

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on the Assessment of Low Atmospheric Pressure System for stunning broiler chickens – Second application

**Held on 16-17 August 2016, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 07 September 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj
Alexei Vyssotski

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Animal and Plant Health Unit: Gabriele Zancanaro

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Discussion on the eligibility criteria of the evidences provided in the LAPS dossier ³

4.1.1. Assessment framework

The WG agreed on working within the framework laid down in the EFSA Guidance on the assessment criteria for studies evaluating the effectiveness of stunning interventions regarding animal protection at the time of killing⁴. The parameters to be provided when applying a stunning intervention based on low atmospheric pressure, and related to the intervention itself, are listed in Table 8 (Section 3.1.3.4) of the same guidance. The parameters related to the outcome of the intervention are listed and described in sections 3.2.1, 3.2.1.3, 3.2.2 and 3.2.3.

It was agreed to assess the eligibility of the provided dossier against the presence/absence of the relevant data mentioned above.

In addition, it was agreed that the assessment, at each step, has to be conducted at dossier level and not at individual study level.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00327>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/3486>

4.1.2. Eligibility assessment

The WG extracted the relevant data from the dossier. Presence / Absence of all the relevant information was assessed.

5. Confidentiality

While checking the documents the applicant provided to the EC and that the EC shared with EFSA, the WG noticed that a considerable number of documents are marked as confidential in their entirety.

While EFSA does not publish entire studies submitted for assessment, in its published scientific opinions EFSA has to disclose data from a given study which are considered essential for the scientific assessment, in order to comply with requirements for transparency as outlined in Articles 38 to 40 of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002.

EFSA will ask the applicant to indicate precisely the specific parts of the documents for which confidentiality is requested (e.g. page numbers, sections, lines, etc.) and to provide a specific justification for each part deemed to be kept confidential by EFSA.

6. Next steps

6.1. Project management

Timelines and milestones of the project were discussed and agreed.

6.2. Tasks and assignments

Specific tasks were assigned to the WG members and EFSA.

7. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held in Parma, on the 11-12 October 2016.

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on the Assessment of Low Atmospheric Pressure System for stunning broiler chickens – Second application

**Held on 11-12 October 2016, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 31 October 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj
Alexei Vyssotski

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Animal and Plant Health Unit: Gabriele Zancanaro, Joana Morgado

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Discussion on the quality of reporting and methodological criteria of the evidences provided in the LAPS dossier ³

The WG extracted and critically assessed the relevant information from the dossier.

Although it emerges clear that the LAPS process induces unconsciousness and death in all the birds at the end of the intervention, at this stage and based on the information provided, the WG is not able to perform a full assessment of the impact on the animal welfare during the induction phase.

5. Confidentiality

Following the e-mail sent by EFSA asking the applicant to indicate precisely the specific parts of the documents for which confidentiality is requested (e.g. page numbers, sections, lines, etc.) and to provide a specific justification for each part deemed to be kept confidential, EFSA

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00327>

received a reply by the applicant. The content of the reply letter is currently under discussion with the legal services of EFSA.

6. Next steps

6.1. Project management

The WG experts, considering that the goal of EFSA is, among others, to promote innovation leading to improved animal welfare at slaughter, agreed on proposing the applicants to provide the EC and EFSA with additional information in order to enable a proper and accurate full assessment of the proposed stunning methodology. The proposal will be evaluated by the AHAW Panel experts in the context of the 100th Plenary Meeting on 18th – 19th October 2016.

Should the applicant agree on providing more data and information as proposed, the timelines of the project need to be revised.

6.2. Tasks and assignments

Specific tasks were assigned to the WG members and EFSA.

7. Next meeting

The next meeting will be held in Parma, on the 28th November 2016.

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on the Assessment of Low Atmospheric Pressure System for stunning broiler chickens – Second application

**Held on 28 November 2016, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 6 December 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Alexei Vyssotski

- **Hearing Experts:**

Gwenola Touzot-Jourde

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Animal and Plant Health Unit: Gabriele Zancanaro

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with the following changes:

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion
 - 4.1. Discussion on the butorphanol issue
 - 4.2. Consolidation of the Eligibility, Methodological and Reporting quality assessment sections
 - 4.3. Overview of the draft opinion: discussion on the pending issues
 - 4.4. Update on the request for additional information

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Discussion on butorphanol³

The appropriateness of the butorphanol as a suitable drug to alleviate pain as used in one of the studies was discussed. Clarifications are needed.

4.2. Consolidation of the Eligibility, Methodological and Reporting quality assessment sections

The document was harmonised across the different sections and appendices.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00327>

4.3. Overview of the draft opinion: discussion on the pending issues

The document was harmonised across the different sections and appendices and the pending issues addressed.

4.4. Update on the request for additional information

An update on the request for information to be sent to the applicants was given by EFSA to the experts.

5. Next steps

5.1. Update of the project outline / milestones / deadlines

It was not possible to outline the project as, should the applicants make the required information available, the date at which they will provide EFSA with the relevant data was not known yet.

6. AOB

No other business

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on the Assessment of Low Atmospheric Pressure System for stunning broiler chickens – Second application

Held on 3 April 2017, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 7 April 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj
Alexei Vyssotski

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Animal and Plant Health Unit: Gabriele Zancanaro

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any change.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion³

4.1. Update on the data and information requested by the WG experts to integrate the submitted dossier

Following a communication from the applicants about a delay in the submission of the required data, the WG adapted the deadlines and the milestones to the new scenario. Adoption of the Scientific Opinion is foreseen for October 2017.

