

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 48th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 30 October 2018

(Agreed on 30 October 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Arginine with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80182 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00612](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate from *Corynebacterium glutamicum* CCTCC M 2015595 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00574](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00783](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate (feed grade) produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80172 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00438](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

12 November 2018

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 47th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 15 October 2018

(Agreed on 15 October 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 46th Working Group meeting held on 17 September 2018, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 46th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 21 September 2018.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* KCCM 10534 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00545](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80179 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00547](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on L-lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00507](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* K12 KCCM 80152 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00693](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.5. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00610](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.6. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-threonine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum*

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

- KCCM 80118 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00084](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.7. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00783](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.8. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate (feed grade) produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80172 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00438](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.9. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate from *Corynebacterium glutamicum* CCTCC M 2015595 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00574](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.10. During the meeting, the Working Group considered the comments received from the Member States through the EFSA exchange platform for the following application: L-lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid Lysine, produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 10227 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00442](#)).
- 5.11. During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following applications had been received: L-Valine produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* K12 KCCM 80159 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00712](#)); L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate using *Escherichia coli* NITE BP-02526 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00782](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

30 October 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 46th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 17 September 2018

(Agreed on 21 September 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes. Two applications were removed because the supplementary information received was not complete:

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

- L-Threonine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80118 for all animal species, [EFSA-Q-2018-00084](#).
- L-Lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) for all animal species, [EFSA-Q-2018-00266](#).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 45th Working Group meeting held on 31 August 2018, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 45th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 7 September 2018.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-leucine produced using strain NITE BP-02351 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00548](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for other fin fish ([EFSA-Q-2018-00546](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on L-tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* K12 KCCM80135 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00542](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00609](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

- 5.5. During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application has been received: L-glutamine produced using strain *Corynebacterium glutamicum* NITE BP-02524 ([EFSA-Q-2018-00693](#)).
- 5.6. The following items were not discussed: L-tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* K12 KCCM 80152 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00693](#)), L-tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00610](#)), L-Lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate from *Corynebacterium glutamicum* CCTCC M 2015595 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00574](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

15 October 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 45th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 31 August 2018

(Agreed on 7 September 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with one change: L-Threonine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species, [EFSA-Q-2018-00084](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf), was removed because the supplementary information received was not a comprehensive dataset.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 44th Working Group meeting held on 16 July 2018, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 44th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 17 July 2018.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid lysine, produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 10227 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00442](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on L-tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80176 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00451](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on L-threonine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80117 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00506](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on riboflavin sodium phosphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00995](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

- 5.5. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00380](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.6. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.7. During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following applications have been received: L-Arginine with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80182 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00612](#)), L-threonine with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80178 (THR Pro feed grade) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00627](#)).
- 5.8. The following item was not discussed: L-tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* K12 KCCM80135 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00542](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

17 September 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 44th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 16 July 2018

(Agreed on 17 July 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:**¹

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes: L-tryptophan for all animal species ([ESFA-Q-2016-00380](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf)) was removed because the supplementary information was received late; L-Arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf)

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

[2016-00783](#)) was also removed because no supplementary information had been received.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. Additionally, no interests were declared at the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 43rd Working Group meeting held on 18 June 2018, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 43rd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 3 July 2018.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine formulated as L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00427](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate (feed grade) produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80172 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00438](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following question/applications have been received: Vitamin D₃ as feed additive for salmonids ([EFSA-Q-2018-00511](#)), L-threonine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80117 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00506](#)), L-lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00507](#)), L-tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* KCCM 10534 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00545](#)), L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for other fin fish ([EFSA-Q-](#)

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/policyonindependence>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencypolicy17>

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/animal-feed/working-groups>

[2018-00546](#)), L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80179 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00547](#)), L-leucine produced using strain NITE BP-02351 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00548](#))

- 5.4. The following items were not discussed: Riboflavin sodium phosphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00955](#)), L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)) and L-tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* K12 KCCM 80135 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00542](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

31 August 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 43rd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 18 June 2018

(Agreed on 3 July 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace (Chair)

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 42nd Working Group meeting held on 28 May 2018, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 42nd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 6 June 2018.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00379](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00609](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for salmonids ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Riboflavin sodium phosphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00955](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00610](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6. During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following questions/applications have been received: L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate (feed grade) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00438](#)), L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00427](#)), L-lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid Lysine for all

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ Please add here the link to the respective minutes published on the EFSA website (for a given WG it will be always the same link)

animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00442](#)) and L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00451](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

16 July 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 42nd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Held on 28 May 2018, Tele-web conference

(Agreed on 6 June 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace (Chair).

