

## **MINUTES OF THE 48<sup>TH</sup> PLENARY MEETING OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS HELD IN PARMA ON 27 AND 28 MAY 2009**

### **AGENDA:**

---

1. OPENING, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE
  2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA
  3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST
  4. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ
  - 4.1 TSE Transmission via semen or embryos of small ruminants
  5. POSSIBLE ADOPTIONS
  6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES
    - 6.1 Revision of the joint CEF/BIOHAZ guidance document on the submission of data for the evaluation of the safety and efficacy of substances for the removal of microbial surface contamination of foods of animal origin intended for human consumption
    - 6.2 Food irradiation (efficacy and microbiological safety)
    - 6.3 Quantitative estimation of the public health impact of setting a new target for the reduction of Salmonella in laying hens (*Gallus gallus*)
    - 6.4 Quantification of the risk posed by broiler meat to human campylobacteriosis in the EU
    - 6.5 Campylobacter in broiler meat production: control options and performance objectives and/or targets at different stages of the food chain
    - 6.6 Technical assistance on the link between Salmonella criteria at different stages of the poultry production chain
    - 6.7 QMRA on Salmonella in slaughter and breeding pigs
    - 6.8 Food safety aspects from the welfare of dairy cows
    - 6.9 ABP Alternative method from European Lime Association (EULA)
    - 6.10 BSE-related risk of bovine intestines
    - 6.11 Welfare aspects of stunning and killing of fish
    - 6.12 Trends of antimicrobial resistance (AMR) in zoonotic infections
    - 6.13 Genetic TSE resistance in goats – all the TSEs in all the EU (except classical scrapie in Cyprus)
    - 6.14 Maintenance of the list of QPS micro-organisms intentionally added to food or feed (2009 update)
    - 6.15 Parasites in fishery products
  7. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS
    - 7.1 Default assumptions used by EFSA's Scientific Panels and Committee in the absence of actual measured data
  8. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA:
    - 8.1 Food safety issues of Influenza Viruses
    - 8.2 Emerging risks
-

9. ANNUAL EFSA/ECDC REPORT ON FOOD BORNE OUTBREAKS
10. Feedback from the Commission on the Opinions adopted by the BIOHAZ Panel in 2006-2009
11. Feedback from discussion on “Transparency in Risk Assessment – Scientific Aspects. Guidance of the Scientific Committee on transparency in the Scientific Aspects of Risk Assessments carried out by EFSA. Part 2: General Principles”
12. ANY OTHER BUSINESS
13. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING

## **PARTICIPANTS**

### Panel Members:

Olivier Andreoletti, Herbert Budka, Sava Buncic, Pierre Colin, John D Collins, Aline De Koeijer, James Hope, Günter Klein, Simone Magnino, Antonio Martínez López, James McLaughlin, Christopher Nguyen-The, Karsten Noeckler, Birgit Noerrung, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Terence Roberts, Ivar Vågsholm and Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

### EFSA:

Marta Hugas, Fulvio Barizzzone, Alessandro Broglia, Bart Goossens, Michaela Hempen, Renata Leuschner, Pietro Stella, Luis Vivas-Alegre, Bianca Bottoni (Administrative staff).

### European Commission (EC):

DG Health and Consumers : Sabine Osaer.

## **1. OPENING AND APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

The Chair welcomed everyone. Apologies were received from John Griffin, Arie Havelaar and Hilde Kruse.

## **2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

The agenda was adopted.

## **3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

EFSA secretariat screened the ADoI and SDoI filled in by the scientific experts invited to this meeting in accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests.

With regard to the ADoI, SDoI and this meeting no other interest than those already declared in the ADoI or in a previous SDoI and screened by EFSA in accordance with its Policy on Declarations of Interests and implementing documents thereof was declared by the experts.

## **4. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ**

### **4.1. TSE TRANSMISSION VIA SEMEN OR EMBRYOS OF SMALL RUMINANTS**

A request for a scientific opinion on TSE transmission via semen or embryos of small ruminants was received from the Commission. Clarification is being sought on the ToR. The Panel decided to establish an "ad hoc" Working Group. An extension of the deadline will be requested for January 2010.

## **5. ADOPTIONS**

There were no draft reports presented for possible adoption.

## **6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES**

#### **6.1. REVISION OF THE JOINT BIOHAZ/CEF GUIDANCE DOCUMENT ON THE SUBMISSION OF DATA FOR THE EVALUATION OF THE SAFETY AND EFFICACY OF SUBSTANCES FOR THE REMOVAL OF MICROBIAL CONTAMINATION OF FOODS OF ANIMAL ORIGIN INTENDED FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION**

Since the last Plenary meeting, no additional WG meeting was held. The next working group meeting will take place directly following the Plenary on 28<sup>th</sup>-29<sup>th</sup> May. The deadline of this mandate has been extended to the end of 2009.

