

## MINUTES OF THE 31<sup>ST</sup> PLENARY MEETING OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS HELD IN PARMA ON 18 AND 19 APRIL 2007

### AGENDA:

---

- 1 Opening, apologies for absence
  - 2 Adoption of the agenda
  - 3 Declarations of interest
  - 4 Requests to EFSA/BIOHAZ
    - 4.1 Foodborne antimicrobial resistance as a biological hazard
  - 5 Discussion and possible adoption of opinions
    - 5.1 Assessment of the likelihood of the infectivity in SRM derived from infected cattle at different age groups estimated by a back calculation modelling
    - 5.2 Review of protocol for TSE test evaluation (small ruminants protocol)
  - 6 Progress reports and discussion on the following mandates
    - 6.1 QMRA on *Salmonella* in slaughter and breeding pigs
    - 6.2 MRA *Salmonella* in meat and meat preparations
    - 6.3 The monitoring of VTEC and the identification of human pathogenic VTEC type
    - 6.4 The monitoring of *Yersinia* spp. and the identification of human pathogenic *Yersinia* types
    - 6.5 The monitoring and surveillance of *Toxoplasma* in humans, food, and animals
    - 6.6 Public health risks involved in the human consumption of reptile meat
    - 6.7 ABP: Progress on process applications received
    - 6.8 Review of protocol for TSE test evaluation (*post-mortem* cattle protocol)
    - 6.9 Review of protocol for TSE test evaluation (*ante-mortem* cattle protocol)
    - 6.10 Feeding of non-ruminant MBM to chickens and pigs
    - 6.11 Opinion on microbiological risk assessment in feedingstuffs for food-producing animals
    - 6.12 Update of scientific data on *Listeria monocytogenes* in ready-to-eat-foods
    - 6.13 Request regarding the link between *Salmonella* criteria at different stages of the poultry production chain
    - 6.14 Progress report on the EFSA opinion QRA tallow
  - 7 Feed back from the Scientific Committee and from other WGs
    - 7.1 Emerging risks
  - 8 AOB
    - 8.1 Avian Influenza – updates
    - 8.2 BSE and the safety of milk
  - 9 Closure of the meeting
-

## **PARTICIPANTS**

### Panel Members:

Olivier Andreoletti, Herbert Budka, Sava Buncic, John D Collins, John Griffin, Arie Havelaar, James Hope, Günter Klein, Hilda Kruse, Simone Magnino, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonio Martínez López, James McLauchlin, Christophe Nguyen-The, Karsten Noeckler, Birgit Noerrung, Ivar Vågsholm and Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

### EFSA:

Marta Hugas, Bart Goossens, Fulvio Barizzone, Tobin Robinson, Eirini Tsigarida, Didier Verloo, Luis Vivas-Alegre (Scientific Staff); Angela Cohen, Cristiana Ventura (Administrative staff).

### European Commission (EC):

DG Health and Consumer Protection: Kris De Smet (Morning, 18th).

## **1. OPENING, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

The Chair welcomed everyone. Apologies were received from Pierre Colin, Aline De Koeijer, Christophe Nguyen-The (18 April) and Terence Roberts.

## **2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

The item “*Salmonella* criteria at different stages of the poultry production chain” was discussed under item 4.2 instead of 6.13. The agenda was adopted.

## **3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no new declarations of interest.

## **4. REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ**

### **4.1. FOODBORNE ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE AS A BIOLOGICAL HAZARD**

This self-tasking mandate was accepted by the Executive Director (ED) of EFSA. The mandate will focus on transfer via food and the first Working Group (WG) meeting will be held on 25 April.

### **4.2. SALMONELLA CRITERIA AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE POULTRY PRODUCTION CHAIN**

The EC presented the new mandate and replied to queries from the Panel. The Panel concluded that there currently is a lack of essential information in order to substantiate if there is a link between *Salmonella* prevalence in flocks of poultry and *Salmonella* criteria applied at different stages of the poultry production. EFSA will write to the EC mentioning the difficulties discussed.

## **5. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF OPINIONS**

### **5.1. ASSESSMENT OF THE LIKELIHOOD OF THE INFECTIVITY IN SRM DERIVED FROM INFECTED CATTLE AT DIFFERENT AGE GROUPS ESTIMATED BY A BACK CALCULATION MODELLING**

The draft opinion was discussed in detail. The opinion was adopted.

