

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 36th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Tele-web conference, 23rd September 2015

(Agreed on 6th October 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Noel Dierick, Secundino López, John Wallace and Piet Wester.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies received from Jürgen Gropp.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Benzoic Acid ([EFSA-Q-2010-0147](#)) for all animal species and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

6. Next meeting

Not Applicable.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 35th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Tele-web conference, 16th July 2015

(Agreed on 16th July 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Noel Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López, John Wallace and Piet Wester.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Orsolya Holczknecht

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 34th Working Group meeting held on 30 June 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 34th Working Group meeting held on 30 June 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Sorbic Acid ([EFSA-Q-2011-00839](#)) and on Potassium Sorbate ([EFSA-Q-2011-00838](#)) for all animal species and decided to present the merged draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the next plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

7. Next meeting

Not Applicable.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwqs/docs/feedaporganicacids.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 34th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Tele-web conference, 30th June 2015

(Agreed on 16th July 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Noel Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Piet Wester.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 33rd Working Group meeting held on 1st June 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 33rd Working Group meeting held on 1st June 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Sorbic Acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00839](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium Sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00838](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The following item was not discussed: Potassium Sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00837](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

7. Next meeting

16th July 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwqs/docs/feedaporganicacids.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 33rd meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Tele-web conference, 1st June 2015

(Agreed on 30th June 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Noel Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López, John Wallace and Piet Wester.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 32nd Working Group meeting held on 17th April 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 32nd Working Group meeting held on 17th April 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Lactic acid and calcium lactate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01221](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

7. Next meeting

30th June 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwqs/docs/feedaporganicacids.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 32nd meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Tele-web conference, 17th April 2015

(Agreed on 1st June 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Noel Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino López, John Wallace and Piet Wester.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 31st Working Group meeting held on 12-13 February 2015, Barcelona.

The minutes of the of the 31st Working Group meeting held on 12-13 February 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Lactic acid and calcium lactate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01221](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The following item was not discussed: Sorbic acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00839](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

7. Next meeting

1st June 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwqs/docs/feedaporganicacids.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 31st meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Held on 12-13 February 2015, Barcelona (Spain)

(Agreed on 17th April 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Noel Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, John Wallace and Piet Wester.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Secundino López

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 30th Working Group meeting held on 5 December 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 30th Working Group meeting held on 5 December 2014 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Ammonium formate, sodium formate and calcium formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00424](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the application on Formic acid, Ammonium Formate, Sodium Formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00755](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Benzoic acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00352](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The following item was not discussed: Lactic acid and calcium lactate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01221](#))

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

7. Next meeting

17th April 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwqs/docs/feedaporganicacids.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 30th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Held on 5th December 2014, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 12th February 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson

Noel Dierick, Jurgen Gropp, Secundino Lopez, John Wallace and Piet Wester have participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 29th Working Group meeting held on 14 November 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 29th Working Group meeting held on 14 November 2014 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Lactic acid and calcium lactate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01221](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Potassium sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00837](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on the applications on Sorbic acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00839](#)) and Potassium sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00838](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The following item was not discussed: Ammonium formate, sodium formate, calcium formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00424](#)).

6. Any Other Business

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwqs/docs/feedaporganicacids.pdf>

Not Applicable.

7. Next meeting

12-13 February 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 29th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Held on 14th November 2014, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 5th December 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson and Jurgen Gropp

Noel Dierick, Secundino Lopez, John Wallace and Piet Wester have participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 28th Working Group meeting held on 10 October 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 28th Working Group meeting held on 10 October 2014 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Lactic acid and calcium lactate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01221](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on the applications on Citric acid (preservative) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00750](#)) and Citric acid (acidity regulator) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00612](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Formic acid, Ammonium Formate, Sodium Formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00755](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The following items were not discussed: Potassium sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00837](#)); Sorbic for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00839](#)); Potassium sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00838](#)).

6. Any Other Business

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwqs/docs/feedaporganicacids.pdf>

Not Applicable.

