

Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare

Minutes of the 119th Plenary meeting

Held on 25-26 September 2019

EFSA, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 11 October 2019)¹

Participants

■ Panel Members:

ALVAREZ Julio, BICOUT Dominique, CALISTRI Paolo (via Skype for business on 26 September), DEPNER Klaus, DREWE Julian, GARIN-BASTUJI Bruno, GONZALES ROJAS Jose Luis, GORTAZAR SCHMIDT Christian, MICHEL Virginie, MIRANDA Miguel Angel, NIELSEN Søren Saxmose (Chair), ROBERTS Helen, SIHVONEN Liisa, SPOOLDER Hans, VELARDE Antonio, VILTROP Arvo, WINCKLER Christoph (only 25 June 2019)

■ European Commission: FORCELLA Simona (26 September 2019 via Skype for business and for point 5.3) & VORNHAGEN Kirsten

■ EFSA:

ALPHA UNIT: Sotiria-Eleni Antoniou, Inma Aznar, Francesca Baldinelli, Alessandro Broglia, Denise Candiani, Sofie Dhollander, Chiara Fabris, Nikolaus Kriz, Marie Louise Schneider, Andras Szoradi, Laura Gonzalez Villeta, Yves Van der Stede, Gabriele Zancanaro.

AMU UNIT: Jose Cortinas Abrahantes, Alexandra Papanikolaou, Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

TS UNIT: Alessandra Serra

■ Hearing experts²: not applicable.

■ Observers: not applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the meeting participants. Apologies were received from Karl STÅHL.

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



Antonio VELARDE was presented as new Panel Member.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest Scientific Panel Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 118th Plenary meeting held on 26-27 June 2019, Parma, (Italy)

The minutes of the 118th Plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure on 8 July 2019.

5. Scientific outputs submitted for possible adoption or endorsement

5.1. Art 29 - Slaughter of animals for human consumption (domestic birds) (EFSA-Q-2018-00715)

The text of the draft Scientific Opinion was presented to the Panel and thoroughly discussed. All comments provided by the Panel members were discussed and addressed. The results obtained from the uncertainty analyses were integrated and rephrased in the conclusions. After some modifications mainly in the Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations, the AHAW Panel adopted the Opinion unanimously.

5.2. Art 29 - Killing for other purposes than slaughter (domestic birds): (EFSA-Q-2018-00716)

The text of the draft Scientific Opinion was presented to the Panel and thoroughly discussed. All comments provided by the Panel members were discussed and addressed. The description of the uncertainty assessment was aligned with EFSA-Q-2018-00715. Modifications were proposed and agreed regarding the unacceptability on welfare grounds of methods and procedures. After some modifications mainly in the Summary, Interpretation of ToRs, Conclusions and Recommendations, the AHAW Panel adopted the Opinion unanimously.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



5.3. Art 29 – African Swine Fever Risk assessment in south eastern Europe & risk ranking matrices (EFSA-Q-2019-00049): TOR1

Following the adoption of the Scientific Opinion on ASF in June 2019, EFSA received a substantial number of comments. In accordance with EFSA's standard operational procedures, these comments were reviewed. In addition, EFSA received a new request from the European Commission on 23 September 2019, in which EFSA was asked to provide an update of the evaluation of the risk of spread of ASF in the South Eastern Countries of Europe; and an identification and description of the main risk factors including the fact that among some of these countries are EU Member States (ToR1).

This last aspect was specifically addressed in the reviewed version of this TOR1, which was discussed thoroughly and adopted on 25-26 September 2019.

In addition, EFSA was asked in the new mandate received on 23 September 2019 from the European Commission to review the evaluation of the ability of matrices, including vegetables, arable crops, hay and straw as well as sawdust, wood chips and similar materials likely to present a risk to transmit ASF. This review should take into account a retrospective analysis of ASF spread mechanisms. The different matrices should be ranked on basis of their level of risk, considering also their trade flow pattern, with a view to enhance preparedness and prevention. EFSA should propose and assess a strategy to manage the risks posed by different matrices. The definition used in the reports shall correspond to the ones present in the EU legislation such as the EU feed law, as far as applicable (ToR2). The new deadline provided for the reviewed version of ToR 2 is June 2020. This additional time provided for this mandate should allow to improve the data collection and reduce the uncertainty around the assessment.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

6.1. Art 29 – Slaughter of rabbits for human consumption of rabbits (EFSA-Q-2018-00594)

The text of the draft Scientific Opinion was presented to the Panel and discussed in depth. The results obtained from the EKE activities (survey and technical hearing meeting) to select the best indicators of unconsciousness based on indicator sensitivity, specificity and ease of use were discussed. The Panel requested a revision of the presentation of the results on the ease of use and the related uncertainty.

This Opinion will be presented for adoption in November 2019.

6.2. Art 29 - Health and welfare of rabbits farmed in different production systems (EFSA-Q-2018-00593) – EKE and survey

The text of the draft Scientific Opinion was presented to the Panel and discussed in depth. The overall results regarding i) comparison of cumulative welfare impact score amongst systems within one animal category, ii) comparison of welfare scores for the single welfare consequences and iii) identification of top five welfare consequences for each system and each category were discussed during the meeting. The Panel was informed that the opinion will include - for each of the six housing systems - a synthesis of findings from the EKE activities and the literature review, as well as the discussion around the six systems. The findings presented in the synthesis will not be repeated in the Conclusions, however, they form the basis for the formulation of Recommendations. This Opinion will be presented for adoption in November 2019.



