

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 88th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Held on 15-16 September 2015, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 22 October 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp, John Wallace.

Lubomir Leng has participated via teleconference.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick and Giovanna Martelli.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

The agenda was adopted with changes: the agenda item related to the application on L-Glutamine for horses (non food-producing) and dogs (EFSA-Q-2014-00635) was deleted because the applicant decided to withdraw the application.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 87th Working Group meeting held on 9-10 July 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 87th Working Group meeting held on 9-10 July 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Guanidinoacetic acid for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for breeding and pigs ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The following items were not discussed: Zinc chelate of methionine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00188](#)), L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00251](#)), L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00252](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

October 22-23

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwgs/docs/Feedapaminoacids.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 87th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

**Held on 9-10 July 2015, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 15 September 2015)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Jürgen Gropp and John Wallace

Paul Brantom, Lucio Costa, Lubomir Leng and Giovanna Martelli have participated via teleconference

Noël Dierick has participated via teleconference, in agenda point 5.1

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Noël Dierick did not participate in agenda point 5.2 due to a Conflict of Interest being identified for this agenda item.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

The agenda was adopted with changes: The item on Zinc chelate of methionine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2015-00188) was deleted because the dossier had been recently validated and there had been no time to prepare the discussion.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 86th Working Group meeting held on 29 June 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 86th Working Group meeting held on 29 June 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00296](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/EFSA-Q-2014-00296)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/EFSA-Q-2012-00273)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

15-16 September 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwgs/docs/Feedapaminoacids.pdf>

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Prof. Noël Dierick declared the following interest: His name appears as co-responsible and coordinator of one efficacy trial (Annex IV 45) of the application of guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2012-00273). He pointed out that he was not directly or indirectly involved in the trial but that his name was included in the report by the study director as a kind of academic courtesy. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director Declarations of Interest,⁶ and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest.

This results in the exclusion of the expert from any discussion, voting or other processing of item guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2012-00273) by the concerned scientific group.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 86th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Tele-web conference, 29 June 2015

(Agreed on 9 July 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa and Noël Dierick.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 85th Working Group meeting held on 18-19 June 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 85th Working Group meeting held on 18-19 June 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

9-10 July 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/feedapwgs/docs/Feedapaminoacids.pdf>

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 85th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 18-19 June 2015, Parma**

(Agreed on 29 June 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Lucio Costa, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli¹ and John Wallace.
 - Paul Brantom and Jürgen Gropp have participated via teleconference.
 - Noël Dierick has participated via teleconference in agenda points 5.1 and 5.2.
- **Hearing Experts:²**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Noël Dierick did not participate in agenda point 5.3

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

¹ Giovanna Martelli attended only the first afternoon.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interests made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 84th Working Group meeting held on 9 June 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 84th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on L-threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00252](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on Guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

29 June 2015

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declarations of Interests (ODoI) done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting, Prof. Noël Dierick declared the following interest: His name appears as co-responsible/coordinator of one efficacy trial (Annex IV 45) of the application of guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2012-00273). He pointed out that he was not directly or indirectly involved in the trial but that his name was included in the report by the study director as a kind of academic courtesy. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁶ and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a potential conflict of Interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when that item (Guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species, EFSA-Q-2012-00273) is discussed, voted on or in anyway processed by that concerned scientific group.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 84th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 9 June 2015

(Agreed on 18-19 June 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa and Jürgen Gropp

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 83rd Working Group meeting held on 29 May 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 83rd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00946](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Lysine sulphate and L-lysine HCl for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00996](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00251](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The following item/s was/were not discussed: L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00252](#)).

6. Next meeting

18-19 June 2015

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 83rd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 29 May 2015,**

(Agreed on 9 June 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace.
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarres-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 82nd Working Group meeting held on 11-13 May 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 82nd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00113](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Lysine sulphate and L-lysine HCl for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00996](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The following items were not discussed: L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00251](#)), L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00252](#)), L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00946](#)).

6. Next meeting

9 June 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 82nd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 11 - 13 May 2015, Parma

(Agreed on 29 May 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom,¹ Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli² and John Wallace.
- **Hearing Experts:³**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarres-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Paul Brantom attended the 11 May p.m. by teleconference.

² Giovanna Martelli attended the 12 May full day and the 13 May a.m.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 81st Working Group meeting held on 27 April 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 81st Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00003](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Lysine sulphate and L-lysine HCl for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00996](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The following items were not discussed: L-Arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00296](#)), L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00113](#)), L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00946](#)), L-Lysine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)).

6. Next meeting

29 May 2015

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 81st meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 27 April 2015**

(Agreed on 11 May 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng and Giovanna Martelli
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from John Wallace.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 80th Working Group meeting held on 20 April 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 80th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00003](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on L-arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00296](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

11-13 May 2015

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 80th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 20 April 2015**

(Agreed on 27 April 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa and Jürgen Gropp.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 79th Working Group meeting held on 13 April 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 79th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

6. Next meeting

27 April 2015

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 79th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 13 April 2015**

(Agreed on 20 April 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom,¹ Lucio Costa, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:²**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Noël Dierick and Jürgen Gropp.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Paul Brantom participated from 15:00 to 16:00 h.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 78th Working Group meeting held on 10 April 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 78th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

20 April 2015

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 78th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 10 April 2015**

(Agreed on 13 April 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom and Jürgen Gropp.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 77th Working Group meeting held on 20 March 2015, in Parma.

The minutes of the 77th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 22 April 2015 and published on the EFSA website 04 May 2015.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00299](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00113](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

13 April 2015

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 77th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 20 March 2015**

(Agreed on 22 April 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom and Lucio Costa.

Noël Dierick did not participate in point 6: any other business

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interests made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 76th Working Group meeting held on 12-13 March 2015, in Parma.

The minutes of the 76th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00946](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The following item was not discussed: L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00113](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Clarifications to the applicant on Guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#))

7. Next meeting

10 April 2015

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declarations of Interests (ODoI) done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Prof. Noël Dierick declared the following interest: His name appears as co-responsible/coordinator of one efficacy trial (Annex IV 45) of the application of guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2012-00273). He pointed out that he was not directly or indirectly involved in the trial but that his name was included in the report by the study director as a kind of academic courtesy. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a potential conflict of Interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when that item (Guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species, EFSA-Q-2012-00273) is discussed, voted on or in anyway processed by that concerned scientific group.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 76th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 12-13 March 2015, Parma

(Agreed on 20 March 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Lucio Costa, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace;
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick¹ and Jürgen Gropp have participated via teleconference.
- **Hearing Experts:²**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with one change: under any other business, clarifications to the applicant of guanidinoacetic acid was added. Noël Dierick did not participate in that discussion.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interests made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

¹ Noël Dierick did not participate in the discussion of point 6.1.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 75th Working Group meeting held on 23 February 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 75th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00996](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00946](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

- 6.1 Clarifications requested by the applicant on Guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species were discussed ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)).

