

**DRAFT MINUTES OF THE 61ST PLENARY MEETING OF
THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS
HELD IN PARMA ON 8-9 DECEMBER 2010**

AGENDA:

- 1. OPENING, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
- 2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**
- 3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**
- 4. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ**
 - 4.1 REQUEST FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON A SUMMARY OF SCIENTIFIC STUDIES UNDERTAKEN BY THE UK FOOD STANDARDS AGENCY TO SUPPORT A PROPOSED PRODUCTION METHOD FOR SMOKED 'SKIN-ON' SHEEP MEAT**
 - 4.1 REQUEST FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION CONCERNING CHANGES OF CATEGORISATION OF PARTICULAR ANIMAL BY-PRODUCTS FROM CATEGORY 2 TO CATEGORY 3**
- 5. DRAFT OPINIONS FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTION**
 - 5.1 QUANTITATIVE RESIDUAL BSE RISK IN PROCESSED ANIMAL PROTEINS**
 - 5.2 MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS MICRO-ORGANISMS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED (2010 UPDATE)**
 - 5.3 RISK FOR HUMAN AND ANIMAL HEALTH RELATED TO THE REVISION OF THE BSE MONITORING REGIME IN SOME MEMBER STATES**
 - 5.4 EPIDEMIOLOGICAL AND MOLECULAR ASSOCIATION BETWEEN THE ANIMAL AND HUMAN TSE CASES**
- 6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES**
 - 6.1 PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF MEAT**
 - 6.2 EVALUATION OF TSE TESTS**
 - 6.3 AN UPDATE OF THE RESENT KNOWLEDGE ON THE OCCURRENCE AND CONTROL OF FOOD-BORNE VIRUSES**
 - 6.4 NOROVIRUSES IN OYSTERS: METHODS, LIMITS AND CONTROL OPTIONS**

- 6.5 ***CAMPYLOBACTER* IN BROILER MEAT PRODUCTION: CONTROL OPTIONS AND PERFORMANCE OBJECTIVES AND/OR TARGETS AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE FOOD CHAIN**
- 6.6 **RISK BASED CONTROL OF BIOGENIC AMINE FORMATION IN FERMENTED FOODS**
- 6.7 **QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN BROILERS (*GALLUS GALLUS*)**
- 6.8 **RESISTANCE CAUSED BY BACTERIAL STRAINS PRODUCING EXTENDED-SPECTRUM B-LACTAMASES AND/OR AMP^C B-LACTAMASES IN FOOD AND FOOD PRODUCING ANIMALS**
- 6.9 **ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN TURKEYS**
- 6.10 **THE CAPACITY OF OLEOCHEMICAL PROCESSES TO INACTIVATE POSSIBLE RISKS LINKED TO TRANSMISSIBLE SPONGIFORM ENCEPHALOPATHIES IN ANIMAL BY-PRODUCTS NOT INTENDED FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION**
- 6.11 **REQUEST FOR AN EVALUATION OF A NEW PROCESSING METHOD ACCORDING TO THE ANIMAL BY-PRODUCT REGULATION FOR FISHERY PRODUCTS**
- 6.12 **POSSIBLE USE OF CASINGS FOR MANUFACTURING SAUSAGES MADE FROM THE INTESTINES OF THE BOVINE ANIMALS**
- 8. **FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS**
- 9. **STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA:**
 - 9.1 **EMERGING RISKS**
 - 9.2 **FEEDBACK FROM THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION**
 - 9.3 **BIOHAZ NETWORKS**
- 10. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS**
- 11. **CLOSURE OF THE MEETING**

PARTICIPANTS

Panel Members:

Olivier Andreoletti, Herbert Budka (Vice-Chair), Sava Buncic, John D Collins (apologies), John Griffin (apologies), Arie Havelaar, Tine Hald, James Hope (apologies), Günter Klein, James McLauchlin, Christine Müller-Graf, Christophe Nguyen-The, Birgit Noerrung (Vice-Chair), Luisa Peixe, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonia Ricci, John Sofos, John Threlfall, Ivar Vågsholm, Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

EFSA:

Marta Hugas, Ernesto Liebana, Fulvio Barizzzone, Michaela Hempen, Renata Leuschner, Winy Messens, Pablo Romero-Barrios, Pietro Stella, Luis Vivas Alegre (Scientific staff), and Bianca Bottoni (Administrative staff).

European Commission (EC):

DG Health and Consumers: Sabine Osaer and Martial Plantady (on the 8th).