#### **6.2. MICROBIOLOGICAL EFFICACY OF FOOD IRRADIATION**

Working group last met on the 2 April. Feedback was given on the preparation of the draft opinion. Another opinion will be prepared by the CEF panel (chemical safety of irradiation). A member of the CEF Panel has been appointed to take part in the BIOHAZ working group meetings. Next meeting will be on 30<sup>th</sup> June/1<sup>st</sup> of July.

#### **6.3. QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN LAYING HENS**

The WG last met on the 19<sup>th</sup> May. The draft outline of the opinion was briefly discussed. The next meeting is scheduled for 6 and 7 July. A hearing expert will be invited to present several aspects on salmonella in eggs for the consideration of the WG members.

#### **6.4. QUANTIFICATION OF THE RISK POSED BY BROILER MEAT TO HUMAN CAMPYLOBACTERIOSIS IN THE EU**

The WG for this mandate has been split in two. This WG discusses the first ToR of the original mandate. Working group last met on the 15 April and there was no new WG since then. The next WG meeting will be on 24 June 2009 at VLA Weybridge.

#### **6.5. CAMPYLOBACTER IN BROILER MEAT PRODUCTION: CONTROL OPTIONS AND PERFORMANCE OBJECTIVES AND/OR TARGETS AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE FOOD CHAIN**

As for 6.4, the WG for this mandate has been split in two. This WG addresses the terms of reference 2 and 3 from the original mandate. Two additional members were invited to join this WG and they accepted. The first meeting will be 25<sup>th</sup> June at VLA Weybridge. Two outsourcing projects are foreseen for this mandate; one procurement on the development of a QMRA model (closes on 6<sup>th</sup> of July 2009) and a grant on data harvesting to support the developed model (this will be launched end of July). A request for an extension of the deadline to October 2010 has been sent to the COM.

#### **6.6. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE LINK BETWEEN SALMONELLA CRITERIA AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE POULTRY PRODUCTION CHAIN**

The WG last met on 28 April and progress was achieved on the draft technical report.. A meeting was held on 14<sup>th</sup> of May 2009 with the contractors carrying out the outsourced project related to this mandate and the progress report was discussed. The deadline for the outsourced work is end of October 2009. The next meeting of the WG is scheduled for 29 September 2009.

#### **6.7. QMRA ON SALMONELLA IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS**

Progress on the draft opinion was presented and some comments were made. Next WG meeting is scheduled for 15-16 June 2009. An update of the opinion will be discussed at the next plenary.

#### **6.8. FOOD SAFETY ASPECTS FROM THE WELFARE OF DAIRY COWS**

The draft document was presented and briefly discussed.

#### **6.9. ABP ALTERNATIVE METHOD FROM EUROPEAN LIME ASSOCIATION (EuLA)**

There was nothing new to report. The WG still waits for information to be received from the EuLA.

#### **6.10. BSE-RELATED RISK OF BOVINE INTESTINES**

The first meeting of this WG was held on the 7<sup>th</sup> of May 2009. A structure for the draft opinion was prepared and work distributed. Next WG meeting is scheduled for the 30<sup>th</sup> of June 2009. A draft will be prepared which will be presented to the July Plenary meeting. Deadline is September 2009.

#### **6.11. WELFARE ASPECTS OF STUNNING AND KILLING FISH**

A draft opinion was presented to the Panel for discussion. Adoption of the opinion is foreseen for July 2009.

#### **6.12. TRENDS OF ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE (AMR) IN ZOO NOTIC INFECTIONS**

An Interagency (EMEA, EDCDC and EFSA together with the non-food Committee SCENHIR) coordination meeting was held on the 24<sup>th</sup> of April 2009. The roadmap for adoption by all parties involved was discussed and tasks allocated. Adoption will be undertaken by each of the agencies using their respective structures. Three to 4 future meetings are foreseen before finalization. Next meeting is foreseen for 8<sup>th</sup> of June 2009. Adoption is planned for the October plenary meeting.

### **6.13. GENETIC TSE RESISTANCE IN GOATS – ALL THE TSEs IN ALL THE EU MEMBERSTATES (EXCEPT CLASSICAL SCRAPIE IN CYPRUS)**

Feedback was provided following the WG meeting of 14 May 2009. The questionnaire which was sent to the MS using the EFSA BSE Network was replied to by 18 MS. The replies were evaluated and discussed at the meeting. The next WG meeting is scheduled for 1<sup>st</sup> of July 2009. The draft will be discussed at the July Plenary. Deadline is end of 2009.

