

26-29 April 2024

09:00-13:00

MINUTES – Agreed on 10 May 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

On 26.04.2024:

Gabriele Aquilina,¹ Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

On 29.03.2024:

Georges Bories and Jürgen Gropp

- Hearing Experts²:
Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable

- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Nicole Bozzi Cionci, Maria Dulak-Lis, Orsolya Holcznecht, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies for absence were received from Luca Tosti.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ Gabriele Aquilina attended the discussion only in the relation to agenda items 4.5 and 4.6.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1 Draft opinion on Perlite (E599) as anticaking agent for all terrestrial animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00704](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.2 Draft opinion on Clinoptilolite of volcanic origin (E567) for all terrestrial animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00674](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.3 Draft Opinion on Lutein-rich extract of *Tagetes erecta* for turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2023-00483](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.4 Draft Opinion on Interban® (10 % Narasin and 0.2 % Diclazuril) for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2023-00748](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.5 Draft opinion on Availa® Cr (Chromium chelate of DL-methionine) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2023-00453](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

4.6 Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 - Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories: Tea tree oil ([EFSA-Q-2024-00119](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.7 Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 - Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.8 Follow-up opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2013-01021 Xanthan gum for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00078](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.9 Request for a scientific opinion under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 on additives for use in animal nutrition – Safety of additives containing selenium for the consumers ([EFSA-Q-2023-00896](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4 Any Other Business

None

5 Next meeting

24 May 2024

05 April 2024

09:00-13:00

MINUTES – Agreed on 05 April 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Georges Bories and Jürgen Gropp
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Request for a scientific opinion under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 on additives for use in animal nutrition – Safety of additives containing selenium for the consumers ([EFSA-Q-2023-00896](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4 Any Other Business

None

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



5 Next meeting

26-29 April 2024

22-25 March 2024

09:00-13:00

MINUTES – Agreed on 29 March 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

On 22.03.2024:

Gabriele Aquilina,¹ Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

On 25.03.2024:

Georges Bories and Jürgen Gropp

- Hearing Experts²:

Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

- EFSA:

FEEDCO Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Rosella Brozzi, Jordi Tarres-Càll, Maria Dulak-Lis, Joana Firmino, Orsolya Holcznecht, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Fabiola Pizzo,

- Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ Gabriele Aquilina attended the discussion only in the relation to agenda items 4.5 and 4.6.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1 Follow-up opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2019-00804 KemTRACE chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00166](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.2 Safety of for KemTRACE Chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00350](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.3 Draft Opinion on Tartrazine 2a102 for freshwater fish ([EFSA-Q-2022-000779](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.4 Draft Opinion on Lutein-rich extract of *Tagetes erecta* for turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2023-00483](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.5 Draft Opinion on Polyethyleneglycol of fatty acids from soya oil (E487) for calves ([EFSA-Q-2013-00070](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.6 Draft Opinion on Interban® (10 % Narasin and 0.2 % Diclazuril) for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2023-00748](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.7 Draft opinion on L-valine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM80365 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00439](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

4.8 Draft opinion on L-lysine sulphate containing non-viable biomass of genetically modified *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00484](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

4.9 Draft opinion on L-lysine base, liquid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00482](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.10 Request for a scientific opinion under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 on additives for use in animal nutrition – Safety of additives containing selenium for the consumers ([EFSA-Q-2023-00896](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4 Any Other Business

None



5 Next meeting

5 April 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Henriqueta Louro, Francesca Marcon, Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

- Hearing Experts¹:
Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable

- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Maria Dulak-Lis, Jordi Ortuño, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Anita Radovnikovic

- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft Opinion on NITTEN DFAIII (Difructose anhydride III) for all ruminants. ([EFSA-Q-2022-000811](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



- 4.2 Follow-up opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2013-00681 Ferric (III) ammonium hexacyanoferrate (II) (AFCF) for ruminants (domestic and wild), calves prior to the start of rumination, sheep, lambs prior to the start of rumination, goats, kids prior to the start of rumination and pigs (domestic and wild) ([EFSA-Q-2024-00023](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

- 4.3 Draft Opinion on Polyethyleneglycol of fatty acids from soya oil (E487) for calves ([EFSA-Q-2013-00070](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

- 4.4 Draft Opinion on AveMix® 02CS (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase, endo-1,3 (4)-beta-glucanase and polygalacturonase) for piglets (weaned) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00635](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

- 4.5 Draft opinion on AveMix 02 CS (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase, endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase and polygalacturonase) for piglets (suckling) ([EFSA-Q-2022-00882](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

- 4.6 Draft opinion on Calcium D-pantothenate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00452](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4 Any Other Business

None

5 Next meeting

22 March 2024 (to be confirmed)

12 January 2024

09:00-13:00

MINUTES – Agreed on 12 January 2024

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Paul Brantom, Georges Bories, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair), Davor Želježić, and Ruud Woutersen

- Hearing Experts¹:
Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable

- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Daniel Pagès Plaza, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo and Maria Vittoria Vettori

- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft Opinion on Canthaxanthin for chickens for fattening, minor poultry species for fattening, laying poultry and poultry reared for laying, ornamental fish and ornamental birds except ornamental breeder hens, ornamental breeder hens ([EFSA-Q-2021-001489](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.2 Draft opinion on CAROPHYLL Red 10% (Canthaxanthin) for breeder hens ([EFSA-Q-2021-00150](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3 Follow-up opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2016-00314 Cashew nutshell liquid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00354](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

4.4 Follow-up opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2020-00323 Vitamin B2 (riboflavin produced by *Eremothecium ashbyi* CCTCCM 2019833) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00693](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

4.5 Draft opinion on Safety of Balancius™ (Muramidase produced by *Trichoderma reesei* DSM 32338, EC 3.2.1.17) for laying hens ([EFSA-Q-2022-00318](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

4.6 Draft opinion on AveMix® XG 10 (xylanase and beta-glucanase produced by *T. longibrachiatum* (MUCL 49755 & 49754)) for laying hens and minor poultry species for fattening and laying ([EFSA-Q-2021-00673](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4 Any Other Business

None

5 Next meeting

9 February 2024 (to be confirmed)

15 December 2023

09:00-13:00

MINUTES – Agreed on 15 December 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Paul Brantom, Georges Bories, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Henriqueta Louro, Francesca Marcon, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

- Hearing Experts¹:
Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable

- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Nicole Bozzi Cionci, Joana Firmino, Alberto Navarro Villa, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Anita Radovnikovic and Maria Vittoria Vettori

- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies for absence were received from Luca Tosti.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft Opinion on Free Yeast F (Fumonisin B1 esterase (3.1.1.87) produced by *Komagataella phaffii* NCAIM (P) Y001485) for piglets (suckling and weaned piglets), pigs for fattening, sows for reproduction, sows, in order to have benefit in piglets ([EFSA-Q-2021-00470](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.2 Draft opinion on L-threonine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM80367 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00873](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.3 Draft opinion on L-tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM80346 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00882](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.4 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2020-00405](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.5 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2021-00074](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.6 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium) for chickens for fattening and turkeys ([EFSA-Q-2016-00643](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.7 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2020-00837](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.8 Follow-up opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2019-00591 Nilablend™ 200G (lasalocid A sodium and nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2023-00519](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4 Any Other Business

None

5 Next meeting

12 January 2024

9-10 November 2023

09:00-13:00

MINUTES – Agreed on 10 November 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

On 9.11.2023:

Georges Bories, Jürgen Gropp, Roberto Villa (chair)

On 10.11.2023:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Paul Brantom, Georges Bories, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

- Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

- EFSA:

FEEDCO Unit: Yolanda García Cazorla, Orsolya Holcznecht, Paola Manini, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Barbara Rossi and Maria Vittoria Vettori

- Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1 Draft opinion on Sacox (salinomycin sodium) for rabbits for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2020-00282](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.2 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2020-00405](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2021-00074](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium) for chickens for fattening and turkeys ([EFSA-Q-2016-00643](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.5 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2020-00837](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.6 Follow-up opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2019-00591 Nilablend™ 200G (lasalocid A sodium and nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2023-00519](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

4.7 Follow-up opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2019-00804 KemTRACE chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00166](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.8 Draft opinion on KemTRACE Chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00350](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.9 Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 - Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories – Celery seeds oil ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.10 Draft opinion on ECONASE® XT (beta-1,4-xylanase 4a8, CBS 114044) for laying hens, minor poultry and pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2022-00027](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

4.11 Draft opinion on Natugrain® TS, Natugrain® TS L (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (EC 3.2.1.8.) produced by the genetically modified *Aspergillus niger* CBS 109.713 and endo-1,4-beta-glucanase (EC 3.2.1.4.) ([EFSA-Q-2023-00042](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.



4 Any Other Business

None

5 Next meeting

15 December 2023

79th Working Group meeting on Toxicology

19-20 October 2023

09:00-13:00 (19.10.2023)

14:30-15:30 (19.10.2023)

09:00-13:00 (20.10.2023)

MINUTES – Agreed on 20 October 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

On 19.10.2023:

Maria Bastos, Georges Bories,¹ Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp,¹ Francesca Marcon, Luca Tosti, Ruud Woutersen

On 20.10.2023:

Maria Bastos, Paul Brantom, Georges Bories, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

- Hearing Experts²:

Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

- EFSA:

FEEDCO Unit: Nicole Bozzi Cionci, Jaume Galobart, Orsolya Holcznecht, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Jordi Ortuño, Alberto Navarro Villa, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Barbara Rossi and Maria Vittoria Vettori

- Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Alberto Mantovani.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ G. Bories and J. Gropp did not attend the discussion on agenda item 4.7.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1 Draft opinion on Sacox (salinomycin sodium) for rabbits for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2020-00282](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2020-00405](#)).

The draft scientific opinion was not discussed due to the lack of time.

4.3 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2021-00074](#)).

The draft scientific opinion was not discussed due to the lack of time.

4.4 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium) for chickens for fattening and turkeys ([EFSA-Q-2016-00643](#)).

The draft scientific opinion was not discussed due to the lack of time.

