



UNIT Animal Health and Plant Health

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

## MINUTES OF THE 1<sup>st</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

**Held on 28 August 2018, Parma**

**(Agreed on 08 September 2019)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

■ Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>

Paolo CALISTRI (Chair), Miguel MIRANDA (Vice Chair), Dominique BICOUT, Simon GUBBINS, Federica MONACO. The following WG members attended via teleconference: Veronique CHEVALIER, Bernard BETT.

■ Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:

Laure DOMMERGUES, Catherine CETRE-SOSSAH (teleconference), Clazien DEVOS (teleconference)

■ EFSA:

ALPHA: Sotiria-Eleni ANTONIOU, Alessandro BROGLIA, Sofie DHOLLANDER, Yves VAN DER STEDE

AMU: Josè CORTIÑAS, Alexandra PAPANIKOLAOU

TS:Marco Conterbia

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Marina MARINI and Dimitrios DILAVERIS from the European Commission.

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The mandate was presented (see here [presentation](#)), indicating for ToR the possible approach and methodology. The deadline for the 3 scientific outputs foreseen is indicated in the presentation in the last slide.

### 4.1. Item<sup>6</sup>: risk of entry of RVF into EU

- Global distribution of RVF (ToR 1.1): The global epidemiological situation related to RVF will be updated starting from the information contained in RVF story maps (2017, [link](#)). Only the new information compared to the story map will be reported and the sources quoted, focusing on the aspects that are relevant for the risk posed by RVF to EU, e.g. changes or new patterns in the epidemiology of the disease. Any information and data on the involvement of the wildlife and on the available and new diagnostic methods and vaccines as well as the effectiveness of vaccination will be included. Tasks are indicated in the draft opinion.
- Regionalisation (ToR 1.2): Sofie DHOLLANDER provided some explanations on the regionalisation of the European Countries implemented for the MINTRISK and clarified that the model takes into consideration only one pathway for the introduction of RVF, i.e. live animals for breeding purposes (cattle, small ruminants, camels).
- The WG decided to discuss and select other possible pathways for the introduction of RVF into EU and to review the literature and the data that may indicate an increased risk in some areas or countries close to EU (e.g. North Africa and Middle East). Even if the risk of introduction remains the same this should be justified and clearly described. The pathways of the introduction of the RVF in EU that are going to be assessed will include those related to live animals, vectors, animal products, humans. The proximity of some countries with the infected ones or with some that maybe of high risk, maybe a factor that increases the risk while illegal activities could be a risk for any country and it is a parameter that cannot be quantified and measured.
- MINTRISK model: the model was presented by Clazien DEVOS and an exercise took place to understand how it works and what changes can be implemented. MintRisk could be used for assessing risk of introduction into EU both into regions and into each MS at risk. It was decided to review the data needed to answer the

---

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>6</sup> Please add the following link to the EFSA's register of questions and substitute YYYY and NNNNN accordingly  
<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-YYYY-NNNNN>

specific questions of MintRisk related to risk of entry , questions 7, 8, 9 (see [excel file](#) "input MintRisk" sheet "Entry", in the online folder DATA > MINTRISK)

#### **4.2. Item: [impact and control in Mayotte](#)**

- Overwintering (TOR 2.1): from the information provided the RVF epidemic in Mayotte was continuing over the winter due to favourable temperature all year around and humidity due to rainy season, thus reflecting a different (or no ) seasonality compared to temperate areas. By the spread model the seasonality can be tested as well.
- Spread model: Simon presented how the bluetongue model could be adapted to RVF (see [ppt](#)), for vectors, the model considers: biting rate, mortality rate, seasonal activity, overwintering
- ToR 2, Situation in Mayotte: Laure DOMMERGUES provided information on the recent outbreaks in Mayotte and analysed the main epidemiological aspects: pathways of introduction and transmission, protentional risk factors, farming systems, climatic conditions, price drivers, control measures implemented, surveillance activities in place.
- Public Health issues: Public health issues are not going to be included in the opinion, it is focused on the impact on animal populations.
- Effectiveness of the control measures (TOR2.3): the model used for Lumpy Skin Disease may be implemented to the RVF as well with some modifications.
  - The main problem is the feasibility of applying the control measures in the Mayotte reality as foreseen by the mandate, this should be clarified with EC if it makes sense to assess the effectiveness of measures whose application in the reality could be unfeasible, like stamping out (total and partial) with or without vaccination (preventive vaccination or after the occurrence of the disease).The length of the radius of the protection and the surveillance zones and the measures implemented there, should be included in the assessment as well.
  - Also the vector control and biosecurity measures need to be estimated in relation to the feasibility that some environmental conditions (forests, national parks, water lands; rivers, lakes) and farming systems (free grazing herds) allow.
- Effectiveness of the Surveillance strategies in Mayotte (TOR 2.4): The model implemented for the Lumpy Skin Disease can be used as well for characterising the surveillance strategies for RVF. Basically the model was used to estimate the prevalence that the disease would reach after different times post-introduction, or estimate the time lag needed to achieve a certain detectable prevalence. Sample size and sampling frequency could be then estimated accordingly.

#### **4.3. Item: [surveillance and control in EU](#)**

To answer this ToR again it was discussed that the spread model can be also used to simulate epidemics and control scenarios after point introduction in Europe. Introduction in 2-3 areas representatives for situation of vectors and climate in whole Europe can be done, e.g. incursion in Spain, incursion in Romania and incursion in the Netherlands.

