

**Minutes of the  
Management Board Meeting  
Public Session, 23 January 2008  
Palazzo Ducale, Parma**

**Members of the Management Board present**

Diána Bánáti	Robert Madelin
Giorgio Calabrese	Milan Pogačnik
Marianne Elvander	Pirkko Raunemaa
Peter Gaemelke	Bart Sangster
Marion Guillou	Roland Vaxelaire
Matthias Horst	Patrick Wall (Chair)

**Observers and Invitees of the Executive Director**

Dr. Alan Reilly, FSAI, Advisory Forum Member	Dr. Leif Busk, NFA, Advisory Forum Member
Dr. Philippe Vannier, Chair of the Scientific panel on Animal Health and Welfare	

**Staff of the European Food Safety Authority present**

Catherine Geslain-Lanéelle	Victoria Villamar
Alexandrine Maviel-Sonet	Riitta Maijala
Anne-Laure Gassin	Hubert Deluyker
Djien Liem	Gisèle Gizzi
Arthur Healy	

## **Table of Contents**

Summary of decisions.....	3
Opening and welcome by Chair.....	4
Adoption of Agenda.....	4
Adoption of draft minutes from the previous meeting and matters arising.....	4
Executive Director's Progress Report.....	4
Presentation on the Activities of the Advisory Forum, Dr. Busk and Dr. Reilly.....	7
Presentation on the AHAW Panel by its Chair, Dr. Philippe Vannier.....	8
Amending Budget 2008.....	8
Rules of the Advisory Forum.....	9
Draft Annual Activity Report 2007.....	9
Update from Audit Committee.....	10
Budget Transfers.....	10
Any other business.....	10
Concluding remarks.....	10

## **SUMMARY OF DECISIONS**

### **The Management Board:**

- Adopted the agenda with one addition under AOB.
- Adopted the minutes from the 13 December 2007 with a request for changes to reflect Minister Silva's address to the Board.
- Announced that two items, 9 and 11, would be deleted from the agenda and that the order of the agenda would be amended as announced.
- Noted that there were no new Declarations of Interest.
- Adopted the Amending Budget 2008.
- Agreed to defer adoption of the Rules of the Advisory Forum until the next meeting.
- Agreed to defer adoption of the Staff Policy Plan until comments had been received from the Commission.

### **The Management Board also:**

- Took note of the Executive Director's Progress Report and congratulated EFSA on the many activities undertaken since the last meeting.
- Took note of Executive Director's Annual Activity Report 2007 and agreed to provide comments.
- Noted the presentation of Dr. Philippe Vannier and thanked him and his panel for their contribution to EFSA.
- Noted the presentation of Dr. Alan Reilly and Dr. Leif Busk and thanked them and their colleagues for their time and efforts.
- Took note of the update from the Chair of the Audit Committee, Mr Vaxelaire, presented by the Chair.
- Took note of the transfers in the EFSA budget.

## Opening and welcome by the Chair

1. The Chair opened the meeting by welcoming the Board Members, Dr. Philippe Vannier, Chair of the AHAW Panel, Dr. Leif Busk and Dr. Alan Reilly, Members of the Advisory Forum, the Authority's staff, members of the public and the viewers on the web. Apologies had been received from Deirdre Hutton, João Pedro Machado and Konstantinos Yazitzoglou.
2. The Chair asked if members wished to make any declarations of interest, none were announced.

## Adoption of Agenda (Document MB 23.01.2008-1; MS Word)

3. The Chair informed the Members of the Management Board of changes to the order of items of the agenda, that Item 9, the rules of the Management Board, would be discussed at the scheduled Management Board Away -Day in March and that Item 11, Staff Policy, would also have to be postponed until the March Board meeting as the views of the Commission had not been received.
4. The Chair asked the Members if there were any changes or additions they would like to make.
5. One item was added to the agenda on Budget Transfers under AOB. The agenda was adopted.