4.5 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2020-00837](#)).

The draft scientific opinion was not discussed due to the lack of time.

4.6 Draft opinion on the update on the Guidance on studies concerning the safety of use of the additive for users/workers ([EFSA-Q-2022-00226](#)).

The Working Group discussed the comments received during the public consultation and decided to present the Guidance, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

4.7 A general discussion on the toxicological assessment of microbial based additives and the suitability of the test items took place.

4.8 Draft opinion on FUMzyme® (Fumonisin esterase EC 3.1.1.87) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00203](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.9 Follow-up opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2021-00075 Natupulse® TS/Natupulse® TS L (endo-1,4-beta-D-mannanase, EC 3.2.178) for all growing poultry species (chickens for fattening, turkeys for fattening and minor growing poultry species and other poultry for fattening (e.g. ducks, geese, pheasants, quail, guinea fowl, ostrich) and ornamental birds ([EFSA-Q-2023-00545](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.10 Follow-up opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2010-01043 Propyl gallate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2023-00231](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.11 Draft opinion on Cylactin® (*Enterococcus faecium* (proposed as *Enterococcus lactis*) NCIMB 10415) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2023-00203](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarifications.

4 Any Other Business



None

5 Next meeting

10 November 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon and Ruud Woutersen.
- Hearing Experts¹:
Alberto Mantovani
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Jaume Galobart, Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft opinion on the update on the Guidance on studies concerning the safety of use of the additive for users/workers ([EFSA-Q-2022-00226](#)).

The Working Group discussed the comments received during the public consultation and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6. Next meeting

19-20 October 2023

15 September 2023

09:30-13:00

MINUTES - Agreed on 15th September 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kjetil Svensson, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

- Hearing Experts¹:
Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable

- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Yvette Dirven, Orsolya Holcznecht, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Alberto Navarro Villa, Jordi Ortuño Casanova, Fabiola Pizzo, Barbara Rossi, Maria Vittoria Vettori

- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2010-01524 - Chlorophyllin Copper Complex E 141 for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2022-00232](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.2 Draft opinion on difructose anhydride III for ruminants ([EFSA-Q-2022-00811](#)).

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3 Draft opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2016-00868 - BioWorma® (*Duddingtonia flagrans* IAH 1297) for all grazing animals ([EFSA-Q-2022-00742](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.4 Draft opinion on Sacox (salinomycin sodium) for rabbits for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2020-00282](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.5 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2020-00405](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.6 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2021-00074](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.7 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium) for chickens for fattening and turkeys ([EFSA-Q-2016-00643](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.8 Draft opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2020-00837](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting

2 October 2023

76th Working Group meeting on Toxicology

29-30 June 2023

14:30-16:30 on 29 June 2023

10:00-12:30 on 30 June 2023

MINUTES - Agreed on 30th June 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

On 29.06.2023

Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Roberto Villa (chair).

On 30.06.2023

Maria Bastos, Paul Brantom, Georges Bories, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Henriqueta Louro, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

- Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

- Hearing Experts representing interested business operators:

Joana Cain, Lee Mangum, Ruud Huibers from Elanco, Anouk Lanckriet from Huvepharma, Richard Coulter, Andrew Hewitt, Kathy Vannatta from Phibro and Giulio Bucci from Zoetis were invited to present their views regarding the item 4.1 "Nicarb[®] (nicarbazine) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00768](#)), on Nicacox[®] (nicarbazine) for chickens for fattening and chickens reared for laying ([EFSA-Q-2021-00259](#)) and on Maxiban G160 (narasin and nicarbazine) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#))" of the present meeting. They attended the meeting from 14:30 to 16:30 (CET time) on 29th June.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA invited Joana Cain, Lee Mangum, Ruud Huibers, Anouk Lanckriet, Richard Coulter, Andrew Hewitt, Kathy Vannatta and Giulio Bucci to submit an ADoI. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

- EFSA:

FEEDCO Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Nicole Bozzi Cionci, Yvette Dirven, Orsolya Holcznecht, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Joana Revés, Maria Vittoria Vettori

- Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Gabriele Aquilina.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1 Applicants' Technical hearing on Nicarb® (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00768](#)), on Nicacox® (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening and chickens reared for laying ([EFSA-Q-2021-00259](#)) and on Maxiban G160 (narsin and nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#)).**

Upon request from EFSA, the applicants were given the opportunity to clarify the data submitted previously to EFSA. After the hearing was finished and the hearing experts left the teleconference, the Working Group discussed the clarifications provided by the industry. EFSA will follow up by providing the applicants with a written summary of the points discussed.

- 4.2 Draft opinion on Quantum Blue (6-phytase) for fish ([EFSA-Q-2021-00313](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

- 4.3 Draft opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2016-00868 - BioWorma® (*Duddingtonia flagrans* IAH 1297) for all grazing animals ([EFSA-Q-2022-00742](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

- 4.4 Draft opinion on Cylactin®, Cernivet® (*Enterococcus faecium* NCIMB 10415) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, minor poultry species for fattening, minor poultry species reared for laying, chicken and minor poultry species reared for breeding, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, ornamental birds, calves for fattening, calves for rearing, kids for fattening, kids for rearing, lambs for fattening, lambs for rearing, minor or other ruminant species for rearing and fattening, sows, piglets (suckling), piglets (weaned), pigs for fattening, pigs for rearing, pigs for reproduction, minor pig species (suckling), minor pig species (weaned), minor pig species for rearing and fattening and minor pig species for reproduction ([EFSA-Q-2020-0391](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

MEETING MINUTES – 29-30 June 2023
76th Working Group meeting on Toxicology



13 July 2023 (to be confirmed)

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon and Ruud Woutersen
- Hearing Experts¹:
Alberto Mantovani
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Jaume Galobart and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft opinion on the update on the Guidance on studies concerning the safety of use of the additive for users/workers ([EFSA-Q-2022-00226](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to send the draft guidance, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting for discussion and possible endorsement for public consultation.

5. Any Other Business

None

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6. Next meeting

29-30 June 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria Bastos, Birgit Dusemund, Henriqueta Louro, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen
- Hearing Experts¹:
Vasileios Bampidis, Alena Pechová
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Orsolya Holczknecht, Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft opinion on E 566 Natrolite-phonolite (PHIL 75®) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2014-00888).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6. Next meeting

20 June 2023
29-30 June 2023

73rd Working Group meeting on Toxicology

24-25 May 2023

09:00-13:00 (24.05.2023)

09:00-13:00 (25.05.2023)

MINUTES – Agreed on 25 May 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

On 24.05.2023:

Maria Bastos, Birgit Dusemund and Henriqueta Louro

On 25.05.2023:

Gabriele Aquilina,¹ Maria Bastos, Paul Brantom, Georges Bories, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

- Hearing Experts²:

Not applicable

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

- EFSA:

FEEDCO Unit: Orsolya Holcznecht, Fabiola Pizzo, Anita Radovnikovic and Maria Vittoria Vettori

- Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ Gabriele Aquilina attended the discussion on agenda item 4.1 only.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1 Draft opinion on decoquinate for chickens for fattening and chickens reared for laying ([EFSA-Q-2021-00428](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

4.2 Draft opinion on dicopper chloride trihydroxide for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00547](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.3 Draft opinion on zinc chloride monohydrate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00548](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.4 Draft opinion on niacinamide for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00512](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

5 Any Other Business

None

6 Next meeting

To be confirmed

72nd Working Group meeting on Toxicology

05-08 May 2023

09:00-13:00 (05.05.2023)

09:00-13:00 (08.05.2023)

MINUTES – Agreed by written procedure on 15 May 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

On 05.05.2023:

Maria Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Fernando Ramos, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen.

On 08.05.2023:

Birgit Dusemund and Maria Bastos

- Hearing Experts¹:
Alberto Mantovani²

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable

- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Jaume Galobart, Orsolya Holcznecht, Jordi Ortuño, Fabiola Pizzo, Barbara Rossi and Maria Vittoria Vettori

- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Francesca Marcon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² A. Mantovani participated to the meeting 05 May 2023.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.1 Draft opinion on the update on the Guidance on studies concerning the safety of use of the additive for users/workers ([EFSA-Q-2022-00226](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

5 Any Other Business

None

6 Next meeting

24-25 May 2023

28 April 2023

09:00-13:00

MINUTES – Agreed 28th April 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen.
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Orsolya Holcznecht, Alberto Navarro Villa, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Barbara Rossi and Maria Vittoria Vettori
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft opinion on NICACOX® (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening and chickens reared for laying ([EFSA-Q-2021-00259](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2 Draft opinion on Maxiban G160 (narasin and nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.3 Draft opinion on Phenylcapsaicin for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2022-00355](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.4 Draft opinion on Quantum Blue (6-phytase) for fish ([EFSA-Q-2021-00313](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.5 Draft opinion on of Iron(II)-betaine complex ([EFSA-Q-2022-00624](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

5 Any Other Business

None

6 Next meeting

5 May 2023

70th Working Group meeting on Toxicology

12-13-14 April 2023

09:00-13:00 (12.04.2023)

09:00-12.30 (13.04.2023)

09:00-13:00 (14.04.2023)

MINUTES – Agreed by written procedure on 19th April 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:

On 12.04.2023:

Birgit Dusemund and Maria Bastos

On 13.04.2023:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund,¹ Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair), Davor Želježić and Ruud Woutersen.

On 14.04.2023:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen.

