

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 24-26 February 2016, Brussels (Belgium)

(Agreed on 26 April 2016)

Participants

- Working Group Members: Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp and Guido Rychen (chair)
- Hearing Experts:¹
 Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives: Marta Ponghellini
- EFSA: FEED Unit: Jaume Galobart and Montserrat Anguita
- Others:
 Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf</u>



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group started the discussion on the analysis of the need for an update of the guidance documents (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00068</u>) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group started the discussion on the consultation of the European Food Safety Authority under Article 7(4) and (5) of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 on the amendment of Commission Regulation (EC) No 429/2008 (EFSA-Q-2016-00070) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meetings

26-28 April 2016

² <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 26-28 April 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 28 April 2016)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp and Guido Rychen (chair)
- Hearing Experts:¹
 Not Applicable.
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 Rosa González
- EFSA: FEED Unit: Jaume Galobart and Montserrat Anguita
- Others: Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after deletion of the following point: Analysis of the need for an update of the guidance documents (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00068</u>)

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf</u>



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. The Working group discussed the consultation of the European Food Safety Authority under Article 7(4) and (5) of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 on the amendment of Commission Regulation (EC) No 429/2008 (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00070</u>) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

10-11 May 2016, Milan

² <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 10-11 May 2016, Milan (Italy)

(Agreed on 31 May 2016)

Participants

• Working Group Members:

Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López Puente¹ and Guido Rychen (Chair)

• Hearing Experts:²

Alexandre Cevallos, Marco Frehner, Manfred Lützow and Susan Schönmann participated to the discussion of item 4.2.

• European Commission and/or Member States representatives: Marta Ponghellini (DG SANTE)

• EFSA:³

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart, Paola Manini, Manuela Tiramani

• Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ Present via teleconference only for the discussion of item 4.2 on 11 May.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:

http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf.

³ Paola Manini and Manuela Tiramani were present only on 11 May.



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the consultation of the European Food Safety Authority under Article 7(4) and (5) of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 on the amendment of Commission Regulation (EC) No 429/2008 (EFSA-Q-2016-00070) and decided that more discussion is needed.
- 4.2. Discussion on the approach for testing mixtures of flavourings in tolerance trials.

Upon request from EFSA, the applicant presented a proposal on how to test mixtures of flavourings in tolerance trials. Discussion took place at this regard and the experts provided feedback on the proposal.

Any Other Business

Not Applicable

Next meeting

31 May and 1 June

⁴ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 31 May and 1 June 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 10 June 2016¹)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 Andrew Chesson and Jürgen Gropp
- Hearing Experts:²
 Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives: Not Applicable
- EFSA:

FEED Unit: Jaume Galobart and Montserrat Anguita

 Others: Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Guido Rychen.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ Agreed by written procedure.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf</u>



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 10-11 May 2016, Milan

The minutes of the of the 3^{rd} Working Group meeting held on 10-11 May 2016 were agreed.⁵

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.5. The Working Group continued the discussion on the consultation of the European Food Safety Authority under Article 7(4) and (5) of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 on the amendment of Commission Regulation (EC) No 429/2008 (EFSA-Q-2016-00070) and decided that more discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

5-8 July 2016, Parma

³ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedwgguidanceupdate.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 5-8 July 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed by written procedure on 8 September 2016)

Participants

- Working Group Members: Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp and Guido Rychen (chair).
- Hearing Experts:¹ Not Applicable.
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives: Not Applicable.
- EFSA:

FEED Unit: Jaume Galobart and Montserrat Anguita.

• Others: Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf</u>



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. The WG continued the discussion on the consultation of the European Food Safety Authority under Article 7(4) and (5) of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 on the amendment of Commission Regulation (EC) No 429/2008 (EFSA-Q-2016-00070) and decided to present it to the Plenary meeting for endorsement.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

27-29 September 2016, Parma

² <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 27-29 September 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed by written procedure on 7 October 2016)

Participants

• Working Group Members:¹

Gabriele Aquilina, Pier Sandro Cocconcelli, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López Puente, Alberto Mantovani, Guido Rychen (chair), Maria Saarela and Robert John Wallace.

• Hearing Experts:

Not Applicable.

• European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable.

• EFSA:

FEED Unit: Jaime Aguilera², Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart, Manuela Tiramani².

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ Gabriele Aquilina, Pier Sandro Cocconcelli, Alberto Mantovani and Maria Saarela participated via

webconference on 27 September 2016 AM for the discussion of item 4.1.

² Attended on 27th of September AM.