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 41st Working Group Meeting held on 24 April 2018, tele-web conference

The minutes of the 41st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 27 April 2018.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1.** The Working Group discussed the application on L-Threonine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80118 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00084](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2.** The Working Group discussed the application on L-Lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-0266](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3.** The Working Group discussed the application on L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-0379](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4.** The Working Group discussed the application on L-Lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid L-lysine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00501](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.5.** The Working Group discussed the application on L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00483](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6.** The following items were not discussed: L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00609](#)); L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for salmonids ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)).

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

18 June 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 41st meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 23 April 2018

(Agreed on 27 April 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application, on L-Tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00542](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Tocopheryl phosphate mixture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00743](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on L-Lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate from *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00574](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.4. During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application has been received: L-lysine monohydrochloride and Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00266](#)).
- 4.5. The following items were not discussed: L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00379](#)), L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for target salmonids ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

28 May 2018

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 40th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 23 March 2018

(Agreed on 23 March 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with one change: L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00610](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf)) was removed because the applicant requested to extend the deadline to provide supplementary information.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 39th Working Group meeting held on 9 February 2018, tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 39th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 23 February 2018.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00693](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on L-Arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00783](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Betaine anhydrous for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00636](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00574](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5. The following item was not discussed: L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)).

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ Please add here the link to the respective minutes published on the EFSA website (for a given WG it will be always the same link)

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

23 April 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 39th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 9 February 2018

(Agreed on 23 February 2018)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarres-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Noël Dierick.

Gerhard Flachowsky did not participate in the discussion of 'answer to question 2 of the letter requesting supplementary information of December 2017' related to agenda point 5.2 due to the EFSA rules (see the Annex).

¹ Gerhard Flachowsky did not approve the minutes because he disagrees with the EFSA rules.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 38th Working Group meeting held on 22 January 2018, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 38th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 23 February 2018.⁵

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application of L-Arginine (not less than 98% expressed on dry matter basis) produced by fermentation of *Escherichia coli* ([EFSA-Q-2017-00480](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for pigs for fattening, sows and cows ([EFSA-Q-2016-00859](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 5.3. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00783](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ Please add here the link to the respective minutes published on the EFSA website (for a given WG it will be always the same link)

- 5.4. During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application has been received: L-Threonine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00084](#)),
- 5.5. The following items were not discussed: L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for salmonids ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)), Lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate from *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00574](#)), Betaine anhydrous for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00636](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

23 March 2018

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting, the applicant of 'Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for pigs for fattening, sows and cows' (point 5.2) has recently submitted supplementary information. This supplementary information, in response to question 2 posed by EFSA, contains, among others, a scientific paper in which Prof. Gerhard Flachowsky is co-author. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁷ the experts 'are not allowed to assess, rate or review their own work.'

This results in the exclusion of the expert from the discussion on the 'answer to question 2 of the supplementary information received in December 2017 related to application Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for pigs for fattening, sows and cows.'

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 38th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 22 January 2018

(Agreed on 23 February 2018)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarres-Call

AMU Unit: Ana Garcia³

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Gerhard Flachowsky did not participate in the discussion of 'answer to question 2 of the letter requesting supplementary information of December 2017' related to agenda point 4.2 due to the EFSA rules (see the Annex).

¹ Gerhard Flachowsky did not approve the minutes because he disagrees with the EFSA rules.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ Ana Garcia participated partially in the discussion of point 4.2.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes: The following agenda items were removed because the supplementary information was not received on time: L-Arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00783](#)), L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for salmonids ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)), and L-Lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate from *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00574](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on L-Arginine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00484](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for pigs for fattening, sows and cows ([EFSA-Q-2016-00859](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The following items were not discussed: L-Arginine (not less than 98% expressed on dry matter basis) produced by fermentation of *Escherichia coli* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00480](#)) and Betaine anhydrous for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00636](#)).