- Hearing Experts¹:

Alberto Mantovani²

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

- EFSA:

FEEDCO Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Joana Firmino, Orsolya Holcznecht, Paola Manini, Alberto Navarro Villa, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Barbara Rossi, Jordi Tarrès-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori

- Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² A. Mantovani participated to the meeting 14 April 2023.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1 Draft opinion on NICACOX® (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening and chickens reared for laying ([EFSA-Q-2021-00259](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

- 4.2 Draft opinion on Maxiban G160 (narasin and nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

- 4.3 Follow-up opinion linked to EFSA-Q-2010-01524 - Chlorophyllin Copper Complex E 141 for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2022-00232](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

- 4.4 Draft opinion on Patent Blue V as a feed additive for all non-food producing species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00478](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

- 4.5 Draft opinion on *Enterococcus faecium* NCIMB 11181 (Lactiferm®) for piglets (weaned), calves for fattening and calves for rearing ([EFSA-Q-2022-00226](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

- 4.6 Draft opinion on the update on the Guidance on studies concerning the safety of use of the additive for users/workers ([EFSA-Q-2022-00226](#)).**

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

5 Any Other Business

None

6 Next meeting

28 April 2023
5 May 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon and Ruud Woutersen.
- Hearing Experts¹:
Alberto Mantovani
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Yvette Dirven, Paola Manini, Daniel Pagés Plaza and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft opinion on the update on the Guidance on studies concerning the safety of use of the additive for users/workers ([EFSA-Q-2022-00226](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6. Next meeting

13-14 April 2023

16 - 17 March 2023

14:00-16:00 (16.03.2023), 09:00-13.00 (17.03.2023)

MINUTES - Agreed on 17th March 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos,¹ Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund,¹ Jürgen Gropp, Henriqueta Louro, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair), Davor Želježić and Ruud Woutersen.
- Hearing Experts²:
Not applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Orsolya Holcznecht, Paola Manini, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Anita Radovnikovic and Maria Vittoria Vettori
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft opinion on Vitamin B12/Cyanocobalamin produced by fermentation with non-genetically modified *Ensifer adhaerens* CGMCC 19596 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00571](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

¹ M. Bastos and B. Dusemund participated to the whole meeting on 16-17 march 2023.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.2 Draft opinion on NICACOX® (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening and chickens reared for laying ([EFSA-Q-2021-00259](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3 Draft opinion on Maxiban G160 (narasin and nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

4.4 Draft opinion on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 - Apiales and Austrobaileyales for all animal species and categories - Celery seed oil ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.5 Draft opinion on Niacin for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00477](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects.

4.6 Draft opinion on Hydroxy-Analogue of Selenomethionine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00375](#)).

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5 Any Other Business

None

6 Next meeting

24 March 2023

Location: Web conference

Attendees:

- Working Group Members:
Gabriele Aquilina,¹ Maria Bastos,² Georges Bories,² Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson,⁴ Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp,² Henriqueta Louro,² Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson,² Luca Tosti,² Roberto Villa (chair)² and Ruud Woutersen.
- Hearing Experts²:
Alberto Mantovani⁴
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Paola Manini, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Joana Revez, and Maria Vittoria Vettori
- Others:
Not Applicable

I. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
No apologies for absence were received.

II. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

III. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

IV. Scientific topics for discussion

a. Draft opinion on MM (chlorophyllins) for chickens for fattening, turkeys for fattening and minor poultry species. ([EFSA-Q-2021-00573](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

¹ G. Aquilina, M. Bastos, G. Bories, J. Gropp, H. Louro, K. Svensson, L. Tosti and R. Villa did not participate to the discussion of the agenda item 4.7

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



b. Draft opinion on 25-Hydroxycholecalciferol for all pigs, all poultry for fattening and ornamental birds, and other poultry species. ([EFSA-Q-2021-00641](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

c. Draft opinion on 25-Hydroxycholecalciferol for pigs and poultry. ([EFSA-Q-2019-00104](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

d. Draft opinion on 25-Hydroxycholecalciferol for ruminants. ([EFSA-Q-2021-00341](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

e. Draft opinion on Pan-Zoot (pancreatin of porcine pancreas glands) for dogs. ([EFSA-Q-2021-00464](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

f. Draft opinion on Natupulse® TS/Natupulse® TS L (endo-1,4-beta-D-mannanase, EC 3.2.178) for all growing poultry species (chickens for fattening, turkeys for fattening and minor growing poultry species and other poultry for fattening (e.g. ducks, geese, pheasants, quail, guinea fowl, ostrich) and ornamental birds. ([EFSA-Q-2021-00075](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

g. Draft opinion on the update on the Guidance on studies concerning the safety of use of the additive for users/workers. ([EFSA-Q-2022-00226](#))

The WG discussed the draft scientific opinion and decided that further discussion is needed.

V. Any Other Business

None

VI. Next meeting

To be confirmed.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 66th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 9th December 2022

(Agreed on 9th December 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria Bastos, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Yvette Dirven, Stefani Fruk, Jordi Ortuño, Daniel Pagés Plaza, and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Pan-Zoot (pancreatin of porcine pancreas glands) for dogs ([EFSA-Q-2021-00464](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

12-13 January 2023

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 65th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 18th November 2022

(Agreed on 18th November 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members¹:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

■ Hearing Experts^{2,3}:

Vasileios Bampidis, Alena Pechová

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

■ EFSA:

FEEDCO Unit: Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Paola Manini, Alberto Navarro Villa, Jordi Ortuño, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Jordi Tarrés-Call, Maria Vittoria Vettori

■ Others:

Not Applicable

¹ G. Aquilina, B. Dusemund, J. Gropp, L. Tosti, K. Svensson and R. Villa did not participate in the discussion of agenda item 4.9.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

³ The hearing experts have participated only in the discussion of agenda item 4.9



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of 25- Hydroxycholecalciferol for all pigs, all poultry for fattening and ornamental birds, and other poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00641](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of 25-Hydroxycholecalciferol for pigs and poultry ([EFSA-Q-2019-00104](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of 25-Hydroxycholecalciferol for ruminants ([EFSA-Q-2021-00341](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Hostazym X (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, minor poultry species reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for fattening, minor poultry species for fattening, minor poultry species for laying, pigs for fattening, piglets (weaned), carp, breeding hens, turkeys for breeding, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species reared for breeding, minor poultry species for breeding, ornamental birds, suckling piglets and minor pig species for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2021-00153](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of semi-refined carrageenan for dogs and cats ([EFSA-Q-2013-00972](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.6.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Ronozyme® Multigrain (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (EC 3.2.1.8), endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase (EC 3.2.1.6) and endo-1,4-beta-glucanase (EC

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



3.2.1.4), produced by *Trichoderma reesei* (ATCC 74444)) for poultry for fattening other than turkeys for fattening, poultry for laying, turkeys for fattening, piglets (weaned) and pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2021-00498](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

- 4.7.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of aXiphen (Phenylcapsaicin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2022-00355](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.8.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Red carotenoid rich *Paracoccus carotinifaciens* (Panaferd-AX) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2017-00694](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.9.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of MM (chlorophyllins) for chickens for fattening, turkeys for fattening and minor poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00573](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

9 December 2022

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 64th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 10th November 2022

(Agreed on 10th November 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon and Ruud Woutersen
- Hearing Experts¹:
Alberto Mantovani
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini, Daniel Pagès Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Andrew Chesson.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The discussion on the Update on the Guidance on studies concerning the safety of use of the additive for users/workers ([EFSA-Q-2022-00226](#)) continued and the Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

18 November 2022

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 63rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 14th October 2022

(Agreed on 14th October 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Henriqueta Louro, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

■ EFSA:

FEEDCO Unit: Jordi Ortuño, Daniel Pagès Plaza, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo and Maria Vittoria Vettori

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



Apologies for absence were received from Gabriele Aquilina.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Clinacox 0.5% (diclazuril) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2020-00201](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Clinacox 0.5% (diclazuril) chicken for laying ([EFSA-Q-2020-00203](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Nicarb® (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00768](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of 25- Hydroxycholecalciferol for all pigs, all poultry for fattening and ornamental birds, and other poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00641](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on HiPhorius™ (6-phytase (EC 3.1.3.2.6) for all pigs, all avian species and all fish ([EFSA-Q-2022-00082](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.6.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of RONOZYME® WX (xylanase) for all pigs and all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2022-00156](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.7.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Hostazym C (endo-1,4-beta-glucanase (E.C.3.2.1.4)) for chickens for fattening, minor poultry species for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species reared for breeding, minor poultry species reared for laying, ornamental birds, piglets (weaned) ([EFSA-Q-2021-00549](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



- 4.8.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Nutrixtend Optim (beta-mannanase (EC 3.2.1.78) produced by *Aspergillus niger* (CBS 120604)) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2021-00549](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.9.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Cycostat 66 G (robenidine hydrochloride) for rabbits for breeding and rabbits for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2020-00539](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

10 November 2022

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 62nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 5th October 2022

(Agreed on 5th October 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon and Ruud Woutersen
- Hearing Experts¹:
Alberto Mantovani
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
FEEDCO Unit: Paola Manini, Daniel Pagès Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo
FIP Unit: Laura Ruggeri
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Andrew Chesson.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The discussion on the user safety assessment continued and the Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

14 October 2022

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 61st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 22nd September 2022

(Agreed on 22nd September 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon and Ruud Woutersen
- Hearing Experts¹:
Alberto Mantovani
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Paola Manini, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The discussion on the user safety assessment continued and the Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

5 October 2022
14 October 2022

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEEDCO UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 60th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 15th and 16th September 2022

(Agreed on 26th September 2022)¹

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

15.09.2022: Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Kjetil Svensson, Roberto Villa (chair), Ruud Woutersen and D. Zeljezic

16.09.2022: Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

■ Hearing Experts^{2,3}:

Vasileios Bampidis, Marta Lopez and Alena Pechová

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

■ EFSA:

FEEDCO Unit: Daniel Pagés Plaza, Orsolya Holcznecht, Fabiola Pizzo, Joana Revez, Jordi Ortuño, Jordi Tarres, Maria Vittoria Vettori

MESE Unit: Maria Chiara Astuto, Cattaneo Irene, Jose Tarazona

■ Others:

Not Applicable

¹ By written procedure

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

³ The hearing experts have participated only on 16.09.2022 in the discussion of agenda item 4.7



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received by Marta Lopez.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of AVATEC® 150 G (lasalocid A sodium) for pheasants, guinea fowl, quails and partridges (pancreatin of porcine pancreas glands) for dogs ([EFSA-Q-2021-00464](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of and AVATEC® 150G (lasalocid A sodium) for turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2020-00597](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of 25- Hydroxycholecalciferol for all pigs, all poultry for fattening and ornamental birds, and other poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00641](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Sodium saccharin for piglets, pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2021-00528](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of RONOZYME® HiPhos (6-phytase) for poultry, pigs for fattening, weaned piglets and sows ([EFSA-Q-2021-00342](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