7. Next meeting

5 December 2014

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 28th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Tele-web conference, 10th October 2014

(Agreed on 14th November 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Noel Dierick, Secundino Lopez, John Wallace and Piet Wester.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Jurgen Gropp.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 27th Working Group meeting held on 18-19 September 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 27th Working Group meeting held on 18-19 September 2014 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the applications on Citric acid (preservative) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00750](#)) and Citric acid (acidity regulator) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00612](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Lactic acid and calcium lactate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01221](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on the applications on Calcium formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00423](#)) and on Formic acid, Ammonium Formate, Sodium Formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00755](#)) and decided to present the draft opinions, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

7. Next meeting

14 November 2014

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwqs/docs/feedaporganicacids.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 27th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Held on 18-19th September 2014, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 10th October 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson and Jurgen Gropp

Noel Dierick, Secundino Lopez, John Wallace and Piet Wester have participated via teleconference.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 26th Working Group meeting held on 18 July 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 26th Working Group meeting held on 18 July 2014 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the applications on Citric acid (preservative) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00750](#)), Citric acid (acidity regulator) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00612](#)) and Calcium Formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00423](#)) and decided to present the three draft opinions, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Lactic acid and calcium lactate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01221](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Formic acid, Ammonium Formate, Sodium Formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00755](#)) and decided that further discussion is need
- 5.4 The following items were not discussed: Ammonium formate, sodium formate, calcium formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00424](#)); Potassium sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00837](#)); Sorbic for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00839](#)); Potassium sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00838](#)).

6. Any Other Business

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwqs/docs/feedaporganicacids.pdf>

Not Applicable.

7. Next meeting

10 October 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 26th Meeting of the Working Group on Organic acids
Held on 18 July 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 18 09 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Andrew Chesson
 - Noel Dierick, Jurgen Gropp and John Wallace participated via teleconference.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 24th Working Group meetings

The minutes of the 25th WG meeting held on 4-6 June 2014 were agreed.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Calcium Formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00423](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Formic Acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00421](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Formic acid, Ammonium Formate, Sodium Formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00755](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed;
- 5.4 The following items were not discussed: Ammonium formate, sodium formate, calcium formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00424](#)); Potassium sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00837](#)); Sorbic for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00839](#)); Potassium sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00838](#)).

6. Next meeting date(s)

18-19 September 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 25th Meeting of the Working Group on Organic acids
Held on 4-6 June 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 18 07 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Andrew Chesson, Noel Dierick, Jurgen Gropp, Secundino López, John Wallace.
 - Piet Wester participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 24th Working Group meetings

The minutes of the 24th WG meeting held on 1-2 April 2014 were agreed.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working group continued the discussion on the application on AviMatrix ([EFSA-Q-2013-00072](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working group continued the discussion on the application on Sorbic acid and potassium sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00840](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group started the discussion on the application on Formic Acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00421](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on Formic acid, Ammonium Formate, Sodium Formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00755](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed;
- 5.5 The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00837](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification
- 5.6 The Working Group discussed the application on Sorbic for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00839](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.7 The Working Group discussed the application Potassium sorbate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00838](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.8 The following items were not discussed: Ammonium formate, sodium formate, calcium formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00424](#)); on Lactic acid and calcium lactate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01221](#)).

6. Next meeting date(s)

18 July 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 24th Meeting of the Working Group on Organic acids
Held on 1-2 April 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 04 06 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Andrew Chesson
 - Noel Dierick, Secundino López, John Wallace and Piet Wester participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 22nd Working Group meetings

The minutes of the 23rd WG meeting held on 21 March 2014 were agreed.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working group discussed the application on Calcium Formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00423](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Sorbic acid and potassium sorbate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00840) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Lactic acid and calcium lactate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01221) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Citric Acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2013-00612) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 A preliminary discussion took place on the application of Formic Acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00421](#)).
- 5.6 The following items were not discussed: Formic acid, Ammonium Formate, Sodium Formate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2013-00755); Ammonium formate, sodium formate, calcium formate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00424](#)).

6. Next meeting date(s)

4 June 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 23rd Meeting of the Working Group on Organic acids
Held on 21 March 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 01 04 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Andrew Chesson
 - Noel Dierick, Jurgen Gropp, Secundino López, John Wallace and Piet Wester participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 22nd Working Group meetings

The minutes of the 22nd WG meeting held on 28 February 2014 were agreed.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Sorbic acid and potassium sorbate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00840) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Lactic acid and calcium lactate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01221) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Citric Acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00750) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Citric Acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2013-00612) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.5 The following application was not discussed: Preparation of benzoic acid, calcium formate and fumaric acid (Avimatrix) for Chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, minor avian species for fattening and to point of lay (EFSA-Q-2013-00072)