## **5. Task distribution**

Distribution of the tasks and responsibilities: in the draft opinion uploaded in Teams the name of the WG members to which tasks are assigned and the deadline for completion are indicated

<b>What</b>	<b>Who</b>	<b>By when</b>
Draft sections related to Epidemiological situation in section 3.1 of the draft opinion. If possible, please report the used literature in format like Endnote, Ris, BibTex, etc.	Names of the experts to whom each topic is assigned are indicated in <b>blue</b> in the draft	30th September
ToR 1.1: Table with P for countries representing RVF risk for EU	Dominique	30 <sup>th</sup> Sept
review in details how Mintrisk computes the probability of entry for each country	Dominique	30th Sept
Section 3.2.1: Short review of the pathways of introduction	Paolo and Veronique (animals), Catherine (animal products and humans), Miguel (vectors)	30th September
Section 3.2: Fill in which data are needed to answer the MINTRISK questions for risk of entry (question 7, 8, 9)	All (table will be circulated asap)	30th September
To check which parameters for the spread model are already available in the literature	Simon	16th September
Dealing with uncertainty	Dominique	30th Sept
To indicate papers where other possible models for Mayotte are described	Veronique, others	asap
Section 3.3.: Draft description about RVF epidemics in Mayotte, focusing on animal health impact	Laure	30th September
Agreement with CIRAD, French CVO, farmer association for sharing data from Mayotte	Ale, Sotiria, Laure	asap
Section 3.4: check for quantitative data for mosquito in European region representatives for the EU situation	Miguel	14th October

## 6. Next WG meetings and timeline:

25-26 Sept	AHAW Panel meeting: presentation of methodology to address epi situation, risk of introduction and spread model for Tor 2 and 3.
end September, to be confirmed	A web conference about the spread model should be scheduled among the WG members involved in modelling
Mid-End of October	web conference for checking section on epidemiological status and inputs (and results?) for MintRisk
20-21 November	AHAW panel meeting: presentation of results for ToR 1.1 and 1.2
22 November	Tentative date for physical WG meeting
22-23 Jan 2020	AHAW Panel meeting: adoption of opinion for ToR 1.1 and 1.2



UNIT Animal Health and Plant Health

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

## MINUTES OF THE 2<sup>nd</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

**Held on 11 October 2019, webmeeting**

**(Agreed on 15 Oct 2019)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

■ Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>

Paolo CALISTRI (Chair), Miguel MIRANDA (Vice Chair), Dominique BICOUT, Simon GUBBINS, Federica MONACO, Clazien DEVOS

■ Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:

Laure DOMMERGUES

■ EFSA:

ALPHA: Sotiria-Eleni ANTONIOU, Alessandro BROGLIA

AMU: Josè CORTIÑAS

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The draft opinion was reviewed and following action points agreed (in yellow the person the task is assigned to). Key messages (2-3 bullet points) should be added (or checked where already present) after each section (**everybody**).

#### Global epidemiological update:

- 3.1.1 Virus agent: It was discussed to indicate the survival conditions for the virus outside the host (**Federica**)
- 3.1.2 Maps: Figure 2 can be kept, to be prepared with OIE data + FAO + WHO data to be displayed in a different way (exclude data from 'publication') starting from 2004, a map for each single year. A link to an external map at bigger resolution can be included. Data from OIE to be requested (available only for 2005, 2006 and 2007 besides what we already have) (**Ale**).
- Figure 4 ok, with data since 2004. (**Ale**)
- Figure 5 CDC: ok, verify caption and data. New map to be prepared since 2005 (**Sotiria**)
- Section 3.1.2.2 to be moved to 3.3.2 together with other info about Mayotte (**Ale**). To verify number of outbreaks comparing ADNS and press release (**Laure**), cross check with French authorities (**Sotiria, Ale**)
- Section 3.1.2.3: map to be prepared out of the data in the table. To exclude Egypt, which is officially affected (**Sotiria, Ale**)
- Section 3.1.3.3 vectors: to cross check list of main vectors in each affected countries (table page 41 of RVF opinion 2013) and indicate which vector is present also in EU >> select those (**Miguel**)
  - Maps for threshold temperature for vector activity using the threshold temperature for different species > **Miguel** to indicate threshold temperature values
- **Section** 3.1.4 animal movement: to organise the text and prepare the map (**Paolo, Ale**)
- Section 3.1.6.2 diagnosis: to add info for Se and Sp of ELISA in a table (**Federica**)
- Section 3.1.6.3 level of capacity: add info about Turkey if any, check key messages (**Federica**)
- Section 3.1.7.1 control measure in legislation: refer to foreseen measures: culling, vaccination, etc. (**Sotiria**)

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

- Section 3.1.7.2 vaccine: check comments in the draft to add info about % of side effects, length of immunity and complete table with indication of commercially available vaccines and where they are authorised.
- Section 3.1.7.3 vector control: add statement about general control of mosquitos (Miguel), any data by Mayotte ? (Laure)
- Deadline for completion of the above mentioned tasks : 3<sup>rd</sup> November

### **Risk of introduction:**

Document prepared by Dominique was revised.

