

21 April 2010

Seminar on Different Approaches in Risk Analysis in the EU Food Safety

14/15 April 2010, Antalya, Turkey,
Dedeman Antalya Hotel & Convention Center

REPORT

Background information:

This seminar was organised as a part of EFSA Pre-Accession Programme 2009-2010 for the Candidate countries and the Potential Candidate Countries*.

The overall objective of the Programme is to promote the understanding of EFSA's work, share expertise and create information exchange mechanisms in order to ensure that the national authorities of the beneficiary countries can participate effectively in the activities of EFSA both prior to accession and following accession to the EU.

The participation in this Programme may contribute to the beneficiaries in familiarising themselves with the EU policies and working methods particularly focusing on “from field to plate” integrated approach to food safety.

Relevance of the Seminar to objectives of the Programme:

- The seminar provided an overall knowledge on the role of EFSA in the area of risk assessment and risk communication,
- In particular, the new initiatives in fostering the Pan-European scientific cooperation and harmonisation of risk assessment methodologies were presented. The representatives from the beneficiary countries were encouraged to apply to the EFSA Expert Data Base,
- Experts from the EU Member States and from each of the Candidate countries presented their approaches in risk analyses and gave information on advantages and disadvantages of the different models,
- This seminar provided a solid starting point for networking and creation of information exchange systems as the first step in preparation of the beneficiaries for their future participation in the EFSA networks.

* **Candidate countries:** Croatia, Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Turkey
Potential Candidate countries: Albania, Bosnia&Herzegovina, Kosovo (under UNSCR1244), Montenegro, Serbia

General considerations:

The main topic of the seminar “different approaches in Risk Analysis in Food Safety in the EU” had special interest for the Turkish delegation as they are preparing new legislation on food safety where one of the uncertainties is whether risk assessment and risk management should be placed in the same institution or in different institutions. It was therefore of special importance for them to hear the speeches on this topic and especially the speech by *Arne Büchert* from Denmark on the different models they have had in Denmark and the positive and negative experiences from the different models. The information by *Saadia Noorani*, EFSA on the EU model was also of interest.

The information on risk assessment of salmonella (by *Luis Vivas Alegre*) and cadmium (by *Stefan Fabiansson*) gave the participants an in-dept knowledge on the scientific and practical work at EFSA on these topics and the case study on cadmium (by *Dr. H. Schafft*) on the risk assessment work in Germany on cadmium.

The practical examples on risk communication by *Karen Talbot*, EFSA created many questions and comments. The information about the future programme for the IPA countries created also questions and suggestions for topics for future seminars/meetings.

The speeches by the Candidate countries gave EFSA and the Member State speakers interesting information on the developments in the countries:

- 1) In Croatia, the Food Agency has been build up following the EFSA model and there is a clear separation of risk assessment (Food Agency) and risk management (Ministry of Agriculture).
- 2) In The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia risk assessment and risk management are in the same institution, but with clear separation. It was mentioned that the risk assessors are independent of the risk managers. The legislation is from 2002 and 2007.
- 3) In Turkey a law from 2004 implemented the EU Food Law 178/2002 and secured the independence for the risk assessors from the risk managers. At the moment the whole risk analysis process takes place in different directorates in the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs. Whether a new institution for risk assessment shall be created is at the moment under discussion at the Parliament.

Conclusions of the seminar:

This seminar gave a solid platform for exchange of views and experiences between the representatives from the beneficiary countries, EFSA and the representatives from Denmark and Germany. The participants took an active part in the discussions on the different topics related to the different approaches in risk analysis in food safety, to the information on risk assessment of salmonella and cadmium, to the examples on risk communication and to the information on the expert database.

Representatives from the three Candidate countries presented the developments on the different parts of the Risk Analysis in their countries. The contacts established during the seminar together with the gained knowledge will help EFSA in planning the future collaboration with these countries under the Pre-Accession Programme. In the conclusions *Finn Sheye* reiterated that scientific cooperation including the Candidate

countries in the field of data collection and harmonisation of risk assessment methodologies is essential.

