

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 112th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 19 October 2018

(Agreed on 19 October 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Lucilla Gregoretti.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes. The following items were not discussed: *Origanum heracleoticum* L. ([EFSA-Q-2010-01289](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf)); Butyric

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

acid ([EFSA-Q-2018-00120](#)); Oil of *Origanum vulgare* L. subsp. *Hirtum* ([EFSA-Q-2018-00121](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. Additionally, no interests were declared at the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 20 - aliphatic and aromatic mono- and di-thiols and mono-, di-, tri-, and polysulphides with or without additional oxygenated functional groups when used as flavourings: 8-mercapto-p-methan-3-one [12.038], p-menth-1-ene-8-thiol [12.085] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2013-00325](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 03 - Alpha, beta-unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing alpha, beta-unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing alpha, beta-unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes: hex-2-en-1-ol [02.020], nona-2,6-dien-1-ol [02.049], pent-2-en-1-ol [02.050], non-2(cis)-en-1-ol [02.112], tr-2, cis-6-nonadien-1-ol [02.231], 2-dodecenal [05.037], nona-2(trans),6(cis)-dienal [05.058], nona-2,4-dienal [05.071], trans-2-nonenal [05.072], hex-2(trans)-enal [05.073], 2,4-decadienal [05.081], 2,4-heptadienal, hepta-2,4-dienal [05.058], deca-2(trans),4(trans)-dienal [05.140], dodec-2(trans)-enal [05.144], hept-2(trans)-enal [05.150], non-2-enal [05.171], nona-2(trans),6(trans)-dienal [05.172], undec-2(trans)-enal [05.184],

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/policyonindependence>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>

trans-2-octenal [05.190], trans-2-decenal [05.191], tr-2, tr-4-nonadienal [05.194], tr-2, tr-4-undecadienal [05.196], allyl heptanoate [09.097], allyl hexanoate [09.244], hex-2(trans)-enyl acetate [09.394] and hex-2-enyl butyrate [09.396] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00344](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Oregano oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00122](#)) decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting

7 November 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 111th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Held on 12 - 13 September 2018, Parma

(Agreed on 13 September 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. Additionally, no interests were declared at the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, *Origanum heracleoticum* L. for suckling piglets, weaned piglets, pigs for fattening, sows for reproduction, sows for benefits in piglets, chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for fattening and breeding and reared for breeding, calves for rearing, veal production, cattle for fattening, dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, lambs for rearing, lambs for fattening, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, kids for rearing, kids for fattening, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, fin fish, shrimps ([EFSA-Q-2010-01289](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Rosemary extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00616](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Lemon extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00680](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.6. The Working Group discussed the application on Olive extract, olive leaf extract (*Olea europaea* L.) ([EFSA-Q-2018-00621](#))

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/policyonindependence>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>

and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

- 4.7. The Working Group discussed the application on *Sus scrofa* (extract from defatted porcine pancreatic glands) for pets ([EFSA-Q-2018-00617](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.8. The following item was not discussed: Chemical Group 20 - aliphatic and aromatic mono- and di-thiols and mono-, di-, tri-, and polysulphides with or without additional oxygenated functional groups when used as flavourings: 8-mercapto-p-methan-3-one [12.038], p-menth-1-ene-8-thiol [12.085] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2013-00325](#)).

5. Next meeting

19 October 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 110th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 5-6 June 2018

(Agreed on 6 June 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf.

Paul Brantom has participated via tele-webconference

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Extract from super critical carbon dioxide extraction of *Humulus Lupulus* L. flos containing 40% beta acids with propylene glycol (Beta Rich Hop Extract - BRHE) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00662](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on *Origanum heracleoticum* L. for suckling piglets, weaned piglets, pigs for fattening, sows for reproduction, sows for benefits in piglets, chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for fattening and breeding and reared for breeding, calves for rearing, veal production, cattle for fattening, dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, lambs for rearing, lambs for fattening, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, kids for rearing, kids for fattening, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, fin fish, shrimps ([EFSA-Q-2010-01289](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on *Arctium lappa* extract (Great burdock extract) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2018-00439](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on *Plantago ovata* L. husk (Fleawort absolute) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2018-00441](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.6. The Working Group discussed the application on *Garcinia cambogia* Desrouss (Garcinia extract) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2018-00440](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.7. The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)).

