

Parma, 12-13 5 2015
EFSA/CONTAM/2449

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Chlorate in Food
12-13 May 2015
(Agreed on 25 05 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Christiane Vleminckx (Chair), Helle Knutsen (Vice-chair), Diane Benford, Tanja Schwerdtle, Jean-Charles Leblanc¹

- **Hearing Experts²**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete, Veerle Vanheusden

- **EFSA**

- **BIOCONTAM Unit:** Hans Steinkellner,
- **DATA Unit:** Jose Angel Gomez Ruiz

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ Participated via tele web

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group Meeting held on 8-9 April 2015, Brussels.

The minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 8-9 April 2015 were agreed⁵.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion of the scientific opinion on chlorate in food (EFSA-Q-2014-00534)⁶

The WG experts discussed the draft opinion. In particular the chapters on occurrence, exposure assessment, risk characterisation, uncertainties and the conclusions. The WG Chair agreed that the draft opinion should be sent to the CONTAM Panel for possible adoption at the next CONTAM Plenary,

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencpolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwgs/documents/contamchloratefood.pdf>

⁶ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/?wicket:interface=:2:::>

Parma, 17 4 2015
EFSA/CONTAM/2443

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Chlorate in Food
8-9 April 2015
(Agreed on 17 04 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Christiane Vleminckx (Chair), Helle Knutsen (Vice-chair)¹, Diane Benford, Tanja Schwerdtle, Jean-Charles Leblanc²

- **Hearing Experts³**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete, Veerle Vanheusden⁴

- **EFSA**

- **BIOCONTAM Unit:** Hans Steinkellner, Barbara Doerr⁵
- **DATA Unit:** Davide Arcella⁶

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ Participated via tele web

² Participated via teleweb on Day 1 9.00 am – 13.00 pm

As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>,

⁴ Participated only on Day1

⁵ Participated only on Day 1 via tele web

⁶ Participated only on Day 1 via tele web

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁷ and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest⁸, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group Meeting held on 23 March 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 23 March 2015 were agreed⁹.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion of the scientific opinion on chlorate in food (EFSA-Q-2014-00534)¹⁰

The WG discussed the revised opinion. Particular emphasis was given to chapters on occurrence, exposure and risk characterisation, uncertainties and conclusions. Further tasks were allocated and timelines agreed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

12-13 May 2015

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencpolicy.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwgs/documents/contamchloratefood.pdf>

¹⁰ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/?wicket:interface=:2:::>

Parma, 24 3 2015
EFSA/CONTAM/2425

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Chlorate in Food
Held by Tele-conference, 23 March 2015
(Agreed on 31 03 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Christiane Vleminckx (Chair), Helle Knutsen (Vice-chair), Diane Benford, Tanja Schwerdtle

- **Hearing Experts¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete, Veerle Vanheusden

- **EFSA**

- **BIOCONTAM Unit:** Hans Steinkellner, Barbara Doerr
- **DATA Unit:** Davide Arcella, Jose Angel Gomez Ruiz

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were given for Jean-Charles Leblanc.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group Meeting held on 5-6 March 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 5-6 March 2015 were agreed⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion of the scientific opinion on chlorate in food (EFSA-Q-2014-00534)⁵

The experts discussed the scientific opinion, especially draft text that had been provided since the last meeting. Comments were addressed and amendments were made accordingly. The occurrence data and exposure assessment was presented and the approach to exposure assessment was agreed. Further tasks were allocated.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

8-9 April 2015, Brussels

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencpolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwgs/documents/contamchloratefood.pdf>

⁵ <http://registrofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/?wicket:interface=:2:::>

Parma, 5-6 3 2015
EFSA/CONTAM/2416

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Chlorate in Food
Parma, 5-6 March 2015
(Agreed on 13 03 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Christiane Vleminckx (Chair)¹, Helle Knutsen (Vice-chair)², Diane Benford, Tanja Schwerdtle³, Jean-Charles Leblanc⁴

- **Hearing Experts⁵**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Veerle Vanheusden⁶

- **EFSA**

- **BIOCONTAM Unit:** Hans Steinkellner, Barbara Doerr, Marco Binaglia⁷
- **DATA Unit:** Davide Arcella⁸, Jose Angel Gomez Ruiz⁹

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ Participated via telephone both days

² Chaired the WG meeting Day 1 and Day 2

³ Participated only on Day 2 9am-10:10am (via telephone)

⁴ Participated only on Day 2 (via telephone)

⁵ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

⁶ Participated only on Day 2 (via telephone)

⁷ Participated only on Day 2 11:10am-1pm

⁸ Participated only in Day 2 9am-12:40pm

⁹ Participated only on Day 2 9am-12:40pm

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were given for Tanja Schwerdtle and Jean-Charles Leblanc on Day 1.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹⁰ and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest¹¹, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group Meeting held on 9-10 February 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 9-10 February 2015 were agreed¹².

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion of the scientific opinion on chlorate in food (EFSA-Q-2014-00534)¹³

The experts discussed the scientific opinion, especially draft text that had been provided since the last meeting. Comments were addressed and amendments were made accordingly. The chapters on toxicity and risk characterisation were discussed in greater detail. Additionally the occurrence data and exposure assessment was discussed and timelines were established. Further tasks were allocated.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

23 March 2015 (Tele-conference)

¹⁰ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

¹¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

¹² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwgs/documents/contamchloratefood.pdf>

¹³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/?wicket:interface=:2:::>

Parma, 9-10 2 2015
EFSA/CONTAM/2382

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Chlorate in Food
Held by TELE-conference, 9-10 February 2015
(Agreed on 18 02 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Christiane Vleminckx (Chair), Helle Knutsen (Vice-chair), Diane Benford, Tanja Schwerdtle, Jean-Charles Leblanc¹

- **Hearing Experts²**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete³, Veerle Vanheusden

- **EFSA**

- **BIOCONTAM Unit:** Hans Steinkellner, Barbara Doerr, Marco Binaglia⁴, Katleen Baert⁵
- **DATA Unit:** Davide Arcella⁶

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ Participated Day 1

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ Participated Day 2

⁴ Participated Day 1 10:00 – 11:00

⁵ Participated Day 2

⁶ Participated Day 2

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were given for Jean-Charles Leblanc on Day 2.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁷ and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest⁸, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group Meeting held on 19-20 January 2015, Parma.

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 19-20 January 2015 were agreed⁹.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion of the scientific opinion on chlorate in food (EFSA-Q-2014-00534)¹⁰

The experts discussed the toxicology chapters and the approach to take for setting health based guidance values. Additionally, concerns about the quality of occurrence data were discussed more and timelines for a preliminary exposure assessment were established. The draft texts provided for the chapters on literature search strategy, toxicity and previous occurrence were discussed and amended according to the comments made. Further tasks were allocated.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

5-6 March 2015

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwgs/documents/contamchloratefood.pdf>

¹⁰ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/?wicket:interface=:2:::>

Parma, 23 1 2015
EFSA/CONTAM/2377

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Chlorate in Food
19-20 January 2015
(Agreed on 30 1 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Christiane Vleminckx (Chair)¹, Helle Knutsen (Vice-chair), Diane Benford, Tanja Schwerdtle.

- **Hearing Experts²**

Rudolf Pfeil

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete³, Veerle Vanheusden

- **EFSA**

- **BIOCONTAM Unit:** Hans Steinkellner, Barbara Doerr, Marco Binaglia⁴, Katleen Baert⁵
- **DATA Unit:** Davide Arcella⁶, Eniko Varga⁶

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ Participated via telephone Day 1 14:00-16:30, Day 2 9:00-12:30

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

³ Participated Day 2

⁴ Participated Day 2 9:00-11:00

⁵ Participated Day 1 14:00-16:00

⁶ Participated Day 1 14:00-16:00

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Jean-Charles Leblanc.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁷ and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest⁸, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group Meeting held on 24-25 November 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 24-25 November 2014 were agreed⁹.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion of the scientific opinion on chlorate in food (EFSA-Q-2014-00534)¹⁰

The experts discussed the occurrence data that were available on chlorate in food and drinking water and the line to take for carrying out an exposure assessment. Then the draft texts provided for the chapters on toxicity were discussed and amended according to the comments made. Further tasks were allocated.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

9-10 February 2015

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwgs/documents/contamchloratefood.pdf>

¹⁰ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/?wicket:interface=:2:::>

Parma, 25 11 2014
EFSA/CONTAM/2333

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Chlorate in Food
24-25 November 2014
(Agreed on 25 11 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Christiane Vleminckx (Chair), Helle Knutsen (Vice-chair), Diane Benford, Tanja Schwerdtle

- **Hearing Experts¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete²,

- **EFSA**

- **BIOCONTAM Unit:** Hans Steinkellner, Barbara Doerr, Nicklas Gustavsson³

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received by Jean-Charles Leblanc and Veerle Vanheusden.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² Present only on 25 November 2014

³ Present only on 24 November 10.00-11.00 CET

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on declarations of interest⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group Meeting held on 7 October 2014, Parma.

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 7 October 2014 were agreed⁶.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Discussion of the scientific opinion on chlorate in food (EFSA-Q-2014-00534)⁷

First the structure of the opinion was discussed. The experts discussed the chapters on methodology for the literature search, chemistry and hazard assessment. Further tasks were allocated.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

19-20 January 2015

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencpolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/contamwgs/documents/contamchloratefood.pdf>

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/?wicket:interface=:2:::>

Parma, 20 10 2014
EFSA/CONTAM/2302

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Chlorate in Food
7 10 2014, 13 - 17 CET, tele web conference
(Agreed on 16 10 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Christiane Vleminckx, Helle Knutsen, Diane Benford, Jean-Charles Leblanc, Tanja Schwerdtle

- **Hearing Experts**

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete, Veerle Vanheusden

- **EFSA BIOCONTAM Unit:**

Hans Steinkellner, Barbara Doerr, Nicklas Gustavsson

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests,² EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the previous Working Group Meeting

Not applicable.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Discussion of the scientific opinion on chlorate in food (EFSA-Q-2014-00534)

The experts discussed terms of reference of the mandate and agreed on a provisional structure and content of the opinion. The members of the Working Group asked the requestor (European Commission) for some clarification in relation to the terms of reference. The European Commission will provide its clarification by revising the terms of reference accordingly. The literature compiled was presented and the members of the Working Group discussed the new format of the opinion and tasks were distributed.

5. Next meeting

24 – 25 November 2014