MINUTES OF THE 50TH PLENARY MEETING OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS HELD IN PARMA ON 8-9 JULY 2009

Agenda:

1. OPENING, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE
2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA
3. WELCOME BY THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
4. WELCOME BY THE RISK ASSESSMENT DIRECTOR
5. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST
6. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ
7. STATE OF THE ART OF THE TSE ROADMAP
8. DRAFT OPINIONS FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTIONS

8.1 **Food safety aspects from the welfare of dairy cows**

8.2 **Food safety aspects from the welfare of stunning and killing of fish**

8.3 **CRL protocol on genetic resistance to TSE in goats in Cyprus**

9. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES

9.1 **Revision of the joint CEF/BIOHAZ guidance document on the submission of data for the evaluation of the safety and efficacy of substances for the removal of microbial surface contamination of foods of animal origin intended for human consumption**

9.2 **Food irradiation (efficacy and microbiological safety)**

9.3 **Quantitative estimation of the public health impact of setting a new target for the reduction of *Salmonella* in laying hens (*Gallus gallus*)**

9.4 **Quantitative estimation of the public health impact of setting a new target for the reduction of *Salmonella* in broilers (*Gallus gallus*)**

9.5 **Quantification of the risk posed by broiler meat to human campylobacteriosis in the EU**

9.6 ***Campylobacter*** **in broiler meat production: control options and performance objectives and/or targets at different stages of the food chain**

9.7 **Technical assistance on the link between *Salmonella* criteria at different stages of the poultry production chain**

9.8 **QMRA on *Salmonella* in slaughter and breeding pigs**

9.9 **ABP Alternative method from European Lime Association (EULA)**

9.10 **BSE-related risk of bovine intestines**

9.11 **The risk of Transmission of TSES via semen and embryos in small ruminants (sheep and goats)**

9.12 **Trends in antimicrobial resistance (AMR) in zoonotic infections**

9.13 **Genetic TSE resistance in goats – all the TSEs in all the EU (except classical scrapie in Cyprus)**

9.14 **Maintenance of the list of QPS micro-organisms intentionally added to food or feed (2009 update)**

9.15 **Parasites in fishery products**

9.16 **Request for technical assistance related to the EFSA opinion on transformation of animal by-products into biogas and compost**

9.17 **Analytical sensitivity of approved TSE rapid tests**

10. **FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS**

11. **STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA:**

11.1 **Food safety issues of Influenza Viruses**

11.2 **Emerging risks**

12. **PRESENTATION OF THE BIOHAZ EXTRANET**

13. **BIOHAZ Networks**

14. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

15. **CLOSURE OF THE MEETING**

PARTICIPANTS

Panel Members:

Olivier Andreoletti, Herbert Budka, Sava Buncic, John D Collins, John Griffin, Tine Hald, Arie Hendric Havelaar, James Hope, Günter Klein, James McLauchlin, Christine Müller-Graf, Christophe Nguyen-The, Birgit Noerrung, Luisa Peixe, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonia Ricci, John Threlfall, Ivar Vågsholm, Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

EFSA:
Marta Hugas, Fulvio Barizzone, Alessandro Broglia, Bart Goossens, Michaela Hempen, Renata Leuschner, Ernesto Liebana, Pietro Stella, (Scientific staff), and Bianca Bottoni (Administrative staff).

European Commission (EC):
DG Health and Consumers: Sabine Osaer, Koen Van Dyck (8 July only).

1. OPENING AND APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

The Chair welcomed everyone. Apologies were received from Winy Messens and John Sofos.

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was adopted.

3. WELCOME BY THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

The EFSA Executive Director, Catherine GESLAIN-LANEELLE welcomed the panel members and congratulated them on their election to the BIOHAZ Panel for the next three years. She gave an overview of the increase in mandates addressed and adopted by EFSA. She further provided some background on the staff evolution in EFSA.

4. WELCOME BY THE RISK ASSESSMENT DIRECTOR

The Director of the Risk Assessment department, Riitta MAIJALA welcomed the panel members and congratulated them on their election to the BIOHAZ Panel for the next three years. She introduced the results the recent EFSA expert survey, panel renewal and the review of the quality process.

5. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited to the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI and SDoI (as well as the ones declared at the beginning of the meeting), please refer to the Annexes I and II.

6. STATE OF THE ART OF THE TSE ROADMAP

Dr. Koen Van Dyck Acting Head of Unit of SANCO E2: Food Hygiene, Alert system and Training of the EU Commission presented the State of the Art of the TSE roadmap. Eradication of the TSEs for the protection of the consumer remains the objective. The removal of the Specified Risk Materials (SRM) from the food and feed chain is a centre piece of the programme.

7. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ

There were no new requests to EFSA/BIOHAZ.

8. DRAFT OPINIONS FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTIONS

8.1. FOOD SAFETY ASPECTS FROM THE WELFARE OF DAIRY COWS

The draft of the opinion was presented and discussed. Comments were taken into account to amend the wording and the document was adopted.

8.2. FOOD SAFETY ASPECTS FROM THE WELFARE OF STUNNING AND KILLING OF FISH

The draft of the opinion was presented and discussed. Comments were taken into account to amend the wording and the document was adopted.

8.3. CRL PROTOCOL ON GENETIC RESISTANCE TO TSE IN GOATS IN CYPRUS

The draft of the document was presented and discussed. Comments were taken into account and the document was adopted. It will be published as a Statement from the BIOHAZ panel.

9. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES

9.1. REVISION OF THE JOINT BIOHAZ/CEF GUIDANCE DOCUMENT ON THE SUBMISSION OF DATA FOR THE EVALUATION OF THE SAFETY AND EFFICACY OF SUBSTANCES FOR THE REMOVAL OF MICROBIAL CONTAMINATION OF FOODS OF ANIMAL ORIGIN INTENDED FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION

The last WG meeting was held on 28th-29th May in Parma. Representatives from SCHER, SCENIHR and CRL for antimicrobial resistance are members of the WG. The next working group meeting will be on 2nd September. The deadline is December 2009.

9.2. MICROBIOLOGICAL EFFICACY OF FOOD IRRADIATION

The working group last met on 30th June and 1st July in Brussels. The discussions held during the working group meeting and the draft opinion was presented. The next meeting will be on 8th September.

9.3. QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN LAYING HENS

The working group last met on 6th and 7th June. The draft opinion was presented. The next meeting will be held on 5th and 6th October in Brussels.

9.4. QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN BROILERS (*GALLUS GALLUS*)

The first working group meeting was held on 7th July in Parma. The initial approach to the mandate and consideration of the modelling needs to support the quantitative estimations were discussed. The next meeting will be held on 11th September in Parma.

9.5. QUANTIFICATION OF THE RISK POSED BY BROILER MEAT TO HUMAN CAMPYLOBACTERIOSIS IN THE EU

The working group last met on 24th June. The discussions held during the working group meeting and an outline of the draft opinion was presented. The next meeting will be held on 25th September in Amsterdam.

9.6. *CAMPYLOBACTER* IN BROILER MEAT PRODUCTION: CONTROL OPTIONS AND PERFORMANCE OBJECTIVES AND/OR TARGETS AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE FOOD CHAIN

The WG met on 25th June. Two calls for outsourcing are being launched. The next meeting of the WG will be held on 24th September in Amsterdam.

9.7. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE LINK BETWEEN *SALMONELLA* CRITERIA AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE POULTRY PRODUCTION CHAIN

An updated draft report was presented. The next meeting is scheduled for the 29th September in Brussels.

9.8. QMRA ON *SALMONELLA* IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS

The on-going work was presented to the panel. The next meeting of the WG will be in November/December after the delivery of the consortium's final report.

9.9. ABP ALTERNATIVE METHOD FROM EUROPEAN LIME ASSOCIATION (EULA)

There was nothing new to report.

9.10. BSE-RELATED RISK OF BOVINE INTESTINES

The second meeting of the WG was held on 30th June 2009. A draft document was presented to the plenary and discussed. The next WG meeting is scheduled for 27 August 2009. The opinion will be presented for adoption at the next plenary meeting in September (9-10 September 2009).

9.11. THE RISK OF TRANSMISSION OF TSES VIA SEMEN AND EMBRYOS IN SMALL RUMINANTS (SHEEP AND GOATS)

The first Working Group meeting will be held in Edinburgh on 22nd July 2009. The European Commission agreed to extend the deadline of the mandate till 31st January 2010 and to modify the Terms of Reference following the panel's remarks.

9.12. TRENDS OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) IN ZOONOTIC INFECTIONS

The draft table of contents for the opinion was presented. The next EFSA WG meeting will take place in Dublin on the 30th July 2009. An Overarching WG meeting (EMEA, EDCDC, EFSA, SCENHIR) is organized for the 3rd September in London.

9.13. GENETIC TSE RESISTANCE IN GOATS – ALL THE TSES IN ALL THE EU (EXCEPT CLASSICAL SCRAPIE IN CYPRUS)

The 3rd meeting of the Working Group took place on 2nd of July 2009. The draft opinion including the approach being adopted to address this mandate were presented and discussed.

