

## **MINUTES OF THE 39<sup>TH</sup> PLENARY MEETING OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS HELD IN PARMA ON 16-17 APRIL 2008**

### **AGENDA:**

---

- 1 Opening, apologies for absence
- 2 Adoption of the agenda
- 3 Declarations of interest
- 4 Presentation by the Director of EFSA Risk Assessment on declarations of interests and Internal and External reviewing of opinions
- 5 New requests to EFSA/BIOHAZ
- 6 Progress reports and discussion on the following mandates
  - 6.1 QMRA on *Salmonella* in slaughter and breeding pigs
  - 6.2 Microbiological risk assessment on feedingstuffs for food-producing animals
  - 6.3 BSE related risk in bovine tongue
  - 6.4 Follow up of the QPS approach for assessing the safety of microorganisms intentionally added to the food chain
  - 6.5 Overview of source attribution methodology
  - 6.6 Assessment on the risk for human and animal health related to the revision of the BSE monitoring regime in some MS
  - 6.7 Assessment on the risk related to TSEs from carcasses of ovine and caprine animals below 6 months of age intended for human consumption
  - 6.8 Food safety aspects from the welfare of dairy cows
  - 6.9 Fish welfare
- 7 Feed back from the Scientific Committee and from other WGs
  - 7.1 Uncertainties in dietary exposure assessment
  - 7.2 Risk benefit analysis
- 8 Standing items on the agenda:
  - 8.1 Food safety issues of Avian Influenza
  - 8.2 Emerging risks
- 9 Brainstorming session on upcoming issues
- 10 Any Other Business
- 11 Closure of the meeting

## **PARTICIPANTS**

### Panel Members:

Olivier Andreoletti, Herbert Budka, Sava Buncic (16 April), Pierre Colin, John D Collins, Aline De Koeijer, John Griffin, Arie Havelaar, James Hope, Günter Klein, Simone Magnino, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonio Martínez López, James McLauchlin, Christophe Nguyen-The, Karsten Noeckler, Birgit Noerrung, Terence Roberts, Ivar Vågsholm and Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

### EFSA:

Riitta Maijala (items 4 and 9), Marta Hugas, Fulvio Barizzzone, Ernesto Liebana Criado, Michaela Hempen, Tobin Robinson, Pietro Stella, Eirini Tsigarida, Luis Vivas-Alegre (Scientific Staff), Angela Cohen, Bianca Bottoni (Administrative staff). Ernesto Guisado-Ferrer (item 4)

### European Commission (EC):

DG Health and Consumer Protection: Kris De Smet (am, 16 April), Taina Sateri (16 April).

## **1. OPENING, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

The Chair welcomed everyone. Apologies were received from Hilde Kruse.

## **2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

The agenda was adopted.

## **3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no new declarations of interest.

## **4. PRESENTATION BY THE DIRECTOR OF EFSA RISK ASSESSMENT ON DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS AND INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL REVIEWING OF OPINIONS**

### **4.1. INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL REVIEW OF SCIENTIFIC OPINIONS**

The Director of Risk Assessment introduced the quality assessment process to review EFSA Opinions<sup>1</sup> following the Opinion of the Scientific Committee on Internal and External Review: Proposal for a Review System for EFSA's Scientific Activities.

---

<sup>1</sup> [www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa\\_locale-1178620753812\\_1178628825410.htm](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa_locale-1178620753812_1178628825410.htm)

## **4.2. ON-LINE TOOL FOR DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

The method for experts to submit their Declarations of Interest (DoI) to EFSA has been streamlined. Software has been developed to enable EFSA's experts to submit the details relating to their declarations on-line. The on-line tool was demonstrated, and further details will be sent to the experts.

## **5. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ**

### **5.1. FURTHER CONSIDERATION OF AGE-RELATED PARAMETERS ON THE RISK FOR HUMAN AND ANIMAL HEALTH RELATED TO THE REVISION OF THE BSE MONITORING REGIME IN SOME MEMBER STATES**

A mandate was received from Belgium concerning an AFSCA<sup>2</sup> Opinion on the risk of raising the age limits concerning active epidemiological surveillance of BSE in cattle. A Working Group (WG) will be formed.

### **5.2. PUBLIC HEALTH SIGNIFICANCE OF METICILLIN RESISTANT *STAPHYLOCOCCUS AUREUS* (MRSA)**

The Terms of Reference (ToR) of this self-tasking mandate were presented to the Panel. A WG will be formed, and due to the multi-disciplinary nature of the mandate, experts from AHAW<sup>3</sup>, ECDC<sup>4</sup> and EMEA<sup>5</sup> will be invited. The expected deadline is December 2008.

### **5.3. REQUEST FOR A QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTIONS OF *SALMONELLA* IN CERTAIN POULTRY PRODUCTIONS: BREEDING HENS, LAYING HENS AND POULTRY**

**&**

### **REQUEST FOR TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE LINK BETWEEN *SALMONELLA* CRITERIA AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE POULTRY PRODUCTION CHAIN**

The EC presented the four mandates to the Panel. Two Working Groups were established.

### **5.4. CLARIFICATION REGARDING THE SCIENTIFIC ASSESSMENT OF THE BIO-DIESEL PRODUCTION PROCESS**

The letter from the EC was presented to the Panel. The Panel decided to reply to the EC with a clarification letter. Expertise from the CONTAM<sup>6</sup> Panel will be sought.

---

<sup>2</sup> AFSCA - Scientific Committee of the Belgian Food Safety Agency (Comité Scientifique de L'Agence Fédérale pour la Sécurité de la Chaîne Alimentaire)

<sup>3</sup> AHAW - Panel on Animal Health and Welfare

<sup>4</sup> ECDC - European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control

<sup>5</sup> EMEA - European Medicines Agency

<sup>6</sup> CONTAM - Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain

## **5.5. TSE INFECTIVITY IN MILK AND MILK PRODUCTS FROM SMALL RUMINANTS**

Given the ongoing work of the BIOHAZ Panel, EFSA will request an extension of the deadline of the mandate to end of October 2008. A WG is to be formed.