7. Next meeting

20 March 2015

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declarations of Interests (ODOI) done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Prof. Noël Dierick declared the following interest: His name appears as co-responsible/coordinator of one efficacy trial (Annex IV 45) of the application of guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2012-00273). He pointed out that he was not directly or indirectly involved in the trial but that his name was included in the report by the study director as a kind of academic courtesy. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁶ and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a potential conflict of Interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when that item (Guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species, EFSA-Q-2012-00273) is discussed, voted on or in anyway processed by that concerned scientific group.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 75th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 23 February 2015**

(Agreed on 12 March 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng and Giovanna Martelli.
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from John Wallace.

Noël Dierick did not participate in agenda point 5.2

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interests made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 74th Working Group meeting held on 9 February 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 74th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on guanidinoacetic acid (CreAMINO) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00946](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Next meeting

12-13 March 2015

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declarations of Interests (ODoI) done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Prof. Noël Dierick declared the following interest: His name appears as co-responsible/coordinator of one efficacy trial (Annex IV 45) of the application of guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2012-00273). He pointed out that he was not directly or indirectly involved in the trial but that his name was included in the report by the study director as a kind of academic courtesy. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a potential conflict of Interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when that item (Guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species, EFSA-Q-2012-00273) is discussed, voted on or in anyway processed by that concerned scientific group.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

**Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 74th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 09 February 2015**

(Agreed on 23 February 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace.
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable.
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable.
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call.
- **Others:**
 - Name: Not applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 73rd Working Group meeting held on 19-20 January 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 73rd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00003](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The following item was not discussed: L-Lysine monohydrochloride and sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00996](#)).

6. Any Other Business

The WG discussed the use of amino acids as additives to water for drinking.

7. Next meeting

23 February 2015

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 73rd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 19-20 January 2015, Parma
(Agreed on 9 February 2014)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp,¹ Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace.
 - Paul Brantom has participated via teleconference,²
 - Noël Dierick has participated via teleconference, in agenda point 5.1.³
- **Hearing Experts:⁴**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Noël Dierick did not participate in agenda point 5.2.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁶ EFSA

¹ Attended by audio web-conference the first day (January 19 p.m.) and face-to-face on January 20.

² The first day (19 January p.m.) and the second day only in the morning (20 January a.m.).

³ Only the first day (19 January p.m.).

⁴ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interests made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 72nd Working Group meeting held on 12 January 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 72nd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Glutamine for horses (non-food producing) and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2014-00635](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on Guanidinoacetic acid (CreAMINO) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The following item was not discussed: L-Lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00003](#)).

6. Next meeting

9 February 2015

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declarations of Interests (ODoI) done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Prof. Noël Dierick declared the following interest: His name appears as co-responsible/coordinator of one efficacy trial (Annex IV 45) of the application of guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2012-00273). He pointed out that he was not directly or indirectly involved in the trial but that his name was included in the report by the study director as a kind of academic courtesy. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁷ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy on Declarations of Interest,⁸ and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a potential conflict of Interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when that item (Guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species, EFSA-Q-2012-00273) is discussed, voted on or in anyway processed by that concerned scientific group.

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 72nd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 12 January 2015
(Agreed on 19 January 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng and Giovanna Martelli.
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa and John Wallace.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 71st Working Group meeting held on 18-19 December 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 71st Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Lysine monohydrochloride and sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00995](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00117](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Valine (feed grade) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00299](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The following items were not discussed: L-Glutamine for horses (non-food producing) and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2014-00635](#)), L-Lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00003](#)).

6. Next meeting

19-20 January 2015

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 71st meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 18 to 19 December 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 12 January 2015)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace.
 - Paul Brantom, Lucio Costa and Noël Dierick participated via teleconference.¹
- **Hearing Experts:²**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

¹ Paul Brantom participated by audio web-conference the 18th a.m. and the 19 a.m.; Lucio Costa participated by audio web-conference the 19th a.m., and Noël Dierick participated by audio web-conference the 18th am.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interests made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 70th Working Group meeting held on 17 November 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 70th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00948](#)) and decided to submit it to the Panel for adoption.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on L-threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00117](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine monohydrochloride and sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00995](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00003](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The Working Group discussed the application on Guanidinoacetic acid (CreAMINO) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

The WG continued the discussion on the potential safety concerns of the presence of bacterial endotoxins in feed additives produced by fermentation.

7. Next meeting

12 January 2015

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declarations of Interests (ODoI) done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Prof. Noël Dierick declared the following interest: His name appears as co-responsible/coordinator of one efficacy trial (Annex IV 45) of the application of guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2012-00273). He pointed out that he was not directly or indirectly involved in the trial but that his name was included in the report by the study director as a kind of academic courtesy. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁶ and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a potential conflict of Interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when that item (Guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species, EFSA-Q-2012-00273) is discussed, voted on or in anyway processed by that concerned scientific group.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 70th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 17 November 2014
(Agreed on 18 December 2014)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng and Giovanna Martelli,
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from John Wallace.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interests made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 69th Working Group meeting held on 3-5 November 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 69th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00299](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The following item/s was/were not discussed: L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00113](#)), Guanidinoacetic acid (CreAMINO) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Discussion was held on the potential safety concerns of the presence of bacterial endotoxins in feed additives produced by fermentation.

7. Next meeting

18-19 December 2014

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declarations of Interests (ODoI) done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Prof. Noël Dierick declared the following interest: His name appears as co-responsible/coordinator of one efficacy trial (Annex IV 45) of the application of guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2012-00273). He pointed out that he was not directly or indirectly involved in the trial but that his name was included in the report by the study director as a kind of academic courtesy. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a potential conflict of Interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when that item (Guanidinoacetic acid for all animal species, EFSA-Q-2012-00273) is discussed, voted on or in anyway processed by that concerned scientific group.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 69th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 3 to 5 November 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 17 November 2014)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom,¹ Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace.
 - Noël Dierick has participated via teleconference.²
- **Hearing Experts:³**
 - Not applicable.
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable.
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call.
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues

¹ Paul Brantom participated face-to-face the 4th pm. and the 5th am.

² Noël Dierick participated by audio web-conference the 4th am. and the 5th am.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 68th Working Group meeting held on 31 October, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 68th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00946](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)) decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00948](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on L-threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00117](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The following item/s was/were not discussed: L-lysine monohydrochloride and sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00995](#)), L-valine (feed grade) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00299](#)).

6. Any Other Business

The WG continued the discussion on the potential safety concerns of the presence of bacterial endotoxins in feed additives produced by fermentation.

7. Next meeting

17 November 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 68th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 31 October 2014, Audio web-conference
(Agreed on 3 November 2014)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace.
- **Hearing Experts:¹**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 67th Working Group meeting held on 29 September to 1 October 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 67th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00296](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The following item was not discussed: L-Threonine for all animal species, ([EFSA-Q-2012-00113](#)); L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00299](#)).

6. Other business

Discussion was held on the potential safety concerns of the presence of bacterial endotoxins in feed additives produced by fermentation.

