

**MINUTES OF THE 19<sup>TH</sup> PLENARY MEETING  
OF THE EFSA SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH  
HELD IN ANGERS ON 18-19 MARCH 2009**

(ADOPTED ON 13 MAY 2009)

| #  | AGENDA   | PAGE |
|----|--|------|
| 1. | Welcome, apologies for absence   | 2    |
| 2. | Adoption of the agenda   | 2    |
| 3. | Declarations of interests  | 2    |
| 4. | Adoption of the minutes of 18 <sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting  | 2    |
| 5. | Discussion of the outcome of public consultation on the draft “Guidance Document on evaluation of pest risk assessment prepared by third parties to justify phytosanitary measures under the Council Directive 2000/29/EC” | 2    |
| 6. | Discussion of the draft opinion on the PRA made by UK on processionary moth <i>Thaumetopoea processionea</i>   | 3    |
| 7. | New mandate:<br>- Request to provide a scientific opinion on the plant health risk of treated wood shavings for the EU territory   | 3    |
| 8. | Presentation of EFSA Art 36 project PRASSIS on “Inventory of data sources for pest risk assessment”  | 4    |
| 9. | Miscellaneous  | 4    |

**PARTICIPANTS**

*Members of the PLH Panel*

Richard BAKER, David CAFFIER, Patrick DE CLERCQ, Erzsébet DORMANNSNÉ SIMON, Bärbel GEROWITT, Olia Evtimova KARADJOVA, David MAKOWSKI, Charles MANCEAU, Dionyssios PERDIKIS, Angelo PORTA PUGLIA, Jan SCHANS, Anita STRÖMBERG, Johan Coert VAN LENTEREN

*Apologies*

James William CHOISEUL, Gábor LÖVEI, Luisa MANICI, Alfons OUDE LANSINK, Gritta SCHRADER, Robert STEFFEK, Kari TIILIKKALA, Irene VLOUTOGLOU

***European Commission (DG SANCO)***

Guillermo CARDON and Michael WALSH

***EFSA***

PLH Unit: Anna CAMPANINI, Elzbieta CEGLARSKA, Sharon CHEEK, Virag KERTESZ, Doreen RUSSELL, Giuseppe STANCANELLI, Sara TRAMONTINI, Sybren VOS.

---

**1. WELCOME, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

The Panel Chair welcomed the Panel members and the Commission observers. Participants were welcomed to Angers and given an overview of the activities of INRA.

Apologies were received from James William CHOISEUL, Gábor LÖVEI, Luisa MANICI, Alfons OUDE LANSINK, Gritta SCHRADER, Robert STEFFEK, Kari TIILIKKALA and Irene VLOUTOGLOU.

**2. ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT AGENDA**

The agenda was adopted, postponing item 8 due to the absence of the speaker.

**3. DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS**

With regard to this meeting no other interests than those already declared in the ADoI or in a previous SDoI and screened by EFSA in accordance with its Policy on Declarations of Interests and implementing documents thereof were declared by the experts.

**4. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES OF 18TH PLENARY MEETING**

The minutes of the 18th Plenary were adopted with minor corrections.

**5. DISCUSSION OF THE OUTCOME OF PUBLIC CONSULTATION ON THE DRAFT “GUIDANCE DOCUMENT ON EVALUATION OF PEST RISK ASSESSMENT PREPARED BY THIRD PARTIES TO JUSTIFY PHYTOSANITARY MEASURES UNDER THE COUNCIL DIRECTIVE 2000/29/EC” (EFSA –Q-2008-259)**

Protective measures against the introduction into the Community of organisms harmful to plants or plant products and against their spread within the Community are established by Council Directive 2000/29/EC (OJ L169, 10.7.2000). A transparent evaluation procedure is required, based on scientific principles, to ensure an objective and consistent approach for an evaluation of pest risk assessments to support decision making by EU risk managers on organisms potentially harmful to plants or plant products. Currently there is no clear and shared consensus on the criteria by which a pest risk assessment dossier should be reviewed.