## **5.6. COOLING OF EGGS**

BfR<sup>7</sup> submitted new ToR in order to provide the clarification requested by EFSA. A WG is to be formed.

## **6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES**

### **6.1. QMRA ON *SALMONELLA* IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS**

The WG met on 15 April.

### **6.2. MICROBIOLOGICAL RISK ASSESSMENT ON FEEDINGSTUFFS FOR FOOD-PRODUCING ANIMALS**

The WG met on 19 March. The draft Opinion was presented to the Panel for its first reading. Adoption is foreseen in June.

### **6.3. BSE RELATED RISK IN BOVINE TONGUE**

The Opinion was adopted.

### **6.4. FOLLOW-UP OF THE QPS APPROACH FOR ASSESSING THE SAFETY OF MICROORGANISMS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO THE FOOD CHAIN**

The first meeting of the WG Qualified Presumption of Safety<sup>8</sup> will be held on 28 May.

### **6.5. OVERVIEW OF SOURCE ATTRIBUTION METHODOLOGY**

The WG met on 27 March. Adoption is foreseen in July.

### **6.6. ASSESSMENT ON THE RISK FOR HUMAN AND ANIMAL HEALTH RELATED TO THE REVISION OF THE BSE MONITORING REGIME IN SOME MS**

The WG met on 25 March and 11 April. Adoption is foreseen in July.

---

<sup>7</sup> BfR - Bundesinstitut für Risikobewertung (German Risk Assessment group)  
<sup>8</sup> [www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa\\_locale-1178620753812\\_1178667590178.htm](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa_locale-1178620753812_1178667590178.htm)

## **6.7. ASSESSMENT ON THE RISK RELATED TO TSEs FROM CARCASSES OF OVINE AND CAPRINE ANIMALS BELOW 6 MONTHS OF AGE INTENDED FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION**

The WG met on 10 April. The draft Opinion was presented for its first reading by the Panel.

## **6.8. FOOD SAFETY ASPECTS FROM THE WELFARE OF DAIRY COWS**

The first meeting relating to the food safety aspects is to be scheduled in June. Adoption is foreseen in July.

## **6.9. FISH WELFARE**

In coordination with the Opinions on the welfare of fish being prepared by the AHAW Panel, a food safety Opinion related to the five fish species is being drafted. Adoption is foreseen in July.

## **7. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS**

The 30<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting of the Scientific Committee will be held on 21-22 April<sup>9</sup>.

### **7.1. UNCERTAINTIES IN DIETARY EXPOSURE ASSESSMENT**

The Panel members were invited to comment on the Scientific Committee's guidance document<sup>10</sup>.

### **7.2. RISK BENEFIT ANALYSIS**

A draft working paper on microbiological risk benefit assessment from a Scientific Committee WG was tabled.

## **8. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA:**

### **8.1. FOOD SAFETY ISSUES OF AVIAN INFLUENZA**

There had been no indications of food safety concerns.

### **8.2. EMERGING RISKS**

The ESCO<sup>11</sup> WG on Emerging Risks comprises around 26 members. Two sub-WGs have been formed to deal with different aspects of the early identification of emerging risks. The WG is reviewing the benefits of an interaction with non-food bodies regarding the timely collection and assessment of information.

---

<sup>9</sup> [www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa\\_locale-1178620753812\\_1178700136320.htm](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa_locale-1178620753812_1178700136320.htm)

<sup>10</sup> [www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa\\_locale-1178620753812\\_1178620763403.htm](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa_locale-1178620753812_1178620763403.htm)

<sup>11</sup> ESCO - EFSA Scientific Cooperation

### **8.3. TRANSPARENCY**

A document on transparency is due to be completed later this year.

## **9. BRAINSTORMING SESSION ON UPCOMING ISSUES**

A brainstorming session took place to address proactive suggestions on food safety questions which may arise in the next years. A discussion paper on the subject was considered. The topic is to be discussed on a continuing basis over coming Plenaries, with the possibility of preparing a position paper from the Panel.

## **10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

### **10.1. THE EFFECT ON ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE OF SUBSTANCES USED FOR DECONTAMINATION OF POULTRY CARCASSES**

Two Opinions had been issued relating to the mandate on four antimicrobial substances.

EFSA's Opinion on the "Assessment of the possible effect of the four antimicrobial treatment substances on the emergence of antimicrobial resistance"<sup>12</sup> was adopted on 6 March 2008.

The EC's Opinion on "Environmental impact and effect on antimicrobial resistance of four substances used for the removal of microbial surface contamination of poultry carcasses"<sup>13</sup> was adopted by SCHER and SCENHIR on 12 March and 2 April 2008.

It was noted that no cross reference to the BIOHAZ Opinion was made in the SCHER and SCENHIR Opinion despite both Opinions being related. The Panel requested that similar difficulties between EFSA and the EC be avoided.

### **10.2. VENUE OF BIOHAZ PLENARY - OCTOBER 2008**

The Panel agreed that the BIOHAZ Plenary scheduled on 22-23 October 2008 shall be held in Vienna.

## **11. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING**

The meeting closed at 13.30.

---

<sup>12</sup> [www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa\\_locale-1178620753812\\_1178697425124.htm](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa_locale-1178620753812_1178697425124.htm)

<sup>13</sup> Adopted by SCHER - Scientific Committee on Health and Environment Risks on 12 March 2008 and SCENIHR - Scientific Committee on Emerging and Newly Identified Health Risks - on 2 April 2008