

## MINUTES OF THE XXXVI PLENARY MEETING OF THE PANEL ON ANIMAL HEALTH AND WELFARE

11-12 SEPTEMBER 2008

<b>1. WELCOME, APOLOGIES AND DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA.....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>3. PREVIOUS MINUTES ADOPTED BY WRITTEN PROCEDURE .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>4. COMMISSION SERVICES (CS) NEW MANDATES.....</b>	<b>2</b>
4.1. NEW MANDATES.....	2
<b>5. OPINIONS AND REPORTS SUBMITTED FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTION/ ACCEPTANCE... 3</b>	
5.1. SCIENTIFIC REPORT AND OPINION ON THE “RISK OF BLUETONGUE TRANSMISSION DURING TRANSIT”.....	3
5.2. FISH: SUSCEPTIBLE SPECIES.....	3
5.3. FISH WELFARE-TROUT: .....	3
5.4. FISH WELFARE-EUROPEAN EEL: .....	3
5.5. FISH WELFARE-SEA BASS AND GILTHEAD SEA BREAM:.....	4
5.6. SCIENTIFIC REPORT: FISH WELFARE-CARP: .....	4
<b>6. WRITTEN COMMENTS ON THE STATE OF PLAY OF THE SCIENTIFIC OPINIONS AND REPORTS .....</b>	<b>4</b>
6.1. WELFARE OF DAIRY COWS .....	4
6.2. CLASSICAL SWINE FEVER .....	5
6.3. EXCHANGE OF VIEWS ON ANIMAL HEALTH ASPECTS TO THE OPINION ON: “MICROBIOLOGICAL RISK IN FEEDING STUFFS FOR FOOD-PRODUCING ANIMALS” .....	5
6.4. SELF-MANDATE ANIMAL WELFARE .....	5
6.5. STUNNING AND KILLING OF 8 SPECIES OF FARMED FISH .....	5
6.6. PUBLIC HEALTH SIGNIFICANCE OF METICILLIN RESISTANT <i>STAPHYLOCOCCUS AUREUS</i> (MRSA)..	6
<b>7. MISCELLANEOUS .....</b>	<b>6</b>
7.1. FISH WELFARE - ATLANTIC SALMON REPORT .....	6
7.2. DOCUMENT ON MODELLING .....	6
7.3. INFORMATION ON RULES OF PROCEDURE INCLUDING WG MINUTES IN EFSA WEB.....	6
7.4. WORKSHOP ON ANIMAL HEALTH, DISEASE AND WELFARE DEFINITIONS. ....	6
7.5. NEXT PLENARY MEETING AND CALENDAR FOR 2009. ....	6

## **PARTICIPANTS**

Bo Algers, Donald Broom, Mariano Domingo, Matthias Greiner, Daniel Guemene, Joerg Hartung, Frank Koenen, David Morton, Christine Müller-Graf, Albert Osterhaus (12<sup>th</sup> September), Mo Salman, Moez Sanaa, Mike Sharp, Philippe Vannier, Martin Wierup.

**EUROPEAN COMMISSION:** X. Pavard (DG SANCO)

**OIE OBSERVER:** E. Erlacher-Vindel

**FAO OBSERVER:** S. De la Roche

EFSA: E. Franchi, (administrative staff AHAW Unit), A. Afonso, F. Berthe, S. Correia Rodeia (11 September), F. De Massis, T. Grudnik, P. Have, O. Ribó, I. Slaatto Naess and J. Serratos (Scientific Coordination AHAW Unit).

### **1. WELCOME, APOLOGIES AND DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

The Chairman welcomed the participants in particular E. Erlacher-Vindel (OIE), I. Slaatto Naess (END) and V. Castells (ACSA) hosting this meeting. Mrs Castell on behalf of ACSA (Agencia Catalana de Seguretat Alimentaria) welcomed the participants. No member declared any conflict of interest on the items on the agenda. Apologies were received from the Panel members Patrizia Costa, Harry Blokhuis, Dirk Pfeiffer and Ronald Roberts.

### **2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

The agenda was adopted.

### **3. PREVIOUS MINUTES ADOPTED BY WRITTEN PROCEDURE**

The minutes of the previous 35<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting held in Parma on the 17 to 19 June 2008 were unanimously adopted by written procedure by Panel members on 16 July 2008 and published on the web (<http://www.efsa.europa.eu>).

## **4. COMMISSION SERVICES (CS) NEW MANDATES**

### **4.1. New mandates**

A new request for a Scientific Opinion on *Brucella suis* was presented. Essentially, SANCO requested an overview of the epidemiology of brucellosis in pigs and the means to control the disease, as well as an assessment of the reliability of available tests. The Panel identified the need of setting up a WG to reply to the Mandate. The Panel also evaluated the feasibility of the exercise within the deadline proposed by SANCO (30 June 2009), and explored the possible need of a meta-analysis to reply to the terms of reference (ToR) about reliability of diagnostic tests. It was concluded that the objectives of this mandate needed to be further discussed with the Commission in order to assess the precise objectives and the right frame allowing EFSA to organize the work and decide on feasibility. The last possible day for adoption of this opinion is 6 June 2009 in the framework of the remit of this Panel (2006-2009), therefore this aspect should be considered at the meeting with the COM. Panel members willing to participate expressed their interest and the possible chairman/en were decided.

## **5. OPINIONS AND REPORTS SUBMITTED FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTION/ACCEPTANCE**

### **5.1. Scientific Report and Opinion on the “Risk of bluetongue transmission during transit”:**

After a preparatory meeting with the Commission’s officers, 7 meetings have been organized between January and June 2008, including a transversal meeting on 20-21 May. After the adoption of the Scientific Opinion about Vectors and Insecticides (replying to the first 4 ToRs of the Mandate) during the 35<sup>th</sup> AHAW Plenary in June, additional work was carried out to reply the 5<sup>th</sup> ToR (the “Risk of Transit”) as a separate mandate informing the EU Commission by 2 July 2008. The scientific opinion on the “Risk of bluetongue transmission during transit” was sent to the Panel on 2 September 2008; comments received were introduced and presented to the Panel for possible adoption during the 36<sup>th</sup> AHAW Plenary meeting. M. Sanaa chaired the discussion of the Scientific Opinion during the Plenary meeting replacing D. Pfeiffer who for personal reasons was not able to attend. The S. Opinion was unanimously adopted.

### **5.2. Fish: susceptible species**

This mandate was accepted in April 2008. The criteria for establishing the susceptibility of a host species were discussed and agreed during the 33<sup>rd</sup> Plenary Meeting of the AHAW Panel. Two WG Meetings were held between April and May, and a Transversal WG meeting was organised with the Panel in May in conjunction with the 34<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting. The third WG meeting was organised in August. The Scientific Opinion was submitted to the Panel in September, and was unanimously adopted during its 36<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting. It was agreed that, given the great number of data included in the report, the Scientific Report and Scientific Opinion should be published separately.

### **5.3. Fish Welfare-Trout:**

The scientific report on trout welfare was accepted at the 35<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting. The draft opinion was submitted to written procedure for possible adoption on the 10/07/08. A new version of the opinion and a summary of all comments received were distributed for review on the 8/8/08. Before the plenary took place 17 Panel members adopted the opinion. C. Muller-Graf chaired the discussion of the scientific opinion during the 36<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting replacing Roberts who for personal reasons could not attend. The opinion was adopted with a minority opinion of Broom, who stated that he had no objection to the scientific report and scientific opinion except that he considered that it was incomplete without a common chapter on general fish welfare concepts and so does not answer the mandate. The Panel disagreed with this view and furthermore did not accept the common chapter as only one out of the 5 working groups had agreed its contents. The scientific report will be separately published as the scientific data for the scientific opinion.

### **5.4. Fish welfare-European eel:**

The Scientific Opinion was formally submitted to the AHAW Panel for possible adoption by written procedure and comments with a deadline of September 5<sup>th</sup> given. An amended version of the opinion was prepared based on comments received from the Panel. The amended version of the opinion was distributed for consideration and possible adoption by the Panel during the 36<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting. D. Morton chaired the discussion on behalf of Roberts. The opinion was adopted with a minority opinion of Broom, who stated that he had no objection to the scientific report and scientific opinion except that he considered that it was incomplete without a common chapter on general fish welfare concepts and so does not answer the mandate. The Panel disagreed with this view and furthermore did not accept the common chapter as only one out of the 5 working groups had agreed its contents. The scientific report will be separately published as the scientific data for the scientific opinion.

