



EFSA
European Food Safety Authority

MINUTES OF THE 19th PLENARY MEETING OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS Held in Parma on 14 and 15 December 2005

AGENDA:

- 1 Welcome & Apologies
- 2 Adoption of the agenda
- 3 Declaration of interest
- 4 Self tasking issues - new proposals
 - 4.1 Antimicrobial resistance
 - 4.2 Guidance document on antimicrobials for decontamination
 - 4.3 Avian influenza - food safety issues
- 5 Official requests to EFSA
 - 5.1 Presentation of new mandates received from the Commission
 - 5.1.1 Presentation by Commission on the TSE road map and the possibility for new mandates emerging from this document
 - 5.1.2 Opinion related to the breeding programme for resistance in small ruminants
 - 5.1.3 Opinion on the use of hides of cohort animals
 - 5.1.4 Evaluation of the comments of the German risk assessment body on SRM (as for the German Meat Industry)
 - 5.1.5 Assessment of the public and animal health risks associated with the adoption of a visual inspection system in veal calves raised in a Member State (or part of a Member State) considered free of tuberculosis
 - 5.1.6 Request concerning the notification of the Netherlands on microbiological criteria for raw poultry meat
 - 5.2 Organization of Working Groups
 - 5.2.1 QRA - sheep mandate - WG established
 - 5.2.2 Visual inspection system for veal calves
 - 5.2.3 Microbiological criteria for poultry meat
- 6 Discussion and possible adoption of opinions
 - 6.1 Decontamination of poultry carcasses
 - 6.2 Goat milk, use of Somatic Cell Count
- 7 Progress reports and discussion on the following mandates:

- 7.1 The risk of feeding farmed animals with ready-to-use milk-based products and milk-derived products (ABP)
- 7.2 Risk reduction options of *Salmonella* in pig production
- 7.3 Base line survey study for Salmonella in pigs - Technical report
- 7.4 Microbiological testing, criteria and other objectives
- 7.5 Opinion on the update of the GBR methodology
- 7.6 Quantitative Risk Assessment for residual BSE risk. Progress reports on Vertebral Column, di-calcium phosphate (DCP) and tri-calcium phosphate (TCP)
- 7.7 Progress report on the evaluation of process in area ABP
- 7.8 The new Guidelines for applications for new alternative methods of disposal of use of animal by-products under Regulation (EC) no 1774/2002
- 8 Feed-back by the Chairman on subjects discussed in the SC of interest to the Panel
- 9 Feed-back by the Panel members attending WG from other Panels
 - 9.1 Exposure Assessment
 - 9.2 Qualified Presumption of Safety
 - 9.3 Welfare aspects of animal stunning and killing methods applied to commercially farmed deer, goats, rabbits, ostriches, ducks, geese and quail (Food safety aspects)
 - 9.4 Farming systems for calves-Food safety aspects
- 10 Any other business
- 11 Closure of the meeting

PARTICIPANTS

Panel Members:

Herbert Budka, Sava Buncic, Pierre Colin, John D Collins, Christian Ducrot, Mac Johnston, Günter Klein, Hilde Kruse, Ernst Lücker, Simone Magnino, Riitta Liisa Maijala (14th), Antonio Martínez López, Christophe Nguyen-The, Birgit Noerrung, Servé Notermans, Maurice Pensaert, Terence Roberts, Ivar Vågsholm, Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch

EFSA

Marta Hugas, Bart Goossens, Eirini Tsigarida, Didier Verloo, Fulvio Barizzzone, Wolfgang Gelbmann (Scientific Staff); Angela Cohen (Administrative staff)

Commission

DG Health and Consumer Protection: Rosella Brozzi-Bettio and Koen van Dyck

1. WELCOME & APOLOGIES

The Chair opened the meeting by welcoming everybody. The following apologies were received: George-John E Nychas, James Hope and Riitta Maijala (15th).

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was adopted.

3. DECLARATION OF INTEREST & MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS PLENARY

No additional declarations of interests were received. The minutes of the previous plenary meeting adopted by written procedure were tabled.

4. SELF-TASKING ISSUES - UPDATE

4.1. ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE

The chairman informed the Panel that the background information and the proposed terms of the reference (ToR) of the above self-task issue were discussed at the plenary of Scientific Committee (SC). The SC agreed that the scope of ToR fell within the remit of the BIOHAZ Panel. The chair will submit the proposed ToR to the EFSA Executive Director for agreement.

