



FEED UNIT

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 19<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 11 December 2020**

**(Agreed on 11 December 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Giovanna Azimonti (Chair of the Working Group)  
Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Fašmon Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Gloria López-Gálvez, Matteo Innocenti, Joana Revez, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori.
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



EFSA welcomed the participants.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Ethoxyquin® for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00372](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.

## 5. Any Other Business

The working group was updated on the clarifications requested by DG-Environment of the European Commission, involving changes made in the former Guidance on the safety of feed additives for the environment of 2008, and the implementation of the new ERA guidance of 2019 depending on the date of submission of the applications. Specific comments on the ERA guidance of feed additives of 2019 were discussed and addressed.

The working group discussed the recirculation aquatic systems for salmonids and their implications on the use of sensory additives, flavouring compounds as 'attractants' for fish.

## 6. Next meeting(s)

15 January 2021 a.m.

---

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 18<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 10 November 2020**

**(Agreed on 10 November 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Giovanna Azimonti (Chair of the Working Group)  
Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Fašmon Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Orsolya Hoczknacht, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori.
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The WG discussed the application on Nicarb® (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00768](#)), and decided to contact the applicant to request additional information.
- 4.2.** The WG discussed the application on Coxiril® (diclazuril) for chickens reared for laying and for pheasants ([EFSA-Q-2020-00343](#)), and decided to contact the applicant to request additional information.

## 5. Any Other Business

In the framework of the assessment of the potential for bioaccumulation and secondary poisoning, the WG discussed the use of estimated parameters versus experimentally determined parameters and the safety factors that should be applied. The conclusion was that no changes are needed in the current Guidance on the assessment of the safety feed additives for the environment.

## 6. Next meeting(s)

11 December 2020 a.m.

---

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 17<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 20 October 2020**

**(Agreed on 20 October 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Giovanna Azimonti (Chair of the Working Group)  
Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Fašmon Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Lucilla Gregoretti, Gloria López Gálvez, Paola Manini, Konstantinos Sofianidis, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori.
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



EFSA welcomed the participants.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Nilablend (lasalocid sodium – nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)), and agreed that the Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Coxiril (diclazuril) for chickens reared for laying and for pheasants ([EFSA-Q-2020-00343](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Avatec 150G (Lasalocid A sodium) for turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00745](#)) and decided to contact the applicant to request additional information.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Nicarb® (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00768](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)) and agreed that the Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.
- 4.6. The WG discussed the application on manganese chelate of ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](#)) and agreed that the Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.
- 4.7. The WG discussed the application on zinc chelate of ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)), and agreed that Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



- 4.8.** The WG discussed the application on iron chelate of Ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-01016](#)), and agreed that Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.
- 4.9.** The WG discussed the application on copper chelate of ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00059](#)), and agreed that Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.

## **5. Any Other Business**

## **6. Next meeting(s)**

10 November 2020 a.m.

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 17<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 20 October 2020**

**(Agreed on 20 October 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Giovanna Azimonti (Chair of the Working Group)  
Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Fašmon Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Lucilla Gregoretti, Gloria López Gálvez, Paola Manini, Konstantinos Sofianidis, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori.
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.





EFSA welcomed the participants.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Nilablend (lasalocid sodium – nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)), and agreed that the Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Coxiril (diclazuril) for chickens reared for laying and for pheasants ([EFSA-Q-2020-00343](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Avatec 150G (Lasalocid A sodium) for turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00745](#)) and decided to contact the applicant to request additional information.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Nicarb® (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00768](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on Safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)) and agreed that the Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.
- 4.6. The WG discussed the application on manganese chelate of ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](#)) and agreed that the Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.
- 4.7. The WG discussed the application on zinc chelate of ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)), and agreed that Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



- 4.8.** The WG discussed the application on iron chelate of Ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-01016](#)), and agreed that Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.
- 4.9.** The WG discussed the application on copper chelate of ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00059](#)), and agreed that Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.

## **5. Any Other Business**

## **6. Next meeting(s)**

10 November 2020 a.m.

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 16<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 4 September 2020**

**(Agreed on 4 September 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Giovanna Azimonti (Chair of the Working Group)  
Antonio Finizio, Mojca Fašmon Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Orsolya Holczknecht, Gloria López-Gálvez, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori.
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Andreas Focks.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The working group (WG) discussed the opinion on Ferrous lysinate sulfate (Plexomin® L-Fe) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00169](#)) and decided that the Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on KemTRACE Chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00804](#)) and decided that the Section on the safety of the additive for the environment is considered finalised.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the opinion on Nilablend (lasalocid sodium – nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the opinion on Coxiril (diclazuril) for chickens reared for laying and for pheasants ([EFSA-Q-2020-00343](#)), and decided to contact the applicant to request additional information.