## Adoption of draft minutes of the previous meeting and matters arising from the minutes (Document MB 23.01.2008-2; MS Word)

6. The minutes of the 13 December 2007 meeting were adopted and would be published on the Authority's website.
7. A Member commented that the minutes should be adjusted to reflect the importance of the address of Minister Silva to the December meeting.
8. Matters arising from the December Board meeting: the Executive Director informed the meeting that the 2008 Workplan, Establishment Plan and Budget had been unanimously adopted by the Board by written procedure in December. Inclusion of Romania and Bulgaria in the list of Article 36 organisations had been endorsed by Management Board, also by a recent written procedure. An executive summary of Management Plan 2008 had been produced and would be available to Members in the following days.

## For information: Executive Director's Progress Report (Document MB 23.01.2008-3; MS Word and PowerPoint presentation)

9. The Chair invited the Executive Director to update the Board on progress made at EFSA since the last Management Board meeting covering the period mid-December to mid-January. The Executive Director updated the Board on the progress of ongoing work in the Panels, Scientific Committee, Advisory Forum, Scientific Cooperation & Assistance, Communications, and External Relations.
10. The Executive Director outlined that, as EFSA entered its second phase of development and approached a staff compliment of over 300, changes in governance were necessary to enable it better deliver its key objectives in 2008, which are: delivering the highest quality scientific advice in the context of an escalating workload; strengthening the quality of EFSA's scientific outputs; and positioning EFSA at the forefront of risk assessment methodology in Europe. The changes in

governance in 2008 included the creation of two new directorates: Risk Assessment and Scientific Cooperation & Assistance. In addition, prioritisation of resources to scientific activities will mean that in the period 2006-2008, the number of staff allocated to scientific activities will have doubled, as will staff allocated to Communications. By the end of 2008, 61% of EFSA staff will be allocated to scientific activities compared to 51% in 2006. The structure of the Management Team was outlined. The personnel are: Catherine Geslain-Lanéelle, Hubert Deluyker, Anne-Laure Gassin, Gisèle Gizzi, Herman Koeter, Djien Liem, Riitta Maijala, Christine Majewski, Alexandrine Mavel-Sonet, Anja van Impe and Victoria Villamar (new organigram attached).

11. AFC had adopted opinions on E901 (carrier), 5 flavouring groups, FGE 79, calcium citrate malate, and on mixed tocopherols as a source of vitamin E. It had approved a 17<sup>th</sup> list of substances for food contact materials, comprising 9 substances, and had launched a public consultation on safe recycled plastic production.
12. AHAW had adopted 5 opinions (pig welfare - tail biting; zoonosis; welfare aspects of killing and skinning seals; 2 aquatic animal diseases), organised a meeting with 25 Member State experts on the welfare of dairy cattle and had two calls under Article 36 approved.
13. BIOHAZ had adopted 3 opinions (TSE risk assessment of blood in feeds for fish, monitoring of human enteropathogenic *Yersinia* and *Listeria monocytogenes* in ready-to-eat foods) and, in collaboration with AHAW and ECDC, had reviewed the Community Summary Report on Trends and Sources of Zoonoses, Zoonotic Agents and Antimicrobial Resistance in the EU 2005.
14. CONTAM had adopted 6 opinions on okadaic acid, glucosinolates in feed and cross-contamination of non-target feeds by salinomycin, monensin, semduramicin and maduramicin.
15. FEEDAP had participated in discussions with the EC Standing Committee on Animal Nutrition on new regulation on rules for the implementation of 1831/2003 (authorizations of feed additives); new guidelines were adopted by SCFCAH. The Panel had also met with FEFANA (EU Association of Feed Additives and Premixtures Operators) and the Commission to review the public consultation on guidance for the assessment of the compatibility of zootechnical microbial additives with antimicrobial substances.
16. GMO had adopted a mandate for a self-task on approaches and guidance for assessing the impacts of GM plants in environmental risk assessments and organised a workshop with applicants under Regulation (EC) 1829/2003 with representatives of the private sector and Europabio.
17. NDA reported that the first applications on children's health and development claims had been received and it expected an opinion on "the setting of nutrient profiles for foods bearing nutrition and health claims pursuant to article 4 of Regulation 1924/2006" to be adopted by the end of January.
18. PLH reported that 9 draft opinions on 30 PRAs on pests consider harmful to the French Overseas Departments (Guadeloupe, French Guiana, Martinique and Reunion) had been discussed at the January 16-17 plenary meeting.
19. PPR had signed two procurement contracts for preparatory work on mandates on pesticides and had published a Guidance Document on risk assessment for birds and mammals on the EFSA website for public consultation until 27th January.
20. The Assessment Methodology Unit had prepared a first draft report on food additives and hyperactivity in children and finalised the Multiple Framework Contract for outsourcing statistical tasks.