5. Any Other Business

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

9 February 2018

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting, the applicant of 'Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for pigs for fattening, sows and cows' (point 4.2) has recently submitted supplementary information. This supplementary information, in response to question 2 posed by EFSA, contains, among others, a scientific paper in which Prof. Gerhard Flachowsky is co-author. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁷ the experts 'are not allowed to assess, rate or review their own work.'

This results in the exclusion of the expert from the discussion on the 'answer to question 2 of the supplementary information received in December 2017 related to application Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for pigs for fattening, sows and cows.'

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 37th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 15 December 2017

(Agreed on 15 December 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Lubomir Leng, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call and Konstantinos Sofianidis

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 36th Working Group meeting held on 6 November 2017, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 36th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 23 November 2017.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00483](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Betaine anhydrous for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00636](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application has been received: Tocopheryl phosphate mixture (TMP[®]) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00743](#)).

6. Any Other Business

A follow up discussion on the adopted opinion on HMTBa and its calcium salt took place.

7. Next meeting

22 January 2018

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ Please add here the link to the respective minutes published on the EFSA website (for a given WG it will be always the same link)

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 36th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 6 November 2017

(Agreed on 23 November 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Lubomir Leng, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

AMU Unit: Ana Garcia

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with changes: Betaine anhydrous for all animal species [EFSA-Q-2014-00636](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf) was removed from the agenda because no supplementary information was received.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 35th Working Group meeting held on 11 October 2017, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 35th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 25 October 2017.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid L-lysine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00501](#)), including the Member States comments, and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) (Lutalin) for pigs for fattening, sows and cows ([EFSA-Q-2016-00859](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ Please add here the link to the respective minutes published on the EFSA website (for a given WG it will be always the same link)

7. Next meeting

15 December 2017

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 35th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 11 October 2017

(Agreed on 25 October 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Lubomir Leng, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

APDESK Unit: Sara de Berardis and Mario Villani

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate produced using different strains of *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00391](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Preparation of HMTBa and calcium salt of HMTBa ([EFSA-Q-2016-00370](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00610](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.4. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00609](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid L-lysine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00501](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. During the meeting, the Working Group was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application has been received: L-Tryptophan produced by fermentation using *Escherichia coli* K12 KCCM80152 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00693](#)).

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

6 November 2017

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 34th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 8 September 2017

(Agreed on 8 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Lubomir Leng, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarres-Call

AMU Unit: Ana Garcia

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 33rd Working Group meeting held on 27 June 2017, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 33rd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 6 September 2017.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) (Lutalin) for pigs for fattening, sows and cows ([EFSA-Q-2016-00859](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00783](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00379](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin B2 (riboflavin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00953](#)) and decided present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ Please add here the link to the respective minutes published on the EFSA website (for a given WG it will be always the same link)

- 5.5. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Tryptophan, technically pure produced by *Escherichia coli* CGMCC 7248 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00485](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.6. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Arginine produced by fermentation of *Escherichia coli* (deposition Number: NITE BP-02186) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00480](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.7. The Working Group discussed the opinion on L-Arginine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00484](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

11 October 2017

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 33rd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 27 June 2017

(Agreed on 6 September 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Lubomir Leng, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with one change. The item on the application of Betain anhydrous for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00636](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf)) was deleted because no supplementary information had been received from the applicant.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for pigs for fattening, sows and cows ([EFSA-Q-2016-00859](https://efsa.europa.eu/en/efsa-q-2016-00859)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

8 September 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 32nd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 31 May 2017

(Agreed on 31 May 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Lubomir Leng, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Preparation of HMTBa and calcium salt of HMTBa for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00370](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

27 June 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 31st meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 26 April 2017

(Agreed on 26 April 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Lubomir Leng, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 30th Working Group meeting held on 7 April 2017, tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 30th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 21 April 2017.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Lysine and related compounds produced using different strains of *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00391](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

