

EXECUTIVE OFFICE

**56th Meeting of EFSA's Management Board
Minutes of the Public Session
Parma, 14 March 2013, 09.00 – 16.00h**

Members of the Management Board present

Sue Davies (Chair)	Stella Canna-Michaelidou
Piergiuseppe Facelli (Vice-Chair)	Jan Mousing
Marianne Elvander (Vice-Chair)	Radu Roatiş-Cheţan
Manuel Barreto Dias	Jiri Ruprich
Valérie Baduel	Paola Testori Coggi
Jaana Husu-Kallio	Piet Vanthemsche
Milan Kováč	Tadeusz Wijaszka

Staff of the European Food Safety Authority present

Catherine Geslain-Lanéelle (Executive Director)	Simone Gabbi
Per Bergman	Anne-Laure Gassin
Gian Luca Bonduri	Olivier Ramsayer
Adrian Bucureci	Alberto Spagnolli
Hubert Deluyker	Bernhard Url

Also attending:

Anthony Hardy, Chair of EFSA's Scientific Committee

Table of Contents

Summary of decisions	3
Welcome by the Chair	4
Adoption of the agenda	4
Executive Director's progress report	4
Draft Annual Activity Report	5
Draft Multiannual Plan 2014-2016	6
Draft Preliminary Management Plan 2014	7
Draft Preliminary Budget and Establishment Plan 2014	7
Appointment of some members of the Panel on FEEDAP Panel	8
Amendments to the Art. 36 list of organisations	8
European Commission's roadmap on the common approach for EU decentralised Agencies	8
Update on EFSA's activities in the field of Emerging Risks	9
2012 and 2013 Budget execution and transfers	9
Feedback from the Audit Committee	10
Any other business	10
Actions arising	10
ANNEX: Management Board analysis and assessment of the 2012 Annual Activity Report	11

SUMMARY OF DECISIONS

The Management Board:

- Adopted the agenda unchanged;
- Postponed the adoption of EFSA's Annual Activity Report asking for the inclusion of changes;
- Postponed the adoption of EFSA's Preliminary Management Plan 2014 asking for the inclusion of changes;
- Postponed the adoption of EFSA's Preliminary Budget and Establishment Plan 2014 asking for the inclusion of changes;
- Appointed two new members of the Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed (FEEDAP);
- Adopted an amended list of Art. 36 organisations.

The Management Board also:

- Noted EFSA's Executive Director's progress report;
- Noted the presentation on the Multiannual Plan 2014-2016 and asked to further discuss it at the following meeting in June;
- Noted the European Commission's presentation on its Roadmap on the common approach for EU decentralised agencies;
- Noted the update on EFSA's activities in the field of Emerging Risks;
- Noted the execution and transfers in EFSA's 2012 and 2013 budgets;
- Noted the feedback from the Audit Committee.

Item 1: Welcome by the Chair

1. The Chair opened the Public Session of the 56th Management Board meeting by welcoming the Board members, EFSA Executive Director, EFSA Management Team members, Chair of the Scientific Committee, audience in Parma, stakeholders, experts and staff members.
2. The Chair invited the Board members to declare possible interests. Piet Vanthemsche informed the meeting that he had been recently appointed as a representative of the European Constituency in the World Farmers Organisation and as a member of the Board of Leuven University. Tadeusz Wijaszka informed the meeting that he resigned from his position of Professor at Krakow University and that he accepted the position of part-time consultant for the Polish Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development.