## 5. Any Other Business

## 6. Next meeting(s)

20 October 2020 a.m.

---

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 15<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 23 June 2020**

**(Agreed on 25 June 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Giovanna Azimonti (Chair of the Working Group)  
Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Kos Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Gloria López Gálvez, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori.
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The working group (WG) discussed the opinion on Ferrous lysinate sulfate (Plexomin® L-Fe) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00169](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on KemTRACE Chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00804](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the opinion on Aviax® 5% (Semduramicin sodium) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00813](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the opinion on Maxiban G160 (80 g narasin and 80 g nicarbazin/Kg) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#)), and decided to contact the applicant to request additional information.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the opinion on Nicarb® (nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00768](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.

## 5. Any Other Business

## 6. Next meeting(s)

4 September 2020 a.m.

---

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 14<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 29 April 2020**

**(Agreed on 29 April 2020)**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Giovanna Azimonti (Chair of the Working Group)  
Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Kos Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori.
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The working group (WG) discussed the opinion on Sorbitan monolaureate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00595](#)) and finalised the section on the safety of the additive for the environment.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the opinion on Aviax® 5% (Semduramicin sodium) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00813](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the opinion on Maxiban G160 (80 g narasin and 80 g nicarbazin/Kg) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the opinion the safety of 31 flavouring compounds belonging to different chemically defined groups for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00175](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.

## 5. Any Other Business

N/A

## 6. Next meeting(s)

26 May a.m.

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 13<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 26 March 2020**

**(Agreed on 26 March 2020)**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Giovanna Azimonti (Chair of the Working Group)  
Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Kos Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Fabiola Pizzo, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori.
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The working group (WG) discussed the application on 3-Nitrooxypropanol (preparation of minimum 10% 3-nitrooxypropanol) for dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, other ruminants for milk production, other ruminants for reproduction ([EFSA-Q-2019-00592](#)) and finalised the section on safety of the additive for the environment.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the opinion on Sorbitan monolaureate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00595](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the opinion on Aviax® 5% (Semduramicin sodium) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00813](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the opinion on Maxiban G160 (80 g narasin and 80 g nicarbazin/Kg) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00739](#)), and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the opinion on Coxidin (monensin sodium) for chickens for fattening and turkeys ([EFSA-Q-2016-00643](#)), and decided to contact the applicant to request additional information.

## 5. Any Other Business

NA

## 6. Next meeting(s)

29 April a.m.

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 12<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 12 February 2020**

**(Agreed on 12 February 2020)**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Giovanna Azimonti (Chair of the Working Group)  
Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Kos Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Gloria López Gálvez, Matteo Innocenti, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori.
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The working group (WG) discussed the application on STENOROL<sup>®</sup> (Halofuginone hydrobromide) for chickens for fattening and turkeys ([EFSA-Q-2012-00407](#)) and finalised the section on safety of the additive for the environment.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the opinion on Stabilflor<sup>®</sup> (Mixture of ZnEDTA and Cu(NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>EDTA chelates, on chicory pulp carrier, supplemented with 3b E6 ZnO and 3b E4 CuO) ([EFSA-Q-2017-00627](#)) and finalised the section on safety of the additive for the environment.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the opinion on Nimicoat<sup>®</sup> (Carvacrol) for weaned piglets. EFSA-Q-2016-00076 ([EFSA-Q-2016-00076](#)), and finalised the section on safety of the additive for the environment.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the opinion on Propyl gallate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01043](#)), and finalised the section on safety of the additive for the environment.

## 5. Any Other Business

- 5.1. The calculation tool was amended, and the corrected version will be published.

## 6. Next meeting(s)

26 March a.m.

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 11<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 14 January 2020**

**(Agreed on 14 January 2020)**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Giovanna Azimonti (Chair of the Working Group)  
Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Kos Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Gloria López Gálvez, Paola Manini, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori.
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The working group (WG) discussed the application on STENOROL<sup>®</sup> (Halofuginone hydrobromide) for chickens for fattening and turkeys ([EFSA-Q-2012-00407](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the opinion on NILABLEND<sup>®</sup> 200G (Lasalocid A sodium - Nicarbazin) for Chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00591](#)), and decided to contact the applicant to request additional information.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the opinion on DSP feed additive premix (Na<sub>2</sub>EDTA, *Castanea sativa* mill, thyme oil, oregano oil) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2018-00430](#)), and finalised the section on safety of the additive for the environment.