31 May 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 30th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 7 April 2017

(Agreed on 21 April 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Lubomir Leng, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Lysine and related compounds produced using different strains of *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00391](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) Lutalin ([EFSA-Q-2016-00859](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

26 April 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 29th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Uncertainty/Prometheus case study

Parma, 16 March 2017¹

(Agreed on 16 March 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani, Noël Dierick and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ An extra WG meeting was held to finalise the report to be presented to the experts of the FEEDAP Panel

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group further discussed the applicability of the "Guidance on uncertainty in EFSA scientific assessment" in an opinion of the FEEDAP Panel ([EFSA-Q-2013-00738](#)) and decided to present the outcome to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group further discussed the applicability of the approach of the PRO-METH-EU-S (Promoting Methods for Evidence Use in Science) project in a case study in the area of the FEEDAP Panel ([EFSA-Q-2016-00636](#)) and decided to present the outcome to the Plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

7 April 2017

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 28th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 6 March 2017

(Agreed on 6 March 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Lubomir Leng, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 25th Working Group meeting held on 30 January – 1 February 2017, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 25th Working Group meeting held on 30 January – 1 February 2017 were agreed by written procedure on 14 February 2017.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-0074](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin B₁₂ (cyanocobalamin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00456](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 5.3. The following items were not discussed: L-Lysine and related compounds produced using different strains of *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00391](#)), Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) Lutalin ([EFSA-Q-2016-00859](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

7 April 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 27th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Uncertainty/Prometheus case study

Parma, 1-2 March 2017

(Agreed on 2 March 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani, Noël Dierick and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Andrew David Hart.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Agnese Balzani, Gloria López-Gálvez and Paola Manini
AMU Unit: Elisa Aiassa

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Lucio Costa.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the applicability of the "Guidance on uncertainty in EFSA scientific assessment" in an opinion of the FEEDAP Panel ([EFSA-Q-2013-00738](#)) and decided to present the outcome to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the applicability of the approach of the PRO-METH-EU-S (Promoting Methods for Evidence Use in Science) project in a case study in the area of the FEEDAP Panel ([EFSA-Q-2016-00636](#)) and decided to present the outcome to the Plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

6 March 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 26th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Uncertainty/Prometheus case study

Tele-web conference, 14 February 2017

(Agreed on 14 February 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Alberto Mantovani, Noël Dierick and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Andrew David Hart

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Agnese Balzani, Gloria López-Gálvez and Paola Manini

AMU Unit: Elisa Aiassa

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Lucio Costa and Gerhard Flachowsky.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the applicability of the "Guidance on uncertainty in EFSA scientific assessment" in an opinion of the FEEDAP Panel ([EFSA-Q-2013-00738](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the applicability of the approach of the PRO-METH-EU-S (Promoting Methods for Evidence Use in Science) project in a case study in the area of the FEEDAP Panel ([EFSA-Q-2016-00636](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

1-2 March 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 25th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Held on 30 January - 1 February 2017, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 14 February 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

Noël Dierick and Lubomir Leng have participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Jordi Tarres-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Gerhard Flachowsky.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on L-Arginine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species, [EFSA-Q-2016-00405](#) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Vitamin B₁₂ (cyanocobalamin) for all animal species, [EFSA-Q-2012-00456](#) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Preparation of HMTBa and HMTBa-Ca for all animal species, [EFSA-Q-2016-00370](#) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.4. The Working Group reviewed the application on L-Arginine for all animal species, [EFSA-Q-2016-00783](#) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.5. The following items were not discussed: L-Threonine for all animal species, [EFSA-Q-2016-00074](#), L-Lysine and related compounds produced using different strains of *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species, [EFSA-Q-2016-00391](#), Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) Lutalin, [EFSA-Q-2016-00859](#).

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

February 14 2017

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 24th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 17 January 2017

(Agreed on 17 January 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Lubomir Leng, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini and Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with this change.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 23rd Working Group meeting held on 10-11 January 2017, Parma.