### **5.2. REVIEW OF PROTOCOL FOR TSE TEST EVALUATION (SMALL RUMINANTS PROTOCOL)**

The next WG meetings will be held on 2 and 25 May. The EC agreed to an extension of the deadline of the mandates listed under items 5.2, 6.8 and 6.9 to the end of June. The Panel reviewed the latest changes to the draft small ruminants protocol document and an updated draft will be presented for possible adoption at the June Plenary.

## **6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES**

### **6.1. QMRA ON *SALMONELLA* IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS**

The call for grant proposals on “QMRA<sup>1</sup> on *Salmonella* in slaughter and breeding pigs” was published on 19 April<sup>2</sup>. The Advisory Forum and organisations listed under Article 36<sup>3</sup> will be notified of the call. The deadline for the submission of applications is 11 June. The next WG meeting will be held on 23 May.

### **6.2. MRA *SALMONELLA* IN MEAT AND MEAT PREPARATIONS**

The WG on MRA<sup>4</sup> *Salmonella* in meat and meat preparations met on 17 April. A draft document on the first of the Terms of Reference (ToR) will be presented at the July Plenary. It is intended to present the draft opinion answering the first ToR for possible adoption at the October Plenary.

### **6.3. THE MONITORING OF VTEC AND THE IDENTIFICATION OF HUMAN PATHOGENIC VTEC TYPE**

The WG will meet for the first time on 20 April.

---

<sup>1</sup> QMRA - Quantitative Microbiological Risk Assessment  
<sup>2</sup> [www.efsa.europa.eu/en/about\\_efsa/cooperation/call\\_for\\_proposal.html](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/about_efsa/cooperation/call_for_proposal.html)  
<sup>3</sup> [www.efsa.europa.eu/en/about\\_efsa/cooperation.html](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/about_efsa/cooperation.html)  
<sup>4</sup> MRA - Microbiological Risk Assessment

#### **6.4. THE MONITORING OF *YERSINIA* SPP. AND THE IDENTIFICATION OF HUMAN PATHOGENIC *YERSINIA* TYPES**

The WG met for the first time on 26-27 March and requested that the title of the mandate be amended to refer more specifically to enteropathogenic *Yersinia*. The Chair of the Panel will write to the EFSA's ED to request the change in the mandate title. The next WG meeting will be held on 31 May. A draft opinion will be presented for possible adoption at the September Plenary.

#### **6.5. THE MONITORING AND SURVEILLANCE OF *TOXOPLASMA* IN HUMANS, FOOD, AND ANIMALS**

The WG met on 9 March. The WG reviewed the current *Toxoplasma* monitoring and surveillance methods used in various countries. The next meetings will be held on 31 May and 31 August. A draft document will be tabled for discussion at the September Plenary.

#### **6.6. PUBLIC HEALTH RISKS INVOLVED IN THE HUMAN CONSUMPTION OF REPTILE MEAT**

The WG met on 29 March. The next WG meeting will be held on 5 June and it is envisaged that the document would be ready for possible adoption at the September Plenary.

#### **6.7. ABP: PROGRESS ON PROCESS APPLICATIONS RECEIVED**

EFSA is awaiting a response from the Spanish Competent Authority.

#### **6.8. REVIEW OF PROTOCOL FOR TSE TEST EVALUATION (*POST-MORTEM* CATTLE PROTOCOL)**

The next WG meetings will be held on 2 and 25 May. The EC agreed to an extension of the deadline of the mandates listed under items 5.2, 6.8 and 6.9 to the end of June. A draft document on the protocol for *post-mortem* cattle tests will be prepared at the above-mentioned meetings and presented for possible adoption at the June Plenary.

#### **6.9. REVIEW OF PROTOCOL FOR TSE TEST EVALUATION (*ANTE-MORTEM* CATTLE PROTOCOL)**

The next WG meetings will be held on 2 and 25 May. The EC agreed to an extension of the deadline of the mandates listed under items 5.2, 6.8 and 6.9 to the end of June. A draft document on the protocol for *ante-mortem* cattle tests will be prepared at the above-mentioned meetings and presented at the June Plenary for possible adoption.

#### **6.10. FEEDING OF NON-RUMINANT MBM TO CHICKENS AND PIGS**

The Panel discussed the question, which was received from the European Parliament. A working group was formed and will meet on 23 April in Parma.

#### **6.11. OPINION ON MICROBIOLOGICAL RISK ASSESSMENT IN FEEDINGSTUFFS FOR FOOD-PRODUCING ANIMALS**

The Chair of the WG presented the mandate to the Panel members. The first meeting will be held on 14 June. Members of the FEEDAP and AHAW Panel will participate in the WG.