- 4.6.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of *Lactobacillus plantarum* DSM 8862 and *Lactobacillus plantarum* DSM 8865 (BIO-SIL) for pigs, bovines, sheep, goats, horses ([EFSA-Q-2021-00131](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.7.** The experts discussed the implementation of the Guidance on technical requirements for regulated food and feed product applications to establish the presence of small particles including nanoparticles and the EFSA SC Guidance on risk assessment of nanomaterials to be applied in the food and feed chain, human and animal health.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

22 September 2022
5 October 2022
14 October 2022



FEEDCO UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 59th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 1st July 2022

(Agreed on 01st July 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen
- Hearing Experts¹:
Alberto Mantovani
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart, Jordi Ortuño Casanova, Paola Manini, Rita Navarrete, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Frank Verdonck
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The discussion on the user safety assessment continued and the Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Pan-Zoot (pancreatin of porcine pancreas glands) for dogs ([EFSA-Q-2021-00464](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

16 September 2022
22 September 2022

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 58th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 17th June 2022

(Agreed on 17th June 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Henriqueta Louro, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Rosella Brozzi, Jordi Ortuño Casanova, Paola Manini, Alberto Navarro Villa, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Joana Revez, Barbara Rossi, Maria Vittoria Vettori
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Sacox® (salinomycin sodium) for rabbits for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2020-00282](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of carmine for dogs and cats ([EFSA-Q-2019-00664](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Chlorophyllin Copper Complex E 141 for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2022-00232](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of E 566 Natrolite-phonolite (PHIL 75®) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00888](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of ProAct 360 (subtilisin protease produced by *Bacillus Licheniformis* (DSM 33099)) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00544](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of AveMix XG 10 (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase and endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase) for piglets (suckling and weaned piglets) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00807](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.7.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Xygest™ HT (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase EC 3.2.1.8) for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2021-00098](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

1 July 2022

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 57th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 25th May 2022

(Agreed on 25th May 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members¹:

Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

■ Hearing Experts^{2,3}:

Alberto Mantovani

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

■ EFSA:

Feed Unit: Jaume Galobart, Paola Manini, Rita Navarrete, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ M. Bastos, G. Bories, J. Gropp and R. Villa participated in the discussion of agenda item 4.1. P. Brantom, A. Chesson, B. Dusemund, F. Marcon, R. Woutersen participated in the discussion of agenda items 4.2.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

³ A. Mantovani participated in the discussion of agenda item 4.2.



No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Sacox® (salinomycin sodium) for rabbits for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2020-00282](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The discussion on the user safety assessment continued and the Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

17 June 2022

1 July 2022

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 56th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 21st April 2022

(Agreed on 21st April 2022)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria Bastos, Romualdo Benigni, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Paola Manini, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Barbara Rossi, Maria Vittoria Vettori
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Gabriele Aquilina and Luca Tosti.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Sacox[®] (salinomycin sodium) for rabbits for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2020-00282](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of QUINOX[®] (Decoquinat) for chickens for fattening and chickens reared for laying ([EFSA-Q-2021-00428](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Locust bean gum for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-01023](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Kieselgur (diatomaceous earth, purified) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00662](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of SGE (Solanum glaucophyllum leaf extract) for dairy cows for milk production and other dairy ruminants ([EFSA-Q-2021-00239](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.6.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Cedarwood texas oil for all animal species and categories and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.7.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of AveMix 02 CS (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase, endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase and polygalacturonase) for piglets (weaned) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00635](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.8.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of AveMix 02 CS (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase, endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase and polygalacturonase) for piglets (suckling) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00840](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification

5. Any other Business

None

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6. Next meeting(s)

To be agreed.



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 55th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 18th March 2022

(Agreed on 18th March 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Romulado Benigni, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Maria Henriqueta Louro, Francesca Marcon, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

■ EFSA:

Feed Unit: Rosella Brozzi, Montserrat Anguita, Yolanda Garcia Cazorla, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* DSM 11520 for horses, cats, dogs and pet rabbits ([EFSA-Q-2021-00687](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Natupulse® TS/Natupulse® TS L (endo-1,4-beta-D-mannanase, EC 3.2.178) for all growing poultry species (chickens for fattening, turkeys for fattening and minor growing poultry species and other poultry for fattening (e.g. ducks, geese, pheasants, quail, guinea fowl, ostrich) and ornamental birds ([EFSA-Q-2021-00075](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of QUINOX® (Decoquinat) for chickens for fattening and chickens reared for laying ([EFSA-Q-2021-00428](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Anpro, a preparation of diatomaceous earth and sepiolite for all terrestrial species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00301](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of RONOZYME® HiPhos (6-phytase) for poultry, pigs for fattening, weaned piglets and sows ([EFSA-Q-2021-00342](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

21 April 2022

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 54th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 18th February 2022

(Agreed on 18th February 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair), Ruud Woutersen and Davor Želježić

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

■ EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Paola Manini, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Jordi Tarrés-Call

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Xylamax (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (EC 3.2.1.8) produced by *Komagataella phaffii* xyl-2 (DSM 33574)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and all minor avian species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00254](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of RONOZYME® HiPhos (6-phytase) for poultry, pigs for fattening, weaned piglets and sows ([EFSA-Q-2021-00342](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of ROVABIO® ADVANCE powder & liquid (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (EC 3.2.1.8), endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase (EC 3.2.1.6)) for pigs for fattening, weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2020-00147](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of L-lysine monohydrochloride, Concentrated Liquid L-lysine, Concentrated Liquid L-lysine monohydrochloride for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2021-00462](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Tocopheryl phosphate mixture (TPM®) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00743](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.6.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of BioCell® (*Saccharomyces cerevisiae* DBVPG 48 SF) for horses, pigs and ruminants ([EFSA-Q-2021-00343](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.7.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Natupulse® TS/Natupulse® TS L (endo-1,4-beta-D-mannanase, EC 3.2.1.78) for all growing poultry species (chickens for fattening, turkeys for fattening and minor growing poultry species and other poultry for fattening (e.g. ducks, geese, pheasants, quail, guinea fowl, ostrich) and ornamental birds ([EFSA-Q-2021-00075](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.⁴

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ Point 4.7 of the minutes was amended on 25.03.2022 to correct a clerical error regarding the outcome of the discussion in the WG. The previous phrase "The WG...finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion" has been replaced with "and decided that further discussion is needed."



5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

4th March 2022

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 53rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 4th February 2022

(Agreed on 4th February 2022)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Henriqueta Louro, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen, Davor Želježić

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

■ EFSA:

Feed Unit: Jordi Ortuño Casanova, Orsolya Holczknecht, Paola Manini, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Francesca Marcon.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Nutrixend Optim (β -mannanase) produced by *Aspergillus niger* (CBS 120604) for poultry for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2021-00549](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Nicarb[®] (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00768](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Nicacox[®] (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening and chickens reared for laying ([EFSA-Q-2021-00259](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Maxiban G160 (narasin and nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of Aviax[®] 5% (semduramicin sodium) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00813](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

18th February 2022

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 52nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 14th January 2022

(Agreed on 14th January 2022)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (chair) and Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Jordi Ortuño Casanova, Paola Manini, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after removing the following item: Safety of Axtra® PHY GOLD 30 L, Axtra® PHY GOLD 30 T, Axtra® PHY GOLD 65 G (6-phytase) for all pigs and all poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00767](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Sepiolitic clay for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00431](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Sepiolite for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00428](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Safety of BLIS K12 (*Streptococcus salivarius* K12) for pets and other non food-producing animals ([EFSA-Q-2021-00501](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Canthaxanthin for chickens for fattening, minor poultry species for fattening, laying poultry and poultry reared for laying, ornamental fish and ornamental birds except ornamental breeder hens, ornamental breeder hens ([EFSA-Q-2021-00149](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on Safety of CAROPHYLL Red 10% (Canthaxanthin) for breeder hens ([EFSA-Q-2021-00150](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

4 February 2022

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 51st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 9-10th December 2021

(Agreed on 10th December 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members¹:

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani, Francesca Marcon, Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts²:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Jaume Galobart, Paola Manini, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Frank Verdonck, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ G. Bories, P. Brantom and J. Gropp participated in the discussion of agenda item 4.1. G. Aquilina, P. Brantom, A. Chesson, B. Dusemund, A. Mantovani, F. Marcon, R. Woutersen participated in the discussion of agenda items 4.2 and 4.3.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of red carotenoid rich *Paracoccus carotinifaciens* (Panaferd-AX) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2017-00694](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

14 January 2022

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 50th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 26th November 2021

(Agreed on 26th November 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Romualdo Benigni, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Matteo Innocenti, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo and Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work : <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



Romualdo Benigni and Gabriele Aquilina participated in the discussion of agenda item 4.7.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of *Lactococcus lactis* (DSM 11037) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00846](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Acacia gum for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-01022](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Guar gum for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-01024](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Aextra® XB 201 TPT and Aextra® XB 201 L (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase EC 3.2.1.8 and endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase (E.C 3.2.1.6)) for all avian species, piglets (suckling and weaned piglets), pigs for fattening, lactating sows (including minor porcine species) and minor growing porcine species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00489](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Cycostat 66 G (robenidine hydrochloride) for rabbits for breeding and rabbits for fattening (FAD-2020-0048) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00539](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.6. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Nicacox (Nicarbazin) ([EFSA-Q-2021-00259](#)) for chickens for fattening and chickens reared for laying and decided that further discussion is needed.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.7. The WG discussed the application on safety of Sunset yellow ([EFSA-Q-2019-00814](#)) for cats and dogs, ornamental fish, grain-eating ornamental birds and small rodents and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

9-10 December 2021



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 49th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 15th-17th and 22nd November 2021