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed general issues regarding the update of the FEEDAP Guidance documents and set working methods and milestones.
- 4.2. The Working Group started the discussion on the guidance on the safety for target species (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00553</u>). It was decided that more discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

15-17 November 2016, Parma

³ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 15-17 November 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 28 November 2016)

Participants

• Working Group Members:

Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López Puente, Guido Rychen and Robert John Wallace

• Hearing Experts:^{1,2}

Yara Antonissen (FEFANA), Ludovic Arnaud (FEFANA), Eric Auclair (FEFANA), Philippe Becquet (FEFANA), Mathieu Castex (FEFANA), Eva Duque Escolar (FEFAC), Davy van Gaver (IFAH) and Anna-Maria Kluenter (FEFANA)

• European Commission:²

Marta Ponghellini

• EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart and Manuela Tiramani²

AMU Unit:³ Laura Martino

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ In the organisation of the meeting, FEFANA was asked to liaise with their members and with the companies active in the field of feed additives in order to guarantee the most representative participation of the necessary scientific expertise. This list of hearing experts is the result of this activity.

² Participated to Agenda item 4.2 only.

³ Participated to Agenda item 4.1 only.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Guidance on safety for target species (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-</u> 00553)

The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft guidance on safety for target species and decided that more discussion is needed.

4.2. General discussion on the update of the FEEDAP Guidance documents

EFSA invited representatives of all industry associations dealing with feed additives to participate to this agenda item. The invited persons participated in the meeting as hearing experts. FEFANA coordinated the involvement of all industry associations.

The hearing experts were asked to answer questions from the Working Group on different aspects that are under discussion in the context of the update of the FEEDAP Guidance documents. The issues for which the input was required focused mainly on how to address the safety and efficacy of feed additives for the target species considering also aspects of the different species and the categories within one species.

Actions for future collaboration between EFSA and its stakeholders were proposed.

⁴ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

28 November 2016.



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 28 November 2016, Teleweb meeting

(Agreed 28 November 2016)

Participants

• Working Group Members:

Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López Puente, Guido Rychen (chair) and Robert John Wallace.

• Hearing Experts:

Not Applicable.

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives: Not Applicable.
- EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita and Jaume Galobart

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the guidance on the safety for target species (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00553</u>) and decided that more discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

13 -14 December 2016, Parma

¹ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 13 and 14 December 2016 in Parma

(Agreed 14 December 2016)

Participants

• Working Group Members:

Andrew Chesson (chair), Pier Sandro Cocconcelli, Baltasar Mayo, Maria Saarela and Robert John Wallace.

• Hearing Experts:

Not Applicable.

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives: Not Applicable.
- EFSA:

FEED Unit: Jaime Aguilera and Rosella Brozzi

• Others: Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. The Working Group started the discussion on the guidance for the characterisation of feed additives (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00823</u>), focusing on microbial aspects, and decided that more discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

10 -11 January 2017, Parma

¹ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 10-13 January 2017 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 17 January 2017)

Participants

• Working Group Members:¹

Maria Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López Puente, Alberto Mantovani, Guido Rychen, Roberto Edoardo Villa and Robert John Wallace

• Hearing Experts:

Not applicable

• European Commission:

Not applicable

• EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Agnese Balzani, Jaume Galobart and Antonio Luis González

Data Unit:² Davide Arcella, Bruno Dujardin and Rita Sousa

AMU Unit:³ Laura Martino

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

¹ Maria Lourdes Bastos, Georges Bories, Paul Brantom and Roberto Edoardo Villa participated on 10-11 January to Agenda item 4.1 only. Alberto Mantovani participated on 11 January to Agenda item 4.1 only Secundino López Puente and Robert John Wallace participated on 12-13 January to Agenda item 4.2 only. Guido Rychen participated on 12 January to Agenda item 4.2 only. Paul Brantom and Georges Bories participated via teleweb-conference.

² Participated on 10 January to Agenda item 4.1 only.

³ Participated on 13 January to Agenda item 4.2 only.



The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Guidance on safety for the consumer (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-</u> 00822)

The Working Group started the discussion on the draft guidance on safety for consumers and decided that more discussion is needed.

4.2. Guidance on safety for target species (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-</u> 00553)

The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft guidance on safety for target species and decided that more discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

6 to 8 February 2017.

