

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 83rd meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 24-25 October 2018

(Agreed on 25 October 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye¹ and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ First day.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. Additionally, no interests were declared at the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on CAROPHYLL® Stay-Pink (astaxanthin dimethyldisuccinate) for fish and crustaceans ([EFSA-Q-2017-00499](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The following items were not discussed: Red carotenoid rich *Paracoccus carotinifaciens* (Panaferd-AX) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2017-00694](#)) and astaxanthin-rich *Phaffia Rhodozyma* (ATCC SD 5340) (AQUASTA) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2015-00754](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

6. Next meeting

Not Applicable.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/policyonindependence>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 82nd meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 25 May 2018

(Agreed on 25 May 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Lucio Guido Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on ethyl ester of beta-apo-8'-carotenoic acid for poultry for fattening and poultry for laying ([EFSA-Q-2018-00267](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on astaxanthin-rich *Phaffia Rhodozyma* (ATCC SD 5340) (AQUASTA) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2015-00754](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

6. Next meeting

8 June 2018

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 81st meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 7-8 May 2018

(Agreed on 8 May 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina,¹ Georges Bories, Jürgen Gropp, and Derek Renshaw.²

- **Hearing Experts:³**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ First day.

² Second day.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on capsanthin for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2010-01525](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on indigo carmine for cats, dogs and ornamental fish ([EFSA-Q-2017-00502](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.3. The following item was not discussed: lutein for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

6. Next meeting

25 May 2018

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 80th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 6 April 2018

(Agreed on 6 April 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Lucio Guido Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on lutein for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on CAROPHYLL® Stay-Pink (astaxanthin dimethyldisuccinate) for fish and crustaceans ([EFSA-Q-2017-00499](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.3. The following application was not discussed: capsanthin for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2010-01525](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

6. Next meeting

25 April 2018

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 79th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 19 March 2018

(Agreed on 19 March 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Georges Bories, Jürgen Gropp and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on lutein for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on capsanthin for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2010-01525](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

6. Next meeting

6 April 2018

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 78th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

31 January – 2 February 2018, Parma

(Agreed on 2 February 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Lucio Guido Costa, Jürgen Gropp,¹ Anne-Katrine Lundebye² and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:³**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Attended via tele-web conference.

² First day afternoon and second day.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on lutein for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on capsanthin for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2010-01525](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on CAROPHYLL® Stay-Pink (astaxanthin dimethyldisuccinate) for fish and crustaceans ([EFSA-Q-2017-00499](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.4. The following item was not discussed: Red carotenoid rich *Paracoccus carotinifaciens* (Panaferd-AX) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2017-00694](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

6. Next meeting

19 March 2018

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 77th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 15-16 November 2017

(Agreed on 16 November 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye¹ and Derek Renshaw.²

- **Hearing Experts:**³

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Second day.

² First day.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on lutein for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The following item was not discussed: CAROPHYLL[®] Stay-Pink (astaxanthin dimethyldisuccinate) for fish and crustaceans ([EFSA-Q-2017-00499](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 76th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 23 October 2017

(Agreed on 23 October 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Lucio Guido Costa, Jürgen Gropp, and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes. Apologies were received from Anne-Katrine Lundebye.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on ponceau 4R for dogs, cats and ornamental fish ([EFSA-Q-2012-00331](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion at the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on lutein for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The following item was not discussed: CAROPHYLL[®] Stay-Pink (astaxanthin dimethyldisuccinate) for fish and crustaceans ([EFSA-Q-2017-00499](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

15-16 November 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 75th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Held on 20-22 September 2017, Parma

(Agreed on 22 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Georges Bories,¹ Lucio Guido Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Gabriele Aquilina.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Participated on the second day via tele-web conference.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on ponceau 4R for dogs, cats and ornamental fish ([EFSA-Q-2012-00331](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on lutein for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The following item was not discussed: Indigo carmine for cats, dogs and ornamental fish ([EFSA-Q-2017-00502](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

23 October 2017

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 74th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 7 September 2017

(Agreed on 7 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on ponceau 4R for dogs, cats and ornamental fish ([EFSA-Q-2012-00331](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on lutein for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