(Agreed on 22nd November 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Orsolya Holczknecht and Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work : <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of red carotenoid rich *Paracoccus carotinifaciens* (Panaferd-AX) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2017-00694](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

26 November 2021

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 48th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 29th October 2021

(Agreed on 29th October 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Romualdo Benigni, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Wolfgang Trunk

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Jordi Tarrés-Call, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



Romualdo Benigni participated in the discussion of agenda item 4.6.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Huvezym neXo (endo-1,4-beta xylanase, endo-1,4-beta-glucanase and xyloglucan-specific-endo-beta-1,4-glucanase) for all poultry species, ornamental birds and piglets (weaned and suckling) ([EFSA-Q-2021-00308](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of VTR-phytase (6-phytase) ([EFSA-Q-2021-00417](#)) for all avian species and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Quantum blue (6-phytase) ([EFSA-Q-2021-00313](#)) for fish and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Cycostat 66G (robenidine hydrochloride) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00539](#)) for rabbits for breeding and rabbits for fattening and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Nicacox (Nicarbazin) ([EFSA-Q-2021-00259](#)) for chickens for fattening and chickens reared for laying and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. The WG discussed the application on safety of Sunset yellow ([EFSA-Q-2019-00814](#)) for cats and dogs, ornamental fish, grain-eating ornamental birds and small rodents and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



15-17-22 November 2021
25-26 November 2021



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 47th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 8th October 2021

(Agreed on 8th October 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Jordi Ortuño Casanova, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Francesca Marcon.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work : <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Creamino (Guanidinoacetic acid) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00521](#)) for all animal species and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of VTR- Xylanase ([EFSA-Q-2021-00427](#)) for piglets (weaned and suckling) and minor growing porcine species and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Sepiolite ([EFSA-Q-2019-00428](#)) for all animal species and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Nicacox ([EFSA-Q-2021-00259](#)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and minor poultry species and decided that further discussion is needed.

Any Other Business

EFSA updated the WG on the outcome of the discussion on FAD-2010-0366 (Sunset yellow) held in the SC WG Genotoxicity.

The WG composition will be updated with one new member. The relevant procedure has been started.

5. Next meeting(s)

29 October 2021

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 46th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 24th September 2021

(Agreed on 24th September 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kettil Svensson, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Jordi Ortuño Casanova, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Martina Reitano, Joana Revez, Jordi Tarrés-Call, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Luca Tosti.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work : <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Creamino (Guanidinoacetic acid) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00521](#)) for all animal species and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Acacia gum ([EFSA-Q-2013-01022](#)) for all animal species and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Guar gum ([EFSA-Q-2013-01024](#)) for all animal species and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Safety of BIO-THREE® (*Bacillus subtilis* TO-A (BS), *Enterococcus faecium* T-110 (EF), *Clostridium butyricum* TO-A (CB)) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00556](#)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and minor poultry species and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on Safety of BA-King (*Bacillus velezensis* TOA5001 (NITE BP-01844)) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00496](#)) for chickens and turkeys for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys reared for breeding and all minor avian and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.6. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Stenorol ([EFSA-Q-2021-00321](#)) for chickens for fattening and turkeys and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.7. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Panaferd (red carotenoid rich *Paracoccus*) ([EFSA-Q-2017-00694](#)) for salmon and trout and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

Any Other Business

EFSA informed the WG that the supplementary data requested for the dossier on sunset yellow (FAD-2010-0366) have been received. The WG agreed to consult the cross-cutting WG on Genotoxicity to have advice on the assessment of the supplementary data.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



5. Next meeting(s)

8 October 2021



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 45th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 10th September 2021

(Agreed on 10th September 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jordi Ortuño Casanova, Paola Manini, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Georges Bories.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Capsozyme SB Plus (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase and alpha-galactosidase) ([EFSA-Q-2021-00174](#)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying and minor poultry species for fattening and reared for laying and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of rosemary extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2020-00728](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Safety of HOSTAZYM® X (endo-1,4-beta xylanase) ([EFSA-Q-2021-00153](#)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, minor poultry species reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for fattening, minor poultry species for fattening, minor poultry species for laying, pigs for fattening, piglets (weaned), carp, breeding hens, turkeys for breeding, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species reared for breeding, minor poultry species for breeding, ornamental birds, suckling piglets and minor pig species for fattening and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

24 September 2021

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 44th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 18th June 2021

(Agreed on 18th June 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Gloria Lopèz Galvèz, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Bovaer® 10 (3-nitrooxypropanol) ([EFSA-Q-2019-00592](#)) for dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, other ruminants for milk production, other ruminants for reproduction and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Maxiban (narasin and nicarbazin) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00282](#)) for chickens for fattening and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Safety of AveMix® XG 10 (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase and endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00807](#)) for piglets (suckling and weaned piglets) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Safety of ZENzyme® (zearalenone hydrolase) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00008](#)) for all terrestrial animal species and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

10 September 2021

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 43rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 8th June 2021

(Agreed on 8th June 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Roberto Villa (Chair)

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Fabiola Pizzo, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the request to provide scientific technical assistance to the Commission on MRLs for Halquinol ([EFSA-Q-2021-00238](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the document.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

18 June 2021

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 42nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 25th May 2021

(Agreed on 25th May 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Roberto Villa (Chair)

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Fabiola Pizzo, Daniel Pagés Plaza, Martina Reitano, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the request to provide scientific technical assistance to the Commission on MRLs for Halquinol ([EFSA-Q-2021-00238](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

8 June 2021

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 41st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 07-11 May 2021

(Agreed on 14 May 2021)¹

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts:

Not Applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Paola Manini, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Daniel Pagés, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Gabriele Aquilina, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti and Ruud Woutersen attended the meeting on 07.05.2021 only.

¹ By written procedure



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Bovaer® 10 (3-nitrooxypropanol) ([EFSA-Q-2019-00592](#)) for dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, other ruminants for milk production, other ruminants for reproduction and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Sacox® (salinomycin sodium) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00093](#)) for rabbits for fattening and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.3 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Maxiban (narasin and nicarbazin) ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#)) for chickens for fattening and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.4 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Avemix® 02CS (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase, endo-1,3 (4)-beta-glucanase and polygalacturonase) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00635](#)) for piglets (weaned) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

4.5 The WG discussed the application on Safety of AveMix® XG 10 (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase and endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00807](#)) for piglets (suckling and weaned piglets) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

4.6 The WG discussed the application on Safety of AveMix® 02 CS (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase, endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase and polygalacturonase) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00840](#)) for piglets (suckling) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

4.7 The Working Group (WG) discussed the request to provide scientific technical assistance to the Commission on MRLs for halquinol ([EFSA-Q-2021-00238](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6. Next meeting(s)

25 May 2021



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 40th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 23-26 April 2021

(Agreed on 26 April 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts:

Jans Didier and Alienor Poher have participated in agenda item 5.1

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Gloria Lopèz-Galvèz, Jordi Ortuño Casanova, Jaume Galobart, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Gabriele Aquilina attended the meeting on 23.04.2021.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Applicant hearing experts

Jans Didier and Alienor Poher were invited to present their views to elaborate on the specific questions they were called upon to answer solely for item 5.1 - Safety of sodium nitrites for cats and dogs - of the present meeting on behalf of the applicant (Eusalt a.i.s.b.l.). They attended the meeting from 9.00 to 10.00 (CET time).

In accordance with EFSA's Independence Policy 2017 and implementing rules⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director of the European Food Safety Authority on Competing Interest Management⁶, EFSA invited Didier Jans and Alienor Poher to submit an ADoI. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Panel, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 The WG⁷ discussed the application on Safety of sodium nitrite for dogs and cats (EFSA-Q-2010-01462). Upon request from EFSA, the applicant was given the opportunity to present at a hearing the information available. After the hearing was finished, and the hearing experts left the teleconference, the WG discussed the clarifications provided by the applicant. EFSA will follow up by providing the applicant with a written summary of the points discussed and the next steps and relative timelines.

5.2 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Axtra® PHY GOLD 30 L, Axtra® PHY GOLD 30 T, Axtra® PHY GOLD 65 G (6- phytase) (EFSA-Q-2020-00767) for all pigs, all poultry species and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5.3 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Capsozyme SB Plus (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase and alpha-galactosidase) (EFSA-Q-2021-00174) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying and minor poultry species for fattening and reared for laying and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ EFSA's Independence Policy 2017 and implementing rules:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/consultation/110707b.pdf>

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director of the European Food Safety Authority on Competing Interest Management:

<https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>

⁷ Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Roberto Villa and Ruud Woutersen participated to the discussion of agenda items 5.1.



5.4 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Bovaer® 10 (3-nitrooxypropanol) ([EFSA-Q-2019-00592](#)) for dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, other ruminants for milk production, other ruminants for reproduction and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.5 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Anpro, a preparation of diatomaceous earth and sepiolite ([EFSA-Q-2019-00301](#)) for all terrestrial species and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5.6 The WG discussed the application on Safety of titanium dioxide (EFSA-Q-2010-01522) for all animal species and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5.7 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00405](#)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.8 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00837](#)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and decided that further discussion is needed.

8.9 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Coxidin (monensin sodium) ([EFSA-Q-2016-00643](#)) for chickens for fattening and turkeys and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.10 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) ([EFSA-Q-2021-00074](#)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.11 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Clinacox 0.5% (contains 0.5 g diclazuril per 100 g) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00201](#)) for chickens reared for laying and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5.12 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Clinacox 0.5% (contains 0.5 g diclazuril per 100 g) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00203](#)) for chickens reared for laying and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5.13 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Riboflavin 5'-phosphate ester monosodium salt produced by *Bacillus subtilis* KCCM-10445 ([EFSA-Q-2020-00838](#)) for all animal species and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

6. Any Other Business

None.