## 5. Any Other Business

- 5.1. Not applicable

## 6. Next meeting(s)

12 February p.m.

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 10<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON THE ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 17 December 2019**

**(Agreed on 17 December 2019)**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Giovanna Azimonti (Chair of the Working Group), Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Kos Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Gloria Lopez Galvez, Maria Vittoria Vettori and Jordi Tárres-Call
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on DSP feed additive premix (Na<sub>2</sub>EDTA, *Castanea sativa* mill, thyme oil, oregano oil) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2018-00430](#)) and finalised the section on safety of the additive for the environment.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on STENOROL<sup>®</sup> (Halofuginone hydrobromide) for chickens for fattening and turkeys ([EFSA-Q-2010-00293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

## 5. Any Other Business

- 5.1. Not applicable

## 6. Next meeting(s)

14 January 2020

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)





FEED UNIT

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 9<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 5 November 2019**

**(Agreed on 5 November 2019)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Giovanna Azimonti, Andreas Focks, Mojca Kos Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
Fabiola Pizzo, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Maria Vittoria Vettori
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Antonio Finizio.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on 3-Nitrooxypropanol (preparation of minimum 10% 3-nitrooxypropanol) for dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, other ruminants for milk production, other ruminants for reproduction ([EFSA-Q-2019-00592](#)) and decided to contact the applicant to request additional information.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the opinion on Sorbitan monolaureate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00595](#)) and decided to contact the applicant to request additional information.

## 5. Any Other Business

- 5.1. Agreement on an introductory text for the calculation tool for predicted environmental concentrations

The WG reviewed the introductory text for the calculation tool for predicted environmental concentrations and considered that it was adequate and ready to be publicised in the EFSA web page containing the guidance on environmental risk assessment of feed additives.

## 6. Next meeting(s)

17 December 2019

---

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



FEED UNIT

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 8<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 10 October 2019**

**(Agreed on 10 October 2019)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

■ Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>

Giovanna Azimonti (Chair of the Working Group), Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Kos Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic

■ Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Gloria López Gálvez, Jordi Tarrés-Call, Frank Verdonck and Maria Vittoria Vettori

■ Others:

Not Applicable

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG continued the discussion of the application on Carvacrol (Nimicoat®) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2016-00076](#)) and decided that the section on environmental risk assessment was ready for adoption at the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The WG continued the discussion on Lignosulphonate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00213](#)) and decided that the section on environmental risk assessment was ready for adoption at the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the opinion on Sorbitan monolaureate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00595](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

## 5. Any Other Business

- 5.1. Agreement on a calculation tool for predicted environmental concentrations  
The WG reviewed the calculation tool for predicted environmental concentrations produced by Giovanna Azimonti and considered that it was adequate to be publicised in the EFSA web page containing the guidance on environmental risk assessment of feed additives.

## 6. Next meeting(s)

5 November 2019

---

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 7<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**Held on 22 – 24 July 2019, Parma  
(Agreed on 24 July 2019)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

■ Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>

Giovanna Azimonti, Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Kos Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic.

■ Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Gloria Lopez Galvez, Paola Manini and Jordi Tarrés-Call

■ Others:

Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working group discussed the application on *Lactococcus lactis* NCIMB 30160 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00365](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working group discussed the application on LANCER® (Lanthanide-citrate) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2019-00380](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working group discussed the application on Monimax® (monesin sodium and nicarbazin) for turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2018-00925](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The Working group discussed the application on Monimax® (monesin sodium and nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2019-00253](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 4.5. The Working group continued the discussion on the application on Nimicoat® (Carvacrol) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2016-00076](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.6. The Working group continued the discussion on the application on Lignosulphonate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00213](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.7. The Working group discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that the section on safety for the environment was ready for adoption at the plenary meeting.
- 4.8. The Working group discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.9. The Working group discussed the application on Stabilflor® (Mixture of ZnEDTA and Cu(NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>EDTA chelates, on chicory pulp carrier, supplemented with 3b E6 ZnO and 3b E4 CuO) ([EFSA-Q-2017-00627](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



## 5. Any Other Business

- 5.1.** The approach to assess the safety for the environment of flavourings of botanical origin was discussed and an agreement was reached.
- 5.2.** A discussion took place on the safe concentration of a feed additive when used in aquaculture according to the new guidance on the safety of feed additives for the environment. With the new calculation parameters, that value is an order of magnitude lower. The procedure to assess the safety for the sediment was discussed and agreed.
- 5.3.** The WG discussed the approach to follow for evaluating the environmental risk assessment of metals used in animal nutrition, also in the context of the new guidance. An agreement was reached.

