

Evidence Management Unit

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Publication of scientific data from EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys

Held on 17 September 2018, Web conference

(DRAFT)

Participants

Working Group Members:

Andrea Maldonado, David Foster, Jelena Sogel, Heli Tapanainen,
Attila Tirian, Sian Thomas

EFSA:

DATA: Jane Richardson (Chair), Eileen O'Dea
LA: Simone Gabbi

Apologies

European Commission:

Christine Laaboudi

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

For the record, a new Declaration of Interests was noted for Sian Thomas.

4. Discussion of the Results of the Survey and other feedback received

The survey results were discussed. 29 Responses were received from 18 Countries (of which 15 are Member States).

90% (n=26) of the responses endorsed the draft Technical Report.

Of the 3 raising queries:

- 1 did not specify any specific concerns;
- 1 related to details of consumption data anonymisation and confidentiality;
- 1 queried matters relating to the collection and transmission of data to EFSA.

These matters were discussed by EFSA with the Member States concerned and with the Working Group to ensure the queries were addressed in the final draft of the report as far as possible.

5. Clarifications required to resolve outstanding issues

The working group discussed suggested adjustments to the Technical Report to address the queries raised in feedback.

- 1) Add to section 3.1 - GDPR and IPR must be protected as described in Section 3.2
- 2) Add a clarification proactive publication applies to the data listed in Table 9 and new data collections starting in EFSA. For historical data approval would be sought prior to publication.
- 3) Add a Clearer statement on which fields will be masked under a new subsection Data protection, confidentiality and anonymisation and add a table in the annex.
- 4) Cite existing guidance from UK Information Standards Board for Health and Social Care *Anonymisation Standard for Publishing Health and Social Care Data Specification* for food consumption data and other similar guidance (where available) plus provide clarification around informed consent for food consumption studies

- 5) Add a subsection Timing of Publication
- 6) Review the section with to the amendment of data after publication
- 7) Include a new sub section on legal remedies in the Accessible and Usable section
- 8) Check whether the “Reuse policy: A study on available reuse implementation instruments and licensing considerations” is now publically available

6. Next Steps

Progress final edits for publication of the technical report by end of 2018.

Evidence Management Unit

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Publication of scientific data from EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys

Held on 6-7 March 2018, Web conference

(Agreed on 10 April 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrea Maldonado, David Foster, Eileen O'Dea, Jelena Sogel, Heli Tapanainen, Attila Tirian, Sian Thomas

- **European Commission:**

Norbert Hohn

- **EFSA:**

DATA: Jane Richardson (Chair)

RASA: Friedemann Ringwald

DTS: Ivana Marsic

LA: Citlali Pintado

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 16 February 2018, online meeting.

The minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 13 February 2018 were agreed.

5. The Publication of scientific data from EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys working group

The working group analysed the technical report and outstanding questions were discussed and finalised.

5.1. Interpretation of the terms of reference

The working group decided to add a short paragraph to the interpretation and introduction of the ToR to clarify purpose of technical report and make reference to the G8 open data charter.

5.2. Open Data Maturity Assessment Reports

The working group decided to add a clarification that these reports cover all forms of open government data and that survey is completed by the PSI coordinators network. The information presented in Table 10 is to be verified.

5.3. Open food safety data in Europe – Case Studies and Success Stories

The working group revised the benefits and barriers and moved this information to the conclusions at the end of the technical report.

5.4. Benefits

No actions.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

5.5. EFSA SDWH and Supported vs Self publishers

The working group noted it is important to emphasise that EFSA provides service of publishing data on behalf of Member States. Competent authorities can self-publish or use the EFSA publication service. To maintain interoperability datasets can be both self-published and published by EFSA.

5.6. Open by default

The working group request a check with DATA Unit determine if informed consent was obtained for the EU MENU data.

5.7. Timely and Comprehensive

The working group requested the addition of diagrams to describe the sub-setting of datasets for publication

5.8. Comparable and Interoperable

The working group proposed to add a section on the DCAT application profile and to describe the mechanisms for identifying the competent authorities to be listed as authors.

5.9. Accessible and Usable

No actions

5.10. Improved Governance and Citizen Engagement

The working group proposed to include reference to DataCite reports and statistics and the tracking features of the European Union Open Data Portal and similar portals.

5.11. Structural metadata

The working group discussed all the structural metadata fields of the data collection tables and clarified which should be subject to data protection.

5.12. Conclusions / Recommendations

The conclusions and recommendations were agreed by the working group

5.13. Consultation of endorsement of report / Presentations to networking groups

The report will be presented to the Contaminants network in April. Presentations to other networks will be scheduled.

Evidence Management Unit

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Publication of scientific data from EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys

Held on 13 February 2018, Web conference

(Agreed on 7 March 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrea Maldonado, David Foster, Adam Locker, Eileen O'Dea, Jose Saez Llorente, Jelena Sogel, Heli Tapanainen, Attila Tirian

- **European Commission:**

Carol Riccalton, Marcella Kuba, Francois Van Den Bril, Christine Laaboudi-Spoiden, Corina Buruiana,

- **EFSA:**

DATA: Jane Richardson (Chair)

RASA: Friedemann Ringwald

DTS: Ivana Marsic

LA: Citlali Pintado

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 16 February 2018, online meeting.

The minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 16 January 2018 were agreed.

5. Licenses

The questions around the licenses include the conditions for the access given to the data published, whether this access is open or not and at which conditions. All questions regarding the consent of the data owners and the anonymization or pseudonymisation having been cleared prior the publication of the data are to be considered the conditions of the openness.

There are a number of licenses in usage in Europe

The licenses proposed by Creative Commons 4.0 proposes a license which allows reuse of the data (copy, redistribution of the material in any medium or format, for any purpose even commercial) and also allows to adapt the material (remix, transform, build upon material for any purpose even commercial).

Some Member States, the European Environment Agency (EEA) have been using [Creative Commons 4.0](#)

EFSA uses a disclaimer on the use that can be done of its documents on its website (see Legal Notice) and in Knowledge Junction. It also uses Creative Commons 4.0 in [Wiley](#) (the publisher of EFSA's scientific outputs) and in [Zenodo](#).

The United Kingdom uses an [Open Government License](#)

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

The European Commission uses a [disclaimer](#) in the EU Open Data portal.

The Knowledge Junction community also has a [disclaimer and allows the use of licenses, such as](#) Creative Commons 4.0.

A common feature of all of these instruments is the requirement for attribution.

With regard to Creative Commons 4.0, questions were raised; whether the use of this license is compliant with EU financial regulations, the fact that the license is irrevocable and the difficulties of enforcement in case of licenses breaches.

This diversity of approaches has led to the Central IP service of the European Commission performing analysis described in the "Reuse policy: A study on available reuse implementation instruments and licensing considerations" internal document. The use done so far of Creative Commons 4.0 is included in this evaluation. The idea being to have an harmonised EU license to be used by all institutions, agencies and bodies of the EU. This because Creative Commons 4.0 was built on US law.

A proposal was made to use Creative Commons 4.0 or comparable license types until a final decision is taken by the European Commission. It was proposed to insert a paragraph indicating that the EU license will be automatically used by EFSA for the publication of Data, as soon as available.

6. Tasks before physical meeting

EFSA will contact the Central IP service for more information.

All Working group members are requested to review the document and complete missing sections

7. Next meetings

DATE	TIME	Location
6-7/03/2018	10 - 15	Parma
10/04 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference

Evidence Management Unit

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Publication of scientific data from EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys

Held on 16 January 2018, Web conference

(Agreed on the 13 February 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Andrea Maldonado, Eileen O'DEA, Jelena Sogel, Heli Tapanainen, Sian Thomas, David Foster

- **European Commission**

Christine Laaboudi-Spoiden

- **EFSA:**

DATA: Jane Richardson (Chair)

RASA: Friedemann Ringwald

DTS: Ivana Marsic

LA: Citlali Pintado

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 28 November 2017, online meeting.

The minutes of the 4th Working Group online meeting held on 28 November 2017 were agreed.

5. Review of draft technical report

The draft of technical report was reviewed. All the previous added comments were discussed and clarified. The key changes are listed in the following below:

Include SSD1 for contaminants and pesticides to ANNEX A.

Add a section about the scientific data warehouse, the *Circle of Trust* Initiative and EFSA data warehouse policy and the scope of the data included in the report.

For supported publication unique identifiers should be replaced with anonymised identifiers

Open text fields will not be included in the published datasets

Web service example and UK open by default to be added to the success stories section

Clarity sought on where supported and self-published datasets should be published in the Publication Office portals

Section to be added on governance, this would include the publication of structural metadata as open access and in github for developers

Licenses will be discussed in the next web conference and recommendations/conclusion addressed at the meeting in March

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

6. Best practice

WG members asked to check whether anything in the report is contrary to national or EU best practice

7. Next meetings

DATE	TIME	Location
6-7/03/2018	10 - 15	Parma
10/04 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference

Evidence Management Unit

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Publication of scientific data from EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys

Held on 28 November 2017, Web conference

Participants

- Working Group Members:

Andrea Maldonado, Attila Tirian, David Foster, Heli Tapanainen, Jelena Sogel, Jose Saez Llorente, Sian Thomas

- European Commission

- EFSA:

DATA: Jane Richardson (Chair)

RASA Barnabas Czomba

RASA: Friedemann Ringwald

DTS: Ivana Marsic

LEGAL: Citlali Pintado

5.2 Citation, versioning and persistence

It was agreed that all publishers must provide either a DOI (digital object identifier) or a URI (uniform resource identifier) to ensure persistence and allow the source of datasets to be cited.

The issues related to timestamping and history management of web services were discussed. There are significant costs related to implementing these functions and this expense is difficult to justify.

The conflict between tracking re-use and adopting an open approach with no requirements for user registration was discussed. The number of downloads was identified as a useful mechanism for valuing data assets.

5.3. Data synchronisation and maintenance

Three cases where the publication of a dataset were identified

- 1) A data steward in a Member State identifies or is notified of a data quality concern and requests the republication of a dataset
- 2) Cases where the EFSA process "Correction of a published scientific output" is triggered linked to one or more datasets cited in the output and the republication of the output occurs
- 3) Errors are identified during the analysis and preparation of subsequent annual reports, in particular where trend analysis is included in the output

In each case the normal policy for correction of data should be followed and for supported publications an amended dataset republished as a new version with information provided on that nature of the amendment.

5. AOB

The use case for developing a catalogue translation tool in the open source software Knime was discussed. Ensuring the latest version of the catalogues can be obtained was identified as an issue and the option downloading the published annual major version versus using catalogue web services was discussed.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

Apologies were received from Eileen O’Dea, Carol Riccalton.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with one minor change. The development of a tool to facilitate catalogue translation was added as AOB.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the Working Group Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of minutes of the last working group

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 7 November 2017 were discussed. The approach for self-publishers was clarified. The publication of datasets should be according to the organisations open data policy in relation to the definition of regional datasets (e.g. England, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland). The report will describe the minimum metadata requirements. The updated minutes are to be adopted by written procedure.

5.1 Review of metadata examples

The variables to be excluded for reasons of data protection were reviewed. It was agreed that the selected variables were acceptable and according to previous agreements achieved under public access to document requests, however for self-publishers if national policy allowed additional information could be provided. With the agreement of the variables for exclusion the working group decided there would be no requirement for datasets to be aggregated and that they could be published as reported to the EFSA data collection framework.

6. Next meetings

DATE	TIME	Location
16/01 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference
13/02 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference
6-7/03/2018	10 - 15	Parma
10/04 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference

Evidence Management Unit

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Publication of scientific data from EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys

Held on 07 November 2017, Web conference

(Agreed on 4 12 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Attila Tirian, Andrea Maldonado, Jose Saez Llorente, David Foster, Jelena Sogel, Heli Tapanainen

- **European Commission**

Agnieszka Zajac

- **EFSA**

DATA: Jane Richardson (Chair)

RASA Barnabas Czomba

RASA: Friedemann Ringwald

LA: Citlali Pintado

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Jane Richardson welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Eileen O'Dea, Carol Riccalton and Sian Thomas

Attila Tirian did not participate in agenda point 6.2.4. in the afternoon.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the Working Group Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 17 September as web conference.

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 27 September 2017 were agreed.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Interoperability

The Working Group reviewed the frequency and spatial scope for the publication of datasets. It was decided that datasets will be published at least annually or in conjunction with an EFSA output. For "Supported publications" a dataset/s will be published for each country whereas self-publishers may chose and appropriate regional scale for publication.

The variables to be excluded from publication will be based on the [Circle of Trust](#) approach and agreements already made for public access to document requests.

For "Supported publications": Regional information should be limited to country level. Administrative identifiers (e.g. animal or herd) would be removed. Free text fields, especially describing products, brand names and comments would be removed. labCode would be removed, since for small countries with single labs this could breach personal data to be

protected in accordance with Regulation (EC) No 45/2001¹. For food consumption surveys there is an ongoing discussion related to public access to document requests and the working group would accept the decision reached in these discussions. However, it was noted that for a consistent approach, also for food consumptions surveys regional information should be limited to country level. For foodborne outbreaks the level of detail in the vehicle and place of exposure needs to be analysed. `sampPoint` was highlighted variable for removal as in small countries with few food business operators personal data protection could be an issue. However this variable is scientifically valuable and should be retained if possible. Self-publishers may choose to publish the information above or additional information according to their own data protection policies.

It was agreed that coded variables (where terminology codes are reported) do not need to be translated for publication, due to file size issues and considering the need for translations in national languages. However linking to the catalogues should be simple for any end users. The working group proposed to analyze possible user-friendly solutions for catalogue integration. Compound elements would be extracted as individual variables as part of the publication process.

The format for dataset publications will be [CSV](#) with [JSON](#) as an addition where technically possible.

5.2. Sampling standards, protocols, other supporting materials and scientific context

To have sufficient information for users to determine the reuse possibilities of a dataset, the metadata is crucial. The following minimum metadata items were identified by the Working Group: title, author, description, publication date, keywords, links and a contact. Links to documentation and visualizations can provide scientific context.

The title will have the name of the data collection and the country (ISO3166-1alpha2 format).

The author will consist of the contributing authorities and not specific names.

The description should include purpose or objective, coverage, constraints, assumptions, data collection method, information about

¹ Regulation (EC) No 45/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 December 2000 on the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data by the Community institutions and bodies and on the free movement of such data, OJ L 8, 12.1.2001, p. 1–22.

anonymization. The description has to be in an easy to read manner to shortly describe the data and should be suitable for automatic translation to increase discoverability.

The publication is the date of the publication

The keywords should enable users to find similar content. For integration with the EU data portal eurovoc domains and concepts should be specified and temporal and spatial coverage reported.

Depending on the frequency of publication, links should be made to legislation, annual reports / national reports, terminology, data models, survey protocols, visualizations and guidelines. This would not be applicable to real-time/web services data publication

A functional e-mail should be provided as a contact for further information.

For “Supported Publications”, since the datasets will generally be published annually, it was proposed to publish a country level dataset to which new versions would be added annually. This approach is suitable for data collected using the same methodology. Should the data collection methodology change substantially a new annual series of dataset would be published.

6. Next meetings

DATE	TIME	Location
16/01 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference
13/02 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference
6-7/03/2018	10 - 15	Parma
10/04 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference

Evidence Management Unit

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Publication of scientific data from EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys

Held on 27 September 2017, Web conference

(Agreed on 8 November 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Jose Saez Llorente, David Foster, Eileen O'Dea, Jelena Sogel, Heli Tapanainen, Sian Thomas, Atila Tirian, Andrea Maldonado

- **European Commission**

Carol Riccalton
Agnieszka Zajac

- **EFSA:**

DATA: Jane Richardson (Chair)

DTS: Ivana Marsic

RASA: Barnabas Czomba

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Jane Richardson welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Citlali Pintado.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the Working Group Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Approval of Minutes of Meeting

The Minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held 5th and 6th September were approved by the Working Group Members and hearing experts having attended the meeting.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Open Data Success Stories

The Working Group reviewed the success stories about open data activities added to the technical report. The Working Group will add the missing success stories and adapt existing stories based on the discussion. It was agreed to add a section on benefits from open data and to indicate the different levels of "Open Data Readiness" across Europe and therefore propose two publishing options "Self-publishing" where the competent authority publishes the data or "Supported publication" where EFSA publishes the data on behalf the competent authority as background documentation of its scientific outputs.

5.2. Data Ownership

An analysis of definitions of data ownership was presented with the conclusion that it seems there is no specific definition of data ownership in European Union legislation. In addition, many actors contribute to the generation of scientific monitoring and survey data (e.g. official sampling officers, survey planners, laboratory technicians, competent authorities, regional authorities and Federal States). Therefore it was proposed to align the process for data publication with the spirit of Directive 2003/98/EC on the re-use of public sector information¹ which states in Recital (16) "*making public all generally available documents held by the public sector — concerning not only the political process but also the legal and administrative process — is a fundamental instrument for extending the right to knowledge, which is a basic principle of democracy. This objective is applicable to institutions at every level, be it local, national or international.*"

¹ OJ L 345, 31.12.2003, p. 90–96.

The Working Group identified that by taking this direction the issues of anonymization, compliance with personal data protection requirements, citation and monitoring reuse, interoperability and licensing will need to be addressed. These topics will all be tackled in the subsequent meetings. The Office for Publications provided links to resources on these topics and best practice in the Member States.

5.3. Publication of datasets

The Working Group agreed that datasets should be publically available prior to the publication of an EFSA scientific output using this data (e.g. Annual Reports) and the datasets should be citable and persistent, without prejudice to Article 38(1) of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002². For “Supported Publication” the approval process would be aligned with data collection processes which require Member State representatives to “confirm” the data can be used for EFSA scientific outputs and can be published prior the adoption of EFSA’s scientific output. This ensures transparency and allows the citation of all data used in an output.

6. Next meetings

DATE	TIME	Location
28/11 2017	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference
16/01 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference
13/02 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference
6-7/03/2018	10 - 15	Parma
10/04 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference

² Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 28 January 2002 laying down the general principles and requirements of food law, establishing the European Food Safety Authority and laying down procedures in matters of food safety, OJ L 31, 1.2.2002, p. 1–24.

Evidence Management Unit

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Publication of scientific data from EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys

Held on 5 September 2017, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 27/09/2017)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:²**

Jose Saez Llorente, David Foster, Eileen O’Dea, Jelena Sogel, Heli Tapanainen, Sian Thomas, Atila Tirian

- **Hearing Experts³:**

Ignacio Vazquez, Valeria Pesce

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Carol Riccalton

- **EFSA:**

DATA: Jane Richardson (Chair)

LA: Citlali Pintado

DTS: Fabrizio Abbinante, Ivana Marsic

AMU: Monica Aryeetey

RASA: Barnabas Czomba

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

The Chair, Jane Richardson welcomed the participants.
Apologies were received from Andrea Maldonado.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Expert (s)

Ignacio Vazquez is invited to present his experience of a request for public access to documents in relation to acrylamide data.

Valeria Pesce invited to present international activities in the area of open agricultural and nutrition data.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁶

5.1. The Publication of scientific data from EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys working group and EFSA activities in Open Data

Jane Richardson presented an overview of EFSA activities related with Open Data; [Knowledge Junction](#) project; EFSA DATA ecosystem; objectives of the working group meetings as well as terms of reference.

The output of the working group activities is preparation of the technical report 'Publication of scientific data from EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys' due April 2018. Item

5.2. EU Open Data Portal

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ Please add the following link to the EFSA's register of questions and substitute YYYY and NNNNN accordingly
<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-YYYY-NNNNN>

Carol Riccalton presented the activities of the European Publications Office. The [EU Open Data Portal](#) (ODP) is a single point of access of open data produced by EU institutions and bodies in high quality machine readable formats searchable in different languages. The [European Data Portal](#) is a metadata catalogue of public sector information available on public data portals across European countries. The importance of the use of Digital Object Identifiers (DOI) and Uniform Resource Identifiers (URI) was highlighted. The European Publications office is a registration agency for DOIs and is collaborating with DataCite.

5.3. Public access to data

Citlali Pintaldo presented EFSA's reactive transparency process in case access to data is requested by the public, in accordance with Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001 on public access to documents. The legal background and framework to the access to documents requests was presented. The public access to documents Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001 applies to all the institutions, agencies and bodies of the EU while individual Member States have their own legislation regarding freedom of information. EU institutions, agencies and bodies are required to provide compelling justifications, such as commercially sensitive information, on-going decision-making processes to support their decisions not to share data. The recent case law developments we presented regarding access to data from databases, falling in the scope of Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001 and on the application of Regulation (EC) No 1367/2006 on access to environmental information. While clarifications regarding the access to pesticides residues data were recently provided by the Union Courts, in other sectors EFSA is doing a case by case assessment of whether Regulation (EC) No 1367/2006 should apply.

5.4. International Open Data Initiatives and the Global Agricultural Concept Scheme

Valeria Pesce presented activities under the [GODAN](#) project which was an output of the G8 International Conference on Open Data for Agriculture. The initiative focuses on building high-level support among governments, policymakers, international organizations and business. She highlighted the [Global Agricultural Concept Scheme \(GACS\)](#), a global map of [data standards](#), on-going activities in science-based ontologies (OBO Foundry) and the proposal of a working group on food classifications as examples of international collaborations to establish a global Data Hub linking all partners.

5.5. Data user perspective: Changing Markets

Ignacio Vázquez presented his experience of making a public access to documents request for acrylamide data to understand whether industry proposed mitigation measures were reducing acrylamide levels. He explained that the process felt too long and bureaucratic, that ownership issues meant that some data was not made available and data was

released in stages. In addition for Changing markets information on Brand names is of public interest and should be made public. He encouraged EFSA and MS to strengthen the design of their sampling programme as to maximise data collection and improve coverage, as their analysis showed this to be heterogeneous. He also indicated that the requirement for legal and technical knowledge to engage in this process poses significant barriers to small organisations/individuals and encouraged EFSA and MS to proactively release this information through the open data initiative.

5.6. Open Food and Feed Safety Data in Spain

Jose Saez Llorente explained that for zoonoses and antimicrobial resistance monitoring the Spanish Ministry of Agriculture is the data owner and the data collection is centralised. The Ministry regularly publishes reports in pdf format including aggregated tables and statistics. Additional information can be made available upon request but farm/establishment information is subject to data protection.

5.7. Open Food and Feed Safety Data in Sweden

David Foster explained that the mission of the Ministry and SLV (Swedish PSI-act 2010) is to make publicly available all open data. He indicated that The Food Database, Monitoring data on pesticides and Black list are already available as a REST API or for download under Creative Commons 4.0 and that more datasets will become available in 2018/19.

5.8. Open Food and Feed Safety Data in Ireland

Eileen O'Dea explained that mission of the Department of Public Expenditure and Reform (DPER) is for Ireland to become a leader in Open Data. Enforcement data from the Irish Food Safety Authority (FSAI) is already accessible through data.gov.ie. However there could be legal issues as National Legislation SI117 transposing Reg.882/2010 includes restrictions on the release of information to the public. The FSAI is developing a data strategy and architecture with the goal of making data along the food chain readily available to members of the public.

5.9. Open Food and Feed Safety Data in Estonia

Jelena Sogel explained that the Veterinary and Food Board (VFB) has a role in coordinating food and feed monitoring and the data is stored in the central [JVIS database](#). Information on food and feed establishments, registered food additives, approved veterinarians are already publically available through a online query interface. Summary reports are published on the VFB website and the member of the public can request additional information.

5.10. Open Food and Feed Safety Data in Finland

Heli Tapanainen explained that National Institute for Health and Welfare (THL) provides public access to the FINDIET surveys (Finnish nutritional

monitoring survey) through an interactive data visualisation platform and aggregated tables can be downloaded in excel format. The survey data is part of the THL biobank where all participants have signed an informed consent for their data to be stored and used for public health research. Access to the biobank data requires researchers ensure their work has scientific value, has ethics approval and that strict data security procedures are applied. The Finnish food composition database ([Fineli](#)) is available for download with a Creative Commons 4.0 license. THL is improving public engagement by developing APIs and organising hackathon events.

5.11. Open Food and Feed Safety Data in United Kingdom

Sian Thomas presented Data Stories from the UK. They have a data strategy that states the organisation is open by default. The journey to open data required the identification of their information assets and the development of a process to publish their [data catalogue](#) and [reference data](#). The data within the catalogue has as DOI, URI and metadata according to the DCAT standard. The publication and subsequent reuse of the allergy alerts dataset was highlighted. This dataset was published with an API so that patient groups could target rapid messaging to their members according to their allergen profiles. The creation of a data catalogue has facilitated the use of multiple datasets to gain better insight (e.g. Food Hygiene Rating Scheme data with laboratory results) and effective prioritisation of new data collection activities.

5.12. Open Food and Feed Safety Data in Hungary

Atilla Tirian explained that the National Food Chain Safety Office is developing a data warehouse which centralises data from official control activities. This will combine information from over 100 transactional IT systems and including some processes which are currently paper based. Data is co-owned by the central and local authorities, access is dependent on the users role within the organisation. Reports and summary tables are published routinely, work is ongoing to improve accessibility.

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Publication of scientific data from EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys

Held on 6 September 2017, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 27/09/2017)⁷

Participants

- **Working Group Members:⁸**

Jose Saez Llorente, David Foster, Eileen O’Dea, Jelena Sogel, Heli Tapanainen, Sian Thomas, Atila Tirian

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Carol Riccalton

- **EFSA:**

DATA: Jane Richardson (Chair)

LA: Citlali Pintado

DTS: Fabrizio Abbinante, Ivana Marsic

AMU: Monica Aryeetey

RASA: Barnabas Czomba

6. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Jane Richardson welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Andrea Maldonado.

7. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

⁷ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

⁸ Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

8. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest¹⁰, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

9. Scientific topic(s) for discussion¹¹

9.1. Data Brain storming: Opportunities and challenges for food and feed safety open data

The Working Group identified the following critical topics to be addressed in the technical report; Scope of the report, Approval for publication, Data aggregation and anonymization, Interoperability, Information reuse (context and sampling plans), Data ownership, Persistence, Success stories and incentives, Citation and versioning, Data synchronisation and maintenance, Licensing and legal issues, End users, Data protection, Examples best practice.

9.2. Review of table of contents of the technical report

The working group agreed the following terms of reference for the technical report

- 1) Review of current European activities in the area of publishing food and feed safety datasets
- 2) Define the process for proactively making publically available the data from
 - official controls sampling (Regulation (EU) 2017/625 Article 2¹²);

⁹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

¹⁰ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

¹¹ Please add the following link to the EFSA's register of questions and substitute YYYY and NNNNN accordingly <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-YYYY-NNNNN>

¹² Regulation (EU) 2017/625 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 15 March 2017 on official controls and other official activities performed to ensure the application of food and feed law, rules on animal health and welfare, plant health and plant protection products, amending Regulations (EC) No 999/2001, (EC) No 396/2005, (EC) No 1069/2009, (EC) No 1107/2009, (EU) No 1151/2012, (EU) No 652/2014, (EU) 2016/429 and (EU) 2016/2031 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Council Regulations (EC) No 1/2005 and (EC) No 1099/2009 and Council Directives 98/58/EC, 1999/74/EC, 2007/43/EC, 2008/119/EC and 2008/120/EC, and repealing Regulations (EC) No 854/2004 and (EC) No 882/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Council Directives 89/608/EEC, 89/662/EEC, 90/425/EEC, 91/496/EEC, 96/23/EC, 96/93/EC and 97/78/EC and Council Decision 92/438/EEC (Official Controls Regulation), OJ L 95, 7.4.2017, p. 1-142.

- EU coordinated monitoring programmes and surveys;
 - data supplied under *ad hoc* calls for data under the remit of EFSA;

and stored in the EFSA scientific data warehouse or released by national food and feed safety organisations.

9.3. EFSA tools for collaborative working

EFSA presented the online tools to be used by the working group members

10. Next meeting(s)

DATE	TIME	Location
27/09 2017	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference
07/11 2017	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference
28/11 2017	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference
16/01 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference
13/02 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference
6-7/03/2018	10 - 15	Parma
10/04 2018	11-13 & 14-16	Web conference