7. Next meeting(s)

7 May 2021



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 39th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 20th April 2021

(Agreed on 20th April 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp, Roberto Villa (Chair)

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Fabiola Pizzo and Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the request to provide scientific technical assistance to the Commission on MRLs for halquinol ([EFSA-Q-2021-00238](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

23-26 April 2021

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 38th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 9th April 2021

(Agreed on 19th April 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettill Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo and Maria Vittoria Vettori

FIP Unit: Ana Maria Rincon, Camilla Smeraldi

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on Safety of Anpro, a preparation of diatomaceous earth and sepiolite for all terrestrial species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00301](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG did not discuss the application on Safety of Riboflavin 5'-phosphate ester monosodium salt produced by *Bacillus subtilis* KCCM-10445 for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2020-00838) due to the lack of time.
- 4.3. The WG did not discuss the applications on Safety of Coxidin ([EFSA-Q-2016-00643](#), [EFSA-Q-2020-00405](#), [EFSA-Q-2020-00837](#)) due to the lack of time.
- 4.4. The WG did not discuss the applications on Safety of Clinacox 0.5% ([EFSA-Q-2020-00201](#), [EFSA-Q-2020-00203](#)) for chickens reared for laying due to the lack of time.

5. Any Other Business

The WG has been updated on the outcome of the assessment on titanium dioxide (E 171) when used as a food additive. The WG has been informed that the supplementary information for the application dossier on titanium dioxide for use as additive in feed ([EFSA-Q-2010-01522](#); FAD-2010-00297) has been received by EFSA on 6.04.2021.

6. Next meeting(s)

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



20 April 2021



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 37th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 19 March 2021

(Agreed on 26 March 2021)¹

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair)

Hearing Experts:

Sabina Diaz, Naveed Honorvar, Diane Shanahan have participated in agenda item 5.10

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Ruud Woutersen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ By written procedure



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Applicant hearing experts

Sabina Diaz, Naveed Honorvar and Diane Shanahan were invited to present their views to elaborate on the specific questions they were called upon to answer solely for item 5.10 - Safety of CIBENZA® PHYTAVERSE® G10, CIBENZA® PHYTAVERSE® L10 (6-phytase) - of the present meeting on behalf of the applicant (*Novus Europe S.A./N.V.*). They attended the meeting from 16:15 to 17:45 (CET time).

In accordance with EFSA's Independence Policy 2017 and implementing rules⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director of the European Food Safety Authority on Competing Interest Management⁷, EFSA invited Sabina Diaz, Naveed Honorvar, Diane Shanahan to submit an ADol. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Panel, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on Safety of buthylated hydroxyanisole (BHA) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00809](#)) for cats and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5.2 The WG discussed the application on Safety of L-glutamic acid and its sodium salt (monosodium glutamate monohydrate) produced using strain NITE BP-01681 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00502](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5.3 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Coxidin (monensin sodium) (EFSA-Q-2016-00643) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.4 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00405](#)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and decided that further discussion is needed.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ EFSA's Independence Policy 2017 and implementing rules:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/consultation/110707b.pdf>

⁷ Decision of the Executive Director of the European Food Safety Authority on Competing Interest Management:

<https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>



5.5 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, wheat bran)) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00837](#)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.6 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Coxidin (monensin sodium (carrier perlite, calcium carbonate)) ([EFSA-Q-2021-00074](#)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.7 The following item was not discussed due to lack of time: Safety of Cycostat 66 G (Robenidine Hydrochloride) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00539](#)) for rabbits for breeding and rabbits for fattening.

5.8 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Clinacox 0.5% (contains 0.5 g diclazuril per 100 g) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00201](#)) for chickens reared for laying and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.9 The WG discussed the application on Safety of Clinacox 0.5% (contains 0.5 g diclazuril per 100 g) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00203](#)) for chickens reared for laying and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.10 The WG⁸ discussed the application on Safety of CIBENZA® PHYTAVERSE® G10, CIBENZA® PHYTAVERSE® L10 (6-phytase) for piglets (weaned), pigs for fattening, sows for reproduction, minor porcine species, chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, minor avian species excluding laying birds, minor avian species for laying ([EFSA-Q-2018-00421](#)). Upon request from EFSA, the applicant was given the opportunity to present at a hearing the additional information available. Following discussion during the hearing, a number of points requiring further clarification was identified. After the hearing was finished, and the hearing experts left the teleconference, the WG discussed the clarifications provided by the applicant. EFSA will follow up by providing the applicant with a written summary of the points discussed and the next steps and relative timelines.

6. Any Other Business

None.

7. Next meeting(s)

9th April 2021

⁸ Gabriele Aquilina, Jürgen Gropp and Francesca Marcon participated to the discussion of agenda items 5.10.



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 36th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 26 February 2021

(Agreed on 26 February 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair) and Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Paola Manini, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo and Jordi Tarrés-Call

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

Gabriele Aquilina participated to the discussion of agenda items 4.3.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Creamino® (Guanidinoacetic acid) (EFSA-Q-2020-00521) for all animal species and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Vitamin B2 (riboflavin) produced by *Bacillus subtilis* KCCM-10445 (EFSA-Q-2020-00160) for all animal species and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the Safety of CIBENZA® PHYTAVERSE® G10, CIBENZA® PHYTAVERSE® L10 (6-phytase) (EFSA-Q-2018-00421) for piglets (weaned), pigs for fattening, sows for reproduction, minor porcine species, chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, minor avian species excluding laying birds, minor avian species for laying and decide to organise an Applicant's hearing.⁶
- 4.4. The WG discussed the Safety of Bovaer® 10 (3-nitrooxypropanol) (EFSA-Q-2019-00592) for dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, other ruminants for milk production, other ruminants for reproduction and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.2903/sp.efsa.2016.EN-1025>



6. Next meeting(s)

19th March 2021

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 35th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 29 January 2021

(Agreed on 29 January 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair) and Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Matteo L. Innocenti, Fabiola Pizzo, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Creamino® (Guanidinoacetic acid) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00521](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Vitamin B2 (Riboflavin produced by *Eremothecium ashbyii* CCTCCM 2019833) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00323](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Sodium nitrite for dogs and cats ([EFSA-Q-2010-01462](#)) and decided to organise an Applicant's hearing.⁶
- 4.4. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of NILABLEND 200G (Lasalocid A sodium - Nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.5. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Allura Red for small mammals and ornamental birds ([EFSA-Q-2020-00290](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.6. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Sunset Yellow FCF for cats and dogs, grain eating ornamental birds, ornamental fish, small rodents ([EFSA-Q-2019-00814](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

None.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.2903/sp.efsa.2016.EN-1025>



6. Next meeting(s)

26th February 2021



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 34th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 7-8 January 2021

(Agreed on 8 January 2021)

Participants

Working Group Members:

07.01.2021: Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair) and Ruud Woutersen

08.01.2021: Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettill Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair) and Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Rosella Brozzi, Orsolya Holczknecht, Matteo L. Innocenti, Gloria Lopez-Galvez, Paola Manini, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Bafasal® (preparation of bacteriophages F/00069, F/00070, F/00071 and F/00097 infecting *Salmonella enterica* ser. Gallinarum B/00111) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00724](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of ECONASE® XT (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase) for piglets (weaned), pigs for fattening, chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding and minor poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00330](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Creamino® (Guanidinoacetic acid) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00521](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of BIO-THREE® (*Bacillus subtilis* TO-A (BS), *Enterococcus faecium* T-110 (EF), *Clostridium butyricum* TO-A (CB)) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00556](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.5. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Vitamin B2 (riboflavin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00160](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



- 4.6. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Sodium nitrite for dogs and cats ([EFSA-Q-2010-01462](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.7. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of KemTRACE chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00804](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.8. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Maxiban G160 contains 80 g narasin and 80 g nicarbazin per Kg for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.9. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Nicarb® (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00768](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.10. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of NILABLEND 200G (Lasalocid A sodium - Nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.11. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Allura Red for small mammals and ornamental birds ([EFSA-Q-2020-00290](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.12. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of Sunset Yellow FCF for cats and dogs, grain eating ornamental birds, ornamental fish, small rodents ([EFSA-Q-2019-00814](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

The WG composition will be updated with one new member. The relevant procedure has been started.

6. Next meeting(s)

29th January 2021



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 33rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 4 December 2020

(Agreed on 14 December 2020)¹

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp, Fernando Ramos, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts²:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Orsolya Holczknecht, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo and Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ By written procedure.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



Paul Brantom, Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Ruud Woutersen participated to the discussion of agenda item 4.1.

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Fernando Ramos, Jürgen Gropp participated to the discussion of agenda items 4.2, 4.3, 4.4., 4.5 and 4.6.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁶, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the Safety of Indigo carmine for cats, dogs and ornamental fish ([EFSA-Q-2017-00502](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the Safety of Vitamin E/all-rac-alpha tocopheryl acetate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00005](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the Safety of RRR alpha tocopheryl acetate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00156](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the Safety of Vitamin E/all-rac-alpha tocopheryl acetate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00148](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the Safety of Vitamin E/all-rac-alpha tocopheryl acetate (3a700) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00146](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.6. The WG discussed the Safety of Vitamin E/all-rac-alpha tocopheryl acetate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00136](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



None.

6. Next meeting(s)

7-8 January 2021.



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 32nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 20 November 2020

(Agreed on 20 November 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Orsolya Holczknecht, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



Luca Tosti and Gabriele Aquilina participated to the discussion of the agenda items 4.2, 4.3 and 4.4.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Vitamin B2 (Riboflavin produced by *Ermothecium ashbyii* CCTCCM 2019833) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00323](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of NILABLEND 200G (Lasalocid A sodium - Nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Maxiban G160 contains 80 g narasin and 80 g nicarbazin per Kg for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Nicarb® (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00768](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

4 December 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 31st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 13 November 2020

(Agreed on 13 November 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Jürgen Gropp, Roberto Villa (Chair)

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Orsolya Holczknecht, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo and Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work : <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of NILABLEND 200G (Lasalocid A sodium - Nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

The WG composition will be updated with one new member. The relevant procedure has been started.