7. Next meetings

3-5 November 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 67th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 29 September to 1 October 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 31 October 2014)

These minutes replace an earlier version following an editorial amendment that does not affect their contents or outcome. To avoid confusion, the original version has been removed from the EFSA website.

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Lucio Costa,¹ Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp,¹ Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace.
- **Hearing Experts:²**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom for all the days.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues

¹ Lucio Costa and Jürgen Gropp did not attend on 29 September p.m.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 66th Working Group meeting held on 8 September 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 66th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00113](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The following item was not discussed: Guanidinoacetic acid (CreAMINO) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)).

6. Next meeting

3-5 November 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 66th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 8 September 2014
(Agreed on 29 September 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng and John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom and Giovanna Martelli.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 65th Working Group meeting held on 28-30 July 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 65th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group continued the discussion on the application L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00113](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The following item was not discussed: Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)).

6. Next meeting

29 September to 1 October 2014.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 65th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 28-30 July 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 8 September 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace;
 - Paul Brantom and Noël Dierick have participated via teleconference.¹
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom and Noël Dierick the 28 and 29 July p.m.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Paul Brantom and Noël Dierick participated on 29 and 30 July a.m.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 64th Working Group meeting held on 17-18 June 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 64th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion, including the Member States comments, on DL-Methionyl-DL-Methionine for all aquatic species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00942](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on guanidinoacetic acid (CreAMINO) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

8 September 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 64th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 17-18 June 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 28 July 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng and Giovanna Martelli;
 - Paul Brantom and Noël Dierick have participated via teleconference.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa,¹ John Wallace,¹ Noël Dierick,² Jürgen Gropp² and Paul Brantom.³

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of

¹ Lucio Costa and John Wallace did not participate at all.

² Noël Dierick and Jürgen Gropp did not participate on June 17th.

³ Paul Brantom did not participate on June 17th a.m.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 63rd Working Group meeting held on 22-23 May 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 63rd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application, including the Member States comments, on L-Valine (feed grade) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00377](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting, provided that clarifications are received from Evonik.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application, including the Member States comments, on L-Lysine monohydrochloride (technically pure) concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) and concentrated liquid L-lysine monohydrochloride for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00823](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting, provided that clarifications are received from Ajinomoto Eurolysine S.A.S.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the draft opinion, including the Member States comments, on L-Tryptophan technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00677](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting, provided that clarifications are received from Ajinomoto Eurolysine S.A.S.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the draft opinion, including the Member States comments, on L-Threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00676](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting, provided that clarifications are received from Ajinomoto Eurolysine S.A.S.
- 5.5 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Valine (feed grade) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00299](#)) and decided to inform the applicant of issues that required clarification.
- 5.6 The following item was not discussed: DL-Methionyl-DL-Methionine for all aquatic species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00942](#)).

6. Next meeting

28-30 July 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 63rd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 22-23 May 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 17 June 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Lucio Costa, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick and Jürgen Gropp have participated via teleconference the 23rd a.m.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 62nd Working Group meeting held on 23-25 April 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 62nd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Lysine monohydrochloride and sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00995](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application, including the Member States comments, on L-Threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00117](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting, provided that clarification is received from HELM AG/Meihua.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on CreAMINO (guanidinoacetic acid) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The following item/s was/were not discussed: Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)), L-threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00113](#)), DL-Methionyl-DL-Methionine for all aquatic species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00942](#)).

6. Next meeting

17-18 June 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 62nd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 23-25 April 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 22 May 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom for both days.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 61st Working Group meeting held on 7 April 2014, Tele web-conference.

The minutes of the 61st Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on L-Tryptophan technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00677](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on L-Tryptophan technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00948](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on DL-Methionyl-DL-Methionine for all aquatic species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00942](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00117](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6 The following item was not discussed: CreAMINO[®] (guanidinoacetic acid) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)).

6. Next meeting

22 -23 May 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 61st meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele web-conference, 7 April 2014
(Agreed on 23 April 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 60th Working Group meeting held on 28 March 2014, Tele web-conference.

The minutes of the 60th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00676](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on L-tryptophan technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00677](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The following item was not discussed: L-tryptophan technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00948](#)).

6. Next meeting

23 -25 April 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 60th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele web-conference, 28 March 2014
(Agreed on 7 April 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 59th Working Group meeting held on 24 March 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 59th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine monohydrochloride (technically pure) concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) and concentrated liquid L-lysine monohydrochloride for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00823](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion, including the Member States comments, on L-threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00115](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The following item was not discussed: L-threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00676](#)).

6. Next meeting

7 April 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 59th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele web-conference, 24 March 2014
(Agreed on 28 March 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Jordi Tarrés-Call, Lucilla Gregoretti.¹
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa and Jürgen Gropp.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Lucilla Gregoretti was only present during the discussion of agenda item 5.4.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 58th Working Group meeting held on 6-7 March 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 58th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion, including the Member States comments, on L-threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00116](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion, including the Member States comments, on L-valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00694](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The following item was not discussed: L-lysine monohydrochloride (technically pure) concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) and concentrated liquid L-lysine monohydrochloride for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00823](#)).

6. Next meeting

28 March 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 58th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 6-7 March 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 24 March 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Lucio Costa, Lubomir Leng and John Wallace
 - Paul Brantom,¹ Noël Dierick² and Jürgen Gropp³ have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Jordi Tarrés-Call, Paola Manini and Roberto Molteni
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Giovanna Martelli for all days; from Paul Brantom and Noël Dierick for the 6 March p.m.

Paola Manini and Roberto Molteni only attended the discussion of the agenda point 5.1.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding

¹ Attended by web-conference the 7th March a.m.

² Attended by web-conference the 7th March a.m.

³ Attended by web-conference on 6th March pm. and 7th March a.m.).

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interests,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 57th Working Group meeting held on 17-19 February 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 57th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 34 - Amino acids for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01170](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00946](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00003](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group revised the draft opinion, including the Member States comments, on L-tryptophan technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00949](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.5 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00116](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6 The following items were not discussed: L-tryptophan technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00677](#)), L-threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00676](#)), L-threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00115](#)), concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)), L-lysine monohydrochloride (technically pure) concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) and concentrated liquid L-lysine monohydrochloride for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00823](#)).

6. Next meeting

24 March 2014

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 57th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 17-19 February 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 06 March 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Lubomir Leng and Giovanna Martelli
 - Paul Brantom and John Wallace participated via teleconference.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick and Jürgen Gropp.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 56th Working Group meeting held on 27 January 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 56th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on the joint mandate on L-tryptophan³ and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-valine feed grade (ValAMINO) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00377](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on the joint mandate on L-lysine and related compounds⁴ and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on the joint mandate on L-threonine⁵ and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The following items were not discussed: L-lysine sulfate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00003](#)), L-tryptophan technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00949](#)), L-tryptophan technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00677](#)), L-threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00676](#)), L-lysine/Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base); L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure; L-lysine sulphate (solid and liquid form) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)),

6. Next meeting

6-7 March 2013

³ [EFSA-Q-2011-00946](#)

⁴ [EFSA-Q-2011-00996](#)

⁵ [EFSA-Q-2012-00116](#)

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 56th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 27 January 2014
(Agreed on 17 February 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 55th Working Group meeting held on 7 January 2014, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 55th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on the joint mandate on L-threonine³ and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The following item was not discussed: L-tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00946](#)).