- 3.2.1.1. animal movements: to remove graphs (ALE) statement about Eurostat data from Turkey (Ale)
- 3.2.1.3 complete section on pathways linked to active movement of vectors and add key messages (Miguel) ; map about ruminant density in EU overlayed to airport and ports (Ale)
- 3.2.1.5 selection of pathways: complete table 1
- 3.2.1.6 Estimation of P of different events for both animal pathways and vector pathway > complete list and indicate possible source of information (Paolo, Miguel, Dominique, Ale)
- 3.3.3 to complete the description of control measures in place in Mayotte (Laure)

Deadline for completion of the above mentioned tasks : 18 October

### **Spread model**

- Simon to check which data are still needed, preliminary results by first week November

## **5. Next WG meetings and timeline:**

20-21 November	AHAW panel meeting: presentation of results for ToR 1.1 and 1.2
22 November	physical WG meeting in Parma
22-23 Jan 2020	AHAW Panel meeting: adoption of opinion for ToR 1.1 and 1.2





UNIT Animal Health and Plant Health

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

## MINUTES OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

**Held on 22 November 2019, Parma**

**(Agreed on 27/11/ 2019)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

■ Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>

Paolo CALISTRI (Chair), Miguel MIRANDA (Vice Chair), Dominique BICOUT, Simon GUBBINS, Federica MONACO, Catherine CETRE-SOSSAH, Bernard Bett, Veronique Chevalier.

■ Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>: Laure DOMMERGUES

■ EFSA: ALPHA: Alessandro BROGLIA

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies by Chevalier, Bett.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

### 4.1 Opinion on risk of introduction into EU

The draft opinion "*Draft opinion RVF\_by Jan2020\_with WG\_comments.docx*" was reviewed and following action points agreed (in yellow the person the task is assigned to)

#### Global epidemiological update:

- 3.1.1 Virus agent: It was discussed to indicate the survival conditions for the virus outside the host . Key messages (2-3 bullet points) should be added
- 3.1.2 check / add key messages, 3.1.2.3 focus only on those countries officially free but reporting seropositivity.
- 3.1.3.1 rearrange the text, check plagiarism
- Section 3.1.3.3 vectors: to cross check list of main vectors in each affected countries (table page 41 of RVF opinion 2013) and indicate which vector is present also in EU >> select those
  - Maps for threshold temperature for vector activity using the threshold temperature for different species > to indicate threshold temperature values
  - 3.1.4.3 check comments
- Section 3.1.5 diagnosis: add info about milk as matrix for diagnosis
- Section 3.1.6.1 control measure in legislation: add key messages
- Section 3.1.6.2 vaccine: re arrange the table with :
  - Type of vaccine
  - Host species
  - DIVA Y/N
  - Manufacturer
  - Country of license and use
- Section 3.1.6.3 Miguel to check if text should be added or references to other works (Miguel)
- Deadline for completion of the above mentioned tasks : 15<sup>rd</sup> December

#### Risk of introduction, section 3.2:

Document prepared by Dominique was revised.

- 3.2.1. cross check with EFSA 2005
- 3.2.1.2 products, cross check with EFSA 2005
- 3.2.1.3 check side comments , add key messages ) ;
  - map about ruminant density in EU overlayed to airport and ports
- 3.2.1.4 humans: cross check EFSA, 2005

- 3.2.2 The table of estimation of P of different events for both animal pathways and vector pathway was completed and methodology for choosing the P was described,
  - the value classes for worldwide occurrence was filled in.
  - for vectors inputs by **Vectornet** is need (first week of December)
  - to provide P for spraying effectiveness in decreasing number of mosquitos in flights.
  - to estimate probability that a viable VBD-agent is still present upon arrival in the area at risk, see table 9
  - Calculate n of days above threshold temperature (Miguel to confirm the value – 8°C) in capital cities in 2013-2018
  - The table with values of P for each MS (*Data > MINTRISK > Overview\_MINTRISK\_parameters.xls*) should be filled in for all pathways and all MS, then model can be run.
- Once the risk is estimated for each MS, to be discussed whether MS should be grouped into areas with similar risk.

By 8 Dec	Inputs by Vectornet
By 13 Dec	Mintrisk run for all MS
By 20 Dec	Conclusion and recommendations drafted

## 4.2 Opinion on overwintering and impact in Mayotte (document: *Draft opinion RVF\_by March\_2020.docx*)

TOR to be addressed:

- 2.1 Assess the probability of overwintering of RVF in the department of Mayotte as well as the risk of RVF spreading from Mayotte to other areas including other French departments in the Indian Ocean or Metropolitan France
- 2.2 Assess the impact of the disease (as defined in the 'VBD opinion'), with emphasis on animal health and farm production in Mayotte from the time of its initial occurrence to date

## Discussion points

### 4.2.1 Overwintering:

- Check paper by Metras (Drivers for..... , 2017, [link](#) ) for long term RVF cycle, and figure out how to give estimation of overwintering, if enough to refer to it (**by end 2019**)
- Check papers by LeGoffe [link](#) + [link](#) and Balenghien 2013 (, **by end 2019**)
  - Retrieve data ( **by end 2019**) for Replacement rate of animals, birth/death 2013-2018, from July-June: to check how long it takes to have new susceptible population, data on mean age of animals

