

**MINUTES OF THE 30TH PLENARY MEETING
OF THE EFSA SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH
HELD IN PARMA (ITALY) ON 12-13 JANUARY 2011**

(ADOPTED ON 23 MARCH 2011)

ITEM	AGENDA	PAGE
1.	Welcome, apologies for absence	2
2.	Adoption of the agenda	2
3.	Declarations of interests	2
4.	Adoption of the minutes of 29 th Plenary meeting	3
5.	Discussion and possible adoption of the draft scientific opinion on Evaluation of PRA on <i>Phytophthora ramorum</i>	3
6.	Discussion of the draft scientific opinion on a technical file submitted by the US authorities to support a request to list a new option among the EU import requirements for wood of <i>Agrilus planipennis</i> host plants	3
7.	New mandates from the Commission: - To be confirmed	3
8.	Update on the status of the on-going mandates: - Assessment of the risk to plant health of solanaceous poospiviroids for the EU territory - Assessment of the risk to plant health of Plum pox virus for the EU territory - Assessment of the risk to plant health of <i>Monilinia fructicola</i> for the EU territory - Request from the USA regarding export of Florida citrus fruit to the EU - Self-task on ERA PLH - Self task on Guidance on evaluation of pest risk reduction options	4
9.	EFSA Scientific Colloquium on emerging plant health threats	5

10.	<p>Miscellaneous:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Report from Scientific Committee - Update from PLH Secretariat - Next meeting confirmation 	6
------------	--	----------

PARTICIPANTS

Members of the PLH Panel

Richard BAKER, Thierry CANDRESSE, Erzsébet DORMANNSNÉ SIMON, Gianni GILIOLI, Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE, Michael John JEGER, Olia Evtimova KARADJOVA, Gábor LÖVEI, David MAKOWSKI, Charles MANCEAU, Maria NAVAJAS, Angelo PORTA PUGLIA, Trond RAFOSS, Vittorio ROSSI, Gritta SCHRADER, Gregor UREK, Johan Coert VAN LENTEREN, Irene VLOUTOGLOU, Stephan WINTER, Marina ZLOTINA

EFSA

PLH Unit: Elzbieta CEGLARSKA, Sharon CHEEK, Virag KERTESZ, Svetla KOZELSKA, Doreen RUSSELL, Giuseppe STANCANELLI, Sara TRAMONTINI, Sybren VOS

Apologies

PLH Panel: Jan SCHANS, Gianni GILIOLI

European Commission: Harry ARIJS, Guillermo CARDON, Michael WALSH, Nandor PETE (DG SANCO) and François CONSTANTIN SEVERINI (DG RTD)

1. WELCOME, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

The Panel Chair welcomed the Panel members. Apologies were received from Jan SCHANS (whole meeting), Gianni GILIOLI (1st day), Harry ARIJS, Guillermo CARDON, Michael WALSH, Nandor PETE and François CONSTANTIN SEVERINI.

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was adopted.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interest, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited to the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the declaration of interest please refer to Annex 1.

4. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES OF THE 29TH PLENARY MEETING

The minutes were adopted without changes. The list of actions from the previous meeting was reviewed.

5. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON EVALUATION OF PRA ON *PHYTOPHTHORA RAMORUM*

EFSA is requested to provide a scientific opinion on the pest risk analysis on *Phytophthora ramorum* prepared by the FP6 project RAPRA. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-00841.

The structure of the draft opinion was presented to the meeting by the chair of the working group who highlighted the complexity in addressing the original pest risk assessment; which includes incorporating comments from the Member States as well as new information in every chapter of the evaluation work. Challenges facing the working group from the regularity of new publications, the identification of new hosts and new modeling approaches was also highlighted to explain the complications encountered in producing the scientific opinion. The preliminary conclusions of the working group were presented and discussed including the situation outside the nursery environment. Maps showing beech and larch forestry distribution and the establishment potential of the pathogen were shared with the Panel.

The Panel discussed the presentation and agreed that, in order to comply with the terms of reference that requests an update on the rapidly evolving Japanese larch situation, an extension to the mandate should be requested.