6. Next meeting

17-19 February 2014

³ [EFSA-Q-2012-00113](#)

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 55th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 07 January 2014
(Agreed on 27 January 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom, Lucio Costa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 54th Working Group meeting held on 16 December 2013, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 54th Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00377](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The following items were not discussed: L-threonine for all species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00113](#)); L-lysine monohydrochloride (technically pure), concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) and concentrated liquid L-lysine monohydrochloride for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00823](#)).

6. Next meeting

27 January 2014

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 54th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 16 December 2013
(Agreed on 7 January 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 53rd Working Group meeting held on 27-29 November 2013, Parma.

The minutes of the 53rd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-tryptophan³ and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-threonine⁴ and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-lysine and related compounds⁵ and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The following items were not discussed: ValAMINO (L-valine feed grade) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00377](#)); L-lysine monohydrochloride (technically pure) concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) and concentrated liquid L-lysine monohydrochloride for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00823](#)); L-lysine/Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure, L-lysine sulphate (solid and liquid form) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)).

6. Next meeting

7 January 2014

³ [EFSA-Q-2011-00949](#).

⁴ [EFSA-Q-2012-00116](#).

⁵ [EFSA-Q-2011-00996](#).

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 53rd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held 27(PM) to 29 (AM) November 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 16 December 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Lucio Costa, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarres-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Noël Dierick and John Wallace.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 52nd Working Group meeting held on 21 October 2013, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 52nd Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine monohydrochloride (technically pure) concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) and concentrated liquid L-lysine monohydrochloride for all animal species, ([EFSA-Q-2013-00823](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the joint/grouped mandate on L-lysine and related compounds³ and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the joint/grouped mandate on L-threonine⁴ and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on L-valine for all animal species (Kyowa Hakko), ([EFSA-Q-2012-00694](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.5 The Working Group discussed the joint/grouped mandate on L-tryptophan⁵ and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.6 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on DL-Methionyl-DL-Methionine for all aquatic species, ([EFSA-Q-2012-00942](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

7. Next meeting

16 December 2013, audio web-conference

³ [EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00996](#)

⁴ [EFSA-Q-2012-00113](#), [EFSA-Q-2012-00115](#), [EFSA-Q-2012-00116](#), [EFSA-Q-2012-00117](#).

⁵ [EFSA-Q-2011-00948](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00949](#).

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 52nd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Audio web conference, 21 October 2013
(Agreed on 27 November 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call and Roberto Molteni
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 51st Working Group meeting held on 03 October 2013, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 51st Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-threonine³ and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-lysine and related compounds⁴ and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meeting

27 (PM) – 29 (AM) November 2013, Parma.

³ [EFSA-Q-2012-00118](#)

⁴ [EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 51st meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Tele-web conference, 03 10 2013
(Agreed on 21 October 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom,¹ Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call, Roberto Molteni
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with/without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ The footnote number must be in Arial in the text and in the footnote.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 51st Working Group meeting held on 03 October 2013, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 51st Working Group meeting were reviewed and agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-threonine⁴ and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-methionine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00581](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00920](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.4 The following items were not discussed: L-threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00116](#)), L-tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00949](#)), and L-lysine (concentrated liquid L-lysine base, L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)).

6. Any Other Business

7. Next meeting

21st October 2013

⁴ [EFSA-Q-2012-00118](#)

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 50th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
WEB-conference, 16 09 2013
(Agreed on 03 October 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jaume Galobart-Cots
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 49th Working Group meeting held on 15 07 2013, WEB-conference.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00677](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on L-threonine technically pure for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00676](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group revised the joint mandate on L-threonine³ and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group revised the joint mandate on L-lysine and related compounds⁴ and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.5 The following item/s was/were not discussed: [EFSA-Q-2011-00949](#) and [EFSA-Q-2012-00116](#).

6. Any Other Business

In order to assess the batch to batch consistency and purity of amino acids, only the official method for the analysis of amino acids (EC 152/2009 or equivalent methods (ISO, VDLUFA, AOAC)) will be considered by the Working Group.

7. Next meeting

3 October (AM), Audio web-conference

³ [EFSA-Q-2012-00118](#)

⁴ [EFSA-Q-2011-00995](#)

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 49th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
WEB-conference, 15 07 2013
(Agreed on 16 September 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. The scientific officer informed the WG that Alex Bach has resigned from the membership of FEEDAP Panel and the Amino Acids WG.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the (48)th Working Group meeting held on 24 06 2013, WEB-conference.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on S-Adenosyl-L-methionine disulfate p-toluenesulfonate for pets and other non food-producing animals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00321](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-threonine³ and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00694](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-lysine and related compounds⁴ and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

16 September 2013, Audio web-conference.

³ [EFSA-Q-2012-00118](#).

⁴ [EFSA-Q-2011-00992](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00993](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00994](#)

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 48th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
WEB-conference, 24 06 2013
(Agreed on 15 July 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Alex Bach.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 47th Working Group meeting held on 3 to 5 06 2013, Parma.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00694](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-threonine³ and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable

7. Next meeting

15 July 2013, Audio web-conference.

³ [EFSA-Q-2012-00114](#)

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 47th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 3 (PM) to 5 (AM) June, Parma
(Agreed on 24 June 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Alex Bach, Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom and Giovanna Martelli for the 5th of June (AM).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the SDoI, please refer to the Annex. Oral Declaration of Interests was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 46th Working Group meeting held on 17 05 2013, WEB-conference; the 45th Working Group held on 13 05 2013, WEB-conference; and the 44th Working Group held on 08 04 2013, WEB-conference.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-lysine and related compounds³ and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-threonine⁴ and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-tryptophan⁵ and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on L-methionine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00581](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5 The following item was not discussed: [EFSA-Q-2012-00118](#)

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable

7. Next meeting

24 June (AM), audio web-conference.

³ [EFSA-Q-2011-00992](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00993](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00994](#)

⁴ [EFSA-Q-2012-00114](#)

⁵ [EFSA-Q-2011-00947](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00948](#)

ANNEX

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of the Specific Declarations of Interests (SDol)⁶

In the SDol filled for the present meeting Dr Alex Bach declared the following interest: Ongoing research project funded by the company Evonik on arginine and placental development. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when that item (5.5) of the meeting is discussed, voted on or in any way processed by that concerned scientific group.