20-22 September 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 73rd meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 6 April 2017

(Agreed on 6 April 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Lucio Guido Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on titanium dioxide (anatase and rutile structure) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01522](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The following item was not discussed: ponceau 4R for dogs, cats and ornamental fish ([EFSA-Q-2012-00331](#))

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

12-13 June 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 72nd meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 20 March 2017

(Agreed on 20 March 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Lucio Guido Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on annatto F (norbixin potassium) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2010-01521](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Titanium dioxide (anatase and rutile structure) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01522](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

6 April 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 71st meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 24 February 2017

(Agreed on 24 February 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on annatto F (norbixin potassium) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2010-01521](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion to the plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

20 March 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 70th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 23 January 2017

(Agreed on 23 January 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Lucio Costa, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Jürgen Gropp.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on annatto F (norbixin potassium) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2010-01521](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on astaxanthin-rich *Phaffia Rhodozyma* (ATCC SD 5340) (AQUASTA) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2015-00754](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

24 February 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 69th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 13 December 2016

(Agreed on 13 December 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on ponceau 4R for dogs, cats and ornamental fish ([EFSA-Q-2012-00331](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.2. A preliminary discussion took place on the application on astaxanthin-rich *Phaffia Rhodozyma* (ATCC SD 5340) (AQUASTA) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2015-00754](#)).
- 4.3. The following item was not discussed: annatto F (norbixin potassium) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2010-01521](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

23 January 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 68th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 12-13 October 2016

(Agreed on 13 October 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on annatto F (norbixin potassium) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2010-01521](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on ponceau 4R for dogs, cats and ornamental fish ([EFSA-Q-2012-00331](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on titanium dioxide (anatase and rutile structure) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01522](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.4. A preliminary discussion took place on the application on astaxanthin-rich *Phaffia Rhodozyma* (ATCC SD 5340) (AQUASTA) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2015-00754](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

13 December 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 67th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 2 September 2016

(Agreed on 2 September 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Georges Bories.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on annatto F (norbixin potassium) for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2010-01521](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Ponceau 4R for dogs, cats and ornamental fish ([EFSA-Q-2012-00331](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The following item was not discussed: titanium dioxide (anatase and rutile structure) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01522](#))

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

11-13 October 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 66th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 23 June 2016

(Agreed on 23 June 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Jürgen Gropp and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori, Manuela Tiramani and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa and Anne-Katrine Lundebye.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Titanium dioxide (anatase and rutile structure) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01522](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

2 September 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 65th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 6 June 2016

(Agreed on 6 June 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Jürgen Gropp and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 64th Working Group meeting held on 12 May 2016, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 64th Working Group meeting held on 12 May 2016 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Titanium dioxide (anatase and rutile structure) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01522](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

20 June 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapcolouringagents20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 64th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 12 May 2016

(Agreed on 6 June 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Anne-Katrine Lundebye.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 63rd Working Group meeting held on 13-15 April 2016, Parma.

The minutes of the 63rd Working Group meeting held on 13-15 April 2016 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on tartrazine for dogs and cats, ornamental fish, grain-eating ornamental birds, small rodents ([EFSA-Q-2012-00661](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on citranaxanthin (Lucantin CX[®] forte) for laying hens ([EFSA-Q-2015-00767](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

6 June 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapcolouringagents20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 63rd meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Held on 13-15 April 2016, Parma

(Agreed on 12 May 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, ¹ Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye² and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:**³

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ First and second day. Third day participated via tele-web conference.

² First and second day. Third day participated via tele-web conference.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 62nd Working Group meeting held on 1 April 2016, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 62nd Working Group meeting held on 1 April 2016 were agreed.⁶

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Iron oxide yellow for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01274](#)); Iron oxide black for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01291](#)); Iron oxide red for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01292](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Bixin (norbixin potassium) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01521](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Titanium dioxide (anatase and rutile structure) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01522](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application Tartrazine for dogs and cats, ornamental fish, grain-eating ornamental birds, small rodents ([EFSA-Q-2012-00661](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5. The following item was not discussed: Citranaxanthin (Lucantin CX[®] forte) for laying hens ([EFSA-Q-2015-00767](#)).

