



Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare

Minutes of the 120th Plenary meeting

Held on 20-21 November 2019

EFSA, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 10 December 2019)¹

Participants

■ Panel Members:

ALVAREZ Julio, BICOUT Dominique, CALISTRI Paolo (via Skype for business (SFB) on 20 November for point 6.1 and whole day on 21 November), DREWE Julian, GARIN-BASTUJI Bruno (via SKB both days), GONZALES ROJAS Jose Luis (via SFB both days), MICHEL Virginie, MIRANDA Miguel Angel, NIELSEN Søren Saxmose (Chair), ROBERTS Helen, SIHVONEN Liisa, SPOOLDER Hans, VELARDE Antonio, WINCKLER Christoph

■ European Commission: FORCELLA Simona (21 November 2019 via SFB for points 6.1 and 8.2) & VORNHAGEN Kirsten (20 November 2019 via SFB for point 5.3)

■ EFSA:

ALPHA UNIT: Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou, Francesca Baldinelli, Alessandro Broglia, Denise Candiani, Sofie Dhollander, Andras Szoradi, Laura Gonzalez Villeta, Yves Van der Stede, Gabriele Zancanaro, Corina Ivanciu, Sara Gisella Omodeo, Claire Donohue, Cristina Rapagna'

AMU UNIT: Jose Cortinas Abrahantes, Alexandra Papanikolaou, Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

■ Hearing experts²: not applicable.

■ Observers: not applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the meeting participants. Apologies were received from DEPNER Klaus, GORTAZAR SCHMIDT Christian, VILTROP Arvo. New trainees (Sara Gisella Omodeo and Claire

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



Donohue), Seconded National Expert (Corina Ivanciu, Romania) and interim (Cristina Rapagnà) presented themselves.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest Scientific Panel Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 119th Plenary meeting held on 25-26 September 2019, Parma, (Italy)

The minutes of the 119th Plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure on 11 October 2019.

5. Scientific outputs submitted for possible adoption or endorsement

5.1. Art 29 - Scientific opinion concerning stunning methods and slaughter of rabbits for human consumption (EFSA-Q-2018-00909 and EFSA-Q-2018-00594)

The text of the draft Scientific Opinion was presented to the Panel and thoroughly discussed. All comments provided by the Panel members were discussed and addressed. The results obtained from the uncertainty analyses were integrated and rephrased in the conclusions. After some modifications mainly in the sections Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations. The AHAW Panel adopted the Opinion unanimously.

5.2. Art 29 - Scientific opinion concerning the killing of rabbits for other purposes than slaughter (EFSA-Q-2019-00518 and EFSA-Q-2019-00519)

The text of the draft Scientific Opinion was presented to the Panel and thoroughly discussed. All comments provided by the Panel members were discussed and addressed. The description of the uncertainty assessment was aligned with the opinions EFSA-Q-2018-00909 and EFSA-Q-2018-00594). Modifications were proposed and agreed regarding the unacceptability on welfare grounds of methods and procedures. It was agreed with the panel that this scientific opinion will be sent for written adoption by 2 December 2019 and followed up according SOP 012.

Post-meeting note: the opinion was adopted unanimously by written procedure on 10 December 2019.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



5.3. Art 29 – Scientific opinion on health and welfare of rabbits farmed in different production systems (EFSA-Q-2019-00593)

The text of the draft Scientific Opinion was presented to the Panel and thoroughly discussed. All comments provided by the Panel members were discussed and addressed. The results obtained from the uncertainty analyses were integrated and rephrased in the conclusions. In particular the calculation of the overall welfare score obtained for each housing system and how these could be compared to each other were discussed in depth. After some modifications mainly in the sections Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations. The AHAW Panel adopted the Opinion unanimously.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

6.1. Art 29 – Scientific Opinion on Rift Valley Fever (EFSA-Q-2019-00422)

The text of the draft Scientific Opinion (TOR 1.1. & 1.3) was presented to the Panel and discussed. The approach taken to describe the global epidemiological situation of RVF since 2009 and the MintRisk model for the estimation of the risk of RVF into the EU were presented in detail. Currently, input from VectorNext consortium is expected to feed the MintRisk model and to proceed with the output. It was agreed with working group and panel that this opinion will be presented for adoption by the next plenary meeting (22-23 January 2019).

6.2. Art 29 - TOR2: African Swine Fever Risk ranking matrices (EFSA-Q-2019-00618)

The new approach that will be applied to rank the different matrices (including vegetables, arable crops, hay and straw as well as sawdust, wood chips and similar materials) for their risk to transmit ASFV was presented in detail. The different matrices will be ranked on basis of their level of risk, considering also their trade flow pattern, with a view to enhance preparedness and preventions. The table of matrices (meat (processed, unprocessed), animal by-products, feed (feed material), etc) was proposed and discussed. An outline of the approach to be taken for the data section was provided: the revised terminology will be approved internally by working group but also by panels of FEED and BIOHAZ and EC. Further it is foreseen that the data section will be consulted and endorsed via public consultation. An update of the systematic literature review on ASFV survival in different matrices retrieved three new scientific papers. In total three Expert knowledge elicitation exercises will take place (contamination, Trade, exposure/contact with three different groups of experts will be organised in 2020)

It was agreed with the panel to ask for extension of the deadline for adoption (proposal December 2020).