1. OPENING AND APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

The meeting started at 9:00. Given the absence of the Panel Chair (Prof John D. Collins), the Plenary was jointly chaired by Prof Herbert Budka and Dr Birgit Noerrung. The Vice-Chairs welcomed everyone. Apologies were received from J.D. Collins, J. Griffin, and J. Hope.

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited to the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the beginning of this meeting.

4. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ

4.1. REQUEST FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON A SUMMARY OF SCIENTIFIC STUDIES UNDERTAKEN BY THE UK FOOD STANDARDS AGENCY TO SUPPORT A PROPOSED PRODUCTION METHOD FOR SMOKED 'SKIN-ON' SHEEP MEAT

A new mandate submitted by the EC was received in EFSA and allocated to the BIOHAZ, CONTAM and CEF Panels in the Risk Assessment Directorate. The terms of reference were discussed in detail. John Sofos was appointed as Chair person. A deadline for adoption in April 2011 has been proposed by the EC.

4.2. REQUEST FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION CONCERNING CHANGES OF CATEGORISATION OF PARTICULAR ANIMAL BY-PRODUCTS FROM CATEGORY 2 TO CATEGORY 3

A new mandate submitted by the EC was received in EFSA and allocated to the BIOHAZ Panel in the Risk Assessment Directorate. The terms of reference were discussed in detail and further clarification will be required to the EC.

5. DRAFT OPINIONS FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTIONS

5.1. QUANTITATIVE RESIDUAL BSE RISK IN PROCESSED ANIMAL PROTEINS

The Draft Opinion as prepared by the Working Group was presented to the Panel by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 9/12/2010.

5.2. MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS MICRO-ORGANISMS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED (2010 UPDATE)

The Draft Opinion as prepared by the Working Group was presented to the Panel by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 9/12/2010.

5.3. RISK FOR HUMAN AND ANIMAL HEALTH RELATED TO THE REVISION OF THE BSE MONITORING REGIME IN SOME MEMBER STATES

The Draft Opinion as prepared by the Working Group was presented to the Panel by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 9/12/2010.

5.4. EPIDEMIOLOGICAL AND MOLECULAR ASSOCIATION BETWEEN THE ANIMAL AND HUMAN TSE CASES

The Draft Opinion as prepared by the Working Group was presented to the Panel by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 9/12/2010. The EC request was for a joint EFSA-ECDC opinion. The opinion was also adopted by ECDC's Advisory Board on 9/12/10.

6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES

6.1. PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF MEAT

The BIOHAZ, CONTAM and AHAW panels and three units from SCA (ZOOLOSES, AMU and DATEX) are involved in the reply to the mandate received. An overarching WG chaired by the Director of Risk Assessment has been established involving the heads of the Units and WG Chairs, to coordinate the work of these panels and units and has met already in two occasions. The BIOHAZ "ad hoc" WG dealing with the inspection of Swine had the last meeting on 3 December 2010 in Copenhagen. The next WG meeting is scheduled for early February. The current deadline for the opinion on inspection of Swine is June 2011.

Discussions took place on the establishment of a new WG on meat inspection of poultry. Tine Hald was appointed as the Chair of the WG. The current deadline for the opinion on inspection of Poultry is June 2012.

6.2. EVALUATION OF TSE TESTS

Recommendations on the laboratory evaluation step of the evaluation have been sent to the European Commission. EFSA will evaluate the report of the last step of the evaluation (i.e. alternative approach to the field trial) when this will be available. A final report on the performance of the new TSE test will be produced after successful completion of all steps.

6.3. AN UPDATE OF THE RESENT KNOWLEDGE ON THE OCCURRENCE AND CONTROL OF FOOD-BORNE VIRUSES

The last meeting of the WG took place in Paris on 9/11/2010. The next meeting is foreseen on 11 February 2011 in Brussels. The WG Chair gave an overall picture of the approach used and progress within this mandate. The deadline for adoption of the opinion is December 2011.

6.4. NOROVIRUSES IN OYSTERS: METHODS, LIMITS AND CONTROL OPTIONS

The last WG meeting took place on 8 November 2010 in Paris. The next meeting is foreseen on 10 February 2011 in Brussels. The WG Chair gave an overall picture of the approach used and progress with this mandate. The deadline for this mandate is December 2011.

6.5. *CAMPYLOBACTER* IN BROILER MEAT PRODUCTION: CONTROL OPTIONS AND PERFORMANCE OBJECTIVES AND/OR TARGETS AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE FOOD CHAIN

The working group last met on 23 November 2010 in Amsterdam. The next WG meeting is scheduled for 20 December 2010 as tele-meeting. A procurement contract has been awarded to obtain Swedish travellers data which should inform the WG on the current incidence of human campylobacteriosis. The current deadline for adoption of this opinion is March 2011.