⁶ The Annual Declarations of Interests have been screened and approved before inviting the experts to the meeting, in accordance with the Decision of the Executive Director implementing the Policy on Independence regarding Declarations of Interests.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 46th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
WEB-conference, 17 05 2013
(Agreed on 03 June 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Alex Bach.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 45th Working Group meeting held on 13 05 2013, WEB-conference.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-tyrosine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01312](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on L-valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00920](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The following item was not discussed: [EFSA-Q-2011-00947](#)

6. Next meeting

June 3 (PM) to 5 (AM), Parma.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 45th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
WEB-conference, 13 05 2013 (AM)
(Agreed on 3 June 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Alex Bach, Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Alex Bach did not participate in agenda item 5.2.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the SDoI, please refer to the Annex. Oral Declaration of Interests was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 44th Working Group meeting held on 08 04 2013, WEB-conference.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the joint/grouped mandate on L-tryptophan and decided that further discussion is needed.³
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on ValAMINO (L-valine feed grade) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00377](#)), and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The following items were not discussed: [EFSA-Q-2010-01312](#), [EFSA-Q-2012-00694](#).

6. Next meeting

17 May 2013

³ [EFSA-Q-2011-00948](#)

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of the Specific Declarations of Interests (SDoI)⁴

CONFLICT OF INTEREST: In the SDoI filled for the present meeting Dr Alex Bach declared the following interest: ongoing research project founded by the company Evonik on arginine and placental development. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when that item 5.2 of the meeting is discussed, voted on or in anyway processed by that concerned scientific group.

⁴ The Annual Declarations of Interests have been screened and approved before inviting the experts to the meeting, in accordance with the Decision of the Executive Director implementing the Policy on Independence regarding Declarations of Interests.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 44th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
WEB-conference, 08 04 2013 (AM).
(Agreed on 3 June 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Alex Bach, Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Alex Bach did not participate in agenda item 5.3. (SDOI)

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the SDoI, please refer to the Annex. Oral Declaration of Interests was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 43rd Working Group meeting held on 3 to 4 04 2013, WEB-conference.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-tyrosine for all animal species, ([EFSA-Q-2010-01312](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the joint/grouped mandate on L-lysine and related compounds and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.³
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on DL-methionyl-DL-methionine for all aquatic species, ([EFSA-Q-2012-00942](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4 The following item was not discussed: [EFSA-Q-2011-00948](#).

6. Next meeting

13 May 2013

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

³ [EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00995](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00996](#)

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of the Specific Declarations of Interests (SDoI)⁴

CONFLICT OF INTEREST: In the SDoI filled for the present meeting DR ALEX BACH declared the following interest: Ongoing research project founded by the company Evonik on arginine and placental development. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest.

This results in the impossibility for the expert to be present when that item 5.3 of the meeting is discussed, voted on or in anyway processed by that concerned scientific group.

⁴ The Annual Declarations of Interests have been screened and approved before inviting the experts to the meeting, in accordance with the Decision of the Executive Director implementing the Policy on Independence regarding Declarations of Interests.

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 43th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
WEB-conference, 03-04 04 2013
(Agreed on 08 April 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Alex Bach for both days.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 42nd Working Group meeting held on 14-15 03 2013, Parma.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-methionine feed grade for all animal species, ([EFSA-Q-2012-00581](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on DL-methionyl-DL-methionine for all aquatic species, ([EFSA-Q-2012-00942](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the joint/grouped mandate on L-lysine and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.³
- 5.4 The following item was not discussed: [EFSA-Q-2011-00948](#).

6. Next meeting

8 April 2013

³ [EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00995](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00996](#)

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 42nd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
Held on 14-15 March 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 03 April 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Lubomir Leng, Jürgen Gropp,¹ Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace;
 - Noel Dierick has participated via teleconference both days
 - Paul Brantom has participated via teleconference.²
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarres-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Alex Bach both days

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Jürgen Gropp participated by teleconference the 15 AM March.

² Paul Brantom participated by teleconference the 15 AM March.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 41st Working Group meeting held on 08 03 2013, WEB-conference.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00920](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the joint/grouped mandate on L-tryptophan⁵ and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the joint/grouped mandate on L-threonine⁶ and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Any Other Business

7. Next meeting

3-4 April 2013, audio web-conference

⁵ [EFSA-Q-2011-00948](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00949](#)

⁶ [EFSA-Q-2012-00116](#), [EFSA-Q-2012-00117](#)

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 41st meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
WEB-conference, 08 03 2013
(Agreed on 14 March 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Alex Bach, Paul Brantom,¹ Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ Apologies were received from Paul Brantom the 8th AM March.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 40th Working Group meeting held on 12 02 2013, WEB-conference.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-cystine ([EFSA-Q-2010-01313](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on L-tyrosine ([EFSA-Q-2010-01312](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3 The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine and related compounds ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4 The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine and related compounds ([EFSA-Q-2011-00995](#), [EFSA-Q-2011-00996](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.5 The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan and related compounds ([EFSA-Q-2011-00949](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Next meeting

14 -15 March 2013, in Parma

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 40th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
WEB-conference, 12 02 2013
(Agreed on 08 March 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Alex Bach, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 39th Working Group meeting held on 11 02 2013, WEB-conference.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-cystine ([EFSA-Q-2010-01313](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on L-tyrosine ([EFSA-Q-2010-01312](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed

6. Next meeting

8 March 2013, web-conference

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 39th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
WEB-conference, 11 02 2013
(Agreed on 12 February 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Alex Bach, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Brantom

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 38th Working Group meeting held on 22 01 2013, WEB-conference.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-cystine ([EFSA-Q-2010-01313](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.2 The following item was not discussed: [EFSA-Q-2010-01312](#)

6. Next meeting

12 February 2013, web-conference

FEED UNIT

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed
Minutes of the 38th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids
WEB-conference, 22 01 2013
(Agreed on 11 February 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Alex Bach, Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - FEED Unit: Jordi Tarres-Call
- **Others:**
 - Not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 37th Working Group meeting held on 17(PM) to 19 (AM) 12 2012, Parma.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1 The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan and related compounds ([EFSA-Q-2011-00946](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2 The Working Group discussed the application on CreAMINOTM/guanidinoacetic acid ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Next meeting(s)

11 February 2013, audio web-conference

FEED UNIT

Parma, 22 March 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 37th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Parma, 17-19 December 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 22 January 2013)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom (Audio web-conference the 19th AM), Noël Dierick (audio web-conference the 18th and the 19th AM), Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and John Wallace

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Alex Bach.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.¹
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan and related compounds and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.²
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-threonine and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.³

¹ EFSA-Q-2011-00992, EFSA-Q-2011-00993, EFSA-Q-2011-00994

² EFSA-Q-2011-00946

³ EFSA-Q-2012-00118

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-tyrosine (EFSA-Q-2010-01312) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-cystine (EFSA-Q-2010-01313) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.⁴
- During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following question(s)/application(s) have been received:
 - EFSA-Q-2012-00273
- During the meeting, the Working Group considered the comments received from the Member States through the EFSA exchange platform for the following application(s): EFSA-Q-2011-00992, EFSA-Q-211-00993 and EFSA-Q-2011-00994.

