

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 30th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins

Held on 28-30 September, Parma

(Agreed by written procedure on 16 October 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani and Kristen Sejrsen

Georges Bories has participated via teleconference¹

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Montserrat Anguita³

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Only the first and the second day.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

³ Only the first day.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 29th Working Group meeting held on 26-28 August 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 29th Working Group meeting held on 26-28 August 2015 were agreed.⁶

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin B₂/Riboflavin and riboflavin 5'-phosphate ester monosodium salt (Riboflavin Universal; ROVIMIX[®] B2 80-SD; Riboflavin 5'-Phosphate Sodium) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01319](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

Not Applicable

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapvitamins_2012-2015.pdf

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 29th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins

Held on 26-28 August, Parma

(Agreed on 28 September 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani and Kristen Sejrsen

Georges Bories has participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Montserrat Anguita (1st day)

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 28th Working Group meeting held on 2-3 June 2015, Copenhagen.

The minutes of the of the 28th Working Group meeting held on 2-3 June 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The following item was not discussed: Inositol for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2015-00367](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

28-30 September 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapvitamins_2012-2015.pdf

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 28th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 2-3 June 2015, Copenhagen
(Agreed by written procedure on 23 June 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak,¹ Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani, Derek Renshaw and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:²**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Only the second day.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 27th Working Group meeting held on 18 May 2015, tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 27th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin B₂/Riboflavin and riboflavin 5'-phosphate ester monosodium salt (Riboflavin Universal; ROVIMIX® B2 80-SD; Riboflavin 5'-Phosphate Sodium) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01319](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Betaine anhydrous for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00636](#)/AB Vista) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

6. Next meeting

26-28 August 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 27th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 18 May 2015, tele-web conference
(Agreed on 2 June 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani, Derek Renshaw and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 26th Working Group meeting held on 13 April 2015, tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 26th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin B₂ (riboflavin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00953](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin B₂/Riboflavin and riboflavin 5'-phosphate ester monosodium salt (Riboflavin Universal; ROVIMIX® B2 80-SD; Riboflavin 5'- Phosphate Sodium) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01319](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The following item was not discussed: Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#))

6. Next meeting

2-3 June 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 26th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 13 April 2015, tele-web conference
(Agreed on 18 May 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Jaime Aguilera
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Derek Renshaw.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 25th Working Group meeting held on 1 April 2015, tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 25th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Vitamin B₁₂/Cyanocobalamin for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00455](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The following items were not discussed: Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)); Vitamin B₂ (riboflavin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00953](#))

6. Next meeting

18 May 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 25th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 1 April 2015, tele-web conference
(Agreed on 13 April 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp and Alberto Mantovani
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Gerhard Flachowsky.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 24th Working Group meeting held on 25-27 March 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 24th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Vitamin B₁₂/Cyanocobalamin for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00455](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

13 April 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 24th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 25-27 March 2015, Parma
(Agreed on 1 April 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

• **Working Group Experts:**

- Georges Bories,¹ Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani² and Kristen Sejrsen
- Derek Renshaw has participated via teleconference³

• **Hearing Experts:⁴**

- Not applicable

• **EFSA:**

- FEED Unit: Paola Manini

• **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not applicable

• **Others:**

- Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁶ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Only the first and the second day.

² Only the second and the third day.

³ Only the second day.

⁴ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 23rd Working Group meeting held on 25-27 February 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 23rd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Omega-6-fatty acids as octadecanoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

1 April 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 23rd meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 25-27 February 2015, Parma
(Agreed on 25 March 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp and Alberto Mantovani¹
 - Derek Renshaw has participated via teleconference²
- **Hearing Experts:**³
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Jaime Aguilera⁴
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Kristen Sejrsen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁶ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Only the second and the third day.

² Only the second day.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

⁴ Only the third day.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 22nd Working Group meeting held on 9 January 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 22nd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Omega-6-fatty acids as octadecanoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Vitamin B₁₂/Cyanocobalamin for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00455](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

25-27 March 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 22nd meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Tele-web conference, 9 January 2015
(Agreed on 25 February 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani, Derek Renshaw and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 21st Working Group meeting held on 24-26 November 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 21st Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Omega-6-fatty acids as octadecanoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Vitamin B₁₂/Cyanocobalamin for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00455](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 During the meeting, the Working Group was informed on the request of withdrawal of the application on Alpha-Lipoic acid for dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-00768](#)).

