

**MINUTES OF THE 31ST PLENARY MEETING
OF THE EFSA SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH
HELD IN PARMA (ITALY) ON 23-24 MARCH 2011**

(ADOPTED ON 18 MAY 2011)

ITEM	AGENDA	PAGE
1.	Welcome, apologies for absence	2
2.	Adoption of the agenda	2
3.	Declarations of interests	2
4.	Adoption of the minutes of 30 th Plenary meeting	3
5.	Discussion and possible adoption of the draft scientific opinion on a technical file submitted by the US authorities to support a request to list a new option among the EU import requirements for wood of <i>Agrilus planipennis</i> host plants	3
6.	Discussion and possible adoption of the draft scientific opinion on assessment of the risk to plant health of <i>Monilinia fructicola</i> for the EU territory	3
7.	New mandates from the Commission: - Risk assessment of potato cyst nematodes (<i>Globodera rostochiensis</i> and <i>G.pallida</i>)	4
8.	Update on the status of the on-going mandates: - Evaluation of PRA of <i>Phytophthora ramorum</i> - Assessment of the risk to plant health of solanaceous poispiviroids for the EU territory - Request from the USA regarding export of Florida citrus fruit to the EU - Self-task on ERA PLH - Self task on Guidance on evaluation of pest risk reduction options	4
9.	Presentation of the EFSA Information Exchange Platform	6
10.	EFSA Scientific Colloquium on emerging plant health threats	6

11.	Panel renewal 2012	
12.	Miscellaneous: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Report from Scientific Committee - Update from PLH Secretariat - Next meeting confirmation 	6

PARTICIPANTS

Members of the PLH Panel

Richard BAKER, Thierry CANDRESSE, Erzsébet DORMANNSNÉ SIMON, Gianni GILIOLI, Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE, Michael John JEGER, Olia Evtimova KARADJOVA, Gábor LÖVEI, David MAKOWSKI, Charles MANCEAU, Maria NAVAJAS, Angelo PORTA PUGLIA, Trond RAFOSS, Vittorio ROSSI, Gritta SCHRADER, Gregor UREK, Johan Coert VAN LENTEREN, Irene VLOUTOGLOU, Stephan WINTER, Marina ZLOTINA

EFSA

PLH Unit: Elzbieta CEGLARSKA, Virag KERTESZ, Svetla KOZELSKA, Doreen RUSSELL, Giuseppe STANCANELLI, Sara TRAMONTINI, Sybren VOS

European Commission (via video link- first day)

Dorota BUZON, Robert BAAYEN, Michael WALSH

Apologies

PLH Panel: Jan SCHANS, Gianni GILIOLI (1st Day)

European Commission: Dana SIMION, Harry ARIJS, Guillermo CARDON, Michael WALSH, Nandor PETE (DG SANCO)

1. WELCOME, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

The Panel Chair welcomed the Panel members. Apologies were received from Jan SCHANS (whole meeting), Gianni GILIOLI (1st day), Harry ARIJS, Guillermo CARDON, Nandor PETE (whole meeting), and Michael WALSH (2nd day). The Chair noted the absence of a physical presence at the meeting by any European Commission representative for the 3rd successive Panel meeting.

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was adopted.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interest, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited to the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the declaration of interest please refer to Annex 1.

4. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES OF THE 30TH PLENARY MEETING

The minutes were adopted without changes. The list of actions from the previous meeting was reviewed.

5. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON A TECHNICAL FILE SUBMITTED BY THE US AUTHORITIES TO SUPPORT A REQUEST TO LIST A NEW OPTION AMONG THE EU IMPORT REQUIREMENTS FOR WOOD OF *AGRILUS PLANIPENNIS* HOST PLANTS

EFSA is requested to provide a scientific opinion on a technical file submitted by the US authorities to support a request to list a new option among the EU import requirements for wood of *Agrilus planipennis* host plants. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-01097.

The chair of the working group presented the background and terms of reference to the request. The rapporteurs provided further information on the pest biology together with the data and statistical analyses performed as part of the evaluation. A major hindrance to finalising the scientific opinion has been resolving the issue of publishing raw data in the Panel opinion which has been declared by the author of the data as confidential.