7. New Mandates

7.1. Request for a scientific opinion for the listing and categorisation of transmissible animal diseases caused by bacteria resistant to antimicrobials, in the framework of the Animal Health Law

The background and the TORs were presented to the panel. The reason for the mandate is to explore the state of play and emerging issues as regards AMR in bacteria responsible for transmissible diseases in animal with a view of listing such pathogens for EU action. The mandate clearly excludes pathogens that are already covered by Directive 99/2003 (zoonotic agents). The mandate was received on 11 November 2019 and the deadline for adoption is March 2022. It was agreed with the panel that this Opinion will be in collaboration with other units within EFSA (BIOHAZ) and other agencies (e.g. EMA). The panel members were requested to volunteer as working group members and/or deep reviewers. The chair of AHAW panel appointed Julio Alvarès as chair of the working group and Dominique Bicot (uncertainty) and Julian Drewe as working group members. Søren Saxmose and Liisa Sihvonen will be deep reviewers.

8. Updates on ongoing mandates

8.1. Art. 31 - Scientific and technical assistance on African swine fever - epidemiological analyses (EFSA-Q-2018-00053) -update

An update of the epidemiological situation in EU was presented. Results from the case-control study in Romania (TOR2) were provided to the panel and discussed. The measures taken by Belgium (based on experiences from Czech Republic) in relation to flexible reorganisation of fence structures were highlighted.

8.2. Art. 31 - Scientific and technical assistance on avian influenza monitoring

An overview of the results from report VIII (period 16 February-15 August 2019) and report IX (period 16 August – 15 November 2019) were presented and discussed with the panel. Report VIII has been published (<https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/sites/default/files/documents/avian-influenza-overview-february-august-2019.pdf>) and report IX will be published in December 2019.

8.3. Art 31 -Scientific and technical assistance on avian influenza surveillance (EFSA-Q-2019-00039)

The first annual EU report by EFSA on the surveillance data on avian influenza in poultry and wild birds was presented. This report will be published in December 2019.

8.4. Assessment of E. multilocularis surveillance reports 2019 (2018 data)(EFSA-Q-2019-00337, EFSA-Q-2019-00338)

This topic could not be covered during meeting. The report has been published in November 2019 <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/it/efsajournal/pub/5906>

8.5. Art 29 - Request for a scientific opinion on the evaluation of public and animal health risks in case of a delayed post-mortem inspection in



ungulates (EFSA-Q-2019-00124) This topic could not be discussed at day 2 due to time constraints

An update of the SO was given providing the input of the last working group meeting. The updated AHAW 'delayed meat inspection matrix disease' table was discussed with the panel. In order to assess the effect of having a delayed post-mortem inspection (comparing immediate with 'after 24h' and 'after 72h'). It was requested to provide feedback and input for columns 'Potential lesions and anomalies detectable on the carcass' and 'Probability of detection at Post mortem inspection' by the next working group meeting.

8.6. Art 29 - Scientific opinion as regards specific maximum levels of cross-contamination for 24 antimicrobial active substances in non-target feed (EFSA-Q-2019-00221)

An update since the last working group was provided to the panel. A revision of data available and detection on differences related to the data sets were considered: e.g. lowest MICs for any of the 24 substances reported in European national reports for animal pathogens; lowest MIC for any of the 24 substances available at EUCAST for selected bacteria. Possible approaches to infer concentrations of antimicrobials in feed from antimicrobial concentrations in the gut of the animals were presented and discussed. In order to infer the antimicrobial concentrations, data on weight/volume of intestinal content for the different species (including fish) were requested to panel members.

9. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission-Activities from other Panels

9.1. Feedback on the Uncertainty working group -> document assessment Uncertainty

Julio Alvares & Dominique Bicout presented the background and rationale for this document. Feedback was collected. The uncertainty ambassadors will liaise with the cross-cutting working group in order to improve the document and provide input for clear instructions on when, how and who should complete the document.

9.2. Feedback on published opinions & Twitter account @Animals_EFSA

Yves Van der Stede provided feedback on the published opinions earlier this year by AHAW panel (ASF opinion and welfare opinions in poultry). The communication process (story telling) was explained to the panel. On 4 November 2019 a new twitter account @Animals_EFSA was launched and is meant to share and announce the output of the AHAW panel.

10. Any other business & wrap up

10.1. Internal quality audit: update of guidance documents – discussion



Two guidance documents: Guidance on Good Practice in Conducting Scientific Assessments in Animal Health using Modelling (<https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/1419>, adopted in December 2009) and Guidance on Risk Assessment for Animal Welfare (<https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/2513>, last updated in February 2012), were listed for discussion with the Panel. It was agreed that both documents could be updated. Proposals for improvement were (Animal Welfare guidance document): uncertainty assessment (integrate the current guidance and checklist), update terminology on risk factors and welfare consequences, improve the description of qualitative and quantitative assessment, integrate a part on communication on risks and animal welfare, stress the benefit of welfare (positive welfare). Proposals for improvement were (Animal Health and modelling): improve section on data limitations and links with guidance on uncertainty, reshuffle the structure of the document, update the workflow described on page 16.

It was decided that the documents will be updated but it needs to be confirmed how (eg. by means of self-mandate or ad hoc assigning panel members to update some sections). IN the first quarter of 2020 the ALPHA Unit will investigate how best to organise and proceed with the update of the two guidance documents.

10.2. Wrap up

A short wrap up was given with summarising the tasks (homework) for the panel between now and the upcoming panel meeting.

10.3. Next meeting

Next Plenary meeting is 22 & 23 January 2020

A list of Panel meetings for 2020, 2021 and 2022 will be proposed. Once agreed, these dates will be fixed. A discussion was raised to distribute the panel meetings equal across the year (six in totals, three before summer (FEB, APRIL, JUNE) and three after summer (SEPT, OCT, DEC).