6. Next meeting

25-27 February 2015

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 21st meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Parma, 24-26 November 2014
(agreed on 9 January 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani (1st and 2nd day), Derek Renshaw (2nd and 3rd day) and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Derek Renshaw for the 1st day and from Alberto Mantovani for the 3rd day.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting held on 13-15 October 2014 (Roma).

The minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on the evaluation of the safety of leaves of *Solanum Glaucophyllum* ([EFSA-Q-2011-01075](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Omega-6-fatty acids as octadecanoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The following item was not discussed: Vitamin B₁₂/Cyanocobalamin for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00455](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

9 January 2015

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 20th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Roma, 13-15 October 2014
(agreed on 24 November 2014)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Antoni Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani, Derek Renshaw (3rd day) and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Derek Renshaw for the 1st and 2nd days.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 18th and 19th Working Group meetings held on 9-11 July 2014 (Parma) and on 22 September 2014 (tele-web conference), respectively.

The minutes of the 18th and 19th Working Group meetings were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on the evaluation of the safety of leaves of *Solanum Glaucophyllum* ([EFSA-Q-2011-01075](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Omega-6-fatty acids as octadecanoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

24-26 November 2014.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 19th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Tele-web conference, 22 September 2014
(agreed on 13 October 2014)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Montserrat Anguita
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Mikolaj Gralak and Derek Renshaw.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on the evaluation of the safety of leaves of *Solanum Glaucophyllum* ([EFSA-Q-2011-01075](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Omega-6-fatty acids as octadecanoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Vitamin B₂/Riboflavin and riboflavin 5'-phosphate ester monosodium salt (Riboflavin Universal; ROVIMIX® B2 80-SD; Riboflavin 5'- Phosphate Sodium) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01319](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on alpha-Lipoic acid for dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-00768](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 A preliminary discussion took place on the application on Vitamin D₃ addition to feedingstuffs for fish ([EFSA-Q-2014-00604](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

13-15 October 2014.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 18th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Parma, 9-11 July 2014
(agreed on 13 October 2014)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani, Derek Renshaw (1st and 2nd day) and Kristen Sejrsen
 - Gerhard Flachowsky has participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Montserrat Anguita
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Derek Renshaw for the 3rd day.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 16th and 17th Working Group meetings held on 14 16 May 2014 (Munich) and on 20 June 2014 (tele-web conference), respectively.

The minutes of the 16th and 17th Working Group meetings were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on the evaluation of the safety of leaves of *Solanum Glaucophyllum* ([EFSA-Q-2011-01075](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Vitamin B₂/Riboflavin and riboflavin 5'-phosphate ester monosodium salt (Riboflavin Universal; ROVIMIX® B2 80-SD; Riboflavin 5'- Phosphate Sodium) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01319](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin B₁₂/Cyanocobalamin for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00455](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The following item was not discussed: Omega-6-fatty acids as octadecanoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

22 September 2014.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 17th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Tele-web conference, 20 June 2014
(agreed on 9 July 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Derek Renshaw and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Alberto Mantovani.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on the evaluation of the safety of leaves of *Solanum Glaucophyllum* ([EFSA-Q-2011-01075](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin B₂/Riboflavin and riboflavin 5'-phosphate ester monosodium salt (Riboflavin Universal; ROVIMIX® B2 80-SD; Riboflavin 5'- Phosphate Sodium) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01319](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Riboflavin sodium phosphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00955](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on Omega-6-fatty acids as octadecanoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The following item was not discussed: Vitamin B₁₂/Cyanocobalamin for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00455](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

6. Next meeting

9-11 July 2014.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 16th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Munich, 14-16 May 2014
(agreed on 9 July 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani (1st and 2nd day) and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Alberto Mantovani for the 3rd day and from Derek Renshaw for the meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting held on 14 April 2014, tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on the evaluation of the safety of leaves of *Solanum Glaucophyllum* ([EFSA-Q-2011-01075](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The following item was not discussed: Omega-6-fatty acids as octadecanoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

20 June 2014.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 15th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Tele-web conference, 14 April 2014
(agreed on 14 May 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani, Derek Renshaw and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 12-14 March 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on the evaluation of the safety of leaves of *Solanum Glaucophyllum* ([EFSA-Q-2011-01075](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on alpha-lipoic acid for dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-00768](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