The Panel discussed the opinion. The Commission representatives agreed that further clarifications from USDA APHIS are needed concerning the data publication issue.

The opinion will be adopted in written procedure.

6. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON ASSESSMENT OF THE RISK TO PLANT HEALTH OF *MONILINIA FRUCTICOLA* FOR THE EU TERRITORY

EFSA is requested to provide a pest risk assessment of *Monilinia fructicola* and if appropriate, to identify risk management options and to evaluate their effectiveness in reducing the risk to plant health posed by this organism. The area to be covered by the requested pest risk assessment is the EU territory. EFSA is also requested to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the special requirements linked to *Monilinia fructicola*, presently listed in Annex IV, Part A, Section I of Council Directive 2000/29/EC, in reducing the risk of introduction of this pest into the EU territory. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-00912.

The Chair of the working group presented the background and terms of reference to the request. The main components of the scientific opinion are the pest risk assessment, the assessment of the effectiveness of management options in reducing the risk to plant health posed by this organism the

evaluation of the special requirements. The working group compiled and issued a questionnaire to member states and the chair outlined other methodologies utilised in production of the opinion.

The Panel discussed the opinion including the methodologies used, uncertainties and the conclusions reached. A few minor changes were suggested. The opinion was adopted unanimously.

7. NEW MANDATES FROM THE COMMISSION

The European Commission representative presented to the Panel a mandate request currently in preparation by the Commission and concerning potato cyst nematodes, (*Globodera rostochiensis* and *G.pallida*). The organisms are listed in Council Directive 2000/29/EC which covers all plant material. Council Directive 2007/33/EC addresses the same group of organisms but specifies different plant materials according to risk, particularly in relation to spread. The Commission indicated that an opinion is needed from EFSA as soon as possible.

The Panel discussed the outline of the request as presented which is yet to be formally received and accepted by EFSA.

8. UPDATE ON THE STATUS OF THE ONGOING MANDATES

- Evaluation of PRA on *Phytophthora ramorum*

EFSA is requested to provide a scientific opinion on the pest risk analysis on *Phytophthora ramorum* prepared by the FP6 project RAPRA. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-00841.

The draft opinion was presented to the meeting by the chair of the working group. Particular emphasis was placed on the abundance of recently available literature and the challenges faced by the working group in incorporating this new material together with the comments provided by Member States. An overview of the key findings, conclusions of the risk assessment and risk management chapters, as well as the overall conclusions was presented. Climate maps and host distributions maps were included in the presentation, and an overview of the uncertainties in the evaluation was made evident to the Panel. Following a final meeting of the working group, the draft opinion will be circulated prior to the 32nd Plenary Meeting.

The Panel discussed the draft opinion, including the importance of considering the environmental impact of the organism.

- Assessment of the risk to plant health of solanaceous pospiviroids for the EU territory

EFSA is requested to provide a pest risk assessment of the solanaceous pospiviroids, to identify risk management options and to evaluate their effectiveness in reducing the risk to plant health posed by this organism. The area to be covered by the requested pest risk assessment is the EU territory. EFSA is also requested to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the measures listed in Commission Decision 2007/410/EC in reducing the risk to plant health posed by this organism. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-00911.

A rapporteur from the working group presented a progress report with respect to the mandate. The group of pathogens affects several host plants including potato, tomato and other vegetables as well as ornamentals. The origins of the viroid and global occurrence were outlined, and the fact that different viroids are present in different EU countries presented to the Panel.

The draft pest risk assessment was presented to the Panel. The Panel sought further clarification in relation to weeds as a host and the need for statistics on the numbers of ornamentals grown near vegetable crops such as tomatoes.

- **Request to provide a scientific opinion on the request from the USA regarding export of Florida citrus fruit to the EU**

EFSA is requested to provide a scientific opinion on risk analyses submitted to the Commission and published by the APHIS/USDA in support of their request to consider removing some of the Union's plant health import requirements for citrus fruit. In particular, EFSA is requested to determine whether the conclusions of those risk analyses are scientifically justified. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-01262.

The working group chair presented the Panel with background to this request and the progress made to date. A decision on the skeleton of the opinion and how it will be formulated has been agreed by the working group and this was presented to the Panel.

