



Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 86th Plenary meeting

WEB conference, 25-26 March 2020
(Agreed on 16 April 2020)

Participants

■ Panel Members

Claude Bragard, Francesco Di Serio, Katharina Dehnen-Schmutz, Annemarie Fejer Justesen, Paolo Gonthier, Josep Jaques Miret, Sven Christer Magnusson, Panagiotis Milonas, Juan A. Navas-Cortés, Roel Potting, Hans-Hermann Thulke, Wopke van der Werf, Antonio Vicent, Jonathan Yuen, Lucia Zappalà Marie-Agnès Jacques, Alan MacLeod and Stephen Parnell.

■ Hearing Experts:

Andrew Hart

Rob Tanner (EPPO)

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Wolfgang Reinert, Maria Belen Marquez Garcia, Maria Kammenou (EC, DG SANTE, Unit Plant Health)

■ EFSA:

ALPHA Unit: Caterina Campese, Laura Carotti, Ewelina Czwieniczek, Eduardo De La Peña, Alice Delbianco, Ciro Gardi, Svetla Kozelska, Nikolaus Kriz, Andrea Maiorano, Maria Rosaria Mannino, Giulia Mattion, Alzbeta Mikulova, Marco Pautasso, Maria Chiara Rosace, Oresteia Sfyrá; Giuseppe Stancanelli, Franz Streissl, Emanuela Tacci and Sara Tramontini.

AMU Unit: Olaf Mosbach Schulz, José Cortiñas Abrahantes

SCER Unit: Bernard Bottex

■ Others:

Eric Grenier (INRA, representing the EFSA Art. 36 Grant on "Characterizing and monitoring resistance adaptation in European populations of the quarantine cyst nematode species *Globodera pallida*)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Committee/Scientific Panel/ Members

Nothing to declare.

4. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and/or possible adoption

4.1 Art. 29 Scientific opinion on Pest categorisation of *Exomala orientalis* ([EFSA-Q-2019-00581](#))

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Exomala orientalis* (Coleoptera: Rutelidae) (Oriental beetle) for the European Union (EU). Larvae feed on the roots of a variety of hosts including most grasses and many vegetable crops. Maize, pineapples, sugarcane are among the main host plants. Larvae are particularly damaging to turfgrass and golf courses. The adults feed on flowers and other soft plant tissues (e.g. *Alcea rosea*, *Dahlia*, *Iris*, *Phlox* and *Rosa*). Eggs are laid in the soil. Larvae feed on host roots and overwinter in the soil. Adults emerge from pupae in the soil in May-June and are present for about 2 months. *E. orientalis* usually completes its life cycle in 1 year although individuals can spend two winters as larvae. Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/2072 (Annex IIA) regulates *E. orientalis*. The legislation also regulates the import of soil attached to plants for planting from third countries, therefore entry of *E. orientalis* eggs, larvae and pupae is prevented. *E. orientalis* is native to Japan or the Philippine islands. It is also found in East Asia and India, Hawaii and north-eastern USA. It is assumed to have reached USA via infested nursery stock. Plants for planting (excluding seeds) and cut flowers provide potential pathways for entry into the EU. *E. orientalis* has been intercepted only once in the EU, on *Ilex crenata* bonsai. Climatic conditions and the availability of host plants provide conditions to support establishment in the EU. Impacts on maize, grassland and turfgrass would be possible. There is uncertainty on the extent of the impact on host plants which are widely commercially grown (e.g. maize) Phytosanitary measures are available to reduce the likelihood of entry. *E. orientalis* satisfies the criteria that are within the remit of EFSA to assess for it to be regarded as a potential Union quarantine pest. Of the criteria that are within the remit of EFSA to assess for it to be regarded as a potential Union regulated non-quarantine pest *E. orientalis* does not meet the criterion of occurring in the EU.

This opinion was adopted by the PLH Panel on 26 March 2020

4.2 Art. 29 Scientific opinion on Pest categorisation of *Naupactus leucoloma* ([EFSA-Q-2019-00582](#))

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Naupactus leucoloma* Boheman (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) for the European Union (EU) territory. *N. leucoloma* is a polyphagous pest reported

to feed on 385 plant species; cultivated hosts include alfalfa, beans, brassicas, carrots, clover, onions, peas, potatoes and soft fruits. *N. leucoma* is native to eastern South America. During the first half of the twentieth century it spread to Australia, New Zealand, South Africa and the USA. In 2005 it was reported in the Azores where it occurs in the wild. In suitable conditions *N. leucoma* can develop from egg to adult in about 12 months with adults emerging during spring and summer. Outside of South America only females are known, they develop and lay eggs without fertilization. Eggs are usually laid in the soil but can be laid on the stem or lower leaves of hosts. Larval root feeding causes damage to root surfaces leading to stunting and yield or quality losses. Larvae can tunnel inside potato tubers causing significant losses. Pupation takes place in the soil in spring and summer. Larvae and eggs that are laid late in the summer overwinter. Plants for planting and plant products, such as potatoes, provide potential pathways for entry into the EU. The suitable climate and the wide availability of host plants provide conditions to support the establishment of *N. leucoma* in the EU. *N. leucoma* is regulated in the EU by Commission Implementing Regulation 2019/2072 (Annex IIA). The import of soil or growing medium, from third countries other than Switzerland, is prohibited in the EU and therefore so far inhibited the entry of *N. leucoma* larvae and pupae. All criteria assessed by EFSA for consideration either as a potential union quarantine pest or as a potential regulated non-quarantine pest are met.

This opinion was adopted by the PLH Panel on 26 March 2020

4.3 Art. 29 Scientific opinion on Commodity risk assessment of *Acer* spp. plants from New Zealand ([EFSA-Q-2019-0060](#), [EFSA-Q-2019-00600](#), [EFSA-Q-2019-00599](#))

The European Commission requested the EFSA Panel on Plant Health to prepare and deliver risk assessments for commodities listed in Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2018/2019 as "High risk plants, plant products and other objects". This Scientific Opinion covers all plant health risks posed by dormant and free of leaves, 1 to 3 year-old bare root plants for planting of *Acer* spp. imported from New Zealand, taking into account the available scientific information, including the technical information provided by New Zealand. The relevance of an EU-quarantine pest for this opinion was based on evidence that: (i) the pest is present in New Zealand; (ii) *Acer* spp. are hosts of the pest, and (iii) the pest can be associated with the commodity. The relevance of this opinion of any other pest, not regulated in the EU, was based on evidence that: (i) the pest is present in New Zealand (ii) the pest is absent from the EU; (iii) *Acer* spp. are hosts of the pest; (iv) the pest can be associated with the commodity and (v) the pest may have an impact and can pose a potential risk for the EU territory. Four pests (*Eotetranychus sexmaculatus*, *Meloidogyne fallax*, *Oemona hirta* and *Platypus apicalis*) that fulfilled all relevant criteria were selected for further evaluation. For the selected pests, the risk mitigation measures

proposed in the technical dossier from New Zealand were evaluated. Limiting factors in the effectiveness of the measures were documented. For the selected pests an expert judgement is given on the likelihood of pest freedom taking into consideration the risk mitigation measures acting on the pest, including uncertainties associated with the assessment. Based on the outcome of Expert Knowledge Elicitation, the degree of pest freedom varies among the pests evaluated. The mite, *Eotetranychus sexmaculatus*, was the pest most likely to cause plants to fail pest freedom status. The Panel is 95% sure that at least 9240 plants per 10,000 will be free from *E. sexmaculatus*.

The opinion was adopted by the PLH Panel on 26 March 2020.

5. Feedback from Scientific Panel including their Working Groups, Scientific Committee, EFSA and European Commission

5.1 Update from High Risk Plants WGs section I, II and III and Momordica WG

The chair of the WG HRP Section I provided a short update presenting the progress on the commodity risk assessment of *Jasminum polyanthum* plants for planting (unrooted cuttings) from Israel, where the evaluation of the pest list has been completed. The chair also presented the ongoing activities for the preparation of the pests list of *Nerium oleander* plants for planting from Turkey.

The chair of the WG HRP Section II provided a short update focusing on two dossiers the WG is dealing with now, i.e. (i) a commodity risk assessment of *Ficus carica* plants for planting (bare-rooted plants and liners) from Israel and (ii) a commodity risk assessment of *Acer palmatum* plants for planting (bare-rooted plants, dormant without leaves, grafted on understock of *Acer davidii*) from China.

The scientific officer of the WG HRP Section III provided a short update focusing on two dossiers the WG is dealing with now, i.e. (i) a commodity risk assessment of *Persea americana* plants for planting from Israel and (ii) a commodity risk assessment of *Ullucus* tubers from Peru. Moreover, the creation of a new WG and the work plan for the evaluation of *Momordica* spp. dossiers were presented to the Panel.

5.2 Presentation of template for scientific opinion on High Risk Plants commodity risk assessment for review and possible endorsement by the Panel

The Template for scientific opinion on High Risk Plants commodity risk assessment was developed based on the HRP commodity risk assessment opinions adopted so far including comments and suggestions provided by the PLH Panel on these opinions and during discussion of the last PLH Panel

plenary meetings. In addition, it also reflects discussions and agreements between the three HRP WGs and relevant EFSA colleagues as well as clarifications provided by the Plant health Unit of European Commission DG SANTE.

After a presentation of the Template by the chair of the WG HRP Section I and a follow-up discussion, the Panel agreed and endorsed the final text of the Template. It is expected that the Panel endorsement of the template will facilitate the working group's activities, harmonise the communication of the results and speed up the future adoptions process.

5.3 Update from Pest categorisation WGs: agriculture insects, plant viruses and plant bacteria

Agricultural Insects WG: The panel was updated on the progress and the work plan for 2020 of the Agricultural Insects WG.

Plant Viruses WG: The pest categorisation of Tomato leaf curl New Delhi virus is under preparation, with the objective to get it proposed for possible adoption in June. The Panels was informed that EFSA is also preparing the pest survey card for the same organism in parallel.