6.3. Art 29 – Scientific opinion on Rift Valley Fever (EFSA-Q-2019-00422)

The timelines for each of the three different outputs (SOs) were agreed with the panel in order to know when a draft document needs to be reviewed (Nov 2019, Jan 2020 and June 2020). The approach to be taken for TOR 1.1 (global epidemiological situation of RVF since 2009) and TOR 1.2 & 1.3 (MintRisk model for estimate introduction of RVF into EU) were explained and discussed with the panel. For TOR1.2 and TOR 1.3 inputs by Vectornet will be provided for the models to be used later on. Vector species with high priority to be used/considered for the abundance models were discussed. For TOR2 (risk of spread and assessment of control measures), a spread model will be used based on an existing Bluetongue model (kernel based model). This model allows to simulate epidemics and control scenarios after point introduction in Europe. For assessing the situation in Mayotte the effectiveness will be assessed knowing that some control strategies may not be feasible on the island (e.g. surveillance zone of 20 km, eradication policy, etc).

7. New Mandates

None

8. Updates on ongoing mandates

8.1. Art. 31 - Scientific and technical assistance on African swine fever - epidemiological analyses (EFSA-Q-2018-00053)

This topic could not be discussed at day 2 due to time constraints

8.2. Art. 31 - Scientific and technical assistance on Avian influenza monitoring

This topic could not be discussed at day 2 due to time constraints

8.3. Art. 31 - Scientific and technical assistance on Avian influenza surveillance (EFSA-Q-2019-00039)

This topic could not be discussed at day 2 due to time constraints

8.4. Assessment of *E. multilocularis* surveillance reports 2019 (2018 data) (EFSA-Q2019-00337, EFSA-Q2019-00338)

This topic could not be discussed at day 2 due to time constraints

8.5. Art 29 - Request for a scientific opinion on the evaluation of public and animal health risks in case of a delayed post-mortem inspection in ungulates (EFSA-Q2019-00124)

An update of the SO was given providing the input of the last working group meeting. The AHAW 'delayed meat inspection matrix disease' table was discussed with the panel. In order to assess the effect of having a delayed post-mortem inspection (comparing immediate with 'after 24h' and 'after 72h' it was agreed to estimate the effect in a relative way (e.g. decrease of Se with



30%) rather than do a full quantitative assessment (e.g. log-reduction of *Salmonella spp.* after 72h). Input from Panel was requested by next panel meeting in order to complete this table; it will be distributed last week October, to be completed by mid-November.

8.6. Art 29 - Scientific opinion as regards specific maximum levels of cross-contamination for 24 antimicrobial active substances in non-target feed (EFSA-Q2019-00124)

An update of the SO was given providing the input of the last working group meeting. The AHAW matrix-animal-farming-substance table was discussed with the panel and input was requested until the next panel meeting in order to complete the list of main bacterial pathogens in the gut. In particular input was requested for gut pathogens of small ruminants and horses.

8.7. Art 29 – Killing of rabbits on-farm for other purposes than human consumption (EFSA-Q-2018-00909)

It was agreed that this scientific opinion is discussed in depth at the Plenary of November 19 and submitted for possible adoption via written procedure in December.

8.8. Data sources on animal diseases in EU Member States (Story maps – country cards)

This topic could not be discussed at day 2 due to time constraints

9. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission-Activities from other Panels

9.1. Presentation project Aquarius (C. Merten – SCER)

This topic could not be discussed at day 2 due to time constraints

9.2. Feedback from last SC committee meeting (chair)

This topic could not be discussed at day 2 due to time constraints

10. Any other business & wrap up

10.1. Internal quality audit: update of guidance documents – discussion

Two guidance documents: Guidance on Good Practice in Conducting Scientific Assessments in Animal Health using Modelling (<https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/1419>, adopted in December 2009) and Guidance on Risk Assessment for Animal Welfare



(<https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/2513>, last updated in February 2012), were listed for discussion with the Panel. The need for update was discussed given the fact that these two guidance documents were developed or last updated more than three years ago.

It was agreed with the Panel that by the next plenary meeting in November 2019 answers to the following questions would be obtained, so the Panel can then then decide if an update is necessary in 2020/2021: Do we need to include risk-benefit for animal welfare?; Is uncertainty well integrated in the guidance documents? Need for update of guidance documents, if so which parts?

10.2. Wrap up

A short wrap up was given with summarising the tasks (homework) for the panel between now and the upcoming panel meeting.

A short overview (Gabriele Zancanaro) was given on the 'Landing page' platform that is developed for AHAW and the AHAW panel. It was pointed out that this platform (Sharepoint site) will be the unique page where the AHAW panel can find all relevant information for a Panel meeting (agenda, minutes, opinions to be reviewed, etc.). Also the table with the links as well as clear instructions for panel members will be provided as well as clear deadlines for the comments to be made in the documents.

10.3. Next meeting

Next Plenary meeting is 20 (9h-18h) & 21 November (9h-14h).