

Parma, 25 November 2013

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 22nd meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on WEB-conference, 19 November 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 22 November 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)
Hans-Hermann Thulke
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj
Lotta Berg

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chairman welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and following the fact that EFSA did not request specific DoIs prior to the meeting, EFSA requested the experts whether they had any additional interest to declare than the ones declared in the Annual Declaration of interest. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 21st Working Group meeting held on 14 10 2013.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 19 11 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 25 11 2013.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00892](#))

The opinion on sheep and goats was revised and further amendments to the toolbox for head-only electrical stunning and slaughter without stunning were done.

5.2. Topic n°2 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00893](#))

The opinion on poultry was revised and further amendments to the toolbox for electrical waterbath stunning, gas stunning and slaughter without stunning were done.

6. Next meeting dates

No meetings are foreseen.

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 21st meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on WEB-conference, 14 October 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 22 November 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)
Hans-Hermann Thulke
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

7. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Lotta Berg.

8. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

9. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

10. Agreement of the minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting held on 08 10 2013.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 22 11 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 25 11 2013.

AHAW UNIT

11. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Topic n°1 ([EFSA-O-2012-00840](#))

The opinion on bovines was revised and further amendments to the toolbox for captive bolt stunning and slaughter without stunning were done.

12. Next meeting dates

19th November webconference

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 20th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on WEB-conference, 8 October 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 22 November 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)
Hans-Hermann Thulke
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj
Lotta Berg

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

13. Welcome and apologies

The chairman welcomed the participants.

14. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

15. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

16. Agreement of the minutes of the 19th Working Group meeting held on 30 09 2013.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02 10 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 03 10 2013.

AHAW UNIT

17. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Topic n°1 ([EFSA-O-2012-00840](#))

The opinion on bovines was revised and further amendments to the toolbox for captive bolt stunning and slaughter without stunning were done.

18. Next meeting dates

14th October webconference

Parma, 3 October 2013

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 19th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on WEB-conference, 30 September 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 02 October 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)
Hans-Hermann Thulke
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

1. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Lotta Berg.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 18th Working Group meeting held on 09 09 2013.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02 10 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 03 10 2013.

AHAW UNIT

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#))

The opinion on bovines was revised and further amendments to the toolbox for captive bolt stunning and slaughter without stunning were done.

6. Next meeting dates

8th October webconference

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 18th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on WEB-conference, 9 September 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 02 October 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)

Hans-Hermann Thulke

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Lotta Berg

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

1. Welcome and apologies

The chairman welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting held on 04 09 2013. The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02 10 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 03 10 2013.

AHAW UNIT

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Topic n°3 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00891](#))

The draft opinion on pigs was completed in light of recent comments from hearing experts.

6. Next meeting dates

30th September webconference

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 17th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on WEB-conference, 4 September 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 2 October 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)

Hans-Hermann Thulke

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj (physical meeting)

Lotta Berg

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

1. Welcome and apologies

The chairman welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting held on 3 09 2013.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02 10 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 03 10 2013.

AHAW UNIT

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#))

The draft opinion on bovines was completed in light of recent comments from hearing experts.

6. Next meeting dates

9th September physical meeting

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 16th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

3 September 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 2 October 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)
Hans-Hermann Thulke
Antonio Velarde
Mohan Raj Lotta Berg

• **Hearing experts:**

Luc Mirabito (idele), Karen von Holleben (bsi-schwarzenbek), Haluk Anil (University of Cardiff), Cees Vermeeren (a.v.e.c.), Elisiv Tolo (Animalia), Rebeca Garcia (AHVLA), Bo Algers (SLU), Marien Gerritzen (WUR), Charlie Mason (HSA),

• **European Commission representatives:**

Terence Cassidy (SANCO), Denis Simonin (SANCO)

• **EFSA:**

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

1. Welcome and apologies

The chairman welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

AHAW UNIT

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting held on 3 09 2013.

The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02 10 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 03 10 2013.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#))

The indicators selected for the toolbox for cattle by the working group on the basis of the outcomes from the stakeholder meeting held in January 2013, the systematic literature review and the online survey were discussed with interested parties. Comments received through the public consultation were also taken into account and discussed.

6. Next meeting dates

4th September webconference

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 15th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on WEB-conference, 1-3 July 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 29 July 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)

HansHerman Thulke

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Lotta Berg

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

7. Welcome and apologies

The chairman welcomed the participants.

8. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

9. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

10. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 28 06

2013. The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 29 07 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 30 07 2013.

AHAW UNIT

11. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#))

The indicators for the toolbox proposed for cattle were selected. The draft opinion was finalised in order to be published on the EFSA's website for a public consultation.

5.2. Topic n°2 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00892](#))

The indicators for the toolbox proposed for sheep and goats were selected. This toolbox will be annexed to the draft opinion on cattle that will be published on the EFSA's website for a public consultation.

5.3. Topic n°3 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00891](#))

The indicators for the toolbox proposed for pigs were selected. This toolbox will be annexed to the draft opinion on cattle that will be published on the EFSA's website for a public consultation.

5.4. Topic n°4 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00893](#))

The indicators for the toolbox proposed for poultry were selected. This toolbox will be annexed to the draft opinion on cattle that will be published on the EFSA's website for a public consultation.

12. Next meeting dates

3rd September physical meeting

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 14th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on WEB-conference, 28 June 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 29 July 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)
HansHerman Thulke

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

7. Welcome and apologies

Apologies were received from Antonio Velarde, Mohan Raj, Lotta Berg

8. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

9. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

10. Agreement of the minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting held on 27 06

2013. The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 29 07 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 30 07 2013.

AHAW UNIT

11. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#))

An overall revision of the draft opinion was carried out, specially aimed at finalising the criteria for selecting the indicators for the toolbox.

12. Next meeting dates

1st and 3rd July web conference

Parma, 30 July 2013

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 13th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on 27 June 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 29 July 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)

HansHerman Thulke

Antonio Velarde

Mohan Raj

Lotta Berg

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

SAS Unit (Gabriele Zancanaro)

13. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

14. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

15. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

AHAW UNIT

16. Agreement of the minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting held on 18 06 2013, TELE-conference. The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 25 06 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 25 06 2013.

17. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#))

The first outcomes of the analysis of the data on cattle collected through the online questionnaire were screened. A draft toolbox of indicators was proposed on the basis of such outcomes. The working group also finalised the section on materials and methods and drafted the Result section.

5.2. Topic n°2 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00893](#))

As for the previous opinion, the first outcomes of the analysis of the data on poultry collected through the online questionnaire were screened. A draft toolbox of indicators was proposed on the basis of such outcomes. The working group also finalised the section on materials and methods and drafted the Result section.

18. Next meeting dates

28th June web conference

Parma, 25 June 2013

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 12th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on TELE-conference, 18 June 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 25 June 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)

HansHerman Thulke

Antonio Velarde

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

SAS Unit (Gabriele Zancanaro)

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

- 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on 07 06 2013, TELE-conference.** The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 17 06 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 18 06 2013.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00893](#))

The chapter on risk factors for the monitoring procedures for bovines was revised following a clarification with the Commission. It is proposed that risk factors affecting the stunning efficacy are not evaluated whilst risk factors affecting the assessment of unconsciousness/death are assessed together with their impact on animal welfare.

6. Next meeting dates

27th June physical meeting

Parma, 17 June 2013

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on TELE-conference, 7 June 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 17 June 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Charlotte Berg

Hans Spoolder (chair)

Antonio Velarde

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

SAS Unit (Gabriele Zancanaro)

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 28 29 05 2013. The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 17 06 2013 and published on the EFSA website on 18 06 2013.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00893](#))

The chapter on welfare indicators to be used for the monitoring procedures for bovines was completed (to be readapted to all species): for each indicator information on its sensitivity, specificity and feasibility is given. Such information is the result of combined findings from the systematic literature review and the online survey that was recently run. Working group members discussed those findings based on their knowledge.

6. Next meeting dates

18th June (1 pm - 4 pm) teleconference

Parma, 06 June 2013

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on 28 29 May 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 05 June 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Charlotte Berghas participated via teleconference
Hans Spoolder (chair)
Mohan Raj (rapporteur)
Antonio Velarde
Hans Hermann Thulke

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)
SAS Unit (Gabriele Zancanaro)

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. **Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 17 05 2013, TELE-conference.** The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 05 06 2013 and published on the EFSA website 06 06 2013.

