



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS AND CONTAMINANTS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS BIOCONTAM UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 6th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON a “request for an update of the scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease”

WEB-conference, 18 July 2019

(Agreed on 25 July 2019)¹

Participants

■ Working Group Members:²

Olivier Andreoletti
Sylvie L. Benestad
Emmanuel Comoy
Romolo Nonno
Giuseppe Ru
Marion M. Simmons (Chair)

■ Hearing Experts³:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

BIOCONTAM Unit: Maria Teresa da Silva Felicio, Maria Francesca Iulietto, Angel Ortiz Pelaez.

■ Others:

Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies received

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 19-20 June 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 19-20 June 2019 were agreed by written procedure on 4 July 2019⁶.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members discussed Section 4 (Answers to the ToRs) of the draft opinion. Agreements were made regarding changes in the current draft. Tasks were allocated to EFSA staff and WG experts⁷.

6. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

7. Next meeting(s)

This was the last WG meeting scheduled.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/biological-hazards/wg-chronic-wasting-disease.pdf>

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00763>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS BIOCONTAM UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 5th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON a “request for an update of the scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease”

Held on 19-20 June 2019, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 5 July 2019)¹

Participants

■ Working Group Members:²

Olivier Andreoletti
Sylvie L. Benestad
Emmanuel Comoy
Romolo Nonno
Giuseppe Ru
Marion M. Simmons (Chair)

■ Hearing Experts³:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

BIOCONTAM Unit: Maria Francesca Iulietto, Angel Ortiz Pelaez.

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies received

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with a change. The agenda of day 2 was rescheduled from 08:00h to 16:00h.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 30 April 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 30 April 2019 were agreed by written procedure on 9 May⁶.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members discussed Section 2 (Data and Methodologies), Section 3 (Assessment) and Section 4 (Answers to the ToRs) of the draft opinion. Agreements were made regarding changes in the current draft. Tasks were allocated to EFSA staff and WG experts⁷.

6. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/biological-hazards/wg-chronic-wasting-disease.pdf>

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00763>



7. Next meeting(s)

The date of the 6th WG meeting was fixed following the availability expressed during the meeting. It will take place as a web-conference, on Thursday 18 July 2019, 09:00-13:00.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS BIOCONTAM UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 4th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON a “request for an update of the scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease”

WEB-conference, 30 April 2019

(Agreed on 9 May 2019)¹

Participants

- Working Group Members:²
 - Olivier Andreoletti
 - Sylvie L. Benestad
 - Emmanuel Comoy
 - Romolo Nonno
 - Giuseppe Ru
 - Marion M. Simmons (Chair)
- Hearing Experts³:
 - Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Sara Perucho Martinez (DG SANTE)
- EFSA:
 - BIOCONTAM Unit: Teresa Da Silva Felicio, Maria Francesca Iulietto, Angel Ortiz Pelaez.
- Others:
 - Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies received

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with a change. Point 6 of the Draft Agenda "Review section 2. Data and Methodologies" was eliminated, following the proposal of the chair, due to shortage of time.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 26 March 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 26 March 2019 were agreed by written procedure on 1 April⁶.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members discussed Section 3 (Assessment) and Section 4 (Answers to the ToRs) of the draft opinion. Agreements were made regarding changes in the current draft. Tasks were allocated to EFSA staff and WG experts⁷

6. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

7. Next meeting(s)

The date of the 5th WG meeting was announced following the availability expressed prior to the meeting. It will take place as a 1.5-day physical meeting in Parma, on Wednesday 19 June 14:00-18:00 and Thursday 20 June 8:30-16:30.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/biological-hazards/wg-chronic-wasting-disease.pdf>

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00763>



BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS AND CONTAMINANTS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS BIOCONTAM UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON a “request for an update of the scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease”

WEB-conference, 26 March 2019

(Agreed on 1 April 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Olivier Andreoletti
 - Sylvie L. Benestad
 - Emmanuel Comoy
 - Romolo Nonno
 - Giuseppe Ru
 - Marion M. Simmons (Chair)
- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Sara Perucho Martinez (DG SANTE)
- EFSA:
 - BIOCONTAM Unit: Maria Francesca Iulietto, Angel Ortiz Pelaez.
- Others:
 - Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies received

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 24-25 January 2019, Parma.

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 24-25 January 2019 were agreed by written procedure on 4 February 2019⁴.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG members discussed the contributions received on the draft opinion. Agreements were made regarding the review/redrafting of the draft opinion. Tasks were allocated to EFSA staff and WG experts⁵

6. Any Other Business

The Chair thanked the participants and closed the meeting.

7. Next meeting(s)

The date of the next WG meeting could not be fixed but it will take place at the end of April / beginning of May 2019. The Secretariat will circulate a doodle poll for the WG members to express their availability.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/biological-hazards/wg-chronic-wasting-disease.pdf>

⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2018-00763>

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on a "request for an update of the scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease"

Held on 24-25 January 2019, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 4 February 2019)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Olivier Andreoletti, Sylvie Benestad, Emmanuel Comoy, Romolo Nonno, Giuseppe Ru, Marion M. Simmons (Chair)

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Teresa da Silva Felicio, Maria Francesca Iulietto, Angel Ortiz Pelaez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies received.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Review of the data received so far

The secretariat presented the data received from the approached researchers. Two Excel files were prepared with the data of bioassays and molecular/ biochemical studies by species and inoculum. the data received so far from 13 (out of 14) research groups provide a good picture of the combination of isolates and mouse lines in which they inoculated. With regards to the molecular studies, there are fewer groups who have submitted data (5 out 10) but there are already data covering the most important European isolates and range of PrP-species specific substrates in PMCA.

4.2. Approaches for the assessment of the ToRs⁴

The WG acknowledged the clarification of the EC on the terms transmissibility and pathogenicity in ToR1 and discussed and agreed the approaches for each of the ToRs, in the light of the data received so far. It was highlighted the fact that most of the relevant studies that eventually will produce key data for the answers to ToR1 and ToR2 are still ongoing and will not be finished and with results in the public domain within the lifespan of this mandate.

4.3. Additional data requests and table of contents

Reminders and request for clarification of the already-sent data will be sent to those approached for the bioassay and molecular studies. The Chair and Secretariat proposed a provisional table of contents. The WG reviewed and agreed new sections more in line with the discussions and agreements of this meeting. The chair proposed all WG members to add

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00763>

in bullet-point format ideas or messages they consider important to be captured in each section and coordinators for drafting each section were assigned.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

3rd meeting: Tuesday 26 March 2019 web-conference 13-17h, pending for confirmation by EFSA secretariat.

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on a "request for an update of the scientific opinion on Chronic Wasting Disease"

Held on 4 December 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 14 December 2018)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Olivier Andreoletti, Sylvie Benestad, Emmanuel Comoy, Romolo Nonno, Marion M. Simmons (Chair)

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Teresa da Silva Felicio, Angel Ortiz Pelaez.

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies received from Giuseppe Ru

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with a change.

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Update of the situation of CWD in Europe

The secretariat and a WG member presented the latest data on the situation of the surveillance and cases in Estonia, Finland, Latvia, Lithuania, Poland, Sweden, Iceland and Norway.

4.2 Mandate and Terms of reference⁴

The secretariat and the chair introduced the mandate received from the European Commission (EC) and terms of reference (ToRs). The WG discussed in detail the mandate and each of the ToR, with the aim to have a common understanding of the questions to be answered. A further clarification on two terms used in ToR1 will be sought to the EC

4.3 Scope and methodology of the evaluation

The WG discussed the methodological approaches that will be adopted for each of the three ToRs.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00763>

2nd meeting: on Thursday 24 January 2019 pm and 25 January 2019 all day as a physical meeting in Parma at EFSA HQ.