

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on

Safety risks arising from the production and consumption of insects as food and feed

Held by teleconference on 18th September 2015 from 9.00 to 12.00

Agreed on 19 October 2015

Participants

- **Working Group Members:** Birgit Noerrung (chair), Dorte Lau Baggesen, Nanna Roos, Anne Katrine Lundebye, Monika Neuhäuser-Berthold, Ine van Der Fels-Klerx, Gerhard Flachowsky, Michael Bonsall, Adrian Charlton, Antonia Ricci and Henk van Loveren.
- **European Commission:** Wolfgang Trunk and Siret Surva (DG SANTE).
- **EFSA:** Tilemachos Goumperis (SCER unit).

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Just Vlák.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI see Annex I. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 31 August, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 31 August 2015 were agreed.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

The draft Opinion on production and consumption of insects as food and feed was presented to the Plenary meeting of Scientific Committee of EFSA on 15 September 2015 by the Chair of the Working Group.

The Scientific Committee welcomed the revised document and provided final suggestions for revisions.

The working group members discussed these suggestions and prepare the final draft that will be shared with the Scientific Committee to be adopted via written procedure.

ANNEX I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST WITH WAIVERS: in his ADoI, Dr. Adrian Charlton declared the following interest: Occasional consultancy to the German Senate Commission on Food Safety and the UK Food Standards Agency. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted as regards his participation to the Scientific Committee working group on the safety assessment of insects as food and feed.

Dr. Adrian Charlton updated his ADoI following the change of status of FERA, now FERA Science Limited, to a non-FSO organisation. The review of the new DOI did not lead to any change regarding the conclusion of the waiver.

Therefore the concerned expert shall be allowed to take part in the discussions and in the drafting phase of the opinion of the above mentioned working group.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on

Safety risks arising from the production and consumption of insects as food and feed

Held by teleconference on 31st August 2015 from 13.00 to 16.00

Agreed on 11 September 2015

Participants

- **Working Group Members:** Birgit Noerrung (chair), Just Vlak, Dorte Lau Baggesen, Nanna Roos, Anne Katrine Lundebye (via teleconference), Monika Neuhäuser-Berthold, Ine van Der Fels-Klerx, Gerhard Flachowsky and Henk van Loveren.
- **European Commission:** Siret Surva (DG SANTE).
- **EFSA:** Tilemachos Goumperis (SCER unit).

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Michael Bonsall, Adrian Charlton and Antonia Ricci.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADol see Annex I. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 18-19 June, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 18-19 June 2015 were agreed.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

The working group members reviewed the new version of the draft Opinion that was produced based on the contributions of working group experts after the previous meeting.

A new version of the document will be prepared incorporating the comments and discussions during the meeting. This version will be shared with the Scientific Committee in order to be tabled for discussion and possible adoption at the Scientific Committee Plenary on 15 September.

According to the mandate, the deadline for the adoption of the Opinion is end September 2015.

ANNEX I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST WITH WAIVERS: in his ADoI, Dr. Adrian Charlton declared the following interest: Occasional consultancy to the German Senate Commission on Food Safety and the UK Food Standards Agency. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted as regards his participation to the Scientific Committee working group on the safety assessment of insects as food and feed.

Dr. Adrian Charlton updated his ADoI following the change of status of FERA, now FERA Science Limited, to a non-FSO organisation. The review of the new DOI did not lead to any change regarding the conclusion of the waiver.