In view of the above the Panel on Plant Health is requested by EFSA to produce a guidance document on the evaluation of pest risk assessments prepared by third parties to justify phytosanitary measures under the Council Directive 2000/29/EC. The mandate is registered in the EFSA Register of Questions as EFSA-Q-2008-259.

The draft guidance document after its preliminary adoption by the Panel was launched for public consultation in January 2009. Comments on the draft were received from the European Commission and the Czech Republic relating to the following and were reviewed by the Panel. The consultation raised two major issues:

- The evaluation of management options should be included in the document.
- The use of terminology should reflect that used in Directive 2000/29.

To address these issues the Panel agreed to the proposal for a joint meeting between the working groups on this guidance document and the working group on the guidance document for a harmonised framework in Pest Risk Assessment.

EFSA was requested to advise the Commission when the final document has been adopted.

#### **6. DISCUSSION OF THE DRAFT OPINION ON THE PRA MADE BY UK ON PROCESSIONARY MOTH *THAUMETOPOEA PROCESSIONEA* EFSA-Q2008-711**

EFSA is requested to provide a scientific opinion on a Pest Risk Analysis provided by the United Kingdom on *Thaumetopoea processionea* L., the oak processionary moth (OPM), and in particular whether this organism can be considered as a harmful organism within the meaning of the definition in Article 2.1(e) of Council Directive 2000/29/EC.

The rapporteur presented the draft opinion, outlining the draft conclusions of the working group on the probability of entry, establishment and spread of the organism. Provisional conclusions on the impact of the organism were also given with reference to data obtained from different Member States. A high level of uncertainty was associated with the organism's distribution, dispersal, climatic response and its impact.

The final opinion will be presented for adoption at the next plenary meeting.

#### **7. REQUEST TO PROVIDE A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON THE PLANT HEALTH RISK OF TREATED WOOD SHAVINGS FOR THE EU TERRITORY EFSA-Q-2009-00447**

EFSA is requested to provide a scientific opinion on the reliability and the effectiveness of a method proposed for the treatment of wood shavings infested by the pinewood nematode *Bursaphelenchus xylophilus*. The mandate is registered in the register of questions as EFSA-Q-2009-00447.

The EFSA scientific officer and rapporteur presented the request and the draft opinion. The Panel discussed the draft opinion raising further issues for consideration. The contribution of additional experts would continue to be sought.

Due to limited timeframe it was decided to adopt the opinion by written procedure.

## **8. PRESENTATION OF EFSA ART 36 PROJECT PRASSIS ON INVENTORY OF DATA SOURCES FOR PEST RISK ASSESSMENT**

Postponed.

## **9. MISCELLANEOUS**

- The Panel Chair reported on the presentation of the Citrus Black Spot opinion at the Standing Committee on Plant Health. The opinion was well received and will form the basis for further discussions in the Standing Committee. The majority of the questions concerned management options. The Standing Committee was strongly in favour of quantitative approach to evaluation of management options. The Panel will consider a proposal to EFSA for self-task on this matter.
- An update on the expert selection procedure was given by the panel coordinator. The inaugural meeting of the new Panel will take place on the 16-17 June in Parma. The meeting will be held together with the FEEDAP Panel.
- A new procedure for plenary minutes was proposed and agreed. It was decided to approve the minutes in written procedure provided they are circulated at least 10 days after the plenary.
- The Panel expressed a need for more efficient use of the Extranet. The Secretariat will make a proposal for the Panel's consideration.
- The secretariat requested that proposals for scientific events should be sent by the end of March 2009 for inclusion in the 2-year activities plan. Information on the Mediterranean Phytopathological Union meeting in 2010 has been uploaded on the Extranet for information.

**Date of next meeting: 13th and 14th May 2009, Jokioinen, Finland.**

**WG Guidance Document on harmonised framework will take place on 12 May in the same location.**