



## ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

### MINUTES OF THE 7<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AMR-AHL

**WEB-conference, 17 December 2020**

**(Agreed on 8 January 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group experts: Julio ALVAREZ, Dominique BICOUT, Jeroen DEWULF, Julian DREWE, Luca GUARDABASSI, Friederike HILBERT, Rodolphe MADER
- University of Copenhagen: Peter DAMBORG (representing the contractor)
- EFSA: Francesca BALDINELLI (ALPHA Unit)

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Peter SMITH.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

#### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

<sup>1</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



The WG experts thoroughly discussed within the group and with the contractor the data extraction model provided by contractor ahead of the meeting. The discussion focused on the data fields related to checking the quality of papers, to the papers on samples collected using a convenience sample procedure (those will be not excluded but a better classification of what is meant by convenience will be provided by the contractor). For the field on the definition of the study population, it was agreed to refer it to the animal rather than to the matrices (e.g., organs) sampled within the animal. Papers combining the categories of 'clinically' resistant and intermediate resistant into a non-susceptible category, will be not excluded at this stage as they might indicate close correspondence with the ECOFF. Following what is also reported in EARS-Vet (<https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/sites/default/files/documents/surveillance-antimicrobial-resistance-Europe-2019.pdf>), papers reporting fewer than 10 isolates for a specific bacterial species-antimicrobial group combination will not be considered eligible. In the specific case of UTI and of E.coli and ampicillin and amoxiclave, the origin of the breakpoint (whether it is the general one or specific for UTI or not specified) will be reported.

### Next meeting(s)

Exact dates for WG meetings for 2021 to be decided. A first meeting will be in the second half of January.



## ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

### MINUTES OF THE 6<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AMR-AHL

**WEB-conference, 1 December 2020**

**(Agreed on 18 December 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group experts: Julio ALVAREZ, Jeroen DEWULF, Julian DREW, Luca GUARDABASSI, Friederike HILBERT, Rodolphe MADER, Peter SMITH
- EFSA: Francesca BALDINELLI (ALPHA Unit)

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Dominique BICOUT.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

#### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts thoroughly discussed the protocol of the extensive literature to provide the contractor with clear indications to go ahead with the work. At the phase of abstract screening, it was agreed to

<sup>1</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



exclude those studies with unknown origin (clinical vs carriage) of the isolates; pharmacological studies that use small strain collections for testing specific drugs; studies where the selection of stains is on a convenient sampling; studies with no abstract or that report abstract in non-English or in a language non accessible to the Contractor's team; studies where data on AMR are reported together for commensal and clinical isolates (as data for clinical isolates alone cannot be deducted); studies with data on AMR reported at the genus level (e.g. *Staphylococcus*); studies where more than one isolate per individual animal is included. For national reports, in case of surveillance programs that report AMR data yearly, only the last edition will be included; in case of data based on set of isolates obtained from national surveillance programs are reported also in published papers, the data available through the last edition of the national surveillance program will be considered only. National report and guidelines that are written in non-English will be included only if the language is accessible to the Contractor's team (e.g. Spanish, Danish). After comparing results in terms of number of studies retrieved and eligible for the full text screening for the two time periods 2000-2020 and 2010-2020, it was decided to include in the searches only studies for the time period 2010-2020. Studies providing AMR data for specific MDR subpopulations only (e.g. MRSP, MRSA, ESBL, etc.) will not be considered to compile prevalence/occurrence figures but will be analysed separately to give an estimation of AMR within each MDR-subtype category, also they will be relevant to assess the impact on animal health. The WG agreed to exclude *Staphylococcus aureus* from the original pig pathogen list, as proposed by the contractor.

### Next meeting(s)

Next WG meeting is planned on 17 December.



## ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

### MINUTES OF THE 5<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AMR-AHL

**WEB-conference, 12 October 2020**

**(Agreed on 2 November 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group experts: Julio ALVAREZ, Jeroen DEWULF, Luca GUARDABASSI, Friederike HILBERT, Rodolphe MADER
- University of Copenhagen: Peter DAMBORG, Carmen ESPINOSA
- EFSA: Francesca BALDINELLI (ALPHA Unit), Simone SCREMIN (FIN)

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Dominique BICOUT, Julian DREWE and Peter SMITH.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

#### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

<sup>1</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



The aim of the meeting was to provide the contractor (University of Copenhagen) with any clarifications needed on task, deliverables, scientific and administrative aspects of the specific contract to collect data for ToR 1 and 2. The working group experts discussed with the contractor the details of the technical specifications, agreed on a detailed working plan and production of deliverables. The work will be conducted by group of animal species, starting with 'dogs and cats'. The contractor will share with EFSA the draft protocol for the ELR in one week after the meeting and EFSA will provide the contractor with the feedback from the experts in few days. The results of the first extensive literature review on dogs and cats will be ready in three weeks time after the production of the draft protocol. The schedule for the results on the other animal species were also discussed and agreed; those that were originally foreseen across Christmas and Easter time will be rescheduled. The target animal species for the review on poultry and aquatic animal species will be further discussed within the WG and communicated to the contractor. The administrative and financial aspects of the framework contract/ specific contract were presented and discussed, EFSA provided clarification where requested.

### Next meeting(s)

Next WG meetings for 2020 planned on 18 November (9.00-13.00) and 17 December (14.00-18.00).



## ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

### MINUTES OF THE 4<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AMR-AHL

**WEB-conference, 30 September 2020**

**(Agreed on 14 October 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group experts:  
Julio ALVAREZ, Dominique BICOUT, Jeroen DEWULF, Julian DREWE, Luca GUARDABASSI,  
Friederike HILBERT, Rodolphe MADER, Peter SMITH
- EFSA:  
ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

<sup>1</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



#### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts revised and deeply discussed the technical specifications for the specific contract to collect data for ToR 1 and 2 via extensive literature review. It was agreed to ask the contractor for data on reduced susceptibility and or failures treatment for all the bacteria that were already identified by the WG with the support of external scientists. This information will allow to answer Tor 1 (give a state of play as regard AMR bacteria). For all these bacteria also the frequency (prevalence in case this would be available) in the EU or the frequency (prevalence if available) elsewhere, but in production systems similar to those present in the EU, should be collected. This latter information will allow the WG to assess if a bacterium is relevant or not in the EU. Only for the bacteria that will be assessed by the WG as relevant in the EU context, the contractor will put together data on recommended antimicrobials treatment from guidelines on antimicrobial use that are available from European countries. The WG will proceed to describe the actual and potential impact of each relevant bacterium on animal health in the EU by considering whether i) resistance has been developed against an antimicrobial that is recommended to treat the infection/disease, ii) and whether there are alternatives for treatment.

The planning of the activities foreseen to assess ToR 1 and 2 (deliverables from contractor and assessment by the WG) were discussed and agreed.

#### Next meeting(s)

Next WG meetings for 2020 planned on 12 October (14.00-18.00), 18 November (9.00-13.00) and 17 December (14.00-18.00).





## ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

### MINUTES OF THE 3<sup>rd</sup> MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AMR-AHL

**WEB-conference, 29 June 2020**

**(Agreed on 9 July 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group experts:  
Julio ALVAREZ, Dominique BICOUT, Jeroen DEWULF, Julian DREWE, Luca GUARDABASSI,  
Friederike HILBERT, Rodolphe MADER, Peter SMITH
- EFSA:  
ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

<sup>1</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



#### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG experts revised and deeply discussed the list of bacterial pathogens causing transmissible animal diseases by each of the animal species categories that were selected for this mandate. The chair presented an overview of the included/excluded bacteria by exclusion criteria. As the same methodology was applied to several animal species, the WG checked consistency among the results (included/excluded bacteria by animal species). Bacterial species that were included in one animal species but excluded in another were deeply discussed; considering that the same organism can behave differently in relation to the host species and that host species are reared under different managerial regimes, the WG will double check the rational for a different inclusion/exclusion results related to same bacterial species in different animals via looking for evidence in the literature that could support or not the results (e.g. *Bartonella* spp., *Anaplasma* spp. in horses and small ruminants). Also, some controversial results will be revised via looking into the literature (i.e. included/excluded bacteria for which there is no complete agreement or only very few experts provided their assessment). The final list will be circulated again among the WG experts to seek agreement.