Item 2: Adoption of the agenda

3. The agenda was adopted unchanged.

Item 3: Executive Director's progress report

4. The Chair invited the Executive Director to present her progress report.
5. The Executive Director gave an overview of the activities carried out since the beginning of 2013, in particular highlighting: the launch of the Transparency Initiative; the scientific outputs on the risks to bees from neonicotinoids, the opinion on endocrine active substances; the meeting with Commissioner Tonio Borg; EFSA and DG SANCO meeting with NGO networks; EFSA and DG AGRI discussion on the research programme "Horizon 2020"; the joint mandate (EFSA ad EMA) on horsemeat contamination; and the meeting with the Advisory Forum, which saw the participation of the Chair of the Management Board and EFSA's liaison MEP, Pilar Ayuso. The Executive Director also drew the meeting's attention to the activities aimed at issuing (by summer 2013) an opinion on meat inspection of solipeds; the public consultation carried out on the draft opinion on aspartame, which will be followed by a workshop between EFSA's experts and those who have commented on the opinion; the ongoing activities on the assessment of bisphenol A, which are carried out in collaboration with the French agency; the meeting with stakeholders on EFSA's opinion on endocrine active substances (Brussels, 20 March); and the hearings at the European Parliament on subjects including probiotics, pesticides and endocrine disruptors. Concluding, the Executive Director made reference to the Authority's budget execution, which was generally in line with the targets set for the end of February. A separate PowerPoint presentation is available online for a detailed description.
6. The Chair complemented the Executive Director on the meeting with the NGO networks highlighting its contribution to strengthening cooperation with stakeholders and in clarifying a number of issues that often cause misunderstandings or misperceptions of EFSA's role in the European food safety system. She also informed the meeting on her participation in the last Advisory Forum meeting, where she had the opportunity to provide the Member States with detailed information on EFSA's external evaluation and the recommendations that the Board adopted at the meeting in December 2012. She said that the Member States also addressed, among others, the issue of EFSA's scientific sustainability in the long term, and the importance of developing expertise and experts for the future.
7. Addressing the questions received from the Board members, the Executive Director proposed to provide them with a feedback on EFSA's work on transparency and cooperation with stakeholders at the meeting scheduled in October. She informed the meeting on the ongoing activities to streamline, in agreement with the Commission services, the use of the "stop-the-clock" mechanism for regulated products. On court cases, she said that they did not raise any particular concern from the budgetary point of view.
8. The Chair of EFSA's Scientific Committee briefed the Board on the Authority's scientific activities in the field of endocrine active substances and informed the meeting that EFSA is liaising with the international organisations having already worked on the subject. He said that the workshop on 20 March will provide an opportunity to discuss with stakeholders and international organisations on the methodologies for the assessment of endocrine disruptors. Alberto Spagnolli (Executive Office) provided information on the annual external review of EFSA's scientific outputs highlighting how the external reviewers had recently issued an overall positive report, which recommends paying more attention to avoiding editorial mistakes among others. Following up on that report, EFSA will devise an action plan to address the identified procedural shortcomings. The Chair asked if

the report of the external reviewers could be circulated among the Board members. Bernhard Url (Risk Assessment and Scientific Assistance) clarified that an MRL has not been established for phenylbutazone (a drug used to treat racehorses), which raises some safety concerns as that substance is not intended to enter the food chain. He said that EFSA is working on a joint statement with EMA on this issue.

9. The Board noted the Executive Director's progress report and asked her to convey their gratitude to EFSA's scientific experts and staff for the excellent work they performed.

Item 4: Draft Annual Activity Report 2012

10. The Chair invited the Executive Director to introduce the subject.
11. Describing the main outcomes achieved in 2012, among others the Executive Director highlighted: the renewal of the Scientific Committee and eight Scientific Panels; the delivery of 763 outputs (out of the 767 estimated in the Management Plan 2012); EFSA's second external evaluation and the Management Board recommendations; the improvements in the fields of independence (e.g.: the Implementing Rules of the Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making) and transparency (e.g.: the participation of observers in the Panel plenary meetings); the enhanced dialogue with stakeholders; the work carried out on urgent requests; the increased support to applicants; the publication of the risk communication guidelines, as well as the "Understanding science" videos and EFSA's debut on the social networks. She underlined that EFSA was capable to efficiently commit 99.3% of its budget, reaching the level of 88% in payment appropriations. EFSA continued working on the restructuring of its operations by achieving structural savings calculated in 3.94 million euro. Concluding, the Executive Director referred to EFSA's challenges in 2012. Among others, she mentioned EFSA's capacity to attract expertise in the area of GMOs; the underperformance in the production of outputs in the areas of pesticides, food additives and packaging; the postponement to 2013 of the adoption of the IT Strategy, as well as the document management system; and the discharge of EFSA's 2010 budget, which was strictly linked to the criticisms on the Authority's independence. A separate PowerPoint presentation is available online for a detailed description.
12. The Chair of the Audit Committee informed the meeting that the previous day the Committee discussed the application of Art. 40 of the EU Financial Regulation, which requires that the Management Board sends to the EU Budgetary Authority and the European Court of Auditors an assessment on the activity report of the previous financial year. The Audit Committee suggested that the Board assessment will be annexed to the minutes of the meeting. The Board members agreed on the proposal of the Audit Committee.
13. Overall, the Board members expressed their appreciation for the positive results achieved by EFSA in 2012, but commented on the complexity of the report, asking that future reports would be simplified.
14. Questions and comments were received on: the number of delivered outputs and the distinction between scientific outputs and "other publications"; the request to report more clearly on elements of underperformance and their causes; whether a simplified version of the Annual Activity Report is made available to the public; the request to include in the report a paragraph on the activities of the Management Board; whether the Annual Activity Report should include information on progress made by EFSA over the years; the number of public consultations carried out vs. those initially planned; the postponement of the IT Strategy to 2013; and the move of EFSA to its new premises without any disruption of its business continuity or productivity.
15. The Executive Director clarified that the Annual Activity Report is mainly targeted to the EU institutions and that it triggers the procedure on the budget discharge. She explained that the report is made available online, but that a simplified version is also made available on the website, which targets the public at large. She agreed on the inclusion of a specific paragraph describing the activities carried out by the Management Board. On the distinction between scientific outputs and other publications, she explained that the latter cannot be considered as independent from the former, but that they are needed to issue scientific outputs like opinions, guidance documents and statements. She also explained that the Board itself, acknowledging the importance of those publications and the allocation of resources for their production, previously asked to consider them as an integral part of EFSA's scientific outputs. Concluding, the Executive Director proposed to revise the executive summary of the report in order to address and clarify the issues raised by the Board.

