016-00002)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

5.7. FGE.503 Grillin' CB-200SF – (EFSA-Q-2016-00003)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.8. Smoke Flavouring Primary Product RS1003 (EFSA-Q-2015-00313)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.9. FGE.77Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2016-00159)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Aberdeen on 7 - 9 June 2016.

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

**Minutes of the 10th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 1-3 March 2016 in Parma
(Agreed on 19 April 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh (1st and 2nd day), Leon Brimer (1st day), Karl-Heinz Engel (2nd and 3rd day), Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice chair), Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder and Harriet Wallin.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (DTU) and Karin Nørby (DTU).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

FIP unit: Annamaria Rossi, Maria Carfi, Maria Anastassiadou,
NUTRI unit: Silvia Valtueña Martínez (3rd day, item 6.1),
FEED unit: Manuela Tiramani (1st day, item 7.1) and
Pesticides unit: Juan Manuel Parra Morte (1st day, item 7.1)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the draft notes and minutes of the 9th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 19-21 January 2016 in Bologna

The minutes of the 9th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 19-21 January 2016 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.49Rev1 – (EFSA-Q-2011-00049 and EFSA-Q-2011-01015)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.2. FGE.313 – (EFSA-Q-2013-00837 and EFSA-Q-2015-00320 and -322)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.3. FGE.400 – (EFSA-Q-2012-00871)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

5.4. FGE.411 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00820)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.5. FGE.501 Grill flavour concentrate (vegetable) – (EFSA-Q-2015-00821)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

5.6. FGE.502 Grillin' 5078 – (EFSA-Q-2016-00002)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.7. FGE.503 Grillin' CB-200SF – (EFSA-Q-2016-00003)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

6. Any Other Business

The chemical name for [FL-no: 12.054] (CAS-no: 4500-58-7) is wrongly reported in the EC Union List as 2-(Ethylthio)phenol. The correct name is 2-ethylthiophenol (or Benzenethiol, 2-ethyl- or *o*-ethylbenzenethiol or 2-Ethylphenyl mercaptan). The name will be rectified to 2-ethylthiophenol at the next amendment of the EC Union List.

7. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Oslo on 19 - 21 April 2016.

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Prof. Dr. Karl-Heinz Engel declared the following interest: As also declared in his annual declaration of interest, his University receives research funding for analysis of flavourings for Silesia. This funding is not related to any of the agenda items. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁶, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

**Minutes of the 9th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 19-21 January 2016 in Bologna
(Agreed on 01 March 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
Ulla Beckman Sundh, Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel (2nd and 3rd day),
Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice chair) and Gerard Mulder.
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
Vibe Beltoft (DTU) and Karin Nørby (DTU), Sven Ballschmiede (EFFA), Jan
Demyttenaere (EFFA) and Sean Taylor (IOFI).
- **European Commission representative:**
Miguel Angel Granero Rosell
- **EFSA:**
Annamaria Rossi, Maria Carfi and Maria Anastassiadou

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair (TH) welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Paul Fowler, Wim Mennes (Chair) and Harriet Wallin.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the draft notes and minutes of the 8th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 17-19 November 2015 in Copenhagen

The minutes of the 8th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 17-19 November 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Hearing Experts

Mr. Sven Ballschmiede, Mr. Jan Demyttenaere, Mr. Sean Taylor, were invited to present their views solely for item 7 of the present meeting on behalf of the European Flavour Association and International Organization of the Flavouring Industry. They attended the meeting on 19th January 2016 from 11:00 to 12:30.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA invited Mr. Sven Ballschmiede, Mr. Jan Demyttenaere and Mr. Sean Taylor to submit an ADoI. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Panel, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁵

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

6.1. FGE.49Rev1 – (EFSA-Q-2011-00049 and EFSA-Q-2011-01015)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

6.2. FGE.313 – (EFSA-Q-2013-00837 and EFSA-Q-2015-00320 and -322)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

6.3. FGE.410 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00567)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>

⁵ Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

6.4. Smoke Flavouring Primary Product RS1003 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00313)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

7. Hearing Experts attended the WG meeting from 11:00 to 12:30 on 19th January 2016 to discuss the following issues: FGE.215Rev1, FGE.217Rev2 and FGE.222Rev1.