5. Next meeting date(s)

22 January 2013, audio web-conference

⁴ EFSA-Q-2011-00947

FEED UNIT

Parma, 22 March 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 36th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Audio web-conference, 3 December 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 17 Dec 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng (Chair),
Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-threonine and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.¹
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-cystine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01313) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date

17(PM) to 19 (AM) December 2012, physical meeting in Parma

¹ EFSA-Q-2012-00118

FEED UNIT

Parma, 22 March 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 35th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Audio web-conference, 19 November 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 03 Dec 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Alex Bach, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng (Chair),
Giovanna Martelli, John Wallace

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paul Brantom.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-valine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2012-00694) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-tyrosine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01312) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.¹
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-threonine and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.²

¹ EFSA-Q-2011-00992, EFSA-Q-2011-00993 and EFSA-Q-2011-00994

² EFSA-Q-2012-00113 and EFSA-Q-2012-00115

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.³
- During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following question has been received:
 - EFSA-Q-2012-00920

5. Next meeting date

3 December 2012 Audio web-conference

³ EFSA-Q-2011-00946

FEED UNIT

Parma, 22 March 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 34th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Audio web-conference, 29 October 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 19 November 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Giovanna Martelli.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.¹
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.²
- The Working Group discussed the application on the product Methionine-zinc technically pure for ruminants (Methionine) and for all animal species (Zn) EFSA-Q-2010-01315 and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- During the meeting, the Working Group considered the comments received from the Member States through the EFSA exchange platform for the following application(s): EFSA-Q-2011-00947, L-tryptophan technically pure.

¹ EFSA-Q-2011-00947

² EFSA-Q-2011-00992, EFSA-Q-2011-00993, EFSA-Q-2011-00994

5. Next meeting dates

- 19 Nov 2012 (AM) audio web-conference
- 3 Dec 2012 (AM) audio web-conference
- 17 (PM) to 19 (AM) Dec 2012 face to face meeting

FEED UNIT

Parma, 22 March 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 33rd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Parma, 26 (PM) -28 (AM) September 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 29 October 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng
EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Giovanna Martelli.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-methionine feed grade for all animal species, EFSA-Q-2012-00581 and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-threonine and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.¹
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.²
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.³

¹ EFSA-Q-2012-00113, EFSA-Q-2012-00114 and EFSA-Q-2012-00118

² EFSA-Q-2011-00995 and EFSA-Q-2011-00996

³ EFSA-Q-2011-00948 and EFSA-Q-2011-00949

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-arginine for all animal species EFSA-Q-2011-00063 and decided that further discussion is needed.
- During the meeting, the Working Group considered the comments received from the Member States through the EFSA exchange platform for the following application(s): EFSA-Q-2012-00114
- During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following question(s)/application(s) have been received:
 - EFSA-Q-2012-00694;
 - FAD-2012-0034.

5. Next meeting dates

The agreed dates for the 2nd half of 2012 were:

- 29 Oct 2012 (AM) audio web-conference
- 19 Nov 2012 (AM) audio web-conference
- 3 Dec 2012 (AM) audio web-conference
- 17 (PM) to 19 (AM) Dec 2012 face to face meeting

FEED UNIT

Parma, 22 March 2013

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 32nd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Parma, 07-08 June 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 26 September 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom (teleconference), Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Annette Schuhmacher and Atte von Wright.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine and related compounds and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.¹
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.²
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-threonine and related compounds and decided that further discussion is needed.³

¹ EFSA-Q-2011-00991

² EFSA-Q-2011-00946

³ EFSA-Q-2012-00116, EFSA-Q-2012-00117

- During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that question EFSA-Q-2012-00581 (L-Methionine feed grade) has been received.

5. Next meeting dates

The dates of the meetings for the second half of 2012 will be decided once the new FEEDAP Panel is operative.

FEED UNIT

Parma, 16 July 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 31st meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Parma 18-19 April 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 07 June 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, Annette Schuhmacher (audio web-conference), Atte von Wright

EFSA: Jordi Tarres-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Noël Dierick for all days; Atte von Wright for the 18th (full day) and 19th AM; and Annette Schuhmacher for the 18 PM and 19 (full day).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with a correction in item 5.5 (EFSA-Q-2012-00118).

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-arginine for all animal species, (EFSA-Q-2011-00063) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification
- The Working Group was informed that a new grouped mandate on L-threonine and related compounds¹ has been received by EFSA. Discussion on the mandate took place and it was decided to contact the applicants on issues that required clarifications.
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine and related compounds² and decided that further discussion is needed.

¹ EFSA-Q-2012-00115, EFSA-Q-2012-00116, EFSA-Q-2012-00117, EFSA-Q-2012-00118.

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan and related compounds³ and decided that further discussion is needed

5. Next meeting date

7-8 June 2012, in Parma.

² EFSA-Q-2011-00991, EFSA-Q-2011-00995, EFSA-Q-2011-00996.

³ EFSA-Q-2011-00946

FEED UNIT

Parma, 16 July 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 30th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Parma, 21 (PM) to 23 (AM) March 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 18 April 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli and Atte von Wright

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Annette Schuhmacher for all the days; Atte von Wright for the 22nd PM and 23rd AM; and Giovanna Martelli for the last morning session.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-tyrosine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01312) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-cystine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01313) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-arginine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00063) and decided that further discussion is needed.

- The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-lysine and related compounds¹ and decided that further discussion is needed.
- The discussions on the joint mandates on L-threonine and related compounds² and on the L-tryptophan and related compounds³ had to be postponed.
- During the meeting, the Working Group considered the comments received from the Member States through the EFSA exchange platform for the following application(s): L-arginine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00063).

5. Next meeting date(s)

April 18 (full day) to 19 (full day), in Parma.

¹ EFSA-Q-2011-00991

² EFSA-Q-2012-00113

³ EFSA-Q-2011-00946

FEED UNIT

Parma, 16 July 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 29th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Brussels, 29 February (PM) to 2 March (AM) 2012

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 21 March 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, Annette Schuhmacher and Atte von Wright

Observers: Wolfgang Trunk (EC, DG SANCO)

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Noël Dierick the first afternoon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group revised the draft opinion on the use of DL-Methionine (technically pure) for all animal species; concentrated liquid sodium DL-Methionine technically pure for all animal species; DL-methionine technically pure protected with ethylcellulose (for ruminants); DL-methionine technically pure protected with copolymer vinylpyridine/styrene (for dairy cows); Isopropyl ester of the hydroxylated analogue of methionine (for dairy cows); Hydroxy Analogue of Methionine for all animal species; Calcium salt of hydroxy analogue of methionine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00995). Some further discussion was held and eventually the WG decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

- The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on Urea technically pure for ruminants from the beginning of the rumination (EFSA-Q-2010-01178) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-cystine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01313) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on L-tyrosine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01312) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The discussion on L-arginine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00063) was postponed.
- The discussion on L-lysine/Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure, and L-lysine sulphate (solid form and liquid form) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00991) was postponed.
- During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application has been received:
 - ValAMINO (L-valine) for all animal species, FAD-2011-0053.
- During the meeting, the Working Group considered the comments received from the Member States through the EFSA exchange platform for the following application(s): Urea technically pure for ruminants from the beginning of the rumination (EFSA-Q-2010-01178).
- The Working Group was informed that a new joint mandate on L-threonine has been received by EFSA and will proceed with the assessment accordingly.¹

5. Next meeting date(s)

21 (PM) to 23 (AM) March, in Parma.