5. **Scientific topics for discussion**

- 5.1 **Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#); [EFSA-Q-2012-00893](#))**

The chapter on materials and methods was drafted for the two opinions. The outcomes of the systematic review about specificity and sensitivity of the indicators were also drafted, as well as the results of the preliminary outcomes of the survey. The session on sampling procedures was drafted for the opinion on bovines.

6. **Next meeting dates**

7th June teleconference

AHAW UNIT

Parma, 06 June 2013

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on TELE-conference, 17 May 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 05 June 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Charlotte Berg
Hans Spoolder (chair)
Mohan Raj (rapporteur)
Antonio Velarde

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

7. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Hans Hermann Thulke.

8. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

9. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

10. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 08 05 2013, TELE-conference. The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 15 05 2013 and published on the EFSA website 15 05 2013.

11. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00892](#))

An overall revision of the chapter on risk factors and welfare consequences was done for the different stunning and killing phases. The overall table of contents was readjusted.

12. Next meeting dates

28th and 29th May physical meeting

Parma, 15 May 2013

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on TELE-conference, 8 May 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 15 May 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Charlotte Berg
Hans Spoolder (chair)
Mohan Raj (rapporteur)
Antonio Velarde

EFSA:

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Hans Hermann Thulke.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

- 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 09-10-11 04 2013, TELE-conference.** The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 02 05 2013 and published on the EFSA website 02 05 2013.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00892](#))

An overall revision of the chapter on the welfare indicators was done for the different stunning and killing phases. The preliminary report from the systematic review was quickly checked but the decision of waiting for a more updated version was taken. The overall table of contents was readjusted.

6. Next meeting dates

17th May (2 pm – 4 pm) teleconference

Parma, 2 May 2013

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on 9-10-11 April 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 19 April 2013)

Participants

- **WG Experts:**

Charlotte Berg (10-11 April 2013 only)

Hans Spoolder (chair) (10-11 April 2013 only)

Mohan Raj (rapporteur) (9-10-11 April 2013)

Hans Hermann Thulke has participated via teleconference

Antonio Velarde (10-11 April 2013 only)

- **EFSA:**

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

- 1. Welcome and apologies**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

- 2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

- 3. Declarations of interest**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

- 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 13 14 03 2013, TELE-conference.** The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 21 03 2013 and published on the EFSA website 09 04 2013.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#); [EFSA-Q-2012-00892](#))

A description of the indicators to be used in the different phases of the slaughter process (stunning, sticking or bleeding) was produced for bovines stunned by captive bolt and for bovines slaughtered without stunning by Mohan Raj on the 9th of April. Such text was commented within the working group on 10 April and a similar one for sheep and goats was produced. On the 11th of April tables were produced summarising the main risk factors and possible solutions for sheep and goats.

6. Next meeting dates

8th May (11 am – 1 pm) teleconference

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on 13-14 March 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 21 March 2013)

Participants

- **WG Experts:**
 - Hans Spoolder (chair)
 - Mohan Raj (rapporteur)
 - Hans Hermann Thulke has participated via teleconference
 - Antonio Velarde
- **EFSA:**
 - AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies were received from Charlotte Berg.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

- 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 28 02 2013, TELE-conference.** The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 12 03 2013 and published on the EFSA website 22 03 2013.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#))

The list of indicators was redefined and indicators were subdivided according to the phase of the slaughter process they are applied to (stunning, sticking or bleeding). The kick-off meeting with the contractor of an online survey, which is soon to be launched about the use of indicators, was also held and the questions to be asked in such survey were agreed.

6. Next meeting dates

10th-11th April 2013 (9 am – 5 pm) physical meeting in Parma

Parma, 22 March 2013

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on 28 February 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 12 March 2013)

Participants

- **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)

Mohan Raj (rapporteur)

Hans Hermann Thulke has participated via teleconference

Antonio Velarde

- **EFSA:**

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Charlotte Berg.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

AHAW UNIT

- 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 23 01 2013, TELE-conference.** The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 12 03 2013 and published on the EFSA website 22 03 2013.

- 5. Scientific topics for discussion**

- 5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#))**

The table of contents of the opinion was drafted and tasks were subdivided among the experts. The outcomes of the questionnaire circulated at the stakeholder meeting held on 30th January 2013 were analysed.