16. Welcoming the proposal of the Executive Director, the Board postponed the adoption of EFSA's Annual Activity Report. The report would be submitted for adoption in written procedure in the following days.

Item 5: Draft Multiannual Plan 2014-2016

17. The Chair invited Alberto Spagnolli (Executive Office) to introduce the subject.
18. Alberto Spagnolli introduced EFSA's first Multiannual Plan by saying that it provides the vision on the evolution of EFSA's activities over the following years, a vision that took inspiration from the Management Board recommendations adopted in December 2012. The Multiannual Plan integrates the main elements of EFSA's Strategic Plan, Science Strategy and Communications Strategy. The operating context of the Multiannual Plan included the following elements: a stable number of outputs but with fluctuations between the different scientific areas in EFSA's remit; an increasing complexity of EFSA's scientific assessments; stable financial resources; more human resources for new tasks and strengthened support to Panels; and an increasing public interest and scrutiny. In view of reducing Panel's workload, EFSA proposed reallocating the work on routine activities, in the field of regulated products, to internal staff. The reallocation would aim to reduce experts' workload for routine activities linked to the evaluation of regulated products, increase EFSA's attractiveness for scientific experts and enhance EFSA scientific sustainability, increase efficiency and predictability in the production of outputs, and alleviate the Member States from the financial burden of bearing an important share of the costs related to the work carried out by the experts. The reallocation of work would require an increase of EFSA's budget of 4.8 million euro over the following three years, and an increase of scientific staff calculated at 45 posts. However, for the year 2014, the increase of staff would be implemented in a budget neutral manner, as the additional costs for the recruitment of 25 staff members would be covered by savings and efficiency gains, mostly identified in the areas of governance and support. EFSA also predicts that from 2015 onwards the Authority will be asked to carry out activities related to new legislation (e.g. novel foods). This would require an increase of EFSA's budget calculated 1.3 million euro and the addition of five posts in its establishment plan. The Multiannual Plan identifies the activities needed to implement the proposed changes, as well as to follow up the Management Board recommendations and the objectives described in EFSA's strategies. In order to measure the effectiveness of those activities, the Multiannual Plan includes key performance indicators for each. In 2014 the scientific cooperation programme (grants and procurement) would receive fewer funds, but they are planned to increase from 2015 onwards (approximately 10 million euro per year). Concluding, Alberto Spagnolli said that the Multiannual Plan will be reviewed annually in order to maintain the vision on EFSA's work over the following three years and include the feedback received from the Commission, European Parliament, Member States and stakeholders. A separate PowerPoint presentation is available online for a detailed description.
19. Stressing the need to safeguard the Panel system in the adoption of EFSA's scientific outputs, the Chair asked clarifications on the redistribution of work between Panel experts and EFSA staff in the field of regulated products. Alberto Spagnolli explained that the redistribution of work between Panel experts and EFSA staff will only relate to routine tasks in the assessment of regulated products, whilst the Panels will retain the task of discussing, reviewing and adopting the documents prepared for them by EFSA's scientific staff. Per Bergman (Scientific Evaluation of Regulated Products) added that the internalisation of scientific routine activities would allow EFSA to make more efficient use of the expertise of the Panel and Working Group members, as well as decrease the number of EFSA Working Groups.
20. Questions and comments were received on: the need to foster scientific cooperation with the Member States by involving them in the elaboration of a common work-plan; the financial sustainability of the new approach for the implementation of tasks in the field of regulated products; EFSA's engagement in post-market monitoring activities; the priority areas for the application of quality management system to EFSA's scientific activities; the need to pursue further efficiency gains in EFSA's operations; clarifications on the move of the activities related to pesticide assessment from Activity 3 (Data collection) to Activity 2 (Evaluation of products); and the need to give more emphasis on the scientific cooperation with national and international organisations in order to achieve further efficiency gains.
21. Stressing that the EU budget authority had not adopted the Multiannual Financial Framework (2014-2020) yet, the European Commission representative raised the issue on the appropriateness of adopting the Multiannual Plan in an environment of ongoing uncertainty in relation to the actual amount of financial resources that the Member States will make available to the European Commission and its Agencies. Summarising the outcomes