¹ EFSA-Q-2012-00113, EFSA-Q-2012-00114, EFSA-Q-2012-00115, EFSA-Q-2012-00116, EFSA-Q-2012-00117, EFSA-Q-2012-00118.

FEED UNIT

Parma, 14 March 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 28th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Parma, 06 to 08 December 2011

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 29 February 2012)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom (PB), Jürgen Gropp (JG - Chair) Lubomir Leng (LL),
Giovanna Martelli (GM), Annette Schuhmacher (AS), Atte von
Wright (AvW)

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Noël Dierick (all days) and from PB and AS (the first morning).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on the use of DL-Methionine (technically pure) for all animal species; concentrated liquid sodium DL-Methionine technically pure for all animal species; DL-methionine technically pure protected with ethylcellulose (for ruminants); DL-methionine technically pure protected with copolymer vinylpyridine/styrene (for dairy cows); Isopropyl ester of the hydroxylated analogue of methionine (for dairy cows); Hydroxy Analogue of Methionine for all animal species; Calcium salt of hydroxy analogue of methionine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00995) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

- The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-tryptophan and related compounds¹ and decided to inform the applicants on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the joint mandate on L-lysine and related compounds² and decided to inform the applicants on issues that required clarification.
- During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application(s) have been received:
 - CreAMINO (guanidinoacetic acid) for all animal species (FAD-2011-0043)

5. Next meeting date

29 February (PM)-2 March (AM), face to face meeting in Brussels

¹ EFSA-Q-2011-00948 and EFSA-Q-2011-00949

² EFSA-Q-2011-00992, EFSA-Q-2011-00993, EFSA-Q-2011-00994, EFSA-Q-2011-00995 and EFSA-Q-2011-00996

FEED UNIT

Parma, 14 March 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 27th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Parma, 8-10 November 2011

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 6 December 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, Atte von Wright.

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Giovanna Martelli for the first day. Annette Schuhmacher (AS), Paul Brantom (PB) and Noël Dierick (ND) attended by audio-web conference (AS the 8th PM; PB and ND the 9th AM).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group revised the draft opinion on on the use of DL-Methionine (technically pure) for all animal species; concentrated liquid sodium DL-Methionine technically pure for all animal species; DL-methionine technically pure protected with ethylcellulose (for ruminants); DL-methionine technically pure protected with copolymer vinylpyridine/styrene (for dairy cows); Isopropyl ester of the hydroxylated analogue of methionine (for dairy cows); Hydroxy Analogue of Methionine for all animal species; Calcium salt of hydroxy analogue of methionine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00995) and decided that further discussion is needed.

- The Working Group was informed that a joint mandate on L-lysine and related compounds¹ has been received by EFSA and a preliminary discussion on the mandate took place.
- The working group was informed that a joint mandate on L-tryptophan and related compounds² has been received by EFSA and a preliminary discussion on the mandate took place.

5. Next meeting date

The next amino acids' WG meeting is planned for 6th (whole day) to 8th (AM) December 2011 in EFSA Premises.

¹ EFSA-Q-2011-00991, EFSA-Q-2011-00992, EFSA-Q-2011-00993, EFSA-Q-2011-00994, EFSA-Q-2011-00995, EFSA-Q-2011-00996

² EFSA-Q-2011-00946, EFSA-Q-2011-00947, EFSA-Q-2011-00948, EFSA-Q-2011-00949

FEED UNIT

Parma, 14 March 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 26th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Brussels, 24-26 October 2011

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 8 November 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paul Brantom for all days; Annette Schuhmacher for the first and the last days; and Atte von Wright on the last day.

Joaquim Brufau resigned as expert of this working group.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group was informed that a grouped mandate on L-lysine and related compounds¹ has been received by EFSA and a preliminary discussion on the mandate took place.
- The working group was informed that a grouped mandate on L-tryptophan and related compounds² has been received by EFSA and a preliminary discussion on the mandate took place.

¹ EFSA-Q-2011-00991, EFSA-Q-2011-00992, EFSA-Q-2011-00993, EFSA-Q-2011-00994, EFSA-Q-2011-00995, EFSA-Q-2011-00996

- The discussion on the use of DL-Methionine (technically pure) for all animal species; concentrated liquid sodium DL-Methionine technically pure for all animal species; DL-methionine technically pure protected with ethylcellulose (for ruminants); DL-methionine technically pure protected with copolymer vinylpyridine/styrene (for dairy cows); Isopropyl ester of the hydroxylated analogue of methionine (for dairy cows); Hydroxy Analogue of Methionine for all animal species; Calcium salt of hydroxy analogue of methionine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00995) was postponed.

5. Next meeting date

The next amino acids' WG meeting is planned for 8th to 10th (AM) November 2011 in EFSA Premises.

² EFSA-Q-2011-00946, EFSA-Q-2011-00947, EFSA-Q-2011-00948, EFSA-Q-2011-00949.

FEED UNIT

Parma, 14 March 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 25th meeting of the Working Group on amino acids

Parma, 19-21 September 2011

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 24 October 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Joaquim Brufau. Atte von Wright sent apologies, due to delayed flights, the 19th PM.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group was informed that a new grouped mandate on L-lysine and related compounds¹ has been received by EFSA and will proceed with the assessment accordingly.
- The Working Group discussed the application on the use of DL-Methionine (technically pure) for all animal species; concentrated liquid sodium DL-Methionine technically pure for all animal species; DL-methionine technically pure protected with ethylcellulose (for ruminants); DL-methionine technically pure protected with copolymer vinylpyridine/styrene (for dairy cows); Isopropyl ester of the hydroxylated analogue of methionine (for dairy cows); Hydroxy Analogue of Methionine for all animal species;

¹ EFSA-Q-2011-00991, EFSA-Q-2011-00992, EFSA-Q-2011-00993, EFSA-Q-2011-00994, EFSA-Q-2011-00995, EFSA-Q-2011-00996

Calcium salt of hydroxy analogue of methionine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-00995) and decided that further discussion is needed.

- The working group was informed that a new grouped mandate on L-tryptophan and related compounds² has been received by EFSA and will proceed with the assessment accordingly.

5. Next meeting date

The next amino acids' WG meeting will be a physical meeting, and it is planned for 24th (PM) to 26th (AM) October 2011 in Brussels.

² EFSA-Q-2011-00946, EFSA-Q-2011-00947, EFSA-Q-2011-00948, EFSA-Q-2011-00949.

