



# SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

## MINUTES OF THE 11<sup>TH</sup> PLENARY MEETING

**Held on 10-12 December 2019, Parma**

**(Agreed on 13 January 2020)**

### Participants

■ Panel Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Laurence Castle, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Maria José Frutos Fernandez, Peter Fürst, Rainer Gürtler, Ursula Gundert-Remy, Trine Husøy, Wim Mennes, Peter Moldeus Agneta Oskarsson<sup>1</sup>, Romina Shah<sup>2</sup>, Dina (Ine) Waalkens-Berendsen, Detlef Wölfle and Maged Younes

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

DG SANTE (Health and Food Safety), E2 Food processing technologies and novel foods: Guillermo Cardon and Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (via web-conference)

■ EFSA:

FIP Unit: Claudia Roncancio Peña, Stefania Barmaz, Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Brian Flynn, Alessandra Giarola, Federica Lodi, Carla Martino, Ana Maria Rincon, Camilla Smeraldi, Alexandra Tard and Giorgia Vianello

DATA Unit: Petra Gergelova

### 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants in the meeting.

### 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

<sup>1</sup> Participated by web-conference on 11 and 12 December 2019

<sup>2</sup> Participated by web-conference on 10 and 11 December 2019 PM



### 3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

### 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Plenary meeting held on 12-14 November 2019, Parma

The minutes of the 10th Plenary meeting held on 12-14 November 2019 were agreed by written procedure on 4 December 2019<sup>5</sup>.

### 5. Report on written procedures since 10th Plenary meeting

No scientific outputs were adopted by written procedure since the last plenary meeting.

### 6. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

#### FOOD ADDITIVES

#### 6.1. Proposed amendment of the specifications of the food additive Lecithins (E 322) and a proposed use in Cocoa and Chocolate products (EFSA-Q-2018-00415)

Further to the initial discussion held at the previous plenary meeting, the Panel discussed the different parts of the assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage.

#### 6.2. Scientific opinion on the follow-up from the re-evaluation of starch sodium octenyl succinate (E 1450) as a food additive, including use in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age (EFSA-Q-2018-00102)

At its previous plenary meeting held in November 2019, the FAF Panel had agreed to the withdrawal of the scientific opinion, previously adopted on 25 September 2019, on the follow-up from the re-evaluation of starch sodium octenyl succinate (E 1450) as a food additive, including use in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age.

On the basis of the discussion held at the previous plenary meeting, some sections of the opinion were further elaborated by the Working Group on the re-evaluation of food additives permitted in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age and a revised draft opinion was tabled for discussion at the current plenary meeting.

<sup>3</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/event/191112-m.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/event/191112-m.pdf>



At the current plenary meeting, the Panel provided additional comments to the draft opinion that will require further elaboration of the text. On the basis of the comments received during the current plenary meeting the draft opinion will be further elaborated by the Working Group on the re-evaluation of food additives permitted in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age and will be tabled for possible adoption at a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

**6.3. Re-evaluation of tartaric acid-tartrates (E 334-337, 354) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00612](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00613](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00614](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00615](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00616](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00617](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00637](#))**

Further to the previous discussion held at the plenary meeting in March 2019, the FAF Panel was presented with a revised draft scientific opinion on tartaric acid (E 334), sodium (E 335), potassium (E 336), potassium sodium (E 337) and calcium tartrate (E 354) as food additives, now encompassing the assessment of the additional information provided by interested parties on the technical part and a revised section on the overall dietary exposure to tartaric acid.

At the current plenary meeting, the Panel discussed and endorsed the technical, biological and toxicological sections of the draft opinion and the exposure assessment. However, the Panel was informed that the draft opinion on the re-evaluation of metatartaric acid (E 353) is still under preparation, pending receipt of additional information that has been requested from interested parties. Because the two scientific opinions are closely related, the Panel considered appropriate to postpone the adoption of the scientific opinion on the re-evaluation of tartaric acid and tartrates (E 334-337; E 354) until the finalisation of the assessment of the safety of metatartaric acid (E 353). On the basis of the comments received during the current plenary meeting the draft opinion will be further elaborated by the Working Group on the re-evaluation of remaining food additives other than colours and sweeteners and will be tabled for possible adoption at a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

**6.4. Re-evaluation of stearyl tartrate (E 483) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00570](#))**

At the current plenary meeting the FAF Panel was presented for the first time with a draft scientific opinion on the re-evaluation of stearyl tartrate (E 483) as a food additive.

The Panel held an initial discussion on the different parts of the assessment and endorsed the technical, biological and toxicological sections of the draft opinion as well as the exposure assessment. Because, this scientific opinion is closely related to the one on tartaric acid and tartrates (E 334-337; E 354) discussed under the item 6.3 above and therefore, also in this case the Panel considered appropriate to postpone its adoption until the finalisation of the assessment of the safety of metatartaric acid (E 353).