The minutes of the 23rd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 17 January 2017."⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on Vitamin D₃ addition to feedingstuffs for fish ([EFSA-Q-2014-00604](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00074](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on L-Arginine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM80099 (L-Arginine feed grade) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00405](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

30 January to 1st February 2017

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 23rd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Uncertainty/Prometheus case study

Parma, 10-11 January 2017

(Agreed by written procedure on 17 January 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace
Lucio Costa has participated by tele-web conference¹

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Andrew David Hart.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Agnese Balzani, Gloria López-Gálvez and Paola Manini
AMU Unit: Elisa Aiassa

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Noël Dierick.

¹ The first day only.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the applicability of the "Guidance on uncertainty in EFSA scientific assessment" in an opinion of the FEEDAP Panel ([EFSA-Q-2013-00738](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the applicability of the approach of the PRO-METH-EU-S (Promoting Methods for Evidence Use in Science) project in a case study in the area of the FEEDAP Panel ([EFSA-Q-2016-00636](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

17 January 2017

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 22nd meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Parma, 15 December 2016

(Agreed on 15 December 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

John Wallace

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky and Alberto Mantovani have attended by tele-web conference

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

The agenda was adopted with this change: Vitamin D₃ addition to feedingstuffs for fish ([EFSA-Q-2014-00604](#)) was excluded from the agenda.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 21st Working Group meeting held on 25 November 2016, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 21st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 5 December 2016."⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on L-Lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00574](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on L-Lysine sulphate produced for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00824](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

10-11 January 2017

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 21st meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 25 November 2016

(Agreed by written procedure on 5 December 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission:**

Wolfgang Trunk (DG SANTE) has participated for item 6.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting held on 14 November 2016, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 21 November 2016."⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on L-Tryptophan produced by *Escherichia coli* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00570](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Vitamin D₃ addition to feedingstuffs for fish ([EFSA-Q-2014-00604](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The following item was not discussed: L-Lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00574](#)).

6. Any Other Business

A general discussion took place on the maximum tolerable level of sulphur in complete feed and on the need to set a maximum content of total sulphur in feed supplemented with L-lysine sulphate.

7. Next meeting

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

15 December 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 20th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Uncertainty/Prometheus case study

Tele-web conference, 14 November 2016

(Agreed by written procedure on 21 November 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Andrew David Hart.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Agnese Balzani, Gloria López-Gálvez and Paola Manini

AMU Unit: Elisa Aiassa

SCER Unit: Andrea Germini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Lucio Costa.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the applicability of the "Guidance on uncertainty in EFSA scientific assessment" in an opinion of the FEEDAP Panel ([EFSA-Q-2013-00738](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the applicability of the approach of the PRO-METH-EU-S (Promoting Methods for Evidence Use in Science) project in a case study in the area of the FEEDAP Panel ([EFSA-Q-2016-00636](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meetings

25 November 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 19th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 21 October 2016

(Agreed on 21 October 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 18th Working Group meeting held on 14 October 2016, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 18th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 21 October 2016.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00380](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/EFSA-Q-2016-00380)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Vitamin D3 addition to feedingstuffs for fish ([EFSA-Q-2014-00604](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/EFSA-Q-2014-00604)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

14 November 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 18th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Uncertainty/Prometheus case study

Tele-web conference, 14 October 2016

(Agreed by written procedure on 21 October 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Andrew David Hart for agenda items 4.2 and 4.3.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez, Paola Manini and Jordi Tarrés-Call

AMU Unit: Elisa Aiassa for agenda items 4.2 and 4.3.