21. DATEX had prepared a final refinement of the marine biotoxin opinion (CONTAM) and had started work on exposure assessment for the Azaspiracids group. The Panel had calculated summary statistics from the EFSA Food Consumption Concise Database and made them available to national experts.
22. PRAPeR had distributed draft assessment reports for 5 new active substances and 3 existing active substances of the third stage and developed a work programme for the third and fourth stage of existing active substances pursuant to Commission Regulation (EC) No. 1095/2007.
23. Zoonoses Unit: the EFSA-ECDC report on "*Trends and Sources of Zoonoses, Antimicrobial Resistance and Food-borne Outbreaks in EU in 2006*" has been published on the EFSA website and a data validation exercise was preformed on the datasets from the EU-wide baseline surveys on *Salmonella* in turkeys and slaughter pigs.
24. The Scientific Committee had published the opinion on "*Food safety, animal health and welfare and environmental impact of animals derived from cloning by somatic cell nucleus transfer and their offspring and products obtained from those animals*" on the EFSA website for public consultation on 10 January 2008.
25. The 24th Advisory Forum plenary meeting had taken place in The Hague on 6-7 December 2007. The Forum endorsed an updated decision on its operation and the new policy, format and guidelines for the Declaration of Interests were presented. In addition, the implementation of the Strategy for Cooperation and Networking was discussed and several national Focal Point agreements were signed, bringing the end-of-year total of signed agreements to 20.
26. The Communications Directorate highlighted media coverage of EFSA, noted that the Authority website had recorded almost 1.5 m visits in 2007 and described recent corporate publications.
27. External Relations reported that, in relation to the EU Presidencies, EFSA had participated in the Council meeting of Chief Plant Health Officers and had discussions with the 2008 Presidencies (Slovenia and France) to organise cooperative activities and joint meetings. European Parliament activities included participation in the AGRI Committee meeting on GMO, "zero-tolerance" scheme and provision of regular information for the ENVI Committee. EFSA's liaison MEP, Kartika Liotard, participated in the Advisory Forum meeting in The Hague on 7 December.
28. The Board thanked the Executive Director for her presentation and congratulated her on the achievements in the short reporting period since mid-December. Members asked questions on (i) how the new EFSA structure would enhance efficiency and reduce complexity; (ii) how EFSA would utilise the limited number of scientific experts available in Europe; (iii) in relation to the enhanced support for Scientific Panels, what difference would a Panel member notice? (iv) the composition of the Management Team; (v) scientific cooperation with Member States; (vi) availability of the newsletter *Moving Together* on the EFSA website; (vii) update on national Focal Points; (viii) cooperation between EFSA's two scientific directorates; (ix) response to the public consultation on animal cloning; (x) inclusion of headline messages in the Annual Activity Report 2007; (xi) the link between future priorities and resource allocation; (xii) in relation to Art. 36, alerting Member States regarding future expertise requirements; (xiii) language barriers in Member States in relation to EFSA outputs, particularly for consumer organisations; (xiv) deputy for the Executive Director when she is out of office; (xv) a survey of Panellists to assess their requirements and priorities; and (xvi) EFSA corporate communication on cloned meat.
29. The Executive Director thanked Board Members for their support and encouraging words which she would share with her staff. She described and provided examples of cooperation between the two new directorates in the context of facilitating management and increasing the coherence of their activities. She emphasised her ambition to improve scientific cooperation and the role of Art. 36 in that process.

In terms of support for Panels, the Executive Director highlighted the enhancement in both administrative and scientific support for Panel members and the improvement in their working conditions. A survey of Panel Members will be considered, but towards the end of 2008. The Executive Director emphasised that EFSA was committed to work with all Member States in the most efficient way and to adapt its working practices to meet their expectations. She reported that the Directorate of Risk Assessment and the Directorate of Scientific Cooperation & Assistance hold regular meetings, as well as *ad hoc* meetings on specific issues.

30. In response to a query from a board member, the ED reassured the Board that a system of delegation was in place to cover any absences of the Executive Director.
31. In relation to communication, she acknowledged the importance of explaining changes in EFSA to our constituents and stakeholders and also to all EFSA staff charged with managing the increasing workload.
32. The creation of the Focal Points will help with the workload as they are designed to enhance scientific cooperation, support the Advisory Forum members, build networks in and cooperation with Member States and provide some financial support to national organisations. EFSA would present a review of Focal Points at the end of the year. Subscription to EFSA newsletters would be provided immediately for Members.
33. On cloning, EFSA had considered all the available scientific data and it was expected that the final opinion would be adopted in May 2008.
34. In relation to Art. 36, the lists of competent organisations could be updated to reflect specific skill requirements, for example, in the area of environmental risk assessment and plant health.
35. Discussion had already taken place on how to translate more EFSA documents.
36. The Chair thanked the Executive Director for her detailed update and emphasised the importance of enhanced communication with staff during times of organisational change. He wanted EFSA to be recognised among the EU institutions as a results-focused agency that offered a high degree of career satisfaction.

## **Presentation of the Activities of the Advisory Forum by Dr. Busk (Swe) and Dr. Reilly (Irl) (PowerPoint presentation)**

37. Alan Reilly (Food Safety Authority of Ireland) described how the Advisory Forum contributes to the overall work of EFSA, particularly in the area of risk assessment and risk communication. He described the differences in attitudes to risk throughout Member States and how the Forum has contributed to the prevention of food scares in Europe. Focal Points and Forum Working Groups were described and the important function of the Forum in information exchange was noted. Other issues covered included networking, dialogue, collaboration, risk communication, avoidance of duplication and building confidence.
38. Leif Busk (National Food Administration, Sweden) described areas of collaboration, ESCO working groups and emphasised that the Forum is still in the learning phase. He described the project on fortification with folic acid as an example of a collaborative activity. He also outlined the working groups on communication and IT and the Art. 36 network. He noted that in addition to the points noted by Dr. Reilly, one of the added values of the Forum was consistency of approach in dealing with food

risk. He welcomed the provision of multi-annual plans for EFSA to enable Member States to plan their contribution to the Forum.

39. The Chair and Members thanked the presenters for their comprehensive overview of the Forum. A Member emphasised the importance for individual states to continue to perform their own risk assessments in order to contribute to EFSA's assessments. The Chair of the Scientific Committee emphasised the importance of the Advisory Forum to EFSA scientists.
40. In relation to a Member's question on communication on animal cloning and consensus in working groups, the Chair of the Scientific Committee reassured Members that opinions were reached by consensus as EFSA Panels considered the views of all parties in drafting and finalising opinions.

### **Presentation on the Activities of the Panel on Animal Health and Welfare by the Panel Chair, Dr. Philippe Vannier (PowerPoint presentation)**

41. Dr. Vannier reminded the meeting of the activities of the Panel and the change of composition from its first mandate to its second. He described the Panel's output of 35 opinions in the period 2003-2007: 20 opinions in animal health, including zoonoses, 14 of which were related to food producing animals, 3 to companion animals, and 3 to wild animals; and 15 opinions in welfare, 12 relating to food producing animals, 1 to laboratory animals and testing, and 2 to wild animals.
42. Topics covered in the presentation included: the composition of the Panel, approaches to animal health and welfare mandates; rules of procedure; measures to improve efficiency; working groups and WG meetings; numbers of experts per WG; stakeholder and Advisory Forum meetings; time to deliver opinions and compliance with deadlines; plenary meetings; interaction with EU and international institutions; composition and tasks of the AHW unit; and Art. 36 calls by AHW.
43. In his personal conclusions, Dr. Vannier noted that the workload of the Panel was high but the level of support from the AHW unit had increased significantly in the last year. He emphasised the need to enhance the usefulness of opinions for risk managers, to balance internal and external levels of expertise, the use of Art. 36 to enhance efficiency, and the dialogue with DG SANCO.
44. The Chair and Members thanked Dr. Vannier for his presentation. Dr. Vannier replied to Members questions on: engagement with stakeholders; selection of WG members; animal health strategy in Europe; involvement of the Panel in reducing human disease burden associated with established pathogens such as *E. coli*; motivation of Panel members in the face of a high workload; and the work programme of the Commission in relation to self-mandates.