#### **6.12. UPDATE OF SCIENTIFIC DATA ON *LISTERIA MONOCYTOGENES* IN READY-TO-EAT-FOODS**

The first meeting of the WG will be held on 25 May.

#### **6.13. REQUEST REGARDING THE LINK BETWEEN *SALMONELLA* CRITERIA AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE POULTRY PRODUCTION CHAIN**

Please see item 4.2.

#### **6.14. PROGRESS REPORT ON THE EFSA OPINION QRA TALLOW**

The outcome of the latest meeting (22 February 2007) between EFSA and the BfR/FLI was presented to the Panel. A list of conclusions and actions were agreed during the said meeting. A small WG will be established comprising the developer of the QRA model, EFSA experts and representatives of the BfR/FLI<sup>5</sup> in order to carry out the actions as agreed.

### **7. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS**

The Scientific Committee<sup>6</sup> met on 16-17 April. Two new WGs which may require BIOHAZ expertise are being formed, i.e. a WG on animal cloning and a WG on the welfare of animals used for experiments.

#### **7.1. EMERGING RISKS**

A new definition of the term “emerging risk” has now been adopted by the SC’s WG. The new definition along with a list of potential indicators will be sent again to the Panel members, with a request to advise the Panel Secretariat of any emerging risks of concern to them and to identify the indicators of most relevance to each risk they mention. They were further requested to submit their views by mid-May.

#### **7.2. SC WG RESPONSE TO URGENT QUESTIONS**

A protocol for dealing with “Urgent Questions” received by EFSA from the EC is in preparation.

---

<sup>5</sup> BfR - Bundesinstitut für Risikobewertung (German Risk Assessment group).

FLI - Friedrich-Loeffler Institut

<sup>6</sup> [www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/sc\\_committee/sc\\_meetings/24th\\_sc\\_meeting.html](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/sc_committee/sc_meetings/24th_sc_meeting.html)

### **7.3. SC WG TRANSPARENCY IN RISK ASSESSMENT**

A guidance document aimed at ensuring a uniform approach to transparency in opinions is in preparation.

### **7.4. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

More information on the completion of Declarations of Interest by experts will be given at the June Plenary.

### **7.5. SC WG QPS**

The WG will meet on 27 April to consider comments received through the public consultation<sup>7</sup> which ended on 5 March.

### **7.6. SC WG RISK/BENEFIT ANALYSIS**

The WG was formed following EFSA Colloquium on “Risk-benefit analysis of foods: methods and approaches” of July 2006<sup>8</sup>. The next meeting will be held on 25 May.

### **7.7. SC WG ON BOTANICALS**

The WG met on 18 April.

### **7.8. AHAW WG FISH WELFARE - FOOD SAFETY ISSUES**

The AHAW<sup>9</sup> WG on fish welfare met on 26 March and discussed salmon welfare. Discussions on trout welfare have begun. The food safety aspects will be addressed by the BIOHAZ Panel.

### **7.9. AHAW WG PIG WELFARE - FOOD SAFETY ISSUES**

A progress report was given on the three areas being dealt with by the AHAW WG on pig welfare. The food safety aspects will be addressed by the BIOHAZ Panel.

### **7.10. SC WG ON REVIEW OF OPINIONS**

Ways of reviewing EFSA’s scientific opinions are being reviewed. A proposed checklist will be discussed at the June Plenary.

---

<sup>7</sup> Qualified Presumption of Safety (QPS) approach for the safety assessment of microorganisms deliberately added to food and feed

[www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/sc\\_committee/sc\\_consultations/sc\\_consultation\\_qps.html](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/sc_committee/sc_consultations/sc_consultation_qps.html)

<sup>8</sup> [www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/colloquium\\_series/risk\\_benefit\\_analys.html](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/colloquium_series/risk_benefit_analys.html)

<sup>9</sup> AHAW - Animal Health and Welfare

### **7.11. EFSA'S FIFTH ANNIVERSARY**

Details of the arrangements for celebrating EFSA's fifth anniversary in Brussels and Parma are being finalised.

## **8. AOB**

### **8.1. AVIAN INFLUENZA – UPDATES**

The Panel was updated on the latest food safety issues related to Avian Influenza.

### **8.2. BSE AND THE SAFETY OF MILK**

The Panel was updated on recent reviews on the safety of milk in relation to BSE.

## **9. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING**

The meeting closed at 13.30.