SCER Unit: Andrea Germini for agenda items 4.2 and 4.3.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Vitamin D₃ addition to feedingstuffs for fish ([EFSA-Q-2014-00604](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. An initial discussion took place on the applicability of the "Guidance on uncertainty in EFSA scientific assessment" in an output of the FEEDAP Panel.
- 4.3. An initial discussion took place on piloting the approach of the PRO-METH-EU-S (Promoting Methods for Evidence Use in Science) project in a case study in the area of the FEEDAP Panel.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meetings

21 October 2016

14 November 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 17th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 30 September 2016

(Agreed on 30 September 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with one change. One agenda item (L-Histidine HCl monohydrate for salmonids/all animal species, [EFSA-Q-2016-00305](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf)

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

and [EFSA-Q-2016-00304](#)) was eliminated because additional information is needed before further discussion.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00570](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.2. The Working Group revised the application on L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00379](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Preparation of HMTBa and calcium salt of HMTBa for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00370](#)) to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.4. The following items were not discussed: L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00380](#)), L-Histidine HCl monohydrate for salmonids/all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305/EFSA-Q-2016-00304](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

14 October 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 16th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 26 September 2016

(Agreed on 26 September 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Lubomir Leng and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Alberto Mantovani.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00391](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Histidine HCl monohydrate for salmonids/all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#) / [EFSA-Q-2016-00304](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.3. The Working Group revised the application on L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00379](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The following item was not discussed: Preparation of HMTBa and calcium salt of HMTBa for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00370](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

30 September 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 15th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 30 August 2016

(Agreed on 30 August 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa and Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Arginine produced by fermentation with *C. glutamicum* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00405](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00391](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The following item was not discussed: L-Histidine HCl monohydrate for salmonids ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

26 September 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 14th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 25 July 2016

(Agreed on 30 August 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Betaine anhydrous for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00636](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.2. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Vitamin B2 (riboflavin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00953](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.3. The following item was not discussed: Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00391](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

30 August 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Working Group on Amino acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 1 July 2016

(Agreed on 1 July 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Alberto Mantovani and Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting held on 10 May 2016, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting held on the 10 May 2016 were agreed at the end of that meeting.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin B2 (riboflavin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00953](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Riboflavin sodium phosphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00955](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The following item was not discussed: Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00391](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable

7. Next meeting

25 July 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Working Group on Amino acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 10 May 2016

(Agreed on 10 May 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Lubomir Leng, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on 10-11 March 2016, Parma.

The minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on the 10-11 March 2016 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00074](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Inositol for dogs and cats ([EFSA-Q-2015-00367](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

The dates for the meetings of the second half of the year were discussed.

7. Next meeting

1 July 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Working Group on Amino acids and Vitamins

Held on 10-11 March 2016, Parma

(Agreed on 10 May 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

Noël Dierick participated via teleconference.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa and Lubomir Leng.

Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 15-17 February 2016, Parma.

The minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 15-17 February 2016 were agreed.⁴

Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Threonine for all species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00555](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on L-lysine HCl for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00556](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on Vitamin B₁₂ (cyanocobalamin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00456](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

Any Other Business

Not Applicable

Next meeting

10 May 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on Amino acids and Vitamins

Held on 15-17 February 2016

(Agreed on 10 March 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

Noël Dierick and Gerhard Flachowsky, have participated via teleconference.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa and Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 18 January 2016 Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 4 March 2016.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Tryptophan for all species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00557](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Betaine anhydrous for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00636](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on Inositol for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2015-00367](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Vitamin D₃ addition to feedingstuffs for fish ([EFSA-Q-2014-00604](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

7. Next meeting

10 March 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on Amino acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 18 January 2016

(Agreed on 4 March 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 12 January 2016 Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 8th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 25 January 2016.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Inositol for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2015-00367](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin D₃ addition to feedingstuffs for fish ([EFSA-Q-2014-00604](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Zinc methionine for all species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00549](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed at the Trace elements working group.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

15-17 February 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Amino acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 12 January 2016

(Agreed on 25 January 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lucio Costa and Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 18 December 2015 Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 18 December 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Inositol for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2015-00367](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The following items were not discussed: Vitamin D₃ addition to feedingstuffs for fish ([EFSA-Q-2014-00604](#)) and Zinc methionine for all species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00549](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

18 January 2016

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Amino acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 18 December 2015

(Agreed on 12 January 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 15 December 2015 Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 15 December 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin B₂ (riboflavin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00953](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Riboflavin sodium phosphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00955](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin D₃ addition to feedingstuffs for fish ([EFSA-Q-2014-00604](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The following item was not discussed: Inositol for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2015-00367](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

12 January 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Amino acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 15 December 2015