6. Next meeting date(s)

1st April 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 22nd Meeting of the Working Group on Organic acids
Held on 28 February 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 21 03 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Andrew Chesson
 - Noel Dierick, Jurgen Gropp and Secundino López has participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó, Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from John Wallace and Piet Wester

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 18th, 19th, 20th and 21th Working Group meetings

Minutes of the 18th (10 December 2012, by teleconference), 19th (20 September 2013, by teleconference), 20th (11 October 2012) and 21st (8 January 2014) WG meetings were agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Sorbic acid and potassium sorbate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00840) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Lactic acid and calcium lactate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01221) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Citric Acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00750) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Citric Acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2013-00612) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The following application was not discussed: Formic acid, ammonium formate and sodium formate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2013-00755)

6. Next meeting date(s)

21st March 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 21th meeting of the Working Group on Organic acids
Tele-web conference, 08 01 2014
(Agreed on 28 02 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Andrew Chesson , Noel Dierick, Jurgen Gropp, Secundino López, John Wallace and Piet Wester
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti, Oriol Ribó
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued its discussion on Malic acid and sodium/calcium malate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01514) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 A preliminary discussion took place on the application on Citric Acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2013-00612).
- 5.3 The following items were not discussed: Sorbic acid and potassium sorbate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00840); Potassium diformate for pigs for fattening, piglets (weaned), sows for reproduction, chickens for fattening (EFSA-Q-2013-00585); Formic acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00421); Ammonium formate, sodium formate, calcium formate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00424); Calcium formate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00423).

5. Next meeting date(s)

28th February 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 20th meeting of the Working Group on Organic acids
Held on 11 10 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 28 02 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp
 - Secundino López and Piet Wester has participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Noel Dierick and John Wallace

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on the Preparation of benzoic acid, calcium formate and fumaric acid (Avimatrix) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, minor avian species for fattening and to point of lay (EFSA-Q-2013-00072) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The following item were not discussed: (EFSA-Q-2011-00421; EFSA-Q-2011-00424; EFSA-Q-2011-00750; EFSA-Q-2013-00585; EFSA-Q-2011-00840)

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting date(s)

21st January 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 19th meeting of the Working Group on Organic acids
Tele-web conference, 20 09 2013
(Agreed on 28 02 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Secundino López, John Wallace and Piet Wester
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Secundino López-Puente

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued its discussion on Sorbic acid and potassium sorbate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00840) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on the Preparation of benzoic acid, calcium formate and fumaric acid (Avimatrix) for Chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, minor avian species for fattening and to point of lay ([EFSA-Q-2013-00072](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The following item/s was/were not discussed: ([EFSA-Q-2013-00585](#))

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting date(s)

11th October 2013, tele-web conference

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 18th meeting of the Working Group on Organic acids
VIDEO/WEB/TELE-conference, 10 12 2012
(Agreed on 28 02 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Noel Dierick, John Wallace and Piet Wester
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Matteo Lorenzo Innocenti
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Secundino López-Puente

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting held on 22 11 2013, Brussels

The minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting held on 22nd November 2012 were agreed

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- The Working Group continued its discussion on Fumaric acid ([EFSA-Q-2012-00414](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable

7. Next meeting date(s)

To be decided.

Parma, 23 January 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 17th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Brussels, 22nd November 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 10th December 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Noel Dierick, John Wallace

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on Fumaric acid (EFSA-Q-2012-00414) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date(s)

10th December 2012

Parma, 23 January 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 16th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Audio web-conference, 7th September 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 22nd November 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Noel Dierick

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on Orthophosphoric acid (EFSA-Q-2011-00419) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Calcium formate (Rovelan) for Piglets (weaned), calves for rearing and for fattening (EFSA-Q-2011-01090) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

22nd November 2012.

Parma, 23 January 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 15th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Audio web-conference, 27th July 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 7th September 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Noel Dierick

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on Orthophosphoric acid (EFSA-Q-2011-00419) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Methyl 4-hydroxybenzoate for all pet species (EFSA-Q-2012-00302) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Sodium ethyl 4-hydroxybenzoate for dogs and cats (EFSA-Q-2012-00301) on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

7th September 2012.

Parma, 23 January 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 14th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Audio web-conference, 13th July 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 27th July 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Noel Dierick

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on Malic acid and sodium/calcium malate (EFSA-Q-2010-01514) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Orthophosphoric acid (EFSA-Q-2011-00419) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

27th July 2012.

