

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare

Minutes of the 125th Plenary meeting

Held on 23-24 September 2020

EFSA, Parma, WEBMEETING¹

(Agreed on 9 October 2020)²

Participants

■ Panel Members:

ALVAREZ Julio, BICOUT Dominique, CALISTRI Paolo, DREWE Julian, GARIN-BASTUJI Bruno, GONZALES ROJAS Jose Luis, GORTAZAR SCHMIDT Christian, HERSKIN Mette, MICHEL Virginie, MIRANDA Miguel Angel, NIELSEN Søren Saxmose (Chair), PASQUALI Paolo, ROBERTS Helen, SIHVONEN Liisa, SPOOLDER Hans, STAHL Karl, VELARDE Antonio, VILTROP Arvo, WINCKLER Christoph (only 23 September 2020)

■ European Commission: LOGAR Barbara (point 6.12, 6.13), SANDER-VORNHAGEN Kirsten (point 5.1, 6.1-6.6, 9-1) SIMONIN Denis (point 5.1), KUSTER Laszlo (point 6.13, 9.1), FORCELLA Simona (6.7-6.11).

■ EFSA:

ALPHA UNIT: Antoniou Sotiria-Eleni, Aznar Inma, Baldinelli Francesca, Broglia Alessandro, Candiani Denise, Carfagnini Roberta, Dhollander Sofie, Dorbek-Kolin Elisabeth, Fabris Chiara, Ivanciu Corina, Gervelmeyer Andrea, Križ Nik (HoU), Omodeo Sara Gisella, Rapagna Cristina, Van der Stede Yves, Zancanaro Gabriele

■ Hearing experts³: not applicable.

■ Observers: not applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

¹ All meetings were rescheduled to web meetings due to Covid-19

² Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The Chair welcomed the meeting participants and two new AHAW panel members were introduced: Paolo Pasquali and Mette Herskin. They briefly introduced themselves. Apologies were received from Klaus Depner for both days.

2. Adoption of the agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest Scientific Panel Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled in by the Scientific Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting had been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 124th Plenary meeting held on 24 & 25 June 2020, Parma, (Italy)

The minutes of the 124th Plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure on 13 July 2020.

5. Scientific outputs submitted for possible adoption or endorsement

5.1. Art. 29 - Scientific opinion concerning the slaughter of cattle (EFSA-Q-2018-00719)

This draft opinion was thoroughly discussed with the Panel members. Comments from panel members on thermal stress, ambient conditions and cold stress were addressed. The welfare consequences related to light had been considered in the section of moving and handling of the cattle. One overall comment was raised by the AHAW panel and was related to the terms used for some welfare consequences (e.g. impeded movement and restriction of movement) and hazards (e.g. inappropriate restraint). These should be consistent throughout all slaughter opinions. No comments were provided for the general conclusions, summary, abstract and recommendations. The AHAW Panel adopted the Opinion unanimously.

5.2. Art. 29 - Scientific opinion on surveillance and control measures for rift valley fever (RVF) in Mayotte and EU (EFSA-Q-2019-00420)

This draft opinion was thoroughly discussed with the Panel members. Comments from panel members and deep reviewers Karl Stahl and José Gonzales were addressed. Clarity has been provided in the abstract and the Chair of the WG proposed to insert a table containing the sources of uncertainty in the result section and a paragraph better explaining the purpose of the model and the interpretation of the results. Effect of uncertainty will be seen in the boxplots in the result section. In addition, a

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



conclusion shall be put at the end of the Scientific opinion in relation to the uncertainty observed running the model for the nine different scenarios. The AHAW Panel adopted the Opinion unanimously.

5.3. Art. 29 - Endorsement AHAW sections in Scientific opinion on the evaluation of public and animal health risks in case of a delayed post-mortem inspection in ungulates (EFSA-Q-2019-00124)

The comments received by the AHAW panel and deep reviewers (Christian Gortazar and Arvo Viltrop) were taken into account. The AHAW sections considered were: summary, section 1.3.2 (Ante-mortem inspection of domestic ungulates), section 1.3.3 (consideration about disease detection in slaughterhouse), section 1.3.6 (bTB and trichinella), section 2.1 (data and methodology related to diseases listed in Art.5 of Regulation 2016/429 and cysticercosis), section 3.1 (Assessment of detection at delayed PMI of animal diseases listed in article 5 of Regulation 2016/429), section 3.3 (Detection of generalised conditions: post-mortem changes in septicaemia, pyaemia, toxemia and viraemia detectable at PMI), section 4 (conclusions). It was agreed to align the choice of the uncertainty level with these used in the BIOHAZ sections (90% instead of 95%). The AHAW sections were endorsed unanimously. This Scientific opinion will be adopted in BIOHAZ panel meeting on 21-22 October 2020.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion (pre-adoption)

6.1. Art. 29 - Scientific opinion concerning the killing (on-farm) of cattle (EFSA-Q-2018-00720)

This draft opinion was thoroughly discussed with the Panel members. Comments and feedback were incorporated. The following sections or issues need revision: consistency in terms used for impeded movement and restriction of movement, ABMs of state of death (decision to refer to "rhythmic breathing" non-rhythmic). A section related to methods that are considered unacceptable (e.g. application of T61 and percussive blow on the head) should be considered before these methods are included in the list of methods leading to serious welfare concern (see section on unacceptable methods).