14-16 May 2014.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 14th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 12-14 March 2014, Parma
(agreed on 14 April 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Mikolaj Gralak and Kristen Sejrsen
 - Gerhard Flachowsky (1st and 2nd day), Jürgen Gropp (1st and 2nd day), Alberto Mantovani (3rd day) and Derek Renshaw (2nd day) have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Montserrat Anguita
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting held on 10 February 2014, Parma and tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on inositol for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01322](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on the evaluation of the safety of leaves of *Solanum Glaucophyllum* ([EFSA-Q-2011-01075](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Coenzyme Q10 (Kaneka Q10) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00002](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin B₁₂ (cyanocobalamin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00455](#)) and decided further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin B₂ (riboflavin sodium phosphate) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00955](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.6 A preliminary discussion took place on the application on alpha-lipoic acid for dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-00768](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

14 April 2014.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 10 February 2014, Parma
(agreed on 12 March 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Mikolaj Gralak and Alberto Mantovani
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Jürgen Gropp, Derek Renshaw and Kristen Sejrsen have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting held on 20 - 21 January 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on inositol for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01322](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin B₁₂ (cyanocobalamin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00456](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Coenzyme Q10 (Kaneka Q10) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00002](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The following item was not discussed: Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

12-14 March 2014.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 20 - 21 January 2014, Parma
(agreed on 10 February 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani (2nd day) and Kristen Sejrsen
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky and Derek Renshaw have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Alberto Mantovani for the 1st day.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on 11 - 13 November 2013, Roma.

The minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on inositol for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01322](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin B₁₂ (cyanocobalamin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00456](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The following item was not discussed: evaluation of the safety of leaves of *Solanum Glaucophyllum* ([EFSA-Q-2011-01075](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

10 February 2014.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 11 - 13 November 2013, Roma
(agreed on 20 January 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani and Derek Renshaw (3rd day)
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies¹ were received from Derek Renshaw for the 1st day and the 2nd day and from Kristen Sejrsen for the meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 14 - 16 October 2013, Parma.

The minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin K₃ (menadione sodium bisulphite and menadione nicotinamide bisulphite) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00111](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin B₂/Riboflavin produced with *Bacillus subtilis* CJKB0001 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-00991](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin D₃ (cholecalciferol) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00952](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.4 The following item was not discussed: inositol for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01322](#)); evaluation of the safety of leaves of *Solanum Glaucophyllum* ([EFSA-Q-2011-01075](#)); vitamin B₁₂ (cyanocobalamin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00456](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

20-21 January 2014.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 14 - 16 October 2013
(agreed on 11 November 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories (2nd and 3rd day), Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani (2nd and 3rd day), Derek Renshaw and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Georges Bories for the 1st day and from Alberto Mantovani for the 1st day and the 2nd day (morning).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 23 - 24 July 2013, Parma.

The minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin K₃ (menadione sodium bisulphite and menadione nicotinamide bisulphite) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00111](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on inositol for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01322](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on evaluation of the safety of leaves of *Solanum Glaucophyllum* ([EFSA-Q-2011-01075](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin B₁₂ (cyanocobalamin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00455](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

11-13 November 2013.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 23 - 24 July 2013, Parma
(agreed on 14 October 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani, Derek Renshaw (2nd day) and Kristen Sejrsen
 - Gerhard Flachowsky has participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Derek Renshaw for the 1st day and from Mikolaj Gralak for the meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 11 June 2013, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin D₃ (cholecalciferol) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00952](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin K₃ (menadione sodium bisulphite and menadione nicotinamide bisulphite) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00111](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The following item was not discussed: Vitamin B₂/Riboflavin produced with *Bacillus subtilis* CJKB0001 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-00991](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

14-16 October 2013.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Tele-web conference, 11 June 2013
(agreed on 23 July 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp, Alberto Mantovani, Derek Renshaw and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 24 May 2013, Parma.

The minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Coenzyme Q10 (Kaneka Q10) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00002](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin K₃ (menadione sodium bisulphite and menadione nicotinamide bisulphite) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00111](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin B₁₂ (cyanocobalamin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00455](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

23-24 July 2013, Parma.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Tele-web conference, 24 May 2013
(Agreed on 11 June 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Alberto Mantovani and Derek Renshaw.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 22-24 April 2013, Parma.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin B₂/Riboflavin for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00953](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Coenzyme Q10 (Kaneka Q10) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00002](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

11 June 2013, Tele-web conference.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 22 - 24 April 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 24 May 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Mikolaj Antoni Gralak and Kristen Sejrsen
 - Gerhard Flachowsky and Jürgen Gropp have participated via teleconference
 - Alberto Mantovani has participated via teleconference on the 2nd and 3rd day
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Alberto Mantovani for the 1st day, from Derek Renshaw and Georges Bories for the meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 25 - 27 March 2013, Munich.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin B₂/Riboflavin and riboflavin 5'-phosphate ester monosodium salt for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01319](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin B₂/Riboflavin produced with *Bacillus subtilis* CJKB0001 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-00991](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin D₃ (cholecalciferol) for pigs, piglets, bovines, ovines, calves, equines, chickens for fattening, turkeys, other poultry, fish, other species or categories of animals ([EFSA-Q-2011-00951](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on inositol for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01322](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin K₃ (menadione sodium bisulphite and menadione nicotinamide bisulphite) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00111](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6 The following item was not discussed: ([EFSA-Q-2011-00952](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

24 May 2013, Tele-web conference.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 25 - 27 03 2013, Munich

(Agreed on 22 April 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak (only on the 2nd and 3rd day), Jürgen Gropp, and Alberto Mantovani (only on the 2nd and 3rd day)
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Mikolaj Gralak and Alberto Mantovani for the 1st day and from Derek Renshaw and Kristen Sejrsen for the meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 22 02 2013, Parma.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on betaine (betaine anhydrous) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00258](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on betaine (betaine anhydrous and betaine hydrochloride) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00259](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on betaine (betaine anhydrous) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00260](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin D₃ (cholecalciferol) for pigs, piglets, bovines, ovines, calves, equines, chickens for fattening, turkeys, other poultry, fish, other species or categories of animals ([EFSA-Q-2011-00951](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The following item was not discussed: [EFSA-Q-2010-01319](#).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

22-24 April 2013, Parma.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on WEB/TELE-conference, 22 02 2013

(Agreed on 25 March 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Antoni Gralak, Jürgen Gropp and Kristen Sejrsen
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Alberto Mantovani and Derek Renshaw.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 25 01 2013, Parma.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on betaine (betaine anhydrous) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00258](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on betaine (betaine anhydrous and betaine hydrochloride) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00259](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on betaine (betaine anhydrous) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00260](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on inositol for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01322](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.5 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin K₃ (menadione sodium bisulphite and menadione nicotinamide bisulphite) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00111](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

25-27 March 2013, Munich.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on WEB/TELE-conference, 25 01 2013

(Agreed on 22 February 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Georges Bories, Gerhard Flachowsky, Mikolaj Gralak, Jürgen Gropp and Derek Renshaw
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Alberto Mantovani and Kristen Sejrnsen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 7-8 01 2013, Parma.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on vitamin C (L-ascorbic acid, sodium L-ascorbate, calcium L-ascorbate, 6-palmitoyl L-ascorbic acid, ascorbyl monophosphate calcium sodium salt) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00249](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on vitamin C (L-ascorbic acid and ascorbyl monophosphate calcium sodium salt) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00250](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin B₂ (Riboflavin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00954](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

22 February 2013, WEB/TELE-conference.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Vitamins
Held on 7 - 8 January 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 25 January 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Gerhard Flachowsky, Jürgen Gropp and Alberto Mantovani
 - Georges Bories, Mikolaj Gralak and Derek Renshaw have participated via teleconference on the 2nd day
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Kristen Sejrsen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 27-28 11 2012, Parma.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on vitamin C (L-ascorbic acid, sodium L-ascorbate, calcium L-ascorbate, 6-palmitoyl L-ascorbic acid, ascorbyl monophosphate calcium sodium salt) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00249](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on vitamin C (L-ascorbic acid and ascorbyl monophosphate calcium sodium salt) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00250](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

25 January 2013, WEB/TELE-conference.

Parma, 5 March 2013

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Groups on Vitamins

Parma, 27 - 28 November 2012

EFSA/FEED Unit

(agreed by the WG on 7 January 2013)

Participants

WG Experts: Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Georges Bories and Derek Renshaw

EFSA: Paola Manini and Montserrat Anguita

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Alberto Mantovani for the meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussion

- The Working Group discussed the application on vitamin A (retinol acetate, retinol palmitate and retinol propionate) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01294) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly to the plenary meeting.
- The Working Group discussed the application on the safety of Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2012-00398) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date

7-8 January 2013, in Parma.