### 4.2.2 spread from Mayotte to other French Department or continental France

- HYSELIT model to check wind current Mayotte (**by 15 Dec**)
- Retrieve data of Number of flights/boats from Mayotte (from website of airport) (**by end 2019**)

#### 4.2.3. Impact in Mayotte

- Check with French vet services ( ):
  - Data on cases, abortions
  - farm production: sick animals, abortions rate, mortality, nr cases per herd
- to ask for information to farmers about deaths, abortions, milk losses

#### Structure of opinion

- Ecology in Mayotte ( by end 2019)
- Livestock and livestock trade in Mayotte (by end 2019)
- History of RVF in Mayotte ( by 15 Dec)
- Epidemics in 2018-2019: surveillance, impact on production cases, etc :  
to rearrange text and info ( by end 2019)

### 5. Next WG meetings and timeline:

8 Dec	Inputs by Vectornet
13 Dec	Mintrisk run for all MS
20 Dec	Conclusion and raccomandations drafted
10 <sup>th</sup> January	Draft opinion to be distributed to the Panel
22-23 Jan 2020	AHAW Panel meeting: adoption of opinion for ToR 1.1 and 1.2



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

## SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

### ANIMAL HEALTH AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

#### MINUTES OF THE 4<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

VIDEO/WEB/TELE-conference, 17 December 2019

(Agreed on 13 December 2019)<sup>1</sup>

#### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Paolo Calistri
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:  
Laure DOMMERGUES
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:  
Not Applicable
- EFSA:  
ALPHA Unit: Sotiria-Eleni ANTONIOU, Alessandro BROGLIA
- Others:  
Not Applicable

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

The Chair welcomed the participants. Simon Gubbins apologised for his absence.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Opinion on the TOR 2.1 and 2.2 (document: [Draft opinion RVF by March 2020.docx](#)):

2.1 Assess the probability of overwintering of RVF in the department of Mayotte as well as the risk of RVF spreading from Mayotte to other areas including other French departments in the Indian Ocean or Metropolitan France

2.2 Assess the impact of the disease (as defined in the 'VBD opinion'), with emphasis on animal health and farm production in Mayotte from the time of its initial occurrence to date

### 4.1. Structure and content of the Opinion

The structure and the content of the document of the Opinion was reviewed, discussed and rearranged in the draft document [here](#):

1. Assessment of the impact of RVF in Mayotte (TOR 2.2)
2. Assessment of the probability of overwintering (TOR 2.1)
3. Assessment of the risk of spread from Mayotte to another French Department in the Indian Ocean or to continental France (TOR 2.1)

### 4.2. Impact in Mayotte

Geographical and ecological characteristics of Mayotte were included.

Animal population in Mayotte: According to the information received by the French Veterinary Authorities, in Mayotte, farms are not geolocated and data on animal numbers are incomplete. However, they provided an estimation of the total amount of cattle and small ruminants farms and animals. The data from the last census carried out in 2010 and found in the web are also included. Since the data on animal populations are not at farm level and are not updated, concerns were expressed on how they can be used.

Data on the number of deaths, the number of births and the abortions would be important, in case they are available, to estimate the impact of RVF in Mayotte.

Flu-like syndromes in cattle, was discussed as well.

---

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

#### **4.3. Assessment of the probability of overwintering (TOR 2.1)**

Data on the vector species presented in Mayotte and their abundance are available only in publications. Nonetheless still missing information on their activity and seasonal dynamics.

The modelling approach and parameter estimation of the publication of [Metras et al. 2017](#), were reviewed by Simon Gubbins and the results can be used for the purpose of the TOR 2.1. In addition, with the available data that we have we'd be able to do anything different/better.

Another model by [Cavalerie et al 2015](#) was proposed to be as well reviewed and compared with the one of Metras et al. 2017.

#### **4.4. Assessment of the risk of spread from Mayotte to another French Department in the Indian Ocean or to continental France (TOR 2.1)**

According to the information received by French Veterinary Authorities there are no exports of live animals from Mayotte.

What it should be discussed is if the same approach as we used for the risk of introduction into EU will be used for this TOR as well.

The transmission of the vectors through the winds is a topic to be discussed if it will be included.

### **5. Any Other Business**

The availability and the quality of the data for the purposes of the relevant TORs was one of the concerns expressed during the meeting.

The text and the information provided in the tables need to be improved and better organised.

### **6. Next meeting(s) and timeline**

14 January 2020	Draft Opinion to be distributed to the AHAW Panel
22 January 2020	AHAW Panel meeting: discussion during the AHAW Panel
Week 27 to 31 January 2020	Web/tele Conference
Week 17 to 21 February 2020	Web/tele Conference
8 March 2020	Draft Opinion to be distributed to the AHAW Panel
18 to 19 March 2020	AHAW Panel meeting: adoption



UNIT Animal Health and Plant Health

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

## MINUTES OF THE 5th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

**Held on 7 Jan 2020, Parma**

**(Agreed on 07 Jan 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

■ Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>

Paolo CALISTRI (Chair), Miguel MIRANDA (Vice Chair), Dominique BICOUT, Simon GUBBINS, Federica MONACO, Catherine CETRE-SOSSAH, Bernard Bett, Veronique Chevalier.

■ Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>: Laure DOMMERGUES

■ EFSA: ALPHA: Alessandro BROGLIA, Sotiria ANTONIOU

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies by Chevalier, Bett.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

### 4.1 Opinion on risk of introduction into EU

- The results by MINTRISK were discussed.
- Conclusions and recommendations were drafted.

## 5. Next WG meetings and timeline:

10 <sup>th</sup> January	Draft opinion to be distributed to the Panel
22-23 Jan 2020	AHAW Panel meeting: adoption of opinion for ToR 1



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

## SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

### ANIMAL HEALTH AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

#### MINUTES OF THE 6<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

VIDEO/WEB/TELE-conference, 31 January 2020

(Agreed on 16 January 2020)<sup>1</sup>

#### Participants

■ Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>

Paolo Calistri, (Chair), Simon GUBBINS, Miguel MIRANDA, Dominique BICOUT, Veronique CHEVALIER, Catherine CETRE-SOSSAH, Simon Gubbins, Clazien DE VOS

■ Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:

Laure DOMMERGUES

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Sotiria-Eleni ANTONIOU, Yves VAN DER STEDE

■ Others:

Not Applicable

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The meeting started by the welcome of the members and the apologies for absences, late comings and early leavings.

## 2. Adoption of the agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Opinion on the TOR 2.1 and 2.2 (document: [31 January WG Draft opinion RVF by March 2020](#)):

1. Assessment of the impact of RVF in Mayotte (TOR 2.2)
2. Assessment of the probability of overwintering (TOR 2.1)
3. Assessment of the risk of spread from Mayotte to other areas including other French departments in the Indian Ocean or Metropolitan France (TOR 2.1)

### 4.1. Clarification on the (TOR 2.1)

The WG members estimated that it is not very clear which areas should be included in the assessment apart from the Department of Reunion and the Metropolitan France. Clarification by the European Commission is necessary in order to continue with the assessment. An email has been sent already to the Commission to define these areas.

### 4.2. Review the data and the information

We went through the Opinion to identify the missing information and the data that are going to be necessary for the analysis. All the missing data, on the number of reported abortions and flu-like syndrome cases, on the milk production, on the vectors, on the flights and boats from Mayotte to other destinations, on the dispatches of containers, on trade activities should be completed up until 14th of February 2020.

### 4.3. Impact on Mayotte

The impact of RVF in Mayotte will be assessed through indicators like morbidity, mortality, number of abortions, flu-like syndrome cases and a case-study of the drop of milk production in an infected dairy farm.

---

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

#### 4.4. Assessment of the probability of overwintering (TOR 2.1)

For the assessment of the overwintering the modelling approach and parameter estimation of the publication of [Metras et al. 2017](#), and [Cavalerie et al 2015](#) were reviewed and the results are going to be used for the purpose of the TOR 2.1. In addition, with the available data that we have we'd be able to do anything different/better.

The uncertainty generated by the lack of evidence on the transovarial transmission of the virus was also discussed and is a parameter that must be investigated and taken into consideration.

#### 4.5. Assessment of the risk of spread from Mayotte to other areas including other French Departments in the Indian Ocean or to continental France (TOR 2.1)

Which countries and islands should be included in the assessment, apart from the Department of Reunion and Metropolitan France, was not very clear and the WG requested clarification from the European Commission.

**HYSPLIT model:** Simon presented the HYSPLIT model and explained the parameters in relation to some characteristic of the vectors (e.g. temperatures, altitude). It will be used to estimate the distance of the transport of vectors through the winds and to estimate the possibility to reach other islands.

Data on the number of flights and the direct connections with different destinations were still pending.

Data on the containers and ships from Mayotte to other destinations is still under investigation.

Data on the products that are exported from Mayotte to other destinations is still under investigation. The export or dispatch of plants should be considered.

### 5. Any Other Business

Tasks were discussed and distributed during the meeting and are indicated on the document of the Opinion.

### 6. Next meeting(s) and timeline

Deadlines for the 2 <sup>nd</sup> Opinion	
<b>14 February 2020</b>	Finalise: data, text, graphs, key points, conclusions, recommendations
17-20 February 2020	Comments and review by the WG and the Panel (to check if possible, for the Panel)
20 February 2020	Web Working Group Meeting
<b>4 March 2020</b>	Send the Opinion to the Panel
16 March 2020	Deadline for the Panel to submit the Comments
16-17 March 2020	Discussion on the Panel's comments
<b>18 March 2020</b>	Adoption of the Opinion



ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

## SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

### ANIMAL HEALTH AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

#### MINUTES OF THE 7<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

VIDEO/WEB/TELE-conference, 20 February 2020

(Agreed on 12 February 2020)<sup>1</sup>

#### Participants

■ Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>

Paolo Calistri, (Chair), Simon GUBBINS, Miguel MIRANDA, Dominique BICOUT, Catherine CETRE-SOSSAH, Simon Gubbins

■ Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>:

Laure DOMMERGUES

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Sotiria-Eleni ANTONIOU, Yves VAN DER STEDE, Alessandro BROGLIA

■ Others:

Not Applicable

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The meeting started by the welcome of the members and the apologies for absences.