Parma, 13 January 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Audio web-conference, 30th April 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 13th July 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Noel Dierick, Atte von Wright,
Piet Wester

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00836) and decided to present the draft opinion to the next plenary meeting.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Orthophosphoric acid (EFSA-Q-2011-00419) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Fumaric acid (EFSA-Q-2012-00414) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date(s)

13th July 2012.

Parma, 13 January 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Audio web-conference, 2nd April 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 30th April 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Noel Dierick, Reinhard Kroker, Atte von Wright, Piet Wester

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00836) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Sodium benzoate, propionic acid, sodium propionate (EFSA-Q-2012-00309) and decided to present the draft opinion to the next plenary meeting
- The Working Group discussed the application on Orthophosphoric acid (EFSA-Q-2011-00419) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date(s)

30th April 2012.

Parma, 23 January 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Brussels, 28th-29th February 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 2nd April 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Reinhard Kroker, Atte von Wright, Piet Wester

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Noel Dierick

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on Aviplus (EFSA-Q-2011-01153) and decided to present the draft opinion to the next plenary meeting
- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00836) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Sorbic acid and potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-840) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00837) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00838) and decided that further discussion is needed.

- The Working Group discussed the application on Sorbic acid (EFSA-Q-2011-00839) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Lactic acid and calcium lactate (EFSA-Q-2010-1221) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Malic acid and sodium/calcium malate (EFSA-Q-2010-01514) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

2nd April 2012.

Parma, 23 January 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Parma, 17th-18th January 2012

EFSA / FEEDAP Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 28 February 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Reinhard Kroker, Noel Dierik,
Atte von Wright, Piet Wester

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on Acetic acid, calcium acetate and sodium diacetate (EFSA-Q-2010-01535) and decided to present the draft opinion to the next plenary meeting
- The Working Group discussed the application on Aviplus (EFSA-Q-2011-01153) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00836) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Sorbic acid and potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-840) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00837) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00838) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Sorbic acid (EFSA-Q-2011-00839) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

17th January 2012.

Parma, 18 January 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Audio web-conference, 11th November 2011

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 17 January 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Reinhard Kroker, Atte von Wright,

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants, apologies were received by Noel Dierik and Pieter Wester

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium diformate (EFSA-Q-2011-00422) and decided to present the draft opinion to the next plenary meeting
- The Working Group discussed the application on Propionic acid, sodium propionate, calcium propionate, ammonium propionate (EFSA-Q-2010-01302) and decided to present the draft opinion to the next plenary meeting
- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00836) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

17th January 2012.

Parma, 11 November 2011

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Barcelona, 27th-28th September 2011

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 11 November 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Reinhard Kroker, Atte von Wright,

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants, apologies were received by Noel Dierik and Pieter Wester

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on Protural (EFSA-Q-2010-00964) and decided to present the draft opinion to the next plenary meeting.
- The Working Group discussed the application on propionic acid, sodium propionate, calcium propionate, ammonium propionate (EFSA-Q-2010-01302) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on formic acid (EFSA-Q-2011-00421) and decided to inform the applicant about issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on calcium formate (EFSA-Q-2011-00423) and decided to inform the applicant about issues that required clarification.

- The Working Group discussed the application on ammonium formate, sodium formate, calcium formate (EFSA-Q-2011-00424) and decided to inform the applicant about issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00838) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Sorbic acid and potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00840) and decided to inform the applicant about issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00841) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-00836) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Sorbic acid (EFSA-Q-2011-00839) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Potassium sorbate (EFSA-Q-2011-0037) and decided to inform the applicant about issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

11th November, audio web conference.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 29 September 2011

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Parma, 14th – 15th July 2011

EFSA / FEEDAP Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 27 September 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Jurgen Gropp, Noel Dierick, Reinhard Kroker, Atte von Wright,
Pieter Wester

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants, apologies were received by Andrew Chesson

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on sodium benzoate, propionic acid, sodium propionate for pigs, poultry, bovines, sheep, goats, rabbits, horses (EFSA-Q-2010-01530) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- The Working Group discussed the application on malic acid and sodium/calcium malate for all species (EFSA-Q-2010-01514) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification

- The Working Group was informed that a new grouped mandate on formic acid and salts of formic acid¹ has been received by EFSA. A discussion on the mandate took place and it was decided to contact the applicants on issues that required clarifications.
- The Working Group was informed that a new grouped mandate on citric acid and salts of citric acid² has been received by EFSA. A discussion on the mandate took place and it was decided to contact the applicants on issues that required clarifications.
- The Working Group was informed that a new grouped mandate on phosphoric acid³ has been received by EFSA. A discussion on the mandate took place and it was decided to contact the applicants on issues that required clarifications.