**5.5. Fish welfare-Sea bass and gilthead sea bream:**

The last WG meeting was held last July 15<sup>th</sup> for final amendments on the scientific report and revision of the RA conclusions. The Scientific Opinion was then submitted for written procedure adoption and comments with a deadline of August 18<sup>th</sup>. Four positive adoption votes and comments from 5 Panel members were received. Bo Algers chaired the discussion on behalf of Roberts. All received comments were compiled into one single document which was distributed to the Panel 5 September 2008 for consideration and possible adoption by the Panel during the 36<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting. After discussing the scientific opinion it was decided that due to the large number of modifications it was reasonable to proceed to written procedure as soon as all changes had been introduced (possibly by end of September).

**5.6. Scientific Report: Fish welfare-Carp:**

The Scientific Report on welfare of common carp had been prepared for the 34<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting of the AHAW Panel. Since then, due to lack of time during plenary meetings, this document has not been discussed yet by the AHAW Panel. The Scientific Opinion was formally submitted to the AHAW Panel for possible adoption written procedure and comments were requested with a deadline of August 30<sup>th</sup> given. An amended version of the opinion has been prepared based on comments received from the Panel. The amended version of the report and opinion will be distributed for consideration and possible adoption by the Panel during the 37<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting in October.

**6. WRITTEN COMMENTS ON THE STATE OF PLAY OF THE SCIENTIFIC OPINIONS AND REPORTS**

**6.1. Welfare of Dairy Cows**

**6.1.1. *Scientific Opinion based on a RA on walking problems***

The first meeting of the WG was held on 17/07/08. The RA tables were revised and hazard characterization for all hazards was scored for each production system considered. Next meeting will be held on 15-16/10/08 for consensus on the RA tables and final calculations. Conclusions and recommendations based on the RA will be drafted on 26 November 2008.

**6.1.2. *Scientific Opinion based on a RA on udder problems***

The first meeting of the WG was held on 18/07/08. The RA tables were revised and hazard characterization for all hazards was scored for each production system considered. Next meeting will be held on 16-17/10/08 for consensus on the RA tables and final calculations. Conclusions and recommendations based on the RA will be drafted on 26 November 2008.

**6.1.3. *Scientific Opinion based on a RA on reproductive and metabolic disorders***

The first meeting of the WG was held on 29/07/08. The RA tables were revised and hazard characterization for all hazards was scored for each production system considered. Next meeting will be held on 13-14/10/08 for consensus on the RA tables and final calculations. Conclusions and recommendations based on the RA will be drafted on 26 November 2008.

**6.1.4. *Scientific Opinion based on RA on behavioural problems***

The first meeting of the WG was held on 05/08/08. The RA tables were revised and hazard characterizations for all hazards were scored for each production system considered. Next meeting will be held on 14-15/10/08 for RA consensus and final calculations. Conclusions and recommendations based on the RA will be drafted on 26 November 2008.

### **6.1.5. *Scientific Opinion on overall dairy cow welfare assessment***

Last meeting of the WG was held on 9-10/09/08. The WG agreed on the Scientific Report, which is 90% finalized, and on the latest contributions. Some conclusions and recommendations from the scientific report were discussed and drafted. Next meeting will be held on the 27 November 2008 for the drafting of the overall dairy cows' welfare assessment with the conclusions and recommendations from the scientific report and the Con&Rec from the 4 Risk Assessments (as explained above).

### **6.2. Classical Swine Fever**

The scientific opinion concerning the CSF mandate was split in two according to the two ToRs. The two working groups have been meeting on consecutive days with joint meetings between in order to keep the connection between the two parts.

#### **6.2.1. *CSF control/eradication in wild boar (ToR1) -***

The data collected through the online questionnaire on CSF in wild boar and hunting practices as a control measure, have been summarised and analysed by the WG. The data extracted from the EU CSF database have also been summarised to the WG. A proposed approach to evaluate the different control and eradication measures of CSF in wild boar has been developed. Meetings have been held 22 and 23 July, and 26 August (control measures evaluation approach – tele- and web conferences) and 9 and 10 September (all WG1). The next meeting will be 9 October.

#### **6.2.2. *Safety of fresh meat from CSF vaccinated pigs (ToR2) -***

EMEA was contacted to forward the questionnaire on the CSF vaccines to the National agencies. The data collected through the online questionnaire on CSF vaccines, have been summarised and analysed by the WG. A risk assessment has been developed and thoroughly discussed. Meetings have been held 1 and 21 July (RA model), 22 July and 9 September (all WG2). The next meeting will be on the 8 October.

### **6.3. Exchange of views on animal health aspects to the opinion on: “Microbiological RA in feeding stuffs for food-producing animals”**

As proposed during the last AHAW plenary, it took place an exchange of views on animal health aspects related to the significance of contamination of feeding stuffs with *Salmonella*. The Panel agreed that the chairman of the AHAW Panel should exchange those Panel views with EFSA's RA director.

### **6.4. Self-mandate Animal Welfare**

The EFSA self-mandate on the development of the RA Guidelines for AW will be partly carried out through grants under Article 36. The AW issues to be considered in the Guidelines have been divided in three main categories: stunning and killing, transport, housing and management. The first project related to the stunning and killing aspects is under developing and the final report is expected in autumn 2008. The evaluation of two proposals received for the Call of Proposals for the development of the transport part of the guidelines was finalised at the end of July. The Grant Agreement is now under signature. The Call of proposals for the development of the Housing and Management RA Guidelines is foreseen by January 2009.

### **6.5. Stunning and Killing of 8 species of Farmed Fish**

A teleconference to discuss the mandate with the WG chairmen and the Commission was held 25 June 2008. It was agreed with the Commission that a total of 7 Scientific Opinions will be delivered for the 8 species of the mandate (sea bass and sea bream considered together). It was

also agreed that for Tuna and Turbot the welfare aspects of the different husbandry systems at the pre-slaughter phase will be also considered as previous opinions had not dealt with these 2 species. The deadline for these 2 SO will be extended until May 2009 (deadline for the other 5 SO, March 2009). The reply letter was sent to the Commission in July 2008 and the Commission accepted these aspects.

A meeting to discuss the common layout for the 7 SOs and the common RA approach to be adopted was held 6 August 2008. The meeting to choose the experts to be invited to the first 3 WGs (Tuna, Salmon and Eel) was held 3 September 2008. A meeting with the Risk Assessors to discuss about the common RA will be held next 6 October and the kick-off meeting of these 3 WGs will be held next 17 October with a common session to explain EFSA rules and the work to be developed and separate session for each WG to assign task and fix meeting dates.

#### **6.6. Public Health significance of meticillin resistant *Staphylococcus aureus* (MRSA)**

EFSA (BIOHAZ) has launched a self-mandate on risk to human health posed by MRSA associated with food and animals. EMEA and ECDC are engaged in other aspects of the same topic and are represented in the BIOHAZ WG. The second WG meeting was held on the 28 August and the opinion is expected to be adopted in January 2009. One AHAW Panel member will support the tasks of the WG in terms of animal health and welfare aspects (transmission routes, animal-human contacts, husbandry and management systems in relation to control options).

As it was asked by the Commission this must be a Joint Report from the three agencies EFSA, EMEA and ECDC. Once a draft Joint Report is produced, it will need to be independently approved by each agency according to its internal policies. Next meeting planned for the 8 October.

### **7. MISCELLANEOUS**

#### **7.1. Fish Welfare - Atlantic Salmon report**

The Atlantic salmon opinion was adopted on 19/06/2008. The minority opinion, report, and appendices were published on the EFSA web

#### **7.2. Document on modelling**

Following the issue started with a document ("white paper on use of models") previously prepared by M. Greiner, it was decided to draft a background for a possible guideline to be proposed to EFSA's hierarchy.

Information on Rules of procedure including WG minutes in EFSA web.

The latest Rules of Procedure version is currently under discussion with the RA directorate and the EFSA Quality Manager. EFSA is drafting work flow charts for developing Scientific Opinions and AHAWs procedures will be included. As soon as a final document is available will be presented to the AHAW Panel members.

#### **7.3. Workshop on Animal Health, Disease and Welfare definitions.**

A workshop on AHAW definitions for Risk Assessment purposes will be held on week 48 or week 49. Members of the Panel will be invited to the workshop and the agenda will be distributed as soon as available.

#### **7.4. Next Plenary Meeting and Calendar for 2009.**

Next plenary meeting will take place in Parma on the **22-23 October** (1<sup>st</sup> day from 09.00 to 18.00h and 2<sup>nd</sup> day from 8.30-15.00) .

The proposed (agreed?) dates for Plenary meetings in 2009 are the following:

- 28-29 January
- 18-19 March

- 29-30 April
- 3-4-5 June
- 10-11 or 29-30 September (EAAP Congress 24-27 September).
  - This date to be confirmed in June 2009
- 28-29 October or 24-25 October to be confirmed in June 2009
- 08-09 December