On the basis of the comments received during the current plenary meeting the draft opinion will be further elaborated by the Working Group on the re-evaluation of remaining food additives other than colours and sweeteners and will be tabled for possible adoption at a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

**6.5. Re-evaluation of polyvinylpyrrolidone (E 1201; PVP)/polyvinylpolypyrrolidone (E 1202; PVPP) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00584](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00585](#))**

At the current plenary meeting, the FAF Panel was presented for the first time with a draft scientific opinion on the re-evaluation of polyvinylpyrrolidone (E 1201; PVP) and polyvinylpolypyrrolidone (E 1202; PVPP) as food additives.



The Panel held an initial discussion on the different parts of the assessment. Comments were provided mainly on the technical part of the draft opinion, requiring further elaboration and clarification of the text.

On the basis of the comments received during the current plenary meeting, the draft opinion will be further elaborated by the Working Group on the re-evaluation of miscellaneous food additives and will be tabled for possible adoption at a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

**6.6. Outcome of the public consultation of the protocol for the exposure assessment as part of the safety assessment of sweeteners under the food additives re-evaluation programme: Sorbitols (E 420 i,ii); Mannitol (E 421 i, ii); Acesulfame K (E 950); Isomalt (E 953); Sucralose (E 955); Thaumatin (E 957); Neohesperidine DC (E 959); salt of aspartame-acesulfame (E 962); Lactitol (E 966); Xylitol (E 967); Erythritol (E 968); Cyclamates (E 952 i, ii, iii); Saccharin Na, Ca, K (E 954 i, ii, iii, iv); Neotame (E 961); Maltitol (E 965 i, ii) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00644](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00645](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00646](#); [EFSA-Q-011-00647](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00721](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00723](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00724](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00725](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00726](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00727](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00728](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00729](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00730](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00733](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00734](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00735](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00736](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00737](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00738](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00739](#)); ([EFSA-Q-2011-00740](#)) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00755](#); [EFSA-Q-2017-00490](#))**

The Panel received an initial feedback from EFSA further to the closure of the public consultation on the draft protocol for the dietary exposure assessment to the sweeteners under re-evaluation and the technical event held in Paris on 3<sup>rd</sup> December 2019.

The proposed changes to the approach for estimating dietary exposure to sweeteners have been overall well received both by the interested parties that have commented during the public consultation phase and by the attendees that have taken part in the technical event.

As a next step, the Working Group on Sweeteners will address all the comments received in a technical report on the public consultation and will revise the draft protocol as needed.

The draft technical report and the revised protocol for the dietary exposure assessment will be presented for possible endorsement at a forthcoming Plenary meeting.

## FLAVOURINGS

**6.7. FGE.73 Rev 5 ([EFSA-Q-2019-00302](#))**

The Panel discussed the different parts of the assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage.



## 7. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission

### 7.1. Scientific Committee and Scientific Panel(s) including their Working Groups

The Chair provided feedback from the last meeting of the EFSA Scientific Committee which took place on 4-5 December 2019. The following items were flagged to the attention of the Panel as of particular relevance for current and future work:

- Draft Guidance on appraising and integrating evidence from epidemiological studies
- Draft framework for protocol development for EFSA's non-application scientific assessments
- Draft guidance on aneugenicity assessment
- Implementation of the guidance on uncertainty in scientific assessment
- Developmental neurotoxicity (DNT) in the EFSA outlook

#### 7.1.1. FAF WG Food Additives Applications

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

#### 7.1.2. FAF WG on the re-evaluation of miscellaneous food additives

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

#### 7.1.3. FAF WG on the re-evaluation of food additives permitted in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

#### 7.1.4. FAF WG on the re-evaluation of remaining food additives other than colours and sweeteners

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

#### 7.1.5. FAF WG on Sweeteners

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

#### 7.1.6. FAF WG on Flavourings

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

#### 7.1.7. FAF WG on Specifications of Food Additives

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).



### **7.1.8. FAF WG on Guidance Update on Flavourings**

The first meeting of this newly established WG was held on 10 December 2019, aimed at gathering relevant background information and initial ideas to be further elaborated. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

### **7.2. EFSA including its Working Groups/Task Forces**

The Panel was reminded of the tentative dates for plenary meetings in 2020.

### **7.3. European Commission**

The representatives of the European Commission briefly updated the Panel on some of the follow-up activities that have originated as a result of the program for the re-evaluation of food additives set up in Regulation (EC) No 257/2010.

## **8. New mandates**

### **8.1. M-2019-0220: Request for a scientific opinion on the specifications of the food additive glycerol (E 422)**

This mandate from the EC covers a request for assessment (EFSA-Q-2019-00815) of new data generated by interested parties as a follow-up from the re-evaluation of glycerol (E 422) completed by the former ANS Panel in 2017. The data to be assessed under the mandate relate to information on the specifications of the food additive. The deadline indicated by the EC for completing this assessment is nine months from the receipt of the mandate, i.e. 09 September 2020, provided that no additional information is sought from interested parties.

Pending acceptance of this mandate, the scientific assessment could be carried out by the already existing WG Specifications of Food Additives, chaired by Peter Fürst, with the possible involvement of additional expertise.

## **9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion**

No other scientific topics were presented for information and/or discussion.

## **10. Any Other Business**

None.