Upon request from EFSA, the applicant was given the opportunity to present at a technical hearing the additional information available and outline additional planned studies for FGE.215Rev1, FGE.217Rev2 and FGE.222Rev1. Following discussion during the hearing a number of points requiring further clarification were identified. After the hearing was finished, and the hearing experts left the room, the WG discussed the clarifications provided by the applicant.

8. Any Other Business

None

9. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 1 - 3 March 2016.

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

**Minutes of the 8th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 17-19 November 2015 in Copenhagen
(Agreed on 19 January 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh, Leon Brimer (1st day), Karl-Heinz Engel (1st and 2nd day until 15h), Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (contractor) and Karin Nørby (contractor).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell (1st and 2nd day via teleconference)

- **EFSA:**

Annamaria Rossi and Maria Anastassiadou

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Trine Husøy (Vice chair) and Harriet Wallin.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the draft notes and minutes of the 7th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 22-24 September 2015 in Rome

The minutes of the 7th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 22-24 September 2015 were agreed.

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.49Rev1 – (EFSA-Q-2011-00049 and EFSA-Q-2011-01015)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.2. FGE.51Rev2 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00315 to -00317 and -00319)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.4. FGE.407 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00244)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

5.5. FGE.408 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00246)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

5.6. FGE.409 - (EFSA-Q-2014-00712 to -00713)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

5.7. FGE.410 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00567)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.8. Smoke Flavouring Primary Product RS1003 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00313)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.9. FGE.500 - (EFSA-Q-2012-00904)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

6. Any Other Business

None

7. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Bologna on 19 - 21 January 2016.

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

**Minutes of the 7th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 22-24 September 2015, Rome
(Agreed on 17 November 2015)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh (1st and 2nd day), Leon Brimer, Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice chair), Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder, Harriet Wallin.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (contractor), Karin Nørby (contractor) and Riccardo Crebelli (ISS).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell (apologies)

- **EFSA:**

- FIP Unit: Annamaria Rossi, Maria Carfí and Maria Anastassiadou
- DATA Unit: Davide Arcella (2nd and 3rd day) and Francesca Mancini (2nd and 3rd day).

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Karl-Heinz Engel and Miguel Angel Granero Rosell.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the draft notes and minutes of the 6th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 8-10 June 2015 in Parma

The minutes of the 6th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 8-10 June 2015 were agreed.

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.49Rev1 – (EFSA-Q-2011-00049 and EFSA-Q-2011-01015)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.2. FGE.302 – (EFSA-Q-2014-00060)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

5.3. FGE.400 – (EFSA-Q-2012-00871)

The draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.4. FGE.407 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00244)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

5.5. FGE.408 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00246)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

5.6. FGE.409 - (EFSA-Q-2014-00712 to -00713)

The draft Scientific Opinion was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group.

6. Any Other Business

None

7. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Copenhagen on 17 - 19 November 2015.

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

**Minutes of the 6th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 9-11 June 2015, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 22 September 2015)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh (1st and 2nd day), Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel (2nd and 3rd day), Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice chair) (the afternoon of the 2nd day by teleconference), Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (contractor) and Karin Nørby (contractor)

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

- FIP Unit: Annamaria Rossi, Maria Carfí and Maria Anastassiadou

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Paul Fowler and Harriet Wallin.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the draft notes and minutes of the 5th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 21-23 April 2015 in Parma

The minutes of the 5th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 21-23 April 2015 were agreed.

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1. FGE.09Rev6 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00318)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.2. FGE.49Rev1 - (EFSA-Q-2011-00049 and EFSA-Q-2011-01015)

The strategy for the risk assessment of FGE.49 Revision 1 will be discussed at the next CEF Panel.

5.3. FGE.51Rev2 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00315 to -00317 and -00319)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.4. FGE.75Rev1 - (EFSA-Q-2013-00194)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.5. FGE.90Rev1 - (EFSA-Q-2013-00195 to -00196)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.6. FGE.99Rev1 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00321) -

The Draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.7. FGE.313 - (EFSA-Q-2013-00837 and EFSA-Q-2015-00320 and -00322)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

5.8. FGE.406 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00082)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

5.9. FGE.407 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00244)

This topic was not discussed due to lack of time.