of the financial agreement reached by the Member States in the context of the summit of February 2013, she emphasised that the Council had proposed a cut of 16% of the resources allocated to the Commission's internal policies, which include food, feed and consumers policies. Reminding the meeting that EFSA is financed with SANCO's budget, she said that, due to the importance of the regulatory work carried out by EFSA, the Commission had decided not to cut EFSA's budget but to keep it at a stable level over the coming years. In addition, she informed the Board that the Commission had decided to reduce its staff by 10% in five years, meaning a gradual reduction of its staff by 2% every year. She clarified that the same decision applies also to the Agencies. However, as far as EFSA is concerned, the actual cut in posts (meaning the reduction of posts in the establishment plan) will be limited to 1% per year. The other 1% of posts will be left to EFSA and reallocated to the execution of tasks linked to the adoption of new legislation. Therefore, bearing in mind the present economic context, the European Commission could not support the adoption of a Multiannual Plan based on the assumption that EFSA would obtain more funds and more staff in the coming years.

22. The Commission also clarified that EFSA's mandate in post-market monitoring is limited and that it mainly evaluates the data provided by industry and Member States. Concluding, the Commission highlighted the need to include in the Multiannual Plan a section on evaluation and auditing, which would clarify what activities the Authority plans to carry out to address the recommendations received.
23. Acknowledging that EFSA's Multiannual Plan was based on a number of assumptions as far as the financial resources made available to the Authority were concerned, the Executive Director suggested postponing the adoption of the Multiannual Plan until the adoption of the EU Multiannual Financial Framework 2014-2020. She also agreed to review the section on EFSA's scientific cooperation with national organisations expanding the focus on activities not only related to grants and procurements. She explained that the activities performed in the field of "food vigilance" are considered of paramount importance by the Member States which, through the Advisory Forum, expressed their strong support for EFSA's engagement in data collection and analysis in this area.
24. Additional questions and comments were received on: the request for more information on how EFSA plans to achieve savings and efficiency gains in the coming years; the need to align EFSA's strategy with the EU policies promoting the reduction in investments in administration; and more information on how the reallocation of scientific work would reduce the likelihood of conflicts of interest.
25. The Chair summarised the main items of discussion and asked EFSA to revise the Multiannual Plan addressing the Board comments. The revised Multiannual Plan will be tabled for further discussion and possible adoption at the June meeting of the Management Board, depending on whether a decision will be made on the EU Multiannual Financial Framework.
26. Before closing the discussion, on a related matter the Chair thanked EFSA for preparing the document prioritising the recommendations received from the external evaluators and explaining how these had been reflected in the Board recommendations.