Possible future participation of the Potential Candidate Countries as observers in EFSA networks (e.g. Expert Group on Food Consumption Data, Expert Group on Chemical Occurrence Data, BSE/TSE Contact Points Network as well as Task Force on Zoonoses Data Collection) will be further discussed. The aim of participation in such EFSA Networks is to help the beneficiaries in adjusting the data collection approaches in their countries to the one recognised by the EU Member States and EFSA and for EFSA to know about the situation and development in their countries.

The participants were informed about and encouraged to apply for the EFSA Expert Database. The contacts established between participants and EFSA representatives and Member States' experts during the seminar will provide a starting point for possible future information exchange and collaboration.

Results of the satisfaction questionnaire

58 representatives of different competent authorities from the three Candidate countries and the two Potential Candidate countries attended the seminar. 45 participants answered to the evaluation questionnaire. Hotel facilities including meeting room were considered as excellent or very good by the majority of the participants (82%). Presentation skills of the speakers (86%), the content of speeches (64%) as well as responsiveness to the questions (71%) were on the highest level. 84% of the participants found presentations being on the right level and the majority felt they had enough opportunity to express their opinion and ask questions (82%). 66% of participants found the overall value of the seminar excellent or very good. The participants considered that this seminar was an excellent or very good opportunity for improving their knowledge on this topic (62%).

Additional topics they would like to see addressed in the future seminars includes topics such as health claims, nutrition, campylobacter, heavy metals in water, data collection and statistics, exposure assessment, dose-response assessment, risk communication, crises management, HACCP and food quality criteria.

AGENDA

14 April 2010	
13.30 – 14.00	Registration
14.00 – 14.10	Welcome and Introduction by the chair <i>Mr. Finn Sheye</i> , Pre-Accession Coordinator, Legal and Policy Affairs Unit, EFSA
14.10 – 14.25	Welcome by the Turkish authorities
14.25 – 15.05 15.05 – 15.45	Part1: The role of EFSA in risk analysis by <i>Saadia Noorani</i> , Scientific Officer Scientific Cooperation Unit, EFSA Part2: Risk Assessments of Salmonella in the EU context by <i>Luis Vivas Alegre</i> , Scientific Officer, BIOHAZ Unit, EFSA
15.45 – 16.10	Coffee break
16.10 – 16.50	Practical examples on Risk Communication by <i>Karen Talbot</i> , Communications Advisor in the Communications Directorate Executive Office, EFSA
16.50 – 17.20	Questions and comments
20.00	Dinner

15 April 2010	
09.00 – 09.40	Division of Risk Assessment from Risk Management; Advantages and challenges by <i>Arne Büchert</i> , Chief consultant and EFSA Focal Point, DTU National Food Institute, Denmark
09.40 – 10.40	Representative from the 3 Candidate countries explain the developments on the different parts of the Risk Analysis (20 min each)
10.40 – 11.00	Coffee break
11.00 – 11.30	Risk assessment of Cadmium by <i>Stefan Fabiansson</i> , Head of DATEX UNIT, EFSA
11.30 – 12.10	Case study on Cadmium. by <i>Dr. H. Schafft</i> , Head of Unit, Feed and Feed Additives/Contaminants in the Food Chain, Federal Institute for Risk Assessment (BfR), Germany
12.10 – 12.30	The Pre-Accession Programmes today and what to expect in the future by <i>Finn Sheye</i> , Pre-Accession Coordinator, The Legal and Policy Affairs Unit, EFSA
12.30 – 12.45	Discussion and Conclusions of the meeting by <i>Mr. Finn Sheye</i> , Pre-Accession Coordinator, Legal and Policy Affairs Unit, EFSA
12.45 – 14.00	Lunch