6. Any Other Business

None

7. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Rome on 22 - 24 September 2015.

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

**Minutes of the 5th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 21-23 April 2015, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 9 June 2015)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh, Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel (Vice chair, 2nd and 3rd day), Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy, Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder, Harriet Wallin

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (contractor) and Karin Nørby (contractor)

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

- FIP Unit: Maria Carfi and Maria Anastassiadou

-

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 3-5 March 2015, Parma (Italy)

The minutes of the 4th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 3-5 March 2015 were agreed.⁴

5 Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1 FGE.18Rev5 - (EFSA-Q-2013-00852)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.2 FGE.49Rev1 - (EFSA-Q-2011-00049 and EFSA-Q-2011-01015)

FGE.49Rev1 will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.3 FGE.57Rev1 - (EFSA-Q-2014-00339 to-00341)

FGE.57Rev1 will be further evaluated at a later flavouring working group meeting.

5.4 FGE.67Rev2 - (EFSA-Q-2014-00145)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.5 FGE.212Rev3 – FGE.19 Subgroup 2.6a - (EFSA-Q-2013-00992 to -01011)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.6 FGE.213Rev2 – FGE.19 Subgroup 2.7 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00138 to -00139)

FGE.213Rev2 will be further evaluated at the next Genotoxicity Working Group meeting.

5.7 FGE.215Rev1 – FGE.19 Subgroup 3.2 - (EFSA-Q-2015-00180 to -00186)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

5.8 FGE.226Rev1 – FGE.19 Subgroup 1.1.1b - (EFSA-Q-2015-00205)

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/fipwgs/docs/flavouringswg.pdf>

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

5.9 FGE.302 – (EFSA-Q-2014-00060)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in the next CEF Panel meeting.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 9 - 11 June 2015.

Standing Working Group on Flavourings of the Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

**Minutes of the 4th Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 3-5 March 2015, Copenhagen (Denmark)
(Agreed on 21 April 2015)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh, Paul Fowler, Karl-Heinz Engel (1st and 2nd day),
Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (1st and 2nd day), Wim Mennes (Chair) and
Gerard Mulder.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (contractor) and Karin Nørby (contractor).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

- FIP Unit: Annamaria Rossi, Maria Carfí and Maria Anastassiadou

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Leon Brimer and Harriet Wallin.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 21-22 January 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the 3rd Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 21-22 January 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 FGE.21Rev5 - Thiazoles, thiophene, thiazoline and thienyl derivatives - (EFSA-Q-2014-00119 to -00121 and EFSA-Q-2013-00861 to - 00864)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in the next CEF Panel meeting.

5.2 FGE.35Rev1 – Three quinine salts from the priority list from chemical group 30 - (EFSA-Q-2011-01033 to -01035)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.3 FGE.49Rev1 – Xanthine alkaloids from the priority list - (EFSA-Q-2011-00049 and EFSA-Q-2011-01015)

FGE.49Rev1 will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.4 FGE.57Rev1 – Pulegone and related substances - (EFSA-Q-2014-00339 to -00341)

The working group discussed the available data / information. FGE.57Rev1 will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ Please add here the link to the respective minutes published on the EFSA website

5.5 FGE.67Rev2 - Alkoyl-substituted furans - (EFSA-Q-2014-00146)

FGE.67Rev2 will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.6 FGE.302 – N-(2-methylcyclohexyl)-2,3,4,5,6-pentafluorobenzamide - (EFSA-Q-2014-00060)

FGE.302 will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

6. Any Other Business

None

7. Next meetings

Next meeting was scheduled in Parma from 21 to 22 April 2015.

Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 3rd Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings Held on 21-22 January 2015, Parma (Italy) (Agreed on 3 March 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh (1st day), Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler (1st day), Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder and Harriet Wallin.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (contractor) and Karin Nørby (contractor).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

- FIP Unit: Annamaria Rossi, Maria Carfí and Maria Anastassiadou

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Fowler and Trine Husøy.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 16-18 December 2014, Rome (Italy).

The minutes of the 2nd Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 16-18 December 2014 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 FGE.13Rev3 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives - (EFSA-Q-2014-00421 to 00422)

The evaluation of FGE.13Rev3 depends on the outcome of the risk assessment of [FL-no: 13.059] in FGE.67Rev2.

5.2 FGE.21Rev5 - Thiazoles, thiophene, thiazoline and thienyl derivatives - (EFSA-Q-2014-00119 to -00121 and EFSA-Q-2013-00861 to - 00864)

FGE.21Rev5 will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.3 FGE.25Rev3 – Aliphatic hydrocarbons from chemical group 31 - (EFSA-Q-2013-00185)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/fip/fipwgs.htm>

5.4 FGE.35Rev1 – Three quinine salts from the priority list from chemical group 30 - (EFSA-Q-2011-01033 to -01035)

FGE.35Rev1 will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.5 FGE.49Rev1 – Xanthine alkaloids from the priority list - (EFSA-Q-2011-00049 and EFSA-Q-2011-01015)

FGE.49Rev1 will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.6 FGE.67Rev2 - Alkoyl-substituted furans - (EFSA-Q-2013-00853 to -00859; EFSA-Q-2014-00146; EFSA-Q-2014-00388 and 00389; EFSA-Q-2014-00416 to 00420)

FGE.67Rev2 will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

6. Any Other Business

The meeting scheduled in Parma from 2 to 4 June 2015 has been postponed. The new dates are from 9 to 11 June 2015.

7. Next meetings

Next meeting was scheduled in Copenhagen from 3 to 5 March 2015.

Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 2nd Meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings Held on 16-18 December 2014, Rome (Italy) (Agreed on 21 January 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh, Leon Brimer (1st and 2nd day), Karl-Heinz Engel (1st and 2nd day), Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder and Harriet Wallin (1st and 2nd day).

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (contractor), Karin Nørby (contractor) and Francesca Marcon (2nd and 3rd day).

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

- FIP Unit: Annamaria Rossi, Maria Carfí and Maria Anastassiadou
- Application Desk: Carla Martino (3rd day)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Fowler and Trine Husøy.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 7-9 October 2014, Copenhagen (Denmark).

The minutes of the 1st Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 7-9 October 2014 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 FGE.13Rev3 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives - (EFSA-Q-2014-00421 to 00422)

The evaluation of FGE.13Rev3 depends on the outcome of the risk assessment of [FL-no: 13.059] in FGE.67Rev2.

5.2 FGE.21Rev5 - Thiazoles, thiophene, thiazoline and thienyl derivatives - (EFSA-Q-2014-00119 to -00121 and EFSA-Q-2013-00861 to - 00864)

The draft scientific opinion has been presented by the rapporteur. This FGE will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.3 FGE.48Rev2 - 2-aminoacetophenone - (EFSA-Q-2014-00338)

The WG considered the additional data/information submitted by the applicant and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting for additional information.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/fip/fipwgs.htm>

5.4 FGE.67Rev2 - Alkoyl-substituted furans - (EFSA-Q-2013-00853 to -00859; EFSA-Q-2014-00146; EFSA-Q-2014-00388 and 00389; EFSA-Q-2014-00416 to 00420)

The draft scientific opinion has been presented by the rapporteur. This FGE will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.5 FGE.76Rev2 - Thiazoles A / Thiazolines A derivatives - (EFSA-Q-2014-00675 to -00679)

The draft scientific opinion has been presented by the rapporteur. This FGE will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

5.6 FGE.78Rev2 - Aliphatic and alicyclic and aromatic hydrocarbons evaluated by JECFA - (EFSA-Q-2013-00185 to -00192 and EFSA-Q-2013-00845)

The draft scientific opinion was finalised by the WG and will be presented for adoption in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting.

5.7 FGE.93Rev2 - Sulfur containing heterocyclic compounds evaluated by JECFA - (EFSA-Q-2014-00682 and EFSA-Q-2014-00683)

FGE.93Rev2 will be further evaluated at the next flavouring working group meeting.

6. Any Other Business

No other business was raised.

7. Next meetings

Next meeting was scheduled in Parma from 21 to 22 January 2015.