Item 6: Draft Preliminary Management Plan 2014 and
Draft Preliminary Budget and Establishment Plan 2014

27. The Chair invited the Executive Director and Olivier Ramsayer (Resources and Support) to introduce the item.
28. Recalling the context in which EFSA will operate in 2014 (see also previous agenda item), the Executive Director outlined EFSA's key priorities for the following year: Fit-for-purpose scientific advice; Transparency; Support for applicants; Development of human capital; Initiate the reallocation of routine tasks in the field of regulated products; and Organisational efficiency. Among the key activities for 2014 she highlighted the protection of public health, the assessment of regulated products, communications on risks and internal communications. Olivier Ramsayer summarised the elements on which EFSA had based the distribution of financial resources between Title I, II and III in its budget. In order to initiate the process of reallocation of routine work in the field of regulatory products, in 2014 EFSA would increase resources in Title I (Staff) and reduce resources in Title III (Operations), whilst the amount allocated in Title II (Infrastructure) would remain at a level close to that of 2013. A separate PowerPoint presentation is available online for a detailed description.
29. Questions and comments were received on: the opportunity to merge the Management Plan and the Budget and Establishment Plan into a single document; the request to align EFSA's Budget and Establishment Plan

with the austerity measures adopted by the Commission; clarifications on the transfer of funds and personnel from Activity 3 to Activity 2; clarifications on the scientific outputs planned to be produced in 2014; and EFSA's IT Strategy.

30. The Executive Director acknowledged the request from the Board to simplify the structure of the documents presented. She said that the additional 25 posts required by EFSA will have no impact on the Authority's budget in 2014, since the additional staff costs would be covered with additional savings and efficiency gains. She clarified that the move from Activity 3 to Activity 2 of the work related to the assessment of pesticides had been reflected in the Preliminary Management Plan both in terms of funds and personnel. In occasion of the adoption of the Management Plan in December 2013, the Executive Director suggested to further clarify the distinction between the different scientific outputs. Reminding the Board that EFSA is currently working on the development of its IT strategy, she suggested postponing the discussion on this topic until later in the year.
31. The European Commission representative reiterated that the proposed Establishment Plan was not in line with the decision of the Commission to gradually reduce the personnel by 10% over the following years. The Board thoroughly discussed the strategic implications of endorsing the Preliminary Management Plan and Preliminary Budget and Establishment Plan as submitted by EFSA and reflected on the opportunity to request additional scientific staff already in 2014. Pending the adoption of EFSA's Multiannual Plan (foreseen in June 2013), the Board agreed that for 2014 the plans should be brought in line with the budgetary and staffing policies adopted by the Commission. Further discussions on the future evolution of EFSA's work and the need for additional staff will be carried out later in the year. Concluding, the Board asked EFSA to revise the Preliminary Management Plan 2014 and the Preliminary Budget and Establishment Plan 2014 in line with the discussion held. The revised documents would be submitted to the Management Board for adoption in written procedure.

Item 7: Appointment of some members of the Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed (FEEDAP)

32. The Chair invited Per Bergman (Scientific Evaluation of Regulated Products) to introduce the agenda item. She clarified that the role of the Board in appointing the members of the Scientific Panels is to ensure that EFSA had identified the candidates in full compliance with the selection procedure.
33. Per Bergman explained that the FEEDAP Panel, composed of 19 experts, needed the inclusion of two new members with expertise in the areas of animal metabolism, pharmacokinetics and pharmacodynamics. The candidates proposed for nomination had been selected from the reserve list approved by the Management Board on 13 December 2012. Their updated Declaration of Interests had been screened and no conflict had been detected.
34. The Board appointed the two experts proposed by EFSA as new members of the Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed (FEEDAP).

Item 8: Amendments to the Art. 36 list of organisations

35. Hubert Deluyker (Science Strategy and Coordination) informed the meeting of EFSA's proposal to add two new organisations (one Finnish and one Romanian) to the list of organisations capable of assisting the Authority in performing its tasks (Art. 36 of EFSA's Founding Regulation). He also drew the Board's attention to the technical changes adopted with decision of the Executive Director dated 5 February, 2013. Concluding, he informed the meeting that EFSA and the Focal Points were carrying out activities aimed at reviewing the organisations included in the list and that a thorough analysis will be carried out in the coming months.
36. The Board adopted the amendments to the Art. 36 list of organisations.