### **For Adoption: Amending Budget 2008 (MB 23.01.08-5, MS Word)**

45. The Director of Administration asked Members to vote on a proposal whereby EFSA has signed an agreement with DG Enlargement to continue the pre-Accession programme for an amount of €500 k, bringing EFSA's 2008 budget to €66.4 m.
46. The proposal was adopted unanimously.

## For Adoption: Rules of the Advisory Forum (MB 23.01.08-6, MS Word)

47. An amended draft version of the strategy first presented to Management Board in January 2003, taking into consideration developments such as the Strategy for Cooperation and Networking, was shared with Members on January 14 and their feedback incorporated into the document.
48. A Member advised that, as the document contained inconsistencies, adoption be postponed and implemented by written procedure.
49. It was agreed to present an amended final version of the document to the next Board meeting for quick discussion and possible adoption

## For comment: Draft Annual Activity Report 2007 (MB 23.01.08-4; MS Word and PowerPoint)

50. The Executive Director invited EFSA Directors and Heads of Units to present the main achievements in 2007.
51. The Director of Risk Assessment introduced the highlights of 2007, which included: 201 opinions, 7 guidance documents and 19 other reports; over 400 experts working in 9 scientific panels and their 96 working groups; 565 Plenary and WG meetings; and 10 public consultations. Staff in units supporting the Scientific Panels increased from 73 (2006) to 101, out of which 66% had scientific tasks.
52. Highlights of Scientific Cooperation & Assistance included: support activities for Panels in data collection and exposure, assessment methodology; databases; pesticide safety; supporting the implementation of, for example, Focal Points; and increasing the visibility of EFSA's scientific activities.
53. Scientific Committee achievements included preparing the opinion on animal cloning for public consultation and drafting an internal quality review of EFSA's scientific outputs, and for the Advisory Forum, the implementation of the Strategy for Cooperation and Networking between EU Member States and EFSA.
54. Communications reported on the successful relaunch of the EFSA website, rebranding, Fifth Anniversary events, new publications such as *Moving Together*, and a 60% increase in media coverage of EFSA.
55. In the area of External Relations, the increased involvement of EFSA staff in the Parliament, Commission, Presidencies and other EU agencies, the stakeholder strategy review and the appointment of the Liaison MEP, Kartika Liotard, were among the highlights of the year.
56. Administration reported an increase in staff numbers to 310 at the end of the year and 91% execution of the Establishment Plan, both significant improvements on the 2006 outcomes.
57. Members commented on the title of the External Relations unit, the inclusion of EFSA's vision for 2008/2009 in the Report, clarification on the completion of the evaluation of stakeholder activities, the size of the Report, the need for a Panel-by-Panel account of 2007 activities, more information on the

impact of activities and the inclusion of comments on the success/failure of activities and lessons learnt.

58. The Executive Director thanked the Members for their comments and responded that their comments would be addressed. She informed Members that the internal Crisis Exercise had been performed in the previous week and that a crisis exercise with the AF will follow shortly.

## **Update from the Audit Committee**

59. As Roland Vaxelaire had to leave the meeting early, the Chair of the Management Board presented the update of the Audit Committee. The meeting of the Audit Committee noted that the Internal Auditor position was currently vacant at EFSA but that the function was being maintained by the assistant internal auditor. Six risk areas had been identified for the period 2008-2020: financial management; selection of scientific experts for panels; human resources; external communications; stakeholder expectations; and information technology.

## **Budget Transfers (MB 23.01.08-9, MS Word)**

60. The Director of Administration outlined transfers made from one title to another and from one chapter to another. The total transfers made in 2007 were under the 10% limit and represented 4.56% of the appropriations for the financial year; in 2006, they represented 6.04%. In December, the last transfers represented 0.33%.

## **Any Other Business**

61. The Director of Administration informed the Board that budget execution for 2007 would be 91% and not 93% as forecast, due to postponement of some scientific meetings at the end of 2007 and amendments to staff salary.

## **Concluding remarks**

62. The Chair thanked the members of the Board, the audience in Parma and those watching the webstreaming, the Authority's staff, the interpreters, Dr. Vannier, Alan Reilly and Leif Busk.