6.2. Art. 29 - Request for scientific opinion on welfare: transport of animals (EFSA-Q-2020-00481 & EFSA-Q-2020-00482)

Denise Candiani shared the background of the mandates and explained common ToRs as well as specific scenarios to be evaluated. The workload planning and organisation of the Welfare farm to fork mandates was also shared. The Panel chair nominated the Chair of the working group "Welfare Farm to Fork" (Christoph Winckler) as well as the vice chair of the Transport free moving working group (Mette Herskin) and for Transport in Cages (Antonio Velarde). Deep readers were identified (Dominique Bicout and Miguel Miranda.) The Panel aims to deliver the opinions in June 2022.

6.3. Art. 29 - Request for scientific opinion on welfare: protection of laying hens (EFSA-Q-2020-00483)

Denise Candiani shared the workload planning and organisation of the Welfare farm to fork mandates. The Panel chair nominated the Chair of the working group "Welfare Farm to Fork" (Christoph Winckler) as well as the vice chair of the protection of laying hens working group



(Virginie Michel) and was informed on EFSA support to each mandate. Deep readers were identified (Karl Stahl and José Gonzales.) The Panel aims to deliver the opinion in December 2022.

6.4. Art. 29 - Request for scientific opinion on welfare: protection of calves (EFSA-Q-2020-00480)

Denise Candiani shared the workload planning and organisation of the Welfare farm to fork mandates. The Panel chair nominated the Chair of the working group "Welfare Farm to Fork", Christoph Winckler, which will also act as chair of the protection of calves working group (Christoph Winckler) and was informed on EFSA support to each mandate. Deep readers were identified (Søren Nielsen, Julian Drewe and Bruno Garin Bastuji.) The Panel aims to deliver the opinion in March 2023.

6.5. Art. 29 - Request for scientific opinion on welfare: protection of broilers (EFSA-Q-2020-00479)

Denise Candiani shared the workload planning and organisation of the Welfare farm to fork mandates. The Panel chair nominated the Chair of the working group "Welfare Farm to Fork" (Christoph Winckler) as well as the vice chair of the protection of broilers working group (Virginie Michel) and was informed on EFSA support to each mandate. Deep readers were identified (Bruno Garin Bastuji and Søren Nielsen.) The Panel aims to deliver the opinion in December 2022.

6.6. Art. 29 - Request for scientific opinion on welfare: protection of pigs (EFSA-Q-2020-00484)

Denise Candiani shared the workload planning and organisation of the Welfare farm to fork mandates. The Panel chair nominated the Chair of the working group "Welfare Farm to Fork" (Christoph Winckler) as well as the vice chair of the protection of pigs working group (Hans Spoolder) and was informed on EFSA support to each mandate. Deep readers were identified (Julio Alvarez, Liisa Sihvonen and Paolo Pasquali) The Panel aims to deliver the opinion in June 2022.

6.7. Art. 29 - Request for scientific opinion on African swine fever: Outdoor farming (EFSA-Q-2020-00425)

EFSA officers presented the first results of questionnaire survey and the progress of the literature review, which aims at collecting evidence on structures and practices of outdoor farming of pigs in the EU, including biosecurity measures applied. It was clarified that backyard farms are not included as a specific category of farms but are included in the assessment if they provide pigs with access to outdoors. It was suggested to use photos to illustrate the different types of outdoor farms. The biosecurity measures currently applied in EU outdoor pig farms should be presented by outdoor farm type.

6.8. Art. 29 - TOR2: African Swine Fever Risk ranking matrices (EFSA-Q-2019-00618)

An overview was given on progress of EKE. Due to the COVID-19 related restrictions, the EKE process will take more time than foreseen. Therefore it will not be possible to keep the current



deadline. It was underlined that early feedback on the model results is needed. Panel members Dominique Bicout and Karl Stahl volunteered to attend a meeting for a detailed review of the first model results. The model results shall be presented and discussed in detail with all Panel members at one of the upcoming plenary meetings. Preliminary calculations will be presented in the next plenary meeting.

