



EFSA
European Food Safety Authority

MINUTES OF THE 29TH PLENARY MEETING OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS HELD IN PARMA ON 24 AND 25 JANUARY 2007

AGENDA:

- 1 Opening, apologies for absence
- 2 Adoption of the agenda
- 3 Declarations of interest
- 4 Official requests to EFSA
 - 4.1 Presentation of new mandates received from the Commission
 - 4.2 Presentation of new mandates received from EFSA
 - 4.3 Organization of Working Groups
- 5 Discussion and possible adoption of opinions
 - 5.1 Cattle SRM related back-calculations
 - 5.2 BSE in fishmeal
 - 5.3 Quantitative Risk Assessment for residual BSE risk in sheep
 - 5.4 Revision of the opinion on microbiological risks in infant formulae
 - 5.5 CRL Report on TSE batch testing
- 6 Progress reports and discussion on the following mandates
 - 6.1 Update on QRA tallow opinion concerning the diverging opinion with BFR/FLI
 - 6.2 ABP: Progress on process applications received
 - 6.3 Update GBR methodology public consultation
 - 6.4 Review of the protocols for TSE test evaluation
 - 6.5 Bovine casings
 - 6.6 Public health risks on consumption of reptile meat
 - 6.7 Microbiological criteria and targets based on analysis
 - 6.8 QMRA on *Salmonella* in slaughter and breeding pigs
 - 6.9 MRA on *Salmonella* in meat and meat preparations
- 7 Feed back from the Scientific Committee and from other WGs
- 8 AOB
- 9 Closure of the meeting

PARTICIPANTS

Panel Members:

Olivier Andreoletti, Herbert Budka, Sava Buncic, Pierre Colin, John D Collins, Aline De Koeijer, John Griffin, Arie Havelaar, James Hope, Günter Klein, Hilde Kruse, Simone Magnino, James McLauchlin, Karsten Noeckler, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Christophe Nguyen-The, Terence Roberts (24 January), and Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

EFSA:

Marta Hugas, Bart Goossens, Fulvio Barizzzone, Tobin Robinson, Eirini Tsigarida, Didier Verloo (Scientific Staff); Angela Cohen, Cristiana Ventura (Administrative staff).

European Commission (EC):

DG Health and Consumer Protection: Taina Sateri (present 24 January, telephone conference 25 January). Joint Research Centre: Christoph Von Holst (item 5.2).

1. OPENING, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

The Chair welcomed everyone. Apologies were received from Antonio Martínez López, Birgit Noerrung, Terence Roberts (25 January) and Ivar Vågsholm.

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was adopted.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no new declarations of interest.

4. OFFICIAL REQUESTS TO EFSA

4.1. PRESENTATION OF NEW MANDATES RECEIVED FROM THE COMMISSION

The following new mandates were received from the European Commission:

4.1.1. TSEs IN OVINE AND CAPRINE ANIMALS

A mandate was received from the European Commission (EC) concerning the AFSSA¹ opinion on scrapie in sheep and goats of 15 January 2007². The deadline for the mandate is 15 February 2007 and the Panel began discussion on the document, but given the importance of the topic, the document will be further developed by the WG so that it can be presented for possible adoption at the March Plenary.

4.1.2. ANIMAL BY PRODUCT MANDATES RECEIVED FROM THE SPANISH COMPETENT AUTHORITY

Four mandates on Animal By-Products (ABP) were received from the Spanish Competent Authority. The dossiers are written in Spanish and the English translation is being requested by EFSA in order to allow a first assessment.

The Chair suggested that the Panel should review in general terms, at a future Plenary meeting, the following: the type of industrial process request which can be addressed, and the information required by the Panel to respond to a mandate.

4.2. PRESENTATION OF NEW MANDATES FROM EFSA

EFSA presented the BIOHAZ Panel with the following mandates:

The monitoring of VTEC and the identification of human pathogenic VTEC types

The monitoring of *Yersinia* spp. and the identification of human pathogenic *Yersinia* types.

The monitoring and surveillance of *Toxoplasma* in humans, food, and animals.

4.3. ORGANISATION OF WORKING GROUPS

The Chairs of the WGs on the mandates mentioned in 4.2 were appointed and it was agreed to establish the three working groups.

¹ AFSSA - Agence Française de Sécurité Sanitaire des Aliments (French Food Safety Agency)

² AFSSA Mandate No 2006-SA-0343 and AFSSA Mandate No 2006-SA-0195

5. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF OPINIONS

5.1. CATTLE SRM RELATED BACK-CALCULATIONS

The Chair of the WG gave a brief report. The WG met on 8 January and further expanded the document to also include the epidemiological data and calculations based on these. These data complement the data already available on the experimental pathogenesis studies. It is intended that the opinion will be presented for possible adoption at the March or April Plenary.

