

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on Phorbol Esters in Jatropha Kernel Meal

Held by WEB-conference, 14 October 2015

(Agreed on 14 October 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Bruce Cottrill (chair)
Stefano Dall'Acqua
Johanna Fink-Gremmels
Harinder Makkar
Manfred Metzler

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete (European Commission)

- **EFSA:**

Biological hazards and contaminants Unit: Karen Mackay

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 10-11 September 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 10-11 September 2015 were agreed by written procedure on 18 September 2015.³

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft opinion on phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445)⁴

The Working Group discussed the updates made to the draft opinion following the discussion and comments received during the CONTAM Plenary and agreed on final amendments to be done.

The chair of the WG decided that after the amendments are completed, the draft opinion will be presented to CONTAM Panel for possible written adoption, by the end of October 2015.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencpolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwgs/documents/phorboljatrophawg.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-20134-00445>

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

TBC

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on Phorbol Esters in Jatropha Kernel Meal

Held on 10-11 September 2015, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 18 September 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Bruce Cottrill (chair)

Stefano Dall'Acqua

Johanna Fink-Gremmels¹

Harinder Makkar

Manfred Metzler

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete² (European Commission)

- **EFSA:**

Biological hazards and contaminants Unit: Karen Mackay

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ Participated on 10 September 2015

² Participated by tele/web conference 10 September 1700-1800 h/ 11 September 0830-0915 h

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 04-05 May 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 14-15 July 2015 were agreed by written procedure on 28 July 2015.⁵

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft opinion on phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445)⁶

The Working Group discussed and reviewed all sections of the draft opinion.

The Working Group finalised the discussions on the draft opinion and agreed on the final amendments to be done. The chair of the WG decided that after the amendments are completed, the draft opinion will be presented at the next CONTAM Panel meeting for discussion and possible adoption.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwqs/documents/phorboljatrophawg.pdf>

⁶ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-20134-00445>

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

TBD

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Phorbol Esters in Jatropha Kernel Meal

Held on 14-15 July 2015, Utrecht (The Netherlands)

(Agreed on 28 July 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Bruce Cottrill (chair)
Stefano Dall'Acqua
Johanna Fink-Gremmels
Harinder Makkar
Manfred Metzler

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete¹

- **EFSA:**

Biological hazards and contaminants Unit: Karen Mackay

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ Participated on 14 July.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 04-05 May 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 15 June 2015 were agreed by written procedure on 24 June 2015.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft opinion on phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445)⁵

The Working Group discussed the draft opinion and in particular the introductory sections (methodology, chemistry and methods of analysis), and the assessment sections, including occurrence, detoxification, feed consumption & exposure, hazard identification & characterisation, dose response assessment, risk characterisation and uncertainty. Further revisions were proposed to these sections of this draft scientific output.

6. Any Other Business

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwqs/documents/phorboljatrophawg.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-20134-00445>

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

10-11 September 2015

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Phorbol Esters in Jatropha Kernel Meal

Held by WEB-conference, 15 June 2015

(Agreed on 24 June 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Bruce Cottrill (vice-chair)

Stefano Dall'Acqua

Johanna Fink-Gremmels

Harinder Makkar

Manfred Metzler (chair)

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

None

- **EFSA:**

Biological hazards and contaminants Unit: Karen Mackay

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies were received from Frans Verstraete.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 04-05 May 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 04-05 May 2015 were agreed by written procedure on 22 May 2015.³

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft opinion on phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445)⁴

The Working Group discussed the draft opinion and in particular the sections on the introduction, chemistry and methods of analysis, occurrence, feed consumption and exposure, hazard identification and uncertainty. Further revisions were proposed to these sections of this draft scientific output.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwqs/documents/phorboljatrophawg.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-20134-00445>

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

14-15 July 2015

Parma, 05 May 2015
EFSA/CONTAM/2464

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal

Held on 04 - 05 May 2015 EFSA, Parma
(Agreed on 22 May 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Bruce Cottrill (vice-chair), Stefano Dall'Acqua, Johanna Fink-Gremmels, Harinder Makkar, Manfred Metzler (chair).
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Frans Verstraete (DG SANCO)¹
- **EFSA:**
 - **Biological hazards and contaminants unit:** Karen Mackay
- **Others:**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in

¹ Participated by Web conference on 04 May from 1430-1500h and on 05 May from 0830 – 0900h.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the previous Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 30 April 2015.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft opinion on phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445)⁴

The Working Group discussed the comments received from the CONTAM Panel at the plenary meeting on 30 April 2015. The draft opinion was discussed and in particular the sections on chemistry, methods of analysis, detoxification processes, hazard identification and characterisation and uncertainty analysis. Further revisions were proposed to these sections of this draft scientific output.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

15 June 2015.

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-20134-00445>

Parma, 20 April 2015
EFSA/CONTAM/2461

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal
Held by WEB-conference, 20 April 2015
(Agreed on 30 April 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Bruce Cottrill (vice-chair), Stefano Dall'Acqua, Johanna Fink-Gremmels, Harinder Makkar, Manfred Metzler (chair).
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Frans Verstraete (DG SANTE)
- **EFSA:**
 - BIOCONTAM Unit: Karen Mackay
- **Others:**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the previous Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 30 March 2015.³

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft opinion on phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445)⁴

The Working Group discussed the draft opinion and in particular the sections on the introduction, chemistry and methods of analysis, detoxification, occurrence, feed consumption and exposure, mode of action and general conclusions. Further revisions were proposed to these sections of this draft scientific output.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

04-05 May 2015

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwgs/documents/phorboljatrophawg.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-20134-00445>

Parma, 06 March 2015
EFSA/CONTAM/2412

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal

Held by WEB-conference, 06 March 2015
(Agreed on 30 March 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Bruce Cottrill (vice-chair), Stefano Dall'Acqua¹, Harinder Makkar, Manfred Metzler (chair).
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - None
- **EFSA:**
 - BIOCONTAM Unit: Karen Mackay
- **Others:**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Johanna Fink-Gremmels and Frans Verstraete.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest³, EFSA

¹ Participated from 1300-1500h

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the previous Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 12-13 February 2015, were agreed. ⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft opinion on phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445)⁵

The Working Group discussed the draft opinion, focussing mainly on the following sections: introduction, chemistry, methods of analysis, occurrence and detoxification processes. Further revisions were proposed to these sections of this draft scientific output.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

20 April 2015.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwgs/documents/phorboljatrophawg.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-20134-00445>

Parma, 13 February 2015
EFSA/CONTAM/2394

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal

Held on 12-13 February 2015 EFSA, Parma
(Agreed on 13 February 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Bruce Cottrill (vice-chair) has participated via teleconference, Stefano Dall'Acqua, Johanna Fink-Gremmels, Harinder Makkar, Manfred Metzler (chair).
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Frans Verstraete¹ (DG SANTE)
- **EFSA:**
 - BIOCONTAM Unit: Karen Mackay
- **Others:**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest³, EFSA

¹ Participated on 12 February 2015.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the previous Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 18-19 December 2014, were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft opinion on phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445)⁵

The Working Group discussed the draft opinion and in particular the sections on the introduction, chemistry and methods of analysis, detoxification processes, occurrence, feed consumption, exposure and hazard identification. Further revisions were proposed to these sections of this draft scientific output.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

06 March 2015.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwgs/documents/phorboljatrophawg.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-20134-00445>

Parma, 19 December 2014
EFSA/CONTAM/2357

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal

Held on 18-19 December 2014 EFSA, Parma
(Agreed on 19 December 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Bruce Cottrill (vice-chair), Stefano Dall'Acqua, Johanna Fink-Gremmels, Harinder Makkar, Manfred Metzler (chair).
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Frans Verstraete (DG SANCO)¹
- **EFSA:**
 - BIOCONTAM Unit: Karen Mackay, Nicklas Gustavsson², Barbara Dörr³
- **Others:**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest⁵, EFSA

¹ Participated by Web conference 0930h-1200h on 18 Dec 2014 and 0900h-1200h 19 Dec 2014.

² Participated from 1100-1200h on 18 Dec 2014.

³ Participated from 0900-1130h on 19 Dec 2014.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the previous Working Group meeting.

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 24 November 2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft opinion on phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445)⁶

The Working Group discussed the draft opinion and in particular the sections on the introduction, data & methodologies, chemistry, methods of analysis, detoxification processes, occurrence, feed consumption, exposure assessment and hazard identification. Further revisions were proposed to these sections of this draft scientific output.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

12-13 February 2015.

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-20134-00445>

Parma, 7th November 2014
EFSA/CONTAM/2312

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal
Held on 07 November 2014 by WEB-conference
(Agreed on 24 November 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Manfred Metzler (chair), Bruce Cottrill (vice-chair), Johanna Fink-Gremmels.
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Frans Verstraete (DG SANCO)
- **EFSA:**
 - BIOCONTAM Unit: Karen Mackay, Nicklas Gustavsson.
- **Others:**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Stefano Dall'Acqua and Harinder Makkar.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the previous Working Group meeting.

Not applicable.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Draft opinion on phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445)³

The working group (WG) discussed the terms of reference, the table of contents of the draft opinion and the meeting plan. Tasks were distributed among the WG members to draft the chapters of this opinion.

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable.

7. Next meeting

18-19 December 2014.

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-20134-00445>