Item 9: European Commission roadmap on the Common Approach for EU decentralised Agencies

37. The Chair invited the Commission representative to introduce the item.
38. The Commission representative informed the Board that in July 2012 the Council and the European Parliament had endorsed a joint statement on the Common Approach on the European Regulatory Agencies. The Common Approach identifies four main objectives targeting the EU Agencies: improved governance, enhanced efficiency, enhanced accountability, and improved coherence. In December 2012, the European Commission had adopted the Roadmap following-up on the Common Approach, which identifies a number of actions to be

carried out with the EU Agencies. These actions are focused on five priority areas: conflicts of interest; activity based budget/management and key performance indicators; evaluations; headquarter agreements; and annual work programmes. In particular, as far as EFSA is concerned, the Commission has identified 15 blocks within which actions could be implemented. Highlighting the uniqueness of EFSA's Management Board (that does not include representatives from each Member State) the Commission representative clarified that it had been decided not to follow the recommendation to align the composition of its Board with that of the other Agencies, which comprise representatives of Member States and EU Institutions. Concluding, the Commission representative explained that the Commission had been granted by the EU Council and Parliament the authority to trigger a warning system if serious concerns arise from the decisions of the Agencies' Management Boards. In particular, the warning system would apply in cases where a Board decision would not comply with the Agency's mandate, would violate EU law, or manifestly contradict EU policy objectives. A separate PowerPoint presentation is available online for a detailed description.

39. The Board noted the presentation on the European Commission Roadmap.

Item 10: Update on EFSA's activities in the field of Emerging Risks

40. The Chair invited Hubert Deluyker (Science Strategy and Coordination) to introduce the item.

41. Reminding the meeting that the Founding Regulation requires EFSA to establish monitoring procedures for the systematic search, collection, collation and analysis of data with a view to identifying emerging risks in the fields within its mission, Hubert Deluyker described the activities that EFSA had carried out in cooperation with the Scientific Committee and Panels, as well as the Member States. Among others, he mentioned EFSA's activities in the fields of biological hazards (e.g.: emerging viruses, parasites, bacteria, etc.), chemical hazards (e.g.: environmental contamination of the food chain), consumption habits, natural toxins, climate change on mycotoxin production, technology, food prices and energy drinks. He said that the Emerging Risk Unit was working on, among others, chemical mixtures, low dose response, -omics technologies, human bio-monitoring and bee health. A separate PowerPoint presentation is available online for a detailed description.

42. The Chair of EFSA's Scientific Committee informed the meeting that the next colloquium will focus on stressors in bees (Parma, 15 May 2013).

43. Referring to the recent scandal of contamination of food with horsemeat, some Board members stressed the importance for EFSA to consider emerging issues linked to globalisation. The European Commission representative brought the Board's attention to the need for EFSA to strictly focus on activities within its mandate.

44. The Board noted the presentation on EFSA's activities in the field of Emerging Risks.

Item 11: 2012 and 2013 Budget execution and transfers

45. Olivier Ramsayer (Resources and Support) informed the Board on the execution level of EFSA's 2012 budget. At the end of the year, EFSA had committed 99.3% of its budget, whilst in terms of payments EFSA had executed 88% of its appropriations. In terms of carry forward, EFSA used 96.7% of the credits committed in 2011 and carried to 2012. The transfers executed by the Executive Director between Titles and Chapters represented 1.36% of EFSA's 2012 budget, which respects the limits imposed by the Financial Regulations. The Board congratulated EFSA for the good financial management.

46. As far as the execution level of EFSA's 2013 budget is concerned, Olivier Ramsayer informed the meeting that on 26 February EFSA had committed 18.45% of its 78.05 million budget. In terms of payments, EFSA had executed 9.07% of its appropriations. No transfer was carried out during the first two months of the year.

47. The European Commission representative stressed the importance of the timely execution of payments and brought the Board's attention on the need to notify the Commission without delay if EFSA anticipated an under-spend of its credits.

48. The Board noted the presentations on EFSA's budget execution and transfers in 2012 and 2013.

Item 12: Feedback from the Audit Committee

49. The Chair invited the Chair of the Audit Committee to briefly update the Board on the items discussed at the Committee meeting on the previous day. The Audit Committee had discussed:
- The report of the Internal Audit Service of the European Commission on risks within EFSA. The Audit Committee members agreed on the need to meet with representatives of the IAS at the next Audit committee meeting in order to finalise EFSA's audit plan for 2014 and beyond;
 - The audit plan for 2013: the Audit Committee asked EFSA's internal audit capabilities to align the 2013 audit plan with that of the Commission's internal audit;
 - The application of Art. 40 of the EU Financial Regulation (see point 12 above);
50. The Board noted the feedback from the Audit Committee.