Food Ingredients and Packaging Unit (FIP UNIT)

**Scientific Panel Food Contact Materials, Enzymes,
Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)**
Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings
Held on 7-9 October 2014, Copenhagen (Denmark)
(Agreed on 16 December 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ulla Beckman Sundh, Leon Brimer, Karl-Heinz Engel (Vice chair), Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy (Vice chair), Wim Mennes (Chair), Gerard Mulder, Harriet Wallin

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Vibe Beltoft (DTU contractor), Karin Nørby (DTU contractor), Sean Taylor (IOFI), Ben Smith (IOFI), Thierry Cachet (IOFI), Jan Demyttenaere (EFFA) and Philippe Vanparys (IOFI/EFFA consultant)

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel Angel Granero Rosell

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Annamaria Rossi

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Trine Husøy, Karl-Heinz Engel and Paul Fowler.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 19th CEF Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 4-6 June 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 19th Flavouring Working Group meeting held on 4-6 June 2014 were agreed.

They will be published on EFSA website <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/fip/fipwgs.htm>

5. Hearing Experts

Sean Taylor, Ben Smith, Thierry Cachet, Jan Demyttenaere and Philippe Vanparys were invited to present their views solely for item 7.2 on behalf of the European Flavour Association and International Organization of the Flavouring Industry. They attended the meeting on 7 October 2014 from 14:00 to 16:00.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁵, EFSA invited Sean Taylor, Ben Smith, Thierry Cachet, Jan Demyttenaere and Philippe Vanparys to submit an ADol. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Panel, in accordance with the applicable legal framework⁶.

6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

6.1 FGE.13Rev3 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives - (EFSA-Q-2014-00421 to 00422)

This discussion has been postponed for the next meeting due to lack of time.

6.2 FGE.21Rev5 - Thiazoles, thiophene, thiazoline and thienyl derivatives - (EFSA-Q-2014-00119 to -00121 and EFSA-Q-2013-00861 to - 00864)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

6.3 FGE.35Rev1 - Quinine salts - (EFSA-Q-2011-01033 to -01035)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was agreed by the WG and will be introduced in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting for adoption.

6.4 FGE.57Rev1 –isopulegone and related substances - (EFSA-Q-2014-00346 and EFSA-Q-2014-00339 to -00341)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

6.5 FGE.65Rev1 Sulphur-substituted furan derivatives - (EFSA-Q-2014-00477 to 00479)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was agreed by the WG and will be introduced in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting for adoption.

6.6 FGE.67Rev2 - Alkoyl-substituted furans - (EFSA-Q-2013-00853 to -00859; EFSA-Q-2014-00146; EFSA-Q-2014-00388 and 00389; EFSA-Q-2014-00416 to 00420)

This discussion has been postponed for the next meeting due to lack of time.

6.7 FGE.77Rev2 - Pyridine, pyrrole and quinoline derivatives - (EFSA-Q-2014-00195 to -00197)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was agreed by the WG and will be introduced in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting for adoption.

6.8 FGE.78Rev2 - Aliphatic and alicyclic and aromatic hydrocarbons evaluated by JECFA - (EFSA-Q-2013-00185 to -00192 and EFSA-Q-2013-00845)

The WG requires additional information to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation is currently suspended, awaiting submission of the additional information requested.

6.9 FGE.86Rev2 - Aliphatic and aromatic amines and amides evaluated by JECFA - (EFSA-Q-2013-00865 and EFSA-Q-2014-00071)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was agreed by the WG and will be introduced in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting for adoption.

6.10 FGE.303Rev1 - Splianthol - (EFSA-Q-2013-00438)

The Draft Scientific Opinion was agreed by the WG and will be introduced in a forthcoming CEF Panel meeting for adoption.

7. Any Other Business

7.1 New EFSA Scientific Opinion Template

The new Template for Scientific Opinions adopted by the EFSA Scientific Committee was presented.

7.2 Hearing Experts attended the WG meeting from 14:00 to 16:00 on 7th October 2014 to discuss the following issues: FGE.200, FGE.203 and FGE.213.

Upon request from EFSA, the applicant was given the opportunity to present at a technical hearing the additional information available and outline additional planned studies for FGE.200, FGE.203Rev1 and FGE.213Rev.1. Following discussion during the hearing a number of points requiring further clarification were identified. After the hearing was finished, and the hearing expert(s) left the room/teleconference, the WG discussed the clarifications provided by the applicant.

8. Next meeting

Next meeting was scheduled from 16 to 18 December in Rome.