4.2. Assessment methodology to be adopted:

The WG discussed the identification and definition of key terminology and parameters in relation to the assessment. A scoping exercise on relevant scientific literature was performed

5. Next steps

5.1. Presentation of the proposed assessment to the AHAW Panel

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00327>

A presentation summarising the proposed assessment approach will be given at the Plenary Meeting on the 4-5 April 2017.

5.2. Request for anticipating

The WG experts suggested to explore the possibility to access the data as early as possible even if this means incomplete data at first. This could mean access to data before the end of April. i.e. visual material and EEG traces.

6. AOB

No other business

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on the Assessment of Low Atmospheric Pressure System for stunning broiler chickens – Second application

**Held on 2-3 May 2017, Barcelona (Spain)
(Agreed on 23 May 2017)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Alexei Vyssotski

Christoph Winckler

Hans-Herman Thulke

Hans Spoolder

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Animal and Plant Health Unit: Gabriele Zancanaro

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Hans Spoolder.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any change.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion³

4.1. Additional data and information provided by the applicants

The WG screened the additional data and information provided by the applicants. The revision of the statistical analysis will be performed by the AMU unit, as planned.

4.2. Assessment methodology to be adopted:

The WG further discussed and agreed on the methodological approach following the input of the EC.

5. Next steps

5.1. Development of the descriptive sections on the proposed stunning intervention

5.2. Setting up of an Expert Knowledge Elicitation

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00327>

6. AOB

No other business

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on the Assessment of Low Atmospheric Pressure System for stunning broiler chickens – Second application

**Held on 31 May 2017, Web-conference
(Agreed on 9 June 2017)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Alexei Vyssotski

Hans-Herman Thulke

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Animal and Plant Health Unit: Gabriele Zancanaro

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Christoph Winckler.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any change.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion³

4.1. Extensive Literature Search and Expert Judgment

The WG discussed and agreed the details of the planned extensive literature search and the expert judgement exercise.

4.2. Draft Scientific Opinion

The WG revised, discussed and agreed on the structure of the draft scientific opinion. The methodological section was revised and discussed.

5. Next steps

5.1. Submission of the draft scientific opinion to the Panel for feedback on the methodological section

5.2. Drafting the results section

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00327>

6. AOB

No other business

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on the Assessment of Low Atmospheric Pressure System for stunning broiler chickens – Second application

**Held on 5-6 July 2017, Parma
(Agreed on 6 July 2017)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Alexei Vyssotski

Hans-Herman Thulke

Christoph Winckler (day 1 only)

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Animal and Plant Health Unit: Gabriele Zancanaro

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Christoph Winckler for day 2.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any change.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion³

4.1. Expert Ranking

The WG identified, discussed and agreed the list of potential hazards across the different stunning methods.

The WG agreed on the list of experts to be contacted for the ranking exercise.

4.2. Draft Scientific Opinion

The WG revised, discussed and agreed on the structure of the draft scientific opinion. The methodological section was revised and discussed in light of the feedback from the Panel. The section related to the available data was reviewed.

5. Next steps

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00327>

5.1. Management and implementation of the extensive literature search and of the ranking exercise

5.2. Drafting the recommendations section

6. AOB

No other business

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on the Assessment of Low Atmospheric Pressure System for stunning broiler chickens – Second application

**Held on 3-4 August 2017, Parma
(Agreed on 4 August 2017)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj
Alexei Vyssotski

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

Animal and Plant Health Unit: Gabriele Zancanaro

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received by Hans Herman Thulke and Christoph Winckler

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any change.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion³

4.1. Extensive literature search

The WG discussed the first outcomes of the data extraction and the feasibility of a quantitative comparison.

4.2. Combination of indicators

The WG analysed, discussed and combined the different information originating from different type of animal welfare indicators.

5. Next steps

5.1. Analysis of the results from the expert ranking

5.2. Discussion and agreement on conclusion and recommendations

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00327>

6. AOB

No other business

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on the Assessment of Low Atmospheric Pressure System for stunning broiler chickens – Second application

**Held on 31 August-1 September 2017, Paris
(Agreed on 11 September 2017)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Alexei Vyssotski

Hans-Herman Thulke (day 1)

Christoph Winckler

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Stanislav RALCHEV

- **EFSA:**

Animal and Plant Health Unit: Gabriele Zancanaro

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received by Hans Herman Thulke for day 2.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any change.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion³

4.1. Conclusions and Recommendations

The WG discussed and agreed on the conclusions and recommendations to be submitted to the Panel at the next plenary meeting.

4.2. Draft revision

The WG revised the entire document to check for consistency and completeness.

5. Next steps

5.1. Submission to the Panel for discussion

6. AOB

No other business

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00327>

ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

Animal and Plant Health Unit

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on the Assessment of Low Atmospheric Pressure System for stunning broiler chickens – Second application

**Held on 6 October 2017, Parma
(Agreed on 13 October 2017)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Alexei Vyssotski

Christoph Winckler

- **Hearing Experts:**

Not applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not applicable

- **EFSA:**

Animal and Plant Health Unit: Gabriele Zancanaro

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any change.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion³

4.1. Draft revision

The WG revised the entire document to check for consistency and completeness, with a particular focus on the earlier sections of the draft.

All pending comments were addressed.

5. Next steps

5.1. Submission to the Panel for adoption

6. AOB

No other business

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00327>