

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 24<sup>th</sup>-meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Parma, 29 October 2018**

**(Agreed on 29 October 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino Lopez Puente, Alberto Mantovani (Chair of the WG), Giovanna Martelli and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Niovi Kordali and Gloria López-Gálvez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Giovanna Azimonti.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. Additionally, no interests were declared at the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 23<sup>rd</sup> Working Group meeting held on 11-12 October 2018 (Audio-Web).

The minutes of the 23<sup>rd</sup> Working Group meeting held on 11-12 October 2018 were agreed on the 12<sup>th</sup> October.<sup>4</sup>

### 5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the draft opinion on **TYPLEX<sup>®</sup> Chelate** (ferric tyrosine chelate) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00481](#)) application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003), following the request from the FEEDAP Panel and the spontaneous information submitted by the applicant and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.2. The WG discussed the draft opinion on the preparation of algae interspaced bentonite for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00429](#)) (application under Regulation (EC) No 178/2002) and decided to finalise the draft opinion with the data available.
- 5.3. The WG discussed the Member States comments received for the Dossier **Biomin<sup>®</sup> DC-P** (preparation of carvacrol, thymol, D-carvone, methyl salicylate and L-menthol) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, minor avian species other than laying species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00418](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003).
- 5.4. The WG discussed the Member States comments received for the Dossier **CarvaDigest** (carvacrol) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2018-00428](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003).

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/policyonindependence>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>

<sup>4</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

## **6. Any Other Business**

N/A

## **7. Next Meeting**

N/A

## **Annex**

### **Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting**

With regard to this meeting, the applicant of 'Lantharenol for cats (item 5.2) submitted supplementary information which contains, among others, a scientific paper in which Prof. Jürgen Gropp is co-author; the information aimed to support safety of the additive for the target animals. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>5</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>6</sup> the experts 'are not allowed to assess, rate or review their own work.'

This results in the exclusion of the expert from the discussion on the 'Safety for target animals' of the dossier.

---

<sup>5</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 23<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Parma, 11-12 October 2018**

**(Agreed on 12 October 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Giovanna Azimonti, Jürgen Gropp,<sup>1</sup> Secundino López Puente, Alberto Mantovani (Chair of the WG) and Roberto Villa.<sup>1</sup>

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>2</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Niovi Kordali and Gloria López-Gálvez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

One of the EFSA representatives welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

---

<sup>1</sup> Participating on the 12<sup>th</sup> October

<sup>2</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>4</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. Additionally, no interests were declared at the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 22<sup>nd</sup>-B Working Group meeting held on 6 September 2018 (Audio-Web).**

The minutes of the 22<sup>nd</sup>-B Working Group meeting held on 6 September 2018 were agreed on the same day.<sup>5</sup>

#### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

5.1. The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on AvailaCr (Chromium chelate of DL-methionine) for dairy cows ([EFSA-Q-2018-00477](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

#### **6. Any Other Business**

N/A

#### **7. Next Meeting**

29<sup>th</sup> October 2018.

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/policyonindependence>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>

<sup>5</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-feed/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 22<sup>nd</sup>-B meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Parma, 6 September 2018**

**(Agreed on 6 September 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino Lopez Puente, Alberto Mantovani (Chair), Giovanna Azimonti, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. Additionally, no interests were declared at the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 22<sup>nd</sup> Working Group meeting held on 23 July 2018 (Audio-Web).**

The minutes of the 22<sup>nd</sup> Working Group meeting held on 23 July 2018 were agreed on 23/07/2018.<sup>4</sup>

#### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 5.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the draft opinion on Biomin® DC-P (carvacrol, thymol, D-carvone, methyl salicylate and L-menthol) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, minor avian species other than laying species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00418](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.2. The WG discussed the draft opinion on CarvaDigest (carvacrol) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2018-00428](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.3. The following item was not discussed: AvailaCr Chromium chelate of DL-methionine for dairy cows ([EFSA-Q-2018-00477](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003).