FEED UNIT

Parma, 14 March 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 24th meeting of the Working Group on amino acids

Audio web-conference, 29 July 2011

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 19 September 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Lubomir Leng, Giovanna Martelli, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Joaquim Brufau.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- A preliminary discussion took place on the application on the use of L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01301)
- A preliminary discussion took place on the application on the use of L-threonine technically pure for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01305)

5. Next meeting date

The next amino acids' WG meeting will be a physical meeting, and it is planned for 19th (PM) to 21st (PM) September 2011.

FEED UNIT

Parma, 14 March 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 23rd meeting of the Working Group on amino acids

Audio web-conference, 4 July 2011

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 29 July 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

European Commission Wolfgang Trunk (Animal Nutrition, DG SANCO)

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Joaquim Brufau and Noël Dierick.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group and the representative of the European Commission discussed the particularities of grouping different applications related to the same amino acid (active substance) in a single mandate. The discussion on the applications of L-lysine (EFSA-Q-2010-01301) and L-threonine (EFSA-Q-2010-01305) had to be postponed to the next meeting.

5. Next meeting date

The next audio web-conference WG meeting is planned for 29 July 2011.

FEED UNIT

Parma, 14 March 2012

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 22nd meeting of the Working Group on amino acids

Audio web-conference, 10 June 2011

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 04 July 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Joaquim Brufau.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-cysteine hydrochloride monohydrate for pet animals (EFSA-Q-2010-01284) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date

The next audio web-teleconference WG meeting is planned for 04 July 2011.

FEED UNIT

Parma, 27 June 2011

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 21st meeting of the Working Group on amino acids

Audio web-conference, 06 May 2011

EFSA / FEED Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 10 June 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- A preliminary discussion took place on the application on the use of L-Arginine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00063).
- The Working Group discussed the application on the use of L-cysteine hydrochloride monohydrate for pet animals (EFSA-Q-2010-01284) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date

The next audio web-teleconference WG meeting is planned for 10 June 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 27 June 2011

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 20th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Audio web-conference, 29 March 2011

EFSA / FEEDAP Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 06 May 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp,
Lubomir Leng, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on the use of L-Cystine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01313) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on the use of L-Tyrosine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01312) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application has been received:
 - EFSA-Q-2011-00063

5. Next meeting date

The next audio web-teleconference WG meeting is planned for 06 May 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 27 June 2011

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 19th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Audio web-conference, 07 March 2011

EFSA / FEEDAP Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 29 March 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on the use of Urea for ruminants from the beginning of rumination (EFSA-Q-2010-01178) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- The Working Group discussed the application on the use of L-Cystine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01313) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date

The next audio web-teleconference WG meeting is planned for 29 March 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 27 June 2011

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 18th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Audio web-conference, 07 February 2011

EFSA / FEEDAP Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 24 February 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp,
Lubomir Leng, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

The Working Group discussed the applications on the use of:

- L-Threonine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01034) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- Urea for ruminants from the beginning of rumination (EFSA-Q-2010-01178) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date

The next audio-web meeting is planned for 07 March 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 27 June 2011

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 17th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Audio web-conference, 17 January 2011

EFSA / FEEDAP Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 22 February 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp,
Lubomir Leng, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti, Jordi Tarrés-Call

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

The Working Group discussed the applications on the use of:

- L-Tryptophan for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01026) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- L-Threonine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01067) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- L-Threonine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01034) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Next meeting date

The next audio-web meeting is planned for 07 February 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 27 June 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 16th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Audio web-conference, 10 January 2011

EFSA / FEEDAP Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 04 February 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp,
Lubomir Leng, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

The Working Group discussed the applications on the use of:

- L-Tryptophan for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01026) and decided that further discussion is needed
- L-Threonine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01067) and decided that further discussion is needed

5. Next meeting dates

The next audio-web meeting is planned for 17 January 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 27 June 2011

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 15th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Audio web-conference, 19 November 2010

EFSA / FEEDAP Unit

(Agreed by the WG on 12 January 2011)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Joaquim Brufau, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

Apologies: Atte von Wright

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

The Working Group discussed the applications on the use of concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride, L-lysine sulphate produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01036) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting dates

The next audio-web meetings are planned for 10 and 17 January 2011.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 14 December 2010

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 14th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Audio-web, 11 October 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 19 November 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Joaquim Brufau, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng,
Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

Apologies: Paul Brantom

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

The Working Group discussed the applications on the use of DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine sodium salt, Hydroxy Analogue of Methionine, and Calcium salt of Methionine Hydroxy Analogue for all animal species; Isopropyl ester of Methionine Hydroxy Analogue and DL-Methionine technically pure protected with copolymer vinylpyridine/styrene for dairy cows and DL-Methionine technically pure for ruminants, protected with ethylcellulose (EFSA-Q-2010-00995) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting dates

The next meeting is planned for the 19 November 2010.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 14 December 2010

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Parma and audio-web, 07/08 October 2010

(Agreed by the WG on 19 November 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom (1st day audio-web), Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Annette Schuhmacher

Apologies: Noël Dierick, Paul Brantom (2nd day)

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

The Working Group discussed the application on the use of DL-Methionine, DL-Methionine sodium salt, Hydroxy Analogue of Methionine, and Calcium salt of Methionine Hydroxy Analogue for all animal species; Isopropyl ester of Methionine Hydroxy Analogue and DL-Methionine technically pure protected with copolymer vinylpyridine/styrene for dairy cows and DL-Methionine technically pure for ruminants, protected with ethylcellulose (EFSA-Q-2010-00995) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Next meeting date(s)

The next meeting is planned for the 11 October 2010.

Parma, 14 December 2010

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Parma, 09/10 July 2009

(Agreed by the WG on 07/08 October 2010)

Participants

WG Experts: Paul Brantom, Noel Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Annette Schuhmacker, Lubomir Leng, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

The Working Group discussed the application on L-isoleucine for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2009-00456) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

Parma, 09 July 2009

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Munich, 18 March 2009

(Adopted by the WG on 09 July 2009)

Participants

WG Experts: Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Annette Schuhmacher, Paul Brantom, Bogdan Debski

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Joaquim Brufau, Noël Dierick and Atte von Wright.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

EFSA secretariat screened the ADol and SDol filled in by the scientific experts invited at this meeting in accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests.

With regard to the ADol, SDol and this meeting no other interest than those already declared in the ADol or in a previous SDol and screened by EFSA, in accordance with its Policy on Declarations of Interests and implementing documents thereof, was declared by the experts.

4. Discussions

- The Working Group discussed the application on L-isoleucine (EFSA-Q-2009-00456) and concluded that further discussion is needed.

FEEDAP UNIT

Parma, 27 January 2009

PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

Minutes of the meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids

Parma, 26 January 2009

(Adopted by the WG on 18 March 2009)

Participants

WG Experts: Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp, Lubomir Leng, Annette Schuhmacher, Atte von Wright

EFSA: Lucilla Gregoretti

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paul Brantom and Joaquim Brufau.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

Joaquim Brufau declared an interest on the dossier Creamino (EFSA-Q-2007-050) as the research institution in which he works was involved in performing some trials on the product. Therefore he will not actively participate in the discussion.

4. Discussions

The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Creamino (EFSA-Q-2007-050) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.