Therefore the concerned expert shall be allowed to take part in the discussions and in the drafting phase of the opinion of the above mentioned working group.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on

Safety risks arising from the production and consumption of insects as food and feed

Held on 18 June (13.00-18.00) and 19 June 2015 (8.30-12.30) in Parma, Italy

Agreed on 31 August 2015

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:** Birgit Noerrung (chair), Just Vlak, Dorte Lau Baggesen, Adrian Charlton, Antonia Ricci, Nanna Roos, Anne Katrine Lundebye (via teleconference), Monika Neuhäuser-Berthold, Ine van Der Fels-Klerx, Gerhard Flachowsky and Henk van Loveren
- **EFSA:** Tilemachos Goumperis (SCER unit)
- **European Commission (DG SANTE)** (via teleconference): Siret Surva (on 18 and 19 June), Wolfgang Trunk (on 18 June)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Michael Bonsall.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI see Annex I. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft table of contents - discussion on draft sections

The draft final version of the Opinion that was produced after the previous meeting was presented to the Scientific Committee (SC) plenary on 8-10 June 2015 for a first reading and discussion. The Chair of the WG explained chapter per chapter the principle information and concepts for the assessment. The SC welcomed the document and provided some comments to be considered by the WG.

The WG discussed on the comments received from the SC and on additional contributions that experts had provided. Further discussion will take place at the next meeting with view to table the Opinion for discussion and possible adoption at the SC Plenary on 15-16 September.

5. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held via teleconference on 31 August 2015.

ANNEX I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST WITH WAIVERS: in his ADoI, Dr. Adrian Charlton declared the following interest: Occasional consultancy to the German Senate Commission on Food Safety and the UK Food Standards Agency. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted as regards his participation to the Scientific Committee working group on the safety assessment of insects as food and feed.

Dr. Adrian Charlton updated his ADoI following the change of status of FERA, now FERA Science Limited, to a non-FSO organisation. The review of the new DOI did not lead to any change regarding the conclusion of the waiver.

Therefore the concerned expert shall be allowed to take part in the discussions and in the drafting phase of the opinion of the above mentioned working group.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on

Safety risks arising from the production and consumption of insects as food and feed

Held on 7 May (13.00-18.00) and 8 May (8.30-12.30) 2015 in Parma, Italy

Agreed on 18 May 2015

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:** Birgit Noerrung (chair), Just Vlak, Dorte Lau Baggesen, Adrian Charlton, Antonia Ricci, Nanna Roos, Anne Katrine Lundebye (via teleconference), Michael Bonsall and Henk van Loveren.
- **EFSA:** Tilemachos Goumperis (SCER unit)
- **European Commission (DG SANTE)** (via teleconference): Siret Surva (on 7 May), Sirkuu Heinimaa (on 8 May), Wolfgang Trunk (on 7 May).

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Monika Neuhäuser-Berthold, Ine van Der Fels-Klerx and Gerhard Flachowsky.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI see Annex I. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft table of contents - discussion on draft sections

The WG discussed on the sections that experts had provided. Further discussion will take place in the next meeting.

A draft final version of the Opinion will be prepared by 13 May 2015 to be tabled for discussion at the Scientific Committee plenary meeting on 8-10 June. The deadline for the adoption of the Opinion is end September 2015.

5. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 18 and 19 June 2015.

ANNEX I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST WITH WAIVERS: in his ADoI, Dr. Adrian Charlton declared the following interest: Occasional consultancy to the German Senate Commission on Food Safety and the UK Food Standards Agency. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted as regards his participation to the Scientific Committee working group on the safety assessment of insects as food and feed.

Therefore the concerned expert shall be allowed to take part in the discussions and in the drafting phase of the opinion of the above mentioned working group.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on

Safety risks arising from the production and consumption of insects as food and feed

Held on 18 March (13.00-18.00) and 19 March (8.30-12.30) 2015 in Parma, Italy

Agreed on 30 April 2015

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:** Birgit Noerrung (chair), Just Vlak, Monika Neuhäuser-Berthold, Dorte Lau Baggesen, Antonia Ricci, Ine van Der Fels-Klerx, Nanna Roos, Anne Katrine Lundebye, Gerhard Flachowsky, Michael Bonsall and Henk van Loveren.
- **EFSA:** Tilemachos Goumperis (SCER unit), Pietro Stella (BIOCONTAM unit)
- **European Commission (DG SANTE, E6 unit):** Siret Surva (via teleconference)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Adrian Charlton. Henk van Loveren participated on 19 March only.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI see Annex I. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft table of contents - discussion on draft sections

The WG discussed on the sections that experts had provided. Further discussion will take place in the next meeting.

A draft final version of the Opinion should be ready by end May to be tabled for discussion at the Scientific Committee meeting on 8-10 June. The deadline for the adoption of the Opinion is end September 2015.

5. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 7 and 8 May 2015.

ANNEX I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST WITH WAIVERS: in his ADoI, Dr. Adrian Charlton declared the following interest: Occasional consultancy to the German Senate Commission on Food Safety and the UK Food Standards Agency. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted as regards his participation to the Scientific Committee working group on the safety assessment of insects as food and feed.

Therefore the concerned expert shall be allowed to take part in the discussions and in the drafting phase of the opinion of the above mentioned working group.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

Minutes of the 5th meeting (second day; 20 February) of the Working Group on Safety risks arising from the production and consumption of insects as food and feed
Held on 20 February 2015 (9:00-17:00) in Brussels, Belgium

Agreed on 18 March 2015

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:** Birgit Noerrung (chair), Just Vlak, Monika Neuhäuser-Berthold, Dorte Lau Baggesen, Antonia Ricci, Ine van Der Fels-Klerx and Henk van Loveren.
- **EFSA:** Tilemachos Goumperis (SCER unit)
- **European Commission (DG SANTE):** Wolfgang Trunk and Siret Surva

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Adrian Charlton, Nanna Roos, Anne Katrine Lundebye, Gerhard Flachowsky and Michael Bonsall.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI see Annex I. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Draft table of contents - discussion on draft sections

The WG discussed on the sections that experts had provided. Further discussion will take place in the next meeting.

4.2 Workshop with stakeholders (review of the meeting held on 19 February 2015)

The WG agreed on that the workshop with stakeholders was very useful. The information received from the stakeholders will assist the development of these sections of the opinion for which there are no or limited data and information published in the scientific literature or in other sources.

5. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Parma on 18 and 19 March 2015.

ANNEX I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST WITH WAIVERS: in his ADoI, Dr. Adrian Charlton declared the following interest: Occasional consultancy to the German Senate Commission on Food Safety and the UK Food Standards Agency. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted as regards his participation to the Scientific Committee working group on the safety assessment of insects as food and feed.

Therefore the concerned expert shall be allowed to take part in the discussions and in the drafting phase of the opinion of the above mentioned working group.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

Minutes of the 5th meeting (first day; 19 February) of the Working Group on Safety risks arising from the production and consumption of insects as food and feed

Held on 19 February 2015 (10:00-18:00) in Brussels, Belgium

Agreed on 18 March 2015

Participants

Working Group Experts: Birgit Noerrung (chair), Just Vlak, Adrian Charlton, Nanna Roos, Monika Neuhäuser-Berthold, Dorte Lau Baggesen, Antonia Ricci, Ine van Der Fels-Klerx, Henk van Loveren and Anne Katrine Lundebye.

Hearing Experts:

- Paul Vantomme; Food and Agricultural Organisation (FAO)
- Venik (the Dutch insect producers association): Margot Calis (Kreca, The Netherlands) and Jonathan Koppert (Koppert Biological Systems, The Netherlands)
- International Producers of Insects for Feed and Food (IPIFF): Tarique Arsiwalla (Protix, The Netherlands) and Antoine Hubert (Ynsect, France)
- GREEINSECT research consortium: David Drew (Agriprotein; South Africa) by teleconference and (ii) Prof. Yupa Hanboonsong (Khon Kan University, Thailand).
- PROtelINSECT research consortium: Geert Bruggeman (Nutrition Biosciences; Belgium) and Richou Han (Guangdong Entomological Institute (GEI), Guangzhou, China) by teleconference.

EFSA: Tilemachos Goumperis (Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks unit)

European Commission (DG SANTE, E6 unit): Sirkku Heinimaa and Siret Surva

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Gerhard Flachowsky and Michael Bonsall.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI see Annex I. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

4. Hearing experts

Hearing experts were invited to present their view on the questions listed in Annex II. EFSA invited them to submit an ADoI prior to the meeting.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Presentation of the EC mandate and objectives of the WG

The EC mandate was presented to the hearing experts by the chair of the WG.

The assessment will follow a risk profile approach. Moreover, the following points are part of the Terms of Reference:

- the list of species provided in the mandate is indicative; it is not expected to assess the risks for each one of these species;
- the hazards that will be identified should be placed in the context of those from other sources of protein;
- importation of insects and products thereof, but not importation of live insects.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

On the other hand, the Terms of Reference do not include:

- risks associated with the accidental release of insects;
- animal health and welfare of insects;
- products of apiculture;
- contamination of insects by pesticide residues;
- hazards from insects harvested from the wild;
- assessment of nutritional value (benefits)

5.2 Hearing experts presentations

The hearing experts presented the following topics:

- | | |
|---|------------------------------------|
| • Insect farming and consumption worldwide | Paul Vantomme |
| • Current status of insect production for food | Margot Calis |
| • Presentation of Venik, the Dutch insect producers association | Jonathan Koppert |
| • Current status of insect production for feed | David Drew |
| • Cricket production for food; the Thailand perspective | Yupa Hanboonsong |
| • Insect production systems for feed in China | Richou Han |
| • Overview of insect for food and feed processing systems | Tarique Arsiwalla & Antoine Hubert |
| • Quality assurance and safety of insect products as food and feed; expectations of feed industry | Geert Bruggeman |

5.3 Discussion on selected questions

A plenary discussion followed on selected questions that are listed in Annex II. The information provided by the hearing experts will be annexed to the Scientific Opinion.

ANNEX I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST WITH WAIVERS: in his ADoI, Dr. Adrian Charlton declared the following interest: Occasional consultancy to the German Senate Commission on Food Safety and the UK Food Standards Agency. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted as regards his participation to the Scientific Committee working group on the safety assessment of insects as food and feed.

Therefore the concerned expert shall be allowed to take part in the discussions and in the drafting phase of the opinion of the above mentioned working group.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

ANNEX II

Questions⁵ proposed to the hearing experts:

1. Which are the major insect species used for food and feed production?
2. a. Which substrates are presently used and which have greatest potential to be used as feed for insect production?
b. What are the criteria for selecting substrates? What are the properties of the substrates?
c. What kind of processing these substrates are subject to prior to their use?
3. What are the harvesting practices?
4. Which are the products (whole insects and processed products) available already on the market and which are foreseen to be available in the future?
5. What are the present and anticipated volumes produced inside and outside Europe?
6. How do you assess safety aspects (e.g. use of antibiotics and pesticides in the chain, presence of pathogens) of (i) the substrates; (ii) the insects and (iii) the products?
7. Are there safety data of edible insects (e.g. chemical residues, occurrence data on pathogenic microorganisms, antinutrients, chitin)?
8. Which are the most common production processes (e.g. killing practices, heat treatment, time intervals, solvents for fat extraction)?
9. Which are the storage and distribution practices?
10. Are there Good Manufacturing Process manuals for insect production and processing?
11. Are there data on consumption (as food and feed, including aquaculture)?
12. Are there data on allergenicity?
13. What is the fate of the waste from insect farming (e.g. is it used on arable land)?
14. How do you consider environmental consequences of production and processing e.g. utilization of residual material and by-products?

⁵ Note: The questions to the industry stakeholders referred to the state-of-the-art and forecasting, both inside and outside the EU and covered insects and products thereof for food and feed.

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on

Safety risks arising from the production and consumption of insects as food and feed

Held on 20 January 2015 (8:30-16:00), in Parma, Italy

(Agreed on 13 February 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:** Birgit Noerrung (chair), Gerhard Flachowsky (by teleconference), Adrian Charlton, Michael Bonsall (by teleconference), Nanna Roos, Monika Neuhäuser-Berthold, Dorte Lau Baggesen, Antonia Ricci, Ine van Der Fels-Klerx (by teleconference), Henk van Loveren and Anne Katrine Lundebye.
- **EFSA:** Tilemachos Goumperis (SCER unit), Pietro Stella (BIOCONTAM unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Just Vlæk.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI see Annex I. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4.1 Draft table of contents - discussion on draft sections

The WG discussed on the sections that experts had provided. Further discussion will take place in the next meeting.

4.2 Workshop with stakeholders

The WG welcomed the experts proposed by insect producers associations and research project consortia to participate as hearing experts to the workshop with stakeholders that is going to take place in Brussels on 19 February 2015.

The WG agreed on more precise questions on selected topics for the identified experts based on the additional information that seeks from the stakeholders.

5. Next meetings

The next meeting will be held in Brussels on 19 and 20 February 2015.

ANNEX I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST WITH WAIVERS: in his ADoI, Dr. Adrian Charlton declared the following interest: Occasional consultancy to the German Senate Commission on Food Safety and the UK Food Standards Agency. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted as regards his participation to the Scientific Committee working group on the safety assessment of insects as food and feed.

Therefore the concerned expert shall be allowed to take part in the discussions and in the drafting phase of the opinion of the above mentioned working group.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on

Safety risks arising from the production and consumption of insects as food and feed

Held on 4 December 2014 (8:30-16:30), in Parma, Italy

(Agreed on 20 January 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:** Birgit Noerrung (chair), Gerhard Flachowsky, Adrian Charlton, Michael Bonsall, Nanna Roos, Monika Neuhäuser-Berthold, Dorte Lau Baggesen, Antonia Ricci, Ine van Der Fels-Klerx, Henk van Loveren and Anne Katrine Lundebye (by teleconference).
- **EFSA:** Tilemachos Goumperis (SCER unit)
- **European Commission (DG-SANCO):** Marina Marini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Just Vlák.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI see Annex I. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Brief outline of the mandate and objectives of the WG³ (EFSA-Q-2014-00578)

The working group (WG) discussed on some parts of the Terms of Reference. In particular, the WG noted that authenticity of insects and products thereof should not be discussed as food/feed fraud is a risk management issue.

The WG noted that the opinion should describe not only the state of the art in the EU, but also:

- Acknowledge practices outside EU e.g. referring to case studies in third countries;
- Examine practices beyond the EU legislative framework e.g. use of substrates or applications not covered by or currently not permitted by the legislation.

4.2 Draft table of contents - discussion on draft sections

The WG discussed on the draft table of contents and on the draft text that experts had provided. Drafting of chapters was assigned to experts with a view to discuss on them in the next meeting.

With regards to potential risks from importation of insects and products thereof from countries outside the EU, the WG decided that a separate chapter will not be needed, as the issue will be discussed within the other chapters.

4.3 Workshop with stakeholders

For transparency reasons, the WG agreed to invite the associations and research project consortia to propose one to two experts instead of inviting directly individual private companies. FAO shall be invited as well.

4.4 Literature search

The WG noted that the lists of references from already published documents could be used for the development of the opinion. These documents include:

- Member State risk assessments
- Scientific publications (reviews) of WG members
- The FAO publication “edible insects” (2013)

Support from EFSA may be asked if needed later on for specific parts of the mandate.

5. Next meetings

The WG agreed on the following meeting dates:

- 20 January 2015, Parma
- 19 and 20 February, Brussels. First day will be the meeting of the working group with stakeholders and second day a meeting of the working group
- 18 afternoon and 19 morning March, Parma
- 7 afternoon and 8 morning May, Parma
- 18 afternoon and 19 morning June, Parma

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2014-00578>

ANNEX I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST WITH WAIVERS: in his ADoI, Dr. Adrian Charlton declared the following interest: Occasional consultancy to the German Senate Commission on Food Safety and the UK Food Standards Agency. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁵, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted as regards his participation to the Scientific Committee working group on the safety assessment of insects as food and feed.

Therefore the concerned expert shall be allowed to take part in the discussions and in the drafting phase of the opinion of the above mentioned working group.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014>

Scientific Committee
Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on
Safety risks arising from the production and consumption of insects as food and feed
Held on 11 November 2014 (14:00-16:00), by web-conference

(Agreed on 18 December 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Birgit Noerrung (chair), Gerhard Flachowsky, Anne Katrine Lundebye, Just Vlak, Michael Bonsall, Nanna Roos, Monika Neuhäuser-Berthold

- **EFSA:**

Tilemachos Goumperis (SCER unit), Wolfgang Gelbmann (NUTRI), Winy Messens (BIOCONTAM)

- **European Commission (DG-SANCO):**

Sirkku Heinimaa, Wolfgang Trunk, Marina Marini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Dorte Lau Baggesen, Antonia Ricci, Ine van Der Fels-Klerx and Henk van Loveren.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 3 November 2014 via web-conference

The minutes of the previous meeting were agreed.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Clarifications on the Terms of Reference³ (EFSA-Q-2014-00578)

The WG discussed some parts of the Terms of Reference with Commission representatives. Clarifications were asked for the environmental assessment and the importation assessment requested by the mandate.

The WG also discussed what to include in the table of content of the draft opinion. More discussion will be held on this issue at the next meeting.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will take place in Parma on 4 December 2014.

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2014-00578>

Scientific Committee
Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on
Safety risks arising from the production and consumption of insects as food and feed
Held on 3 November 2014 (8:30-11:30), by web-conference

(Agreed on 18 December 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Birgit Noerrung (chair), Gerhard Flachowsky, Anne Katrine Lundebye, Monika Neuhäuser-Berthold, Antonia Ricci, Nanna Roos, Ine van Der Fels-Klerx, Henk van Loveren, Just Vlak

- **EFSA:**

Tilemachos Goumperis (SCER unit)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Dorte Lau Baggesen and Michael Bonsall.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without change.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

4.1 Presentation of the mandate⁶ (M-2014-0150; EFSA-Q-2014-00578)

The chair presented the mandate outlining the objectives of the activities of the WG. The WG agreed that the opinion that will be developed should follow a risk profile approach.

4.2 Organization of the activities of the WG

The WG agreed on a draft Table of Contents and discussed the working plan.

4.3 Timelines for the activities of the WG

It is expected that the draft opinion will be submitted to the EFSA Scientific Committee for discussion in June 2015. According to the mandate, the opinion shall be adopted by September 2015.

A workshop with stakeholders from the area of edible insects (such as breeders, processors, research groups, national authorities and the European Commission) will be organised early 2015 in order to get insights on production, processing and consumption of insects and products thereof.

4.4 Risk assessments in Member States

The EFSA Focal Points of Member States and EFTA countries were asked to share existing and on-going risk assessments on the safety of insects as food and feed performed in their country. The WG was updated on risk assessments at national level and the timelines for future publications.

4.5 Literature search

The mandate foresees the possibility of performing a literature search to assist the development of the opinion. The WG discussed the need of a literature search since some of the WG members published or submitted scientific papers on the topic. In addition, other sources of scientific literature include a number of published review scientific papers and risk assessments at national level. The WG shall decide the need and extend of a literature search in the meeting on 4 December.

5. Next meetings

The next meetings will take place on 11 November (via web-conference) and on 4 December 2014 (in Parma).