4.2. GUIDANCE DOCUMENT ON ANTIMICROBIALS FOR DECONTAMINATION

The Secretariat had taken into the consideration the comments of the -Panel at the previous plenary meeting and a revised background and Terms of Reference was presented. The new Regulation 853/2004¹ on specific hygiene rules for food of animal origin provides a legal basis to permit the use of a substance other than potable water to remove surface contamination from products of animal origin. The main scope of the self-task issue of the BIOHAZ Panel is the development of a guidance document to assist in the evaluation of the efficacy of substances other than potable water to be used to decontaminate the surface of foods of animal origin. The background information and the Terms of Reference were unanimously adopted. The chair will submit the proposed ToR to the EFSA Executive Director for agreement as a matter of urgency given the importance of this work for future assessments.

¹ OJ L226/25.06.04, p22

4.3. AVIAN INFLUENZA - FOOD SAFETY ISSUES

The WHO press release on Avian Influenza was distributed. No new scientific developments on AI and food safety issues have been published since the last plenary meeting.

5. OFFICIAL REQUESTS TO EFSA

5.1. PRESENTATIONS OF NEW MANDATES RECEIVED FROM THE COMMISSION

5.1.1. Presentation by Commission on the TSE road map and the possibility for new mandates emerging from this document

A Commission representative presented the TSE roadmap http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/food/biosafety/bse/roadmap_en.pdf and outlined amendments of certain measures that could be envisaged. In this light, future mandates to EFSA were also presented.

5.1.2. Opinion related to the breeding programme for resistance in small ruminants

The mandate was presented to the plenary meeting. The composition of the working group was discussed and a Chair was designated and agreed. The first meeting of the working group will take place at the end of January.

5.1.3. Opinion on the use of hides of cohort animals

The mandate was presented and the terms of reference were discussed with the representative from the Commission. The first working group for that mandate will take place end of January or beginning of February; some discussion took place on the definition of the word “cohort” and this will be addressed in the opinion.

5.1.4. Evaluation of the comments of the German risk assessment body on SRM (as for the German Meat Industry)

A member of the Plenary introduced the draft letter prepared in reply to the above comments, to the Plenary. The letter was discussed and agreed by the panel members. The Secretariat will send the letter to the German Risk Assessment body.

5.1.5. Assessment of the public and animal health risks associated with the adoption of a visual inspection system in veal calves raised in a Member State (or part of a Member State) considered free of tuberculosis

The mandate was introduced and the ToR was discussed. The Panel is asked to advise on the public and animal health risks associated with the adoption of a visual inspection system in veal calves in a Member State considered free of tuberculosis. A chairman/rapporteur to deal with the opinion was identified. It was agreed that the chairman/rapporteur would draft a response to the mandate and that the WG would reply electronically. A member of the AHAW Panel was invited to join the WG.

5.1.6. Request concerning the notification of the Netherlands on microbiological criteria for raw poultry meat

The Secretariat informed the Panel that EFSA had been asked by the Commission for a reaction following notification from the Netherlands regarding microbiological criteria for raw poultry meat, specifically to evaluate if the Dutch draft Decree relating to (raw poultry meat free from pathogenic microorganisms, Salmonella and Campylobacter being of most concern), can be considered scientifically justified, particularly in relation to the proposed *Campylobacter* criterion.

The Panel discussed the issue in the light of a previous opinion on *Campylobacter* and the CARMA-RIVM project developed in the Netherlands and concluded that the proposed requirement for the absence of *Campylobacter* claimed in the Dutch draft Decree seems not to be in accordance with the conclusions from the EFSA/BIOHAZ opinion and the CARMA-RIVM report. Accordingly, the Dutch draft Decree cannot be considered scientifically justified, particularly in relation to the proposed *Campylobacter* criterion.

5.2. ORGANIZATION OF WORKING GROUPS

Separate WGs were organized to deal with each of the above mandates.

6. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF OPINIONS

6.1. EFFICACY OF PEROXYACIDS FOR THE DECONTAMINATION OF POULTRY CARCASSES

The Chair of the WG introduced the draft opinion. After discussion the opinion was adopted. The Standing WG on Efficacy of Decontaminants will meet again in January to assess other substances.

6.2. GOAT MILK, USE OF SOMATIC CELL COUNT

The Chairman of the WG presented the draft opinion to the BIOHAZ plenary. After some discussion, the opinion was adopted.

7. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES:

7.1. THE RISK OF FEEDING FARMED ANIMALS WITH READY-TO-USE MILK-BASED PRODUCTS AND MILK-DERIVED PRODUCTS

The Chairman briefed the Panel on the progress of the draft opinion. It is intended that the report of the WG of the BIOHAZ Panel and the report of the WG of AHAW Panel will share an introductory chapter on milk and dairy production, dairy technology, etc. The lack of data on volumes of the rejected products of concern for the risk assessment was highlighted.

7.2. RISK REDUCTION OPTIONS OF *SALMONELLA* IN PIG PRODUCTION

The Rapporteur introduced the draft opinion and outlined the progress made by the WG. He mentioned the wide range of issues covered by the Terms of Reference and reported that the WG had undertaken a farm-to-fork approach. Then the main points and the draft conclusions of each chapter were introduced. Several suggestions were made to improve the draft opinion. The Panel members were asked to forward any further comments to the Rapporteur and the Chairman of the WG.

7.3. BASELINE SURVEY STUDY FOR *SALMONELLA* IN PIGS - TECHNICAL REPORT

The secretariat informed the Panel that a sub-working group of the Salmonella WG has been established to develop the protocol for the drafting of a baseline study on *Salmonella* in pigs. This technical report will be an Annex to the draft opinion. The WG had discussed in detail the issue of sampling methods to be used. The BIOHAZ Panel will provide the Commission with this technical report, as an example.

7.4. MICROBIOLOGICAL TESTING, CRITERIA AND OTHER OBJECTIVES.

The Chair briefed the Panel on the progress of this self-task issue. The need to produce a short and comprehensive opinion, addressing the determination of the use and application of the new concepts of food safety (ALOP, FSO, PO, PC) and the difference between them and microbiological criteria, as well as the need of giving practical examples for FSO and PO, were the main conclusions of the last meeting of the WG.

7.5. OPINION ON THE UPDATE OF THE GBR METHODOLOGY

The Chair provided an overview of the activities of that working group. Some clarification was given by the Commission representative regarding the role of the OIE in the classification of countries according to BSE risk. It was clear that OIE is to take the leading role in this classification work as it (OIE) is an international world wide organisation. However, if OIE were to decide not to do so, EFSA will be asked to complete the task.

7.6. QUANTITATIVE RISK ASSESSMENT FOR RESIDUAL BSE RISK. PROGRESS REPORTS ON VERTEBRAL COLUMN, DI-CALCIUM PHOSPHATE (DCP) AND TRI-CALCIUM PHOSPHATE (TCP)

A short progress report was given on both opinions. The EFSA secretariat had concluded that a reasonable deadline for adoption would be February 2006 for both opinions. As for the opinion on the residual risk of Gelatine the presentation of this opinion for adoption had been delayed till January due to the need to address other urgent priorities.

7.7. PROGRESS REPORT ON THE EVALUATION OF PROCESS IN AREA ABP - TWO NEW REQUESTS FOR PROCESSES

The Secretariat had received two requests on the evaluation of the following:

- New treatment to process ABP of category 2
- New treatment to process ABP of categories 1, 2 and 3

7.8. INFO ON THE NEW GUIDELINES FOR APPLICATIONS FOR NEW ALTERNATIVE METHODS OF DISPOSAL OF USE OF ANIMAL BY-PRODUCTS UNDER REGULATION (EC) NO 1774/2002

The Secretariat presented the draft of the new Guidelines, which were prepared jointly by the EC DG SANCO and EFSA

8. FEED-BACK BY THE CHAIRMAN ON SUBJECTS DISCUSSED IN THE SC OF INTEREST TO THE PANEL

The Chairman reported on the last meeting of the Scientific Committee. Discussions included performance indicators, transparency, research priorities and the work programme of EFSA in 2006.

(Please see www.efsa.eu.int/science/sc_committee/sc_meetings/1242_en.html)

9. FEED-BACK BY THE PANEL MEMBERS ATTENDING WG FROM OTHER PANELS

9.1. EXPOSURE ASSESSMENT

The representative of the BIOHAZ Panel on this WG briefed the Panel on the outcome of the last WG meeting.

9.2. QUALIFIED PRESUMPTION OF SAFETY

The representative of the BIOHAZ Panel on this WG informed the Panel about the setting of several sub working groups *viz.* *Bacillus*, lactic acid bacteria, yeasts and fungi. A member of the Panel is joining the sub-WG on *Bacillus*.

9.3. STUNNING SYSTEMS-FOOD SAFETY ASPECTS

The member of the WG briefed the Panel on the progress of the AHAW WG. As soon as this WG has identified the stunning/killing method(s) to be used, the BIOHAZ Panel will assess the impact of these methods on the microbiological safety of the carcass for public health.

9.4. FARMING SYSTEMS FOR CALVES-FOOD SAFETY ASPECTS

The member of the WG briefed the Panel on the progress of the AHAW WG. The food safety aspects will be compiled in a single chapter in the opinion.

10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

A member of the Panel outlined the main issues at the last EFSA Colloque on Risk Assessment on Animal Health and Welfare. A discussion followed.

The Chair of the Panel briefed about a meeting organised by the Commission and held in Brussels, involving the Chairs and Secretariats of the food and non food Committees and Panels.

Several Panel members informed the Panel on upcoming conferences and symposia on food borne zoonoses and on control strategies at the pre-harvest level.

The dates for the plenary meeting in May were agreed, i.e. on 17-18 May 2006.

11. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING

The meeting closed at 14.00