

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare (AHAW)

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on
revision of guidance of the assessment criteria for
studies evaluating the effectiveness of stunning
interventions regarding animal protection at the time of
killing

Held on 4-5 December 2017, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 19 December 2017)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel (Chair)
Christoph Winckler
Mohan Raj
Hans Spoolder
Antonio Velarde
Hans-Hermann Thulke

- **EFSA:**

AHAW Unit: Denise Candiani

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies were presented for Hans-Hermann Thulke.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Terms of reference of the mandate ³

The Terms of reference (ToRs) of the Mandate were presented to the WG Members and the approach to be followed was discussed. ToR1 requires a revision and refinement of the criteria and procedure for assessment phase 1 of the guidance. Therefore, the criteria that need to be revised were listed and a discussion was held on how they can be refined with the overall aim of simplifying the steps of the guidance related to assessment phase 1. Table of contents and structure of the guidance were agreed.

ToR3 requires a revision of the welfare outcomes that should be provided by the applicant to demonstrate the results of the new or modified stunning intervention. A discussion on welfare outcomes and their level of details was therefore held and it was agreed to establish broad categories of outcomes (e.g. physiology, behaviour, neurology) that the applicant will have to provide in the dossier submitted to EFSA.

5. Next meeting(s)

Next meetings: webconferences - 8th, 15th and 18th January 2018

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00711>

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare (AHAW)

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on
revision of guidance of the assessment criteria for
studies evaluating the effectiveness of stunning
interventions regarding animal protection at the time of
killing

Held on 8th, 15th and 18th January 2018, via WEB-
conference

(Agreed on 19 January 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel (Chair)
Christoph Winckler
Mohan Raj
Hans Spoolder
Antonio Velarde
Hans-Hermann Thulke

- **EFSA:**

AHAW Unit: Denise Candiani

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were presented for Hans-Hermann Thulke and Hans Spoolder for the 18th January 18.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1th Working Group meeting held on 4-5 December 2017, Parma.

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 4-5 December 2017 were agreed by written procedure on 19 December 2017.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Terms of reference of the mandate ³

Firstly, the process for submission of "applications" on new or modified stunning methods was defined. The information needed in the "dossier" submitted by the applicant was also discussed and agreed. A flowchart summarising the process was produced. Secondly, the first 3 ToRs were dealt with. For ToR1 the WG agreed and compiled all criteria (that need to be revised) and the steps of the guidance that have to be simplified for assessment phase 1. For ToR2 data variables to be provided by the applicant were discussed and specified. For ToR3, the approach was discussed and it was agreed that the chapter will provide examples of welfare outcomes. It will be up to the applicant to select the most appropriate welfare outcomes and provide justification for those. A table was produced that classifies welfare outcome examples into behavioural, neurological and physiological.

6. Next meeting(s)

Next meetings: 22nd and 25th January 2018

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00711>

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare (AHAW)

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on
revision of guidance of the assessment criteria for
studies evaluating the effectiveness of stunning
interventions regarding animal protection at the time of
killing

Held on 22nd and 25th January 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 9 February 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Virginie Michel (Chair)
Christoph Winckler
Mohan Raj
Hans Spoolder
Antonio Velarde
Hans-Hermann Thulke

- **EFSA:**

AHAW Unit: Denise Candiani

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were presented for Hans-Hermann Thulke and Hans Spoolder for the 18th January 18.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 8th, 15th and 18th January 2018, Parma.

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 8th, 15th and 18th January 2018 were agreed on 19 January 2018.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1. Terms of reference of the mandate ³

The discussion was focused on ToR4, on criteria for internal and external validity, and on ToR5 on methodologies for assessing the equivalence with existing stunning interventions. It was agreed that

6. Next meeting(s)

Next meetings: 20th and 21st February 2018

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2017-00711>

Animal and Plant Health Unit (ALPHA UNIT)**Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare (AHAW)****Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on revision of guidance of the assessment criteria for studies evaluating the effectiveness of stunning interventions regarding animal protection at the time of killing****Held on 20th - 21st February 2018****(Agreed on 5 March 2018)****Participants****• Working Group Members:**

Christoph Winckler (CW), Mohan Raj (MR), Hans Spoolder (HS) Antonio Velarde (AV), Virginie Michel (VM, Chair), Hans-Hermann Thulke (HHT).

• EFSA:

AHAW Unit: Denise Candiani (DC)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were presented for Hans-Hermann Thulke.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Terms of reference of the mandate (<http://raw-app.efsa.eu.int:8080/raw-war/wicket/page?1>)

The text was finalised about all criteria (that need to be revised) and the steps of the guidance. It was agreed that the first completeness check will be performed by the EFSA APDESK Unit. The AHAW Panel will check for the second step of the assessment, namely the suitability of the scientific evaluation of the proposed stunning method. The text explaining the data variables to be provided by the applicant was finalised. Criteria for internal and external validity were also finalised as well as criteria and methods for assessing the equivalence with existing approved stunning methods. The document will be discussed at the next AHAW Plenary meeting for endorsement before public consultation. The public consultation will take place from mid-March till end of April 18.

5. Next meeting

Next meetings: 18 May 2018 (webconference)

Animal and Plant Health Unit (ALPHA UNIT)**Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare (AHAW)****Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on revision of guidance of the assessment criteria for studies evaluating the effectiveness of stunning interventions regarding animal protection at the time of killing****Held by webconference on 18th – 22nd May 2018****(Agreed on 6 June 2018)****Participants****• Working Group Members:**

18 May 2018: Christoph Winckler (CW), Mohan Raj (MR), Hans Spooler (HS), Antonio Velarde (AV), Hans-Hermann Thulke (HHT), Virginie Michel (VM, Chair).

22 May 2108: Virginie Michel (VM, Chair)

• EFSA:

AHAW Unit: Denise Candiani (DC)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 Terms of reference of the mandate (<http://raw-app.efsa.eu.int:8080/raw-war/wicket/page?1>)

The guidance was amended following the comments from public consultation. Comments aimed at improving the document clarity were taken on board and the guidance was

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

amended accordingly. These comments were either related to the process for handling the applications or to the scientific assessment of the method. In parallel, a technical report from the public consultation was produced by EFSA's secretariat and was assessed by the working group.

A final revision of the draft was carried out in order to prepare the document for possible adoption during the AHAW Plenary meeting of June 2018.