6. Next meeting(s)

20th November 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 30th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 23 October 2020

(Agreed on 23 October 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kettill Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Lucilla Gregoretti, Matteo L. Innocenti, Gloria Lopez-Galvez, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work : <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the Safety of Copper chelate of Ethylenediamine (CuEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00215](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the Safety of Iron chelate of Ethylenediamine (FeEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00215](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the Safety of Carrageenan gum for pet species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00970](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the Safety of Vitamin E/all-rac-alpha tocopheryl acetate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00005](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the Safety of RRR alpha tocopheryl acetate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00156](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.6. The WG discussed the Safety of Vitamin E/all-rac-alpha tocopheryl acetate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00148](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.7. The WG discussed the Safety of Vitamin E/all-rac-alpha tocopheryl acetate (3a700) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00146](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.8. The WG discussed the Safety of Vitamin E/all-rac-alpha tocopheryl acetate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00136](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

To be agreed.



Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting, Dr Paul G. Brantom declared the following interest: he signed off a study cited by JECFA in 1999 and he was involved in the discussion with the Philippine sponsors of this work and in the subsequent politics of eventual approval of PNG carrageenan at JECFA and FDA. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest (CoI). This results in the exclusion of the expert from any discussion, voting or other processing of item 4.3 (Safety of Carrageenan gum for pet species) by the concerned scientific group.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 29th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 8-9 October 2020

(Agreed on 9 October 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos,¹ Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts²:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Orsolya Holczknecht, Lucilla Gregoretti, Gloria López-Gálvez, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Konstantinos Sofianidis and Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ He participated on 9th October

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



No apologies for absence were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after the withdrawal of the item 'Safety of Allura red for small mammals and ornamental birds ([EFSA-Q-2020-00290](#))'.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁶, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the Safety of NILABLEND 200G (Lasalocid A sodium - Nicarbazine) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the Safety of Indigo carmine for cats, dogs and ornamental fish ([EFSA-Q-2017-00502](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the Safety of Nicarb® (nicarbazine) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00768](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the Safety of Maxiban G160 contains 80g narasin and 80g nicarbazine per Kg for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the Safety of Zinc chelate of Ethylenediamine (ZnEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.6. The WG discussed the Safety of Manganese chelate of Ethylenediamine (MnEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.7. The following items were not discussed due to lack of time: Safety of Copper chelate of Ethylenediamine (CuEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00059](#)) and Safety of Iron chelate of Ethylenediamine (FeEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-01016](#)).

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

23rd October 2020

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 28th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 25 September 2020

(Agreed on 25 September 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Orsolya Holczknecht, Jaume Galobart, Matteo L. Innocenti, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work : <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Caramel colours for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00215](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of NILABLEND 200G (Lasalocid A sodium - Nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Guar gum for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-01024](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Tragacanth gum for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-01020](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Carrageenan gum for pet species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00970](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

8-9 October 2020

Annex

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting, Dr Paul G. Brantom declared the following interest: he signed off a study cited by JECFA in 1999 and he was involved in the discussion with the Philippine sponsors of this work and in the subsequent politics of eventual approval of PNG carrageenan at JECFA and FDA. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest (CoI). This results in the exclusion of the expert from any discussion, voting or other processing of item 4.5 (Safety of Carrageenan gum for pet species) by the concerned scientific group.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 27th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 11 September 2020

(Agreed on 11 September 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Orsolya Holczknecht, Gloria López-Gálvez, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work : <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of NILABLEND 200G (Lasalocid A sodium - Nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Kemtrace chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00804](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

25 September 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 26th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 26 June 2020

(Agreed on 26 June 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Konstantinos Sofianidis, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Fernando Ramos.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Caramel colours (E 150b, E 1650c and E 150d) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00215](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Copper chelate of Ethylenediamine (CuEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00059](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Iron chelate of Ethylenediamine (FeEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-01016](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

To be agreed.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 25th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 12 June 2020

(Agreed on 12 June 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Orsolya Holczknecht, Gloria López-Gálvez, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Jürgen Gropp.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on Safety of Stenorol® (halofuginone hydrobromide) (EFSA-Q-2012-00407) for chickens for fattening and turkeys and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Caramel colours (E 150b, E 1650c and E 150d) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2019-00215) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on KemTRACE chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species (EFSA-Q-2019-00804) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

26th June 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 24th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 29 May 2020

(Agreed on 29 May 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts:

Roselinde Goselink, Philippe Guion, Marie-Julie Hannoun, A.J.M.(Alfons) Jasman, Diana Jonker have participated in agenda item 5.1

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Jaume Galobart, Lucilla Gregoretti, Gloria López-Gálvez, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Applicant hearing experts

Roselinde Goselink, Philippe Guion, Marie-Julie Hannoun, A.J.M.(Alfons) Jasman and Diana Jonker were invited to present their views to elaborate on the specific questions they were called upon to answer solely for item 5.1 – Safety of dried killed bacterial biomasses produced by genetically modified *Escherichia coli* strain FERM BP-10942 (PT73) or *Escherichia coli* strain FERM BP-10941 (PL73) of the present meeting on behalf of the applicant (Ajinomoto Animal Nutrition Europe). They attended the meeting from 09:00 to 11:00 (CET time).

In accordance with EFSA's Independence Policy 2017 and implementing rules⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director of the European Food Safety Authority on Competing Interest Management⁶, EFSA invited Roselinde Goselink, Philippe Guion, Marie-Julie Hannoun, A.J.M.(Alfons) Jasman and Diana Jonker to submit an ADol. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Panel, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on Safety of dried killed bacterial biomasses produced by genetically modified *Escherichia coli* strain FERM BP-10942 (PT73) or *Escherichia coli* strain FERM BP-10941 (PL73) ([EFSA-Q-2020-00132](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)). Upon request from EFSA, the applicant was given the opportunity to clarify some outstanding issues related to the application. After the hearing was finished and the hearing experts left the teleconference, the WG discussed the clarifications provided by the applicant. EFSA will follow up by providing the applicant with a written summary of the points discussed.

5.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Manganese chelate of ethylenediamine ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)) for all animal species and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

6. Any Other Business

None.

¹ [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

² [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

³ [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

⁴ [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

⁵ EFSA's Independence Policy 2017 and implementing rules:

<https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/consultation/110707b.pdf>

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director of the European Food Safety Authority on Competing Interest Management:

<https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>



7. Next meeting(s)

12th June 2020

26th June 2020

10th July 2020



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 23rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 13 May 2020

(Agreed on 13 May 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Mohan Raj, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Lucilla Gregoretti, Gloria López-Gálvez, Orsolya Holczknecht, Paola Manini, Konstantinos Sofianidis, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Zinc chelate of ethylenediamine ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)) for all animal species and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on NILABLEND 200G (Lasalocid A sodium Nicarbazine) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

29th May 2020
12nd June 2020
26th June 2020
10th July 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 22nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 04 May 2020

(Agreed on 04 May 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Kettil Svensson, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Jaume Galobart, Gloria López-Gálvez, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo.

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on Safety of dried killed bacterial biomasses produced by genetically modified *Escherichia coli* strain FERM BP-10942 (PT73) or *Escherichia coli* strain FERM BP-10941 (PL73) ([EFSA-Q-2017-00724](#)) and decide to organise an Applicant's hearing.⁶
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Safety of Zearalenone hydrolase (ZENzyme®) for all terrestrial animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00008](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

13th May 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.2903/sp.efsa.2016.EN-1025>



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 21st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 22 April 2020

(Agreed on 22 April 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts¹:

Alberto Mantovani

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Jaume Galobart, Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo.

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The discussion on the user safety assessment continued and the Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

4th May 2020

13rd May 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 20TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 17 April 2020

(Agreed on 17 April 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Mohan Raj, Fernando Ramos, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez, Orsolya Holczknecht, Paola Manini, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Jordi Tarrés-Call, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on NILABLEND 200G (Lasalocid A sodium Nicarbazine) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Caramel colours (E 150b, E 1650c and E 150d) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00215](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3. The following item was not discussed: Dried killed bacterial biomasses produced by genetically modified *Escherichia coli* strain FERM BP-10942 (PT73) or *Escherichia coli* strain FERM BP-10941 (PL73) ([EFSA-Q-2017-00724](#)) (application under Article 29 of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002).
- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of RONOZYME® ProAct (serine protease EC 3.4.21.- produced by *Bacillus licheniformis* DSM 19670) ([EFSA-Q-2019-00156](#)) for chickens for fattening and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Zinc chelate of ethylenediamine ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)) for all animal species and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. The following item was not discussed: Zearalenone hydrolase (ZENzyme®) for all terrestrial animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00008](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003).
- 4.7. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety sorbitan monolaureate ([EFSA-Q-2019-00595](#)) for all animal species and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5. Any Other Business

None.



6. Next meeting(s)

22nd April 2020 (user safety)



Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regards to this meeting, Dr. Ruud Woutersen declared the following interest: his signature appears in two reports on user safety for agenda item 4.4 (RONOZYME® ProAct - EFSA-Q-2019-00156). He explained that he was not the study director and he was not involved in the execution of the work; his signature represented the approval of the management. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest (CoI) since experts 'are not allowed to assess, rate or review their own work'.

This resulted in the exclusion of the expert from the discussion of the two reports above.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 19TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 26 March 2020

(Agreed on 26 March 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts¹:

Alberto Mantovani

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Jaume Galobart, Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo.

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

No apologies for absence were received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The initial discussion on the user safety assessment took place and the Working Group decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

17th April 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 18TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

Web-conference, 05 March 2020

(Agreed on 05 March 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jürgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kettill Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Jaume Galobart, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori.

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a teleconference to avoid traveling to Parma in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Bovaer®10 (3-nitrooxypropanol) for dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, other ruminants for milk production, other ruminants for reproduction ([EFSA-Q-2019-00592](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Caramel colours (E 150b, E 1650c and E 150d) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00215](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Sunset Yellow FCF for cats, dogs, grain eating ornamental birds, ornamental fish, small rodents ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of dried killed bacterial biomasses produced by genetically modified *Escherichia coli* strain FERM BP-10942 (PT73) or *Escherichia coli* strain FERM BP-10941 (PL73) ([EFSA-Q-2017-00724](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

The WG composition will be updated with two new members. The relevant procedure has been started.