### Adoption of the agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 2. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 3. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

Opinion on the TOR 2.1 and 2.2 (document: [2nd RVF Opinion March 2020](#)):

1. Assessment of the impact of RVF in Mayotte (TOR 2.2)
2. Assessment of the probability of overwintering (TOR 2.1)
3. Assessment of the risk of spread from Mayotte to other areas including other French departments in the Indian Ocean or Metropolitan France (TOR 2.1)

### 3.1. Discussion and implementation of the comments already received on draft document

We went through the Opinion to discuss the comments already received by the Panel members, by our WG reviewer Clazien DE VOS and by the WG members. Moreover, there was a discussion on some missing information and data, on the points that need improvement and on the interpretation of all TORs. EC didn't comment on the document.

### 3.2. Impact on Mayotte

The impact of RVF in Mayotte will be assessed through indicators like morbidity, mortality, number of abortions, flu-like syndrome cases. There was a discussion on the case-study of the drop of milk production in an infected dairy farm, in relation to the methodology used to describe the dataset. In addition, it was agreed that from one farm and the results we have we can not generalise the impact of RVF on milk production in the whole Department of Mayotte.

### 3.3. Assessment of the probability of overwintering (TOR 2.1)

For the assessment of the overwintering the modelling approach and parameter estimation of the publication of [Metras et al. 2017](#), and [Cavalerie et al 2015](#) were reviewed and the results are going to be used for the purpose of the TOR 2.1. In addition, with the available data that we have we'd be able to do anything different/better.

---

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

The uncertainty generated by the lack of evidence on the transovarial transmission of the virus was also discussed and is a parameter that must be investigated and taken into consideration.

Moreover, this part needs improvement and more detailed description of the results and the limitations of the previous studies.

### **3.4. Assessment of the risk of spread from Mayotte to other areas including other French Departments in the Indian Ocean or to continental France (TOR 2.1)**

Interpretation of the specific TOR should be improved in relation to the explanation of the selection of the areas to be included.

The methodology of the HYSPLIT model needs improvement and more explanation should be provided in relation to the altitude (100m), the 14 days visualisation on graphs and the results.

## **4. Any Other Business**

Tasks and deadlines were discussed and distributed during the meeting and in addition a list with the individual tasks and deadlines was sent to the WG members.

## **5. Next meeting(s) and timeline**

<b>Deadlines for the 2<sup>nd</sup> Opinion</b>	
<b>5 March 2020</b>	Send the Opinion to the Panel
16 March 2020	Deadline for the Panel to submit the Comments
16-17 March 2020	Discussion on the Panel's comments
<b>18 March 2020</b>	Adoption of the Opinion



UNIT Animal Health and Plant Health

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

## MINUTES OF THE 8th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

Q number: EFSA-Q-2019-00420

**Held on 19-20 March 2020, web**

**(Agreed on 23 March 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

■ Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>

Paolo CALISTRI (Chair), Miguel MIRANDA (Vice Chair), Dominique BICOUT, Simon GUBBINS, Helen ROBERTS

■ Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>: Laure DOMMERGUES

■ EFSA: ALPHA: Alessandro BROGLIA,

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

### 4.1 Opinion on assessment of effectiveness of control measures and surveillance for Mayotte and Europe

#### Mayotte:

- Model by Metras et al, 2017 to be used for Mayotte, **Simon** to implement
- Which measures could be included
- Which spatial unit to consider: entire island (zone by AHL is 20 and 50 km, so bigger than the whole island)
- Movement restriction does not make sense, since the island is very small, vectors will move all over the island in any case
- To use theoretical seasonality based on temperature threshold
- The decision is to select those measures that we can implement quicker than dispersal time of vectors, also considering the delay in detecting
- First model the spread, then see how far away can spread and decide if movement restrictions should be added
- Output will be (SEIR ) number of infected or with IgM (I), farms infected, number of immune with IgG (R)
- Test vaccination both reactive and pre-emptive
- For surveillance we can consider one single unit, random sampling , consider different level of design prevalence and see by the model when after introduction we are able to detect the disease and then apply the measures (same approach as for LSD).
- Vector control: description of measures in place, and plugged in the model >> reduction of intensity of transmission in vectors. See review by Vectornet (**Miguel** to check).
- **Laure** to draft section about control measures in place in Mayotte
- Recall from 1<sup>st</sup> opinion (**Ale, Paolo**)      Se of diagnostics  
Estimate time for vaccine onset of immunity

#### One model for EU, adapted from BTV model

- Which region to consider for introduction:
  - First opinion: BE, NL, MT and Greece, due to establishment and import of vectors. Then consider **NL** (we need farm XY location of cattle and small

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

ruminants) **and Greece** (location of small ruminants? Otherwise NUTS 3 or change with Italy for small ruminants).

- Surveillance scenarios as predicted by the model (same approach as for lumpy skin)
- How long to model: until the curve will stabilise, e.g. 5 years.
- Consider single vector population
  - To explain which species are present in NL and Greece (Miguel)
  - Distribution, dispersal, seasonal activity for those 2 countries (Miguel to check)
  - Vectors in the first opinion: Miguel to summarise info from first opinion for the vector dispersal and pathways of dispersals
  - To model wind dispersal (200-500km) : fat tailed kernel (Simon)
- TOR about measures foreseen by AHL:
  - With the model >> to check if the radius 20 km foreseen by AHL is feasible in relation to speed of spread within the PZ-monitoring period of 30 days where the measures are applied (stamping out is foreseen in all farms in the PZ + stand still of movements)
  - Assess ring vaccination in different ring side.
  - Compare stamp out vs vaccination policies
  - Asses the effectiveness of monitoring period 45 days >> Paolo to draft section considering transovarial transmission, wildlife reservoir (description of uncertainty).
  - Ale to check with enetwild about wild ruminants distribution in Europe, what is available now
  - surveillance performed after vaccination there will entail lot of uncertainty.
  - Miguel: to describe about measures of vector control, importance of integrated approach coupled with monitoring etc. Specific spot control when detected a positive?