Item 12: Any other business

51. The Chair informed the meeting of the Commission's decision not to recommend the application of a fee system to EFSA. The Commission representative asked EFSA to revise its Multiannual Plan by amending references to the possibility of receiving fees in the coming years. No additional item was proposed for discussion under this heading.
52. In closing the meeting, the Chair thanked the Board members, EFSA's Executive Director, Members of her Management Team, the Chair of the Scientific Committee, EFSA staff, the experts working in EFSA Panels and Scientific Committee, the audience in Parma and the technicians, and took the occasion to extend to all her personal and the Board's wishes for a good Easter break. She reminded the audience that the meeting proceedings will be available online on demand the following day (15 March 2013), and that the next Management Board meeting will be held in Parma on 27 June 2013.

END

Actions Arising

Meeting reference	Action	Deadline	Status
March 14, 2013	EFSA to provide the Board with the report of the External Reviewers.	ASAP	Done
March 14, 2013	EFSA to revise the Draft Annual Activity Report and circulate it among the Board members for adoption in written procedure.	18 March 2013	Done
March 14, 2013	EFSA to revise the Multiannual Plan and table it for discussion at the June meeting of the Management Board.	June 2013	Open
March 14, 2013	EFSA to revise the Draft Preliminary Management Plan 2014 and Preliminary Budget and Establishment Plan 2014 and circulate it among the Board members for adoption in written procedure.	18 March 2013	Done

ANNEX

Management Board analysis and assessment of the EFSA 2012 Annual Activity Report

The Management Board,

- having regard to Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 28 January 2002,
 - having regard to the Financial Regulation applicable to the budget of the European Food Safety Authority and in particular Article 40 thereof,
 - having regard to the 2012 Management Plan of the Authority adopted by the Management Board at its meeting of 15 December 2011,
 - having regard to the Annual Activity Report 2012 of the Authority adopted by the Management Board by written procedure on 26 March 2012.
1. Welcomes the considerable work programme delivered in 2012 and the strong contribution of EFSA to European food safety policy;
 2. Acknowledges the productivity of the organisation and the delivery of 678 scientific outputs and supporting publications (763 including internal reports) in 2012;
 3. Notes the shortfalls in scientific outputs in some areas including pesticides, dietary reference values, food flavourings and enzymes, and plastic recycling processes, and appreciates that this was due to a number of factors, among which the non-receipt of some mandates and the need to prioritise some activities;
 4. Welcomes the positive budget management outcomes achieved in 2012, namely the commitment of 99.3% of its budget;
 5. Welcomes the ongoing reduction in administrative costs of the Authority and notes the reduction of 4% in personnel and the saving of €3.94 m in governance and support activities in 2012;
 6. Welcomes the successful renewal of eight Scientific Panels and the Scientific Committee;
 7. Welcomes the delivery of the second external evaluation of the Authority which has enabled the Board to develop a set of recommendations to steer the organisation in the coming years;
 8. Welcomes the positive findings of the external evaluation indicating that EFSA is delivering its mission;
 9. Acknowledges the European Court of Auditors report on the independence of four EU agencies, which has recognised that EFSA has one of the most advanced systems, and the recommendations for EFSA contained therein;
 10. Notes the concerns raised in relation to conflicts of interest by some Members of the European Parliament and NGOs; acknowledges EFSA's activities to ensure the implementation of its Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision Making Processes; and acknowledges the efforts underway to communicate more effectively on EFSA's independence system;

11. Calls on EFSA to fully consider and implement as far as is practicable all the recommendations arising from the 2010 Budget discharge procedure and the recommendations of the Court of Auditors and to continue to enhance the effectiveness of its communications on the implementation of the recommendations to all stakeholders and interested parties;
12. Welcomes EFSA's initiative to open scientific meetings to observers and looks forward to the review of the pilot programme in 2013;
13. Calls on EFSA to honour its commitment to deliver an IT Operational Strategy and Document Management System;
14. Welcomes EFSA's commitment to building European risk assessment capacity through, among others, the provision of advanced training courses in risk assessment for experts and staff and the successful organisation of a scientific risk assessment conference in November with the participation of more than 600 scientific experts;
15. Welcomes the renewal of the mandate of the Stakeholder Consultative Platform and the Authority's progress in strengthening collaboration with stakeholders and other interested parties;
16. Asks the Secretariat to amend the structure of the next Annual Activity Report to facilitate easier assessment of EFSA's organisational performance;
17. Thanks EFSA's contributing experts, Executive Director and staff for their commitment to the organisation.

Adopted in written procedure on 8 April 2013

For EFSA Management Board

Sue Davies,
Chair of the Management Board