## 6. Next meeting

10 September 2019

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 6<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**WEB/TELE-conference, 11 June 2019**

**(Agreed on 20 June 2019)**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Giovanna Azimonti, Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojka Kos Durjava, Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Matteo Innocenti, Gloria López Gálvez, Paola Manini, Jordi Tarrés-Call, Maria Vittoria Vettori
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.





## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The working group continued the discussion on the application on Elancoban (200g/kg monensin sodium produced by *Streptomyces cinnamonensis* or mutants) for chicken for fattening, chicken reared for laying and turkey for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00752](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the Plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Monimax® (monesin sodium and nicarbazin) for turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2018-00925](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Carvacrol (Nimicoat®) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2016-00076](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Lignosulphonate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00213](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

## 5. Next meeting(s)

July 22 – 24 (face-to-face meeting in Parma)

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



FEED UNIT

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 5<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 7 May 2019**

**(Agreed on 7 May 2019)**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Giovanna Azimonti, Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks, Mojca Kos Durjava and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoret, Paola Manini, Jordi Tarrés-Call, Maria Vittoria Vettori
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted with one change: Lignosulphonate for all animal species, FAD-2017-0012/EFSA-Q-2017-00213 was withdrawn.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Elancoban (200g/kg monensin sodium produced by *Streptomyces cinnamonensis* or mutants) for chicken for fattening, chicken reared for laying and turkey for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00752](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: cardamom oil from *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.

### 5. Any Other Business

The WG identified the need to request supplementary information on the safety of iron chelate of ethylenediamine (EDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-01016](#)) for the environment, as in the case of Manganese chelate of EDA and Zn chelate of EDA previously discussed.

### 6. Next meeting(s)

11 June 2019

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 4<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENT

**TELE-conference, 28 March 2019**

**(Agreed on 28 March 2019)**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Giovanna Azimonti, Mojca Kos Durjava, Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Gloria Lopez-Galvez, Paola Manini, Jordi Tarrés-Call, Maria Vittoria Vettori
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Monimax® (monesin sodium and nicarbazin) for turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2018-00925](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Lignosulphonate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00213](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Manganese chelate of ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](#)) and finalised the section on safety for the environment of the draft opinion.
- 4.4. The Working group discussed the application on Zinc chelate of ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)) and finalised the section on safety for the environment of the draft opinion.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: cardamom oil from *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. The Working Group discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.7. The Working Group discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decide that further discussion is needed.

### 5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



## **6. Next meeting(s)**

7 May 2019

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

## MINUTES OF THE 3<sup>RD</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENTAL RISK ASSESSMENT

**TELE-conference, 15 February 2019**

**(Agreed on 15 February 2019)**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Giovanna Azimonti, Mojca Kos Durjava, Antonio Finizio, Andreas Focks and Ivana Teodorovic
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call, Vittoria Vettori
- Others:  
Not Applicable

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the update of the technical guidance for assessing the safety of feed additives for the environment ([EFSA-Q-2016-00400](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Monimax (monensin sodium and nicarbazin) for turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2018-00925](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed

### 5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

### 6. Next meeting(s)

12 March 2019

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Environmental risk assessment

**Tele-web conference of 15 January 2019**

**(Agreed on 16 January 2019)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Giovanna Azimonti, Mojca Kos Durjava and Antonio Finizio.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López Gálvez, Jordi Tarrés-Call, Vittoria Vettori.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the update of the technical guidance for assessing the safety of feed additives for the environment ([EFSA-Q-2016-00400](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Robenz® 66G (robenidine hydrochloride) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying and turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00976](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Maxiban G160 (nazarin and nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2015-00032](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Monimax (monensin sodium and nicarbazin) for turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2018-00925](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Zinc chelate of ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. The Working Group discussed the application on Manganese chelate of ethylenediamine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

#### **5. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

#### **6. Next meeting(s)**

12 February 2019

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup>

[http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Environmental risk assessment

**Tele-web conferences of 6, 13 and 17 December 2018**

**(Agreed on 17 December 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Giovanna Azimonti, Mojca Kos Durjava and Antonio Finizio

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call, Vittoria Vettori

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. Additionally, no interests were declared at the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topics for discussion**

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the update of the technical guidance for assessing the safety of feed additives for the environment ([EFSA-Q-2016-00400](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Lignosulphonate ([EFSA-Q-2017-00213](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.3. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Robenz® 66G (robenidine hydrochloride) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying and turkeys for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00976](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Maxiban G160 (nasezin and nicarbazin) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2015-00032](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

#### **5. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

#### **6. Next meeting**

9 January 2019

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/policyonindependence>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>