⁴ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 6-8 February 2017 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed by written procedure on 10 February 2017)

Participants

• Working Group Members:

Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp¹, Secundino López Puente² and Guido Rychen

• Hearing Experts:

Not applicable

• European Commission:

Not applicable

• EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Gloria López Gálvez and Paola Manini

AMU Unit: Laura Martino³

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ Jürgen Gropp participated via teleweb-conference.

² Secundino López Puente participated on 8th of February to Agenda item 4.2 via teleweb-conference.

³ Participated on 8th of February to Agenda item 4.2 only.



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Guidance on the characterisation of feed additives (<u>EFSA-</u> <u>Q-2016-00823</u>)

The Working Group discussed the draft guidance on the characterisation of feed additives and decided that more discussion is needed.

4.2. Guidance on safety for target species (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00553</u>)

The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft guidance on safety for target species and decided that more discussion is needed.

5. Any other business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

7 to 10 March 2017.

⁴ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 21-22 February 2017 in Madrid (Spain)

(Agreed on 22 February 2017)

Participants

• Working Group Members:

Andrew Chesson (chair), Pier Sandro Cocconcelli, Baltasar Mayo, Maria Saarela and Robert John Wallace.

Hearing Experts:

Not applicable

- European Commission:
 Not applicable
- EFSA:

FEED Unit: Jaime Aguilera and Rosella Brozzi

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the guidance document for the risk assessment of additives produced with genetically modified microorganisms (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00069</u>), and decided that more discussion is needed.

5. Any other business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

7 to 10 March 2017.

¹ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 7-10 March 2017 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed by written procedure on 17th March 2017)

Participants

• Working Group Members:

Georges Bories,¹ Maria de Lourdes Bastos², Paul Brantom³, Andrew Chesson⁴, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López Puente⁵, Alberto Mantovani⁶, Guido Rychen⁵, Roberto Edoardo Villa⁷ and Robert John Wallace⁵

• Hearing Experts:⁸

Mojtaba Ghadiri and Leonhard Heubach

• European Commission:

Not applicable

• EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti.

DATA Unit:⁹ Davide Arcella, Bruno Dujardin and Rita Sousa

AMU Unit:¹⁰ Laura Martino

• Others:

Not Applicable.

Georges Bories participated on the 7th and 8th of March via teleweb-conference.

² Maria de Lourdes Bastos participated from the 7th to the 9th of March.

³ Paul Brantom participated on the 7th of March via teleweb-conference.

⁴ Andrew Chesson participated from the 8^{th} to the 10^{th} of March.

⁵ Secundino López Puente, Guido Rychen and Robert John Wallace participated on the 10th of March via teleweb-conference.

⁶ Alberto Mantovani participated on the 7th of March.

⁷ Roberto Edoardo Villa participated from the 7th to the 9th of March via teleweb-conference.

⁸ Mojtaba Ghadiri and Leonhard Heubach participated on the 7th to Agenda item 4.2 via teleweb-conference.

⁹ Davide Arcella, Bruno Dujardin and Rita Sousa participated on the 8th to Agenda item 4.1.

¹⁰ Laura Martino participated on the 10th to Agenda item 4.3.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after adding the following item: Guidance on the characterisation of feed additives (EFSA-Q-2016-00823).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,¹² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Guidance on safety for the consumer (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-</u> 00822)

The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft guidance on safety for consumers and decided to present the document to the Plenary meeting for discussion and possible endorsement.

4.2. Guidance on the characterisation of feed additives (<u>EFSA-</u> <u>Q-2016-00823</u>)

The Working Group together with the hearing experts discussed the draft guidance on the characterisation of feed additives and decided to present the document to the Plenary meeting for discussion and possible endorsement.

4.3. Guidance on safety for target species (EFSA-Q-2016-00553)

The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft guidance on safety for target species and decided to present the

¹¹ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

¹² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



document to the Plenary meeting for discussion and possible endorsement.

5. Any other business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

29 March 2017.



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 14th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 29 March 2017 in Brussels (Belgium)

(Agreed by written procedure on 5 April 2017)

Participants

• Working Group Members:

Andrew Chesson (chair), Pier Sandro Cocconcelli, Juan Antonio Gabaldón, Baltasar Mayo, Maria Saarela and Robert John Wallace.

• Hearing Experts:

Not applicable

• European Commission:

Not applicable

• EFSA:

FEED Unit: Jaime Aguilera and Rosella Brozzi.

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the guidance on the characterisation of microorganisms used as feed additives or as production organisms (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00069</u> and <u>EFSA-Q-2017-00211</u>), and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

10 April 2017

¹ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 15th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 10 April 2017 in Brussels (Belgium)

(Agreed on 10 April 2017)

Participants

• Working Group Members:

Andrew Chesson (chair), Pier Sandro Cocconcelli, Baltasar Mayo, Maria Saarela and Robert John Wallace.