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapcolouringagents20152018.pdf>

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

12 May 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 62nd meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference 1 April 2016

(Agreed on 13 April 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 61st Working Group meeting held on 2-4 March 2016, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 61st Working Group meeting held on 2-4 March 2016 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application Titanium dioxide (anatase and rutile structure) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01522](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

13-15 April 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapcolouringagents20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 61st meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Held on 2-4 March 2016, Parma

(Agreed on 1 April 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye¹ and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:**²

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ First and second day.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 60th Working Group meeting held on 1 February 2016, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 60th Working Group meeting held on 1 February 2016 were agreed.⁵

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application Lutein for poultry, crustaceans, fish/tilapias, cats and dogs, ornamental fish and birds ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application Bixin (norbixin potassium) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01521](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The following item was not discussed: Iron oxide yellow for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01274](#)); Iron oxide black for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01291](#)); Iron oxide red for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01292](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

1 April 2016

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapcolouringagents20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 60th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 1 February 2016

(Agreed on 2 March 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Georges Bories, Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 59th Working Group meeting held on 13-15 January 2016, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 59th Working Group meeting held on 13-15 January 2016, Parma were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application Lutein for poultry, crustaceans, fish/tilapias, cats and dogs, ornamental fish and birds ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application Iron oxide yellow for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01274](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application Iron oxide black for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01291](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application Iron oxide red for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01292](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5. The following item was not discussed: Bixin (norbixin potassium) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01521](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

2-4 March 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/feedapcolouringagents20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 59th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Held on 13-15 January 2016, Parma

(Agreed on 1 February 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Jürgen Gropp, Derek Renshaw and Georges Bories. Anne-Katrine Lundebye has participated via teleconference.¹

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Third day afternoon.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 58th Working Group meeting held on 11 December 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 58th Working Group meeting held on 11 December 2015 were agreed.⁵

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Ethyl ester of beta-apo-8'-carotenoic acid for poultry for fattening, poultry for laying ([EFSA-Q-2010-01300](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The following items were not discussed: Lutein for poultry, crustaceans, fish/tilapias, cats and dogs, ornamental fish and birds ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)), Iron oxide yellow for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01274](#)), Iron oxide black for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01291](#)), Iron oxide red for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01292](#)), Bixin (norbixin potassium) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01521](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

1 February 2016

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/assets/feedapcolouringagents.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 58th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents

Tele-web conference, 11 December 2015

(Agreed on 13 January 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Jürgen Gropp and Georges Bories.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa, Anne-Katrine Lundebye and Derek Renshaw.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 57th Working Group meeting held on 25-27 November 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 57th Working Group meeting held on 25-27 November 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Ethyl ester of beta-apo-8'-carotenoic acid for poultry for fattening, poultry for laying ([EFSA-Q-2010-01300](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The following item was not discussed: Lutein for poultry, crustaceans, fish/tilapias, cats and dogs, ornamental fish and birds ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

13-15 January 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/assets/feedapcolouringagents.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 57th meeting of the Working Group on Colouring Agents¹

Held on 25-27 November 2015, Parma

(Agreed on 11 December 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye,² Georges Bories³ and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:⁴**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Maria Vittoria Vettori and Orsolya Holczknecht.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Please refer to the Closed Working Group section for previous Working Group meeting minutes.

² First day. Second day has participated via teleconference.

³ First day and second day afternoon has participated via teleconference.

⁴ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁶ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 56th Working Group meeting held on 30 September – 2 October 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 56th Working Group meeting held on 30 September – 2 October 2015 were agreed.⁷

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Copper complexes of chlorophylls for ornamental fish, grain-eating ornamental birds and small rodents and copper complexes of chlorophyllins for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01524](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Ethyl ester of beta-apo-8'-carotenoic acid for poultry for fattening, poultry for laying ([EFSA-Q-2010-01300](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Iron oxide yellow for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01274](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Iron oxide black for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01291](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Iron oxide red for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01292](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/assets/feedapcolouringagents.pdf>

5.6. The following item was not discussed: Lutein for poultry, crustaceans, fish/tilapias, cats and dogs, ornamental fish and birds ([EFSA-Q-2012-00535](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

11 December 2015