6.6. RISK BASED CONTROL OF BIOGENIC AMINE FORMATION IN FERMENTED FOODS

The last WG meeting took place on 16 November 2010 in Brussels. The next WG meeting is scheduled for 14 January 2011 (web conference). The WG Chair gave an overview of the approach used. The current deadline for adoption of this opinion is December 2011.

6.7. QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN BROILERS (*GALLUS GALLUS*)

The last WG meeting took place on 22 October 2010 in Parma. The next meeting will take place on 15 December 2011 via web-meeting. . The WG Chair updated the group on the state of the outsourced work and delivered a presentation on the model used for

estimating *Salmonella* cases attributed to different animal and food sources. The current deadline for this mandate is March 2011.

6.8. RESISTANCE CAUSED BY BACTERIAL STRAINS PRODUCING EXTENDED-SPECTRUM B-LACTAMASES AND/OR AMPC B-LACTAMASES IN FOOD AND FOOD PRODUCING ANIMALS

The second WG meeting took place on 12 November 2010 in Brussels. The following meeting will be on 20 and 21st January in Parma. The deadline for this mandate is June 2011.

6.9. ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN TURKEYS

The first WG meeting will take place in Parma on 21 January 2011. The deadline of the opinion is March 2012.

6.10. THE CAPACITY OF OLEOCHEMICAL PROCESSES TO INACTIVATE POSSIBLE RISKS LINKED TO TRANSMISSIBLE SPONGIFORM ENCEPHALOPATHIES IN ANIMAL BY-PRODUCTS NOT INTENDED FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION

The last WG meeting took place on 7th December 2010 in Parma. The next WG meeting is foreseen on 18th January 2011 in Parma. The deadline of the opinion is 15th February 2011, adoption is foreseen at Plenary in January 2011.

6.11. REQUEST FOR AN EVALUATION OF A NEW PROCESSING METHOD ACCORDING TO THE ANIMAL BY-PRODUCT REGULATION FOR FISHERY PRODUCTS

The last meeting of the WG took place on 23 November 2010 in Brussels. A request to perform an additional study has been sent to the applicant (Norwegian Food Safety Authority), results should be ready by mid February 2011. The next WG meeting will be scheduled once the additional data will be available. The deadline of the opinion is May 2011.

6.12. POSSIBLE USE OF CASINGS FOR MANUFACTURING SAUSAGES MADE FROM THE INTESTINES OF THE BOVINE ANIMALS

The deadline for this mandate has been extended to 31 March 2011. A WG has been established and will meet on 14 December 2010 in Brussels.

7. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS

Prof Herbert Budka, attended the last meeting of the SC, held on the 7th December 2010 in Rome, and gave feed back to the plenary. The minutes of that meeting will be available on the EFSA website (<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/scaf101207.htm>).

8. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

8.1. EMERGING RISKS

The BIOHAZ Panel was informed of the monitoring activities from the Emerging Risks Units. Briefing notes are in the BIOHAZ science net space for information to the Panel members.

8.2. FEEDBACK FROM THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION

The EC official provided feedback to the group on the actions resulting from recently adopted opinions.

8.3. BIOHAZ NETWORKS

The Scientific Network on BSE-TSE with Member States, candidate countries and potential candidate countries representatives met on 18-19 November in Parma. Minutes of the meeting will be published in the EFSA web together with other Network documents

An annual report of the Scientific Networks on MRA and BSE-TSE will be published before the end of the year.

9. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

During the discussions on BSE/TSE opinions to be adopted at this plenary meeting, concerns were raised by the Panel Members about the “systemic risk” of Classical BSE re-emergence (or the emergence of other TSEs in the EU). The changes to the individual BSE control measures assessed in the separate Opinions will not necessarily imply an increased risk of the re-emergence of Classical BSE in the EU (or emergence of other cattle TSEs). However, when a particular BSE control measure is relaxed, this relaxation might pose a “systemic risk” in the overall EU BSE control system in place (i.e. feed ban, SRM controls and BSE monitoring), due to the known and unknown interdependencies and inter-linkages between the individual BSE control measures in place. These inter-linkages and interdependencies between the individual BSE control measures imply that relaxation of an individual control measure could result in cascading failures in the overall BSE control system, which could lead to the potential re-emergence of Classical BSE, or emergence of other cattle TSE. It is therefore important to remain vigilant of the systemic BSE risks in the general context of the EU BSE control system. Moreover, implementing multiple changes to the BSE control could imply an uncertain but possibly elevated systemic risk.

10. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING

The meeting closed at 2 pm.