#### **6. Any Other Business**

N/A

#### **7. Next Meeting**

To be decided.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/policyonindependence>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>

<sup>4</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-feed/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>



## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

Parma, 23 July 2018

(Agreed on 23 July 2018)

#### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino Lopez Puente, Alberto Mantovani (Chair), Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Niovi Kordali and Gloria López-Gálvez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Giovanna Azimonti.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. Additionally, no interests were declared at the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 21<sup>st</sup> Working Group meeting held on 26-27 April 2018 (Audio-Web).

The minutes of the 21<sup>st</sup> Working Group meeting held on 26-27 April 2018 were agreed on 27/04/2018.<sup>4</sup>

### 5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on TYPLEX® Chelate (ferric tyrosine chelate) for all avian species (EFSA-Q-2017-00481) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003). The document had been already finalised in the previous WG meeting where it was decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting; however some additional aspects related to the characterisation of the additive were identified as deserving additional clarification in the present meeting.
- 5.2. The WG discussed the draft opinion on DSP feed additive premix (Na<sub>2</sub>EDTA, *Castanea sativa* mill, thyme oil, oregano oil) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2018-00430](#)) (application under Article 29 of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.3. The WG discussed the draft opinion on Preparation of algae interspaced bentonite for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00429](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.4. During the meeting, the WG was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application has been received: AvailaCr (Chromium chelate of DL-methionine) for

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/policyonindependence>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/corporate/pub/independencepolicy17>

<sup>4</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

dairy cows ([EFSA-Q-2018-00477](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003).

5.5. The following items were not discussed:

BioMin® DC-P (preparation of oregano oil, caraway oil, carvacrol, methyl salicylate and L-menthol) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, minor avian species other than laying species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00418](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and

CarvaDigest (carvacrol) for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2018-00428](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003)

## **6. Any Other Business**

N/A

## **7. Next Meeting**

6 September 2018

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 21<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Parma, 26-27 April 2018**

**(Agreed on 27 April 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Giovanna Azimonti, Andrew Chesson,<sup>1</sup> Jürgen Gropp,<sup>1</sup> Secundino Lopez Puente,<sup>1</sup> Alberto Mantovani (Chair), Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>2</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Niovi Kordali and Gloria López-Gálvez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Jürgen Gropp did not participate in the discussion of 'Safety for target animals' related to agenda item 5.2 due to the EFSA rules (see the Annex).

---

<sup>1</sup> Participated by Audio-Web

<sup>2</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>4</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declaration of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

## 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 20<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 20 March 2018 (Audio-Web).

The minutes of the 20<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 20 March 2018 were agreed on 20/03/2018.<sup>5</sup>

## 5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The WG discussed the draft opinion on TYPLEX<sup>®</sup> Chelate (ferric tyrosine chelate) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00481](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerule2014.pdf)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The WG discussed the draft opinion on Lantharenol<sup>®</sup> Lanthanum carbonate octahydrate for cats ([EFSA-Q-2017-00288](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerule2014.pdf)) (application under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.3. The WG discussed the draft opinion on and VevoVitall<sup>®</sup> (Benzoic acid) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2017-00648](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerule2014.pdf)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerule2014.pdf](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerule2014.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerule2014.pdf](https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerule2014.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

## **6. Any Other Business**

N/A

## **7. Next Meeting**

23 July 2018.

## **Annex**

### **Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting**

With regard to this meeting, the applicant of 'Lantharenol for cats (item 5.2) submitted supplementary information which contains, among others, a scientific paper in which Prof. Jürgen Gropp is co-author; the information aimed to support safety of the additive for the target animals. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>6</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>7</sup> the experts 'are not allowed to assess, rate or review their own work.'

This results in the exclusion of the expert from the discussion on the 'Safety for target animals' of the dossier.

---

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>7</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 20<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Audio-Web, 20 March 2018**

**(Agreed on 20 March 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Giovanna Azimonti, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino Lopez Puente, Alberto Mantovani (Chair),<sup>1</sup> Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>2</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Niovi Kordali and Gloria López-Gálvez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Andrew Chesson.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> Participated from Parma

<sup>2</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>4</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 19-B<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 8 March 2018 (Audio-Web).

The minutes of the 19-B<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 8 March 2018 were agreed on 8/03/2018.<sup>5</sup>

### 5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. Following the proposal of the FEEDAP Panel (see Minutes of Minutes of the 131st Plenary meeting), the Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on Taminizer D (dimethylglycine sodium salt) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00818](#)) (application under Article 13 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003), focusing in the Safety for target animals and Safety for consumers, and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The WG discussed the draft opinion on TYPLEX<sup>®</sup> Chelate (ferric tyrosine chelate) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00481](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The following items were not discussed: Lantharenol<sup>®</sup> Lanthanum carbonate octahydrate for cats ([EFSA-Q-2017-00288](#)) (application under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and VevoVital<sup>®</sup> (Benzoic acid) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2017-00648](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003).

### 6. Any Other Business

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

N/A

## **7. Next Meeting**

26-27 April 2018.

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 19<sup>th</sup>-B meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Audio-Web, 08 March 2018**

**(Agreed on 08 March 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp and Alberto Mantovani (Chair).<sup>1</sup>

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>2</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Niovi Kordali and Gloria López-Gálvez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. This meeting was set as an additional one to finalise some items which needed only the participation of a reduced number of experts.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> Participated from Parma

<sup>2</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>4</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 19<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 23 February 2018 (Audio-Web).**

The minutes of the 19<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 23 February 2018 were agreed on 23/02/2018.<sup>5</sup>

### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 5.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on Fumonisin esterase (FUMzyme<sup>®</sup>) for all pigs and avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00073](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) aiming to complete editorial aspects of the draft opinion. The document had been already finalised in a previous WG meeting where it was decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Biomin<sup>®</sup> DC-C (preparation of oregano oil, caraway oil, carvacrol, methyl salicylate and L-menthol) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2017-00479](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

### **6. Any Other Business**

N/A

### **7. Next Meeting**

20 March 2018

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 19<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Audio-Web, 23 February 2018**

**(Agreed on 23 February 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Giovanna Azimonti, Andrew Chesson, Jürgen Gropp, Secundino Lopez Puente, Alberto Mantovani (Chair),<sup>1</sup> Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>2</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Niovi Kordali and Gloria López-Gálvez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The EFSA representative welcome the new Chair of the WG, and thanks Secundino López Puente for his Chairmanship activity since 2015.

The Chair welcomed the participants.

---

<sup>1</sup> Participated from Parma

<sup>2</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>4</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 18<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 9-11 January 2018 (Parma).

The minutes of the 18<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 9-11 January 2018 were agreed on 11/01/2018.<sup>5</sup>

## 5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Kelforce<sup>®</sup> (L-glutamic acid, N,N-diacetic acid, tetrasodium salt (GLDA-Na<sub>4</sub>)) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00434](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The WG discussed the draft opinion on Stabilflor<sup>®</sup> (Mixture of ZnEDTA and Cu(NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>EDTA chelates, on chicory pulp carrier, supplemented with 3b E6 ZnO and 3b E4 CuO) for pigs ([EFSA-Q-2017-00627](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The following items were not discussed: Biomin<sup>®</sup> DC-C (preparation of oregano oil, caraway oil, carvacrol, methyl salicylate and L-menthol) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2017-00479](#)), TYPLEX<sup>®</sup> Chelate (ferric tyrosine chelate) for all avian

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00481](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003), Lantharenol<sup>®</sup> Lanthanum carbonate octahydrate for cats ([EFSA-Q-2017-00288](#)) (application under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and VevoVital<sup>®</sup> (Benzoic acid) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2017-00648](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003).

## **6. Any Other Business**

N/A

## **7. Next Meeting**

24 April 2018.

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 18<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Parma, 9-11 January 2018**

**(Agreed on 11 January 2018)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente (Chair),<sup>1</sup> Giovanna Azimonti, Andrew Chesson,<sup>2</sup> Jürgen Gropp,<sup>3</sup> Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.<sup>4</sup>

- **Hearing Experts:**<sup>5</sup>

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants, highlighting the presence of two new members: Giovanna Azimonti and Jürgen Gropp.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

---

<sup>1</sup> Participated by Audio-Web

<sup>2</sup> Present on the 11<sup>th</sup> of January

<sup>3</sup> Participated by Audio-Web on 10<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup>

<sup>4</sup> Participated in Parma on the 9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> and by Audio-Web on the 11<sup>th</sup>

<sup>5</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



The agenda was adopted without changes.

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>6</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>7</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 17-B<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 19 December 2017 (Audio-Web).**

The minutes of the 17-B<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 19 December 2017 were agreed on 19/12/2017.<sup>8</sup>

### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 5.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Kelforce<sup>®</sup> (L-glutamic acid, N,N-diacetic acid, tetrasodium salt (GLDA-Na4)) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00434](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Taminizer D (dimethylglycine sodium salt) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00818](#)) (application under Article 13 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.3. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Fumonisin esterase (FUMzyme<sup>®</sup>) for all pigs and avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00073](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.4. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Biomin<sup>®</sup> DC-C (preparation of oregano oil, caraway oil, carvacrol, methyl salicylate and L-menthol) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2017-00479](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>7</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>8</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

- 5.5. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on TYPLEX<sup>®</sup> Chelate (ferric tyrosine chelate) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00481](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.6. The WG discussed the draft opinion on Stabilflor<sup>®</sup> (Mixture of ZnEDTA and Cu(NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>EDTA chelates, on chicory pulp carrier, supplemented with 3b E6 ZnO and 3b E4 CuO) for pigs ([EFSA-Q-2017-00627](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.7. The following items were not discussed: Lantharenol<sup>®</sup> Lanthanum carbonate octahydrate for cats ([EFSA-Q-2017-00288](#)) (application under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and VevoVital<sup>®</sup> (Benzoic acid) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2017-00648](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003).

## **6. Any Other Business**

N/A

## **7. Next Meeting**

23 February 2017.

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 17<sup>th</sup>-B meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Tele-web conference, 19 December 2017**

**(Agreed on 19 December 2017)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente (Chair), Andrew Chesson, Alberto Mantovani and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 17<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 24 November 2017, Tele-web conference.**

The minutes of the 17<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 24 November 2017 were agreed on 24/11/2017.<sup>4</sup>

#### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 5.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Kelforce<sup>®</sup> (L-glutamic acid, N,N-diacetic acid, tetrasodium salt (GLDA-Na<sub>4</sub>)) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00434](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Taminizer D (dimethylglycine sodium salt) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00818](#)) (application under Article 13 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Fumonisin esterase (FUMzyme<sup>®</sup>) for all pigs and avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00073](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.4. The following item was not discussed: Lantharenol<sup>®</sup> Lanthanum carbonate octahydrate for cats ([EFSA-Q-2017-00288](#)) (application under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003).

#### **6. Any Other Business**

N/A

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

## **7. Next Meeting**

9-11 January 2018.

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 17<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Tele-web conference, 24 November 2017**

**(Agreed on 24 November 2017)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente (Chair), Andrew Chesson, Boris Kolar, Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 16<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 18-19 October 2017, AECOSAN (Madrid).**

The minutes of the 16<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 18-19 October 2017 were agreed on 19/10/2017.<sup>4</sup>

#### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 5.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Kelforce<sup>®</sup> (L-glutamic acid, N,N-diacetic acid, tetrasodium salt (GLDA-Na<sub>4</sub>)) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00434](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The following items were not discussed: Taminizer D (dimethylglycine sodium salt) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00818](#)) (application under Article 13 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003), Fumonisin esterase (FUMzyme<sup>®</sup>) for all pigs and avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00073](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC)), Lantharenol<sup>®</sup> Lanthanum carbonate octahydrate for cats ([EFSA-Q-2017-00288](#)) (application under Article 14 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003), Biomin<sup>®</sup> DC-C (preparation of oregano oil, caraway oil, carvacrol, methyl salicylate and L-menthol) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2017-00479](#)), VevoVital<sup>®</sup> (Benzoic acid) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2017-00648](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and TYPLEX<sup>®</sup> Chelate (ferric tyrosine chelate) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00481](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003).

#### **6. Any Other Business**

The WG composition will be updated with the substitution of Boris Kolar. The relevant procedure has been started.

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

## **7. Next Meeting**

To Be Decided.



## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 16<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Agencia Española de Consumo, Seguridad Alimentaria y Nutrición (AECOSAN)**

**Madrid**

**18-19 October 2017**

**(Agreed on 19 October 2017)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente (Chair), Andrew Chesson, Boris Kolar, Giovanna Martelli and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The meeting took place in the facilities of AECOSAN (Agencia Española de Consumo, Seguridad Alimentaria y Nutrición), Madrid. The Chair of the WG thanked the Authorities of the Agency and welcomed the

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

participants to the meeting. Apologies were received from Alberto Mantovani and Roberto Villa.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Kelforce<sup>®</sup> (L-glutamic acid, N,N-diacetic acid, tetrasodium salt (GLDA-Na<sub>4</sub>)) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00434](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Bentonite for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00561](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG preliminary discussed the draft opinion on VevoVital<sup>®</sup> (Benzoic acid) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2017-00648](#)) (application under Article 4(1) of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. During the meeting, the WG was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application has been received: Stabilflor<sup>®</sup> (Mixture of ZnEDTA and Cu(NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>EDTA chelates, on chicory pulp carrier, supplemented with 3b E6 ZnO and 3b E4 CuO) for pigs ([EFSA-Q-2017-00627](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003).

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4.5. The following items were not discussed: Fumonisin esterase (FUMzyme<sup>®</sup>) for all pigs and avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00073](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and Biomin<sup>®</sup> DC-C (preparation of oregano oil, caraway oil, carvacrol, methyl salicylate and L-menthol) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2017-00479](#)).

## **5. Any Other Business**

The WG composition will be updated with one new member. The relevant procedure has been started.

## **6. Next Meeting**

24 November 2017

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 15<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Tele-web conference, 2 October 2017**

**(Agreed on 2 October 2017)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente (Chair), Andrew Chesson, Boris Kolar, Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 14<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 24 July 2017, Audio-Web.**

The minutes of the 14<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 10 and 21 July 2017 were agreed on 10 and 25/07/2017, respectively.<sup>4</sup>

#### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 5.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Kelforce<sup>®</sup> (L-glutamic acid, N,N-diacetic acid, tetrasodium salt (GLDA-Na<sub>4</sub>)) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00434](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Bentonite for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00561](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The following item was not discussed: Fumonisin esterase (FUMzyme<sup>®</sup>) for all pigs and avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00073](#)).

#### **6. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

#### **7. Next Meeting**

18-19 October 2017

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 14<sup>th</sup>-B meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

Tele-web conference, 21 July 2017, Parma

(Agreed on 25 July 2017)

#### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrew Chesson, Alberto Mantovani and Giovanna Martelli.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The EFSA representative welcomed the participants.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Benzoic acid for suckling piglets, weaned piglets, pigs for fattening, sows for reproduction, sows in order to have benefit in piglets, minor porcine species, chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, breeding hens, turkeys for fattening, turkeys for breeding purposes, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00858](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the Plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Biomin® DC-C (preparation of oregano oil, caraway oil, carvacrol, methyl salicylate and L-menthol) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2017-00479](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on TYPLEX® Chelate (ferric tyrosine chelate) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00481](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

#### **5. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

#### **6. Next Meeting**

29 September 2017

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 14<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Tele-web conference, 10 July 2017, Parma**

**(Agreed on 10 July 2017)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Andrew Chesson, Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Agnese Balzani and Gloria López-Gálvez

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Boris Kolar and Roberto Villa.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Taminizer D (dimethylglycine sodium salt) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00818](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.2. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Benzoic acid for suckling piglets, weaned piglets, pigs for fattening, sows for reproduction, sows in order to have benefit in piglets, minor porcine species, chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, breeding hens, turkeys for fattening, turkeys for breeding purposes, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00858](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Lantharenol® Lanthanum carbonate octahydrate for cats ([EFSA-Q-2017-00288](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.4. The following items were not discussed: Biomin® DC-C (preparation of oregano oil, caraway oil, carvacrol, methyl salicylate and L-menthol) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2017-00479](#)) and TYPLEX® Chelate (ferric tyrosine chelate) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00481](#)).

### 5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## **6. Next Meeting**

21 July 2017

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 13<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

Held on 18-19 May 2017, Parma

(Agreed by written procedure on 23 May 2017)

#### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Andrew Chesson, Boris Kolar, Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw<sup>1</sup> and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>2</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Agnese Balzani and Gloria López-Gálvez

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> Participated by Audio-web

<sup>2</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>4</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Taminizer D (dimethylglycine sodium salt) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00818](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Nimicoat® (Carvacrol) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2016-00076](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.3. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on VevoVital® Benzoic acid for minor porcine species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00861](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Benzoic acid for suckling piglets, weaned piglets, pigs for fattening, sows for reproduction, sows in order to have benefit in piglets, minor porcine species, chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, laying hens, breeding hens, turkeys for fattening, turkeys for breeding purposes, turkeys reared for breeding, minor poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00858](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.5. During the meeting, the WG was informed, in order to plan the future discussions, that the following application has been received: Lantharenol® Lanthanum carbonate octahydrate for cats ([EFSA-Q-2017-00288](#)).
- 4.6. The following items were not discussed: FUMzyme® Fumonisin esterase for pigs and all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00073](#)).

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## **5. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

## **6. Next Meeting**

10 July 2017

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 12<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Tele-Web conference 28 April 2017, Parma**

**(Agreed by written procedure on 3<sup>rd</sup> May 2017)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Andrew Chesson,<sup>1</sup> Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>2</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Agnese Balzani and Gloria López-Gálvez

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Boris Kolar.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> Participated from Parma

<sup>2</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>4</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Liderfeed® (Clove oil, eugenol) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00394](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The WG further discussed the draft opinion on VevoVital® (Benzoic acid) for weaned piglets and pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00017](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Avimatrix (Benzoic acid/Calcium formate/Fumaric acid) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2017-00047](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The following item was not discussed: Taminizer D (dimethylglycine sodium salt) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00818](#)).

### 5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

### 6. Next Meeting

18-19 May 2017

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 11<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

Held on 26-27 January 2017, Parma

(Agreed on 27 January 2017)

#### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Andrew Chesson, Boris Kolar, Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Matteo L. Innocenti

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft opinion on Nimicoat (Carvacrol) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2016-00076](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion of the draft opinion on Bentonite for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00561](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.3. The following items were not discussed: VevoVital® (Benzoic acid) for weaned piglets and pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00017](#)), Liderfeed® (Clove oil, eugenol) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00394](#)) and Taminizer D (dimethylglycine sodium salt) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00818](#)).

### 5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

### 6. Next Meeting

28 April 2017

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 10<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Tele-Web conference 10 November 2016**

**(Agreed on 10 November 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Boris Kolar, Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson, Lubomir Leng.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft opinion on BIOMIN® BBSH 797 (DSM 11798) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00145](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion of the draft opinion on VevoVital<sup>®</sup> (Benzoic acid) for weaned piglets and pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00017](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

### 5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

### 6. Next Meeting

26-27 January 2017

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 9<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Tele-Web conference 16 September 2016**

**(Agreed on 16 September 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Andrew Chesson, Boris Kolar, Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion of the draft opinion on Preparation of algae interspaced bentonite for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00053](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft opinion on BIOMIN<sup>®</sup> BBSH 797 (DSM 11798) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00145](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued the discussion of the draft opinion on Liderfeed<sup>®</sup> (Clove oil, eugenol) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00394](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The following item was not discussed: VevoVital<sup>®</sup> (Benzoic acid) for weaned piglets and pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00017](#)).

#### **5. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

#### **6. Next Meeting**

10 November 2016

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 8<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Tele-Web conference 29 August 2016**

**(Agreed on 29 August 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Andrew Chesson, Boris Kolar, Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng and Roberto Villa.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion of the draft opinion on Preparation of algae interspaced bentonite for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00053](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on Liderfeed<sup>®</sup> (Clove oil, eugenol) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00394](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The following item was not discussed: BIOMIN<sup>®</sup> BBSH 797 (DSM 11798) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00145](#)).

### **5. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

### **6. Next Meeting**

16 September 2016

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Tele-Web conference 7 July 2016**

**(Agreed on 7 July 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Boris Kolar, Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson and Lubomir Leng.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>



### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 7 July 2016, Tele-web conference.**

The minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 7 July 2016 were agreed.<sup>4</sup>

### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion of the draft opinion on Preparation of algae interspaced bentonite for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00053](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the the draft opinion on VevoVital® (Benzoic acid) for weaned piglets and pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00017](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. A preliminary discussion took place on the application Liderfeed® (Clove oil, eugenol) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00394](#)).
- 5.4. The following item was not discussed: FUMzyme® (fumonisin esterase) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00900](#)).

### **6. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

### **7. Next Meeting**

29 August 2016

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

Held on 8-9 June 2016, Madrid, Spain

(Agreed on 9 June 2016)

#### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Andrew Chesson, Boris Kolar, Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng and Christer Hogstrand.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 21-22 April 2016, Parma and of the 6<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 8-9 June, Madrid.

The minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 21-22 April 2016 and of the 6<sup>th</sup> Working Group Meeting held on 8-9 June in Madrid were agreed.<sup>4</sup>

### 5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on FUMzyme<sup>®</sup> (fumonisin esterase) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00900](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Nimicoat (Carvacrol) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2016-00076](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The Working Group discussed the application on Activo<sup>®</sup> MC (encapsulated mixture of secondary plant compounds with Carvacrol as marker compound), for all avian species and pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2016-00196](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4. The Working Group discussed the application on BIOMIN<sup>®</sup> BBSH 797 (DSM 11798) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00145](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on a single issue that required clarification.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

5.5. The following item was not discussed: Toxfin® Dry (preparation of bentonite-montmorillonite and sepiolite) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00903](#)).

## **6. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

## **7. Next Meeting**

7 July 2016

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

Held on 21-22 April 2016, Parma, Italy

(Agreed on 08 June 2016)

#### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Andrew Chesson, Boris Kolar, Christer Hogstrand, Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Lubomir Leng and Christer Hogstrand.

Derek Renshaw participated via teleconference. Roberto Villa participated via teleconference on 22 April.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2016, Tele-web conference. .**

The minutes of the of the 4<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2016 were agreed.<sup>4</sup>

### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 5.1. The Working Group discussed the application on Preparation of algae interspaced bentonite for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00053](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.2. A preliminary discussion took place on the application on FUMzyme<sup>®</sup> (fumonisin esterase) for all avian species ([EFSA-Q-2014-00900](#)).
- 5.3. The following items were not discussed: Lanthanide-citrate (LANCER) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2015-00718](#)); Kelforce (L-glutamic acid, N,N-diacetic acid, tetrasodium salt (GLDA-Na4)) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00434](#)).

### **6. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

### **7. Next Meeting**

8–9 June 2016, Madrid

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Tele-Web conference 22 March 2016**

**(Agreed on 21 April 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Christer Hogstrand, Boris Kolar, Alberto Mantovani, Giovanna Martelli and Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrew Chesson and Roberto Villa

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Working Group meeting held on 22 (AM)-23 (AM) January 2016, Tele-web conference.**

The minutes of the of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Working Group meeting held on 22<sup>nd</sup> and 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2016 were agreed.<sup>4</sup>

### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion of the draft opinion on Lanthanide-citrate (LANCER) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2015-00718](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group continued the discussion of the draft opinion on Kelforce (L-glutamic acid, N,N-diacetic acid, tetrasodium salt (GLDA-Na<sub>4</sub>)) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00434](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.

### **6. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

### **7. Next Meeting**

21-22 April 2016

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>



## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Tele-Web conference 22(AM) - 23(AM) February 2016**

**(Agreed on 22 March 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Andrew Chesson,<sup>1</sup> Christer Hogstrand,<sup>2</sup> Boris Kolar,<sup>3</sup> Alberto Mantovani,<sup>4</sup> Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>5</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> Only the first day

<sup>2</sup> Only the second day

<sup>3</sup> Only the second day

<sup>4</sup> Only the first day

<sup>5</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>6</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>7</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Working Group meeting held on 28-29 January 2016, Parma.**

The minutes of the of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Working Group meeting held on 28-29 January 2016 were agreed.<sup>8</sup>

### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion of the draft opinion on Kelforce (L-glutamic acid, N,N-diacetic acid, tetrasodium salt (GLDA-Na<sub>4</sub>)) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00434](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The Working Group continued the discussion of the draft opinion on Lanthanide-citrate (LANCER) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2015-00718](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3. The Working Group continued the discussion of the draft opinion on Diarr-Stop S Plus (Na<sub>2</sub>EDTA, castanea sativa mill, thyme oil, oregano oil) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00060](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.4. The following items were not discussed: Preparation of algae interspaced bentonite for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00053](#)).

### **6. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

### **7. Next Meeting**

22 March 2016

---

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>7</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>8</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Held on 28-29 January 2016, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 22 February 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Andrew Chesson, Boris Kolar, Christer Hogstrand, Giovanna Martelli, Derek Renshaw and Roberto Villa.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Alberto Mantovani.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> Working Group meeting held on 19 November 2015, Tele-web conference.**

The minutes of the of the 1<sup>st</sup> Working Group meeting held on 19<sup>th</sup> November 2016 were agreed.<sup>4</sup>

### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on Kelforce (L-glutamic acid, N,N-diacetic acid, tetrasodium salt (GLDA-Na<sub>4</sub>)) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00434](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The Working Group discussed the application on Lanthanide-citrate (LANCER) for weaned piglets ([EFSA-Q-2015-00718](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.3. The following items were not discussed: Diarr-Stop S Plus (Na<sub>2</sub>EDTA, castanea sativa mill, thyme oil, oregano oil) for pigs for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2011-00060](#)); Preparation of algae interspaced bentonite for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2015-00053](#)).

### **6. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

### **7. Next Meeting**

22-23 February 2016

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/FeedapOtherAdditives.pdf>

## Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

### Minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Working Group on Other Additives

**Tele-Web conference 19 November 2015**

**(Agreed on 28 January 2016)**

#### **Participants**

- **Working Group Members:**

Secundino Lopez Puente, Andrew Chesson, Boris Kolar, Giovanna Martelli, Alberto Mantovani, Derek Renshaw.

- **Hearing Experts:<sup>1</sup>**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Roberto Villa.

#### **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,<sup>3</sup> EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on Amoklor (ammonium chloride) for cats and dogs, pigs, and ruminants (domestic and wild) ([EFSA-Q-2014-00607](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The following item was not discussed: Kelforce (L-glutamic acid, N,N-diacetic acid, tetrasodium salt (GLDA-Na<sub>4</sub>)) for chickens for fattening ([EFSA-Q-2013-00434](#)).

### **5. Any Other Business**

Not Applicable

### **6. Next Meeting**

28-29 January 2016 (Parma)

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>