6.9. Art. 29 - Request for scientific opinion on African swine fever: Exit Strategy (EFSA-Q-2020-00423-424)

The progress made on the three pillars (exploration of field data, narrative literature review and epidemiological model) contributing to the development of the formulation of recommendations for the ASF exit strategy was presented. The exploratory analysis of the apparent seroprevalence from the period before and after the last PCR positive samples found in Sardinia, Latvia and Estonia were updated. The literature review on possible mechanisms contributing to persistence of ASF in wild boar populations and on attributes of ASFV that are associated with a high uncertainty, which could influence the outcomes of the epidemiological model was updated. The planning for the future working group meetings and the planning of different stages of the opinion to be presented during the future plenary meetings was presented. José Gonzales will replace Søren Nielsen as deep reviewer. Workplan and milestones of the working group were communicated to the Panel members.

6.10. Art. 31 - Technical and scientific assistance on African swine fever: EPI-5 report (EFSA-Q-2020-00426)

The progress made on the collection of wild boar surveillance data from the ASF-affected MS in the EU as well as the progress on the data collection to evaluate the effectiveness of the measures applied in the white zones, was presented. The planning for the future working group meetings and the planning of different stages of the report to be presented during the future plenary meetings was presented. José Gonzales will replace Klaus Depner as deep reviewer. Workplan and milestones were communicated to the Panel members.

6.11. Art. 31 - Technical and scientific assistance on African swine fever: Research Gap Analysis (EFSA-Q-2020-430)

The progress made on the development of the research protocols for the 4 research domains was presented, which could be carried out in a short time frame and will have an impact on the control and eradication of ASF. Fourteen research protocols will be developed by Enetwild for research on wild boar, 6 research protocols on vectorial transmission will be developed by Vectornet, 1 research protocol on ASF survival in carcasses and the environment, and 1 research protocol on ASF seasonality will be outsourced. Working group meeting have been organised to follow up the contractors and the planning for the future working group meetings and the planning of different stages of the report to be presented during the future plenary meetings was presented.

6.12. Art. 29 - Disease control measures category A diseases AHL (EFSA-Q-2020-00193-00198)

The chair of the working group (Helen Roberts) presented the methodology, using some descriptive examples, on how to tackle TOR1. In order to assess the clinical and sampling



procedures for all Category A diseases, available literature, diagnostic manuals, current and old pieces of relevant legislation, and other sources of information will be identified and reviewed. The first outputs from the contractor in relation to TOR2 were presented. Only results for African Horse Sickness were presented, as this was the first disease for which results were provided by the contractor. Similar methodology will be used for the rest of the diseases. Transmission kernels and results extracted from them for all 5 diseases were presented. EC expressed satisfaction with the presented approach to tackle TOR1, TOR2, and TOR3. An extension of the deadline for TOR 4 (6 months) had been previously agreed with the EC.

6.13. Art. 29- Scientific opinion for the listing and categorisation of transmissible animal diseases caused by bacteria resistant to antimicrobials, in the framework of the Animal Health Law (EFSA-Q-2019-00760)

The state of play of the current mandate was discussed with AHAW panel. The University of Copenhagen has been awarded for the contract (literature review on listing of bacteria with impact on animal health and for which issue with antimicrobial resistance had been observed). No questions were raised from Panel members to the working group representatives. Comments on the document have to be submitted by 29 September 2020 COB the latest.

6.14. Updated Guidance in AHAW: Risk assessment for animal welfare (EFSA-Q-2020-00179) and Animal health risk assessment using modelling (EFSA-Q2020-00180)

An update was provided by the working group chair to Panel members (Dominique Bicout).

6.15. Art. 31 - Scientific and technical assistance on Avian Influenza monitoring (EFSA-Q-2020-00272)

Francesca Baldinelli presented to the Panel members the report on monitoring of Avian Influenza within and outside Europe for the reporting period May – August 2020 that will be published by 30 September 2020.

7. New Mandates

No new mandates.

8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission-Activities from other Panels

8.1. Feedback from the EC

N/A

9. Any other business & wrap up



9.1. Covid-19 in animals

A short round table was organised to collect information on ongoing risk assessments of COVID-19 in animals (including pets). Soren Nielsen gave update of the situation of animals within farms in Denmark. Helen Roberts shared information on possible infection in pet animals.

9.2. Organisation of WG meetings in EFSA/role of chair of WGs

Yves Van der Stede shared the recent EFSA decision on organisation of WG meetings and role of Chair of WGs. The expert appointed as WG chair may be invited to participate in the role of chair or member in a given WG meeting, based on EFSA's decision whether the agenda topics are sensitive and/or complex.

9.3. Feedback interviews AHAW panel

Yves Van Der Stede provided feedback on the interviews that had taken place during summer 2020 with each of the panel members. The exercise was considered as a good initiative in order to improve the collaboration with external experts and EFSA.

9.4. Wrap up and next meeting

A short wrap up was provided and tasks were distributed.

Next Plenary meeting will be via WEB next 28-29 October 2020.