6. OPINION ON A TECHNICAL FILE SUBMITTED BY THE US AUTHORITIES TO SUPPORT A REQUEST TO LIST A NEW OPTION AMONG THE EU IMPORT REQUIREMENTS FOR WOOD OF *AGRILUS PLANIPENNIS* HOST PLANTS

EFSA is requested to provide a scientific opinion on a technical file submitted by the US authorities to support a request to list a new option among the EU import requirements for wood of *Agrilus planipennis* host plants. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-01097.

A status report on the production of the opinion was presented by the chair of the working group.

7. NEW MANDATES FROM THE COMMISSION

In the absence of the Commission representatives the EFSA secretariat advised the Panel that several mandates expected in 2010 did not materialise. To facilitate improved communication, an internal contact point has been established in the EFSA secretariat to obtain feedback from the Commission Annexes working group. The importance of the review of the current plant health regime and the potential impact on the workload on the Panel was considered.

8. UPDATE ON THE STATUS OF THE ONGOING MANDATES

- **Assessment of the risk to plant health of *solanaceous pospiviroids* for the EU territory**

EFSA is requested to provide a pest risk assessment of the *solanaceous pospiviroids*, to identify risk management options and to evaluate their effectiveness in reducing the risk to plant health posed by this organism. The area to be covered by the requested pest risk assessment is the EU territory. EFSA is also requested to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the measures listed in Commission Decision 2007/410/EC in reducing the risk to plant health posed by this organism. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-00911.

The effect of this group of pospiviroids on host plants and the pests' characteristics was indicated to the Panel. Of the nine pathogens to be considered three have regulatory status but all are to be included in the pest risk assessment. The preliminary draft pest risk assessment is near completion and the working group is now considering the assessment of pest risk management options.

The Panel discussed the mandate, its inherent complexity and agreed to provide early comments on the draft when it is made available.

- **Assessment of the risk to plant health of Plum pox virus for the EU territory**

EFSA is requested to provide a pest risk assessment of Plum Pox Virus (PPV), to identify risk management options and to evaluate their effectiveness in reducing the risk to plant health posed by this organism. The area to be covered by the requested pest risk assessment is the EU territory. EFSA is also requested to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the special requirements linked to PPV, presently listed in Annex IV, Part A, Section I and II of Council Directive 2000/29/EC, in reducing the risk of introduction and spread of this pest into the EU territory. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-00913.

The secretariat advised the Panel that the Commission has requested a suspension of the work on the pest risk assessment and that the working group have been informed of this.

- **Assessment of the risk to plant health of *Monilinia fructicola* for the EU territory**

EFSA is requested to provide a pest risk assessment of *Monilinia fructicola* and if appropriate, to identify risk management options and to evaluate their effectiveness in reducing the risk to plant health posed by this organism. The area to be covered by the requested pest risk assessment is the EU territory. EFSA is also requested to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the special requirements linked to *Monilinia fructicola*, presently listed in Annex IV, Part A, Section I of Council Directive 2000/29/EC, in reducing the risk of introduction of this pest into the EU territory. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-00912.

An overview was presented of the effect of the fungus on stone fruits such as peaches and nectarines. The conclusions for entry, establishment, spread and impact will be presented separately in the opinion and the ratings on these made with different descriptors. Risk ratings are made in accordance with specific descriptors and there has been no combination of ratings. The Climpest model has been used for this organism. Preliminary conclusions in relation to pest risk management options were presented to the Panel.

The Panel discussed the presentation and sought further information on the draft pest risk assessment from the working group.

- **Request to provide a scientific opinion on the request from the USA regarding export of Florida citrus fruit to the EU**

EFSA is requested to provide a scientific opinion on risk analyses submitted to the Commission and published by the APHIS/USDA in support of their request to consider removing some of the Union's plant health import requirements for citrus fruit. In particular, EFSA is requested to determine whether the conclusions of those risk analyses are scientifically justified. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-01262.

The working group chair presented the Panel with background to this request, the composition of the working group and the meeting timetable for producing the opinion. The Panel requested clarifications from the working group chair.

