



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 144TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 9 December 2020

(Agreed on 9 December 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG), Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing experts:
Loic Bureau (expert in phytochemistry and nutraceuticals, consultant for MANGHEBATI SAS), Florence Hinault (MANGHEBATI SAS, contact point for FEFANA asbl) and Isabelle Machet (MANGHEBATI SAS, contact point for FEFANA asbl)
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Experts

Mr. Loic Bureau, Ms. Florence Hinault and Ms. Isabelle Machet were invited to present their view for item 5.2 of the present meeting "irrespective of whether they hold potential CoI", in accordance with Article 9 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management.³ They attended the meeting from 10:00 for one hour.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA invited Mr. Loic Bureau, Ms. Florence Hinault and Ms. Isabelle Machet to submit an ADoI. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁶

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.2. Clarification on the additional information submitted and discussion on the data required for the risk assessment of substances of concern in botanical preparations.

Upon request from EFSA, the applicant MANGHEBATISAS, contact point for FEFANA asbl, was given the opportunity clarify some outstanding issues related to the presence of substances of concern in several preparations from Botanically defined group 02. After the hearing was finished, and the hearing experts left the teleconference, the WG discussed the clarifications provided by the applicant.

EFSA will follow up by providing the applicant with a written summary of the points discussed and the next steps and relative timelines.

5.3. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 – Gentianales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-01182](#)/ FEFANA asbl) and decided that further discussion is needed.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>



- 5.4.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

The WG composition will be updated with two new members. The relevant procedure has been started.

7. Next meeting

22 January 2021



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 143RD MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 27 November 2020

(Agreed on 27 November 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.

The following item was removed from the agenda: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#))



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided to invite the applicant to a technical hearing at the next meeting of the WG to provide clarification on the additional information submitted.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)/ FEFANA asbl) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

9 December 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 142ND MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 10-11 November 2020

(Agreed on 11 November 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01296 ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#))) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 – Apiales and Austrobaileyales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The WG discussed the application on Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)) and decide to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

27 November 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 141ST MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 20 October 2020

(Agreed on 20 October 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01296 ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#))) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

10-11 November 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 140TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 2 October 2020

(Agreed on 2 October 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Jaume Galobart and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.



The following item was removed from the agenda: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on the Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

20 October 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 139TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 15-16 September 2020

(Agreed on 16 September 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.



The following item was removed from the agenda: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on the Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

2 October 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 138TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 17 July 2020

(Agreed by written procedure on 21 July 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on *Verbascum thapsus* L. (great mullein tincture) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00449](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 – Gentianales: Gentian tincture for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-00182](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

15 September 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 137TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 23 June 2020

(Agreed on 23 June 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on the Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

17 July 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 136TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 3 June 2020

(Agreed on 3 June 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on the Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3.** The WG discussed the application on the Mugwort tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00344](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.4.** The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#))

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

23 June 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 135TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 8 May 2020

(Agreed on 8 April 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on the Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)/ FEFANA asbl) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

3 June 2020



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 134TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 3 April 2020

(Agreed on 3 April 2020)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The meeting originally scheduled as a physical meeting was converted into teleconference to avoid traveling to Parma in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection.

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.2.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.3.** The WG continued the discussion on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4.** The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 – Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

8 May 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 133RD MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Parma, 3-4 March 2020

(Agreed on 4 March 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The meeting originally scheduled as a physical meeting was converted into teleconference to avoid traveling to Parma in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection. EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 – Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Lemon extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00680](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

3 April 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 132ND MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 7 February 2020

(Agreed on 7 February 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG),
Francesca Marcon and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG continued the discussion on the application on Dry grape extract 60-20 for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2019-00036](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 14 for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-00180](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Lemon extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00680](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

The WG composition has been updated with a new member, Francesca Marcon (starting from this meeting). Francesca Marcon is a member of the FEEDAP Panel and during 2019 has participated in several WG meetings as a hearing expert.

6. Next meeting

3-4 March 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 131ST MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 17 January 2020

(Agreed on 17 January 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing experts:
Francesca Marcon
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2.** The Working Group discussed the application on Dry grape extract 60-20 for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2019-00036](#)/ ACTIV'INSIDE and Spécialités Pet Food (SPF - DIANA PET FOOD) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

7 February 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 130TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 13 December 2019

(Agreed on 13 December 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG)
and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 – Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

17 January 2020

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 129TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 6 December 2019

(Agreed on 6 December 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf

■ Hearing experts:

Benjamin Costerousse (Saqual – consultant for FEFANA asbl), Alicia Juárez Pallarés (FEFANA asbl) and Manfred Lützow (Saqual– consultant for FEFANA asbl) have participated for item 5.2

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Almudena Rodríguez Sánchez-Beato has participated for item 5.2

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Experts

Mr. Benjamin Costerousse, Ms. Alicia Juárez Pallarés and Mr. Manfred Lützow were invited to participate in the working group meeting "irrespective of whether they hold potential CoI", in accordance with Article 9 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management.³ They attended the meeting from 9:30 for two hours.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA invited Mr. Benjamin Costerousse, Ms. Alicia Juárez Pallarés and Mr. Manfred Lützow to submit an ADoI. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁶

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)/ FEFANA asbl) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.2. Discussion on the data required for the risk assessment of substances of concern in botanical preparations.