Plant Bacteria WG: The Panel was updated about the progress of the work on the categorisation of non-EU potato phytoplasmas. A preliminary list of relevant phytoplasmas is under preparation, with planned circulation to the EU MS for their feedback on data collected over the coming weeks. The work plan for the rest of the year was presented.

5.4 Update on Quantitative pest risk assessment and uncertainty guidances.

The Panel was updated about the calendar of planned discussions on uncertainty and quantitative pest risk assessment during the year.

A presentation was given on the basics of distributions used for quantitative pest risk assessment.

An online exercise on multiplying distributions using the EFSA R4EU online tool was conducted by Panel members individually.

Feedback on the exercise was collected.

5.5 Presentation by Eric Grenier (INRA, France) of the final report of the EFSA Art. 36 Grant "Characterizing and monitoring resistance adaptation in European populations of the quarantine cyst nematode species *Globodera pallida*"

The Panel was updated about the results and final report of the EFSA Art. 36 Grant on "Characterizing and monitoring resistance adaptation in European populations of the quarantine cyst nematode species *Globodera pallida*"

5.6 EFSA new Art. 36 Grants Calls (<https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/calls/art36grants>)

Two open calls for proposals were presented:

- GP/EFSA/ENCO/2020/02 - Thematic grants: Preparedness for future challenges in specific areas of EFSA`s work (ADD LINK)
- GP/EFSA/ALPHA/2020/01 - Entrusting support tasks in the area of Plant health Commodity risk assessment for High Risk Plants (plants for planting for ornamental purpose) (ADD LINK)

A short presentation was given with the deadlines and specifications of the two calls.

5.7 Update on EFSA activities for the International Year of Plant Health 2020

The new EFSA microsite dedicated to the Plant Health activity and inaugurated in occasion of the International Year of Plant Health was presented to the Panel (<https://bit.ly/3dtyypm>).

Ideas for future contributions by Panel members in social media and media relations were discussed.

6. Report on written procedures since 85th PLH Plenary meeting

6.1 85th Plenary minutes, agreed by written procedure

Plenary minutes were agreed on February 19th and were published on EFSA web site <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/event/2020/85th-plh-plenary-meeting-minutes.pdf>

6.2 Art. 29 Scientific opinion on Commodity risk assessment of *Malus domestica* plants from Serbia ([EFSA-Q-2019-00532](#))

The opinion was adopted (abstract below) by written procedure the PLH Panel on March 13th. All Panel members voted favourably for the adoption.

Abstract

The EFSA Panel on Plant health was requested to prepare and deliver risk assessments for commodities listed in the relevant Implementing Acts as "High risk plants, plant products and other objects" (Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2018/2019 establishing a provisional list of high risk plants, plant products or other objects, within the meaning of Article 42 of Regulation (EU) 2016/2031). The current scientific opinion covers all plant health risks posed by dormant bare-rooted plants for planting of *Malus domestica* (1-2 years old) imported from Serbia, considering the available scientific information, including the technical

information provided by the Plant Protection Directorate from Serbia on 27 December 2019. The relevance of an EU-quarantine pest for this opinion was based on evidence that: (a) the pest is present in Serbia; (b) the pest uses *M. domestica* as a host; c) one or more life stages of the pest can be associated with the specified commodity. The relevance for this opinion of pests not regulated in the EU was based on the following criteria: (i) the pest is present in Serbia; (ii) the pest is not present in the EU; (iii) *M. domestica* is a host of the pest (iv) the pest can be associated with the commodity and (v) the pest may have an impact and can pose potential risk for the EU territory. After the assessment of 1191 potential pests, one bacterium, *Erwinia amylovora*, fulfilled all criteria and accordingly, was selected for further evaluation. For this bacterium, the risk mitigation measures proposed in the technical dossier were evaluated. Limiting factors on the effectiveness of the measures were also considered. For the selected species, an expert judgement is given on the likelihood of pest freedom taking into consideration the risk mitigation measures acting on *E. amylovora*, including any uncertainties. Based on the outcomes of an Expert Knowledge Elicitation, the Panel is considering a pallet as a unit; and taking into account the uncertainties associated with the assessment the panel is 95% sure that 9,934 or more pallets out of 10,000 will be pest free.

7. Update from Scientific Committee and its Working Groups

PLH Panel chair updated the Panel on the activity of the Scientific committee, in particular regarding: Workshop on Microbiome, Draft opinion on SynBio, Besides SynBIO, report on bee health, botanicals, Draft framework for protocol development, Guidance on Epidemiology.

Next meeting scheduled in Athens (April) will be organized online.

8. AOB: wrap up & next Panel meetings: Plenary dates for 2020

A presentation was given on the 2020 Plenary dates and the confirmed 2021 Plenary dates. There was a general positive feedback about the quality and the organisation of this WEB plenary.

The Panel will soon be informed whether also the next Plenary in June 2020 would be done as a web plenary.