5. Next meeting

12-13 September 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 109th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 25 May 2018

(Agreed on 25 May 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Expert:¹**

Emilio Benfenati

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Expert

Emilio Benfenati was invited to present his views for the topic 6.1 of the present meeting.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on *Echinacea angustifolia* DC. (Blacksamson echinacea extract) and *Echinacea purpurea* (L.) Moench. (Echinacea extract) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2018-00319](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on *Panax Ginseng* C.A. Meyer (Ginseng extract) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2018-00320](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on *Gingko biloba* L. (gingko extract) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2018-00318](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4. The following items were not discussed: Extract from super critical carbon dioxide extraction of *Humulus Lupulus* L. flos containing 40% beta acids with propylene glycol (Beta Rich Hop Extract - BRHE) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00662](#)), *Origanum heracleoticum* L. for suckling piglets, weaned piglets, pigs for fattening, sows for reproduction, sows for benefits in piglets, chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for fattening and breeding and reared for breeding, calves for rearing, veal production, cattle for fattening, dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, lambs for rearing, lambs for fattening, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, kids for rearing, kids for fattening, dairy

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, fin fish, shrimps ([EFSA-Q-2010-01289](#)).

6. Any Other Business

- 6.1. Emilio Benfenati made a presentation on the grouping of substances of botanical origin and assessment of their toxicological properties based on *in silico* models.

7. Next meeting

5-6 June 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 108th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 06 April 2018

(Agreed on 06 April 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Boris Kolar, Patrick van Beelen and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: cardamom oil from *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.2. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.3. Chemically defined flavourings for use in cats and dogs from different chemical groups ([EFSA-Q-2018-00123](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.4. The following item was not discussed: Extract from super critical carbon dioxide extraction of *Humulus Lupulus* L. flos containing 40% beta acids with propylene glycol (Beta Rich Hop Extract - BRHE) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00662](#))

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting

25 May 2018

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 107th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 09 March 2018

(Agreed on 09 March 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. Extract from super critical carbon dioxide extraction of *Humulus Lupulus* L. flos containing 40% beta acids with propylene glycol (Beta Rich Hop Extract - BRHE) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00662](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. Butyric acid for dogs and cats ([EFSA-Q-2018-00120](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.3. Oregano oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00122](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.4. Oil of *Origanum vulgare* L. subsp. *Hirtum* for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2018-00121](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.5. The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: cardamom oil from *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#))

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting

6 April 2018

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 106th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 14-15 February 2018

(Agreed on 15 February 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund¹ and Johannes Westendorf

Paul Brantom² has participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:**³

Gabriele Aquilina⁴ has participated via teleconference, in agenda point 4.1

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

SCER Unit: Jean-Lou Dorne⁵

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ The second day.

² Both days in the morning.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

⁴ The second day in the morning.

⁵ For the topic recorded under any other business.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁷ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: cardamom oil from *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on *Cumin Cyminum* L. for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00909](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on *Mugwort* tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00181](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.6. The WG discussed the application on Denseflower mullein tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00146](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

5. Any Other Business

6. Next meeting

09 March 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 105th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 26 January 2018

(Agreed on 26 January 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paul Brantom.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: cardamom oil from *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. *Origanum heracleoticum* L. for suckling piglets, weaned piglets, pigs for fattening, sows for reproduction, sows for benefits in piglets, chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, turkeys for fattening and breeding and reared for breeding, calves for rearing, veal production, cattle for fattening, dairy cows for milk production, cows for reproduction, lambs for rearing, lambs for fattening, dairy sheep for milk production, ewes for reproduction, kids for rearing, kids for fattening, dairy goats for milk production, goats for reproduction, fin fish, shrimps ([EFSA-Q-2010-01289](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting

14 - 15 February 2018

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 104th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 11 December 2017

(Agreed on 11 December 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lurdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Cumin Cyminum L. for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00909](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3. Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: cardamom oil from Elettaria cardamomum (L.) Maton for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting

26 January 2018

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 103rd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 14-15 November 2017

(Agreed on 15 November 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lurdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

Boris Kolar¹ and Patrick van Beelen¹ have participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paul Brantom.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ The first day in the morning

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: cardamom oil from *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on extract from super critical carbon dioxide extraction of *Humulus Lupulus* L. flos containing 40% beta acids with propylene glycol (Beta Rich Hop Extract - BRHE) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00662](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

6. Next meeting

06 December 2017

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 102nd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 16 October 2017

(Agreed by written procedure on 24 October 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lurdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Boris Kolar, Patrick van Beelen and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Lucilla Gregoretti.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols: d,l-menthol [02.218], isopulegone [07.067] and α -damascone [07.134] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00163](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 05 - saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols, ketones and esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal when used as flavourings for all animal species and categories: isopulegol [02.067], 5-methylhept-2-en-4-one [07.139], oct-1-en-3-ol [02.023], pent-1-en-3-ol [02.099], oct-1-en-3-one [07.081] and oct-1-en-3-yl acetate [09.281] ([EFSA-Q-2015-00599](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The following item was not discussed: Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)); Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales:

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

cardamom oil from *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)); Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting

14-15 November 2017

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 101th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 19 September 2017

(Agreed on 19 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lurdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Boris Kolar and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Patrick van Beelen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 100th Working Group meeting held on 14 July, tele-web conference

The minutes of the of the 100th Working Group meeting held on 14 July were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The WG discussed the application Natural essential oil from *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. *Vulkan* (DOS 00001) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The WG discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols: d,l-menthol [02.218], isopulegone [07.067] and α -damascone [07.134] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00163](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The WG discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 05 - saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols, ketones and esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal when used as flavourings for all animal species and categories: isopulegol [02.067], 5-methylhept-2-en-4-one [07.139], oct-1-en-3-ol

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

[02.023], pent-1-en-3-ol [02.099], oct-1-en-3-one [07.081] and oct-1-en-3-yl acetate [09.281] ([EFSA-Q-2015-00599](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable

7. Next meeting

16 October 2017

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 100th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 14 July 2017

(Agreed on 19 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lurdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Boris Kolar, Patrick van Beelen and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Sodium saccharin for Piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - *Zingiberales* for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)): cardamom oil from *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - *Zingiberales* for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2017-00532](#)): turmeric oil, turmeric oleoresin, turmeric extract (sb) and turmeric tincture from *Curcuma longa* L. and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - *Zingiberales* for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)): ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc. and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.6. The following items were not discussed: Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols: d,l-menthol [02.218], isopulegone [07.067] and α -damascone [07.134] for all animal

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00163](#)); Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 05 - saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols, ketones and esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal when used as flavourings for all animal species and categories: isopulegol [02.067], 5-methylhept-2-en-4-one [07.139], oct-1-en-3-ol [02.023], pent-1-en-3-ol [02.099], oct-1-en-3-one [07.081] and oct-1-en-3-yl acetate [09.281] ([EFSA-Q-2015-00599](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting

19 September 2017

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 99th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 13-14 June 2017

(Agreed on 14 June 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lurdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

Paul Brantom,¹ Boris Kolar² and Patrick van Beelen² have participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:³**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ The first day, in the morning.

² The first day, in the afternoon.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - *Zingiberales* for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Natural essential oil from *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. Vulkan (DOS 00001) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on *Cumin Cyminum* L. (Cumin tincture) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00909](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Sodium saccharin for Piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)/FEFANA asbl) and decided further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. The following item was not discussed: Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)).

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting

14 July 2017

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 98th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 12 May 2017

(Agreed by written procedure on 15 May 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lurdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The participants were welcomed. Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - *Zingiberales* for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The following items were not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517/FEFANA asbl](#)); Natural essential oil from *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. Vulkan (DOS 00001) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting

13-14 June 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 97th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 26-27 April 2017

(Agreed on 27 April 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lurdes Bastos and Johannes Westendorf
Paul Brantom¹ and Birgit Dusemund have participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Almudena Rodríguez Sánchez-Beato³

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini and Manuela Tiramani³

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ The first day.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ The second day, for item 5. Any Other Business.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)/FEFANA asbl) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - *Zingiberales* for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Natural essential oil from *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. Vulkan (DOS 00001) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

In the context of this meeting EFSA hosted a trilateral meeting organised and coordinated by the European Commission with the applicants (Feed Flavourings Authorisation Consortium) and the EFSA Working Group on Feed Flavourings regarding the risk assessment of botanical flavourings.

6. Next meeting

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

12 May 2017

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 96th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 17 March 2017

(Agreed on 17 March 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lurdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - *Zingiberales* for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Natural essential oil from *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. *Vulkan* (DOS 00001) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The application on Benzoic acid for suckling piglets, weaned piglets, pigs for fattening, sows for reproduction, sows in order to have benefit in piglets, minor porcine species, chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, breeding hens, turkeys for fattening, turkeys for breeding purposes, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00858](#)) will be transferred to the Working Group on Other Additives.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

26-27 April 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 95th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 15 - 17 February 2017

(Agreed on 17 February 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos and Johannes Westendorf

Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund and Boris Kolar¹ participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Gabriele Aquilina participated for agenda point 4.1.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Almudena Rodríguez Sánchez-Beato

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ The second day.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on *Cumin Cyminum* L. for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00909](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require further clarification.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Natural essential oil from *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. *Vulkan* (DOS 00001) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

17 March 2017

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 94th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 16 January 2017

(Agreed on 16 January 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lurdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paul Brantom.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The following items were not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)); *Cumin Cyminum* L. for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00909](#)); Natural essential oil from *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. *Vulkan* (DOS 00001) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

15-17 February 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 93rd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 12 December 2016

(Agreed on 12 December 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lurdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Birgit Dusemund, Roberto Edoardo Villa and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

16 January 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 92nd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 22-23 November 2016

(Agreed on 23 November 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lurdes Bastos and Johannes Westendorf
Paul Brantom¹ and Roberto Edoardo Villa¹ participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Gabriele Aquilina participated via teleconference for item 4.1.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ The first day.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 24 – Pyrazine derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01032](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 22 - Aryl-substituted primary alcohol/aldehyde/acid/ester/acetal derivatives, including unsaturated ones for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01042](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the application on *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. Vulkan (DOS 00001) ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)) and decided to inform the applicant about issues that require clarification.

5. Any Other Business

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

12 December 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 91st meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 20-21 October 2016

(Agreed on 21 October 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Maria de Lurdes Bastos and Roberto Edoardo Villa¹

Johannes Westendorf and Roberto Edoardo Villa² participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:**³

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Marta Ponghellini and Almudena Rodriguez Sanchez-Beato have participated for item 5.3.

- **EFSA:**

Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

Jaume Galobart and Manuela Tiramani have participated for item 5.3.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ The first day.

² The second day.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 90th Working Group meeting held on 14 October 2016, tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 90th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 18 October 2016.⁶

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 24 – Pyrazine derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01032](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 22 - Aryl-substituted primary alcohol/aldehyde/acid/ester/acetal derivatives, including unsaturated ones for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01042](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The following items were not discussed: *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. Vulkan (DOS 00001) ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)); Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)).

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

22-23 November 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 90th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 14 October 2016

(Agreed by written procedure on 18 10 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Patrick van Beelen, Christer Hogstrand, Boris Kolar, Paul Brantom and Johannes Westendorf.

- **Hearing Experts:**¹

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with these changes: Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 10 - Secondary aliphatic saturated or unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with a second secondary or tertiary oxygenated functional group for all animal species and categories

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

([EFSA-Q-2010-00874](#)), Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 24 – Pyrazine derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01032](#)) and Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 22 - Aryl-substituted primary alcohol/aldehyde/acid/ester/acetal derivatives, including unsaturated ones for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01042](#)) were excluded from the agenda.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the (89)th Working Group meeting held on 13-14 September 2016, Parma.

The minutes of the 89th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 03 October 2016.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 12 - Maltol derivatives and ketodioxane derivatives: maltol [07.014] ([EFSA-Q-2010-10133](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Sodium Saccharin for pigs, piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing, calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

7. Next meeting

20, 21.10.2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 89th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Held on 13-14 September 2016, Parma

(Agreed by written procedure on 03 10 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria Lourdes de Bastos, Andrew Chesson and Johannes Westendorf.

Birgit Dusemund participated via teleconference.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Gabriele Aquilina,² Claudia Bolognesi,² Riccardo Crebelli,² Rainer Gürtler² and Pasquale Mosesso² have participated for agenda items 4.1 and 4.3.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Lucilla Gregoretti

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Natalia Kovalkovicova and Anne Theobald

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² The first day only, in the morning.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 10 - Secondary aliphatic saturated or unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with a second secondary or tertiary oxygenated functional group for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00874](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 12 - Maltol derivatives and ketodioxane derivatives: maltol [07.014] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01033](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 22 - Aryl-substituted primary alcohol/aldehyde/acid/ester/acetal derivatives, including unsaturated ones for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01042](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 24 - Pyrazine derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01032](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

- 4.6. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. Vulkan (DOS 00001) ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.7. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on Dry grape extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00342](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.8. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

14 October 2016

20-21 October 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 88th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 02 September 2016

(Agreed on 02 September 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Christer Hogstrand, Boris Kolar and Patrick van Beelen.

- **Hearing Experts:**¹

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Lucilla Gregoretti

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the environmental section of the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 10 - Secondary aliphatic saturated or unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with a second secondary or tertiary oxygenated functional group for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00874](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the environmental section of the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 22 - Aryl-substituted primary alcohol/aldehyde/acid/ester/acetal derivatives, including unsaturated ones for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01042](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the environmental section of the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 24 - Pyrazine derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01032](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

13-14 September 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 87th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Held on 21-23 June 2016, Porto, Portugal

(Agreed on 23 June 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Christer Hogstrand, Patrick van Beelen, Roberto Villa and Johannes Westendorf.

Paul Brantom¹ has participated via teleconference.

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

Lucilla Gregoretti has participated via teleconference.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Boris Kolar.

¹ The first and the second day.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 86th Working Group meeting held on 06 June 2016, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 86th Working Group meeting held on 06th June 2016 were agreed by written procedure on 9 June 2016.⁵

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 04 – Non-conjugated and accumulated unsaturated straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing unsaturated alcohols and acetals containing unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00988](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 21 - Aromatic ketones, secondary alcohols and related esters for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01041](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 10 - Secondary aliphatic saturated or unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with a second secondary or tertiary oxygenated functional group for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00874](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The Working Group started the discussion on the application on Dry grape extract for use in water for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-000342](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5. The Working Group discussed the application on *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. Vulkan (DOS 00001) ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)) for all animal species and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6. The Working Group discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.7. The following item was not discussed because the expected data were not available: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

02 September 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 86th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 06 June 2016

(Agreed on 9 June 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Patrick van Beelen, Birgit Dusemund, Boris Kolar, Roberto Villa and Johannes Westendorf.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucilla Gregoretti.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 04 – Non-conjugated and accumulated unsaturated straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing unsaturated alcohols and acetals containing unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00988](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 21 - Aromatic ketones, secondary alcohols and related esters for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01041](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

21-23 June 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 85th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Held on 12-13 May 2016, Milan

(Agreed on 13 May 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Roberto Villa and Johannes Westendorf.

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom and Patrick van Beelen¹ have participated via teleconference.

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Antje Holthausen³ (Delacon – member of FEFANA-FFAC steering committee), Karin Erni³ and Manfred Lützwow³ (Saqual – consultant for FEFANA-FFAC) have participated for item 6.6.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini and Manuela Tiramani⁴

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Boris Kolar and Christer Hogstrand.

¹ The first day only, in the afternoon.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

³ The first day only, 9.00-11.00 a.m.

⁴ The first day only, in the morning.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁶ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 84th Working Group meeting held on 29th April 2016, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 84th Working Group meeting held on 29th April 2016 were agreed by written procedure on 12 May 2016.⁷

5. Hearing Experts

Ms. Antje Holthausen, Ms. Karin Erni and Mr. Manfred Lützow were invited to present their views on agenda item 6.6 on behalf of the applicant FEFANA-FFAC. They attended the meeting on 12 May 2016 from 9:00 for two hours.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest, EFSA invited Ms. Antje Holthausen, Ms. Karin Erni and Mr. Manfred Lützow to submit an ADoI. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.

6. Scientific topics for discussion

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

- 6.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 03 – α , β -unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing α , β -unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing α , β -unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01219](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 6.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 04 – Non-conjugated and accumulated unsaturated straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing unsaturated alcohols and acetals containing unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00988](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 6.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. Vulkan (DOS 00001) ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 6.4. The application on Botanically defined flavourings from BDG 07 - Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)) was not discussed.
- 6.5. The application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) was discussed in the context of agenda item 6.6.
- 6.6. Discussion on the ongoing work regarding the pilot dossiers BDG08 and BDG09.

Upon request from EFSA, the applicant FEFANA-FFAC was given the opportunity to continue the discussion started at the Info-session (Barcelona, 6 May 2015) and at the technical hearing at the WG on Feed Flavourings (24 June 2015) on the data required for the assessment of botanicals as feed flavourings. The applicant updated the WG on the status of the on-going work regarding the two dossiers selected for the pilot phase (BDG08 and BDG09), highlighting the difficulties met in the generation of compositional data.

EFSA will follow up by providing the applicant with a written summary of the points discussed and the next steps and relative timelines.

7. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

8. Next meeting

06 June 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 84th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 29 April 2016

(Agreed on 12 May 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Roberto Villa and Johannes Westendorf.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Birgit Dusemund.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.

The following item was removed from the agenda: *Cumin Cyminum* L. for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00909](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf)).

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 83rd Working Group meeting held on 1st April 2016, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 83rd Working Group meeting held on 01st April 2016 were agreed by written procedure on 25 April 2016.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 03 – α , β -unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing α , β -unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing α , β -unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01219](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group started the discussion on *Origanum vulgare* L. ssp. *hirtum* var. Vulkan (DOS 00001) ([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

12-13 May 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 83rd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 01 April 2016

(Agreed on 25 April 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Roberto Villa and Johannes Westendorf.

- **Hearing Experts:**¹

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.

The following item was removed from the agenda: *Cumin Cyminum* L. for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00909](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf)).

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 82nd Working Group meeting held on 1-2 March 2016, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 82nd Working Group meeting held on 1-2 March 2016 were agreed by written procedure on 12 March 2016.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Dry grape extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00213](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The following items were not discussed:
Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 21 - Aromatic ketones, secondary alcohols and related esters for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01041](#));
Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 03 - α , β -unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing α , β -unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing α , β -unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01219](#)); *Origanum vulgare*

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

L. ssp. *hirtum* var. Vulkan (DOS 00001) for all animal species
([EFSA-Q-2016-00112](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

29 April 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 82nd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Held on 1-2 March 2016, Parma

(Agreed on 12 March 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Roberto Villa¹ and Johannes Westendorf²

Paul Brantom, Boris Kolar and Patrick van Beelen have participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:**³

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Christer Hogstrand.

¹ Until the 2nd day morning.

² From the 1st day afternoon.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 81st Working Group meeting held on 15 February, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 81st Working Group meeting held on 15 February 2016 were agreed by written procedure on 17 February 2016.⁶

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 03 - α , β -unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing α , β -unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing α , β -unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01219](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 21 - Aromatic ketones, secondary alcohols and related esters for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01041](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 29 - 2,4,5-

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

trimethylthiazole, 2-acetylthiazole, 2-ethyl 4-methylthiazole, 2-isobutylthiazole, 2-isopropyl-4-methylthiazole, 4,5-dihydrothiophen-3(2H)-one, 5,6-dihydro-2,4,6-trans(2-methylpropyl)4H-1,3,5-dithiazine, 4-methyl-5-vinylthiazole, 5-(2-hydroxyethyl)-4-methylthiazole, benzothiazole, thiamine hydrochloride for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2013-00569](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

- 5.4. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on Dry grape extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00213](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6. The following items were not discussed: Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 04 – Non-conjugated and accumulated unsaturated straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing unsaturated alcohols and acetals containing unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00988](#)); Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 12 - Maltol derivatives and ketodioxane derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01033](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

01 April 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 81st meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 15 February 2016

(Agreed on 17 February 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Roberto Villa and Johannes Westendorf.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini and Roberto Molteni

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 80th Working Group meeting held on 19-20 January 2016, Barcelona.

The minutes of the of the 80th Working Group meeting held on 19 and 20 January 2016 were agreed by written procedure on 5 February 2016.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Dry grape extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00213](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The following items were not discussed: Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 21 - Aromatic ketones, secondary alcohols and related esters for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01041](#)), Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 29 - 2,4,5-trimethylthiazole, 2-acetylthiazole, 2-ethyl 4-methylthiazole, 2-isobutylthiazole, 2-isopropyl-4-methylthiazole, 4,5-dihydrothiophen-3(2H)-one, 5,6-dihydro-2,4,6-trans(2-methylpropyl)4H-1,3,5-dithiazine, 4-methyl-5-vinylthiazole, 5-(2-hydroxyethyl)-4-methylthiazole, benzothiazole, thiamine hydrochloride for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2013-00569](#)), *Cumin Cuminum L.* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00909](#))
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the need to update the guidance for the preparation of dossiers for sensory additives

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

01-02 March 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 80th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Held on 19-20 January 2016, Barcelona

(Agreed on 5 February 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Roberto Edoardo Villa and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

Lucilla Gregoretti and Roberto Molteni have participated via teleconference

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 79th Working Group meeting held on 16-17 December 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 79th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 15 January 2016.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 28 - Pyridine, pyrrole and quinoline derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01171](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - Secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols ([EFSA-Q-2010-01181](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 21 - Aromatic ketones, secondary alcohols and related esters for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01041](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 29 - 2,4,5-

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

trimethylthiazole, 2-acetylthiazole, 2-ethyl 4-methylthiazole, 2-isobutylthiazole, 2-isopropyl-4-methylthiazole, 4,5-dihydrothiophen-3(2H)-one, 5,6-dihydro-2,4,6-trans(2-methylpropyl)4H-1,3,5-dithiazine, 4-methyl-5-vinylthiazole, 5-(2-hydroxyethyl)-4-methylthiazole, benzothiazole, thiamine hydrochloride for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2013-00569](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

- 5.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Dry grape extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00213](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6. The Working Group discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.7. The Working Group discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

15 February 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 79th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Held on 16-17 December, Parma

(Agreed on 15 January 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Birgit Dusemund, Christer Hogstrand, Roberto Edoardo Villa and Johannes Westendorf.

Paul Brantom,¹ Boris Kolar² and Patrick van Beelen² have participated via teleconference.

- **Hearing Experts:³**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti,² Paola Manini and Roberto Molteni.⁴

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson.

¹ First day (am).

² First day (am) and second day (am).

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

⁴ First day only.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes.

The following item was removed from the agenda: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#))

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁶ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 78th Working Group meeting held on 5 November 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 78th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 01 December 2015.⁷

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - Secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols ([EFSA-Q-2010-01181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 12 - Maltol derivatives and ketodioxane derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01033](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 28 - Pyridine, pyrrole and quinoline derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01171](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 29 - 2,4,5-trimethylthiazole, 2-acetylthiazole, 2-ethyl 4-methylthiazole, 2-isobutylthiazole, 2-isopropyl-4-methylthiazole, 4,5-dihydrothiophen-3(2H)-one, 5,6-dihydro-2,4,6-trans(2-methylpropyl)4H-1,3,5-dithiazine, 4-methyl-5-vinylthiazole, 5-(2-hydroxyethyl)-4-methylthiazole, benzothiazole, thiamine hydrochloride for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2013-00569](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5. A preliminary discussion took place on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 - Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)).
- 5.6. The Working Group discussed the application on Dry grape extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00213](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

19-20 January 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 78th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Held on 17-18 November, Parma

(Agreed on 01 December 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson and Johannes Westendorf. Paul Brantom¹ has participated via teleconference.

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini and Roberto Molteni.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Christer Hogstrand and Roberto Edoardo Villa.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ First day in the afternoon and second day in the morning.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 77th Working Group meeting held on 5 November 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 77th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 12 November 2015.⁵

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise (BIOSTRONG[®] 510) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - Secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols ([EFSA-Q-2010-01181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 12 - Maltol derivatives and ketodioxane derivatives for all animal species

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01033](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

- 5.5. The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 28 - Pyridine, pyrrole and quinoline derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01171](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6. The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 29 - 2,4,5-trimethylthiazole, 2-acetylthiazole, 2-ethyl 4-methylthiazole, 2-isobutylthiazole, 2-isopropyl-4-methylthiazole, 4,5-dihydrothiophen-3(2H)-one, 5,6-dihydro-2,4,6-trans(2-methylpropyl)4H-1,3,5-dithiazine, 4-methyl-5-vinylthiazole, 5-(2-hydroxyethyl)-4-methylthiazole, benzothiazole, thiamine hydrochloride for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2013-00569](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

16-17 December 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 77th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 5 November 2015

(Agreed on 12 November 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Christer Hogstrand, Boris Kolar, Patrick van Beelen.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini and Roberto Molteni

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 76th Working Group meeting held on 22-23 October 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 76th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 26 October 2015.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 28 - Pyridine, pyrrole and quinoline derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01171](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the approach to be taken for Botanical feed additives when considering risks for the environment.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

17-18 November 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 76th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Held on 22-23 October, Parma

(Agreed on 26 October 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Boris Kolar, Roberto Edoardo Villa and Johannes Westendorf.

Patrick van Beelen¹ and Paul Brantom² have participated via teleconference.

- **Hearing Experts:**³

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini and Roberto Molteni

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ Only the second day.

² Only the second day.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 75th Working Group meeting held on 1-2 September 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 75th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 9 September 2015.⁶

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application Preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise (BIOSTRONG[®] 510) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - Secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols ([EFSA-Q-2010-01181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 28 - Pyridine, pyrrole and quinoline derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01171](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring (SmokEz C-10) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

5.5. The following items were not discussed: Dry grape extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00213](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

5 November 2015