- **Self task ERA**

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health is requested to develop guidance for the assessment of environmental risks of harmful organisms. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-00794.

The approach proposed, presented by the working group chair, is to evaluate the environmental impact of plant pests based on their impact on the ecosystem service provision, without considering cultural services, as this is outside the remit of the Panel. Developments in the process with regard to the list of questions and sub questions and the related rating system and the glossary of the document were presented. Future developments concerning methodology, particularly in relation to the uncertainty issue, as well as minimum data requirements were shared with the Panel.

It is planned to present the draft to the EFSA Scientific Committee (21-22 June 2011) followed by an inter panel consultation and later a public consultation will be launched (July-September). As a request to extend the deadline of the mandate was agreed, the presentation for final adoption is planned for the November Plenary meeting.

- **Self task on Guidance on evaluation of pest risk reduction options**

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health is requested to produce guidance on methodology for evaluation of the effectiveness of options to reduce the risk of introduction and spread of organisms harmful to plants in the EU territory. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-01343.

The chair of the working group provided a progress report, including the terms of reference and the areas the guidance document wishes to address with respect to opinions already published or in

preparation. Tasks for the working group include a review of guidance produced by other organisations and a checklist will be produced to enable a preliminary assessment of documents.

The Panel sought further clarifications with regard to the terms of reference of this self task and if the working group will consider case studies and historical evidence.

9. PRESENTATION OF THE EFSA INFORMATION EXCHANGE PLATFORM

A representative from the EFSA Scientific Cooperation Unit presented an overview of the IEP, created as a tool for cooperation and networking with member states. It is the role of the national focal points to upload documents intended for sharing such as risk assessments carried out in member states. Information can be downloaded and a monthly report can be made available to the Panel. Information on access rights and statistical reports in relation to the uploaded information was shared with the Panel. There is also a facility that enables a subscription to be made to receive notifications.

The Panel asked for further information regarding the use of IEP and its functioning.

10. EFSA SCIENTIFIC COLLOQUIUM ON EMERGING PLANT HEALTH THREATS

The EFSA secretariat presented a short announcement concerning this event. The four discussion groups agreed by the Panel were outlined and how the groups will be integrated into the plenary discussions explained. A draft programme was shared with the Panel, including the subject areas and confirmed speakers. The programme for the organisational arrangements for the colloquium was also given.

The Panel provided their comments and suggested other speakers for the topic areas and discussed the proposed discussion groups.

11. PANEL RENEWAL 2012

Brief information on the call for Panel renewals was given to the Panel. Particular emphasis was placed on the need to explicitly detail expertise in the application. The timelines for the call, evaluation and final EFSA management board decision on the lists were presented.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

- Report from Scientific Committee

The Panel chair provided a report from last meeting of the EFSA Scientific Committee. The work of the Panel was presented at the last meeting of the advisory forum, particular with respect to the relationship between EFSA and member states. A standing working group on EmRisk is being created with representatives from all concerned Panels including Plant Health. The report on terminology and how uncertainties are dealt with was also discussed at the meeting and good coverage as to how the PLH Panel addresses uncertainties in its opinions given.

- Update from PLH Secretariat

Dates for the forthcoming systematic review workshops were given to the Panel. A new format for publishing Panel members' expertise on the EFSA website will be distributed.

- **Next meeting confirmation:**

18-19 May 2011 Budapest, Hungary.

Annex 1

With regard to the mandate on *Phytophthora ramorum* (EFSA-Q-2010-00841) Dr. Richard Baker declared an interest in relation to his involvement in preparation of the PRA under evaluation. In accordance with EFSA's policy on Declarations of Interest and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting above, the interest above was deemed to be a conflict (level C). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert as per point C.III¹ is excluded from drafting the opinion, and discussing and adopting the final Panel output.

With regard to the mandate on *Agrilus planipennis* (EFSA-Q-2010-01097) and citrus canker (EFSA-Q-2010-01262) Dr. Marina Zlotina declared an interest in relation to her current activities with USDA APHIS. In accordance with EFSA's policy on Declarations of Interest and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting above, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict (level C). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert as per point C.III¹ is excluded from drafting the opinions, and discussing and adopting the final Panel outputs.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/doiconflicts.pdf>