(Agreed on 18 December 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th and 5th Working Group meetings held on 24 and 26 November 2015 Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 4th and 5th Working Group meetings were agreed by written procedure on 10 and 11 December 2015, respectively.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application Zinc chelate of methionine (Zinc-Met) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00188](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed at the trace elements WG.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Vitamin B₂ (riboflavin) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00953](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The following item was not discussed: Riboflavin sodium phosphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00955](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

18 December 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ Please add here the link to the respective minutes published on the EFSA website (for a given WG it will be always the same link)

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Amino acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 26 November 2015

(Agreed on 11 December 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gerhard Flachowsky, Kristen Sejrsen and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 24 November 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 24 November 2015 were agreed by written procedure on 10 December 2015.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

6. Next meetings

15 December 2015

18 December 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 24 November 2015

(Agreed on 10 December 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Noël Dierick, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and Robert Wallace (chair)

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 10 November 2015 Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 3rd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 20 November 2015.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application L-Threonine technically pure for all animal species, ([EFSA-Q-2015-00252](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application L-Tryptophan technically pure for all animal species, ([EFSA-Q-2015-00251](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species, ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.⁵

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

⁵ This draft opinion was partially assessed in the plenary meetings of April and June. However, an internal review at EFSA proposed a further review by the WG.

7. Next meeting

26 November 2015

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Amino acids and Vitamins

Tele-web conference, 10 November 2015

(Agreed on 20 November 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gerhard Flachowsky, Kristen Sejrsen and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 09 November 2015, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 09 November 2015 were agreed by written procedure on 17 November 2015.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Omega-6-fatty acid as octadecadienoic acid (conjugated linoleic acid-methylester) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2012-00398](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Next meetings

24 November 2015

26 November 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Amino acids and vitamins

Tele-web conference, 9 November 2015

(Agreed on 17 November 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Lucio Costa, Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 22-23 October 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 22-23 October 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Guanidinoacetic acid for pigs, chickens for fattening and chickens reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.⁵
- 5.2. The following items were not discussed: Zinc chelate of methionine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00188](#)), Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride technically pure and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00991](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meetings

24 November and 26 November

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Feedapaminoacids20152018.pdf>

⁵ This draft opinion was considered ready for submission to the plenary meeting in the WG meeting of 15-16 September. Nevertheless, an internal review at EFSA proposed a further review by the WG.

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Amino Acids and Vitamins

Held on 22-23 October 2015, Parma (Italy)¹

(Agreed on 9 November 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gerhard Flachowsky, Alberto Mantovani and John Wallace

Lucio Costa has participated via teleconference

Noël Dierick has participated via teleconference, in agenda points 5.1 to 5.5 and 5.7

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call and (temporarily) Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

¹ Please refer to the Closed Working Group section for previous Working Group meeting minutes).

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

Noël Dierick did not participate in agenda point 5.6 due to a potential conflict of Interest being identified for this agenda item.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 88th Working Group meeting held on 15-16 September 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 88th Working Group meeting held on 15-16 September 2015 were agreed.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00251](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00252](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Threonine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00555](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Lysine monohydrochloride for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00556](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

- 5.5. The Working Group discussed the application on L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00557](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.6. The Working Group discussed the application on Guanidinoacetic acid for pigs, chickens for fattening and chickens reared for breeding ([EFSA-Q-2012-00273](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.7. The following item was not discussed: Zinc chelate of methionine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00188](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

9 November 2015

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting Prof. Noël Dierick declared the following interest: His name appears as co-responsible/coordinator of one efficacy trial (Annex IV 45) of the application of guanidinoacetic acid for chickens for fattening, pigs, breeder hens and roosters (EFSA-Q-2012-00273). He pointed out that he was not directly or indirectly involved in the trial but that his name was included in the report by the study director as a kind of academic courtesy. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director Declarations of Interest,⁶ and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a potential conflict of Interest.

This results in the exclusion of the expert from any discussion, voting or other processing of item (guanidinoacetic acid for chickens for fattening, pigs, breeder hens and roosters, EFSA-Q-2012-00273) by the concerned scientific group.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>