- **Self task ERA**

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health is requested to develop guidance for the assessment of environmental risks of harmful organisms. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-00794.

Following an update on the working group activities, the need for a scenario analysis to support the new approach to assess environmental risks was presented to the Panel for discussion. The assumption underlying the evaluation of environmental impacts, the different steps of a scenario analysis, the importance of establishing the time horizon and considering possible management options have been addressed.

The Panel provided feedback on the presentation and also requested certain clarifications.

- **Self task on Guidance on evaluation of pest risk reduction options**

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health is requested to produce guidance on methodology for evaluation of the effectiveness of options to reduce the risk of introduction and spread of organisms harmful to plants in the EU territory. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-01343.

Background to the mandate was provided together with a need to refer to the guidance document on a harmonised framework for pest risk assessment as well as requests that seek a quick response. The composition of the working group was presented together with the work plan to address the mandate.

9. EFSA SCIENTIFIC COLLOQUIUM ON EMERGING PLANT HEALTH THREATS

The provisional programme for this event was presented to the Panel including aim, scope, and audience together with the expected output which will be the publication of a summary report. The first announcement of the colloquium has already been published on the EFSA website. An overview of the possible topics for the discussion groups, based on the suggestions given by the Panel at its 29th plenary meeting was presented.

The Panel provided their comments and agreed on the approach to focus each discussion group on the identification of plant health risks at different scales (e.g. plant pest scale, agriculture scale, global scale and medium-long term scenarios; including climate change). The Panel Chair sought suggestions for possible speakers for the colloquium plenary sessions from the Panel and requested that further suggestions are forwarded to the EFSA secretariat.

10. MISCELLANEOUS

- **Report from Scientific Committee**

Feedback from the 46th meeting of the EFSA Scientific Committee was provided by the Panel vice-Chair. A significant update concerned the acceptance of the EFSA Journal for bibliographic indexation so that EFSA outputs will be available in certain international scientific databases. An update on the inter-Panel consultation on the Nanotechnologies opinion and external report on EFSA's use of terminology were provided. Questionnaires on the harmonisation of the terminology used in risk assessment should be delivered by 18 February 2011. An update from the working group on statistical significance vs. biological risk was given and the Panel was also advised that a symposium on systematic review methodology will be open to EFSA staff.

- **Update from PLH Secretariat**

The EFSA secretariat provided an update on the EFSA Environmental Risk Assessment horizontal task force which meets to address commonalities and discrepancies among the EFSA Panels addressing environmental risk assessment. A draft report will be presented to the EFSA Scientific Committee.

The EFSA secretariat reported on the new Article 36 contract for Pest Risk Surveys for the EU territory and the new Service Level Agreement with the JRC to provide forestry data and maps.

- **Next meeting confirmation:**

23-24 March 2011 Parma, Italy.

Annex 1

With regard to the mandate on *Phytophthora ramorum* (EFSA-Q-2010-00841) Dr. Richard Baker declared an interest in relation to his involvement in preparation of the PRA under evaluation. In accordance with EFSA's policy on Declarations of Interest and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting above, the interest above was deemed to be a conflict (level C). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert as per point C.III¹ is excluded from drafting the opinion, and discussing and adopting the final Panel output.

With regard to the mandate on plum pox virus (EFSA-Q-2010-00913) Dr. Thierry Candresse declared an interest in relation to his current activity with INRA in France. In accordance with EFSA's policy on Declarations of Interest and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting above, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict (level C). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert as per point C.III¹ is excluded from drafting the opinion, and discussing and adopting the final Panel output.

With regard to the mandate on *Agrilus planipennis* (EFSA-Q-2010-01097) and citrus canker (EFSA-Q-2010-01262) Dr. Marina Zlotina declared an interest in relation to her current activities with USDA APHIS. In accordance with EFSA's policy on Declarations of Interest and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting above, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict (level C). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert as per point C.III¹ is excluded from drafting the opinions, and discussing and adopting the final Panel outputs.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/doiconflicts.pdf>