6. Next meeting(s)

26th March 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 17TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 14 February 2020

(Agreed on 14 February 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Birgit Dusemund, Jurgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kettill Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Rosella Brozzi, Orsolya Holczknecht, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori.

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies for absence were received from Paul Brantom.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Avatec 150G (Lasalocid A sodium) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, minor avian species (pheasants, guinea fowl, quails and partridges) ([EFSA-Q-2019-00494](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on NILABLEND 200G (Lasalocid A sodium Nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Bovaer®10 (3-nitrooxypropanol) for dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, other ruminants for milk production, other ruminants for reproduction ([EFSA-Q-2019-00592](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of BAFASAL® for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00724](#)) and decided to contact the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

5th March 2020 (physical meeting in Parma).

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 16TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 31 January 2020

(Agreed on 31 January 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul George Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jurgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts¹:

Not applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Rosella Brozzi, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of BAFASAL® for all avian species (EFSA-Q-2017-00724) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on ammonium formate (E 295) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2018-00341) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

14 February 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 15TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 10 January 2020

(Agreed on 10 January 2020)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul George Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Jurgen Gropp, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts¹:

Alberto Mantovani

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart, Orsolya Holczknecht, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori.

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Avatec 150G (Lasalocid A sodium) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, minor avian species (pheasants, guinea fowl, quails and partridges) ([EFSA-Q-2019-00494](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on NILABLEND 200G (Lasalocid A sodium Nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Bovaer®10 (3-nitrooxypropanol) for dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, other ruminants for milk production, other ruminants for reproduction ([EFSA-Q-2019-00592](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

To be agreed.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 14TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 17 December 2019

(Agreed on 17 December 2019)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Fabiola Pizzo

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Birgit Dusemund.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Bovaer®10 (3-nitrooxypropanol) for dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, other ruminants for milk production, other ruminants for reproduction ([EFSA-Q-2019-00592](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

10 January 2020

31 January 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 13TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 29 November 2019

(Agreed on 29 November 2019)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul George Brantom, Fernando Ramos, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair), Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Orsolya Holczknecht, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Birgit Dusemund and Francesca Marcon.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Stenorol® (halofuginone hydrobromide) (EFSA-Q-2012-00407) for chickens for fattening and turkeys and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of RONOZYME® VP (CT) and RONOZYME® VP (L) (endo-1,3(4)-β-glucanase (IUB No 3.2.1.6)) (EFSA-Q-2019-00528) for weaned piglets and chickens for fattening and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

17 December 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 12TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 30 October 2019

(Agreed on 30 October 2019)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa (Chair of the WG) and Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Fernando Ramos.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Lancer (lanthanide-citrate) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2019-00380](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

29 November 2019

17 December 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 11TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 20 September 2019

(Agreed on 20 September 2019)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Kjetil Svensson, Roberto Villa
(Chair of the WG) and Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies for absence were received from Fernando Ramos and Luca Tosti.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of endo-1,4-beta-xylanase and alpha-galactosidase (Capsozyme SB Plus) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying and minor poultry species for fattening and reared for laying ([EFSA-Q-2017-00837](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of endo-1,4-beta-xylanase, alpha-amylase and protease (Aextra® XAP 104 TPT) for chickens for fattening, laying hens and all minor poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00717](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The Working group discussed the application on Safety of endo-1,4-beta-xylanase, endo-1,4-beta-glucanase (Natugrain® TS and Natugrain® TS L) in sows in order to have benefit in piglets species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00651](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

To be agreed.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 10TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 16 September 2019

(Agreed on 16 September 2019)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Roberto Villa (Chair of the WG), Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp, Josef Schlatter and Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Orsolya Holczknecht and Maria Vittoria Vettori

Nutri Unit: Reinhard Ackerl and Hans Steinkellner

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on astaxanthin dimethyldisuccinate (CAROPHYLL® Stay-Pink) for salmon and trout, crustaceans and other fish ([EFSA-Q-2017-00499](#)) finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

20 September 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 9TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 06 September 2019

(Agreed on 06 September 2019)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa, Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Fabiola Pizzo

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with/without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety of Lancer (lanthanide-citrate) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2019-00380](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of OptiPhos® PLUS (6-phytase) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species for fattening, minor poultry species reared for laying, minor poultry species reared for breeding and ornamental birds ([EFSA-Q-2019-00303](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

16 September 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 8TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 16 July 2019

(Agreed on 16 July 2019)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Roberto Villa, Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp, Josef Schlatter and Ruud Woutersen

Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Orsolya Holczknecht and Maria Vittoria Vettori

Nutri Unit: Reinhard Ackerl and Hans Steinkellner

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on astaxanthin dimethyldisuccinate (CAROPHYLL® Stay-Pink) for salmon and trout, crustaceans and other fish ([EFSA-Q-2017-00499](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

6 September 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 7TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 05 July 2019

(Agreed on 05 July 2019)¹

Participants

Working Group Members:

Roberto Villa, Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp, Josef Schlatter, Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts²:

Not Applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Orsolya Holczknecht, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

Nutri Unit: Hans Steinkellner, Reinhard Ackerl, Wolfgang Gelbmann

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁶, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on FAD-2017-0029 Safety and efficacy of Astaxanthin dimethyldisuccinate (CAROPHYLL® Stay-Pink) for salmon and trout, crustaceans and other fish ([EFSA-Q-2017-00499](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

16 July 2019

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 6TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 14 June 2019

(Agreed on 14 June 2019)¹

Participants

Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Fernando Ramos, Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa, Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts²:

Not Applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Jordi Tarrés-Call.

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work : <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with/without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁶, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of L-glutamine produced using strain *Corynebacterium glutamicum* NITE BP-02524 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00693](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate (feed grade) produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80172 ([EFSA-Q-2018-00438](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

5 July 2019

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 5TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 24 May 2019

(Agreed on 24 May 2019)¹

Participants

Working Group Members:²

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Francesca Marcon, Kettil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa and Ruud Woutersen.

Hearing Experts³:

Not Applicable

European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Orsolya Holczknecht, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo.

Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁷, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of MSG (monosodium L-glutamate) produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80188 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00037](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of Citranaxanthin (Lucantin CX® forte) for laying hens ([EFSA-Q-2015-00767](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of Iron chelate of Ethylenediamine (FeEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-01016](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of Copper chelate Ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00059](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

14 June 2019

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁷ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 4TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 03 May 2019

(Agreed on 03 May 2019)¹

Participants

n Working Group Members:²

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Kjetil Svensson, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa and Ruud Woutersen.

n Hearing Experts³:

Not Applicable

n European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

n EFSA:

Feed Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Orsolya Holczknecht, Elisa Pettenati, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori.

n Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Fernando Ramos.

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁷, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of Astaxanthin dimethyldisuccinate for salmon and trout, crustaceans and other fish ([EFSA-Q-2017-00499](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of IMP (disodium 5'-inosinate) produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium ammoniagenes* KCCM 80161 ([EFSA-Q-2019-00040](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of Belfeed B MP/ML (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase produced by *Bacillus subtilis* LMG S-15136) for sows in order to have benefit in piglets and all porcine species and life stages ([EFSA-Q-2018-00253](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

To be agreed.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁷ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 3RD MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 22 March 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 22 March 2019)

Participants

n Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa and Ruud Woutersen.

Fernando Ramos participated in agenda items 4.1, 4.2, 4.3 and 4.4.

n Hearing Experts¹:

Not Applicable

n European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

n EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Rosella Brozzi, Gloria Lopez-Galvez, Matteo L. Innocenti, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo.

n Others:

Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of Zinc chelate of ethylenediamine as feed additive for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of Manganese chelate of ethylenediamine as feed additive for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of Biomin® DC-P (preparation of oregano oil, caraway oil, carvacrol, methyl salicylate and L-menthol) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, minor avian species other than laying species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00418](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of Gellan gum as feed additive for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2018-00815](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of APSA PHYTAFEED® 20,000 GR, APSA PHYTAFEED® 20,000 L (6-phytase) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying and minor poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00478](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4.6. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of preparation of bacteriophages (3sent1, 8sent65, 8sent1748 & 5sent1) (BAFASAL®) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00724](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

5 April 2019

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 2ND MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON TOXICOLOGY

WEB-conference, 8 February 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 8 February 2019)¹

Participants

n Working Group Members:²

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa.

Apologies for absence were received from Ruud Woutersen.

Fernando Ramos participated in the agenda items 4.3 and 4.4

n Hearing Experts³:

Not Applicable

n European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

n EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Maria Vittoria Vettori

n Others:

Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy Ronozyme® WX (CT)/Ronozyme® WX (L) (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase) for sows for reproduction ([EFSA-Q-2018-00622](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of CIBENZA® PHYTAVERSE® G10, CIBENZA® PHYTAVERSE® L10 (6-phytase) for piglets (weaned), pigs for fattening, sows for reproduction, minor porcine species, chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for fattening, turkeys reared for breeding, minor avian species excluding laying birds, minor avian species for laying ([EFSA-Q-2018-00421](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.3. The working group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of *Macleaya cordata* extract (Sangrovit®) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate using *Escherichia coli* NITE BP-02526 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00782](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



6. Next meeting(s)

To be agreed

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Toxicology

WEB-conference, 25 January 2019

(Agreed on 25 January 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund, Francesca Marcon, Luca Tosti, Roberto Villa, Ruud Woutersen.

Fernando Ramos has participated in agenda point 4.1 and 4.2

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez, Paola Manini, Fabiola Pizzo, Jordi Tarrés-Call.

- **Others:**

Not applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokeZ C-10) for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2013-01029) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of L-tryptophan produced with *Escherichia coli* CGMCC11674 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00380](#)) and finalised the assessment related to the toxicological aspects of the draft opinion.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of ferric citrate chelate for piglets (weaned, suckling) and minor porcine species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00758](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of Zinc chelate of ethylenediamine as feed additive for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Safety and efficacy of Manganese chelate of ethylenediamine as feed additive for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

8 February 2019 (AM)

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting, Dr. Dusemund declared the following interest: co-authoring in a review paper on dietary manganese exposure in adult population in Germany (not published yet). In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf