

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 75th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Held on 01-02 September, Parma

(Agreed on 09 September 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Christer Hogstrand¹ and Johannes Westendorf

Vasileios Bampidis², Paul Brantom³ and Secundino Lopez Puente⁴ have participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:**⁵

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Roberto Molteni

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucilla Gregoretti.

¹ Only the first day.

² Only in the afternoon of the two days.

³ Only in the morning of the first day and the second day.

⁴ Only the second day.

⁵ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁷ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 74th Working Group meeting held on 17 July 2015, Tele-webconference.

The minutes of the of the 74th Working Group meeting held on 17 July 2015 were agreed.⁸

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. Discussion on the approach to the risk assessment of genotoxic carcinogens in botanical preparations.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application Preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise (BIOSTRONG[®] 510) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)/Delacon Biotechnik GmbH) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 14 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01218](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - Secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/assets/feedapfeedflavourings.pdf>

ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols ([EFSA-Q-2010-01181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

- 5.5. The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2015-00069](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

22-23 October 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 74th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 17 July 2015

(Agreed on 24 July 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Robert Luttik and Patrick van Beelen

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Luca Bellomo, Paola Manini and Roberto Molteni

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucilla Gregoretti.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the the 73rd Working Group meeting held on 26 June 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 73rd Working Group meeting held on 26 June 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application "Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 14 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms" for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01218](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application "Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - Secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols" ([EFSA-Q-2010-01181](#)) for all animal species and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

1-2- September 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwqs/docs/feedapfeedflavourings.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 73rd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 26 June 2015
(Agreed on 26 June 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Christer Hogstrand, Robert Luttk, Patrick van Beelen
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Yara Antonissen (FEFANA-FFAC), Ludovic Arnaud (FEFANA-FFAC), Michael Klein (Fraunhofer IME – hearing expert for FEFANA-FFAC), Manfred Lützow (Saqual – consultant for FEFANA-FFAC), Susan Schönmann (Saqual – consultant for FEFANA-FFAC) have participated in agenda point 5.3.
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Luca Bellomo, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni
 - Lucilla Gregoretti has participated via teleconference
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Experts

Ms. Yara Antonissen, Mr. Ludovic Arnaud, Mr. Michael Klein, Mr. Manfred Lützow and Ms. Susan Schönmann were invited to present their views on the specific questions they were called upon to answer solely for topic. They attended the meeting on 26 June 2015 from 10:30 to 12:30.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁵, EFSA invited Ms. Yara Antonissen, Mr. Ludovic Arnaud, Mr. Michael Klein, Mr. Manfred Lützow and Ms. Susan Schönmann to submit an ADoI. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁶

5. Agreement of the minutes of the 72nd Working Group meeting held on 23-24 June 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 72nd Working Group meeting were agreed on 24 June 2015.

6. Scientific topics for discussion

- 6.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Group 28 - Pyridine, pyrrole and quinoline derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01171](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 6.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 6.3 Discussion on the environmental risk assessment of feed flavourings

Upon request from EFSA, the applicant FEFANA-FFAC was given the opportunity to further discuss at a technical hearing the additional information required for the environmental risk assessment of chemically defined flavourings and sodium saccharin. Following discussion during the hearing, a number of points were clarified. After the hearing was finished, and the hearing experts left the teleconference, the WG discussed the clarifications provided by the applicant.

EFSA will follow up by providing the applicant with a written summary of the points discussed and the next steps and relative timelines.

Next meeting

17 July 2015

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 72nd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
3rd Meeting on Botanicals as Feed Flavourings
Held on 23-24 June 2015
(Agreed on 24 June 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Christer Hogstrand, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Antje Holthausen² (Delacon – member of FEFANA-FFAC steering committee) and Manfred Lützwow¹ (Saqual – consultant for FEFANA-FFAC) have participated in agenda point 5.4.
- **European Commission:**
 - Marta Ponghellini¹ and Almudena Rodríguez Sánchez-Beato¹ have participated via videoconference in agenda point 5.4.
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Luca Bellomo, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni, Jaume Galobart¹
 - Lucilla Gregoretta has participated via teleconference
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² The second day only, 9.30-11.30 a.m.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Hearing Experts

Ms. Antje Holthausen and Mr. Manfred Lützwow were invited to present their views on the specific questions they were called upon to answer solely for topic 5.4 of the present meeting on behalf of the applicant FEFANA-FFAC. They attended the meeting on 24 June 2015 from 9:30 for two hours.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁶, EFSA invited Mr. Manfred Lützwow and Ms. Antje Holthausen to submit an ADoI. Their participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Working Group, in accordance with the applicable legal framework⁷.

5. Agreement of the minutes of the 71st Working Group meeting held on 27 May 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 71st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 3 June 2015 and published on the EFSA website on 4 June 2015.

6. Scientific topics for discussion

- 6.1 The Working Group discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from BDG 07 - Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 6.2 The Working Group discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from BDG 01 – Lamiales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01307](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 6.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Dry grape extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00213](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 6.4 Discussion on the data required for the assessment of botanicals as feed flavourings.

Upon request from EFSA, the applicant FEFANA-FFAC was given the opportunity to continue the discussion started at the Info-session (Barcelona 6 May 2015) on the data required for the assessment of botanicals as feed flavourings. It was agreed to test a strategy for the assessment of one or two representative groups once additional data have been provided. After the hearing was finished, and the hearing experts left the room, the WG discussed the clarifications provided by the applicant.

EFSA will follow up by providing the applicant with a written summary of the points discussed and the next steps and relative timelines.

Next meetings

26 June 2015

1-2 September 2015

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁷ Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 71th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 27 May 2015
(To be agreed by written procedure on 3 June 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Christer Hogstrand, Secundino Lopez Puente, Derek Renshaw
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Luca Bellomo, Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson, Robert Luttik, Johannes Westendorf.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 70th Working Group meeting held on 23 April 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 70th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 30 April 2015 and published on the EFSA website on 4 May 2015.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 14 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01218](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2015-00069](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Next meeting

26 June 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 70th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
2nd Meeting on Botanicals as Feed Flavourings
Held on 23 April 2015
(To be agreed by written procedure on 30 April 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Luca Bellomo, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucilla Gregoretti, Christer Hogstrand.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 69th Working Group meeting held on 13 February 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 69th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 20 April 2015 and published on the EFSA website on 22 April 2015.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from BDG 07 - Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Cumin *Cuminum L.* (Cumin Tincture) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00909](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

Next meeting

23-24 June 2015

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 69th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 13 April 2015
(Agreed by written procedure on 20 April 2015)**

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Christer Hogstrand, Secundino Lopez Puente, Derek Renshaw, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Luca Bellomo, Jaume Galobart, Lucilla Gregoretti, Roberto Molteni
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paola Manini.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 68th Working Group meeting held on 12 March 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 68th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 25 March 2015 and published on the EFSA website on 27 March 2015.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 14 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01218](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2015-00069](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The following item was not discussed: Preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise (BIOSTRONG® 510) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)).

6. Any Other Business

- 6.1 A discussion took place on the assessment of the safety for target species of feed flavourings that should be discussed during the Info Session on Applications – FEED – Technical Meeting with Stakeholders on Feed Additives Applications (Barcelona, 5 May 2015).

Next meeting

27 May 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 68th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 12-13 March 2015
(Agreed by written procedure on 25 March 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Christer Hogstrand, Secundino Lopez Puente, Robert Luttik¹, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:** ²
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Luca Bellomo, Jaume Galobart³, Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Only the second day.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ Only the first day.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 67th Working Group meeting held on 18-19 February 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 67th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 26 February 2015 and published on the EFSA website on 6 March 2015.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 14 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01218](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 28 - Pyridine, pyrrole, and quinoline derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01171](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The following items were not discussed: Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - Secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01181](#)).

6. Any Other Business

- 6.1 A discussion took place on the assessment of the safety for target species of feed flavourings.

Next meeting

13 April 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 67th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
1st Meeting on Botanicals as Feed Flavourings
Held on 18-19 February 2015
(Agreed by written procedure on 20 February 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund, Christer Hogstrand¹, Johannes Westendorf
 - Paul Brantom has participated via teleconference²
- **Hearing Experts:**³
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Luca Bellomo, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucilla Gregoretti.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the

¹ Only the second day.

² Only the first day.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 66th Working Group meeting held on 16 February 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 66th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 17 February 2015 and published on the EFSA website 18 February 2015.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 A preliminary discussion took place on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from BDG 07 - Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)).

6. Next meeting

12-13 March 2015

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 66th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 16 February 2015**

(Agreed by written procedure on 17 February 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lurdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Christer Hogstrand, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Luca Bellomo, Lucilla Gregoretti, Derek Renshaw

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 65th Working Group meeting held on 13-14 January 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 65th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 14 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01218](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - Secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohol ([EFSA-Q-2010-01181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on BIOSTRONG[®] 510 (Preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on Liderfeed[®] (Clove oil eugenol) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00278](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The following item was not discussed: SmokEz C-10 (Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring) ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)).

6. Next meeting

12-13 March 2015

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 65th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 13-14 January 2015**

(Agreed on 16 February 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Maria de Lurdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Robert Luttik, Derek Renshaw, Johannes Westendorf
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Paul Brantom and Patrick van Beelen have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni, Luca Bellomo
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 64th Working Group meeting held on 4 December 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 64th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 05 - Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - Secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohol for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 14 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01218](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 28 - Pyridine, pyrrole, and quinoline derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01171](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - Aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00816](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.6 The Working Group continued its discussion on Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.7 The following item was not discussed: SmokEz C-10 (Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring) ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)).

6. Next meeting

16 February 2015

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 64th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 4 December 2014
(Agreed on 13 January 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Christer Hogstrand, Secundino Lopez-Puente, Derek Renshaw, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson and Anne-Katrine Lundebye.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 63rd Working Group meeting held on 18 November 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 63rd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued its discussion on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 05 - Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued its discussion on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - Aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00816](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued its discussion on Chemically defined flavouring - Glycyrrhizic acid, ammoniated- for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01179](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued its discussion on Preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise (BIOSTRONG[®] 510) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 During the meeting, the Working Group was informed on the request of withdrawal of the application Grape seed extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-00759](#)).

6. Next meeting

13-14 January 2015

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 63rd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 18 November 2014
(Agreed on 4 December 2014)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Christer Hogstrand, Secundino Lopez-Puente, Derek Renshaw, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni, Luca Bellomo
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 62nd Working Group meeting held on 21-22 October 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 62nd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued its discussion on Chemically defined flavouring - Glycyrrhizic acid, ammoniated- for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01179](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The following items were not discussed: Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 05 - Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)); Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - Aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00816](#)) and Preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise (BIOSTRONG[®] 510) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)).

6. Next meeting

04 December 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 62nd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 21-22 October 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 18 November 2014)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Derek Renshaw, Christer Hogstrand
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Paul Brantom (2nd day), Secundino Lopez-Puente, Anne-Katrine Lundebye (2nd day), Johannes Westendorf have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni, Luca Bellomo
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson and Patrick Van Beelen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 61st Working Group meeting held on 11-12 September 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 61st Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 05 - Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 12 - Maltol derivatives and ketodioxane derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01033](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 14 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01218](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - Aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00816](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavouring - Glycyrrhizic acid, ammoniated- for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01179](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6 The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on SmokEz C-10 (Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.7 The Working Group discussed the application on Liderfeed[®] (Clove oil eugenol) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00278](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Next meeting

18 November 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 61st meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 11-12 September 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 21 October 2014)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Secundino Lopez-Puente, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf.
 - Paul Brantom and Derek Renshaw (2nd day) have participated via teleconference.
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini.
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Christer Hogstrand.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 60th Working Group meeting held on 14 July 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 60th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 05 - Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavouring - Glycyrrhizic acid, ammoniated - for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01179](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued its discussion on Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - Aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00816](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The Working Group continued its discussion of the application on Diarr-Stop S Plus (Na₂EDTA, *Castanea sativa* Mill, thyme oil, oregano oil) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00060](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6 The Working Group continued its discussion of the application on Liderfeed[®] (Clove oil eugenol) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00278](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.7 A preliminary discussion took place on the application on SmokEz C-10 (Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)).

6. Next meeting

21, 22 October 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 60th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 14 July 2014
(Agreed on 11 September 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Christer Hogstrand, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni.
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 59th Working Group meeting held on 27 June 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 59th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 30 - Tannic acid for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01513](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - Aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00816](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Liderfeed[®] (Clove oil eugenol) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00278](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on Diarr-Stop S Plus (Na₂EDTA, *Castanea sativa* Mill, thyme oil, oregano oil) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00060](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Next meeting

11, 12 September 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 59th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 27 June 2014
(Agreed on 14 July 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Derek Renshaw, Johannes Westendorf.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni.
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson, Christer Hogstrand, Patrick Van Beelen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 58th Working Group meeting held on 10-11 June 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 58th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 30 - Tannic acid for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01513](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - Aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00816](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Liderfeed[®] (Clove oil eugenol) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00278](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on Diarr-Stop S Plus (Na₂EDTA, *Castanea sativa* Mill, thyme oil, oregano oil) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00060](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

14 July 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 58th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 10-11 June 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 27 June 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Secundino Lopez-Puente, Derek Renshaw, Johannes Westendorf.
 - Paul Brantom and Patrick Van Beelen have participated via teleconference.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni.
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 57th Working Group meeting held on 12 May 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 57th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 - Geraniales, Myrtales, Poales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 08 - Secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - Aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00816](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued its discussion of the application on Diarr-Stop S Plus (Na₂EDTA, *Castanea sativa* Mill, thyme oil, oregano oil) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00060](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The Working Group continued its discussion of the application on Liderfeed[®] (Clove oil eugenol) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00278](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

27 June 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 57th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 12 May 2014
(Agreed on 10 June 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Christer Hogstrand, Johannes Westendorf.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni.
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 56th Working Group meeting held on 10-11 April 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 56th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 30 - Tannic acid for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01513](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on grape seed extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-00759](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The following items were not discussed: Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 05 - Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)).

6. Next meeting

10, 11 June 2014

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 56th Working Group meeting held on 10-11 April 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 56th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 30 - Tannic acid for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01513](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on grape seed extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-00759](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The following items were not discussed: Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 05 - Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)).

6. Next meeting

10, 11 June 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 56th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 10-11 April 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 12 May 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Derek Renshaw.
 - Paul Brantom and Johannes Westendorf have participated via teleconference.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Christer Hogstrand, Secundino Lopez-Puente.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 55th Working Group meeting held on 17 March 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 55th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued its discussion on the **Chemically defined** flavourings from Chemical Group 30 - Tannic acid for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01513](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on the Grape seed extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-00759](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Diarr-Stop S Plus (Na₂EDTA, *Castanea sativa* Mill, thyme oil, oregano oil) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00060](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued the discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - Aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-00816](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 A preliminary discussion took place on the application on the Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 07 - Geraniales, Myrtales and Poales ([EFSA-Q-2010-01282](#)).

6. Next meeting

12 May 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 55th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference on 17 March 2014
(Agreed on 10 April 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Johannes Westendorf.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 54st Working Group meeting held on 24-25 February 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 54st Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on the Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 30 - Tannic acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01513](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The following items were not discussed: Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 03 - α,β -unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing α , β -unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing α , β -unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01219](#)); Chemical Group 05 – Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)); Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 31 - Aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00816](#)); Na₂EDTA, *Castanea sativa* Mill, thyme oil, oregano oil (Diarr-Stop S Plus) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00060](#)).

6. Next meeting

10-11 April 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 54th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 24-25 February 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 17 March 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson (2nd day), Christer Hogstrand, Derek Renshaw (1st day) and Johannes Westendorf
 - Vasileios Bampidis (1st and 2nd day), Paul Brantom (2nd day) and Patrick Van Beelen (2nd day) have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Anne-Katrine Lundebye.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 53rd Working Group meeting held on 14 February 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 53rd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for fish ([EFSA-Q-2013-00782](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on Clove oil eugenol (Liderfeed[®]) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00278](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The following items were not discussed: Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 03 - α,β -unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing α, β -unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing α,β -unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01219](#)); Chemical Group 05 – Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)); Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 30 - Tannic acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01513](#)); Na₂EDTA, *Castanea sativa* Mill, thyme oil, oregano oil (Diarr-Stop S Plus) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00060](#)).

6. Next meeting

17 March 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 53rd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 14 February 2014
(Agreed on 24 February 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Roberto Molteni
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 52nd Working Group meeting held on 30-31 January 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 52nd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on Chemical Group 13 - Furanones and tetrahydrofurfuryl derivatives (5-ethyl-3-hydroxy-4-methyl-furan-2(5H)-one and 3-hydroxy-4,5-di-methyl-furan-2(5H)-one) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2012-00632](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on Chemically defined flavouring – Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides, Disodium 5'-guanylate (GMP), Disodium 5'-inosinate for all animal species and categories (IMP) ([EFSA-Q-2010-01285](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued the discussion on Clove oil eugenol (Liderfeed[®]) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00278](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The following items were not discussed: Chemical Group 05 – Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)); Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 03 - α,β -unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing α,β -unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing α,β -unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01219](#)); Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for fish ([EFSA-Q-2013-00782](#)); Grape seed extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-00759](#)).

6. Next meeting

24-25 February 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 52nd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 30-31 January 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 14 February 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye (1st day), Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
 - Andrew Chesson and Paul Brantom (2nd day) have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini and Roberto Molteni
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 51th Working Group meeting held on 10 January 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 51th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on Clove oil eugenol (Liderfeed[®]) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00278](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for fish ([EFSA-Q-2013-00782](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued the discussion on Sodium saccharin Piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The Working Group continued the discussion on Chemical Group 05 – Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6 The Working Group continued the discussion on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 03 - α , β -unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing α , β -unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing α , β -unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01219](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

7. Next meeting

14 February 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 51st meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 10 January 2014
(Agreed on 30 January 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Andrew Chesson, Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini and Roberto Molteni
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 50th Working Group meeting held on 29 November 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 50th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued its discussion on the draft opinion on the Chemically defined flavouring – Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides, Disodium 5'-guanylate (GMP), Disodium 5'-inosinate (IMP) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01285](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued its discussion on the Chemically defined flavouring – Tannic acid for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01513](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The following items were not discussed: Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)), Chemical Group 05 – Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)), Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for fish ([EFSA-Q-2013-00782](#)), Chemical Group 03 - α , β -unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing α , β -unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing α , β -unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01219](#)).

6. Any Other Business

7. Next meeting

30, 31 January 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 50th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 29 November 2013
(Agreed on 10 January 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Andrew Chesson, Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti and Roberto Molteni
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom, Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Paola Manini

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 49th Working Group meeting held on 7-8 November 2013, Parma.

The minutes of the 49th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemical Group 05 – Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01040](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on the application on Chemical Group 13 - Furanones and tetrahydrofurfuryl derivatives (5-ethyl-3-hydroxy-4-methyl-furan-2(5H)-one and 3-hydroxy-4,5-di-methyl-furan-2(5H)-one) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2012-00632](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavouring – Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides, Disodium 5'-guanylate (GMP), Disodium 5'-inosinate (IMP) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01285](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 A preliminary discussion took place on the application on Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for fish ([EFSA-Q-2013-00782](#)).
- 5.5 The following items were not discussed: Chemical Group 12 – Maltol for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01033](#)), Grape seed extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-00759](#)), Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01033](#)), Chemically defined flavouring – Tannic acid for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01513](#)), Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)).

6. Next meeting

10 January 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 49th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 7 - 8 November 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 29 November 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen
 - Andrew Chesson, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Johannes Westendorf have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini and Roberto Molteni
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 48th Working Group meeting held on 22 September 2013, tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 48th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemical Group 13 - Furanones and tetrahydrofurfuryl derivatives (5-ethyl-3-hydroxy-4-methyl-furan-2(5H)-one and 3-hydroxy-4,5-di-methyl-furan-2(5H)-one) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2012-00632](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 14 - Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01218](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavouring – Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides, Disodium 5'-guanylate (GMP), Disodium 5'-inosinate (IMP) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01285](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Chemically defined flavouring – Tannic acid for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01513](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.6 During the meeting, the Working Group considered the comments received from the Member States through the EFSA exchange platform for the following application(s): Chemically defined flavouring – Tannic acid for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01513](#)).
- 5.7 During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application has been received:
 - Grape seed extract for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-00759](#)) .
- 5.8 The following items were not discussed: Chemical Group 12 – Maltol for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01033](#)),

6. Next meeting

29 November 2013

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 48th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 22 October 2013
(Agreed on 07 November 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen and Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 47rd Working Group meeting held on 10, 11 October 2013, Parma.

The minutes of the 47th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 29 – Thiazoles, thiophene, thiazoline and thienyl derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2013-01569](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, on Chemically defined flavouring - Chemically defined flavouring – Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides, Disodium 5'-guanylate (GMP), Disodium 5'-inosinate (IMP) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01285-](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavouring - 30 - Tannic acid for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01513](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The following item was not discussed: Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#))

6. Next meeting

7, 8 November 2013

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 47th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 10 - 11 October 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 22 October 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Christer Hogstrand, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
 - Paul Brantom has participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Derek Renshaw.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 46th Working Group meeting held on 17, 18 September 2013, tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 46th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 10 - Secondary aliphatic saturated or unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with a second secondary or tertiary oxygenated functional group for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00874](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 13 - Furanones and tetrahydrofurfuryl derivatives (5-ethyl-3-hydroxy-4-methyl-furan-2(5H)-one and 3-hydroxy-4,5-di-methyl-furan-2(5H)-one) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2012-00632](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavouring – Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides, Disodium 5'-guanylate (GMP), Disodium 5'-inosinate (IMP) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01285](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The following items were not discussed: Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)), L-cysteine hydrochloride monohydrate for all pet animals ([EFSA-Q-2010-01284](#)), Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)), Glycyrrhizic acid ammoniated ([EFSA-Q-2010-01179](#))

6. Next meeting

22 October 2013

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 46th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 17 - 18 September 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 10 October 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Derek Renshaw, Johannes Westendorf
 - Paul Brantom and Vasileios Bampidis have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Patrick Van Beelen and Anne-Katrine Lundebye.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 45th Working Group meeting held on 06 September 2013, tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 45th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, on BIOSTRONG[®] 510: preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise for chickens and minor avian species for fattening and rearing to point of lay ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on the use of Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on L-cysteine hydrochloride monohydrate for all pet animals ([EFSA-Q-2010-01284](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.5 The following items were not discussed: Glycyrrhizic acid ammoniated ([EFSA-Q-2010-01179](#)) and Chemically defined flavouring – Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides, Disodium 5'-guanylate (GMP), Disodium 5'-inosinate (IMP) ([EFSA-Q-2010-01285](#)).

6. Next meeting

10, 11 October 2013

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 45th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Tele-web conference, 06 September 2013
(Agreed on 17 September 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Derek Renshaw, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom, Patrick Van Beelen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 44rd Working Group meeting held on 4 July 2013, Parma.

The minutes of the 44th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, on BIOSTRONG[®] 510: preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise for chickens and minor avian species for fattening and rearing to point of lay ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, on Chemically defined flavouring - Glycyrrhizic acid, ammoniated for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01179](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, on Na₂EDTA, castanea sativa mill, thyme oil, oregano oil (Diarr-Stop S Plus) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00060](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The following items were not discussed: L-cysteine hydrochloride monohydrate for all pet animals ([EFSA-Q-2010-01284](#)), Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)), Chemically defined flavouring – Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides, Disodium 5'-guanylate (GMP), Disodium 5'-inosinate (IMP) ([EFSA-Q-2010-01285](#)).

6. Next meeting

17, 18 September 2013, in Parma

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 44th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on Tele-web conference, 04 July 2013
(Agreed on 06 September 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 43rd Working Group meeting held on 20 - 21 June 2013, Parma.

The minutes of the 43rd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, on BIOSTRONG[®] 510: preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise for chickens and minor avian species for fattening and rearing to point of lay ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 29 - Thiazoles, thiophene, thiazoline and thienyl derivatives ([EFSA-Q-2010-01180](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The following items were not discussed: L-cysteine hydrochloride monohydrate for all pet animals ([EFSA-Q-2010-01284](#)), Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)), Chemically defined flavouring – Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides, Disodium 5'-guanylate (GMP), Disodium 5'-inosinate (IMP) ([EFSA-Q-2010-01285](#)), Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#))

6. Next meeting

06 September 2013

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 43rd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 20 - 21 June 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 04 July 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen (1st day), Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
 - Paul Brantom has participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 42nd Working Group meeting held on 28 May 2013, tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 42nd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavouring - 12 - Maltol derivatives and ketodioxane derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01033](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavouring - 13 - Furanones and tetrahydrofurfuryl derivatives: 5-ethyl-3-hydroxy-4-methyl-furan-2(5H)-one and 3-hydroxy-4,5-di-methyl-furan-2(5H)-one for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00632](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, on BIOSTRONG[®] 510: preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise for chickens and minor avian species for fattening and rearing to point of lay ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.5 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavouring - Glycyrrhizic acid, ammoniated for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01179](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6 The Working Group discussed the application on the use of Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.7 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavouring – Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides, Disodium 5'-guanylate (GMP), Disodium 5'-inosinate (IMP) ([EFSA-Q-2010-01285](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.8 The Working Group discussed the application on Na₂EDTA, castanea sativa mill, thyme oil, oregano oil (Diarr-Stop S Plus) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00060](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

04 July 2013

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 42nd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on Tele-web conference, 28 05 2013
(Agreed on 20 June 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 41st Working Group meeting held on 18 - 19 April 2013, Parma.

The minutes of the 41st Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, on BIOSTRONG[®] 510: preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise for chickens and minor avian species for fattening and rearing to point of lay ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 29 - Thiazoles, thiophene, thiazoline and thienyl derivatives ([EFSA-Q-2010-01180](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 24 - Pyrazine derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01032](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on the use of Sodium saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 A preliminary discussion took place on the application on Chemically defined flavouring – Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides, Disodium 5'-guanylate (GMP), Disodium 5'-inosinate (IMP) ([EFSA-Q-2010-01285](#)).
- 5.6 A preliminary discussion took place on the application on Na₂EDTA, castanea sativa mill, thyme oil, oregano oil (Diarr-Stop S Plus) ([EFSA-Q-2010-00060](#)).
- 5.7 The following item was not discussed: L-cysteine hydrochloride monohydrate for all pet animals ([EFSA-Q-2010-01284](#)).

6. Next meeting

20, 21 June 2013

FEED UNIT

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 41st meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 18 - 19 April 2013, Parma**

(Agreed on 28 May 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen (2nd day), Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 40th Working Group meeting held on 8 March 2013, tele-web conference.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 22 - Aryl-substituted primary alcohol/aldehyde/acid/ester/acetal derivatives, including unsaturated ones for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01042](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 24 – Pyrazine derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01032](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on Sodium saccharin for Piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing and calves for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2010-01228](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.5 The Working Group discussed the application on BIOSTRONG® 510 preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise for chickens and minor avian species for fattening and rearing to point of lay ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting is planned for the 28 May 2013, in tele-web conference.

FEED UNIT

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 40th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on VIDEO/WEB/TELE-conference, 08 March 2013
(Agreed on 18 April 2013)**

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 39th Working Group meeting held on 22 02 2013, Parma

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 01 - Straight-chain primary aliphatic alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00702](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 20 - Aliphatic and aromatic mono- and di- thiols and mono-, di-, tri-, and polysulfides with or without additional oxygenated functional groups for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-00998](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 24 - Pyrazine derivatives for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01032](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on L-cysteine hydrochloride monohydrate for all pet animals ([EFSA-Q-2010-01284](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.5 The Working Group discussed the application on BIOSTRONG[®] 510 (preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening and rearing to point of lay ([EFSA-Q-2011-01152](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6 The Working Group discussed the application on Liderfeed: Clove oil eugenol for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00278](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting is planned for the 18, 19 April 2013, in Parma

FEED UNIT

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 39th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on VIDEO/WEB/TELE-conference, 22 February 2013
(Agreed on 08 March 2013)**

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted changes

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 38th Working Group meeting held on 31 01 2013, Parma. The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 27 02 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 07 03 2013

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on Chemical Group 01 - Straight-chain primary aliphatic alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00702) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Na₂-EDTA, castanea sativa mill, thyme oil, oregano oil (Diarr-Stop S Plus) (EFSA-Q-2011-00060) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The following item/s was/were not discussed: EFSA-Q-2010-01284.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting is planned for the 08 March 2013, in audio - web

FEED UNIT

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 38th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Held on 31 January, 01 February 2013, Parma,
(Agreed on 27 February 2013)**

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf
 - Paul Brantom has participated via teleconference on the 2nd day
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 37th Working Group meeting held on 06 12 2012, WEB -conference.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 Chemical Group 01 - Straight-chain primary aliphatic alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00702) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 Chemical Group 20 – Aliphatic and aromatic mono- and di- thiols and mono-, di-, tri-, and polysulfides with or without additional oxygenated functional groups for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00998) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 Chemical Group 21 - Aromatic ketones, secondary alcohols and related esters (EFSA-Q-2010-01041) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 Chemical Group 28 - Pyridine, pyrrole, and quinoline derivatives (EFSA-Q-2010-01171) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.5 A preliminary discussion took place on the application on L-cysteine hydrochloride monohydrate for all pet animals (EFSA-Q-2010-01284).
- 5.6 A preliminary discussion took place on the application on Na₂-EDTA, castanea sativa mill, thyme oil, oregano oil (Diarr-Stop S Plus) (EFSA-Q-2011-00060).

6. Next meeting

The next meeting is planned for the 22 February 2013, in audio - web.

FEED UNIT

Parma, 06 March 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 37th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio-web conference, 06 December 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 31 January 2013)

Participants

WG Experts: Vasileios Bampidis, Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen, Derek Renshaw, Patrick Van Beelen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Johannes Westendorf

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group continued its discussion on
 - Chemical Group 01 - Straight-chain primary aliphatic alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters (EFSA-Q-2010-00702) and decided that further discussion is needed;
 - Chemical Group 20 – Aliphatic and aromatic mono- and di- thiols and mono-, di-, tri-, and polysulfides with or without additional oxygenated functional groups for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00998) and decided that further discussion is needed;
 - Chemical Group 21 - Aromatic ketones, secondary alcohols and related esters for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01041) and decided that further discussion is needed;

- Chemical Group 28 - Pyridine, pyrrole, and quinoline derivatives (EFSA-Q-2010-01171) for all animal species and categories and decided that further discussion is needed;
- Clove oil eugenol (Liderfeed®) for chickens for fattening (EFSA-Q-2011-00278) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification;

5. Next meeting date

The next meeting is planned for the 31th January and 01st February 2013, in Parma and audio - web.

FEED UNIT

Parma, 06 March 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 36th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 24, 25 October 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 06 December 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen

Audio-Web: Vasileios Bampidis, Paul Brantom (1st day) Patrick Van Beelen, Johannes Westendorf

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini (1st day)

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group continued its discussion on
 - Chemical Group 04 – Non-conjugated and accumulated unsaturated straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing unsaturated alcohols and acetals containing unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00988) and decided that further discussion is needed;
 - Chemical Group 20 – Aliphatic and aromatic mono- and di- thiols and mono-, di-, tri-, and polysulfides with or without additional oxygenated functional groups for all

animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00998) and decided that further discussion is needed;

- Chemical Group 21 - Aromatic ketones, secondary alcohols and related esters (EFSA-Q-2010-01041) and decided that further discussion is needed;
- Chemical Group 24 – Pyrazine derivatives for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01032) and decided that further discussion is needed;
- Chemical Group 28 - Pyridine, pyrrole, and quinoline derivatives (EFSA-Q-2010-01171) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date

The next meeting is planned for the 06 December 2012, in audio - web.

FEED UNIT

Parma, 05 December 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 35th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio web-conference, 11 October 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 24 October 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Christer Hogstrand, Johannes Westendorf

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group continued its discussion on
 - Chemical Group 04 – Non-conjugated and accumulated unsaturated straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing unsaturated alcohols and acetals containing unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00988) and decided that further discussion is needed;
 - Chemical Group 06 - Aliphatic, alicyclic and aromatic saturated and unsaturated tertiary alcohols and esters for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00873) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting;
 - Chemical Group 09 - Primary aliphatic saturated or unsaturated alcohols/aldehydes/acids/acetals/esters with a second primary, secondary or

tertiary oxygenated functional group including aliphatic lactones (EFSA-Q-2010-01177) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting;

- Chemical Group 16 - Aliphatic and alicyclic ethers for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00989) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting;
- Chemical Group 20 – Aliphatic and aromatic mono- and di- thiols and mono-, di-, tri-, and polysulfides with or without additional oxygenated functional groups for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00998) and decided that further discussion is needed;
- Chemical Group 24 – Pyrazine derivatives for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01032) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date

The next meeting is planned for the 24, 25 October 2012, in Parma and audio - web.

FEED UNIT

Parma, 05 December 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 34th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 18 - 19 September 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 11 October 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Christer Hogstrand (2nd day) and Johannes Westendorf

Audio-Web conference: (2nd day) Guido Rychen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group continued its discussion on
 - Chemical Group 04 – Non-conjugated and accumulated unsaturated straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing unsaturated alcohols and acetals containing unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00988) and decided that further discussion is needed;
 - Chemical Group 06 - Aliphatic, alicyclic and aromatic saturated and unsaturated tertiary alcohols and esters for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00873) and decided that further discussion is needed;

- Chemical Group 09 - Primary aliphatic saturated or unsaturated alcohols/aldehydes/acids/acetals/esters with a second primary, secondary or tertiary oxygenated functional group including aliphatic lactones (EFSA-Q-2010-01177) and decided that further discussion is needed;
- Chemical Group 16 - Aliphatic and alicyclic ethers for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00989) and decided that further discussion is needed;
- Chemically defined flavouring - Glycyrrhizic acid, ammoniated for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01179) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification;
- BIOSTRONG[®] 510 (Preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening and rearing to point of lay (EFSA-Q-2011-01152) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification

5. Next meeting date

The next meeting is planned for the 11 October 2012, in audio - web.

FEED UNIT

Parma, 05 December 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 33rd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio web-conference, 03 September 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 18 September 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Christer Hogstrand

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Johannes Westendorf.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group continued its discussion on
 - Chemical Group 01 - Straight-chain primary aliphatic alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters (EFSA-Q-2010-00702) and decided to present the draft documents, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting;
 - Chemical Group 02 - Branched-chain primary aliphatic alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetal and esters, for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00701) and decided to present the draft documents, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting

5. Next meeting date

The next meeting is planned for the 18 and 19 September 2012, in Parma.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 5 December 2012

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED
Minutes of the 32nd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Parma, 17- 18 July 2012

(Agreed by the WG on 03 September 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Joop de Knecht, Jürgen Gropp, Johannes Westendorf.

Audio-Web conference: (1st day) Christer Hogstrand
(2nd day) Christer Hogstrand

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Paul Brantom.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the draft opinions on:
 - Chemical Group 01 - Straight-chain primary aliphatic alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters (EFSA-Q-2010-00702) and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - Chemical Group 02 - Branched-chain primary aliphatic alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetal and esters, for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00701) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 03 September 2012, in Audio-Web.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 05 December 2012

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 31st meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 05 - 06 June 2012

(Agreed by the WG on 17 July 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Georges Bories, Andrew Chesson, Joop de Knecht, Jürgen Gropp, Christer Hogstrand and Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen.

Audio-Web conference: (1st day) Guido Rychen

(2nd day) Paul Brantom

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Johannes Westendorf.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the draft opinions on:
 - Chemical Group 02 - Branched-chain primary aliphatic alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetal and esters, for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00701) and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - Chemical Group 09 - Primary aliphatic saturated or unsaturated alcohols/aldehydes/acids/acetals/esters with a second primary, secondary or tertiary oxygenated functional group including aliphatic lactones, for all animal categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01177) and decided that further discussion is needed.

- Chemical group 23 - Benzyl alcohols/aldehydes/acids/esters/acetals for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00876) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- Clove oil eugenol for chickens for fattening (EFSA-Q-2011-00278) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- BIOSTRONG[®] 510 (Preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening and rearing to point of lay (EFSA-Q-2011-01152) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 17th and 18th July 2012, in Parma.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 26 July 2012

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED
Minutes of the 30th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Munich, 10 - 11 May 2012

(Agreed by the WG on 05 June 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Christer Hogstrand.

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Joop de Knecht and Johannes Westendorf.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the draft opinions on:
 - Chemical group 23 - Benzyl alcohols/aldehydes/acids/esters/acetals for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00876) and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - Tannic acid, for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010- 01513) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Clove oil eugenol for chickens for fattening (EFSA-Q-2011-00278) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 5th and 6th June 2012, in Parma.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 26 July 2012

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED
Minutes of the 29th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Brussels, 02 - 03 May 2012

(Agreed by the WG on 10 May 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Georges Bories, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Joop de Knecht, Christer Hogstrand.

Audio-Web conference: (2nd day) Paul Brantom, Anne-Katrine Lundebye-Haldorsen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apology was received by Johannes Westendorf.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the draft opinions on:
 - Chemical group 13 - Aliphatic, alicyclic and aromatic saturated and unsaturated tertiary alcohols and esters, for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01169) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - Scansmoke SEF 7525 smoke flavourings for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2010-01520) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 10th and 11th May 2012, in Munich.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 26 July 2012

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 28th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Brussels, 14 - 15 March 2012

(Agreed by the WG on 02 May 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Joop de Knecht and Johannes Westendorf.

Audio-Web conference: Christer Hogstrand and Guido Rychen (1st day)

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Anne-Katrine Lundebye-Haldorsen

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical group 13 - Aliphatic, alicyclic and aromatic saturated and unsaturated tertiary alcohols and esters, for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01169) and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - Chemical group 26 - Aromatic ethers including anisole derivatives, for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-0131) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

- Chemical group 33 - Aliphatic and aromatic amines, for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01045) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- BIOSTRONG[®] 510 (Preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening and rearing to point of lay (EFSA-Q-2011-01152) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 02nd and 03rd May 2012, in Brussels.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 26 July 2012

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED
Minutes of the 27th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Brussels, 07 - 08 February 2012

(Agreed by the WG on 14 March 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Georges Bories, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye-Haldorsen and Johannes Westendorf.

Audio-Web conference: Joop De Knecht (1st day)

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paul Brantom

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical group 11 - Alicyclic and aromatic lactones, for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01063) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - Chemical group 15 - Phenyl ethyl alcohols, phenylacetic acids, related esters, phenoxyacetic acids and related esters for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00875) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

- Chemical group 26 - Aromatic ethers including anisole derivatives, for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-0131) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- Scansmoke SEF 7525 smoke flavourings for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2010-01520) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 14th and 15th March 2012, in Brussels.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 26 July 2012

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED
Minutes of the 26th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Parma, 26 - 27 January 2012

(Agreed by the WG on 07 February 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Georges Bories, Andrew Chesson, Joop De Knecht, Jürgen Gropp.
Audio-Web conference: Paul Brantom (2nd day), Christer Hogstrand (1st day)

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical group 11 - Alicyclic and aromatic lactones, for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01063) and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - Chemical group 15 - Phenyl ethyl alcohols, phenylacetic acids, related esters, phenoxyacetic acids and related esters for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00875) and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - Chemical group 25 - Phenol derivatives containing ring-alkyl, ring-alkoxy and side-chains with an oxygenated functional group, for all animal species (EFSA-Q-

2009-00882) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

- Chemical group 26 - Aromatic ethers including anisole derivatives, for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-0131) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- BIOSTRONG® 510 (Preparation of essential oil of thyme and star anise) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening and rearing to point of lay (EFSA-Q-2011-01152) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 7th and 8th February 2012, in Brussels.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 26 July 2012

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED
Minutes of the 25th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Brussels, 23 - 25 November 2011

(Agreed by the WG on 27 January 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Georges Bories, Jürgen Gropp, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen, Johannes Westendorf.
EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini
Apologies: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson,

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical group 17 - Propenylhydroxybenzenes, for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01035) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - Chemical group 08 - Secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01181) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

- Chemical group 25 - Phenol derivatives containing ring-alkyl, ring-alkoxy and side-chains with an oxygenated functional group, for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2009-00882) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- Chemical group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01170) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 26th and 27th January 2012, in Parma.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 25 January 2012

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 24th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Brussels, 27 - 28 October 2011

(Agreed by the WG on 25 November 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson.
Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen by audio-web conference on the 2nd day.

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Jürgen Gropp

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for Piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs, pigs for fattening, bovines, calves for rearing up to 4 months and/or fattening up to 6 months, sheep, lambs for rearing up to 3 months, lambs for fattening up to 6 months or older, dairy sheep for milk production, fish, salmon and trout, dogs (EFSA-Q-2010-01229) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - Chemical group 03 - Alfa, beta-unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing alfa, beta-unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing alfa,

beta-unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01219) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

- Chemical Group 13 - Furanones and tetrahydrofurfuryl derivatives for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01169) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- Chemical Group 25 - Phenol derivatives containing ring-alkyl, ring-alkoxy and side-chains with an oxygenated functional group, for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2009-00882) and decided that further discussion is needed
- Chemical Group 29 - Thiazoles, thiophene, thiazoline and thienyl derivatives for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01180) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 23 and 25 November 2011, in Parma.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 25 January 2012

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 23rd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Brussels, 03 - 04 October 2011

(Agreed by the WG on 28 October 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen, Johannes Westendorf

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 18 - Allylhydroxybenzenes (EFSA-Q-2010-00815) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 27 - Anthranilate derivatives for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00990) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for Piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs, pigs for fattening, bovines, calves for rearing up to 4 months and/or fattening up to 6 months, sheep, lambs for rearing up to 3 months, lambs for fattening up to 6

months or older, dairy sheep for milk production, fish, salmon and trout, dogs (EFSA-Q-2010-01229) and decided that further discussion is needed.

- Chemical group 09 - Primary aliphatic saturated or unsaturated alcohols/aldehydes/acids/acetals/esters with a second primary, secondary or tertiary oxygenated functional group including aliphatic lactones for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01177) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 27 and 28 October 2011, in Brussels.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 20 October 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 22nd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 22, 23 September 2011

(Agreed by the WG on 04 October 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Georges Bories, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen, Johannes Westendorf

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Naringin for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01220) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 18 - Allylhydroxybenzenes (EFSA-Q-2010-00815) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 27 - Anthranilate derivatives for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00990) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

- Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 11 - Alicyclic and aromatic lactones for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01063) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 09 - Primary aliphatic saturated or unsaturated alcohols/aldehydes/acids/acetals/esters with a second primary, secondary or tertiary oxygenated functional group including aliphatic lactones for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01177) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 33 - Aliphatic and aromatic amines for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01045) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- Smoke flavouring (Scansmoke SEF 7525) for cats and dogs (EFSA-Q-2010-01520) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 03 and 04 October 2011, in Brussels.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 20 October 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED
Minutes of the 21st meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Brussels, 28 - 29 June 2011

(Agreed by the WG on 04 October 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau and Guido Rychen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Thaumatin for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01223) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 17 – Propenylhydroxybenzene – for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01035) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 18 – Allylhydroxybenzenes (EFSA-Q-2010-00815) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

- Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 27 – Anthranilate derivatives for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00990) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following question(s)/application(s) have been received:
 - EFSA-Q-2010-01513
 - EFSA-Q-2011-00060
 - EFSA-Q-2011-00278

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 22 and 23 September 2011, in Parma.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 14 September 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED
Minutes of the 20th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
London, 09 June 2011

(Agreed by the WG on 29 June 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Joaquim Brufau, Jürgen Gropp, Guido Rychen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemically Defined Flavourings from Chemical Group 25 - Phenol derivatives containing ring-alkyl, ring-alkoxy and side-chains with an oxygenated functional group, for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2009-00882)
 - Thaumatin for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01223)

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 28 and 29 June 2011, in Brussels.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 14 September 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED
Minutes of the 19th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Parma, 10 May 2011

(Agreed by the WG on 09 June 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp,
Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretto, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Guido Rychen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemically Defined Flavourings from Chemical Group 25 - Phenol derivatives containing ring-alkyl, ring-alkoxy and side-chains with an oxygenated functional group, for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2009-00882)

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 9 June 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 14 September 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 18th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio-web conference, 28 April 2011

(Agreed by the WG on 17 May 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Guido Rychen
EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Christer Hogstrand.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Sodium Saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing, and calves for fattening (EFSA-Q-2010-01228) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 10 May 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 14 September 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED
Minutes of the 17th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Audio-web conference, 11 April 2011
(Agreed by the WG on 05 May 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp
EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Sodium Saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing, and calves for fattening (EFSA-Q-2010-01228) and decided that further discussion is needed
- During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application has been received:
 - EFSA-Q-2010-01513

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 28 April 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 1 July 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 16th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio-web conference, 10 March 2011

(Agreed by the WG on 18 April 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Christer Hogstrand, Guido Rychen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - FRESTA[®] F (EFSA-Q-2009-00939) for weaned piglets and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
 - Sodium Saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing, and calves for fattening (EFSA-Q-2010-01228) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 11 April 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 1 July 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 15th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio-web conference, 18 February 2011

(Agreed by the WG on 10 March 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp

EC: Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes. Apologies were received from Guido Rychen.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Disodium guanosine 5'-monophosphate (GMP) for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01285) and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - Sodium Saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing, and calves for fattening (EFSA-Q-2010-01228) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 10 March 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 1 July 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 14th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio-web conference, 28 January 2011

(Agreed by the WG on 18 February 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes. Apologies were received from Joaquim Brufau, Gérard Pascal and Guido Rychen.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical group 3 – α , β -Unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing α , β -unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing α , β -unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01219) and decided to inform the applicant of issues that required clarification.
 - Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing, lambs for rearing, salmon and trout, dogs (EFSA-Q-2010- 01229) and decided to inform the applicant of issues that required clarification.
 - Disodium guanosine 5'-monophosphate (GMP) for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-01285) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 18 February 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 1 July 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio-web conference, 21 January 2011

(Agreed by the WG on 28 January 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Guido Rychen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Gérard Pascal.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical group 34 – Amino acids for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01170) and decided to inform the applicant of issues that required clarification.
 - Naringin for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01220) and decided to inform the applicant of issues that required clarification.
 - Sodium Saccharin for piglets (suckling and weaned), pigs for fattening, calves for rearing, and calves for fattening (EFSA-Q-2010-01228) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 28 January 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 1 July 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED
Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Parma, 09 December 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 28 January 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini, Claudia Roncancio-Peña

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the principles of the assessment of feed flavourings dossiers taken into account the view of applicants.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 28 January 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 1 July 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio-web conference, 02 - 03 December 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 28 January 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Gérard Pascal,
Guido Rychen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Joaquim Brufau.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI and SDoI (as well as the ones declared at the beginning of the meeting), please refer to the Annex.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical group 34 – Amino acids for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01170) and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - Chemical group 13 – Furanones and tetrahydro-furfuryl derivatives for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01169) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical group 28 – Pyridine, pyrrole, and quinoline derivate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01171) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical group 29 – Thiazoles, thiophene, thiazoline and thienyl derivatives for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010- 01180) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

- Chemical group 08 – Secondary alicyclic saturated and unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with ketals containing alicyclic alcohols or ketones and esters containing secondary alicyclic alcohols. Esters may contain aliphatic acyclic or alicyclic acid component for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01181) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- Chemical group 09 – Primary aliphatic saturated or unsaturated alcohols/aldehydes/acids/acetals/esters with a second primary, secondary or tertiary oxygenated functional group including aliphatic lactones for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01177) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- Chemical group 14 – Furfuryl and furan derivatives with and without additional side-chain substituents and heteroatoms for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01218) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- FRESTA[®]F (carvone minimum 0.35%) for weaned piglets (EFSA-Q-2009-00939) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- Request for an opinion on the safety and efficacy of the use of Thaumatin for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01223) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meeting is planned for the 09 December 2010.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 1 July 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio-web conference, 15 November 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 02 December 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Guido Rychen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. For further details on the outcome of the declaration of interests at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical group 34 – Amino acids for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01170) and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - Glycyrrhizic acid ammoniated for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01179) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meeting is planned for the 02 - 03 December 2010.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 1 July 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio-web conference, 11 - 12 November 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 15 November 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye-Haldorsen, Gérard Pascal, Guido Rychen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. For further details on the outcome of the declaration of interests at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - FRESTA[®] F for weaned piglets (EFSA-Q-2009-00939) and decided that further discussion is needed.
 - Chemical group 33 – Aliphatic and aromatic amines for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01045) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical group 11 – Alicyclic and aromatic lactones for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01063) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meeting is planned for the 15 November 2010.

Annex

INTERESTS AND ACTIONS RESULTING FROM THE SCREENING OF ADOI

With regard to this meeting **Dr. Brufau** declared that the institute where he works performed some research activities related to the product FRESTA[®] F (EFSA-Q-2009-00939). In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest. Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert incurs in the limitations identified under point C.III.b¹ that is he may address orally or in writing questions raised during the evaluation of products, but cannot draft opinions or parts of them.

¹ Implementing act to the policy on declaration of interests procedure for identifying and handling potential conflicts of interest.
<<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/doiconflicts.pdf> >

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 1 July 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio-web conference, 20 September 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 11 November 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Guido Rychen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical group 17 – Propenylhydroxybenzenes for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01035) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical group 05 – Saturated and unsaturated aliphatic secondary alcohols, ketones and esters with esters containing secondary alcohols. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or ketal for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01040) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical group 21 – Aromatic ketones, secondary alcohols and related esters for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01041) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

- Chemical group 22 – Aryl-substituted primary alcohol/aldehyde/acid/ester/acetal derivatives, including unsaturated ones for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01042) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meeting is planned for the 11 and 12 November 2010.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 1 July 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 09 - 10 September 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 20 September 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen, Christer Hogstrand, Gérard Pascal

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical group 04 – Non-conjugated and accumulated unsaturated straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing unsaturated alcohols and acetals containing unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes. No aromatic or heteroaromatic moiety as a component of an ester or acetal for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00988) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical group 16 – Aliphatic and alicyclic ethers for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00989) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical group 20 – Aliphatic and aromatic mono- and di- thiols and mono-, di-, tri-, and polysulfides with or without additional oxygenated functional groups for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00998) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

- Chemical group 27 – Anthranilate derivatives for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00990) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- Chemical group 24 – Pyrazine derivatives for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01032) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- Chemical group 26 – Aromatic ethers including anisole derivatives for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01031) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- Chemical group 12 – Maltol derivatives and ketodioxane derivatives for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01033) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meeting is planned for the 20 September 2010.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 1 July 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

**Minutes of the 6th audio-web meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings
Parma, 02 September 2010**

(Agreed by the WG on 20 September 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Christer Hogstrand, Guido Rychen

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - FRESTA[®] F for weaned piglets (EFSA-Q-2009-00939) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meeting is planned for the 9 and 10 September 2010.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 18 November 2010

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio-web conference, 29 July 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 10 September 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp

Apologies:

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical Group 18: Allylhydroxybenzenes (EFSA-Q-2010-00815) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meetings are planned for the 02 and 09 - 10 September 2010.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 18 November 2010

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Audio-web conference, 27 July 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 10 September 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Gérard Pascal, Jürgen Gropp

Apologies:

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical Group 31: Aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons (EFSA-Q-2010-00816) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical Group 06: Aliphatic, alicyclic and aromatic saturated and unsaturated tertiary alcohols and esters (EFSA-Q-2010-00873) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical Group 10: Secondary aliphatic saturated or unsaturated alcohols/ketones/ketals/esters with a second secondary or tertiary oxygenated functional group (EFSA-Q-2010-00874) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meetings are planned for the 02 and 09 - 10 September 2010.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 18 November 2010

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 14 July 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 10 September 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen

Apologies:

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical Group 15: Phenyl ethyl alcohols (EFSA-Q-2010-00875) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical Group 23: Benzyl alcohols/aldehydes (EFSA-Q-2010-00876) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meetings are planned for the 02 and 09 - 10 September 2010.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 18 November 2010

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Brussels, 24 June 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 29 July 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Jürgen Gropp, Gérard Pascal, Guido Rychen, Christer Hogstrand.

Apologies:

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Claudia Roncancio-Peña.

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI and SDoI, please refer to the Annex.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - FRESTA[®] F (EFSA-Q-2009-00939) for weaned piglets and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical Group 01 - Straight-chain primary aliphatic alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing saturated alcohols and acetals containing saturated aldehydes for all animal species and categories (EFSA-Q-2010-00702) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical Group 02 - Branched-chain primary aliphatic alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetal and esters (EFSA-Q-2010-00701) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following applications have been received:

- EFSA-Q-2010-00815, EFSA-Q-2010-00816, EFSA-Q-2010-00873, EFSA-Q-2010-00874, EFSA-Q-2010-00875, EFSA-Q-2010-00876.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meetings are planned for the 14, 27 and 29 July 2010 in Parma and in audio-web.

Annex

INTERESTS AND ACTIONS RESULTING FROM THE SCREENING OF ADOI

In the **SDoI Dr. Brufau** declared that the institute where he works performed some research activities related to the product FRESTA[®] F (EFSA-Q-2009-00939). In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of interest. Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert incurs in the limitations identified under point C.III.b¹ that is he may address orally or in writing questions raised during the evaluation of products, but cannot draft opinions or parts of them.

¹ Implementing act to the policy on declaration of interests procedure for identifying and handling potential conflicts of interest. http://www.efsa.europa.eu/cs/BlobServer/General/mb_annex_procedure_doi_en%20221008,0.pdf?ssbinary=true

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 28 June 2010

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Munich, 14 April 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 24 June 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Jürgen Gropp, Gerard Pascal, Guido Rychen.

Apologies: Christer Hogstrand

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI and SDoI, please refer to the Annex.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - Chemical Group 25-Phenol derivatives containing ring-alkyl, ring-alkoxy and side-chains with an oxygenated functional group for all species (EFSA-Q-2009-00882) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meeting is planned for the 24th June 2010 in Brussels.

Annex

INTERESTS AND ACTIONS RESULTING FROM THE SCREENING OF ADOI

In the **SDoI Dr. Brufau** declared that the institute where he works performed some research activities related to the product FRESTA[®] F (EFSA-Q-2009-00939). In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of interest. Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert incurs in the limitations identified under point C.III.b¹ that is he may address orally or in writing questions raised during the evaluation of products, but cannot draft opinions or parts of them.

¹ Implementing act to the policy on declaration of interests procedure for identifying and handling potential conflicts of interest. http://www.efsa.europa.eu/cs/BlobServer/General/mb_annex_procedure_doi_en%20221008,0.pdf?ssbinary=true

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 08 April 2010

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Parma, 01 - 02 March 2010

(Adopted by the WG on 14 April 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Christer Hogstrand, Jürgen Gropp, Guido Rychen.

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretto

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI and SDoI, please refer to the Annex.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the applications on:
 - FRESTA[®] F (EFSA-Q-2009-00939) for weaned piglets and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
 - Chemical Group 25-Phenol derivatives containing ring-alkyl, ring-alkoxy and side-chains with an oxygenated functional group for all species (EFSA-Q-2009-00882) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meeting is planned for the 14th April 2010 in Munich.

Annex

INTERESTS AND ACTIONS RESULTING FROM THE SCREENING OF ADOI

In the **SDoI Dr. Brufau** declared that the institute where he works performed some research activities related to the product FRESTA[®] F (EFSA-Q-2009-00939). In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of interest. Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert incurs in the limitations identified under point C.III.b¹ that is he may address orally or in writing questions raised during the evaluation of products, but cannot draft opinions or parts of them.

¹ Implementing act to the policy on declaration of interests procedure for identifying and handling potential conflicts of interest. http://www.efsa.europa.eu/cs/BlobServer/General/mb_annex_procedure_doi_en%20221008,0.pdf?ssbinary=true