5.2. BSE IN FISHMEAL

The Chair of the WG presented the opinion. The opinion was adopted by the Panel.

5.3. QUANTITATIVE RISK ASSESSMENT FOR RESIDUAL BSE RISK IN SHEEP

The draft document was discussed and some minor changes were made. The opinion was adopted.

5.4. REVISION OF THE OPINION ON MICROBIOLOGICAL RISKS IN INFANT FORMULAE

The opinion was adopted.

5.5. CRL REPORT ON TSE BATCH TESTING

The draft Scientific Opinion based on the report of the Working Group was sent to the Panel where it was discussed. Some comments were received which were included in the text and the Scientific Opinion was adopted subject to editorial amendment.

6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES

6.1. UPDATE ON QRA TALLOW OPINION CONCERNING THE DIVERGING OPINION WITH BfR/FLI

The secretariat briefed the Panel about a meeting of the Deputy Executive Director/Director of Science of EFSA and experts from BfR/FLI³ in Berlin. BfR

³ BfR - Bundesinstitut für Risikobewertung (German Risk Assessment group).
FLI - Friedrich-Loeffler Institut

had indicated its agreement to accept EFSA's QRA opinion on tallow⁴. A joint statement is to be made explaining the understanding reached, as was requested under an Article 30 procedure. A joint meeting between EFSA and BfR/FLI will be organised in Parma to prepare such a statement.

6.2. ABP: PROGRESS ON PROCESS APPLICATIONS RECEIVED

6.2.1. Treatment of animal by-products in mesophilic biogas fermenters

The draft opinion was discussed. The opinion will be presented for possible adoption at the March Plenary.

6.3. UPDATE GBR METHODOLOGY PUBLIC CONSULTATION

The public consultation on the draft opinion⁵ was closed on 22 January. The WG met on 16-17 January to review the comments received. The WG will meet on 2 March to finalise the methodology and the draft opinion may be presented for possible adoption at the March Plenary.

6.4. REVIEW OF THE PROTOCOLS FOR TSE TEST EVALUATION

The Chair of the WG gave a progress report. A representative of the Institute for Reference Material Measurements (IRMM) was present at the working group meeting of 17 January. After the meeting, the IRMM submitted an objection to the European Commission on the methodology for preparing the reference material. This was documented in a letter sent to the EC with EFSA in copy. The concerns raised by the IRMM in the letter will be discussed at the next meeting of the WG on 30 January.

6.5. BOVINE CASINGS

The WG had its first meeting on 15 January. The Chair of the WG outlined the background to the mandate. The draft opinion may be presented for possible adoption at the March Plenary.

6.6. PUBLIC HEALTH RISKS ON CONSUMPTION OF REPTILE MEAT

The WG will have its first meeting on 7 February. With regard to the evaluation of the possibility of the presence of contaminants in reptile meat, an expert from EFSA's CONTAM⁶ Panel will also participate.

⁴ www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/biohaz/biohaz_opinions/1110.html

⁵ www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/biohaz/biohaz_consultations/gbr_methodology.html

⁶ CONTAM - Panel on contaminants in the food chain

6.7. MICROBIOLOGICAL CRITERIA AND TARGETS BASED ON ANALYSIS

The next WG meeting will be held on 26 February.

6.8. QMRA ON *SALMONELLA* IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS

At the WG meeting of 23 January, the experts considered the scope of the Terms of Reference (ToR) and developed a technical specification for the work to be outsourced to conduct the QMRA⁷. Advice on the deadlines for the grant process of outsourcing via Article 36⁸ was provided by EFSA's legal officers. The WG will meet again on 7 February.

6.9. MRA ON *SALMONELLA* IN MEAT AND MEAT PREPARATIONS

The next WG meeting for the MRA⁹ on *Salmonella* in meat and meat preparations will be held on 6 March.

7. FEEDBACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WG

The next meeting of the Scientific Committee (SC)¹⁰ will be held on 15-16 February. Panel members attending WGs from other scientific panels briefed the BIOHAZ plenary on the development of the opinions.

8. AOB

8.1. EXPERT REIMBURSEMENTS

The Chair expressed appreciation of the measures taken by EFSA's Executive Director to improve the reimbursement conditions for experts participating at meetings.

9. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING

The meeting closed at 14.00.

⁷ QMRA - Quantitative Microbiological Risk Assessment
⁸ www.efsa.europa.eu/en/about_efsa/cooperation.html
⁹ MRA - Microbiological Risk Assessment
¹⁰ www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/sc_committee/sc_meetings.html