• Hearing Experts:

Not applicable

• European Commission:

Not applicable

• EFSA:

FEED Unit: Jaime Aguilera and Rosella Brozzi.

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the guidance on the characterisation of microorganisms used as feed additives or as production organisms (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00069</u> and <u>EFSA-Q-2017-00211</u>), and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

3-5 May 2017.

¹ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 16th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 3-5 May 2017 Parma (Italy)

(Agreed by written procedure on 15 May 2017)

Participants

• Working Group Members:

Georges Bories¹, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López Puente² and Guido Rychen³.

- **Hearing Experts:** • Not applicable
- **European Commission:**

Not applicable

EFSA:

DATA Unit⁴: Bruno Dujardin and Rita Sousa

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

 $^{^1}$ Participated via teleweb-conference on 4th and 5th of May to agenda item 4.3. 2 Participated via teleweb-conference on 3rd and 4th of May to agenda item 4.1.

³ Participated on 3rd and 4th of May to agenda item 4.1 only.

⁴ Participated on the 5th of May to agenda item 4.3.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁶ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Guidance on the assessment of the efficacy of feed additives (<u>EFSA-Q-2017-00246</u>)

The Working Group started the discussion on the draft guidance on the assessment of the efficacy of feed additives and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2. Guidance on the identity, characterisation and conditions of use of feed additives (<u>EFSA-0-2016-00823</u>)

The Working Group continued the discussion of the draft guidance on the characterisation of feed additives and decided to present the document to the Plenary meeting for discussion and possible endorsement.

4.3. Guidance on the assessment of the safety of feed additives for the consumer (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00822</u>)

The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft guidance on safety for consumers and decided that more discussion is needed.

5. Any other business

Not applicable.

⁵ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 17th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 11 May 2017 Teleweb-conference

(Agreed by written procedure on 15 May 2017)

Participants

- Working Group Members: Andrew Chesson and Jürgen Gropp
- Hearing Experts:
 Not applicable
- European Commission: Not applicable
- EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Georges Bories.

2. Adoption of agenda



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Guidance on the assessment of the safety of feed additives for the consumer (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00822</u>)

The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft guidance on safety for consumers and decided to present the document to the Plenary meeting for discussion and possible endorsement.

5. Any other business

Not applicable.

¹ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 18th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 20-22 June 2017, Parma, Italy

(Agreed by written procedure on 7 July 2017)

Participants

• Working Group Members:

Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López Puente¹ and Guido Rychen (Chair)²

• Hearing Experts:

Not applicable

• European Commission:

Not applicable

• EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart and Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Participated via teleweb-conference.

² Participated on the 20 and 21.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Guidance on the assessment of the safety of feed additives for the target species (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00553</u>)

The Working Group revised the draft Guidance on the assessment of the safety of feed additives for the target species taking into account the comments received during the public consultation, and decided that further discussion is needed.

4.2. Guidance on the assessment of the efficacy of feed additives (<u>EFSA-Q-2017-00246</u>)

The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft guidance on the assessment of the efficacy and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any other business

Not applicable.

³ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

⁴ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf</u>



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 19th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 5 to 7 September 2017, Parma, Italy

(Agreed on 14 September 2017)

Participants

• Working Group Members:¹

Georges Bories, Maria Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp and Guido Rychen

• Hearing Experts:

Not applicable

• European Commission:

Marta Ponghellini²

• EFSA:

DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin³

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart and Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

¹ Georges Bories and Maria Lourdes Bastos participated on the 6th of September to agenda item 4.3 (via

teleweb-conference). Guido Rychen participated on the 5th of September to agenda items 4.1 and 4.2.

² Participated on the 5th of September to agenda items 4.1 and 4.2 (via teleweb-conference). ³ Participated on the 6^{th} of September to agenda item 4.2

³ Participated on the 6th of September to agenda item 4.3.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Guidance on the assessment of the safety of feed additives for the target species (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00553</u>)

The Working Group continued the revision of the draft Guidance on the assessment of the safety of feed additives for the target species taking into account the comments received during the public consultation, and decided to present it to the Plenary meeting for discussion and possible adoption.

4.2. Guidance on the identity, characterisation and conditions of use of feed additives (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00823</u>)

The Working Group revised the draft Guidance on the identity, characterisation and conditions of use of feed additives taking into account the comments received during the public consultation, and decided to present it to the Plenary meeting for discussion and possible adoption.

