

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### BIOCONTAM Unit

## Minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the requirements for the development of microbiological criteria

**Held on 8 to 9 June 2017, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 19 June 2017)**

### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ana Allende, Jens Kirk Andersen, Birgit Nørrung (Chair), Panos Skandamis, Mieke Uyttendaele (only on 9 June) and Antonio Valero

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Maria Teresa Da Silva Felicio, Winy Messens

- **European Commission:**

DG SANCO: Pamina Mika Suzuki

- **Others:**

Visiting scientist from China National Center for Food Safety Risk Assessment (CFSA): Jianghui Zhu

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed the members of the working group (WG). Apologies were received from Mieke Uyttendaele for the first day of the meeting, 8 June 2017.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### **3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the WG members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 15 May 2017, web conference**

The minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 23 May 2017.<sup>3</sup>

### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

#### **5.1. Requirements for the development of microbiological criteria<sup>4</sup>**

The Working Group discussed in detail all contributions received on the draft opinion since the previous meeting. Tasks were allocated to the Working group Members.

### **6. Next meeting**

The next WG meeting was scheduled as follows:

- 1 September (13:00-16:30), web conference.

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/microbiologicalcriteria.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00227>

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### BIOCONTAM Unit

## Minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the requirements for the development of microbiological criteria

**Held on 15 May 2017, web conference**

**(Agreed on 23 May 2017)**

### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ana Allende, Jens Kirk Andersen, Birgit Nørrung (Chair), Panos Skandamis, Mieke Uyttendaele and Antonio Valero

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Maria Teresa Da Silva Felicio

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed the members of the working group (WG). Apologies were received from Pamina Mika Suzuki (EC).

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the WG members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 16 to 17 March 2017, Parma**

The minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 30 March 2017.<sup>3</sup>

#### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

##### **5.1. Requirements for the development of microbiological criteria<sup>4</sup>**

The Working Group discussed in detail all contributions received on the draft opinion since the previous meeting. Tasks were allocated to the Working group Members.

#### **6. Next meeting**

The next WG meeting was scheduled as follows:

- 8 June (14:00-18:00) to 9 June 2017 (8:30-14:00).

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/microbiologicalcriteria.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00227>

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### BIOCONTAM Unit

## Minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the requirements for the development of microbiological criteria

**Held on 16 to 17 March 2017, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 30 March 2017)**

### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ana Allende, Jens Kirk Andersen, Birgit Nørrung (Chair), Panos Skandamis, Mieke Uyttendaele and Antonio Valero

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Maria Teresa Da Silva Felicio, Winy Messens

- **European Commission:**

DG SANCO: Pamina Mika Suzuki (16 March and 17 March until 10:30)

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed the members of the working group (WG). No apologies were received.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the WG members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 20 February 2017, Murcia**

The minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 2 March 2017.<sup>3</sup>

#### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

##### **5.1. Requirements for the development of microbiological criteria<sup>4</sup>**

The Working Group discussed in detail all contributions received on the draft opinion since the previous meeting. Tasks were allocated to the Working group Members.

#### **6. Next meeting**

The next WG meetings were scheduled as follows:

- 15 May (9:00-12:30), web conference and
- 8 June (14:00-18:00) to 9 June 2017 (8:30-14:00) in Parma.

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/microbiologicalcriteria.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00227>

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### BIOCONTAM Unit

## Minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the requirements for the development of microbiological criteria

**Held on 20 February 2017, Murcia (Spain)**

**(Agreed on 2 March 2017)**

### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ana Allende, Jens Kirk Andersen, Birgit Nørrung (Chair), Panos Skandamis, Mieke Uyttendaele and Antonio Valero

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Maria Teresa Da Silva Felicio

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed the members of the working group (WG). No apologies were received.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest <sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the WG members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Working Group meeting held on 16 December 2016, WEB-conference**

The minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 6 January 2017.<sup>3</sup>

#### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

##### **5.1. Requirements for the development of microbiological criteria<sup>4</sup>**

The Working Group discussed in detail all contributions received on the draft opinion since the previous meeting. Tasks were allocated to the Working group Members.

#### **6. Next meeting**

The next WG meetings were scheduled as follows:

- 16 March (14:00-18:00) to 17 March 2017 (8:30-14:00) in Parma and
- 8 June (14:00-18:00) to 9 June 2017 (8:30-14:00) in Parma.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/microbiologicalcriteria.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00227>



## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### BIOCONTAM Unit

## Minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the requirements for the development of microbiological criteria

**Held on 16 December 2016, web conference**

**(Agreed on 6 January 2016)**

### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ana Allende, Jens Kirk Andersen, Birgit Nørrung (Chair), Panos Skandamis, Mieke Uyttendaele and Antonio Valero

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Maria Teresa Da Silva Felicio, Francesca Latronico

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed the members of the working group (WG). No apologies were received.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest <sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the WG members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> Working Group meeting held on 2 September 2016, Copenhagen**

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 4 November 2016.<sup>3</sup>

#### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

##### **5.1. Requirements for the development of microbiological criteria<sup>4</sup>**

The Working Group discussed in detail all contributions received on the draft opinion since the previous meeting. Tasks were allocated to the Working group Members.

#### **6. Next meeting**

The next WG meeting were scheduled as follows:

In addition the following meeting dates were agreed:

- 20 February 2017 (8:00-17:00) in Murcia,
- 16 March (14:00-18:00) to 17 March 2017 (8:30-14:00) in Parma and
- 8 June (14:00-18:00) to 9 June 2017 (8:30-14:00) in Parma.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/microbiologicalcriteria.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00227>

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### BIOCONTAM Unit

## Minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the requirements for the development of microbiological criteria

**Held on 20 to 21 October 2016, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 4 November 2016)**

### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ana Allende, Jens Kirk Andersen, Birgit Nørrung (Chair), Panos Skandamis, Mieke Uyttendaele and Antonio Valero

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Maria Teresa Da Silva Felicio, Winy Messens (only on 20 October)

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed the members of the working group (WG). Apologies were received from Pamina Mika-Suzuki (EC).

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the WG members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> Working Group meeting held on 2 September 2016, Copenhagen**

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 12 September 2016.<sup>3</sup>

#### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

##### **5.1. Requirements for the development of microbiological criteria<sup>4</sup>**

The Working Group discussed in detail all contributions received on the draft opinion since the previous meeting. Tasks were allocated to the Working group Members.

#### **6. Next meeting**

The next WG meeting will take place via web conference on 16 December from 9:00 to 12:00. In addition the following meeting dates were agreed:

- 20 February: full day physical meeting in Murcia and
- 8 June (14:00-18:00) to 9 June (8:30-14:00) in Parma.

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/microbiologicalcriteria.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00227>

## Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

### BIOCONTAM Unit

## Minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the requirements for the development of microbiological criteria

**Held on 2 September 2016, Copenhagen (Denmark)**

**(Agreed on 12 September 2016)**

### Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Ana Allende, Jens Kirk Andersen, Birgit Nørrung (Chair), Panos Skandamis and Antonio Valero

- **European Commission (DG Santé – Unit G4):**

Kris De Smet (only for brief update on interpretation of the ToRs)

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Maria Teresa Da Silva Felicio

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed the members of the working group (WG).

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the WG members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

##### **4.1. Requirements for the development of microbiological criteria<sup>3</sup>**

The Working Group discussed the self-tasking mandate received from the BIOHAZ Panel. The approach to answer all terms of reference (ToR 1 to ToR 4) was thoroughly discussed. An overview of all the previous EFSA Scientific Opinions/Reports related to microbiological criteria was provided to the WG and the WG experts agreed to do a critical review of these documents in order to answer to ToR 1. When addressing ToR 2, the WG will provide practical and useful guidance to the BIOHAZ Panel as risk assessors in future requests related to microbiological criteria. This guidance should allow the BIOHAZ Panel to address future requests in a more consistent and harmonised way. Issues such as the (i) the possible lack of data, (ii) knowledge gaps and (iii) how to deal with uncertainties when dealing with requests related to microbiological criteria will also be addressed. A review of the most important and useful available methods/tools to design microbiological criteria will be performed based on the knowledge and expertise of the WG members in order to answer to ToR 3.

It was clarified with the European Commission that this mandate does not intend to review any microbiological criteria currently defined in the EU regulation nor to propose new ones and that the focus of this mandate will be on risk assessment methodologies.

The preliminary table of contents of the draft scientific opinion was agreed and tasks were allocated to EFSA staff and Working group experts. The Working Group discussed the opportunity to hold a technical consultation with relevant stakeholders further ahead to gather information useful for the development of the Scientific Opinion (in particular to answer to ToR

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00227>

4). It was also agreed to expand the WG by inviting an additional expert from the reserve list which was prepared when establishing this WG.

## **5. Next meeting**

The next WG meeting will take place in Parma from 20 October (14:00-18:00) to 21 October (8:00-16:00).