Attendees

Participants from Croatia

- Bašić Sandra, Croatian Food Agency,
- Delić Ivica, Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Rural Development,
- Đugum Jelena, Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Rural Development,
- Gross Bošković Andrea, Croatian Food Agency,
- Sokolić-Mihalak Darja, Croatian Food Agency,
- Knežević Dražen, Croatian Food Agency,
- Mikec Darko, Croatian Food Agency,
- Miloš Sanja, Croatian Food Agency,
- Vasić Rački Đurđa, Faculty of Chemical Engineering and Technology

Participants from the Former Yugoslavian Republic of Macedonia

- BACHANOVIKJ, Angelina, Ministry of Health, Republic of Macedonia,
- DURIDANSKA, Olga, Food Directorate, Ministry of Health, Republic of Macedonia,
- JOSIFOVSKI, Marijan, Center for Public Health, Probistip, Republic of Macedonia,
- KASUMI, Ilir, Food Directorate, Ministry of Health, Republic of Macedonia,
- KENDROVSKI, Vladimir, Institute for Public Health of Republic of Macedonia, Republic of Macedonia,
- KUSHEVSKA, Sonja, Food Directorate, Ministry of Health, Republic of Macedonia,
- MAKAROVSKI, Spiro, Food Directorate, Ministry of Health, Republic of Macedonia,
- PETRESKI, Dimce, Food Directorate, Ministry of Health, Republic of Macedonia,
- POPOVSKA-DOMAZETOVA Marina, Director of the Ministry of Health of the Former Yugoslavian republic of Macedonia and coordinator of the EFSA Pre-Accession Programme

Participants from Turkey

- Ahmet BUDAKLIER, MARA, GDAR, Dept. of Food and Feed Research,
- ÖZBAĞ Nergiz, MARA, GDPC, Dept. of Food and Feed Registration Services, Codex Division,
- Levent AYDAR, MARA
- Adalet YORGANCIOĞLU, MARA,
- Halil APAYDIN, MARA
- Fulya ARICAN ÖZNUR, MARA, GDPC, Dep. of Food and Feed Registration Services, Codex Division
- Özlem ERALP, MARA, GDPC, Dep. of Food and Feed Registration, Services, Codex Division
- Murat ŞAHİN, MARA, GDPC, Dep. of Plant Protection Services, Director of Division
- Nilay DEMİR, MARA, GDPC, Dep. of Food Control Services
- Yasemin ATAYETER, MARA,

-
- Derya YAŞAYAN, MARA
 - Atanur TEZEL, MARA, Directorate of National Reference Laboratory,
 - Elmas SEÇER, MARA, PD of Ankara, Food and Feed Control Division,
 - Şennur ÖZKAYA, Asistant Coordinator PAP of Turkey,
 - Ömer Kenan GİZİROĞLU, MARA, GDPC, Dept. of Animal Health Services
 - İlhan TAŞÇI, MARA, GDPC, Dept. Of Animal Movement and Quarantine Services
 - Pelin AKSU, MARA, Plant Protection Central Research Institute
 - Ergün CÖNGER, MARA, Plant Protection Central Research Institute,
 - Emine Güher ÇELTEK, MARA, European Union and Foreign Affairs Dept.,
 - Ruhşan ÖZDEMİR ÇİFÇİ, MARA, PD of Izmir, Food and Feed Control Division,
 - Şehmus ALPARSLAN, MARA, PD1 of Adana, Food and Feed Control Division,
 - Gülcan BATI, MARA, PD of Bursa, Food and Feed Control Division,
 - Oktay DARCAN, MARA, PD of Mugla, Food and Feed Control Division,
 - Emir GEYLANI, MARA, PD of Mersin, Food and Feed Control Division,
 - Nurcan BAKIR, MARA, PD of Istanbul, Food and Feed Control Division,
 - Mehmet Ali ERFA, MARA, PD of Edirne, Food and Feed Control Division,

Participant from Kosovo under UNSCR 1244

- ZYMBERI Iliriana, Kosovo Food and Veterinary Agency,

Participant from Serbia

- STANOJRVIĆ Slavoljub, Veterinary Directorate, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Water Management