The objectives and review questions foreseen for the collection of data via extensive literature review were discussed. In relation to objective 1, the WG agreed to focus the data collection on any authorised antimicrobial and to screen then the results according to only relevant antimicrobials. For this purpose, the WG will elaborate a list of antimicrobials that are suggested for treatment in veterinary medicine (global scale) by host species. The WG agreed to exclude from the list the antimicrobials listed under category A of the Antimicrobial Advice Ad Hoc Expert Group (AMEG). Also, evidence reporting failure of antimicrobial treatment should be collected. A first proposal for objective 3 was elaborated at the meeting and will be further discussed among the WG experts via mail.



## ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

### MINUTES OF THE 2<sup>nd</sup> MEETING OF THE STANDING WORKING GROUP ON AMR-AHL

**WEB-conference, 8 June 2020**

**(Agreed on 29 June 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Julio ALVAREZ, Dominique BICOUT, Jeroen DEWULF, Julian DREWE, Luca GUARDABASSI,  
Friederike HILBERT, Rodolphe MADER, Peter SMITH
- EFSA:  
ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Inmaculada AZNAR

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

<sup>1</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



#### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The WG meeting focussed on the data collection for ToR 1 and 2. The draft list of bacteria on which collect the data was further discussed among the experts. To include or exclude the bacteria from that list, three criteria were previously identified by the WG experts: the clinical significance, the association with antimicrobial use and the evidence of (acquired) antimicrobial resistance. A first assessment of the bacteria that were originally listed (known bacterial pathogen causing diseases in the animal species selected) with the three criteria was made by the experts and further circulated to i) external scientists with specific expertise on the different animal species under consideration for this mandate; ii) the AHAW Panel of experts. At the meeting the summary of the feedback received on that first assessment was presented by the chair and discussed among the WG experts. The WG planned to circulate this summary to the external scientists for them to be informed on the final outcome of the exercise and to seek any final feedback. Also, the WG went through the drafted review questions and proposed amendments. Both the list of bacteria and the review questions will be further revised after the meeting by the WG experts with the aim of finalising in the next WG meeting.

#### 5. Next meeting(s)

Next WG meeting is scheduled on 29 June 2020.



## ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

### MINUTES OF THE 1<sup>st</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AMR-AHL

**WEB-conference, 4 May 2020**

**(Agreed on 14 May 2020)**

#### Participants

■ Working Group:

Julio ALVAREZ, Dominique BICOUT, Jeroen DEWULF, Julian DREWE, Luca GUARDABASSI, Friederike HILBERT, Rodolphe MADER, Peter SMITH

■ EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Francesca BALDINELLI, Inmaculada AZNAR

#### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants.

#### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

#### 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

<sup>1</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)



#### 4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The working group (WG) experts were informed on the expert compensation scheme that EFSA's Management Board endorsed at its last meeting of 2019, and on the EFSA collaboration space (accessible to all WG experts) that will be used to draft and exchange any scientific documents for this mandate.

The mandate and the three terms of reference (ToR) as received from the Commission were presented to the WG. A general approach and related timelines to conduct the activities by ToR was proposed and discussed. The meeting then focussed on ToR 1 and 2. The WG expressed the need to clarify the interpretation of some aspects of ToR 1 and 2 and made some proposals to be further evaluated and discussed with the AHAW Panel (e.g. animal species to be tackled). Data collection for ToR 1 and 2 were extensively discussed. The WG was informed on a framework contract that EFSA launched to collect the data; identified, as first steps to proceed, the definition of the review question to be answered via the literature search; also, made a first attempt to define 'AMR concern' in both terrestrial and aquatic animal species. The WG agreed to focus the data collection on the known bacteria that are responsible for transmissible diseases in animals but not in humans. A first list of such bacteria, stratified by affected animal species and drafted as preparatory work for the meeting, was presented. The WG will revise the draft list of bacteria and will draft the review questions/technical specifications for the data collection by the next meeting.

#### 5. Next meeting(s)

Next WG meeting is scheduled on 8 June 2020; to prepare the June meeting, the WG agreed to hold a preparatory meeting by end of May.