5. Next meeting date(s)

27th – 28th September 2011 in Barcelona.

¹ EFSA-Q-2011-00421; EFSA-Q-2011-00422; EFSA-Q-2011-00423; EFSA-Q-2011-00424;

² EFSA-Q-2011-00748; EFSA-Q-2011-00749; EFSA-Q-2011-00750;

³ EFSA-Q-2011-00419; EFSA-Q-2011-00420;

Parma, 15 July 2011

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Parma, 24th – 25th May 2011

EFSA / FEEDAP Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 14 July 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Noel Dierick, Reinhard Kroker, Atte von Wright, Pieter Wester

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants, apologies were received by Atte von Wright (2nd day)

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on Acetic acid, calcium acetate and sodium diacetate for all species (EFSA-Q-2010-01535) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification
- The Working Group discussed the application on Propionic acid, sodium propionate, calcium propionate and ammonium propionate for all species (EFSA-Q-2010-01302) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification
- The Working Group discussed the application on Sodium benzoate, propionic acid and sodium propionate for pigs, bovines, poultry, sheep, goats, rabbits, horses (EFSA-Q-2010-01530) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date(s)

14th – 15th July 2011 in Parma.

Parma, 25 May 2011

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Parma, 17th - 18th March 2011

EFSA / FEEDAP Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 24 May 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Noel Dierick, Reinhard Kroker
EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants, apologies were received by Atte von Wright

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on Acetic acid, calcium acetate and sodium diacetate for all species (EFSA-Q-2010-01535) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification
- A preliminary discussion took place on the application on Potassium sorbate for all species (EFSA-Q-2010-01225)
- A preliminary discussion took place on the application on Sorbic acid and potassium sorbate for all species (EFSA-Q-2010-01279)
- During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following questions have been received:
 - (EFSA-Q-2010-01225)
 - (EFSA-Q-2010-01302)

- (EFSA-Q-2010-01530)
- (EFSA-Q-2010-01221)

5. Next meeting date(s)

24th – 25th May 2011

Parma, 17 March 2011

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids

Audio web-conference, 22nd November 2010

EFSA / FEEDAP Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 17 March 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Noel Dierick, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group continued its discussion on Protural (sodium benzoate) for weaned piglets (EFSA-Q-2009-00446) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date(s)

Not decided

Parma, 22 November 2010

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Organic acids

Parma/Audio web-conference 27th-28th July 2010

EFSA / FEEDAP Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 22nd November 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jurgen Gropp, Atte Von Wright

EFSA: Matteo L. Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA secretariat screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the scientific experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

The Working Group discussed the application on Formic acid (EFSA Q....) for all species and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification

5. Next meeting date

Next meeting date has not been decided

Parma, 8 May 2009

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

**Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Organic Acids Related Dossier
Brussels, 7 May 2009**

(Adopted by the WG on 27 July 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Atte von Wright (Chair), Andrew Chesson, Piet Wester
EFSA: Jaime Galobart, Matteo Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Noël Dierick, Walter Rambeck

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group revised the draft opinion on FormiTM LHS (potassium diformate) for sows (EFSA-Q-2008-693) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on AviPlus (citric acid, sorbic acid and thymol) for weaned piglets (EFSA-Q-2008-701) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on Protural (sodium benzoate) for weaned piglets (EFSA-Q-2009-446) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date

No date have been set for the next Working Group meeting.

Brussels, 17 February 2009

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

**Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Organic acids related dossiers
Brussels 17 February 2009**

(Adopted by the Working Group on 7 May 2009)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson , Noël Dierick, Walter Rambeck , Piet Wester and Atte von Wright.

EFSA: Jaume Galobart and Matteo Innocenti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

EFSA secretariat screened the ADol and SDol filled in by the scientific experts invited at this meeting in accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests.

With regard to the ADol, SDol and this meeting no other interest than those already declared in the ADol or in a previous SDol and screened by EFSA in accordance with its Policy on Declarations of Interests and implementing documents thereof was declared by the experts.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on FormiTM LHS for sows (EFSA-Q-2008-693) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following question/application has been received:
 - EFSA-Q-2008-701, AviPlus (citric acid, sorbic acid and thymol) for weaned piglets