## 5. timeline:

23 april	Web meeting – results about Mayotte
6-7- May	AHAW Plenary – presentation preliminary results
24-25 June	AHAW Plenary - discussion
23-24 Sept	AHAW Plenary - adoption



UNIT Animal Health and Plant Health

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

## MINUTES OF THE 9th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

Q number: EFSA-Q-2019-00420

**Held on 30 April 2020, web**

**(Agreed on 7 May 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Paolo CALISTRI (Chair), Miguel MIRANDA (Vice Chair), Dominique BICOUT, Simon GUBBINS
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>: Laure DOMMERGUES
- EFSA: ALPHA: Alessandro BROGLIA, José Cortinhas

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

### 4.1 Opinion on assessment of effectiveness of control measures and surveillance for Mayotte and Europe

The following points were discussed and agreed, in yellow the ones the tasks are assigned to, deadline 19<sup>th</sup> May:

- Se of diagnostics: decided to consider the lower bound of Se of IDVet IgG ELISA, 91%;
- Measures for vaccine effectiveness to be provided by **Paolo**, for CLONE 13 according to Nyenga et al., 2017, 67% in cattle, 91% in small ruminants,; measures for VE for inactivated vaccine to be provided;

#### Mayotte:

- **Laure** to circulate the protocol for disinsectisation, to structure section about measures applied in Mayotte
- Model by Metras et al, 2017 to be used for Mayotte, **Simon** to run simulations for:
  - rate and date of start of vaccination (done, inserted in the draft)
  - stamping out policies, total or partial
  - vector control: modify R0 values, check with **Miguel** which level to use
- For surveillance: , random sampling , consider different level of design prevalence and see by the model when after introduction we are able to detect the disease and then apply the measures (same approach as for LSD). **Simon** to derive the frequency for testing, from the time needed to achieve the design prevalence.

#### One model for EU, adapted from BTV model

- Population data from NL and Greece obtained
- **Simon** to set the model and simulations:
  - Simulations:
    - to check if the radius 20 km foreseen by AHL is feasible in relation to speed of spread within the PZ-monitoring period of 30 days where the measures are applied (stamping out is foreseen in all farms in the PZ + stand still of movements)
    - Assess ring vaccination in different ring sizes.

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

- Compare stamp out (total and partial) vs vaccination policies (rate and date of start)
- Vector to be considered in the model: *Culex pipiens*
- To model wind dispersal (200-500km) : fat tailed kernel (Simon)
- Vectors:
  - Description of distribution, dispersal, seasonal activity in NL and Greece
  - for NL to consider the paper by Ibanez -Justicia > Miguel, + occurrence maps
  - Retrieve info about Greece (Miguel)
  - Miguel: to describe about measures of vector control, importance of integrated approach coupled with monitoring etc.
- Surveillance:
  - Section to discuss surveillance scenarios in NL and Greece
  - Type of surveillance
  - Target population
  - Design prevalence <> time to detection
  - Sample size and frequency of testing
  - Any risk based surveillance?
- Wildlife role: map with all species merged + description of susceptibility (Ale)

## 5. Timeline:

19 May	WG meeting: checking results for model in Mayotte and EU
3 June	WG meeting: sections drafted, draft conclusions
24-25 June	AHAW Plenary - discussion
23-24 Sept	AHAW Plenary - adoption



UNIT Animal Health and Plant Health

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

## MINUTES OF THE 10th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

Q number: EFSA-Q-2019-00420

**Held on 18 May 2020, web**

**(Agreed on 18 May 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup> Simon GUBBINS
- EFSA: ALPHA: Alessandro BROGLIA

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

#### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

##### 4.1 Opinion on assessment of effectiveness of control measures and surveillance for Mayotte and Europe

The structure and simulations produced by the mathematical model were discussed.

#### 5. Timeline:

19 May	WG meeting: checking results for model in Mayotte and EU
3 June	WG meeting: sections drafted, draft conclusions
24-25 June	AHAW Plenary - discussion
23-24 Sept	AHAW Plenary - adoption



UNIT Animal Health and Plant Health

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

## MINUTES OF THE 11th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

Q number: EFSA-Q-2019-00420

**Held on 19 May 2020, web**

**(Agreed on 19 May 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Paolo CALISTRI (Chair), Miguel MIRANDA (Vice Chair), Dominique BICOUT, Simon GUBBINS
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>: Laure DOMMERGUES
- EFSA: ALPHA: Alessandro BROGLIA, José Cortinhas, Sotiria Antoniou