### **6.14. MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS MICROORGANISMS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED (2009 UPDATE)**

The first meeting of the WG was held on the 26<sup>th</sup> of May 2009. A structure of the draft opinion was discussed and tasks allocated to the different members of the WG. Future meetings are foreseen at the end of June and August 2009.

### **6.15. PARASITES IN FISHERY PRODUCTS.**

The WG will meet for the first time in July 2009. A request was sent to the EC asking for some clarifications of the ToR. A reply from the EC was received and discussed.

## **7. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS**

### **7.1. DEFAULT ASSUMPTIONS USED BY EFSA'S SCIENTIFIC PANELS AND COMMITTEE IN THE ABSENCE OF ACTUAL MEASURED DATA**

A presentation was made by EFSA's DATEX Unit on the outcome of a questionnaire on the subject mentioned and which was sent to all EFSA RA Units.

### **7.2. FEEDBACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE.**

Feedback by the Chairman on items at the last Scientific Committee was provided. The details can be found in the SC minutes as published on the EFSA web. [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/ScientificPanels/efsa\\_locale-1178620753812\\_ScientificCommittee.htm](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/ScientificPanels/efsa_locale-1178620753812_ScientificCommittee.htm)

## **8. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA:**

### **8.1. FOOD SAFETY ISSUES OF INFLUENZA VIRUSES**

An EFSA document providing scientific background on the recently emerged form of Influenza caused by a novel H1N1 type virus was presented and discussed. The document was jointly prepared by several EFSA units and will be kept under review. The plenary will be regularly updated as to follow up on further developments.

### **8.2. EMERGING RISKS**

A presentation on recent reports concerning *Clostridium difficile* was made by the Biohaz secretariat and a discussion on the topic took place. It was agreed that the Biohaz secretariat will continue to monitor the situation.

## **9. ANNUAL EFSA/ECDC REPORT ON FOOD BORNE ZOONOSIS.**

The 2007 annual report on “Trends and sources of zoonoses and Zoonotic agents in the EU” was presented by EFSA zoonoses Hof U. It provides data on the most common types of food borne outbreak in the 27 MS and will facilitate monitoring of trends. The report was jointly prepared by EFSA and the European Centre for Disease Control (ECDC).

## **10. FEEDBACK FROM THE COMMISSION ON THE OPINIONS ADOPTED BY THE BIOHAZ PANEL IN 2006-2009.**

An overview was presented by the EC representative on the outcome of the BIOHAZ opinions after adoption and the Risk Management actions taken by the EC based on the opinions. It covered all adopted opinions of the BioHaz mandate over 2006-2009.

## **11. TRANSPARENCY IN RISK ASSESSMENT – SCIENTIFIC ASPECTS – GUIDANCE OF THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE ON TRANSPARENCY IN THE SCIENTIFIC ASPECTS OF RISK ASSESSMENTS CARRIED OUT BY EFSA. PART 2: GENERAL PRINCIPLES**

As a follow-up to the discussions held at the previous Plenary meeting on the guidance adopted by the Scientific Committee, the Panel Members went through a document summarizing those discussions and reflecting on transparency in past, current and future BIOHAZ risk assessments.

## **12. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

### **12.1. JOINT BIOHAZ/EFSA STATEMENT ON THE JOINT GMO AND BIOHAZ OPINION “USE OF ANTIBIOTIC RESISTANCE GENES AS MARKER GENES IN GENETICALLY MODIFIED PLANTS” AND OF THE GMO ON “CONSEQUENCES OF THE OPINION OF THE USE OF ANTIBIOTIC RESISTANCE GENES AS MARKER GENES IN GENETICALLY MODIFIED PLANTS ON PREVIOUS EFSA ASSESSMENTS OF INDIVIDUAL GM PLANTS”**

An EFSA statement on the above mentioned opinions was prepared and presented for information.

### **12.2. END OF THE MANDATE FOR THE CURRENT PANEL**

This was the last meeting of the BioHaz panel under its current three year mandate (2006-2009). The chairman thanked all the panel members for their efforts and contribution to the work of the panel, the WG and EFSA in general. A newly constituted panel with a new three year mandate takes over the work as from June 2009. The chairman also thanked the BIOHAZ unit secretariat for the support over the past three years.

## **13. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING**

The meeting closed at 12.30.