Upon request from EFSA, the applicant FEFANA was given the opportunity to clarify some outstanding issues related to the presence of substances of concern in several *Citrus* preparations from Botanically defined group 08. After the hearing was finished, and the hearing experts left the teleconference, the WG discussed the clarifications provided by the applicant.

EFSA will follow up by providing the applicant with a written summary of the points discussed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>



7. Next meeting

13 December 2019



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 128TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 26 November 2019

(Agreed on 26 November 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG)
and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing experts:
Francesca Marcon
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

6 December 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 127TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 5 November 2019

(Agreed on 5 November 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

26 November 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 126TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 28 October 2019

(Agreed on 28 October 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Francesca Marcon
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

5 November 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 125TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Held on 16-17 October 2019

(Agreed on 17 October 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the Working Group), Johannes Westendorf and Maria de Lourdes Bastos.
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Paola Manini and Lucilla Gregoretti
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Olive extract, olive leaf extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 21 - Aromatic ketones, secondary alcohols and related esters: 4-phenylbut-3-en-2-one [07.024] and benzophenone [07.032] for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00453](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 12 - Gentianales: Gentian tincture for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2011-00182](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

None

6. Next meeting(s)

28 October 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 124TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 27 September 2019

(Agreed on 27 September 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund (Chair of the WG) and Johannes Westendorf
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Maria de Lourdes Bastos and Lucilla Gregoretti.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on the Olive extract, olive leaf extract (*Olea europaea* L.) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the applications on the CGD 05 II ([EFSA-Q-2015-00599](#)) and CDG 08 II ([EFSA-Q-2016-00163](#)) for all animal species and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanical Group 09 Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) for all animal species and categories and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) for all animal species and categories and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

16-17 October 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 123RD MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Meeting, 19 July 2019

(Agreed on 19 July 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on the Olive extract, olive leaf extract (*Olea europaea* L.) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the applications on the CGD 05 II ([EFSA-Q-2015-00599](#)) and CDG 08 II ([EFSA-Q-2016-00163](#)) for all animal species and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanical Group 09 Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

27 September 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 122ND MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Meeting, 25-26 June 2019

(Agreed on 26 June 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom,¹ Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini and Fabiola Pizzo

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Attended by teleconference.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed
- 4.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanical Group 09 Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working group continued the discussion on the application on the Olive extract, olive leaf extract (*Olea europaea* L.) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed
- 4.5. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 02 - for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01286](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

19 July 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 121ST MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Tele-web conference, 7 June 2019

(Agreed on 7 June 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts:
Francesca Marcon
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The following items were not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)), Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)), Olive extract, olive leaf extract (*Olea europaea* L.) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

25-26 June 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 120TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Tele-web conference, 10 May 2019

(Agreed on 10 May 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

■ Hearing Experts:

Francesca Marcon

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Dry grape extract 60-20 for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2019-00036](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The following items were not discussed: *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)), Olive extract, olive leaf extract (*Olea europaea* L.) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#)).

5. Any Other Business

- 5.1. Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

7 June 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 119TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Held on 26-27 March 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 27 March 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf.
Paul Brantom attended on both days via web conference.

■ Hearing Experts:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Macleaya cordata extract for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01066) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Mugwort tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00181](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Great mullein tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00146](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Melissa officinalis dry extract all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from Zingiber officinale Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.7. The following item was not discussed: Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#))

5. Any Other Business

- 5.1. Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

10 May 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 118TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Held on 28 February 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 28 February 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos and Birgit Dusemund
Andrew Chesson and Johannes Westendorf have participated via teleconference
- Hearing Experts¹:
Gabriele Aquilina, Diane Benford, Claudia Bolognesi, Rainer Gürtler and Josef Schlatter
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Miguel-Angel Granero-Rosell
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Maria Vittoria Vettori and Frank Verdonck
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Carla Martino and Camilla Smeraldi
SCER Unit: Daniela Maurici
- Others:

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Experts⁴

Gabriele Aquilina, Diane Benford, Claudia Bolognesi, Francesca Marcon, Rainer Gürtler and Josef Schlatter were invited to present their view for item 5.1 of the present meeting.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2013-01029) and decided that further discussion is needed.**