4.3. Guidance on the assessment of the safety of feed additives for the consumer (<u>EFSA-Q-2016-00822</u>)

The Working Group revised the draft Guidance on the safety of feed additives for the consumer taking into account the comments received during the public consultation, and decided to present it to the Plenary meeting for discussion and possible adoption.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



4.4. Guidance on the assessment of the efficacy of feed additives (<u>EFSA-Q-2017-00246</u>)

Not discussed.

5. Any other business

Not applicable.



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 20th meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 24-26 of October 2017, Parma, Italy

(Agreed on 3 November 2017)

Participants

• Working Group Members:¹

Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López Puente and Guido Rychen

• Hearing Experts:²

Ruud Bremmers (EFFSACO), Anna Maria Kluenter (FEFANA), Elinor McCartney (AVC) and Davy van Gaver (IFAH-Europe)

• European Commission:

Not applicable

• EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart and Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti

• Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

 $^{^1}$ Secundino López Puente participated via teleweb-conference. Guido Rychen participated on the 24^{th} and 25^{th}

only.

² Participated via teleweb-conference on 26th November.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Guidance on the assessment of the efficacy of feed additives (<u>EFSA-Q-2017-00246</u>)

The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft guidance on the assessment of the efficacy of feed additives.

EFSA created a discussion group for the preparation of this guidance document. The members of the discussion group (see under Hearing experts) were presented the draft guidance under preparation and asked to provide comments within a deadline. The comments will be considered in order to finalise the draft guidance before discussion and possible endorsement by the Panel in view of the public consultation.

5. Next Meeting

21-23 November 2017.

³ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

⁴ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf</u>



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 21st meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 7 November 2017, teleweb-conference

(Agreed on 7 November 2017)

Participants

• Working Group Members:

Andrew Chesson (chair), Pier Sandro Cocconcelli, Baltasar Mayo, Maria Saarela and Robert John Wallace.

• Hearing Experts:

Not applicable

• European Commission:

Not applicale

• EFSA:

FEED Unit: Jaime Aguilera and Rosella Brozzi

• Others:

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Guidance on the characterisation of microorganisms used as feed additives or as production organisms (<u>EFSA-Q-</u> <u>2016-00069 and EFSA-Q-2017-00211</u>)

The Working Group continued the revision of the draft guidance on the characterisation of microorganisms used as feed additives or as production organisms taking into account the comments received during the public consultation, and decided to present it to the Plenary meeting for discussion and possible adoption.

5. Any other business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

21-23 November 2017.

¹ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 22nd meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 21-23 November 2017, Parma, Italy

(Agreed on 29 November 2017)

Participants

• Working Group Members:¹

Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López Puente and Guido Rychen

• Hearing Experts:²

Anna Maria Kluenter (FEFANA), Elinor McCartney (AVC) and Davy van Gaver (IFAH-Europe)

• European Commission:

Not applicable

• EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart and Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti

• Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Ruud Bremmers (EFFSACO).

¹ Secundino López Puente participated via teleweb-conference. Guido Rychen participated on the 21st only.

 $^{^{\}rm 2}$ Participated via teleweb-conference on $21^{\rm st}$ November.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Guidance on the assessment of the efficacy of feed additives (EFSA-Q-2017-00246)

The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft guidance on the assessment of the efficacy of feed additives. In the previous meeting the members of the discussion group (see under Hearing experts) were asked to provide comments on the draft document. The comments were discussed with the members of the discussion group and considered for the finalisation of the draft. The Working Group decided to send the draft guidance, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting for discussion and possible endorsement for public consultation.

5. Next Meeting

12 December 2017.

³ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

⁴ <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf</u>



Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 23rd meeting of the Working Group on Guidance Update

Held on 6-8 February 2018, Parma, Italy

(Agreed on 16 April 2017 by written procedure)

Participants

• Working Group Members:¹

Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López Puente and Guido Rychen

• Hearing Experts:

Not applicable

• European Commission:

Not applicable

• EFSA:

FEED Unit: Montserrat Anguita, Jaume Galobart and Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti

• Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Secundino López Puente participated via teleweb-conference.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. Guidance on the assessment of the efficacy of feed additives (EFSA-Q-2017-00246)

The Working Group revised the draft Guidance on the assessment of the efficacy of feed additives taking into account the comments received during the public consultation. The Working Group decided to send the draft guidance, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting for discussion and possible adoption.

² <u>http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf</u>

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf