

---

**BIOCONTAM UNIT**

**Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards**

**Minutes of the 8<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the public health risks of table eggs due to deterioration and development of pathogens**

**Held on 3 and 4/06/2014, in Parma**

**(Agreed on 04/06/2014)<sup>1</sup>**

**Participants**

- **Working Group Experts<sup>2</sup>:**
  - Marianne Chemaly, Rob Davies, Pablo Fernandez Escamez, Sophie Jan, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonia Ricci
- **Hearing expert:**
  - Thomas Humphrey
- **EFSA:**
  - BIOCONTAM Unit: Pablo Romero Barrios
- **Apologies:**
  - Francesca Martelli, Tine Hald

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Francesca Martelli and Tine Hald.

**2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

**3. Declarations of interest**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the abovementioned Working Group experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in

---

<sup>1</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname(John Smith) all throughout the document

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

**4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 12 05 2014, Parma.**

The minutes were agreed at the end of the meeting on 12 5 2014 and published on the EFSA website on 13 5 2014.

**5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

5.1. Public health risks of table eggs due to deterioration and development of pathogens ([EFSA-Q-2013-0400](#))

The outputs from the risk assessment model were discussed. The draft opinion and the contributions provided by the experts were reviewed. The experts were assigned different tasks related to further developing each of the chapters in the draft Opinion.

**6. Next meeting(s)**

The next (ninth) will take place on June 19<sup>th</sup> as a webconference.

---

**BIOCONTAM UNIT**

**Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards**

**Minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the public health risks of table eggs due to deterioration and development of pathogens**

**Held on 12/05/2014, via webconference**

**(Agreed on 12/05/2014)<sup>1</sup>**

**Participants**

- **Working Group Experts<sup>2</sup>:**
  - Marianne Chemaly, Rob Davies, Pablo Fernandez Escamez, Tine Hald, Sophie Jan, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonia Ricci
- **Hearing experts:**
  - Thomas Humphrey
- **EFSA:**
  - BIOCONTAM Unit: Pablo Romero Barrios
- **Apologies:**
  - Francesca Martelli

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Francesca Martelli.

**2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

**3. Declarations of interest**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the abovementioned Working Group experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in

---

<sup>1</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and them surname(John Smith) all throughout the document

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 14 04 2014, Parma.**

The minutes were agreed at the end of the meeting on 14 4 2014 and published on the EFSA website on 15 4 2014.

#### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

**5.1.** Public health risks of table eggs due to deterioration and development of pathogens ([EFSA-Q-2013-0400](#))

The outputs from the risk assessment model were discussed. The draft opinion and the contributions provided by the experts were reviewed. The experts were assigned different tasks related to further developing each of the chapters in the draft Opinion.

#### **6. Next meeting(s)**

The next (eighth) will take place on June 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> in Parma.

---

**BIOCONTAM UNIT**

**Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards**

**Minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the public health risks of table eggs due to deterioration and development of pathogens**

**Held on 14/04/2014, via webconference**

**(Agreed on 14/04/2014)<sup>1</sup>**

**Participants**

- **Working Group Experts<sup>2</sup>:**
  - Marianne Chemaly, Rob Davies, Pablo Fernandez Escamez, Tine Hald, Sophie Jan, Francesca Martelli, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonia Ricci
- **Hearing experts:**
  - Thomas Humphrey
- **EFSA:**
  - BIOCONTAM Unit: Pablo Romero Barrios

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

**2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

**3. Declarations of interest**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the abovementioned Working Group experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

**4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 6 and 7 03 2014, Parma.**

---

<sup>1</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and them surname(John Smith) all throughout the document

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

The minutes were agreed at the end of the meeting on 7 3 2014 and published on the EFSA website on 10 3 2014.

## **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

**5.1.** Public health risks of table eggs due to deterioration and development of pathogens ([EFSA-Q-2013-0400](#))

The inputs for the risk assessment model were discussed. The draft opinion and the contributions provided by the experts were reviewed. The experts were assigned different tasks related to further developing each of the chapters in the draft Opinion.

## **6. Next meeting(s)**

The next (seventh) meeting will take place 12<sup>th</sup> May as a webconference. A subsequent physical meeting has been agreed for June 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> in Parma.

---

**BIOCONTAM UNIT**

**Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards**

**Minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the public health risks of table eggs due to deterioration and development of pathogens**

**Held on 6 and 7/03/2014, Parma**

**(Agreed on 7/03/2014)<sup>1</sup>**

**Participants**

- **Working Group Experts<sup>2</sup>:**
  - Marianne Chemaly, Rob Davies, Pablo Fernandez Escamez, Sophie Jan, Francesca Martelli, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonia Ricci
- **Hearing experts:**
  - Thomas Humphrey
- **EFSA:**
  - BIOCONTAM Unit: Pablo Romero Barrios, Winy Messens
  - AMU Unit: Laura Martino, Fulvio Barizzone

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Tine Hald.

**2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

**3. Declarations of interest**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the abovementioned Working Group experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

---

<sup>1</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and them surname(John Smith) all throughout the document

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

#### **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 23 and 24 01 2014, Parma.**

The minutes were agreed at the end of the meeting on 24 1 2014 and published on the EFSA website on 31 1 2014.

#### **5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

**5.1.** Public health risks of table eggs due to deterioration and development of pathogens ([EFSA-Q-2013-0400](#))

The inputs for the risk assessment model were discussed. The draft opinion and the contributions provided by the experts were reviewed. The experts were assigned different tasks related to further developing each of the chapters in the draft Opinion.

#### **6. Next meeting(s)**

The next (sixth) meeting will take place 14<sup>th</sup> April as a webconference. A subsequent webconference has been agreed 12<sup>th</sup> May, at 10h CET and a physical meeting for June 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> in Parma.



---

**BIOCONTAM UNIT**

**Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards**

**Minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the public health risks of table eggs due to deterioration and development of pathogens**

**Held on 23 and 24/01/2014, Parma**

**(Agreed on 24/01/2014)<sup>1</sup>**

**Participants**

- **Working Group Experts<sup>2</sup>:**
  - Marianne Chemaly, Rob Davies, Pablo Fernandez Escamez, Thomas Humphrey, Sophie Jan, Francesca Martelli, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonia Ricci
- **EFSA:**
  - BIOCONTAM Unit: Pablo Romero Barrios, Winy Messens, Sandra Correia
  - AMU Unit: Laura Martino
- **Apologies:** Tine Hald, Miguel Prieto Maradona (24<sup>th</sup> January)

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Tine Hald, and from Miguel Prieto Maradona for the second day of the meeting.

**2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

**3. Declarations of interest**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the abovementioned Working Group experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in

---

<sup>1</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and them surname(John Smith) all throughout the document

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

The inputs for the risk assessment model were discussed. The draft opinion and the contributions provided by the experts were reviewed. The experts were assigned different tasks related to further developing each of the chapters in the draft Opinion.

#### **5. Next meeting(s)**

The next (fifth) meeting will take place 6 and 7<sup>th</sup> March in Parma. A webconference has been pencilled down for February 5<sup>th</sup> to discuss modelling issues. Subsequent webconferences have been agreed for 14<sup>th</sup> April and 12<sup>th</sup> May, both at 10h CET.

---

**BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS UNIT**

**Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards**

**Minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the public health risks of table eggs due to deterioration and development of pathogens**

**Held on 2/12/2013, Parma**

**(Agreed on 2/12/2013)<sup>1</sup>**

**Participants**

- **Working Group Experts<sup>2</sup>:**
  - Marianne Chemaly, Rob Davies, Pablo Fernandez Escamez, Tine Hald, Sophie Jan, Francesca Martelli, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonia Ricci
- **EFSA:**
  - BIOHAZ Unit: Pablo Romero Barrios
  - SAS Unit: Laura Martino
- **Apologies:** Thomas Humphrey

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Thomas Humphrey.

**2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

**3. Declarations of interest**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the abovementioned Working Group experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in

---

<sup>1</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and them surname(John Smith) all throughout the document

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

#### **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

The modelling approach and the possible model choices were discussed. The data provided by the experts for the model were reviewed and gaps were identified. The experts were assigned different tasks related to the data needs for the model, and to develop further each of the chapters in the draft Opinion.

#### **5. Next meeting(s)**

The next (fourth) meeting will take place 23 and 24 January in Parma. A webconference has been pencilled down for February 5<sup>th</sup>. A subsequent meeting date has been tentatively fixed for 6 and 7<sup>th</sup> March in Parma.

---

**BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS UNIT**

**Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards**

**Minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the public health risks of table eggs due to deterioration and development of pathogens**

**Held on 11 and 12/07/2013, Parma**

**(Agreed on 12/07/2013)<sup>1</sup>**

**Participants**

- **Working Group Experts<sup>2</sup>:**
  - Marianne Chemaly, Rob Davies, Pablo Fernandez Escamez, Sophie Jan, Francesca Martelli, Antonia Ricci
- **Hearing Experts:**
  - Thomas Humphrey
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
  - Klaus Kostenzer (DG SANCO)
- **EFSA:**
  - BIOHAZ Unit: Michaela Hempen, Winy Messens, Pablo Romero Barrios
  - BIOMO Unit: Giusi Amore
  - SAS Unit: Laura Martino

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Miguel Prieto Maradona (Working Group Expert).

**2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

**3. Declarations of interest**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding

---

<sup>1</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname(John Smith) all throughout the document

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

---

**BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS UNIT**

**Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards**

**Minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Working Group on the public health risks of table eggs due to deterioration and development of pathogens**

**Held on 3 and 4/10/2013, Parma**

**(Agreed on 4/10/2013)<sup>1</sup>**

**Participants**

- **Working Group Experts<sup>2</sup>:**
  - Marianne Chemaly, Rob Davies, Pablo Fernandez Escamez, Francesca Martelli, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonia Ricci
- **EFSA:**
  - BIOHAZ Unit: Winy Messens, Pablo Romero Barrios
  - SAS Unit: Laura Martino
- **Apologies:** Thomas Humphrey, Sophie Jan

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Thomas Humphrey (Hearing expert) and Sophie Jan (Working Group expert).

**2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

**3. Declarations of interest**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the abovementioned Working Group experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

---

<sup>1</sup> The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and them surname(John Smith) all throughout the document

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

#### **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

The draft opinion and new contributions were reviewed. The modelling approach and the possible model choices were discussed. The experts were assigned different tasks related to the data needs for the model, and to develop further each of the chapters in the draft Opinion.

#### **5. Next meeting(s)**

The next (third) meeting will take place as a webconference in late November or early December, date to be determined. A subsequent meeting date has been tentatively fixed for 23 and 24 January.

Declarations of Interests<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the abovementioned Working Group experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

In the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) Thomas Humphrey declared the following interest: CONSULTACY ACTIVITIES ON TESTING PROTOCOLS FOR *SALMONELLA* IN EGGS AND ENVIRONMENTAL SAMPLES. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest. This conflict was mitigated by the fact that he was invited only as a hearing expert to the Working Group meeting. He was invited to provide information on growth and deposition of *Salmonella* in eggs due to his extensive expertise.

#### **4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion**

The ToRs of the mandate (EFSA-Q-2013-00400) were discussed in detail. A preliminary Table of Contents was agreed. The experts assigned to develop further each one of the chapters in the draft Opinion were identified.

#### **5. Next meeting(s)**

The next (second) meeting will take place in Parma on 3 October from 9:00 until 17:00 and on 4 October 2013 from 9:00 until 12:30.

---

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>