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion and task distribution

### 4.1 Opinion on assessment of effectiveness of control measures and surveillance for Mayotte and Europe

- Methodology: section was discussed. Dominique to have a look at the remaining comments and clean them up please, in case ask Simon;
- Assessment:
  - Mayotte: Laure, Paolo to have a look at the comments in the draft;
    - Surveillance scenario: I think we can choose the design prevalence based on what happened in Mayotte, i.e. disease detected at least 2 months after introduction. Then 30 days could be a quite good performance, not? Otherwise see the proposal by Josè, also for Simon to consider.
      - Frequency of testing: could be derived from the epidemic curve?
    - Vaccination scenario: I have inserted a table where we can express some output underlying the boxplot as vaccination coverage achieved, % of infected animals after 3 years, duration of epidemics in months. I wonder if Simon could provide the output values underlying the boxplot, also if other want to play with them in the meantime to produce other visualisations.
    - Culling: I think we said to compute the number of culled animals and how many infected animals are left at the end of the period considered. Possible, Simon?
    - Combination of measures: vector control measures can be combined with vaccination or test and slaughter, but the last two cannot combined together. They are clearly opposite. When choosing the vaccination policy it would be impossible to also serologically test the animals. Therefore, only two combinations can be considered: - vaccination + vector control; - test and slaughter + vector control
    - Of course we cannot combine these control options considering all possible scenarios as taken into account in single option analysis. To explore the effect of any combination we should consider only one scenario for vaccination (for example: 30 days after epidemic started, 200 animals per day and 60% vaccination effectiveness), one scenario for test and slaughter (for example: 30 days after epidemic started, 200 animals tested per day) and one scenario for mosquito control (for example: 10% reduction).
  - EU:
    - Control measures, Vector control: Miguel, literature review by Vectornet.
    - Simulations: end of next week as indicated by Simon

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

## 5. Timeline:

3 June	WG meeting: sections drafted, draft conclusions
18 June	Draft opinion to be distributed to the AHAW Panel
24-25 June	AHAW Plenary - discussion
23-24 Sept	AHAW Plenary - adoption



UNIT Animal Health and Plant Health

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

## MINUTES OF THE 12th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

Q number: EFSA-Q-2019-00420

**Held on 3 June 2020, web**

**(Agreed on 3 June 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Simon GUBBINS
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>: none
- EFSA: ALPHA: Alessandro BROGLIA

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

#### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion and task distribution

The mathematical model for the assessment of effectiveness of control measures and surveillance for Mayotte and Europe was discussed and implemented.

#### 5. Timeline:

18 June	Draft opinion to be distributed to the AHAW Panel
24-25 June	AHAW Plenary - discussion
23-24 Sept	AHAW Plenary - adoption

---

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



UNIT Animal Health and Plant Health

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

## MINUTES OF THE 13th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

Q number: EFSA-Q-2019-00420

**Held on 12 June 2020, web**

**(Agreed on 12 June 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Paolo CALISTRI (Chair), Miguel MIRANDA (Vice Chair), Dominique BICOUT, Simon GUBBINS, Helen Roberts
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>: Laure DOMMERGUES
- EFSA: ALPHA: Alessandro BROGLIA, José Cortinhas

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

### 4.1 Opinion on assessment of effectiveness of control measures and surveillance for Mayotte and Europe

The conclusions were drafted about

- surveillance to be put in place in Mayotte
- Vaccination policy
- Culling policy
- combined measures

#### About the model to be used for the assessment of RVF incursion in EU :

- The results about assessment of restriction zones were discussed and conclusions drafted.
- The type of model to be used for assessing spread and vaccination was discussed and agreed.

#### Timeline:

24-25 June	AHAW Plenary - discussion
23-24 Sept	AHAW Plenary - adoption

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



UNIT Animal Health and Plant Health

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

## MINUTES OF THE 14th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

Q number: EFSA-Q-2019-00420

**Held on 3 Sept 2020, web**

**(Agreed on 3 Sept 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Simon GUBBINS
- EFSA: ALPHA: Alessandro BROGLIA

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

---

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

#### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

##### 4.1 Opinion on assessment of effectiveness of control measures and surveillance for Mayotte and Europe

The model simulations about the control measures for RVF in EU were discussed, the assumptions checked and related key messages drafted.

##### Timeline:

23-24 Sept	AHAW Plenary - adoption
------------	-------------------------





UNIT Animal Health and Plant Health

# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND ANIMAL WELFARE

## MINUTES OF THE 15th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON RIFT VALLEY FEVER

Q number: EFSA-Q-2019-00420

**Held on 4 Sept 2020, web**

**(Agreed on 4 Sept 2020)<sup>1</sup>**

### Participants

- Working Group Members:<sup>2</sup>  
Paolo CALISTRI (Chair), Miguel MIRANDA (Vice Chair), Dominique BICOUT, Simon GUBBINS, Helen Roberts
- Hearing Experts<sup>3</sup>: Laure DOMMERGUES
- EFSA: ALPHA: Alessandro BROGLIA, José Cortinhas

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

<sup>1</sup> Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

<sup>2</sup> Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

<sup>3</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>4</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>5</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

### 4.1 Opinion on assessment of effectiveness of control measures and surveillance for Mayotte and Europe

- The comments provided by the AHAW Panel were discussed, the draft opinion improved and conclusions and recommendations refined.

## 5. Task distribution

- The WG members have to revise the opinion by 10<sup>th</sup> September

### Timeline:

23-24 Sept	AHAW Plenary - adoption
------------	-------------------------

---

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)