- 6. Next meeting dates**

13th-14th March 2013 (9 am – 5 pm) physical meeting in Parma

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on or TELE-conference, 23 January 2013

(Agreed on 12 March 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)
Mohan Raj (rapporteur)
Charlotte Berg
Hans Hermann Thulke
Antonio Velarde

• **EFSA:**

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

7. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

8. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

9. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

10. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 18 01 2013, TELE-conference. The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 12 03 2013 and published on the EFSA website 22 03 2013.

11. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#))

The draft Powerpoint presentations from the speakers of the stakeholder meeting which will be held on January 30th 2013 were revised. The questions of the questionnaire about the

AHAW UNIT

indicators for assessing unconsciousness and death of the animals were also revised. Since EFSA will outsource a contract for running an online survey, it was decided not to run a second round of the same questionnaire. Purposes of this first questionnaire are to collect information about the use of the indicators and to collect contacts of competent people to be involved in the future online survey. The aim of the latter is to achieve a larger number of respondents and to collect information about sensitivity and specificity of the indicators.

12. Next meeting dates

28th February 2013 (9 am – 5 pm) physical meeting in Parma

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on or WEB-conference, 18 January 2013

(Agreed on 12 March 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)
Mohan Raj (rapporteur)
Charlotte Berg
Hans Hermann Thulke
Antonio Velarde

• **EFSA:**

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 19 12 2012, TELE-conference. The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 12 03 2013 and published on the EFSA website 22 03 2013.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#))

The draft Powerpoint presentations from the speakers of the stakeholder meeting which will be held on January 30th 2013 have been discussed and some amendments were agreed

AHAW UNIT

(e.g. the presentation on the indicators of death will also include a section on the indicators of unconsciousness after killing). Decisions were taken about the questionnaire about the indicators for assessing unconsciousness and death of the animals. In particular, it will be distributed to the participants for compilation during the meeting. A second round of the same questionnaire could follow to give the respondents the opportunity to revise their answers, in agreement with the Delphi methodology for eliciting expert knowledge.

6. Next meetings

23rd January 2013 (10 am – 2 pm) tele-conference

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on or TELE-conference, 19 December 2012

(Agreed on 12 March 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)
Mohan Raj (rapporteur)
Charlotte Berg
Hans Hermann Thulke
Antonio Velarde

• **EFSA:**

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

1. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 12 12 2012, TELE-conference. The minutes were agreed by written procedure on 12 03 2013 and published on the EFSA website 22 03 2013.

2. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#))

The contents of the stakeholder meeting which will be held on January 30th 2013 have been discussed and the draft agenda agreed. A questionnaire about the indicators for assessing

AHAW UNIT

unconsciousness and death of the animals will be distributed to the participants. The main purposes of it are to collect information about the use of the indicators and to collect contacts of competent people to be involved in a future exercise of expert knowledge elicitation.

The table of contents of the scientific opinions was also discussed and it was proposed to follow the sequence of points to be addressed in the mandate. It was also agreed to start with the scientific opinion on Bovines stunned by captive bolt and killed without stunning as a pilot opinion.

3. Next meeting dates

18th January 2013 (10 am – 2 pm) tele-conference

Scientific Panel on animal health and welfare

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the working group on monitoring procedures at slaughterhouses

Held on or TELE-conference, 12 December 2012

(Agreed on 12 March 2013)

Participants

• **WG Experts:**

Hans Spoolder (chair)
Mohan Raj (rapporteur)
Charlotte Berg
Hans Hermann Thulke
Antonio Velarde

• **EFSA:**

AHAW Unit (Denise Candiani, Chiara Fabris, Maria Ferrara)

1. Welcome and apologies

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Topic n°1 ([EFSA-Q-2012-00840](#))

The methodology of systematic review for collecting scientific evidence on the performances of the welfare indicators for monitoring unconsciousness and death of the animals at slaughter was discussed. The need of a clear and univocal definition of unconsciousness

AHAW UNIT

and death was emphasised; this definition should be taken from previous EFSA scientific opinions and re-worded in order to make it more operational and practical for the people that are working in the field. An Expert Knowledge Elicitation (EKE) exercise will also be carried out involving people that have the practical knowledge of the stunning/killing process (e.g. operators of the biggest slaughterhouses in EU and Official veterinarians-inspectors). Considering the indicators listed by the WG, these people will be asked to give their subjective opinion on: i) specificity and sensitivity of the indicators, ii) the frequency of occurrence of the indicators (i.e., how often the indicators are checked and seen?).

5. Next meeting dates

19th December 2012 – tele-conference