6. Any Other Business

- 6.1. Not Applicable**

7. Next meeting

26-27 March 2019.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 117th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 15 February 2019

(Agreed on 15 February 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on *Mugwort* tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on great mullein tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00146](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 - Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.5. Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 03 - Alfa, beta-unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing alfa, beta-unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing alfa, beta-unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes: hex-2-en-1-ol [02.020], nona-2,6-dien-1-ol [02.049], pent-2-en-1-ol [02.050], non-2(cis)-en-1-ol [02.112], tr-2, cis-6-nonadien-1-ol [02.231], 2-dodecenal [05.037], nona-2(trans),6(cis)-dial [05.058], nona-2,4-dienal [05.071], trans-2-nonenal [05.072], hex-2(trans)-enal [05.073], 2,4-decadienal [05.081], 2,4-heptadienal, hepta-2,4-dienal [05.058], deca-2(trans),4(trans)-dial [05.140], dodec-2(trans)-enal [05.144], hept-2(trans)-enal [05.150], non-2-enal [05.171], nona-2(trans),6(trans)-dial [05.172], undec-2(trans)-enal [05.184], trans-2-octenal [05.190], trans-2-decenal [05.191], tr-2, tr-4-nonadienal [05.194], tr-2, tr-4-undecadienal [05.196], allyl heptanoate [09.097], allyl hexanoate [09.244], hex-2(trans)-enyl acetate [09.394] and hex-2-enyl

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



butyrate [09.396] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00344](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

5.1. Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

28 February 2019

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 116th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 29 January 2019

(Agreed on 29 January 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair of the Working Group welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued its discussion on chemically defined flavourings for use in cats and dogs from different chemical groups ([EFSA-Q-2018-00123](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on *Mugwort* tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on great mullein tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00146](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

15 February 2019 (web conference)

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 115th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 8 January 2019

(Agreed on 8 January 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair of the Working Group welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued its discussion on Oil of *Origanum vulgare* L. subsp. *Hirtum* for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2018-00121](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on Oregano oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00122](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 - Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.6. The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)), Chemically

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

defined flavourings for use in cats and dogs from different chemical groups ([EFSA-Q-2018-00123](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

29 January 2019

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 114th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 03 December 2018

(Agreed on 03 December 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair of the Working Group welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

The agenda was adopted with changes. The following item was not discussed *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued its discussion on Oil of *Origanum vulgare* L. subsp. *Hirtum* for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2018-00121](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued its discussion on *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings for use in cats and dogs from different chemical groups ([EFSA-Q-2018-00123](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

6. Next meeting

8 January 2019

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 113th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 07 November 2018

(Agreed on 07 November 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 112nd Working Group meeting held on 19 October 2018, Tele web-conference.

The minutes of the 112nd Working Group meeting held on 19 October 2018 were agreed on the same day⁴.

5. Scientific Topics for discussion

- 5.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: cardamom oil from *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 5.2.** The Working Group continued its discussion on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 20 - aliphatic and aromatic mono- and di-thiols and mono-, di-, tri-, and polysulphides with or without additional oxygenated functional groups when used as flavourings: 8-mercapto-p-methan-3-one [12.038], p-menth-1-ene-8-thiol [12.085] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2013-00325](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3.** The Working Group continued its discussion on Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 03 - Alpha, beta-unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing alpha, beta-unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing alpha, beta-unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes: hex-2-en-1-ol [02.020], nona-2,6-dien-1-ol [02.049], pent-2-en-1-ol [02.050], non-2(cis)-en-1-ol [02.112], tr-2, cis-6-nonadien-1-ol [02.231], 2-dodecenal [05.037], nona-2(trans),6(cis)-dienal [05.058], nona-2,4-dienal [05.071], trans-2-nonenal [05.072], hex-2(trans)-enal [05.073], 2,4-decadienal [05.081], 2,4-

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

heptadienal, hepta-2,4-dienal [05.058], deca-2(trans),4(trans)-dienal [05.140], dodec-2(trans)-enal [05.144], hept-2(trans)-enal [05.150], non-2-enal [05.171], nona-2(trans),6(trans)-dienal [05.172], undec-2(trans)-enal [05.184], trans-2-octenal [05.190], trans-2-decenal [05.191], tr-2, tr-4-nonadienal [05.194], tr-2, tr-4-undecadienal [05.196], allyl heptanoate [09.097], allyl hexanoate [09.244], hex-2(trans)-enyl acetate [09.394] and hex-2-enyl butyrate [09.396] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00344](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Oregano oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00122](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.5. The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable

7. Next meeting

3 December 2018