9.14. MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS MICROORGANISMS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED (2009 UPDATE)

The first meeting of the WG was held on the 26th of May and the second on 23 June 2009. The chair gave an update on the progress and the proposed structure of the draft opinion. The inclusion of yeasts, viruses and bacteriophages as items for consideration was noted. The next meeting will be held on 24 August 2009.

9.15. PARASITES IN FISHERY PRODUCTS

The Panel established a Working Group. A deadline extension has been requested and agreed by the EC to March 2010. The first Working Group meeting has been held on 1st July, the next one is scheduled on 11th September. The table of content was introduced and discussed at the plenary.

9.16. REQUEST FOR TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE RELATED TO THE EFSA OPINION ON TRANSFORMATION OF ANIMAL BY-PRODUCTS INTO BIOGAS AND COMPOST

The Working Group dealing with the mandate is being set up and it is proposed to hold the first Working Group meeting in Brussels on 4th September 2009.

9.17. ANALYTICAL SENSITIVITY OF APPROVED TSE RAPID TESTS

A working group is being established. The first meeting of the working group is expected to take place in September. A deadline extension to December 2009 has been requested of the EC.

10. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS

There had been no meeting of the Scientific Committee since the last BioHaz Plenary. The next meeting of SC and the inaugural meeting will be held on 21-22 July 2009.

11. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA:

11.1. FOOD SAFETY ISSUES OF INFLUENZA VIRUSES

EFSA has prepared an internal document on the recent emerging H1N1 epidemics and is closely following the situation. There have been no indications of food safety concerns.

11.2. EMERGING RISKS

A Panel member presented the finding of the recent outbreak of Q-fever in goats and sheep and transferable to humans in the Netherlands. The panel agreed to monitor the situation and to follow up. The EMRISK Unit has been briefed on the issue.

12. PRESENTATION OF THE BIOHAZ EXTRANET

A presentation on the use of the BIOHAZ Extranet was introduced to the panel members.

13. BIOHAZ NETWORKS

The BIOHAZ unit maintains two networks, one on Microbiological Risk Assessment (MRA) and one on TSE's.

The MRA Network had its 3rd meeting 17 June in Parma at which Member States gathered to discuss the work related to the Microbiological Risk Assessment conducted within EFSA. Two MS gave a presentation, UK on *Campylobacter* control strategies and NL on antimicrobial resistance the food and agricultural sector. Furthermore, there was an invited speaker from the Network on Foodborne Viruses in Europe. Some concerns on high levels of biogenic amines in hard cheeses in different EU countries where expressed. The next MRA Network meeting will be on 16th June 2010.

The TSE Network will have its fourth meeting on 15-16 October 2009.

14. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The recent publication of the Proceedings of the EFSA's 12th Scientific Symposium entitled "Assessing Health Benefits of Controlling *Campylobacter* in the Food Chain" was noted.

On EFSA website:
www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa_locale-1178620753812_1211902642362.htm

There were no other items.

15. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING

The meeting closed at 14.00.

Annex I

INTERESTS AND ACTIONS RESULTING FROM THE SCREENING OF ADOI OR SDOIs

a) **CONFLICT LEVEL B:** In his ADoI/SDoI Dr. James Hope declared the following interest: he was involved in the drafting of the document on "A technical Advice related to the Cyprus protocol". His declared interest relates to his affiliation with the Community Reference Laboratory for TSEs which was tasked to draft this protocol. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest (level B). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert incurs the limitations identified under point C.III.b[1]. That is, Dr. Hope did not take part in the discussions on this agenda item**.**

[1] Implementing act to the policy on declaration of interests procedure for identifying and handling potential conflicts of interest.
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/cs/BlobServer/General/mb_annex_procedure_doi_en%20221008,0.pdf?ssbinary=true

Annex II

INTERESTS AND ACTIONS RESULTING FROM DECLARATIONS MADE AT BEGINNING OF THE MEETING

CONFLICT LEVEL B: With regard to this meeting Dr. James Hope declared the following interest: he was involved in the drafting of the document on "A technical Advice related to the Cyprus protocol". His declared interest relates to his affiliation with the Community Reference Laboratory for TSEs which was tasked to draft this protocol.
In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the above interest was deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest (level B). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert incurs the limitations identified under point C.III.b[2] . That is, Dr. Hope did not take part in the discussions on this agenda item**.**

[2] Implementing act to the policy on declaration of interests procedure for identifying and handling potential conflicts of interest.
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/cs/BlobServer/General/mb_annex_procedure_doi_en%20221008,0.pdf?ssbinary=true